# 2021 ARTS EDUCATION ADOPTION INSTRUCTIONAL QUALITY COMMISSION ADVISORY REPORT



Submitted to the California State Board of Education

November 2021

## Table of Contents

[2021 ARTS EDUCATION ADOPTION INSTRUCTIONAL QUALITY COMMISSION ADVISORY REPORT 1](#_Toc83624713)

[Table of Contents 2](#_Toc83624714)

[Introduction 3](#_Toc83624715)

[Adoption Process 5](#_Toc83624716)

[Adoption Timeline 5](#_Toc83624717)

[Publisher Invitation to Submit Meeting 6](#_Toc83624718)

[Publisher Fees 6](#_Toc83624719)

[Reviewer Appointment and Training 6](#_Toc83624720)

[IMR/CRE Review, Deliberations, and Reports of Findings 7](#_Toc83624721)

[Public Comment and Review 8](#_Toc83624722)

[Instructional Quality Commission Review and Deliberations 9](#_Toc83624723)

[Requirement of Number of Adopted Programs 9](#_Toc83624724)

[Edits and Corrections 10](#_Toc83624725)

[Adopted Publishers’ Responsibilities 10](#_Toc83624726)

[Changes to Instructional Materials Statutes and Funding 10](#_Toc83624727)

[Instructional Quality Commission Recommendations 12](#_Toc83624728)

[Basic Instructional Materials: Visual Arts Programs 13](#_Toc83624729)

[The Art of Education, *FLEX Curriculum*, Grades K–8 13](#_Toc83624730)

[Arts Attack, *Arts Attack*, Grades K–8 22](#_Toc83624731)

[Davis Publications, Inc., *Explorations in Art, 2nd Edition*, Grades 1–6 31](#_Toc83624732)

[Basic Instructional Materials: Music Programs 37](#_Toc83624733)

[OpusYou, Inc., *OpusYou Learning*, Grades K–8 37](#_Toc83624734)

[QuaverEd, Inc., *QuaverEd Music*, Grade K–5 96](#_Toc83624735)

[Appendix A: Criteria for the Evaluation of Instructional Materials Aligned to the California Arts Standards and Framework 116](#_Toc83624736)

[Category 1: Alignment with the California Arts Education Performance Standards 117](#_Toc83624737)

[Category 2: Program Organization 118](#_Toc83624738)

[Category 3: Assessment 119](#_Toc83624739)

[Category 4: Access and Equity 119](#_Toc83624740)

[Category 5: Instructional Planning and Support 120](#_Toc83624741)

## Introduction

The 2021 Arts Education Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials (Arts Adoption) began in earnest in January 2021. That month, the California State Board of Education (SBE) recommended the Content Review Experts (CREs) and Instructional Materials Reviewers (IMRs) who would review submitted programs. Later that month, publishers attended the Invitation to Submit meeting which stipulated the process to submit materials in each of the five arts disciplines. These actions were specified by the SBE-approved Schedule of Significant Events, yet they took place amidst unprecedented circumstances. January 2021, on the national political front, included the planned inauguration of the nation’s 46th President and first female Vice President. The aftermath of the presidential election was a period of unrest that culminated in a violent insurrection on the US Capitol on January 6. There was an ongoing, nation-wide census operation and a wave of racial justice protests taking place in cities throughout the country. The outcomes listed on the 2021 Arts Education Adoption’s Schedule of Significant Events stand within and among these circumstances and the landscape shaped by the public health emergencies stemming from ongoing, global pandemic.

The Curriculum Framework and Instructional Resources Division (CFIRD) staff organizing the process aligned its development with Governor Gavin Newsom’s Executive Order N-29-2, which transferred much of the work performed by state agencies into virtual spaces. The order delayed the process of recommending IMRs and CREs, but it provided time for the CFIRD staff to create a virtual meeting model to effectively conduct the IMR/CRE training and program deliberations and ensure the revised approach adhered to the rules in the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

The reports of findings produced during the Arts Adoption deliberations recognize and recommend programs that meet fully the grade-level standards for music and visual arts, and also align with the evaluation criteria for arts education instructional materials as clarified in the Arts Education Framework for California Public Schools, Transitional Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve (*Arts Framework*) (Appendix A).

The 2021 Arts Adoption features all-digital submissions—the first adoption of its kind. Similarly, the programs for consideration by the SBE are designed to respond new outcomes on California’s arts educational landscape. The programs aim to provide innovative approaches the 2019 California Arts Standards for Public Schools, Prekindergarten Through Grade Twelve (Arts Standards), and maintain rigorous approaches to the process-oriented, grade-appropriate indicators of what students need to know and be able to do with art. Recommended programs embody creative processes that are outcomes-based, communicating high and achievable goals, and are both designed to serve all students and guide teachers in providing a unified quality arts education to achieve the outcomes established by the standards.

The SBE approves the standards, framework, and instructional materials, but each milestone in the process reflects important work done by a wide association of stakeholders. This includes the work of many volunteers—primarily teachers, specialists, university professors, and arts experts—who serve on various SBE-appointed committees and review panels to advise the Instructional Quality Commission (IQC) in making its own recommendations to the SBE.

This Instructional Quality Commission Advisory Report to the SBE on the 2021 Arts Adoption takes into consideration the reports of findings developed by each review panel, public comment submitted throughout the adoption process, and the consideration of each IQC member.

The *Arts Framework* stipulates the SBE-adopted criteria for evaluating K–8 instructional materials. The criteria serve as the evaluation instrument for determining whether instructional materials align to the content standards, *Arts Framework*, and the other requirements established by the SBE, California *Education Code* (*EC*), and *California Code of Regulations* (*CCR*). The criteria require that publisher-submitted instructional materials cover at least one full-year course of study.

The criteria for the evaluation of arts education instructional resources for kindergarten through grade eight are organized into five categories:

1. **Alignment with the CA Arts Education Performance Standards:** Instructional materials include content as specified in the Arts Standards. To be eligible for adoption, programs must include a discipline-specific, well-defined sequence of instructional opportunities that provides a path for all students to become proficient in all grade-level or grade-span standards.
2. **Program Organization**: Instructional resources support instruction and learning of the Arts Standards and include such features as the organization, coherence, and design of the program; chapter, unit, and lesson overviews; and glossaries. Sequential organization and a coherent instructional design of the dance, media arts, music, theatre, or visual arts education program provide structure for what students should learn at each grade level or grade span and allow teachers to facilitate student learning of the content efficiently and effectively. The content also reflects the variety of instructional models, staffing, and facilities at a given school site.
3. **Assessment**: Instructional resources include multiple models of diagnostic, formative, and summative assessment tasks for measuring what students know and are able to do, while also providing guidance for teachers on how to interpret assessment results to guide instruction. The program provides teachers with discipline-specific assessment practices at each grade level or grade span necessary to prepare all students for success in later grade-level or grade-span arts education.
4. **Access and Equity**: The California *Education Code* requires that all students are provided equal access to public education (e.g., *EC* 200 et seq., *EC* 221.5[f]). The goal of arts education in California is to ensure universal and equitable access to high-quality curriculum and instruction for all students so they can meet or exceed the artistic literacy goals as described in the Arts Standards. Resources should incorporate recognized principles, concepts, processes, and research-based strategies to meet the needs of all students and provide equal access to learning. Instructional resources should include suggestions for teachers on how to differentiate instruction to meet the needs of all students. In particular, instructional resources should provide guidance to support students who are English learners; at-promise students (Per *EC* Section 96, the term “at-risk” is replaced in the *Education Code* with the term “at-promise.”); lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer, and questioning (LGBTQ+) students; advanced learners; and students with visible and non-visible disabilities.
5. **Instructional Planning and Support**: The information and resources should present explicit, coherent guidelines for teachers to follow when planning instruction and are designed to help teachers provide effective standards-based instruction. The resources should be designed to help teachers provide instruction that ensures opportunities for all students to learn the discipline-specific arts concepts, processes, skills specified in the Standards.

To be adopted, instructional materials must meet Category 1: Alignment with the *Arts Standards*, in full. Reviewers evaluate instructional materials holistically for strengths in the other categories of Program Organization, Assessment, Access and Equity, and Instructional Planning and Support. This means that while a program may not meet every criterion listed in those categories, to be eligible for state adoption, it must meet the intent stated in the introductory paragraph of each category.

Programs that do not meet category 1 in full and do not show strengths in each one of the other four categories will not be adopted. These criteria are designed to guide publishers in developing their programs and for local educational agencies when selecting instructional materials. To assist in the evaluation of instructional materials, publishers must use the SBE-approved standards maps and evaluation criteria map templates, developed and supplied by the California Department of Education (CDE), to provide evidence that the program provides students a path to meet the appropriate discipline-specific grade-level or grade-span standards of the *Arts Standards* by the end of the grade level or grade span.

## Adoption Process

### Adoption Timeline

The CDE conducted the instructional materials adoption process pursuant to the 2021 Arts Adoption’s Schedule of Significant Events approved by the SBE on July 8, 2020, adhering to all applicable state laws and regulations. The complete Schedule of Significant Events can be found on the CDE website at <https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/vp/im/artsadoptionschedule.asp>

### Publisher Invitation to Submit Meeting

In September 2020, the CDE posted a bulletin which included the documents necessary for publisher participation in the adoption, including each submission form and guiding document. The CDE staff and members of the IQC held an online Publisher Invitation to Submit (ITS) meeting on January 27, 2021, focusing process of participation in the adoption. The ITS outlined the evaluation criteria and the technical aspects of timely and appropriate publisher participation. Following the meeting, the CDE provided individual guidance to inquiring publishers and posted online regular updates to a list of frequently asked questions.

The adoption process required interested publishers to submit an initial Intent to Submit form by February 11, 2021, and to file additional submission documents by March 9, 2021. Copies of complete publisher programs were due by May 7, 2021. Following the deliberations, three visual arts publishers and two music publishers submitted instructional materials programs for consideration of SBE adoption.

### Publisher Fees

*EC* Section 60212 includes the provision that upon the request of a small publisher or small manufacturer the SBE may reduce the fee for participation in the adoption. This law defines “small publisher” and “small manufacturer” as “an independently owned or operated publisher or manufacturer that is not dominant in its field of operation and that, together with its affiliates, has 100 or fewer employees, and has average annual gross receipts of ten million dollars ($10,000,000) or less over the previous three years.”

Section 9517.3 of *5 CCR*, adopted by the SBE at its November 2016 meeting, establishes the publisher fees for this adoption at $8,000 per grade level for each program submitted for review, the criteria for determining if a publisher is eligible for a reduced fee, and the process for requesting the reduction. Four publishers for this adoption qualified for fee reduction.

### Reviewer Appointment and Training

The SBE appointed 15 CREs and 28 IMRs based on the recommendations of the IQC and CDE staff. Pursuant to *5 CCR* Section 9512, the majority of reviewers included classroom teachers with a “professional” credential who teach students in kindergarten or grades 1–12 and who have experience with, and expertise in, standards-based-educational programs and practices in the arts. Some of the reviewers had experience in providing instruction to English learners and in providing instruction to students with disabilities.

In February 2021, five publishers provided the CFIRD staff with intent to submit forms—two for music and three with programs in visual arts. Reviewers with content-area expertise outside of music and visual arts excused themselves from the process, and of the 43 reviewers appointed by the SBE in January, a total of 21 completed the virtual reviewer training and virtual deliberations processes.

The training was organized in asynchronous learning modules and supported by whole-group synchronous sessions taking place virtually through the Zoom meeting platform. The five-day training included a live webcast which is archived on the IQC website.

The training materials consisted of SBE-approved training materials adapted for the virtual training. Materials were provided for reviewers in digital, asynchronous modules organized in Google Classroom. Members of the IQC and CFIRD staff trained reviewers in synchronous sessions held April 12–16, 2021, to prepare them for their independent review and subsequent deliberations. The training included presentations that reviewed key aspects of the *Arts Standards* and *Arts Framework*, evaluation criteria, social content requirements, and the overall adoption process. Publishers made scheduled formal presentations to their respective program review panels on the final day of the training and answered reviewer questions.

The CDE conducted the training in accordance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act. Various publisher representatives and interested members of the public attended the training, and each day at a pre-determined time, trainers paused the session to invite public comment.

### IMR/CRE Review, Deliberations, and Reports of Findings

The restrictions related to the COVID-19 pandemic resulted in the closure of Learning Resource Display Centers. For this all-digital adoption, participating publishers provided complete copies of their programs via digital access to all reviewers on or before May 7, 2021. Reviewers conducted their independent reviews of the submitted instructional materials in May, June, and early July 2021. Members of the public were provided access to student versions of the materials through the 2021 Arts Education Adoption web page.

The reviewers were notified of a soft deadline of July 14 by which to submit initial tally forms, a digital survey stipulating the reviewer’s initial perspective on the program’s alignment with the *Arts Standards* and the evaluation criteria in the *Arts Framework*. The results of these initial tallies were combined in panel-specific spreadsheets on the evening of Sunday, July 18, 2021.

Reviewers met in panel-specific Zoom meetings held July 19–23. The data derived through completed digital tallies helped establish initial consensus and provided facilitators with direction for the in-depth discussions on the programs. A member of the IQC and two CDE staff facilitated each panel through this process, while additional CDE staff provided administrative support. At least one member of the CFIRD staff was present in each panel. In-depth discussion on areas of disagreement occurred until the reviewers reached consensus, which was recorded on spreadsheets to capture the group’s evolving conclusions. In addition to daily public comment periods during deliberations, publishers were provided a 15 minute response presentation to address panels’ formal questions.

Once facilitators confirmed consensus on alignment with standards and evaluation criteria, reviewers collaborated to co-write a report of findings report for each program. The reports include findings for each category of the criteria and exemplary citations to support those findings. Reviewers were asked to include citations for each grade level in category 1, criteria 1. In the case where the panel concluded a program would not be recommended for adoption, the reviewers included multiple citations for each grade level where publishers did not meet the standard.

The deliberations concluded with panels recommending three programs of the five submitted for consideration of adoption, with some recommendations contingent upon satisfactory completion of specified edits and corrections and/or social content citations.

Edits and corrections are defined as inexact language, imprecise definitions, mistaken notations, mislabeling, misspellings, and grammatical errors. Edits and corrections do not include rewrites, including revisions of sections, chapters, or entire pages, or adding new content to a program; rewrites are not allowed during the adoption process (pursuant to *5 CCR* sections 9510 and 9519[f]). The review panels also provided citations for social content violations when those were found in the programs (pursuant to *5 CCR* Section 9518).

The panel deliberations were conducted in accordance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act. Various publisher representatives and interested members of the public attended the deliberations. At least twice each day, the deliberations process included an opportunity for public comment.

### Public Comment and Review

Information on each program submitted for adoption was posted on the CDE’s 2021 Arts Education Adoption web page for public review and comment. Access included links to the student materials of submitted programs posted on the Arts Education Adoption web page (pursuant to *5 CCR* Section 9523[b]). No comments on the submitted instructional materials were received prior to deliberations for the review panels’ consideration.

On August 17, 2021, pursuant to *5 CCR* Section 9524, the IQC hosted a virtual meeting to take public comment on the 2021 Arts Education Adoption. Publisher representatives and members of the public attended and submitted comments to the IQC for consideration. Not all members of the IQC were present at that meeting, but all members received copies of comments that were submitted in writing.

Pursuant to *5 CCR* Section 9521, the CDE forwarded for consideration any public comments received by specific deadlines to the relevant review panels, the IQC, and the SBE. All comments received by July 5, 2021, were forwarded to the review panels; all comments received by September 16, 2021, were forwarded to the IQC. The public comment also encompasses any minimal errata identified by publishers. All publisher-submitted errata meets the definition of “edits and corrections” pursuant to *5 CCR*, Section 9510. All public comments received by October 27, 2021, were forwarded to the SBE. Any comments received after the outlined dates were shared with reviewers, commissioners, and board members, but those comments were not included in posted meeting notice attachments, which are posted 10 days before the meeting in accordance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

The IQC held two additional public hearings prior to making its recommendations to the SBE. These hearings took place during the Arts Subject Matter Committee (Arts SMC) meeting on September 22, 2021, and the full IQC meeting on September 23, 2021.

The SBE will hold a final public hearing at the November meeting prior to taking action on the IQC’s recommendations.

## Instructional Quality Commission Review and Deliberations

On September 22–23, 2021, the members of the IQC considered the review panel recommendations, public comments, and reports from individual Commissioners to determine whether each program satisfied or did not satisfy the SBE-adopted evaluation criteria for this adoption.

On September 22, 2021, the Arts SMC held a public hearing and discussed in depth the review panel Report of Findings for each program. The committee heard testimony from three members of the public before taking action to recommend programs to the full IQC. Members of the committee initiated individual program-specific motions and voted on each of the five programs submitted by publishers. Each motion was stated in the affirmative. A majority vote from the Arts SMC was required for any program to be recommended to the full IQC for adoption. The committee recommended for SBE adoption three of the five submitted programs.

On September 23, 2021, after conducting a second open hearing in which no members of the public made comment, the full IQC engaged in an extended discussion of the Arts SMC’s recommendation before it took action to recommend programs to the SBE. Nine members of the IQC had to vote in the affirmative for any program to be recommended to the SBE. The IQC recommended three of the five programs.

### Requirement of Number of Adopted Programs

*EC* Section 60200(e) requires specific findings related to the number of programs adopted by the SBE. In this adoption, the total number of recommended programs does not provide five or more basic instructional materials programs for each arts discipline in K–8 grade levels.

An initial publisher bulletin posted September 24, 2020, marked the beginning of a widely publicized process to initiate the scheduled 2021 Arts Adoption. Information posted to the CDE website and notifications sent to known publishers ultimately yielded five arts publisher program submissions—three in visual arts and two in music.

The SBE’s recommendations—after considering the review panels’ reports of findings, the IQC Advisory Report, public comment, and the process outlined above––satisfy *EC* Section 60200(a) which allows the SBE to adopt fewer than five programs when fewer than five satisfy the SBE’s related curriculum framework and its instructional materials adoption evaluation criteria.

SBE liaisons were present at all meetings of the IQC related to this adoption, and at the select training and deliberations of reviewers, and can attest to the extent to which the process was aligned to the SBE-adopted *Arts Framework*.

### Edits and Corrections

Edits and corrections meetings were scheduled with individual publishers after the SBE took its final action on the adoption. The process and timeline for edits and corrections meetings are specified in 5 *CCR* Section 9525, titled “Post Adoption Edits and Corrections Procedures.” These meetings with publishers will address the edits and corrections that are required by the SBE as part of its action to adopt instructional materials. Publishers whose programs are adopted by the SBE will be required to complete all edits and corrections within 60 days of CDE notification of the results of the edits and corrections meetings pursuant to 5 *CCR* Section 9525(e). No programs will be added to the CDE Price List of Adopted Instructional Materials online database until all edits and corrections have been made and verified.

### Adopted Publishers’ Responsibilities

According to the provisions of *EC* sections 60061 and 60061.5, publishers are required to comply with a number of very specific provisions that ensure that publishers furnish instructional materials to every school district in California at the lowest or same price offered to other districts in this state or any other state in the nation. A bulletin was sent to all adopted publishers containing information about the statutory and regulatory requirements related to state-adopted materials, post-adoption timelines, requirements regarding sales and marketing, alternate formats, pricing, and other issues.

### Changes to Instructional Materials Statutes and Funding

Pursuant to *EC* Section 60210, districts are no longer required to purchase instructional materials from a state adoption list. If a district elects to purchase materials that are not state adopted, they are required to include a majority of classroom teachers who are assigned to the subject area or grade level of the materials in their local review process.

Districts receive state instructional materials funding as part of their basic funding under the Local Control Funding Formula (LCFF) pursuant to Assembly Bill 97. More information about the LCFF can be found on the CDE website at <http://www.cde.ca.gov/fg/aa/lc/>.

Instructional materials sufficiency requirements (*EC* Section 60119) remain in effect. Districts must certify each year that they have standards-aligned textbooks or basic instructional materials in English language arts, mathematics, science, and history–social science students for all students in kindergarten through grade twelve to use in class and take home. Since the state instructional materials funds have been incorporated into LCFF, there is no financial penalty for failing to meet the sufficiency requirement, but this may change with future legislation.

## Instructional Quality Commission Recommendations

*As of the posting date of this Advisory Report, these programs have not been adopted by the State Board of Education*

The reports of the IMR/CRE review panels are posted in their entirety on the CDE Arts Education Instructional Materials Adoption web page at <https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/vp/im/2021artrofs.asp>

| **Publisher** | **Program Title** | **Grade Level(s)** | **IMR/CRE Recommendation** | **IQC Recommendation** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| The Art of Education | *FLEX Curriculum* | K–8 | Recommended | Recommended |
| Arts Attack | *Arts Attack* | K–8 | Not Recommended | Not Recommended |
| Davis Publications, Inc. | *Explorations in Art, 2nd Edition* | 1–6 | Recommended | Recommended |
| OpusYou, Inc. | *OpusYou Learning* | K–8 | Not Recommended | Not Recommended |
| QuaverEd, Inc. | *QuaverEd Music* | K–5 | Recommended | Recommended |

## Basic Instructional Materials: Visual Arts Programs

### The Art of Education, *FLEX Curriculum*, Grades K–8

#### Program Summary:

The Art of Education program includes the following through its FLEX Platform*: California Scope and Sequence (SS); Teacher’s Edition (TE); Implementation Resources (IR); Student Collections (SC); Student Lessons (SL); Student Videos (SV); Student Resources (SR), Student Assessments (SA)*

#### Recommendation:

*FLEX Curriculum* is recommended for adoption because the instructional materials include content as specified in the *California Arts Standards for California Public Schools,* *Prekindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Arts Standards*), and meet all the criteria in category 1 with strengths in categories 2–5.

