# FINAL MINUTES OF MEETING: January 15–16, 2020 Instructional Quality Commission An advisory body to the California State Board of Education (Commission approved on April 17, 2020)

Page 1 of 14

## **Report of Action**

## **Wednesday, January 15, 2020**

## **Instructional Quality Commissioners Present:**

Senator Ben Allen

Cristina Andre

Mariana Astorga-Almanza

Christine Chapman

Shay Fairchild

Linsey Gotanda

Deborah Costa Hernández

Jose Iniguez

Yolanda Muñoz

Melanie Murphy-Corwin

David Phanthai

Alma-Delia Renteria

Manuel Rustin

Julie Tonkovich

Pamela Williamson

## **Commissioners Absent:**

Assemblymember Shirley Weber

## **Executive Director:**

Shanine Coats

## **State Board of Education Liaison Present:**

Patricia Rucker

Ilene Straus

## 2020 Instructional Quality Commission Orientation

The Commission conducted an orientation that provided an opportunity for new and returning commissioners to learn and reflect upon the Commission’s policies, procedures, and goals and to focus on some training areas which time does not permit during the year.

Public Comment: None

## **Report of Action**

## **Thursday, January 16, 2020**

## **Instructional Quality Commissioners Present:**

Senator Ben