#### Criteria Category 1: Arts Education Content/Alignment with Standards

The program supports instruction designed to ensure that students master all the *Arts Standards* for the intended grade level(s), and meets all of the evaluation criteria in category 1.

##### Citations:

* Criterion #1.1: Grades K–8; Lesson Examples (SL):
  + Kindergarten: K.VA:Cn11, Sculpture Park. <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/sculpture-park-art-ca/>
  + Grade 1: 1.Va:Cr3, Painted Paper Weaving. <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/painted-paper-weaving-ca/>
  + Grade 2: 2.VA:Cr 1.1, Paper Mache Play. <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/paper-mache-play-ca/>
  + Grade 3: 3.VA: Cr 2.1, Photomontage (Hannah Hoch). <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/photomontage-collage-portraits-ca/>
  + Grade 4: 4.VA: Pr:6, Create Your Own Museum. <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/create-your-art-museum-ca/>
  + Grade 5: 5.VA:Re7.1, Abstract Digital Explorations. <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/abstract-digital-explorations-ca/>
  + Grade 6: 6. 6.VA:Pr6, From Virtual to Concrete. <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/from-virtual-to-concrete-ca/>
  + Grade 7: 7.VA:Cr1.1, Dream Drawing. <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/dream-drawing-ca/>
  + Grade 8: 8.VA:Cn11, Graffiti That Sticks. <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/graffiti-that-sticks-ca/>
* Criterion #1.2, 1.3, 1.4, 1.6, 1.7, and 1.8: Grades K–8, the FLEX California Scope & Sequence (SS) (<https://uploads.theartofeducation.edu/2021/04/CA-k-8-Scope-and-Sequence.pdf>). Pages 1–92 provide teachers with grade-level specific units that include targeted *Art Standards* outlining lessons, resources, and other supplemental instructional materials.
* Criterion #1.9: Grades 6–8, Eco-Visualization and Me (SL) (<https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/eco-visualization-and-me/>) The program includes ways for students learn about eco-visualization artists who highlight sustainability issues to help people understand their impact on natural systems. The program invites students to identify a local ecological issue and bring awareness visually using a choice of artmaking materials.
* Criterion #1.6: Grades K–8, Latinx Artists Article (IR) (<https://theartofeducation.edu/2020/11/11/6-latin-artists-your-students-will-love/>). Pages 1–10 guide teachers to incorporate culturally- and linguistically-relevant artists into their curriculum as a way to engage a broader variety of student artists.

#### Criteria Category 2: Program Organization

The organization and features of the instructional materials support instruction and learning of the standards.

##### Citations:

* Criterion #2.1, 2.2, 2.3, 2.4, 2.5, 2.6, 2.7, 2.8, and 2.9: Grades K–8, the FLEX Implementation page at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/implementation/> includes an overview of the program that allows teachers to access content efficiently. Some support documents include
  + FLEX Teacher’s Edition (TE) at ~~https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/implementation/flex-teachers-edition/~~ [the preceding link is no longer valid], FLEX Collections (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/collections/>; and
  + FLEX Lessons (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/>, FLEX Resources (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/resources/>.
* Criterion #2.3 and 2.4: Grades K–8, [FLEX Collections](https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/collections/) (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/collections/>, FLEX Resources (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/resources/>, and FLEX Lessons (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/>. Specific sample lessons are found in the Creating with Everyday Objects Collection (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/collections/creating-with-everyday-objects-ca/> and Exploring My Community Collection (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/collections/exploring-my-community-ca/>.
* Criterion #2.2 and 2.6: Grades K–8, FLEX Assessments (IR) and (SA), at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/assessments/>, include formative and summative assessments, peer feedback, reflections and critiques at beginner, intermediate, and advanced levels.
* Criterion #2.5 and 2.6: Grades K–8, Paper Manipulation Techniques (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/resources?shared=330972>, Brush Chart (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/resources?shared=331550>, Stop Motion Animation Set-up (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/resources?shared=331741>, and 5 Cut Paper Collage Techniques (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/resources?shared=331001> are examples of accurate, well-annotated, or well-labeled graphics.

#### Criteria Category 3: Assessment

The instructional materials provide teachers with assistance in using assessments for planning instruction and monitoring student progress toward mastering the content.

##### Citations:

* Criterion #3.1, 3.2, 3.3, and 3.4: Grades K–8, the FLEX Assessment page (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/assessments/> includes support documents such as Anticipatory Sets with FLEX at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/>, Learning Goals Self Assessment Rubric at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/>, and My “Best Work” Reflection at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/>, which teachers can use to determine prior knowledge, assess student work, and evaluate progress.
* Criterion #3.5: Grades K–8, FLEX Assessment page (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/assessments/> provides a broad array of assessment strategies including summative and formative assessments as well as critiques and peer assessments.
* Criterion #3.6: Grades K–8, FLEX Teacher’s Edition (TE) at ~~https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/implementation/flex-teachers-edition/~~ [the preceding link is no longer valid], guides teachers on how to adapt instruction on the basis of evidence from assessment.
* Criterion #3.7: Grades K–8, FLEX Assessment (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/assessments/>, which includes 10 Questions for Critique at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/>, which is an example that provides guiding questions to monitor student understanding of the arts.

#### Criteria Category 4: Access and Equity

Program materials ensure universal and equitable access to high-quality curriculum and instruction for all students and provideteachers with suggestions for differentiation for students with special needs.

##### Citations:

* Criterion #4.1: Grades K–8, FLEX Implementation Page (IR) at ~~https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/implementation/flex-differentiated-instruction~~ [preceding link is no longer available], provides strategies for differentiated instruction for all students.
* Criterion #4.2: Grades K–8, Differentiation in the Art Room (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/packs/exploring-differentiation-art-room/>, includes suggestions for adaptations to the curriculum to meet the students’ assessed instructional needs.
* Criterion #4.3: Grades K–8, FLEX Teacher’s Edition (TE) at ~~https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/implementation/flex-teachers-edition/~~ [preceding link is no longer available] provides comprehensive guidance for teachers based on current and confirmed research to adapt curriculum to meet the needs of all students.
* Criterion #4.4: Grades K–2, Talking About Art (SL) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/talking-about-art-ca> is an example that includes strategies for English learners.
* Criterion #4.5: Grades 6–7, Barbara’s Story Photos (SL) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/barbaras-story-photos-ca/> is an example that includes strategies for English learners.

#### Criteria Category 5: Instructional Planning and Support

The instructional materials contain a clear road map for teachers to follow when planning instruction and are designed to help teachers provide effective standards-based instruction and ensure opportunities for all students to learn the essential skills and knowledge specified in the standards.

##### Citations:

* Criterion #5.1, 5.2, and 5.3: Grades K–8, The FLEX California Scope & Sequence (SS) at <https://uploads.theartofeducation.edu/2021/04/CA-k-8-Scope-and-Sequence.pdf> and the Differentiation Guide (IR) at <https://uploads.theartofeducation.edu/2021/04/FLEX_Differentiated-Instruction.pdf> include support for lesson plans found in the FLEX Lesson Plans (SL) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/> and in the FLEX Teacher’s Edition (TE) at ~~https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/implementation/flex-teachers-edition/~~ [the preceding link is no longer valid]. This includes resource organization, pacing guides, and instructional strategies.
* Criterion #5.4: Grades K–8, FLEX Lesson Plans (SL) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/>, when filtered by the curricular connection search feature, give suggestions for connecting the arts with educational concepts.
* Criterion #5.5 and 5.6: Grades K–8, the FLEX Implementation page (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/implementation/> includes technical support and suggestions for appropriate use of resources. Examples of this are Tips for Using Apps to Manipulate Artwork at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/>, which includes user-friendly components and platform neutral materials such as the FLEX Platform Walkthrough at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/>.
* Criterion #5.12-5.13: Grades K–8, The program includes safety guidelines for use of materials, facilities and online environment. Examples include these documents: Guide to Digital Citizenship (IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/> and Planning for Safety(IR) at <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/>**.**

#### Edits and Corrections:

The following edits and corrections must be made as a condition of adoption:

| # | Grade  Level | Component | Location | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for edit |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Beginner | Lesson: Mondrian and Mishima | Home/FLEX/Lessons/ Mondrian and Mishima  <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/mondrian-and-mishima-ca/> | Description:  Students will analyze the works of Piet Mondrian and create their own unique composition inspired by his style on a clay tile. They will define their directional lines using a Mishima technique before glazing the surface shapes with primary colors. | Description: Students will analyze the works of Piet Mondrian and create their own unique composition influenced by his style on a clay tile. They will define their directional lines using a technique adapted from Mishima before glazing the surface shapes with primary colors. | Text relied on imprecise definition of Mishima technique. |
| 2 | Beginner | Lesson: Mondrian and Mishima | Home/FLEX/Lessons/ Mondrian and Mishima  <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/mondrian-and-mishima-ca/> | Students will use the Mishima technique to inlay color in textured lines before glazing the surface. | Students will use the Mishima-inspired technique to inlay color in textured lines before glazing the surface. | Text relied on imprecise definition of Mishima technique. |
| 3 | Beginner | Lesson: Mondrian and Mishima | Home/FLEX/Lessons/ Mondrian and Mishima  <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/mondrian-and-mishima-ca/> | Demonstrate ceramics methods including the Mishima technique of glazing. | Demonstrate ceramics methods including the inlay technique of glazing. | Text relied on imprecise definition of Mishima technique. |
| 4 | Intermediate | Lesson: Ceramic Landscapes | Home/FLEX/Lessons/Ceramic Landscapes<https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/lesson-plans/ceramic-landscapes-ca/> | Teaching Strategies:  -Facilitate a discussion on the components of landscapes in art.  -Guide students in planning and sketching their landscape, considering seasons and different environments.  -Facilitate the preparation and organization of materials from start to finish.  -Demonstrate ceramics methods.  -Discuss and teach the Mishima technique.  Lesson Objectives:  Students will learn about the Mishima technique and apply it to their ceramic landscape. | Teaching Strategies:  -Facilitate a discussion on the components of landscapes in art.  -Guide students in planning and sketching their landscape, considering seasons and different environments.  -Facilitate the preparation and organization of materials from start to finish.  -Demonstrate ceramics methods.  -Discuss and teach the glaze inlay technique. | Text relied on imprecise definition of Mishima technique. |
| 4 | (cont.) | (cont.) | (cont.) | (cont.) | (cont.)  Lesson Objectives:  Students will learn about the glaze inlay technique and apply it to their ceramic landscape. | (cont.) |
| 5 | Intermediate | Resource: Anchor Chart | Home/FLEX/Resources  <https://theartofeducation.edu/flex/resources?shared=351124> | Title: Mishima Technique  Subtitle: The Mishima technique is a method of inlaying glaze in textured and carved areas of a ceramics piece. | Title: Mishima-Inspired Technique  Subtitle: The Mishima technique is a method of inlaying color in textured and carved areas of a ceramics piece. | Text relied on imprecise definition of Mishima technique. |

#### Social Content Citations:

The panel submits no social content violations.

**Visual Arts Program**

### Arts Attack, *Arts Attack*, Grades K–8

#### Program Summary:

The Arts Attack digital program includes the following: *Teachers Manual* (*TM); Art Print Guide (APG); Grade Document (GD); Grade Video (GV); Art Print (AP); Video Lesson (VL); Response/Evaluation (RE); Discussion Question (DQ).*

Note: The citations listed below reflect the page numbers printed on the documents provided by the program and may be different from page numbers assigned by viewing software.

#### Recommendation:

*Arts Attack* is not recommended for adoption because the instructional materials do not include content as specified in the *California Arts Standards for California Public Schools, Prekindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Arts Standards*), and do not meet all the criteria in category 1 and do not show strengths in categories 2, 3, and 4.

#### Criteria Category 1: Arts Education Content/Alignment with Standards

The program does not support instruction designed to ensure that students master all the *Arts Standards* for the intended grade levels, and does not meet all of the evaluation criteria in category 1.

##### Citations:

Criteria Category 1, Criterion #1: Standards Not Met:

* Criterion #1.1: K.VA:Cr1.2; TM, pp. 67–68, procedures 1–7. The program does not provide students with sufficient opportunities to engage collaboratively in creative artmaking in response to an artistic problem. Students engage individually in teacher-directed projects. No opportunities for students to work collaboratively as defined by the *Arts Standards* Visual Art Glossary, p. 222.
* Criterion #1.1: 3.VA:Pr4; TM, p. 98, Displaying Artwork. Insufficient opportunities for students to investigate and discuss possibilities and limitations of spaces, including electronic spaces, for exhibiting artwork. Instructions emphasize the teacher’s role in displaying artwork and do not include explicitly include students as partners to investigate and conceptualize displays or discovering venue options.
* Criterion #1.1: 4.VA:Cr2.2; TM, p. 36, Safety and Care of Equipment. The program outlines safety and care of equipment for the teacher only, insufficient providing explicit opportunities for students to demonstrate safe use and care for materials, tools, and equipment in a manner that prevents danger to oneself and others when making works of art.
* Criterion #1.1: 4.VA:Cn10; TM, pp. 143–147 (Kachina Dolls). The program missed opportunities for students to create works of art that reflect community cultural traditions. The program prescribes cultural traditions to investigate rather than providing space for students investigate community cultural traditions. Students are asked to copy the cultural and spiritual artifacts of other cultures, resulting in cultural misappropriation as described in the *California Arts Education Framework for Public Schools, Transitional Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Arts Education Framework*)*,* p. 81.
* Criterion #1.1: 5.VA:Re9; TM, p. 164, Year-end Art Print Study. Artwork provided as instructional examples is restricted to paintings, missing opportunities to provide variety in art media and promote diversity in the cultural/historical contexts of the artwork. The program lacks opportunities for students to recognize differences in criteria used to evaluate works of art depending on styles, genres, and media, as well as historical and cultural contexts.
* Criterion #1.1: 7.VA:Cr1.1; TM, pp. 97–112, VL Michelangelo. The program does not include guidance to support students to respond to and overcome creative blocks.
* Criterion #1.1: 7.VA:Cr1.2; TM, pp. 68–70, procedures 1–8, RE 19–22. Students are provided a limited set of criteria and are not afforded opportunities to develop their own criteria to guide their art-making to meet an identified goal.
* Criterion #1.4: Grades K–8; VLs contain documented/attributed source material inconsistent with 8.VA:Cr2.2,“Demonstrate awareness of practices, issues, and ethics of appropriation, fair use, copyright, open source, and Creative Commons as they apply to creating works of art and design.”
* Criterion #1.6: Grades K–8; TM, pp. 14–15, Scope and Sequence (all grade levels). The program does align with the *Arts Education Framework* (p. 81) by addressing culturally sustaining or relevant work and providing the sources and acknowledging where the contents, styles, and practices were generated. The program does not provide culturally and linguistically responsive activities for engaging students in the arts processes to increase students’ knowledge of the arts through their study of the historical, contemporary, and multicultural artistic concepts and the lives, contributions, and innovations of various artists and arts movements. The Culture and History category and the Artists and Aesthetics category of lessons misappropriate various cultures in materials designed for elementary and middle-school students.

#### Criteria Category 2: Program Organization

The organization and features of the instructional materials do not support instruction and learning of the standards.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #2.1: Grades K–8; TM, pp. 3–6 and 14–15; GV Teacher Training Video, Program Overview Chapter. The program delivers individual lessons organized in a manner misaligned to the recommendations for including enduring understandings, essential questions, and big ideas, as described in the *Arts Education Framework*, p. 12.
  + Criterion #2.4: Grades K–8; GD, California Standards Alignment. The California Standards Alignment document for each grade level contain inaccuracies and inconsistencies associated with the *Arts Standards* in the cited lessons.
  + Criterion #2.4: Grades K–8; GD, Lesson Summaries. Grade-level lessons are not aligned to the *Arts Standards*. The structure of the program is not organized by chapters or units and does not include explanation of how the arts standards will be met in each offering. The structure of the program does not provide chapter or unit outlines, essential questions, big ideas, and enduring understandings in alignment with the standards and the framework.
  + Criterion #2.5: Grades K–8; TM, VL, APG. The program includes images and graphics that lack sufficient diversity of represented artworks and art media to enhance students’ focus and understanding of the content and that does not reflect the diversity of California. Images, videos, and graphics are inconsistently attributed.

#### Criteria Category 3: Assessment

The instructional materials do not provide teachers with assistance in using assessments for planning instruction and monitoring student progress toward mastering the content.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #3.1: TM, p. 24. Diagnostic Assessment does not include strategies or instruments that guide teachers in determining students’ prior knowledge.
  + Criterion #3.4: Grades K–8; TM, Teaching the Arts Attack Program: Teach the Lesson: Show the Lesson on the Video to the Students, p. 17, 4–5. Guidance around teacher observation primarily focuses on ways to assess students’ ability to independently apply discipline-specific arts concepts, processes, and principles. The result is a series of missed opportunities for employing multiple measurements and differentiated strategies.
  + Criterion #3.5: Grades K–8; TM, Assessment and Evaluation, pp. 24–25. The assessment strategies provided do not include opportunities to for teachers to use a broad array of assessment strategies to evaluate student understanding.
  + Criterion #3.6: GV, Teacher Training Video, Helpful Teaching Tips *–* General (time stamp 48:57 to 1:00:08). The resource does not address specific elements of assessment and includes minimal guidance for adapting instruction based on evidence and improve student learning.

#### Criteria Category 4: Access and Equity

Program materials do not ensure universal and equitable access to high-quality program and instruction for all students anddo not provide teachers with suggestions for differentiation for students with special needs.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #4.1: Grades K–8; TM, Artists Studied in Arts Attack, pp. 7–11; TM, Artists Studied in Digital Program, p. 11. The program provides lists of 32 and 61 artists. Choices are overwhelmingly male, resulting in missed opportunities to highlight contemporary artists, contemporary art movements, and diversity of artists from a variety ethnicities, cultures, experiences, and backgrounds to represent and reach the diversity of learners.
  + Criterion #4.1: Grades K–8; TM, Holiday Art Lessons: Grade 1, pp. 67 and 142; Grade 2, p. 63; Grade 3, p. 63; Grade 4, p. 57. Missed opportunities for instruction that includes all students, and guidance for highlighting diverse backgrounds as a resource for student learning.
  + Criterion #4.2: Grades K–8; TM, p. 18. The program missed opportunities to provide current and confirmed research for adapting the program and the instruction in ways that meet students’ needs. Current and confirmed research should provide students with opportunities for contemporary explorations of self, peoples, and cultures and with more student voice/choice in the lessons to provide differentiated instruction and be inclusive. (See also Kindergarten, p. 75; Grade 1, p. 142; Grade 2, p. 72; Grade 4, p. 143; Grade 5, p. 125; Grade 6, p. 145; Grade 7, p. 137; Grade 8, p. 93).
  + Criterion #4.3: Grades K–8; TM, p. 18. The program does not refer to current and confirmed research, including the guidelines of the Universal Design of Learning stipulated in the *Arts Education Framework*, resulting in missed opportunities for comprehensive teacher guidance and differentiation strategies to adapt the program to meet students' identified special needs and to provide effective, efficient instruction for all students.
  + Criterion #4.4: Grades K–8; TM, p. 18 (especially item 5 in the list). The program did not provide sufficient guidance to support English learners or alignment with the *California English Language Development Standards: Kindergarten Through Grade 12* (*ELD Standards*)adopted under *EC* Section 60811. The program does not provide specific support for students who are English learners or direct connections to the *ELD Standards* and missed opportunities for teachers to use students’ cultural backgrounds as assets to learning.
  + Criterion #4.5: Grades K–8; TM, p. 18 (especially item 5 in the list). The program misses opportunities to provide specific strategies and support for English learners in both student and teacher editions, as appropriate, at every grade level and grade span.
  + Criterion #4.6: Grades K–8; TM, p. 18. The program does not provide sufficient scaffolding or strategies for students who perform below grade level or need assistance with arts content.

#### Criteria Category 5: Instructional Planning and Support

The instructional materials containa clear road map for teachers to follow when planning instruction and are designed to help teachers provide effective standards-based instruction and ensure opportunities for all students to learn the essential skills and knowledge specified in the standards.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #5.1: Grades K–8; TM. Detailed lesson plans provide information needed teach the lesson, including background information, drawing aids or student handouts, concepts listed, vocabulary, step-by-step procedures, discussion guidance, assessment and evaluation exercises and connections activities.
  + Criterion #5.1: Grades K–8; TM (all grades), pp. 16–17, and GV Teacher Training Video, Teaching Tips (time stamp 34:07–1:00:08). Materials provide suggestions for organizing resources in the classroom and ideas for pacing lessons.
  + Criterion #5.5: GV How to Use Arts Attack and the Support Hotline in grade-level resources provides support for educators in the use of the program.
  + Criterion #5.6: Arts Attack Online is a user-friendly resource consisting of Videos, Documents, Art Print Images, and Lessons and is compatible with all common platforms and browsers.
  + Criterion #5.11: Guidelines for presentations of student artwork in an ART SHOW are outlined in How to Give an Art Show, pp. 26–28, of the Teacher’s Manual (all grades). Guideline 15 and 16 describe how to present explanations of formal and informal artistic elements and principles to explain each lesson and the complete survey of lessons and concepts for each grade level.

#### Edits and Corrections:

The panel recommends the following edits and corrections:

| # | Grade level | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for edit |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | 1 | TM  Art Supply List | 34  1 | For cowboy & Indian printing lesson | Correct to say: For cowboy & his horse printing lesson | To align with the title of the Lesson & Video |
| 2 | 5 | TM | 1 | … grades K–6 | … grades K–8 | K–8 is the correct grade span |
| 3 | 5 | APG | 23 | He remained in Paris until 1985, … | He remained in Paris until 1885, … | 1985 is a typo |
| 4 | 3 | APG | 13 | Missing death year (2000) for Jacob Lawrence | Add death year (2000) for Jacob Lawrence | Missing death year – inconsistent with rest of APG |
| 5 | 6 | TM | 40 | 3. TROPICAL BIRDS: Color 5340 | 3.TROPICAL BIRDS: Color 53 | 5340 is a typo |
| 6 | 8 | General Materials | Title page | How to Read a Picture Grade 7 | How to Read a Picture Grade 8 | Grade 8 is the correct grade level (is Grade 8 in TM p. 57) |

#### Social Content Citations:

The panel found the following social content violations:

| # | SC Code | Grade level | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for citation |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | L-1 | K | TM | 67–68 | “Cat in the Hat” | A non-branded character | Use of a branded name, “Cat in the Hat.” |
| 2 | G-3 | 1 | TM | 67 | Halloween Night | A non-holiday-specific representation | Diversity of religion is not depicted. |
| 3 | L-1 | 1 | TM | 122 | “Cat in the Hat” | A non-branded character | Use of a branded name, “Cat in the Hat.” |
| 4 | L-1 | 1 | TM | 123 | …on the internet: (Google Images website) are: … | …on the internet are: … | Brand name (Google) |
| 5 | L-1 | 1 | TM | 141 | Art.com | Art web page | Commercial site |
| 6 | G-3 | 1 | TM | 142 | Sweet Smell of Christmas | A non-holiday-specific representation | Diversity of religion is not depicted. |
| 7 | L-1 | 1 | TM | 142 | Sweet Smell of Christmas | A non-branded book | Use of branded materials. |
| 8 | G-3 | 2 | TM | 63 | Halloween Night | A non-holiday-specific representation | Diversity of religion is not depicted. |
| 9 | E-1 | 2 | TM | 145–149 | Seven Dwarfs lesson | NA | Problematic for students with disabilities– focus on a group of people solely on genetic traits seems insensitive. |
| 10 | G-3 | 3 | TM | 63 | Halloween Night | A non-holiday-specific representation | Diversity of religion is not depicted. |
| 11 | L-1 | 3 | TM | 152 | …available using the Google website… | …available on the internet … | Brand name (Google) |
| 12 | G-3 | 4 | TM | 57 | Halloween Night | A non-holiday-specific representation | Diversity of religion is not depicted. |
| 13 | L-1 | 4 | TM | 95 | …(These are all on the internet at www.google.com:...) | (These images can be found with an internet search …) | Brand name (www.google.com) |
| 14 | B-1 | 5 | TM | 125–130 and throughout | (term “Indians”) | Native American | Missed opportunity to update material to be culturally sensitive or align with social expectations to reflect the diversity of CA |
| 15 | B-1 | 5 | TM | 125–140 | All content in selected pages. | NA | Entire lesson presents Native Americans as exclusively in the past |
| 16 | A-8 | 5 | TM | 134 | “man” and “mankind” | Change “man” to “people” and “humans” instead of “mankind” | for inclusivity/non-gendered language |
| 17 | E1 | 6 | TM | 110 | “Stress that, being **handicapped**, he became an observer of life” | “Stress that, having a disability, he became and observer of life.” | not inclusive - otherising |
| 18 | L-1 | 6 | TM | 148 | …Google Images website… | …on the internet … | Brand name (Google Images) |
| 19 | B | 7 | Video | G7–16 | “Here’s an African mask I made as an example” | remove “African” | If the instructor made it and is not from Africa herself, it is not an African mask. |
| 20 | L-1 | 8 | TM | 70 | …(Go to the Google Images website and search under …) | …(Conduct an internet search for …) | Brand name (Google Images) |
| 21 | L-1 | 8 | TM | 116 | graphic/image of “Oil of Olay Total Effects” bottle | A non-branded material | Use of branded materials. |

**Visual Arts Program**

### Davis Publications, Inc., *Explorations in Art, 2nd Edition*, Grades 1–6

#### Program Summary:

*Explorations in Art, 2nd Edition*, includes the following: *Student Edition (SE); Teacher Edition (TE) includes Teacher resources (TR) in the form of* *lesson planning with objectives; step-by-step instruction for engaging, exploring, and creating; assessment strategies; and closing activities; TE also includes differentiated instruction (DI) strategies; artist biographical information (BI); cross-curricular connections (CX); and children’s trade book (TB) suggestions.*

#### Recommendation:

*Explorations in Art, 2nd Edition*,is recommended for adoption because the instructional materials include content as specified in the *California Arts Standards for California Public Schools,* *Prekindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Arts Standards*), and meet all the criteria in category 1, with strengths in categories 2–5.

#### Criteria Category 1: Arts Education Content/Alignment with Standards

The program supports instruction designed to ensure that students master all the *Arts Standards* for the intended grade level(s), and meets all of the evaluation criteria in category 1.

##### Citations:

* Criterion #1.1: Grade 1, 1VA:Cr1.1; SE, Unit 5 STEAM: Consider Structure When Creating Art, Research and Collaborate/Create, Reflect, Revise, p. 149. Students have the opportunity to engage in small collaborative groups for exploration and imaginative play with art materials.
* Criterion #1.1: Grade 2, 2.VA:Cr1.1; SE, Unit 2 STEAM: Consider Materials When Creating Art: Research and Collaborate/Create, Reflect, Revise, p. 59. The program provides opportunities for students to brainstorm ideas and generate multiple approaches for an art or design problem.
* Criterion #1.1: Grade 3, 3.VA:Cr2.1; SE, 1.6 People in Action: Sculpting with Clay: 5. Reflect and Present, p. 18. Students are provided opportunities to create personally satisfying artwork using a variety of artistic processes and materials.
* Criterion #1.1: Grade 4, 4.VA:Cr1.1; SE, 2.6 Play on Words: Collage: 1. Explore, p. 46. Students are provided opportunities to brainstorm individual and collaborative approaches to a creative art or design problem.
* Criterion #1.1: Grade 5, 5.VA:Cr1.1; SE, Unit 6.6 In Your Dreams: Unusual Proportions: 1. Explore, p. 166. The program provides opportunities for students to explore ways to combine ideas to work through/create an innovative art making process.
* Criterion #1.1: Grade 6, 6.VA:Re7.2; SE, Unit 4, Design, pp. 92–121. The content provides multiple methods to explore the *Arts Standards* while allowing students a range of options to explore and grow within their interests and challenge their boundaries and assumptions about art, themselves, and the world.
* Criterion #1.2: Grade 2, TE, 6.3 Mod Pods: Building with Paper: Prepare/Teach Through Inquiry/Assess/Assessment Rubric/Close, pp. 158–161. Instructional materials are consistent with *the California Arts Education Framework for Public Schools, Transitional Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Arts Framework*).
* Criterion #1.3: Grades 1–6, TE, Unit Structure, pp. xviii–xxxvii; Program Overview: Structure of the Program: Continuity and Variety within Each Grade Level, p. R5; Art in Daily Life, p. R42; Art in the Total Curriculum, p. R43. The program offers instructional strategies that incorporate skill developing and sequential, discipline specific learning in all four artistic processes (creating, performing/producing/presenting, responding, connecting) over time.
* Criterion #1.9: Grade 1, TE, Unit 4 STEAM: Consider Categories When Creating Art: Teach Through Inquiry/STEAM Science/STEAM Technology, pp. 118–119. The program contents examine humanity’s place in ecological systems and the importance of protecting the environment.

#### Criteria Category 2: Program Organization

The organization and features of the instructional materials support instruction and learning of the standards.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #2.1: Grades 1–6, TE, Unit Structure, pp. xviii–xxxvii. The Program Overview includes an organizational structure that provides logic and coherence to facilitate efficient and effective teaching and learning.
  + Criterion #2.2: Grades 1–6, TE, Unit Structure, pp. xviii–xxxvii; Student Book Index, p. R3; Grade Overview, p. R6–R11; Strategies for Assessment, p. R34–R35; English Glossary, p. R56–R61; Spanish Glossary, p. R62–R67. The program resources include tables of contents, indexes, resources, and support materials to help administrators, teachers, parents, guardians, and students navigate the program.
  + Criterion #2.4: Grades 1–6, TE, Unit 1 Planning Guide, pp. 1A–1B. Each chapter, at all grade levels (pp. A–E that parallels the unit page number in SE) (e.g., TE/SE Grade 6, p. 92), includes an overview of the content in each unit that outlines the concepts, processes and skills to be developed.
  + Criterion #2.8: Grades 1–6, TE, Unit 1 Introduction: Teach Through Inquiry, pp. 1E and 2; Program Overview: Structure of the Program: Continuity and Variety within Each Grade Level, p. R5; Art in the Total Curriculum, p. R43. Content provides a structure that builds on knowledge and skills across grade levels.

#### Criteria Category 3: Assessment

The instructional materials provide teachers with assistance in using assessments for planning instruction and monitoring student progress toward mastering the content.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #3.2: Grades 1–6, TE, Unit Structure (Close/Assess/Studio Evaluation Criteria/Quick Question Review/Assessment Rubric/Unit Review), pp. xxv–xxxvii; Strategies for Assessment, pp. R34–R35. Formative and summative assessments are provided throughout all grade levels and units of study.
  + Criterion #3.4: Grade 4, TE, 2.9 Zoetrope Toys: Moving Pictures: Teach through Inquiry/Assess/Assessment Rubric/Close, pp. 54–57. The program contains opportunities to measure student application of arts concepts, principles and processes through student observation/response, sketching/planning, experimenting, evaluating and revision.
  + Criterion #3.5: Grades 1–6, TE, Helping Students Learn, pp. R32–R33; Strategies for Assessment, pp. R34–R35; Guiding Responses to Art, pp. R36–R37. The instructional materials include a range of supports and strategies for the educator in determining where the student is in their work and how to guide them further as well as match to the rubric/assignment criteria.
  + Criterion #3.6: Grades 1–6, TE, Differentiated Instruction, pp. R20–R23. Differentiated instruction strategies are included throughout all TEs to meet the diverse needs of all learners.

#### Criteria Category 4: Access and Equity

Program materials ensure universal and equitable access to high-quality curriculum and instruction for all students andprovide teachers with suggestions for differentiation for students with special needs.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #4.1: Grades 1–6: TE: Program Overview: Structure of the Program: Student Centered Teaching Strategies, p. R5; Differentiated Instruction, pp. R20–R23; Teaching Art with a Global Perspective, p. R38. This program is appropriate for use with all students and includes a strategies for differentiated instruction to meet access and equity criteria.
  + Criterion #4.2: Grades 1–6: TE: Choice in the Elementary Classroom, p. R13; Visual Literacy, pp. R16–R17; Design Thinking for Visual Art Teachers, pp. R18–R19; Differentiated Instruction, pp. R20–R23; Helping Students Learn, pp. R32–R33; Bibliography, pp. R54–R55. The program cites current and confirmed research for adapting the curriculum and the instruction to meet the instructional needs of the students.
  + Criterion #4.6: Grades 1–6: TE: Visual Literacy, pp. R16–R17; Helping Students Learn, pp. R32–R33; Guiding Response to Art, pp. R36–R37. English/language arts, the writing process, and reading comprehension strategies are identified throughout the grade levels in the TEs to support all students.
  + Criterion #4.7: Grades 1–6: TE: Using a Research Journal in the Art Room, pp. R14–R15. Differentiated instruction provided throughout the program and lessons allows and guides students to go deeper into their investigations and explorations.

#### Criteria Category 5: Instructional Planning and Support

The instructional materials containa clear road map for teachers to follow when planning instruction and are designed to help teachers provide effective standards-based instruction and ensure opportunities for all students to learn the essential skills and knowledge specified in the standards.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #5.1: Grades 1–6, TE, Unit 1 Planning Guide, pp. 1A–1B; Unit 2 Planning Guide, pp. 31A–31B; Unit 3 Planning Guide, pp. 61A–61B; Unit 4 Planning Guide, pp. 91A–91B; Unit 5 Planning Guide, pp. 121A–121B; Unit 6 Planning Guide, pp. 151A–151B; Grade Overview, pp. R6–R11; Art Materials and Supplies, pp. R52–R53. The program provide lesson plans that provide an effective learning progression, suggestions for organizing resources in the classroom, and strategies to guide teachers in pacing lessons.
  + Criterion #5.3: Grades 1–6, TE, Differentiated Instruction: Knowing and Respecting Your Students, p. R21; Helping Students Learn, pp. R32–R33; The resources provide a variety of instructional strategies to accommodate learning modalities.
  + Criterion #5.4: Grades 1–6, TE, Unit 1 Cross Curricular Connections, p. 1D; Unit 2 Cross Curricular Connections, p. 31D; Unit 3 Cross Curricular Connections, p. 61D; Unit 4 Cross Curricular Connections, p. 91D; Unit 5 Cross Curricular Connections, p. 121D; Unit 6 Cross Curricular Connections, p. 151D; Visual Literacy p. R16–R17; Art in the Total Curriculum, p. R43. The program provides opportunities for teachers to implement interdisciplinary instruction with the appropriate grade level and grade span.
  + Criterion #5.5: Grades 1–6, TE, Unit 1 Resources: Digital Fine Art Images, p. 1C; Unit 2 Resources: Digital Fine Art Images, p. 31C; Unit 3 Resources: Digital Fine Art Images, p. 61C; Unit 4 Resources: Digital Fine Art Images, p. 91C; Unit 5 Resources: Digital Fine Art Images, p. 121C; Unit 6 Resources: Digital Fine Art Images, p. 151C; The program includes multimedia resources for use in association with a unit of study.
  + Criterion #5.13: Grades 1–6, SE, Art Safety, pp. 182–183; TE (all grade levels): Guiding Explorations in Art: Extending the Learning Process: Safety in the Art Class, p. R25. The program guidelines to create an environment for safe physical performances.
  + Criterion #5.14: Grades 1–6, TE, Using a Research Journal in the Art Room, p. R14–R15. The program provides opportunities for both students and teachers to use supportive tools for use in multiple art environments.

#### Edits and Corrections:

The following edits and corrections must be made as a condition of adoption:

| # | Grade level | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for edit |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | 1 | TE | R8 | Unit 3 Colorful Stories  *How do we tell stories* | Unit 3 Colorful Stories  *How do we tell stories?* | *“?” makes heading consistent with others similar in program* |

#### Social Content Citations:

The panel found no social content violations.

## Basic Instructional Materials: Music Programs

### OpusYou, Inc., *OpusYou Learning*, Grades K–8

#### Program Summary:

OpusYou Learning includes the following: *Student Edition (SE)*; *Teacher Edition (TE); Lesson Preparation (LP);* *Planning and Assessment Support* (*PAS); Grade Overviews (GO); Self-Assessment (SA); Record of Learning and Listen (RL); Respond Guide (RG)*

#### Recommendation:

*OpusYou Learning* is not recommended for adoption because the instructional materials do not include content as specified in the *California Arts Standards for California Public Schools, Prekindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Arts Standards*), and do not meet all the criteria in category 1 or show strengths in categories 2, 4, and 5.

#### Criteria Category 1: Arts Education Content/Alignment with Standards

The program does not support instruction designed to ensure that students master all the *Arts Standards* for the intended grade level(s), and does not meet all of the evaluation criteria in category 1.

##### Citations:

Criteria Category 1, criterion #1: Standards Not Met:

* + Kindergarten
    - K.MU:Cr3.1a: (PAS) The Kindergarten Teacher Assessment Guide and Log advises teachers to “revisit” as students apply personal, peer, and teacher feedback, but provides no guidance on specific examples to revisit, and the provided prompts for personal feedback are not related to Creating. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/K-assessment>
    - K.MU:Pr5a: (PAS) Prompts in the assessment guide, such as “rehearse and refine,” do not specify when or by whom the prompts should be used. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/K-assessment>
    - K.MU:Pr5b: (LP) The program lacks strategies for students to improve expressive qualities for rehearsal. [https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/kmupr5b-teplan1](https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/kmupr5b-teplan1" \o "Kindergarten Week 5: Eency Weency Spider)
    - K.MU:Pr6b: (LP) Opportunities to demonstrate performance decorum are not included. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/kmupr6b-teplan1>
    - K.MU:Re8: (LP) The program misses opportunities for students to demonstrate awareness of “creators’ and performers’ expressive intent,” as called for in the standard. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/kmure8-teplan1>
    - K.MU:Cn10: (LP) Prompts do not include access to students' personal interests in connection to creating and performing. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/kmucn10-teplan1>
    - K.MU:Cn11: (LP) Activities lack opportunities for students to share personal interests and connections once they have been taught about the cultural context. ~~https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resources/194622~~ [preceding link is no longer valid]
  + Grade 1
    - 1.MU:Cr1b: (LP) The lesson does not provide opportunities for students to create in minor, though the standard calls for students to generate musical ideas in multiple tonalities. Unit 3 Understanding the Music document calls for students to create in minor, but it is not present in the Understanding the Music teaching video. <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resources/190193>
    - 1.MU:Cr2a: (TE & LP) After selecting musical ideas (e.g., when improvisation and composition in Unit 2 Week 1 lesson), students are not invited to “discuss personal reasons for selecting musical ideas that represent expressive intent,” for which the standard calls. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/1mucr2a-teteach1>
    - 1.MU:Pr5a: (PAS) Assessment guides and lesson plans lack explicit detail as to who will be providing the feedback during “rehearsing,” and there are no questioning prompts to provide the “limited guidance” outlined by the standard. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/1-assessment>
    - 1.MU:Pr5b: (LP) The assessment guides and lesson plans do not identify the interpretive qualities that will be rehearsed, as specified in the *Arts Standards*, and lack questioning prompts to provide the “limited guidance” required for the standard. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/1mupr5b-teplan2>
    - 1.MU:Pr6b: (LP) The program provides limited to no attention to audience etiquette. An example of this is the Perform and Share section of the lesson plan for Unit 2 Week 4. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/1mupr6b-teplan1>
    - 1.MU:Re7.1: (LP) After stating personal interests (through questions like, “Do you like the music?” in the Listen and Respond section of the lesson), students have no opportunities to connect those interests to musical selection (of music heard). <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/1mure71-teplan1>
    - 1.MU:Re7.2a: (LP) After identifying and demonstrating music concepts (such as beat in the Respond section of the lesson), students are not provided opportunities to explore connections to the music’s purpose. Rather, connections are prescribed by the publisher. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/1mure72-teteach2>
    - 1.MU:Re8: (LP) The program lacks opportunities for students to connect expressive qualities (such as the style question in the Respond section of the lesson) to “creators’ and performers’ expressive intent” as called for in the standard. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/1mure8-teteach1>
    - 1.MU:Re9: (PAS) The program does not provide guidance for students to connect evaluation to their own expressive preferences or evaluate music “for specific purposes,” only discuss “what you enjoyed and what you think could have been better.” Strategies for eliciting student exploration using limited guidance are not provided. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/1-assessment>
    - 1.MU:Cn10: (LP) The program lacks opportunities for students to demonstrate personal interests beyond, “Do you like the music” (Responding). None exist for Performing or Creating. Overall, the program provides no means by which students can, with limited guidance, discuss how personal interests connect to creating, performing, and responding to music. ~~https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/1mure71-teplan1~~ [the preceding link is no longer valid]
    - 1.MU:Cn11: (LP) The program does not provide guidance for students to discuss or individually make cultural connections once they have been taught about the cultural context. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/1mucn11-teteach1>
  + Grade 2
    - 2.MU:Cr2a: (TE) The TE lacks prompts to provide students an opportunity to explain personal reasons for selecting that pattern or idea. <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/opus_you_lesson_plans/2nd%20Grade/Unit%201/4%20-%20Lets%20Work%20It%20Out%20Together/Lesson%20Plans/G2%20U1%20W4%20Core%20Learning%20-%20Lets%20Work%20It%20Out%20Together.pdf>
    - 2.MU:Cr3.1a (PAS): Peer assessment and/or teacher feedback are not included in the assessment options. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/2-assessment>
    - 2.MU:Pr4.1: (LP) Students are not asked to demonstrate or explain personal interest in, or knowledge about musical selections <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353945-2nd-grade/1353951-how-does-music-connect-us-with-our-planet/lessons/504878-core-learning?resource_id=194423>
    - 2.MU:Pr4.3: (LP) The program did not provide expressive markings for students to demonstrate, or prompts for conveying expressive intent. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/2mupr43-teplan2>
    - 2.MU:Pr5a: (PAS) The program lacks criteria for the intended results of accuracy, expressiveness, and effectiveness. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/2-assessment>
    - 2.MU:Pr6b: (LP) Lessons provide no means by which students demonstrate performance decorum and audience etiquette. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/2mupr6b-teteach2>
    - 2.MU:Re7.1: (TE) Students lack opportunities to explain and demonstrate how personal interests and experiences influenced the purpose for that specific musical selection. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/2mure71-teteach1>
    - MU:Re7.2a: (LP) The program lacks opportunities for students to describe how specific music concepts are used to support a specific purpose in music. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/2mure72-teplan1>
    - 2.MU:Re8: (LP) The program lacks opportunities for students to describe how expressive qualities support creators’ and performers’ expressive intent. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/2mure8-teplan1>
    - 2.MU:Re9: (LP) There are missed opportunities for students to apply personal preferences in the evaluation of music for specific purposes, such as a lullaby, a march, etc. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/2mure9-teplan1>
    - 2.MU:Cn10: (TE) The questions posed in the “Did You Know” section may target student personal interests and experiences, but statements do not connect to the creating and performing of the music. The questions in the program are: “In how many languages do you know how to say, ‘Hello’?” “In the song, why do you think the sun says, ‘Hello’ and the moon says ‘Goodbye’?” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/2mucn10-teteach1>
  + Grade 3
    - 3.MU:Cr3.1a: (PAS) Students are not provided with examples of collaboratively developed criteria. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/3-assessment>
    - 3.MU:Cr3.2: (LP/TE) Lessons lack examples of connection to expressive intent. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/3mucr32-teplan1>
    - 3.MU:Pr4.3: (LP/TE) The program misses opportunities for students to “describe how intent is conveyed through expressive qualities.” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/3mupr43-teplan1>
    - 3.MU:Pr5a: (PAS) Students are not given the opportunity to collaboratively develop criteria. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/3-assessment>
    - 3.MU:Pr6b: (LP/TE) Students are not given examples for addressing the concept of performance decorum and audience etiquette. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/3mupr6b-teplan1>
    - 3.MU:Re8: (LP/TE) Lessons for songs such as “Hoedown” do not include a task for students to explain “how performers’ personal interpretations use expressive qualities to reflect creators’ expressive intent.” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/3mure8-teplan1>
    - 3.MU:Re9: (LP/TE) Students do not have the opportunity to apply established criteria, and describe appropriateness to the context. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/3mure8-teplan1> <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/3mure9-teplan1>
    - 3.MU:Cn10 (LP/TE) Program lacks opportunities for students to “demonstrate how personal interests, experiences, and ideas relate to creating, performing, and responding to music.” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/3mucn10-teplan1>
  + Grade 4
    - 4.MU:Cr1a: (LP/TE) “Look into the Night” provides no opportunity for students to explain “connection to specific purpose and context (such as social and cultural).” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mucr2a-teplan1>
    - 4.MU:Cr2a: (LP/TE) “Look into the Night” includes no opportunity for students to select and organize musical ideas and explain connection to purpose and context. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mucr2a-teplan1>
    - 4.MU:Cr3.1a: (PAS) There is not sufficient language in the Assessment Guide and Log to instruct the teacher to document revisions of personal music, nor is there a tool or space on the assessment log to document revisions of personal music. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4-assessment>
    - 4.MU:Cr3.2: (LP/TE) In “I Like My School” and other examples provided, examples do not include “personal created music,” as the standard states. The lessons provided do not contain clear language for students to explain a connection to their expressive intent. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mucr32-teplan1>
    - 4.MU:Pr4.3: (LP/TE) The portion of this standard to “demonstrate and explain how intent is conveyed” is not achieved through the activity in “De Colores.” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mupr43-teplan1>
    - 4.MU:Pr5a: (PAS) The program lacks examples of criteria the teacher will use to evaluate “accuracy and expressiveness…of performances” or reference to a rubric in the Teacher Assessment Guide and Log. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4-assessment>
    - 4.MU:Pr5b (LP/TE) Sheet music included across the grade level does have notation for students to play, and the “Whole Song with Score” format in lessons such as “Home On The Range” can support students refining technical accuracy at the discretion of the teacher. However, the sheet music has insufficient dynamic markings or clear rehearsal processes for students to refine expressive qualities. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mupr5b-teplan1>
    - 4.MU:Pr6a: (LP/TE) “Do You Ever Wonder” includes language stating that students should understand the emotion/feeling /intent of the song and explain it to the class or each other and to present a holistic performance with some understanding of the musical, cultural, historical contexts. However, this language is not sufficiently clearly aligned with “music with expression, technical accuracy, and appropriate interpretation” as the standard requires. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mupr6a-teplan1>
    - 4.MU:Pr6b: (SE) “El Borrego” and other performance-week lesson plans include very few “specific behaviors to be implemented or avoided” regarding “performance decorum,” and none are included about “audience etiquette.” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mupr6b-teteach1>
    - 4.MU:Re8: (LP/TE) The program lacks specific ways for students to show the connection with expressive qualities to “reflect creators’ expressive intent” in lessons such as [“Happy To Be Me.”](https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mure8-teplan1) <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mure8-teplan1>
    - 4.MU:Re9: (PAS) Resources such as the Teacher Assessment Guide and Log does not include sufficient criteria for students to “evaluate musical works and performances” or to “explain appropriateness to the context.” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4-assessment>
    - 4.MU:Cn10: (LP/TE) The prompts for students in “A Bright Sunny Day” do not sufficiently support students to “describe and demonstrate student personal interest, experiences, ideas and knowledge” related to their improvisation, creating, and responding to the music. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mucn10-teplan1>
  + Grade 5
    - 5.MU:Cr1a: (TE) Lesson plans and student slides across the program do not address the second half of the standard to “explain connection to specific purpose and context.”
      * “La Bamba” <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354002-5th-grade/1354004-how-does-music-connect-us-with-our-past/lessons/504413-core-learning/planning>
      * “Down By the Riverside” <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354002-5th-grade/1354007-how-does-music-shape-our-way-of-life/lessons/504447-core-learning/planning>
    - 5.MU:Cr3.1a: (PAS) The Grade 5 Assessment chart cited by the publisher does not include “teacher-provided...criteria.” Lessons guide students to “refine and document” personal music but not to “explain rationale for changes” or receive teacher feedback. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/5-assessment>
      * “Simple Gifts” <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354002-5th-grade/1354006-how-does-music-teach-us-about-our-community/lessons/504437-core-learning/planning>
    - 5.MU:Pr4.3: (SE) Lessons such as “Danny Boy” do not include sufficient mention of students explaining “interpretive decisions and expressive qualities.” Relevant vocabulary is present in the “Understanding Music” sections but the program provides no opportunities for students to utilize vocabulary to illustrate understanding. When learning or performing songs, the (TE) Lead sheets and (SE) melodic PDFs include insufficient markings (dynamics, articulations, etc.) for the students or teacher *to* interpret or express.
      * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354002-5th-grade/1354003-how-does-music-bring-us-together/lessons/504397-core-learning/planning>
      * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/opus_you_sheet_music/5th%20Grade/Unit%201/2%20-%20Danny%20Boy/Lead%20Sheets/Danny%20Boy%20-%20Melody%20Lyrics%20and%20Chords.pdf>
      * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/opus_you_lesson_plans/5th%20Grade/Unit%201/1%20-%20Do%20What%20You%20Want%20To/Lesson%20Plans/G5%20U1%20Understanding%20Music.pdf>
    - 5.MU:Pr5a: (PAS) Similar to the rationale in Cr3.1a, the assessment chart cited by the publisher does not include “teacher-provided and established criteria to evaluate the accuracy and expressiveness of...performances.” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/5-assessment>
    - 5.MU:Pr6b: (TE) The provided lessons offer no expectations for 5.students to demonstrate protocols for “audience etiquette.” For example, Gr5Un6Wk2 “Our Beautiful Planet.” <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/opus_you_lesson_plans/5th%20Grade/Unit%206/2%20-%20Our%20Beautiful%20Planet/Lesson%20Plans/G5%20U6%20W2%20Core%20Learning%20-%20Our%20Beautiful%20Planet.pdf>
    - 5.MU:Re7.2a: (TE) In lessons such as “I’m On My Way” there is not an explicit opportunity for students to “explain” how “responses to music are informed by the structure, the use of the elements of music, and context.” <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354002-5th-grade/1354008-how-does-music-connect-us-with-the-environment/lessons/504461-core-learning/planning>
    - 5.MU:Re8: (TE) Multiple lessons, such as “Let the Melting Pot Melt,” lack opportunities for students to explicitly connect the identified expressive qualities to “‘performers’ personal interpretations” or ‘creators’ expressive intent.” <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354002-5th-grade/1354005-how-does-music-make-the-world-a-better-place/lessons/504423-core-learning/planning>
    - 5.MU:Re9: (PAS) The assessment chart cited by the publisher does not include sufficient criteria to “evaluate musical works and performances” or to “explain appropriateness to the context.” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/5-assessment>
  + Grade 6
    - 6.MU:Cr1a: (TE) The program lacked evidence for ways students can generate harmonic phrases or convey expressive intent, as in Creative Project Plan - Create: Compose. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-5-teachers-project-plan>
    - 6.MU:Pr4.2c: (TE) The program lacked evidence of a process for students to identify personal, social, cultural, and historical context to inform performances as indicated in the Standard. The brief summary provides no guidance for teachers and students to address that part of the standard. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8-standards-approach>
    - 6.MU:Pr5a: (TE) The program did not indicate a process to guide students to determine when a piece is ready to perform. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8-standards-approach>
    - 6.MU:Pr6b: (TE) The program did not provide evidence of a process for students to demonstrate audience etiquette appropriate for a particular venue and purpose as indicated in the standards. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8-standards-approach>
    - 6.MU:Re7.1: (TE) The program notes songs are “specially selected” by the teacher, missing opportunities to provide guidance for students to select music and describe connections to specific interests or experiences for a specific purpose as indicated in the *Arts Standards*. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8-standards-approach>
  + Grade 7
    - 7.MU:Cr1a: (TE) Throughout the grade level, lessons do not meet the portion of the standard related to musical elements such as harmonic accompaniment and expressive intent. One example is in the Project Breakdown section of the plan: <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/7-6-project-plan>
    - 7.MU:Cr2a: (TE) The TE does not address grade-level musical elements stated in the standard related to form (AB, ABA, theme and variation), and expressive intent. For example, the “Musical Building Blocks” document describes melodic and harmonic concepts but not Form or expressive markings. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8/gr7-building-blocks>
    - 7.MU:Pr5a: (LP) Across the grade level, the program lacked opportunities for “identifying and applying collaboratively developed criteria” or “determining when music is ready to perform.” The Unit 3 Creative Project Plan includes steps to prepare for performance, includes no criteria or determination for how the steps impact performance. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/7-3-project-plan>
    - 7.MU:Pr6b: (TE) Across the grade level this does not meet the Standard as it did not demonstrate evidence of audience etiquette. One example is in the Perform and Evaluate section of the following example: <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8-standards-approach>
    - 7.MU:Re7.1: (TE) The breadth of the standard was not met across grade 7, missing guidance for “selecting contrasting music to listen to” and “comparing the connections to specific interests and experiences.” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8-standards-approach>
    - 7.MU:Re7.2a: (TE) The program did not meet the breadth of the grade-level standard throughout the program; minimal evidence that students are “classifying and explaining how musical elements and expressive qualities relate to structure of contrasting pieces.” Students are not given an opportunity to classify, explain how musical elements and expressive qualities relate to structure in contrasting pieces as shown in the Lesson Content and Activities section of the following example: <https://www.opusyou.com/>
  + Grade 8
  + 8.MU:Cr1a: (TE) The program misses opportunities to provide guidance for teachers to support student generation of rhythmic, melodic, and harmonic phrases and harmonic accompaniments within expanded forms(including introductions, transitions, and codas), or any directive on how to meet this standard. <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/8/Musical%20Building%20Blocks%20Guide.pdf>
  + 8.MU:Cr2a: (TE) The program did not provide opportunities for students to experience the full breadth of the standard.
    - * Approach to Standards at Grades 6–8 <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/6/Approach%20to%20Standards%20at%20Grades%206-8.pdf>

<https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/8/Unit%204/Unit%204%20Creative%20Project%20Plan.pdf>

* + - * Unit 4 Creative Project Plan <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/8/Musical%20Building%20Blocks%20Guide.pdf>
  + 8.MU:Cr3.2: (TE) There are no opportunities for the application of “compositional techniques.”
    - * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/6/Approach%20to%20Standards%20at%20Grades%206-8.pdf>
      * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/8/Musical%20Building%20Blocks%20Guide.pdf>
  + 8.MU:Pr4.2a: (TE) The program misses chances for students to perform key actions, "compare" and "explain," when engaged in this strand.
    - * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/6/Approach%20to%20Standards%20at%20Grades%206-8.pdf>
      * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/8/Musical%20Building%20Blocks%20Guide.pdf>
      * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/8/Unit%205/Unit%205%20Creative%20Project%20Plan.pdf>
  + 8.MU:Pr4.2b: (TE) The program does not show evidence of sight reading in various clefs. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8-standards-approach>
  + 8.MU:Pr4.3: (TE) The program does not contain sufficient performance or explanation of contrasting pieces.
    - * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/6/Approach%20to%20Standards%20at%20Grades%206-8.pdf>
      * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/8/Musical%20Building%20Blocks%20Guide.pdf>
      * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/8/Unit%206/Unit%206%20Creative%20Project%20Plan.pdf>
      * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/8/Unit%206/Unit%206%20Creative%20Project%20Plan.pdf>
  + 8.MU:Pr5a: (TE) The program does not provide evidence of identifying and personally applying developed criteria or determining when music is ready to perform.
    - * <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8/gr8-building-blocks>
      * <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8-standards-approach>
  + 8.MU:Pr6b: (TE) The program does not provide guidance for etiquette and decorum, including the rationale for and exemplifying of specific behaviors in a variety of music contexts.
    - * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/6/Approach%20to%20Standards%20at%20Grades%206-8.pdf>
      * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/8/Musical%20Building%20Blocks%20Guide.pdf>
      * <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/8/Unit%203/Unit%203%20Creative%20Project%20Plan.pdf>
  + 8.MU:Re7.1: (TE) Limited evidence to support teaching the breadth of the standard, including missed opportunities for students to select programs of music and the connections to specific interests and experiences. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8-standards-approach>
  + 8.MU:Re7.2a: (TE) Few to no opportunities for students are comparing and explaining how musical elements and expressive qualities relate to structure within programs of music. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8-standards-approach>
* Criterion #1.2: (TE) In Grade 1, Unit 3 Week 3, guides teachers to present a song to perform but the lesson does not provide opportunities for students to create their own music, as stipulated by the *Arts Education Framework*. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/2-1-10>
* Criterion #1.3: (PAS/TE) Instructional materials do not include instructional strategies that incorporate skill development and authentic, sequential, discipline-specific learning in all four processes.
  + Grade 3 Musical Progression <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/1-3-5>
  + Musical Building Blocks (grades 6–8) <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/7/Musical%20Building%20Blocks%20Guide.pdf>
* Criterion #1.6: (TE) Instructional materials lack culturally- and linguistically-responsive activities for engaging students in the arts process through the study of historical, contemporary and multicultural artistic concepts and the lives, contributions and innovations of various artists and arts movements.
  + Grade K, Unit 3, Week 4: The “Did You Know” tab uses “e.g.,” a term Kindergarten students are not expected to know or understand. <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resources/193593>
  + Grade 2, Unit 2, Week 6: (“Yo Tenga Una Casita” does not have Spanish song lyrics translated or described in lyrics sheets or “Listen and Respond” sections of the slides) <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353945-2nd-grade/1353948-how-does-music-help-to-make-the-world-a-better-place/lessons/504852-core-learning>
  + Grade 5, Unit 3, Week 6: (“El Sombrero Blanco” does not have Spanish song lyrics translated or described in lyrics sheets or “Listen and Respond” sections of the slides) <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resources/192811>
* Criterion #1.7: (TE) In grades K-3, there was not an opportunity to study the connections among the arts disciplines to support development in the designated performance standards for dance, media arts, music, theatre, and the visual arts at various grade levels.
  + Kindergarten lesson example provides no arts connections: <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/1-7-1>
  + Grade 3 lesson example provides no arts connections: <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/1-7-3>
* Criterion #1.8: (LP, TE) The instructional materials did not include clear procedures and explanations of underlying concepts, artistic processes, language, and theories integral to and supportive of the teaching and learning of arts. An example of this can be found in the lesson plan for Grade 2, Unit 5, week 1. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/1-8-1>
* Criterion #1.9: (GO) Grade 8 does not include any materials for examining humanity’s place in ecological systems and the necessity for the protection of the environment to satisfy this criterion. See Overview, which lists all lessons in the grade level: <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354023-8th-grade>

#### Criteria Category 2: Program Organization

The organization and features of the instructional materials do not supportinstruction and learning of the standards.

##### Citations:

* Criterion #2.1: (GO/TE/LP) The organizational structure does not provide a logical, efficient, and effective method of teaching and learning within the discipline specific unit, lesson and grade level. Specifically, lesson plans do not cohere to the given scope and sequence.
  + - The scope and sequence requires a focus on the strong beat in Grade 2.  
      <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/2-1-3>
    - The concept of strong beat is missing from the lesson plan in Grade 2 Unit 6, Week 3, “The Other Side of the Moon.” <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/opus_you_lesson_plans/2nd%20Grade/Unit%206/3%20-%20The%20Other%20Side%20Of%20The%20Moon/Lesson%20Plans/G2%20U6%20W3%20Core%20Learning%20-%20The%20Other%20Side%20Of%20The%20Moon.pdf>
* Criterion #2.6: (LP) Support materials are not clearly aligned with the Arts Standards in many grade levels. These examples show the standards stated in the lesson plan but are not addressed.
  + - Grade 1: MU:Pr5b Interpretive qualities not addressed in the lesson <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353938-1st-grade/1353943-how-does-music-make-us-happy/lessons/505041-core-learning/planning>
    - Grade 3: MU:Re9 Requirements for established criteria not included  
      <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/3mure9-teplan1>
    - Grade 6: MU:Pr4c Process for students to identify personal, social, cultural, and historical context to inform performances not included. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/6-8-standards-approach>
* Criterion #2.7: (PAS) The program doesn’t provide opportunities for students or teachers to achieve proficiency at grade-level. Students may master certain skills, but are not provided with opportunities to meet all grade-level standards.
  + - Grade K–2 Teacher Assessment Guide: <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/3-3-5>
    - Grade 3–5 Teacher Assessment Guide: <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/3-3-6>
    - Grade 6–8 Teacher Assessment Guide: <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/3-3-7>
* Criterion #2.8: (TE/GO) The structures provided, such as grade-level Musical Progressions and Scope and Sequence documents, do not explicitly connect the skills and concepts with the artistic processes. Some of the skills from the standards are missing from the Scope and Sequences entirely (such as Pr6b: performance decorum and audience etiquette), and there are no Enduring Understandings or Essential Questions from the *Arts Standards* that would increase rigor across grade levels. The Scope and Sequence documents are not accurately reflected in lesson plans.
  + - (TE) Scope and Sequence: Skills<https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/2-8-10>
    - (TE) Scope and Sequence: Concepts <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/2-8-11>

#### Criteria Category 3: Assessment

The instructional materials provide teachers with assistance in using assessments for planning instruction and monitoring student progress toward mastering the content.

##### Citations:

* Criterion #3.1: (SE, TE) Each grade level’s assessment resources include a Baseline Theory Quiz at the beginning of the year which teachers may use as a diagnostic tool (see slide 1 at “The Song of Hiawatha”). <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354016-7th-grade/1354017-my-place-in-the-world/lessons/505996-core-learning>
* Criterion #3.2: (TE) The assessment resources include a grade-span Assessment Guide and grade-level Teacher Assessment Guide and Log describing various assessment types during (formative) and at the end of units (summative).
  + - Grades 3–5  
      <https://www.opusyou.com/>
    - Grade 8  
      <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/file/download?digilearning_support_file_id=56689>
  + Criterion #3.3: (TE, SE, LP) Each unit includes several measures to evaluate individual student progress. These measures include
    - Grade 4 composition tasks using the Music Notepad app <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/3-3-1>
    - Grade 4 end-of-Unit quizzes  
      <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/3-3-3>
    - Grade 4 end-of-grade quizzes  
      <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/3-3-4>
  + Criterion #3.5: (PAS) There are multiple assessment types to evaluate student learning. The grade-span Assessment Guides (K–2, Grade 3–5, Grade 6–8) give an overview of formative and summative assessment opportunities in broad strokes. The Teacher Assessment Guide for each grade level provides guidance in and criteria for assessing performances. In primary grades, this guide also addresses separate assessment of Creating, Responding, and Connecting.
    - Grades K–2 Assessment Guide <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/3-5-1>
    - Grades 3–5 Assessment Guide <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/3-3-6>
    - Grades 6–8 Assessment Guide <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/2-2-4>
    - Grade 3 Teacher Assessment Guide and Log <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/3-4-1>
  + Criterion #3.7: (LP) Listen and Respond activities in each lesson include open and closed questions that help monitor student understanding of the arts, such as identifying musical concepts and expressive qualities.
    - Grade 3 Unit 3 Week 3 contains Listen and Respond guiding questions.  
      <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/3-7-1>

#### Criteria Category 4: Access and Equity

Program materials do not ensure universal and equitable access to high-quality curriculum and instruction for all students and do not provide teachers with suggestions for differentiation for students with special needs.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #4.1: (TE) Grades 6–8 program materials did not demonstrate accessibility by “appropriate for use with all students,” specifically English learners. The Access and Equity material specifically describes the program’s philosophy of “minimizing the need for spoken and written English in our lessons” and describes how the program “supports ‘Flipped Learning,’” both of which contrast the recommendations outlined in the *ELD Standards* to best meet the needs of students who are English learners.  
    <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/4-1-1>
  + Criterion #4.3: (TE) In grades 4-8, the program did not demonstrate “comprehensive teacher guidance and differentiation strategies... to adapt instructions to meet students’ identified special needs and to provide effective, efficient, instruction for all students.” The program misses opportunities to address English learners, and despite including captioning for improved access, does not meet the full breadth of the criteria. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/4-3-5>

Additionally, the program did not include citations of “current and confirmed research.”

* + Criterion #4.4: (TE) In grades 4–8, the program did not demonstrate “strategies for English Learners that are consistent with the California English Language Development Standards.” Specifically, the program does not demonstrate non-designated time, frequent meaningful interactions, and appropriate teaching approaches for English learners. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/4-3-5>
  + Criterion #4.6: (TE) In grades 4–8, the program did not provide additional support “to help students who are below grade level…in academic English to understand the Arts content.” The provided scaffold does not provide sufficient support to best meet the needs of these students. <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353952-3rd-grade/1353974-how-does-music-teach-us-about-our-community/lessons/499985-core-learning?resource_id=188995>

#### Criteria Category 5: Instructional Planning and Support

The instructional materials do not contain a clear road map for teachers to follow when planning instruction and are not designed to help teachers provide effective standards-based instruction and ensure opportunities for all students to learn the essential skills and knowledge specified in the standards.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #5.3: (TE) In grades 4–8, there is not a sufficient variety of pedagogical strategies (such as Orff, Gordon, etc.) and instructional strategies.  
    <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/5-3-1>
  + Criterion #5.4: (TE) In grades 4–5, Cross-Curricular Links documents provide insufficient “suggestions for connecting Arts education concepts with other areas of the curriculum.” In most lesson plans, the Listen & Respond sections list those connections as extended-learning points not main points. There are also few “examples of interdisciplinary (across the five Arts disciplines) instruction” in lessons, aside from occasional Dance references.  
    <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/opus_you_lesson_plans/5th%20Grade/Unit%205/3%20-%20Down%20By%20The%20Riverside/Lesson%20Plans/G5%20U5%20W3%20Core%20Learning%20-%20Down%20By%20The%20Riverside.pdf>
  + Criterion #5.9: (TE) In grades 6–8, the “discipline-specific arts content” in the [Musical Building Blocks Guide](https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/2-3-9) and the Music Theory Guide do not consistently include “clearly written and accurate explanations.” For example, key signatures and scales and rhythmic patterns do not consistently include definitions or include a model of the counting. <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/2-3-9>
  + Criterion #5.10: (TE) In grades 4–8, overview documents, there are no “clear procedures and explanations of underlying concepts, principles, and theories” in lessons to ensure “that performance skills are learned in the context of specific performance standards.” <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/5-11-2>
  + Criterion #5.11: (TE) The program provides no performance “guidelines” in grades 4 and 5 for student work and other works “focused on demonstrating the formal and informal artistic elements and principles.” In addition, there are no specific guidelines or rubrics to aid meaningful learning.  
    <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/5-11-2>
  + Criterion #5.13: (TE) The program misses opportunities to provide guidelines for the teacher or administrator to use or advocate “for a safe physical facility appropriate to the level of physical performance and training called for in the arts curriculum.” Teachers and administrators should have a reference point as they consider movement, instrument playing, and organization of resources to create an accessible learning environment in the Music classroom. In the “Music Is In My Soul” Lesson, guidelines are not present.  
    <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/5-13-1>
  + Criterion #5.14: (TE) The program provides no evidence supporting the “implementation” and use of “general or specialized facilities,” including how to address any issues for various school facilities and “a range of school resources.”  
    <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/artscriteria/5-14-1>

#### Edits and Corrections:

The panel recommends the following edits and corrections:

| # | Grade level | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for edit |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | 6–8 | Musical Building Blocks Guide | 2 | [image of G Major scale] | Adjust the spacing so the text line “G Major” from page 1 can be on the same page as the actual G-Major scale on p. 2. | Page 2 contains no label for the scale because it’s back at the end of page 1. |
| 2 | 6–8 | Musical Building Blocks Guide | 12 | [image of treble clef staff] | Adjust the spacing so the text line about the “treble clef” from page 11 can be on the same page as the actual treble clef staff on page 12. | If you are looking at page 12, it appears there is no label for the clef/staff because it’s back at the end of page 11. |
| 3 | All | Criterion 4.3  Access & Equity  <https://cdn.charanga.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Access%20and%20Equity.pdf> | Throughout | Throughout | Need to include current and confirmed research. Websites to national organizations are good but please include citations of research studies/ books to support your statements in this document. Some suggestions pertaining to multiple learning styles, UDL, and students with special needs and exceptionalities are below.  -Universal Design for Learning and the ArtsbyDon Glass; Anne Meyer; David Rose in *Harvard Educational Review* (2013) 83 (1): 98–119. | To meet the full breadth of Criterion 4.3, recognition and inclusion of current and confirmed research needs to be cited in the program documents. |
| 3 | All | (cont.) | (cont.) | (cont.) | -Multiple learning styles/modalities Barbe & Swassing, Howard  Gardner’s Multiple Intelligence etc. as cited in *Music in Childhood* by C. Scott Kassner & P. Campbell (2018).  -Music in Special Education (2018) by M. Adamek A. Darrow.  -Hammel, A. (2018). Amy and Drew: Two Children Who Helped Determine What Free Appropriate Public Education Means. *General Music Today Vol. 31(2)* 29–32. | (cont.) |
| 4 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence Skills | 8th Grade, page 1 | Rehearse and learn songs in specific musical styles. Listen and Response to a widening range of musical styles: Pop Disco Country Jazz Classical Rock Hip Hop Ragtime  Use songs in musical styles as models for composing | Students will:   * Rehearse, learn, listen, and respond to songs in specific musical styles (Pop Disco Country Jazz Classical Rock Hip Hop Ragtime) * Compose songs using the styles listed above as models | “Use songs in musical styles as models for composing” is not a complete sentence and needs a period. Multiple examples of incomplete sentences in the scope and sequence in all grade levels.  This was done much better in the document “Students - Welcome to 7th Grade.” |
| 5 | 6–8 | Musical Building Blocks Guide | Page 1 and throughout | All “major” and “minor” scales/chords are presented with lowercase “m”s | Write the names of “Major” chords with capital “M”s. | Chord charts and lead sheets use capital letters to denote Major chords, so labeling “A Major triad” in the guide would look clearer than “A major triad.” |
| 6 | 6–8 | Approach to Standards | 1 | From Grade 6, students complete six projects, building on what they have learned previously, and using a series of creative apps – including YuStudio, OpusYou Learning’s online music studio, to produce their own music. | From Grade 6, students complete six projects, building on what they have learned previously, and using a series of creative apps – including YuStudio, OpusYou Learning’s online music studio – to produce their own music. | The last five words of the sentence belong to the beginning of the sentence. The phrase within the dashes is an interruption. |
| 7 | 6–8 | Grades 6–8 Music Theory Guide | 1 | Staves:  Music is written on a ladder of five lines called a ‘stave’. When music is written down, it is placed on a stave. You can see that the stave has five lines… | Staff:  Music is written on a ladder of five lines called a ‘staff’. When music is written down, it is placed on a staff. You can see that the staff has five lines… | Use the American form of “staff” when used in the singular. |
| 8 | 6–8 | Grades 6–8 Music Theory Guide | 4 | 7/8 – 7 quarter notes in every measure:  9/8 – 9 quarter notes in every measure:  12/8 – 12 quarter notes in every measure: | 7/8 – 7 eighth notes in every measure:  9/8 – 9 eighth notes in every measure:  12/8 – 12 eighth notes in every measure: | Correct time signature definitions to use eighth notes instead of quarter notes. |
| 9 | 6–8 | Musical Building Blocks  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/6/Musical%20Building%20Blocks%20Guide.pdf> | 1 | Melodies are a sequence of notes that can be organized onto a stave. | Melodies are a sequence of notes that can be organized onto a staff. | Use the American form of “staff” when used in the singular. |
| 10 | 6–8 | Musical Building Blocks  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/6/Musical%20Building%20Blocks%20Guide.pdf> | 10 | Music is written on a ladder of five lines called a ‘stave’. When music is written down, it is placed on a stave. You can see that the stave has five lines: | Music is written on a ladder of five lines called a ‘staff’. When music is written down, it is placed on a staff. You can see that the staff has five lines: | Use the American form of “staff” when used in the singular. |
| 11 | 6–8 | Musical Building Blocks  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/6/Musical%20Building%20Blocks%20Guide.pdf> | 17 | Time Signature 12–8  The time signature in this piece is nine-eight. | Time Signature 12–8  The time signature in this piece is twelve-eight. | Matching the names of the time signature to be the same time signature. |
| 12 | 6–8 | Listen and Respond Connect (Connections Timeline) | New Orleans Jazz | **Melody** instruments including the clarinet, cornet; and trombone. | **Melody** instruments including the clarinet, cornet, and trombone. | Use a regular comma instead of a semi-colon, since it is a straightforward continuing list of items. |
| 13 | K–8 | Pedagogical Approach Guide  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Pedagogical%20Approach.pdf> | 1 | To prepare, students work through a series of musical activities where they acquire new, and enrich existing, musical knowledge and understanding.. | To prepare, students work through a series of musical activities where they acquire new, and enrich existing, musical knowledge and understanding. | Remove one of the two periods. |
| 14 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Concepts  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Concepts.pdf> | 3  (Design: Texture  Kindergarten) | Sing Togther | Sing Together | Correct the spelling of “together.” |
| 15 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Concepts  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Concepts.pdf> | 1–5 | There is no content for grades 7 and 8 | Is the same scope and sequence used for grades 6, 7, and 8? | There are no entries for Grades 7 and 8. |
| 16 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 1  (Singing, Grades 3–5) | Copy Sing 4 bar phrases based on doh ray me in C Major… | Copy Sing 4 bar phrases based on do re mi in C Major… | Use the correct Kodaly solfege syllable spelling instead of phonetic spelling. |
| 17 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 1  (Singing,  Grades 6–7) | Rn’B | R&B (or R ’n B) | Use accepted spellings of this musical style. |
| 18 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 2 | Listening Respond/Analyse | Listening Respond/Analyze | Use the American form of “analyze.” |
| 19 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 2  (Listening, Grades 3–4) | Recognise… | Recognize… | Use the American form of “recognize.” |
| 20 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 2  (Listening, Grades 3–5) | Identify 2/ 4, 3/ 4, and 4/4 metre | Identify 2/4, 3/4, and 4/4 meter | Use the American form of “meter.” Also correct spacing in time signatures in 3rd and 5th grades. |
| 21 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 2  (Listening, Grade 6) | * Rhythm & Blues * Film /Programme Music | * Rhythm & Blues * Film /Program Music | Use the American form of “program” and remove the empty bullet point. |
| 22 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 2  (Listening, Grade 7) | * Trad Jazz Techno, House, musicals, Native American music | * Trad Jazz * Techno * House * Musicals * Native American music | Give each musical style its own bullet point to align with similar formatting across grade levels. |
| 23 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 3  (Playing Instruments, Grades 3–5) | Rehearse and learn in time with a steady beat in a metre of 2, 3, or 4 beats | Rehearse and learn in time with a steady beat in a meter of 2, 3, or 4 beats | Use the American form of “meter.” |
| 24 | 6–8 | Musical Building Blocks Guide | 14 | The end of a piece is shown by a final barline. | The end of a piece is shown by a double bar line. | It’s a double bar at the end. |
| 25 | 6–8 | Musical Building Blocks Guide | 19 | Crescendo/Diminuendo | Crescendo: gradually get louder. Diminuendo: gradually get softer. | There’s no definition for the < or > symbols. |
| 26 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 4  (Creating Composing, Grades 3–5) | Create musical ideas that fit with the tonality and metre of a song | Create musical ideas that fit with the tonality and meter of a song | Use the American form of “meter.” |
| 27 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 5  (Notation, Grade 2) | Reflect on feelings about sharing and preforming e.g. excitement, nerves, enjoyment etc. | Reflect on feelings about sharing and performing, e.g., excitement, nerves, enjoyment etc. | Corrected spelling of “performing” and added commas before and after “e.g.,” for proper grammar |
| 28 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 5  (Notation, Grades 2–8) | …and recognise music notation… (gr2)  Recognising how notes are grouped when notated (gr3–8) | …and recognize music notation… (gr2)  Recognizing how notes are grouped when notated (gr3–8) | Use the American form of “recognize”/“recognizing.” |
| 29 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Skills  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Skills.pdf> | 5  (Notation, Grades 2–8) | … music notation on a stave of five lines… (gr2)  Identifying stave, treble clef, the name… (gr3–8) | … music notation on a staff of five lines… (gr2)  Identifying staff, treble clef, the name… (gr3–8) | Use the American form of “staff” when used in the singular. |
| 30 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Concepts  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Concepts.pdf> | 1  (Duration: Rhythm, Grades K–6)  4  (Tone Color: Vocal/ Instrumental, Grades 3–5) | Recognise… | Recognize… | Use the American form of “recognize.” |
| 31 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Concepts  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Concepts.pdf> | 2  (Pitch: Melody, Grade 6) | Analyse the melody and words of a song | Analyze the melody and words of a song | Use the American form of “analyze.” |
| 32 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Concepts  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Concepts.pdf> | 4  (Tone Color: Vocal/ Instrumental, Grade 6) | * Film /Programme Music | * Film /Program Music | Use the American form of “program.” |
| 33 | K–8 | Scope and Sequence: Concepts  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/teacher-edition/Scope%20and%20Sequence%20-%20Concepts.pdf> | 6  (Expression: Articulation, Grade 6) | Use articulation to communicate the style of the song or piece of music e.g. accents | Use articulation to communicate the style of the song or piece of music, e.g., accents | Use the correct punctuation before and after “e.g.” |
| 34 | K–8 | Gr7 Un3 Wk1  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354016-7th-grade/1354019-music-freedom-and-change/lessons/506020-core-learning> | throughout the program | Pictures without annotations | Pictures need to be annotated with the group name or place and source. | Pictures were not annotated throughout the program. This is one example. |
| 35 | K–8 | Grade K overview | 1 | Singing, dancing, moving to the beat, and having fun with music, is what this Grade is all about! | Singing, dancing, moving to the beat, and having fun with music, is what this grade is all about! | No need to capitalize words in the middle of sentences. This happens throughout the program with the word grade. |
| 36 | K–5 | Grade K Scope & Sequence: Concepts | 1 | Talk about spikey music, and interpret it in a meaningful way | Talk about spiky music, and interpret it in a meaningful way | The dictionary spelling of the word is “spiky.”  This also occurs in the materials forGrK Un4 Wk2 and throughout the program. Or consider using a different term like “bumpy or choppy” in lower grades, and “staccato” or “short and detached” in upper grades. |
| 37 | K | Grade K Overview | 1 | Unit 2: How Does Music Tell Us Stories About The Past? | Unit 2: How Does Music Tell Us Stories About The Past? | The last three characters should also be bolded for consistency. |
| 38 | K | Grade K Overview | 2 | If You’re Happy and You Know it | If You’re Happy and You Know It | Capitalize “it” to match every other title (which has every word’s first letter capitalized) and to match elsewhere this title is used. |
| 39 | K | Unit 2 main screen  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353931-kindergarten> | Kindergarten Units | How Does Music Tell Stories about the past? | How Does Music Tell Stories About The Past? | Capitalize last three words to match formatting of all other unit titles. Ensure the title case is consistent in all titles and headings. |
| 40 | K | GrK Un1 Wk6 – Lesson Plan  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353931-kindergarten/1353932-how-can-we-make-friends-when-we-sing-together/lessons/504927-core-learning/planning> | Teachers Supporting Documents   * Core Learning * Melody Lyrics and Chord * Lyrics | Im a Little Teapot | I’m a Little Teapot | Correct name of three documents to include the apostrophe (“I’m”). |
| 41 | K | Unit 1 Week 6 – Lesson Plan – Core Learning  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/opus_you_lesson_plans/Kindergarten/Unit%201/6%20-%20Im%20A%20Little%20Teapot/Lesson%20Plans/GK%20U1%20W6%20Core%20Learning%20-%20Im%20A%20Little%20Teapot.pdf> | Knowledge and Skills | Children will learn to  1. Move in time with a steady beat  2. As point 1  3. Copy back… | Children will learn to  1. Move in time with a steady beat  2. Copy back… | Remove #2 as it is not knowledge or skills.  This also appears in Core Learning documents from other lessons. |
| 42 | K | GrK Un3 Wk4 Lesson Plan  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/opus_you_lesson_plans/Kindergarten/Unit%203/4%20-%20Shapes/Lesson%20Plans/GK%20U3%20W4%20Core%20Learning%20-%20Shapes.pdf> | 5 | Learning Focus  Help to create a simple melody using 2,3,4, or 5 notes.  Keep a record of your composition then you can play it again with your friends | Learning Focus  Help to create a simple melody using 2,3,4, or 5 notes.  Keep a record of your composition then you can play it again with your friends. | Add a period at the end of the sentence. |
| 43 | K | GrK Un3 Wk4 Lesson Plan  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/opus_you_lesson_plans/Kindergarten/Unit%203/4%20-%20Shapes/Lesson%20Plans/GK%20U3%20W4%20Core%20Learning%20-%20Shapes.pdf> | 5 | Notes:   * C D * C D E * @C D E F * C D E F G | Notes:   * C D * C D E * C D E F * C D E F G | Remove unnecessary @ sign. |
| 44 | K | GrK Un1 Wk3  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353931-kindergarten/1353932-how-can-we-make-friends-when-we-sing-together/lessons/504925-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Dynamics | Did you think the music was loud, quiet or just OK? | Did you think the music was loud, quiet, or in-between? | “Just OK” is an opinion of like or dislike, not a description of dynamics. Dynamics cover a spectrum of volume, so if it is neither loud nor quiet, it is in the middle, or medium. “In-between” is the language used elsewhere (such as for tempo inGrK Un1 Wk4 orGrK Un2 Wk5). |
| 45 | K | GrK Un3 Wk4  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353931-kindergarten/1353934-how-does-music-make-the-world-a-better-place/lessons/504947-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Did You Know? | The pentagon is one of the largest office buildings in the world and is for America’s department of defense. | The Pentagon is one of the largest office buildings in the world and is for the United States Department of Defense. | Several terms in this sentence are proper nouns, so they need to be capitalized and written as officially named. |
| 46 | K | GrK Un5 Wk3  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353931-kindergarten/1353936-what-songs-can-we-sing-to-help-us-through-the-day/lessons/504969-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Did You Know? | Listen out for… | Listen for… | Change from a British phrase to an American phrase.  This phrase also occurs in the same place in other lessons, such as<https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353931-kindergarten/1353937-how-does-music-teach-us-about-looking-after-our-planet/lessons/504979-core-learning> and <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353931-kindergarten/1353932-how-can-we-make-friends-when-we-sing-together/lessons/504925-core-learning>. |
| 47 | K | GrK Un2 Wk3  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353931-kindergarten/1353933-how-does-music-tell-stories-about-the-past/lessons/504933-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Did You Know? | There is no picture, only a blank space for a picture. | Add relevant content. | This slide is missing its picture. |
| 48 | K | GrK Un2 Wk5  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353931-kindergarten/1353933-how-does-music-tell-stories-about-the-past/lessons/504937-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Did You Know? | There is no picture, only a blank space for a picture. | Add relevant content. | This slide is missing its picture. |
| 49 | K | GrK Un6 Wk3  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353931-kindergarten/1353937-how-does-music-teach-us-about-looking-after-our-planet/lessons/504981-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Did You Know? | Do you think the music was the music fast or slow or in-between? | Do you think the music was fast or slow or in-between? | Removed extra words.  This also appears in theListen and Respond Teacher Guide PDF for the same lesson on p. 2 where questions are listed.  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353931-kindergarten/1353937-how-does-music-teach-us-about-looking-after-our-planet/lessons/504981-core-learning/planning> |
| 50 | K | Assessment Guide and Log  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/K/Grade%20K%20Teacher%20Assessment%20Guide%20and%20Log.pdf> | Unit Assessment Log – p.1 (p. 5 in PDF) | If the student is working at the expected level of musical learning then it’s not necessary to record any information, you decide, it’s a working document for you to use as you please. | If the student is working at the expected level of musical learning, then it’s not necessary to record any information. You decide – it’s a working document for you to use as you please. | Add punctuation to make these into complete and grammatically correct sentences.  This occurs in the Assessment Log of other grades as well. |
| 51 | K | Assessment Guide and Log  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/K/Grade%20K%20Teacher%20Assessment%20Guide%20and%20Log.pdf> | Teacher Assessment Guide – p. 4 | Rehearse, and perform, a song to an audience, explaining why the song was chosen. | Rehearse and perform a song for an audience, explaining why the song was chosen. | Commas are not needed, and it is more common to say we perform “for” an audience, not “to” an audience. (Performing “to” an audience also implies we change what we’re doing to fit the audience.)  This occurs in the Assessment Guide of other grades as well. |
| 52 | 1 | Grade 1 Overview | 1 | Improvise and compose - explore and create with the song you are learning.  Perform and Share all the learning and creating that has taken place. | Improvise and Compose - explore and create with the song you are learning.  Perform and Share - all the learning and creating that has taken place. | Capitalize “compose” to match formatting of other items.  Add a dash after “Perform and Share” to match formatting of other items, and separate the item from its definition.  This also occurs in the Grade 2 Overview. |
| 53 | 1 | Grade 1 Scope & Sequence: Concepts | 1 | Rehearse and play a simple instrumental melody as part to go with a song | Rehearse and play a simple instrumental melody to go with a song | Removed words to make the statement make sense |
| 54 | 1 | Grade 1 Scope & Sequence: Skills | 1  (Second row, in dark blue) | Grade 3 Musical Expectations | Musical Learning | Change wording to match the rest of the dark blue rows. Also, this is not Grade 3. |
| 55 | 1 | Gr1 Un2 Wk1 – Lesson Plan  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353938-1st-grade/1353940-how-does-music-teach-us-about-the-past/lessons/505003-core-learning/planning> | Activities 5 and 6 | Activity 5 – Improvise with the Song *[contains an activity description for Listening and Responding]*  Activity 6 – Compose with the Song *[contains an activity description for Learn to Sing the Song and choreograph movement]* | Activity 5 – Improvise with the Song *[contains an activity description for Improvising]*  Activity 6 – Compose with the Song *[contains an activity description for Composing]* | Align the activity language to the title of the learning segment. |
| 56 | 1 | Gr1 Un2 Wk2 – Lesson Plan  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353938-1st-grade/1353940-how-does-music-teach-us-about-the-past/lessons/505005-core-learning/planning> | Activities 2, 3, 4, and 5 | Activity 2 – Listen and Respond *[contains an activity description for Play Your Instruments With the Song]*  Activity 3 – Learn to Sing the Song *[contains an activity description for Perform the Song]*  Activity 4 – Play Your Instruments  *[contains an activity description for Improvise with the Song]*  Activity 5 – Perform the Song *[contains an activity description for Compose With the Song]* | Activity 2 – Listen and Respond *[contains an activity description for Listen and Respond]*  Activity 3 – Learn to Sing the Song *[contains an activity description for Sing the Song]*  Activity 4 – Play Your Instruments  *[contains an activity description for Play the Song]*  Activity 5 – Perform the Song *[contains an activity description for Perform the Song]* | Align the activity language to the title of the learning segment. |
| 57 | 1 | Gr1 Un3 Wk2  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353938-1st-grade/1353941-how-does-music-make-the-world-a-better-place/lessons/505017-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Respond | How is the song put together | How is the song put together? | Add punctuation (a question mark) to the question. |
| 58 | 1 | Gr1 Un1 Wk6  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353938-1st-grade/1353939-how-does-music-help-us-to-make-friends/lessons/505001-core-learning> | Listen and Respond -Did You Know? | There are songs to sing to help us learn how to do things or remember facts, like maths songs or the Alphabet Song. | There are songs to sing to help us learn how to do things or remember facts, like math songs or the Alphabet Song. | Change from the British word “maths” to the American word “mathematics.” |
| 59 | 1 | Gr1 Un3 Wk1  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353938-1st-grade/1353941-how-does-music-make-the-world-a-better-place/lessons/505015-core-learning> | Listen and Respond -Did You Know? | This light is bent and reflected, like a reflection in a mirror, and this causes all of the amazing colors that you see | This light is bent and reflected, like a reflection in a mirror, and this causes all of the amazing colors that you see. | Add a period/ punctuation at the end of the sentence. |
| 60 | 1 | Gr1 Un3 Wk2  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353938-1st-grade/1353941-how-does-music-make-the-world-a-better-place/lessons/505017-core-learning> | Listen and Respond -Respond | How is the song put together | How is the song put together? | Add a question mark/punctuation at the end of the question. |
| 61 | 1 | Gr1 Un5 Wk2  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353938-1st-grade/1353943-how-does-music-make-us-happy/lessons/505041-core-learning> | Listen and Respond -Respond | Instrument – trumpet | Replace text with a question | Change the statement to be a question (the Respond text boxes have questions to discuss). |
| 62 | 1 | Gr1 Un6 Wk5  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353938-1st-grade/1353944-how-does-music-teach-us-about-looking-after-our-planet/lessons/505059-core-learning> | Listen and Respond -Respond | Instrument – trumpet | Replace text with a question | Change the statement to be a question (the Respond text boxes have questions to discuss). |
| 63 | 2 | Please Be Kind  Unit 1 Wk 2  <https://www.opusyou.com/> | Listen and Respond  Did you know? | Although Please Be Kind does have instruments, the backing vocals sing in a similar way to a capella. | Although “Please Be Kind” does have instruments, the backing vocals sing in a similar way to a capella at the end of the song.  OR  Although “Please Be Kind” does have instruments, listen for when the backing vocals sing in a similar way to a capella. | Change the statement to explain that only part of the song is sung in a style similar to a capella. |
| 64 | 2 | Gr2 Un2 Wk1 - Plan: Looking In The Mirror, Compose With The Song  <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/2mucr2b-teplan1> | Lead sheet w/ Melody, Lyrics and Chords; Chorus 1 | They teach you that honour is enough. | They teach you that honor is enough. | Use the American spelling for the word “honor.” |
| 65 | 2 | Gr2 Un2 Wk3  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353945-2nd-grade/1353947-what-stories-does-music-tell-us-about-the-past/lessons/504834-core-learning> | Listen and Respond Did You Know? | Think about why we need to look after our Redwood trees | Think about why we need to look after our Redwood trees. | Add a period/punctuation at the end of the sentence. |
| 66 | 3 | Musical Progression | Activity 1 in each unit | Recognize and move to a steady beat in a metre | Recognize and move to a steady beat in a meter. | Use the American form of “meter.” |
| 67 | 3 | Gr3 Un6 Wk3  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353952-3rd-grade/1353988-how-does-music-connect-us-with-the-environment/lessons/500052-core-learning?resource_id=164148> | Listen and Respond - Respond | Is the tempo fast, slow, or steady? | Is the tempo fast or slow? Is it steady or does it change? | Fast, slow, and steady are not comparable items. Tempo can be (and often is) steady at any speed.  This appears in other lessons and other grade levels (3+). |
| 68 | 3 | Gr3 Un5 Wk6  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353952-3rd-grade/1353981-how-does-music-shape-our-way-of-life/lessons/500034-core-learning?resource_id=164147> | Listen and Respond Understand | Sea Shanties were songs originally sung by sailors to help them coordinate their work, but are now sung by bands and choirs all over the world. | Sea Shanties were songs originally sung by sailors to help them coordinate their work, but are now performed by bands and choirs all over the world. | Change the last verb to perform, since while choirs do sing sea shanties, bands typically play them (not sing them). |
| 69 | 4 | Gr4 Un5 Wk3  <https://www.opusyou.com/> | Lesson Plan | “Country music originated in the Southern States” | Country music originated in the South” | Use the correct term for that part of the United States |
| 70 | 4 | Gr4 Un5 Wk3  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/file/download?digilearning_support_file_id=46438> | Lesson Plan | *Images in the lesson depict the Southwest* | Use images in the lesson that depict the South, OR give context that “Home on the Range” is a cowboy song that comes from the Midwest (even though country music is from the South) | Images do not reflect the stated locale (the South). |
| 71 | 4 | Baseline Quiz – Grade 4 | Question 15 | What is the term of the five lines that music is written on?  Keys  Clef  Stave  Notes | What is the term of the five lines that music is written on?  Keys  Clef  Staff  Notes | Use the American form of “staff.”  This also appears in the baseline quiz of all later grades (5–8). |
| 72 | 4 | Gr4 Un2 Wk6 – Lesson Plan and at other grade levels  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353995-4th-grade/1353997-how-does-music-connect-us-with-our-past/lessons/503732-core-learning/planning> | 3 | Focussed, deeper musical learning with the song | Focused, deeper musical learning with the song | Use the standard American form of “focused.”  This also occurs in other lesson plans at this grade level and other grade levels. |
| 73 | 4 | Gr4 Un1 Wk4 Lesson Plan  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353995-4th-grade/1353996-how-does-music-bring-us-together/lessons/503716-core-learning/planninghttps:/www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353995-4th-grade/1353996-how-does-music-bring-us-together/lessons/503716-core-learning/planning> | 4 | 3. Sing as part of an ensemble or large group is fun, but that you must listen to each other 4. learn by ear or from notation that the song is in 4/4 time and in C major  4. Learn the design of the song: Introduction, Verse 1, Chorus 1, Verse 2, Chorus 2. | 3. Singing as part of an ensemble or large group is fun, but you must listen to each other  4. Learn by ear or from notation that the song is in 4/4 time and in C major  5. Learn the design of the song: Introduction, Verse 1, Chorus 1, Verse 2, Chorus 2. | A few grammatical corrections in the first sentence.  Bullet point #4 needs to be on its own line, and capitalized. Further bullet points need to be renumbered to match.  This also occurs in other lesson plans at this grade level. |
| 74 | 4 | Gr4 Un1 Wk6  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1353995-4th-grade/1353996-how-does-music-bring-us-together/lessons/503720-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Understand - Cross-curricular | At the time this song was written, it wasn't always easy to find musical instruments, so people would make music from whatever they had in the house eg jugs, washboards and spoons. | At the time this song was written, it wasn't always easy to find musical instruments, so people would make music from whatever they had in the house, e.g., jugs, washboards and spoons. | Use the correct abbreviation and punctuation for “e.g.” |
| 75 | 4 | Gr4 Un5 Wk1 - Plan: Look Into The Night, Compose With The Song  <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mucr2a-teplan1> | Core Learning Plan Document: Activity #5 - Learning Focus | Children compose an eight measure melody using 3 or 5 notes over the backing track of Bringing Us Together. The melody can be included as part of the final performance. | Children compose an eight measure melody using 3 or 5 notes over the backing track of “Look Into the Night.” The melody can be included as part of the final performance. | The wrong song is cited in the lesson plan directions. |
| 76 | 4 | Gr4 Un6 Wk1 - Plan: You And Me, Listen and Respond (Connect)  <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/4mucn11-teplan1> | In Listen and Respond Plan under “Listen” | Last bullet says ‘PROOFED 17/02/21’ | Delete this bullet | Delete the bullet stating when it was proofread. This comment also appears across the rest of the grade levels. |
| 77 | 5 | Gr5 Un3 Wk5  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354002-5th-grade/1354005-how-does-music-make-the-world-a-better-place/lessons/504427-core-learning?resource_id=192687> | Listen and Respond -Listen | 1. Do you like the song? 2. Do you like the song? 3. Does the song tell a story? 4. What can you hear? | 1. Do you like the song? 2. Does this music remind you of anything? 3. Does the song tell a story? 4. What can you hear? | Change question 1 or 2 so that they are not identical. |
| 78 | 5 | Gr5 Un3 Wk4  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354002-5th-grade/1354005-how-does-music-make-the-world-a-better-place/lessons/504425-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Extended Listening | There are ad-libs throughout the song, they increase and become more and more emotive. | There are ad-libs throughout the song. They increase and become more and more emotive. | Add punctuation to make two complete sentences (in lieu of one run-on sentence). |
| 79 | 5 | Gr5 Un5 Wk1  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354002-5th-grade/1354008-how-does-music-connect-us-with-the-environment/lessons/504455-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Understand - History and Culture | He is a United Nations Goodwill Ambassador and his music has featured in a few video games such as The Sims 2 and FIFA 10 | He is a United Nations Goodwill Ambassador and his music has featured in a few video games such as The Sims 2 and FIFA 10. | Add a period at the end of the sentence. |
| 80 | 5 | Gr5 Un3 Wk4 - Plan: Freedom Is Coming, Compose With The Song  <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/5mucr2b-teplan1> | Core Learning Plan document, Activity #5, Learning Focus | Children compose an eight-bar melody using 3, 5, or 7 notes over the backing track of Do What You Want To Do. The melody can be included as part of the final performance. | Children compose an eight-bar melody using 3, 5, or 7 notes over the backing track of “Freedom is Coming.” The melody can be included as part of the final performance. | The wrong song is cited in the lesson plan directions. |
| 81 | 5 | Gr5 Un3 Wk5 - Student: All Over Again, Listen and Respond (Listen) - Extended Listening  <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/5mucn10-se1> | Extended Listening TAB - Instrumental/Vocal (expression) | The singer changes the timbre of his voice to give an extra feeling at the climax of the song. | The singer changes the timbre of their voice to give an extra feeling at the climax of the song. | It is unclear which singer is being referred to; use “their” as a more-inclusive descriptor. |
| 82 | 6 | Listen and Respond – The Stars and Stripes Forever  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resources/194356> | Listen and Respond - Understand - Explore | If you want to hear a Pop song in the style of a marching band music, listen to Don't Stop Believin'' by The Ohio State University Marching Band. | If you want to hear a Pop song in the style of a marching band music, listen to “Don't Stop Believin'” by The Ohio State University Marching Band. | Remove one of the two apostrophes at the end of Believin’ and add quotation marks around the song title. |
| 83 | 6 | Listen and Respond - Amazing Grace  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resources/193847> | Listen and Respond - Respond | Does the tempo remain the same throughout the song | Does the tempo remain the same throughout the song? | Add a question mark at the end of the question to match formatting of other text boxes. |
| 84 | 6 | Gr6 Un2 Wk4  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354009-6th-grade/1354011-how-is-music-an-extension-of-our-culture-and-community/lessons/505942-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Understand - Cross-curricular | If successful, two to four years of training takes place in singing, dancing, language, and acting. | If successful, two to four years of training take place in singing, dancing, language, and acting. | The conjugation of the verb “take” should match the plural noun “years.” |
| 85 | 6 | Gr6 Un2 Wk5  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354009-6th-grade/1354011-how-is-music-an-extension-of-our-culture-and-community/lessons/505944-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Respond | What Instruments can you hear? | What instruments can you hear? | No need to capitalize the word “instruments” in the middle of the sentence. |
| 86 | 6 | Gr6 Un3 Wk1  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354009-6th-grade/1354012-do-we-need-to-borrow-from-the-past-to-create-new-musical-ideas/lessons/505948-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Understand - History | He first studied piano with his mother and then in St.Petersburg, before joining the army, where he continued to compose and perform. | He first studied piano with his mother and then in St. Petersburg, before joining the army, where he continued to compose and perform. | Insert a space to make “St. Petersburg” two separate words. |
| 87 | 6 | Gr6 Un6 Wk6  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354009-6th-grade/1354015-who-are-the-musical-changemakers/lessons/505994-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Understand - Composer | Composer, Florence Price (1887-1953) is remembered as the first African American woman… | Composer Florence Price (1887-1953) is remembered as the first African American woman… | No comma is needed after “composer.” |
| 88 | 7 | Unit 1 Creative Project Plan  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resource_library/products/pdfs/USA/ca/Grades%20and%20Units/Grades/7/Unit%201/Unit%201%20Creative%20Project%20Plan.pdf> | 3 | The students should perform their new piece in any way that suits their group, but must include a detailed introduction to the music | The students should perform their new piece in any way that suits their group, but must include a detailed introduction to the music. | Add a period at the end of the sentence. |
| 89 | 7 | Gr7 Un3 Wk5  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354016-7th-grade/1354019-music-freedom-and-change/lessons/506028-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Understand - History | … because its clear AABA form, comprising of short phrases makes it a lot of fun for improvisation. | … because its clear AABA form, consisting of short phrases, makes it a lot of fun for improvisation. | A shift of a word and an added comma to fix the grammar and syntax of the sentence.  (“Comprise” does not need an “of,” so alternatively the sentence could be “…AABA form, comprising short phrases…” but that’s a more rare phrasing.) |
| 90 | 7 | Gr7 Un6 Wk2  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354016-7th-grade/1354022-contemporary-native-american-music/lessons/506058-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Extended Listening | The music fades as the song comes to an end and the song ends with the backing vocals a capella. For the first time, we can clearly hear the close vocal harmonies. | **Harmony**  The music fades as the song comes to an end and the song ends with the backing vocals a cappella. For the first time, we can clearly hear the close vocal harmonies. | The box 4 header (topic) is missing. |
| 91 | 7 | Gr7 Un6 Wk3  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354016-7th-grade/1354022-contemporary-native-american-music/lessons/506060-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Understand - Culture | …So we're dancing, but we're connected" | …So we're dancing, but we're connected. | Add a period at the end of the sentence. |
| 92 | 7 | Gr7 Un6 Wk4  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354016-7th-grade/1354022-contemporary-native-american-music/lessons/506062-core-learning> | Listen and Respond - Understand - Lyric Focus | …How should salaries be calculated?" | …How should salaries be calculated? | Remove unnecessary quotation marks at the end of the statement. (This is not a quote.) |
| 93 | 7 | Gr7 Un6 Wk6  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/c/1354016-7th-grade/1354022-contemporary-native-american-music/lessons/506066-core-learning> | Navigation tabs on left | Jen and Jermain Intetribal Song | Jen and Jermain Intertribal Song | Fix the spelling of “intertribal” and also to make it match the first tab (Listen and Respond). |
| 94 | 7 | Listen and Respond - Be Thou My Vision  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resources/193580> | Understand - Culture | Paul Brady (1947) is a prominent Irish singer… | Paul Brady (b.1947) is a prominent Irish singer… | Add the abbreviation for “born.” |
| 95 | 7 | Listen and Respond – Sleigh Ride  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resources/194330> | Understand - History | In 1885 USA, the Boston Pops Orchestra was founded as a second branding of the Boston Symphony Orchestra to perform more popular and light orchestral pieces. | In 1885, the Boston Pops Orchestra was founded as a second branding of the Boston Symphony Orchestra to perform more popular and light orchestral pieces. | Remove the unrelated “USA” to make the statement clear and accurate. |
| 96 | 7 | Listen and Respond – We Risk, We Care, We Dream  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resources/194000> | Understand Culture | Tinariwen, a Rock band formed of musicians from the Sahara Desert region of northern Mali in 1979 is still touring and performing today. | Tinariwen, a Rock band formed of musicians from the Sahara Desert region of northern Mali in 1979, is still touring and performing today. | Add a comma to set apart the extra information in the middle of the sentence. |
| 97 | 1–5 | Core Learning Lesson Plans | 1 or 2 (Understanding Music”) | Children will learn to  1. internalize, keep and move in time with a steady beat | Children will learn to  1. Internalize, keep and move in time with a steady beat | Capitalize the word “internalize” to keep with the formatting of all other bullet points. |
| 98 | K–5 | Core Learning Lesson Plans | 1 | *Italicised text* denotes deeper learning. | *Italicized text* denotes deeper learning. | Use the American form of “italicized.” |

\*\*\*Edits and corrections that may have changed over the course of the review and not previously captured

| # | Grade level | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for edit |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | 1 | Gr1 Un1 Wk4 - Teach: Hey Friends!, Listen and Respond (Respond)  <https://opusyoulearning.com/ca/standards/1mupr42a-teteach1> | Respond TAB | (Question) What type of voice sings the song?  (Answer) Female voice and female backing voices. | Not applicable per “Reason for edit” column | Incorrectly identified in Respond TAB as Female vocals  NOTE: I had made this note early in my review process but when I went to check the link during deliberations, the answer had been changed: (“It is male”) |
| 2 | 1 | Grade 1 / Unit 3  Week 3 – Upside Down  Lesson Plan – Core Learning | 2 (PDF) | “1. internalize, keep and move in time with a steady beat” | Not applicable per “Reason for edit” column | Notes from independent review initially cite the word “internalise” as “internalize,” which suggests changes have been made since materials were submitted. |
| 3 | 3 | Gr3 Un4 Wk5 - Teach: March Of The 3rd Graders, Perform and Share  <https://www.opusyou.com/> | Extended Listening TAB:  Instrumental Tone Color | Can you hear the xylophone…? It sounds silvery and metal. | Not applicable per “Reason for edit” column | Listening example actually plays a glockenspiel. (Not xylophone).  NOTE: I had made this note early in my review process but when I went to check the link during deliberations, the answer had been changed: (“Can you hear the glockenspiel?”) |
| 4 | 8 | Unit 4  Student Creative Plan and Log  <https://www.opusyou.com/> | Missing | Missing and/or has been changed | Not applicable per “Reason for edit” column | Numbering (8 to 6) has been changed and the original table of contents doesn’t match the initial review. Additionally, some specific BLM wording and content has been removed since the initial review. |

#### Social Content Citations:

The panel found the following social content violations:

| # | SC Code | Grade level | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for citation |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | B2 | K–8 | Throughout | Through-out | Content and images do not reflect the diversity of the state of California. | Content and images should reflect the diversity of the state of California. | Musical content and images are not in fair proportion of diverse ethnic groups as referenced in the State statute. |
| 2 | E2 | K–8 | Throughout | Through-out | Images do not represent a proportional amount of people with disabilities. | Images should proportionally represent people with disabilities. | “Proportion of portrayals” Images do not proportionally reflect representations of people with disabilities in a broad range of human activities. |
| 3 | C1 | 1 | Gr1 Un3 Wk4  Listen and Respond - Did you know  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resources/194219> | Listen and Respond - Love What We Do, Did You Know? TAB | Disco was very popular 50 years ago and is important for some members of the LGBTQ+ community to express themselves and feel included, especially around the United States. | Beginning in the mid to late 1960s, Disco music became a popular music genre. Many different people enjoyed Disco music, and during the 1970s some members of the LGBTQ+ community found the freedom to express themselves and feel included through Disco music. | Description may stereotype a group due to the multiple uses throughout the program in other grade levels. |
| 4 | I1 | 6 | G6 Un4 Wk2  <https://www.opusyoulearning.com/resources/194358> | Core Learning and Listen & Respond - Understand | Woody Guthrie image shows him smoking a cigarette & the person behind has a beer bottle in hand. | Replace with an alternative image without alcohol and cigarettes. | Discourage alcohol and tobacco use |
| 5 | I1 & J3 | 7 | Gr7 Un1 Wk6: Listen and Respond (music video)  <https://www.opusyou.com/> | Listen and Respond - Baião Funque | Video contains weaponry, specifically a gun drawn at the viewer. | Edit the video to remove the gun or remove completely | Video shows girl pointing gun directly towards the camera |

## Music Program

### QuaverEd, Inc., *QuaverEd Music*, Grade K–5

#### Program Summary:

The QuaverEd Music program includes the following: *Student Dashboard (SD); Teacher Dashboard (TD); Lesson plans organized by grade level (LP); Song-Based Lessons (SBL); ClassPlay song resource library (CP); Choral Resources (CR); Quaver Musicals (QM); Quaver Books (QB); Resource Manager (RM).*

Note: The QuaverEd curriculum with all its interactive elements can be accessed at <https://www.quavered.com/music/curriculum-overview/> using the instructions provided at <https://www.quavered.com/ca-reviewers>.

#### Recommendation:

*QuaverEd Music* is recommended for adoption because the instructional materials include content as specified in the *California Arts Standards for California Public Schools,* *Prekindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Arts Standards*), and meet all the criteria in category 1 with strengths in categories 2–5.

#### Criteria Category 1: Arts Education Content/Alignment with Standards

The program supports instruction designed to ensure that students master all the *Arts Standards* for the intended grade level(s), and meets all of the evaluation criteria in category 1.

##### Citations:

* Criterion #1.1: The grade-level Standards Maps illustrate the ways the program aligns with the *Arts Standards*. Specific examples within those maps are included below.
* Kindergarten: K.MU:Cr1a: Exploring and experiencing melodic contour <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=db1b3277-8e4b-4bde-97b8-54634587192f&slideGUID=34c919ac-a158-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
* Grade 1: 1.MU:Cr2b: Using iconic notation to document personal ideas <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=c65c9c8a-1bed-40f9-90df-0e76d2e260b1&slideGUID=8fc59304-9b4f-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
* Grade 2: 2.MU:Re7.1: Explain and demonstrate how personal interests and experiences influence musical selection for specific purposes.[https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=bddb37c9- a92e-4611-be83-b50dbcaa94a4&slideGUID=23bfca7d-a321-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba](https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=bddb37c9-%20a92e-4611-be83-b50dbcaa94a4&slideGUID=23bfca7d-a321-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba)
* Grade 3: 3.MU:Pr5b: Rehearse and refine technical accuracy <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=c5a71e9f-5d71-423d-b25f-804625e2c9b3&slideGUID=92c56bb7-9d6e-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
* Grade 4: 4.MU:Cn11 Describe and demonstrate connections between music and societal, cultural, and historical contexts. 4LP13–18 “Lift Ev’ry Voice and Sing” (About the Song) <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=971efbfd-2822-4394-bdf9-ab7ee7a693e0&slideGUID=19e360b2-a1fe-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
* Grade 5: 5.MU:Cr3.2 “Present the final version of personal created music to others that demonstrates craftsmanship and explain connection to expressive intent” is addressed in the “Commercial Project Dress Rehearsal.” <https://www.quavermusic.com/lpphost.aspx?lpGuid=9546a7a6-2745-4df2-8ca7-2444ed945d67&slideGUID=cc49c3ac-a324-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
* The standards are organized within instructional materials through a K–5 Curriculum Map and Scope and Sequence documents
  + K–5 Map: <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/82334489-f9dd-4b4b-868c-d639d6aa9a1a.pdf>
  + Scope and Sequence: <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/28debf04-bb6e-473a-960d-915ce49726eb.pdf>
* Criterion #1.2: (LP) Materials provide opportunities for creative processes along with real-world, relatable challenges, such as the Grade 5 Commercial Project. <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=a9c187b7-0d73-4ea2-97d5-cc748b852135&slideGUID=cb5cfa7d-a324-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
* Criterion #1.3: (LP) Materials progressively build student abilities through creating, performing, responding, and connecting.
* Create. The Grade 5 Commercial Project (LP) 5.MU:Re9. Evaluate musical works and performances, applying established criteria, and explain appropriateness to the context, citing evidence from the elements of music.
* Perform. “Arctic Overture” (LP) 5.MU.Pr6a. Perform music, alone or with others, with expression, technical accuracy, and appropriate interpretation. <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=d7c8c62c-3b10-4940-9c98-ad51641b78dd&slideGUID=328037d1-a323-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
* Respond. “Flight of the Bumblebee” (LP) 5.MU.Re:7.2. Demonstrate and explain, citing evidence, how responses to music are informed by the structure, the use of the elements of music, and context (such as personal, social, cultural, and historical). 5LP10-17 <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=8090614f-4a8c-4e3e-81f1-0ad820f51e61&slideGUID=984829b6-9823-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
* Connect. “Spoons in the Americas” (LP) 5.MU.Cn:11. <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=a529be74-b657-47be-a97d-eb4334b88795&slideGUID=93c5492b-9be3-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
* Criterion #1.9: (LP) The QuaverMusic program consistently addresses issues related to humanity’s place in the ecological system.
* Grade 1: “Habitat” (Lyrics): <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=078672fa-d2cb-4739-8054-62546f4f7eef&slideGUID=8dc41b42-9b4f-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
* Grade 5: “Save the Planet” (Lyrics): <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=d9272ab4-c541-46b2-a0bd-24b6e04f89a2&slideGUID=988f8e99-98ab-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>

#### Criteria Category 2: Program Organization

The organization and features of the instructional materials support instruction and learning of the standards.

##### Citations:

* Criterion #2.2: (SD/TD) A table of contents provides students and teachers navigation of the Lesson Selection Menu of the dashboard, supporting administrators, teachers, parents/guardians, and students
  + Educator Lesson Selection Menu: ~~https://help.quavered.com/product-support/quavermusic/lesson-selection-menu~~ [preceding link is no longer valid]
  + Student Lesson Selection Menu: ~~https://help.quavered.com/product-support/quavermusic/student-dashboard/~~ [preceding link is no longer valid]
* Criterion #2.3 (LP): Each lesson plan provides an overview of the lesson content, including the purpose of the lesson, key student objectives, standards, essential questions, and teacher notes.
  + Kindergarten: Lesson 13 <https://www.quavermusic.com/GeneratePrintedLessonPlan.aspx?guid=db1b3277-8e4b-4bde-97b8-54634587192f&rand=0.9737726431582194>

(TD) Within the Lesson Selection Menu, educators and administrators can access an overview of the year and each unit. Each lesson identifies *Arts Standards* addressed. See Lesson Selection menu: ~~https://help.quavered.com/product-support/quavermusic/lesson-selection-menu~~ [preceding link is no longer valid]

* Criterion #2.6: (SBL) The program relies on Kodály and/or Orff pedagogies, or presents song-based lessons organized by themed. Cross-curricular lessons are also included throughout the program.
  + Kindergarten: Kodály lesson: <https://www.quavermusic.com/GeneratePrintedLessonPlan.aspx?guid=5cd17af5-d7f3-41e2-8d64-c7774be13f1d&rand=0.36232411842219436>
* Criterion #2.8
  + The Scope and Sequence demonstrates how instructional materials scaffolds concepts throughout the program. <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/28debf04-bb6e-473a-960d-915ce49726eb.pdf>
  + K–5 Curriculum Maps provide an overview of the units and lessons in each grade level to show how the curriculum builds on prior knowledge. <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/82334489-f9dd-4b4b-868c-d639d6aa9a1a.pdf>
  + An Essential Questions document maps out grade-appropriate essential questions in each process component area by grade bands (Grades K–1, Grades 2–3, Grades 4–5). <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/9edb05df-9f84-459a-8e8b-819dd0e8c368.pdf>

#### Criteria Category 3: Assessment

The instructional materials provide teachers with assistance in using assessments for planning instruction and monitoring student progress toward mastering the content.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #3.1: The program provides diagnostic assessment tools at every grade level to help determine students’ prior knowledge. <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=rid_6133>
  + Criterion #3.2: (LP) Opportunities for both formative and summative assessments are present throughout the program.
    - Train the Brain formative assessment tool: <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=eeed4b1f-cd73-49d1-988f-81017abf2643&slideGUID=c930f383-a324-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
    - Customizable rubrics offer both formative and summative assessment criteria: <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=656b1236-975a-45f0-80d5-d744365e463a&slideGUID=18bf2551-a220-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
    - Year-end summative assessment: <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=fe824efc-278e-4129-8e16-d7bc59685ff0&slideGUID=5cc80a24-a318-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
  + Criterion #3.3: (LP) Consistent provision of end-of-unit assessments <https://www.quavermusic.com/LPPHostLite.aspx?lpGuid=dd3cb940-8f7c-44c7-b392-a201a3240c79&slideGUID=e41f91ce-e442-4a70-9511-0f2efcc6ae32&currID=0&rand=0.2018895404879011>
  + Criterion #3.4: (LP) All lessons include opportunities for students to independently apply arts concepts, such as practicing basic rhythms (<https://www.quavermusic.com/LPPHostLite.aspx?lpGuid=8cdd60f2-1ae3-4817-8727-855779f88377&slideGUID=d560e319-9b43-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>) and exploring dynamics: (<https://www.quavermusic.com/LPPHostLite.aspx?lpGuid=a206e635-096d-46cf-992a-cabf84eab924&slideGUID=43f34f33-a31f-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>)

#### Criteria Category 4: Access and Equity

Program materials ensure universal and equitable access to high-quality curriculum and instruction for all students and provide teachers with suggestions for differentiation for students with special needs.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #4.1: The program provides resources to ensure access for all students.
    - Commitment to Accessibility Document: <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/1d4b2afd-947d-4b01-8a2c-3705d315dee6.pdf>
    - Stance on Diversity & Inclusion Document: <https://www.quavered.com/music/curriculum-overview/>
  + Criterion #4.4: The program includes strategies for students who are English learners that are consistent with the California English Language Development Standards.
  + Best Practices for Teaching Document: <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/59e39555-3f30-4463-a959-34f8ee734eff.pdf>
  + Criterion #4.5: The program includes a variety of guidance documents to provide support for English learners at every grade level and grade span.
  + Best Practices for Teaching Document, Teacher Dashboard (TD), LPs, Lyrics for Songs on separate slides, Teacher and Student Recording Tools, Interactives, and Resource sharing by links and QR Codes: ~~https://help.quavered.com/how-to-articles/content-distribution/resource-sharing-by-link/~~ [preceding link is no longer valid]
    - Commitment to Accessibility: <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/1d4b2afd-947d-4b01-8a2c-3705d315dee6.pdf>
* Stance on Diversity and Inclusion: <https://www.quavered.com/music/curriculum-overview/>
* Criterion #4.6:
  + (LP) Lessons include a keyword/vocabulary tab at the bottom of the first slide. Grade 2 Lesson 31 A-B Form and Repeat Signs: <https://www.quavered.com/music/curriculum-overview/>
  + Drawing Tool allows teachers to annotate slides both in-person or in-virtual learning. The Quaver Support page explains the features of the Drawing tool: ~~https://help.quavered.com/product-support/quavermusic/lesson-navigation~~ [preceding link is no longer valid]
* Criterion #4.7:
  + Quaver Creatives allow for extended learning and differentiation: ~~https://help.quavered.com/how-to-articles/quavermusic-creatives~~ [preceding link is no longer valid]
  + The program provides customizable lessons to allow for more in depth study in a particular area. Link to explanation document and customization can occur through the TD: ~~https://help.quavered.com/how-to-articles/lessons/create-a-custom-curriculum-menu/~~ [preceding link is no longer valid]
* Criterion #4.8: QuaverEd offers a diverse community of characters.
  + (LP) Grade 3 lesson 1 slide 1 “Welcome to Music!”: ~~https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=6bfc2f54-ee29-4b8f-8e4b-6bfb04c9de1f&slideGUID=c4489fb2-9825-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba~~ [preceding link is no longer valid]

#### Criteria Category 5: Instructional Planning and Support

The instructional materials contain a clear road map for teachers to follow when planning instruction and are designed to help teachers provide effective standards-based instruction and ensure opportunities for all students to learn the essential skills and knowledge specified in the standards.

##### Citations:

* + Criterion #5.9: The teacher document Rhythm Counting and Notation explains and compares multiple methods of counting (numbers, syllables, Gordon, Takadimi, Eastman). <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/eb8e0692-6c35-4c9c-a6ae-0dda24ebe9be.pdf>
  + Criterion #5.10: The teacher document provides explanations and integration of the Kodály method. <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/b8ebd0d4-701d-47d8-bbc9-82649ace6c6d.pdf>
  + Criterion #5.11: Performance rubrics provide criteria for standards-aligned evaluation of student work, with the option to customize aspects to meet individual learning goals. <https://www.quavermusic.com/lppHost.aspx?lpGuid=01a92ef7-7a56-499d-9452-b7972aa42098&slideGUID=67affe31-a324-11eb-aa16-02420a807bba>
  + Criterion #5.12: The program’s clear guidelines offer ways to establish safe and effective online experiences for both students and teachers, especially assisting in establishing online behavior expectations, including the Quaver Five. <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/ebc8955f-49b8-446d-902f-de554d3be778.pdf>
  + Criterion #5.14 The *QuaverEd* program addresses the varied expertise across members of the staff. The included samples and exemplar lessons can be customized with the Resource Manager and Resource Creation links provided in the Teacher Dashboard. ~~https://help.quavered.com/product-support/quavermusic/resource-manager/~~ [preceding link is no longer valid]

#### Edits and Corrections:

The following edits and corrections must be made as a condition of adoption:

| # | Grade level | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for edit |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | All | Digital Resources pertaining to Access and Equity.  Hyperlinks are listed in the “Current Text” column. | Throughout | Stance on Diversity and Inclusion <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/9809f3ef-f0a3-45d6-9d2e-7e83a4674e66.pdf>  Commitment to Accessibility <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/1d4b2afd-947d-4b01-8a2c-3705d315dee6.pdf>  Best Practices for Teaching Exceptional Students  <https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/59e39555-3f30-4463-a959-34f8ee734eff.pdf> | Please include citations of specific research studies that are current (within the last 10–15 years). One example for UDL-Universal Design for Learning and the ArtsbyDon Glass; Anne Meyer; David Rose in *Harvard Educational Review* (2013) 83 (1): 98–119.  One example for multiple learning styles might be Barbe & Swassing, Howard Gardner’s Multiple Intelligences, etc. as cited in *Music in Childhood* by C. Scott Kassner & P. Campbell (2018). | Statements regarding access and equity need to be supported with accurate citations of current and confirmed research. |
| 1 | (cont.) | (cont.) | (cont.) | (cont.) | (cont.)  Two examples for exceptional learners might be *Music in Special Education* (2018) by M. Adamek & A. Darrow. Hammel, A. (2018). Amy and Drew: Two Children Who Helped Determine What Free Appropriate Public Education Means *General Music Today,* *Vol. 31(2)* 29–32. | (cont.) |
| 2 | All | Careers in Music – Hall of Fame | Renee Fleming Career Highlights | She was the first classical singer to sing the National Anthem at the 2014 Super Bowl. | In 2014, she was the first classical singer to sing “The Star-Spangled Banner,” our national anthem, at Super Bowl XLVIII. | The original text reads as if multiple people sang the national anthem at the 2014 Super Bowl.  The words “national anthem” are not a proper name or song title; I propose including the actual title. Quotation marks should be added around song titles. |
| 3 | All | Careers in Music – Hall of Fame | Audra McDonald Struggles/Problems | She has publicly admitted that even though she is considered a star, she still struggles with an insecurity about her talent everyday. | She has publicly admitted that, even though she is considered a star, she still struggles with an insecurity about her talent every day. | At the end, “every day” should be two words. Also, an additional comma after “admitted that.” |
| 4 | All—Resource Manager | Peppy Bingo | “Menu,” “Notes” | “Peppy Bingo! - (3 mins.) [Screen 3]  \* Invite students to sing “”Bingo”” again, only this time at an extremely fast tempo.  \* Then ask them how that felt. (We’re tired! That was way too fast!!)  >INSERT BINGO SCORE HERE<  \* Reinforce the idea that every song feels best and sounds best at just the “”right”” tempo.  \* As with “”Bingo,”” if a song is too slow or drags, we practically fall asleep.  \* If it’s too fast or rushes, we feel scared or almost in a panic!  \* But just the “”right”” tempo makes music feel “”just right!””“ | “Peppy Bingo!” - (3 mins.)   * Invite students to sing “Bingo” again, only this time at an extremely fast tempo. * Then ask them how that felt. (We’re tired! That was way too fast!!) * Reinforce the idea that every song feels best and sounds best at just the “right” tempo. * As with “Bingo,” if a song is too slow or drags, we practically fall asleep. * If it’s too fast or rushes, we feel scared or almost in a panic! * \* But just the “right” tempo makes music feel “just right!” | Amend formatting: add an ending quotation mark for the song title, remove double quotation marks throughout, remove the extra quotation mark at the end, remove (or otherwise fix) “INSERT BINGO SCORE HERE,” text, use actual bullets instead of “\*” to align with formatting in other teacher Notes, and possibly fix first line text. |
| 5 | All-Resource Manager | Movement Video | “Printables” “Instructional Guide”  Page 1 | MU:Cn11.0 Connect #11- Relate musical ideas and works with varied context to deepen understanding. | MU:Cn11.0 Connect - Relate musical ideas and works with varied context to deepen understanding. | The “#11” is not part of the standard.  This is on every Movement Video Instructional Guide. |
| 6 | All | Song titles when referred to in text. | Throughout | One of myriad examples: <https://www.quavermusic.com/MobileWebActivities/worldmusic/Default.aspx> | Song titles should be in quotations in all narratives and Notes sections. (They do not need to be in quotations for playlists, song lists, or title screens.) | Two reasons: 1. For grammatical purposes  2. Out of respect for the composer and the song |
| 7 | K | Lemonade lyrics | “Song Hub” “Song Components” “Explore” click on 6th cloud from the left | What instrument could you use to play the parts | What instrument could you use to play the parts? | Prompt should include a question mark. |
| 8 | K | 0LP19-20 Meet José Silvestre White | “Menu” “Notes” | Select each tab to reveal facts and accomplishments from Lafitte’s life. | Select each tab to reveal facts and accomplishments from White’s life. | Include “Lafitte,” his second last name, which is not mentioned. (Or add Lafitte everywhere to be consistent; the “Stance on Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion” PDF (<https://www.quavermusic.com/media/images/9809f3ef-f0a3-45d6-9d2e-7e83a4674e66.pdf>) shows a picture of this slide and it includes both his last names.) |
| 9 | 1 | 1LP08-13 Great Big House in New Orleans (lyrics) | “Menu,” “Notes”  Final bullet point | Sing the song again clapping the rhythm, using rhythm syllables. | Sing the song again while clapping the rhythm. OR Sing the song using rhythm syllables while clapping the rhythm. | One can’t sing and speak rhythm syllables at the same time. |
| 10 | 1 | 1LP31-18 Album for the Young: The Happy Farmer (Movement Videos) | ”Menu,”  “Notes”  1st line | Move to show the form in “Carnival of the Animals” | Move to show the form in ”Album for the Young: Happy Farmer” | Reference to correct piece used in the lesson. |
| 11 | 2 | 2LP05-09 Cielito Lindo (full score) | ”Menu,”  “Notes”  9th bullet point | Ask students to play 3 beat pattern… | Ask students to play a 3 beat pattern… | It needs an article (or needs to be “patterns,” plural). |
| 12 | 2 | 1LP05-09 Cielito Lindo (full score) | ”Menu,”  “Notes”  10th (final) bullet point | Transfer the 3 beat pattern to barred instrument… | Transfer the 3 beat pattern to a barred instrument… | It needs an article (or needs to be “instruments,” plural). |
| 13 | 2 | 2LP14-08 Great Big House in New Orleans (Full Score) | ”Menu,”  “Notes”  5th bullet point | Tell students that during the B section of the song, they will hive time for 8 different pie rhythms… | Tell students that during the B section of the song, they will have time for 8 different pie rhythms… | Misspelling of the word “have” |
| 14 | 3 | 3LP24-14 The B-Lues (Animated Score) | ”Menu,”  “Notes”  6th bullet point | Demonstrate and discuss how improvising can be used when playing recorder. Improvising allows you to fill the music with your own | Demonstrate and discuss how improvising can be used when playing recorder. Improvising allows you to fill the music with your own musical ideas. | The second sentence is an incomplete thought and missing a period. |
| 15 | 3 | 3LP07-09 My Scaly Melody | QDo  Icon  Step 3 | Create a new melody...in the trebel clef | Create a new melody...in the treble clef | Correct spelling of the word treble |
| 16 | 3 | 3LP18-09 Flight of the Bumblebee (Movement Videos) | Overview  Tab 18  01  18-09 | 18-09-Promote students ability...Orff | Flight of Bumblebee | Mislabeled in Overview Tab |
| 17 | 4 | 4LP24-05 Slice It, Dice It (Full Score) | “Menu,” “Notes” | Variation: Ask students how the composer used musical elements to achieve unity and variety, tension and release, balance, or other features in this piece. (e.g. Unity created by nice, even 4-bar phrases and repeats; variety created by use of different instruments, dynamics, and harmonies)” | Variation: Ask students how the composer used musical elements to achieve unity and variety, tension and release, balance, or other features in this piece (e.g., unity created by nice, even 4-bar phrases and repeats; variety created by use of different instruments, dynamics, and harmonies). | Grammatical fixes:   * Move period to the end. * Remove the quotation mark from the end. * Add a comma after e.g. * Uncapitalize “unity” since it is now part of the previous sentence. |
| 18 | 4 | 4LP29-03 QGrooves - My Rap Form | “Menu,” “Notes”  3rd bullet point | Display the QGrooves pre designed rap backing track (Intro: 2 measures; A section: 8 measures; B section: 4 measures; A section:repeat; B section: repeat; 2 measure ending) | Display the QGrooves predesigned rap backing track (Intro: 2 measures; A section: 8 measures; B section: 4 measures; A section: repeat; B section: repeat; 2 measure ending). | Remove the space to make “predesigned” correctly spelled as one word.  Add a space in “A section: repeat.”  Add period at the end of the sentence. |
| 19 | 4 | 4LP33-10 My List Poem Performance | “Menu,” “Notes”  1st bullet point | [*.MU:Pr4.2c*] | [4*.MU:Pr4.2c*] | Add the grade level in the standard. |
| 20 | 4 | 4LP40-03 Identifying Studio Effects | “Menu,” “Notes”  7th bullet point | Note…  What are some positive responses to the natural voice and vocal skills versus some positive responses to an affected vocal sound. | Note…  What are some positive responses to the natural voice and vocal skills versus some positive responses to an affected vocal sound? | The question needs a question mark instead of a period. |
| 21 | 4 | 4LP09-11 Write a Jazz Melody | QDo Icon  •Step 2  •Step 3 | •Copy the middle C half notes....  •Create a new melody by moving your C’s... | •Copy the notes in the spaces…  •Create a new melody by moving the notes up to a different space... | Original printed instructions/ text on screen don’t match the visual graphics or recorded directions. |
| 22 | 4 | 4LP24-05 Slice It, Dice It (Full Score) | “Menu,” “Notes” | Variation: Ask students how the composer used musical elements to achieve unity and variety, tension and release, balance, or other features in this piece. (e.g. Unity created by nice, even 4-bar phrases and repeats; variety created by use of different instruments, dynamics, and harmonies)” | Variation: Ask students how the composer used musical elements to achieve unity and variety, tension and release, balance, or other features in this piece (e.g., unity created by nice, even 4-bar phrases and repeats; variety created by use of different instruments, dynamics, and harmonies). | Grammatical fixes:   * Move period to the end. * Remove the quotation mark from the end. * Add a comma after e.g. * Uncapitalize “unity” since it is now part of the previous sentence. |
| 23 | 4 | 4LP33-03 Spoons in Music | Welcome to the Performing with Spoons- Slide #3  titled Spoons in Music | Unannotated image | Pictures for String Band and Jug Band need to be annotated with the group name or source for the picture. | These pictures were not annotated. |
| 24 | 5 | 5LP32-07 Our Banjo Song | “Menu” “Notes”  Middle of the page | * Students can write their own couplets using the space provided on p. 5 * of the Banjo Project Book. | * Students can write their own couplets using the space provided on p. 5 of the Banjo Project Book. | One sentence has accidentally been broken up into two bullet points. |
| 25 | 5 | 5LP14-08 He Had a Dream (Orff) | “Menu” “Notes”  2nd bullet point | Ask volunteers to identify specific places in the score with challenges, explaining their reasoning (i.e. rhythms, accidentals, and so on). | Ask volunteers to identify specific places in the score with challenges, explaining their reasoning (e.g., rhythms, accidentals, and so on). | For examples, use “e.g.,” instead of “i.e.” (which would be for restating, rephrasing, or clarifying) |
| 26 | 5 | 5LP31-04 African Stringed Instruments | “Menu” “Notes”  Final bullet point | Encourage students to Explain and demonstrate connections… | Encourage students to explain and demonstrate connections… | The word “explain” should not be capitalized. |
| 27 | 5 | 5LP-44 | Slides 4, 5, and 6  “Menu” “Notes”  2nd bullet point | After reviewing *[title]* and three other song options… | After reviewing *[title]* and two other song options… | There are only three pieces in total. |
| 28 | 5 | 5LP-46 | Slides 4, 5, and 6  “Menu” “Notes” | (Slide 4) Have group two perform Blukegrass.  (Slide 5) Have group three perform Jungle-lele.  (Slide 6) Have group four perform Hip-a-lele. | (Slide 4) Have group one perform Blukegrass.  (Slide 5) Have group two perform Jungle-lele.  (Slide 6) Have group three perform Hip-a-lele. | Group numbering is off. There is no group one. |
| 29 | 5 | 5LP32-07 Our Banjo Song | “Menu” “Notes”  Middle of the page | * Students can write their own couplets using the space provided on Pg 5 * of the Banjo Project Book. | * Students can write their own couplets using the space provided on Pg 5 of the Banjo Project Book. | One sentence has accidentally been broken up into two bullet points. |

#### Social Content Citations:

The panel found the following social content violations:

| # | SC Code | Grade level | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for citation |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | A2 | All | Quaver Books | Genre Topics | Unequal images in reference to gender portrayal. | Replace with more examples of female professionals in each genre. | The current text does not portray men and women equally (in number) within the texts. Would like to see more women portrayed. |
| 2 | D1, D2, D3 | All | Throughout | Throughout | When elderly characters are shown, they are typically added when the song title includes the word “old” and are represented as stereotypically old. (Cane, white hair, bent over, missing teeth etc.) ex. “This Old Man”, “Old Folks At Home, Swanee River” | Replace current elderly characters that are more representative of the elderly population. | The current images, individuals, and characters need to reflect the elderly population in an appropriate way. |
| 3 | H2 | K | 0LP23-04 Loud Movement, Soft Movement | Land of LawdnSoff  Slides 3 & 4  Hear Mr. Lowd  Hear Missus Soff  Click on icon to hear/see how loud or soft the sound is. | Graphics for both characters show ‘spray’ of cough/sneeze particles and use their hand to cover their faces, (when you click on the icon to ‘hear’ the sound of each character). | Consider updating graphics to show cough and sneeze into their elbow instead. | Due to pandemic protocols and national standards, it may help to be consistent with CDC guidelines. |
| 4 | B1 | 2 | 2LP08-16 Organize, Prioritize (Lyrics) | Video accompanying song/lyrics | Beginning of video shows a black student being ‘picked on’ by other students while struggling to study. | Consider updating video to address this possible bias/stereotype | Consider addressing possible racial bias/stereotype by avoiding possible adverse reflection |
| 5 | E8 | 3 | 3LP2 | “Hey, Mr. Beat Boy” | ”Hey Mr. Beat Boy…” | Consider other gender or neutral options. Possibly written in the note section. | Avoid exclusion of female or gender neutral individuals. |
| 6 | B1 | 3 | Image of Lemon in the song “Al Citron” | ”Al Citron” | Lemon is wearing a sombrero | Consider a different choice to show the Mexican heritage, for example, use a background of Mexico. | Use of a sombrero can be considered stereotypical. |
| 7 | B5 | 3 | 3LP32-15 Click Go the Shears (Lyrics) | Video for song Click Go the Shears | White “boss” depicted in sheep shearing role | Consider updating video to address this possible bias | Consider addressing possible racial bias/stereotype by avoiding possible adverse reflection or socioeconomic status |

## Appendix A: Criteria for the Evaluation of Instructional Materials Aligned to the California Arts Standards and Framework

Adopted by the State Board of Education on July 8, 2020

This document provides criteria for evaluating the alignment of instructional materials with the *California Arts Standards for Public Schools, Prekindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Standards)*, adopted in 2019, and the subsequent adoption of the *California Arts Education Framework for Public Schools, Transitional Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Framework*),in July 2020. The framework, together with the standards, ensure all California students are afforded arts education opportunities that develop well-rounded, life-long learners who contribute to the prosperity and quality of life for local and global communities.

The instructional materials must provide guidance for the teacher to facilitate student engagement with the content standards, framework, and curriculum at each grade level and to teach students performance standards required for the grade level. Students should be able to demonstrate reasoning, reflection, and research skills.

To be adopted, instructional materials must meet Category 1, Alignment with the California Arts Education Performance Standards, in full. Instructional materials will be evaluated holistically for strengths in the other categories of Program Organization, Assessment, Access and Equity, and Instructional Planning and Support. This means that while a program may not meet every criterion listed in those categories, to be eligible for state adoption, it must meet the intent stated in the introductory paragraph of each category. Programs that do not meet Category 1 in full and do not show strengths in each one of the other four categories will not be adopted. These criteria are designed to be a guide for publishers in developing their instructional resources and for local educational agencies when selecting instructional materials. To assist in the evaluation of instructional materials, publishers must use the State Board of Education-approved standards maps and evaluation criteria map templates, developed and supplied by the California Department of Education, to show evidence that the program provides students a path to meet the appropriate discipline-specific grade-level or grade-span standards of the California Arts Standards by the end of the grade level or grade span.

It is the intent of the State Board of Education that these criteria be neutral on the format of instructional materials. Print-based, digital, interactive online, and other types of programs may all be submitted for adoption as long as they are aligned to the evaluation criteria. Any gross inaccuracies or deliberate falsification revealed during the review process may result in disqualification, and any found during the adoption cycle may subject the program to removal from the list of state-adopted instructional materials. Gross inaccuracies and deliberate falsifications are defined as those requiring changes in instructional content. All authors listed in the instructional program are held responsible for the content. Beyond the title and publishing company’s name, the only name(s) to appear on a cover and title page shall be the actual author or authors.

The criteria are organized into five categories:

### Category 1: Alignment with the California Arts Education Performance Standards

Instructional materials include content as specified in the *Arts Standards*. To be eligible for adoption, programs must include a discipline-specific, well-defined sequence of instructional opportunities that provides a path for all students to become proficient in all grade-level or grade-span standards.

All programs must include the following features:

1. Instructional materials, as defined in *EC* Section 60010(h), must align to the California Arts Standards for Public Schools, Prekindergarten Through Grade Twelve, adopted by the State Board of Education in January 2019.
2. Instructional materials are consistent with the content of the *California Arts Education Framework for Public Schools, Transitional* *Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve*.
3. Instructional materials must include instructional strategies and student activities that incorporate skill development and authentic sequential, discipline-specific learning in all four artistic processes (Creating, Performing/Producing/Presenting, Responding, Connecting) over time leading to artistically literate individuals.
4. Instructional materials must be consistent with current state statutes and support statutorily mandated instruction as noted in these criteria.
5. Instructional materials shall be accurate and use proper grammar and spelling (*EC* Section 60045).
6. Instructional materials shall include standards-aligned opportunities, including culturally and linguistically responsive activities for engaging students in the arts processes, to increase students’ knowledge of the arts through their study of the historical, contemporary, and multicultural artistic concepts and the lives, contributions, and innovations of various artists and arts movements.
7. Instructional materials shall include opportunities for students to study the connections among the arts disciplines to support development in the designated performance standards for dance, media arts, music, theatre, and the visual arts at various grade levels.
8. Instructional materials shall include clear procedures and explanations of underlying concepts, artistic processes, language, and theories integral to and supportive of the teaching and learning of arts disciplines so that artistic skills are learned in the context of specific performance standards.
9. Instructional materials examine humanity’s place in ecological systems and the necessity for the protection of the environment (*EC* Section 60041) and include instructional content based on the California Environmental Principles and Concepts developed by the California Environmental Protection Agency and adopted by the State Board of Education (*Public Resources Code* Section 71301) where appropriate and aligned to the California Arts Standards*.*

### Category 2: Program Organization

Instructional resources support instruction and learning of the arts standardsand include such features as the organization, coherence, and design of the program; chapter, unit, and lesson overviews; and glossaries. Sequential organization and a coherent instructional design of the dance, media arts, music, theatre, or visual arts education program provide structure for what students should learn at each grade level or grade span and allow teachers to facilitate student learning of the content efficiently and effectively. The content also reflects the variety of instructional models, staffing, and facilities at a given school site. Instructional resources must have strengths in these areas to be considered for adoption:

1. An organizational structure that provides logic and coherence to facilitate efficient and effective teaching and learning within the discipline-specific unit, lesson, and grade level or grade span, consistent with the guidance in the *Arts Framework*
2. Tables of contents, indexes, glossaries, technology-based resources, support materials, content summaries, and assessment guides designed to help administrators, teachers, parents or guardians, and students navigate the program
3. An overview of the content in each chapter or unit that describes how it supports instruction and learning of the arts standards
4. An overview of the content in each chapter or unit that outlines the arts concepts, processes, and skills to be developed
5. Graphics (e.g., pictures, maps, charts) that are accurate, are well annotated or labeled, and enhance students’ focus and understanding of the content.
6. Support materials that are an integral part of the instructional program and are clearly aligned with the arts standards
7. A well-organized structure that provides students with opportunities to achieve the discipline-specific grade-level or grade-span standards
8. A structure that builds on knowledge and skills acquired at earlier grade levels and makes explicit the connections between the discipline-specific arts education essential concepts and processes and the other standards across the grade levels and grade spans
9. A list of the discipline-specific grade-level or grade-span standards in the teacher’s guide together with page number citations or other references that demonstrate alignment with the performance standards

### Category 3: Assessment

Instructional resources include multiple models of diagnostic, formative, and summative assessment tasks for measuring what students know and are able to do, while also providing guidance for teachers on how to interpret assessment results to guide instruction. The program provides teachers with discipline-specific assessment practices at each grade level or grade span necessary to prepare all students for success in later grade-level or grade-span arts education. Instructional resources must have strengths in these areas to be considered suitable for adoption:

1. Strategies or instruments that teachers can use to determine students’ prior knowledge
2. Formative and summative assessments
3. Multiple measures of individual student progress at regular intervals to evaluate students’ attainment of grade-level or grade-span knowledge and artistic skills
4. Multiple measures of students’ ability to independently apply discipline-specific arts concepts, processes, and principles
5. A broad array of assessment strategies that allow students to demonstrate what they know, understand, and are able to do
6. Guidance for teachers on how to adapt instruction on the basis of evidence from assessment and make adjustments that yield immediate benefits to student learning
7. Guiding questions to monitor student understanding of the arts

### Category 4: Access and Equity

The California *Education Code* requires that all students are provided equal access to public education (e.g., *EC* 200 et seq., *EC* 221.5(f)). The goal of arts education in California is to ensure universal and equitable access to high-quality curriculum and instruction for all students so they can meet or exceed the artistic literacy goals as described in the *Arts Standards*. Resources should incorporate recognized principles, concepts, processes, and research-based strategies to meet the needs of all students and provide equal access to learning. Instructional resources should include suggestions for teachers on how to differentiate instruction to meet the needs of all students. In particular, instructional resources should provide guidance to support students who are English learners; at-promise students (per *Education Code* Section 96, the term ‘at-risk’ is replaced in the *Education Code* with the term ‘at-promise’); lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer, and questioning (LGBTQ+) students; advanced learners; and students with visible and nonvisible disabilities. Instructional resources must have strengths in these areas to be considered for adoption:

1. Appropriate for use with all students, including students who are English learners, at-promise students, students with visible and nonvisible disabilities, and regardless of gender, gender identity, gender expression, nationality, race or ethnicity, culture, religion, sexual orientation, body type/physical appearance, or living situation
2. Suggestions based on current and confirmed research for adapting the curriculum and the instruction to meet students’ assessed instructional needs
3. Comprehensive teacher guidance and differentiation strategies, based on current and confirmed research, to adapt the curriculum to meet students' identified special needs and to provide effective, efficient instruction for all students, including students who are English learners, at-promise students, students with visible and nonvisible disabilities, and regardless of gender, gender identity, gender expression, nationality, race or ethnicity, culture, religion, sexual orientation, body type/physical appearance, or living situation
4. Strategies for students who are English learners that are consistent with the *California English Language Development Standards: Kindergarten Through Grade 12* adopted under *EC* Section 60811
5. Strategies for English learners in lessons and teacher’s editions, as appropriate, at every grade level and grade span
6. Strategies to help students who are below grade level in reading, writing, speaking, and listening in academic English to understand the arts content
7. Suggestions for advanced learners that are tied to the California Arts Framework and that allow students to study content in greater depth
8. Images that are age-appropriate and depict students at the grade level or grade span of instruction, reflect the diversity of California’s students, and are affirmatively inclusive

### Category 5: Instructional Planning and Support

The information and resources should present explicit, coherent guidelines for teachers to follow when planning instruction and are designed to help teachers provide effective standards-based instruction. The resources should be designed to help teachers provide instruction that ensures opportunities for all students to learn the discipline-specific arts concepts, processes, skills specified in the *Arts Standards.* The resources must have strengths in these areas of instructional planning and teacher support to be considered suitable for adoption:

1. Lesson plans, suggestions for organizing resources in the classroom, and ideas for pacing lessons
2. A pacing guide or scope and sequence for planning instruction
3. A variety of pedagogical and instructional strategies to accommodate/include multiple learning modalities
4. Suggestions for connecting arts education concepts with other areas of the curriculum and examples of interdisciplinary (across the five arts disciplines) instruction within the appropriate grade level or grade span
5. Technical support and suggestions for appropriate use of electronic resources, audiovisual, multimedia, and information technology resources associated with a unit
6. User-friendly components and platform-neutral electronic materials
7. Homework assignments, if included in the program, that support classroom learning, give clear directions, and provide practice and reinforcement for the discipline-specific skills taught in the classroom
8. Homework assignments, if included in the program, that support parent, guardian, and caretaker engagement
9. Clearly written and accurate explanations of discipline-specific arts content
10. Clear procedures and explanations of underlying concepts, principles, and theories integral to and supportive of the teaching and learning of the discipline-specific art forms so that performance skills are learned in the context of specific performance standards
11. Guidelines for presentations/performances/productions of student work and other artwork focused on demonstrating the formal and informal artistic elements and principles in the specific discipline, thereby aiding meaningful learning
12. Guidelines for a safe online environment when used in the instruction of the arts
13. Guidelines for a safe physical facility appropriate to the level of physical performance and training called for in the arts curriculum
14. Guidelines for the implementation of the discipline-specific instructional content that reflect general or specialized facilities, varied staff expertise, and a range of school resources.

California Department of Education, November 2021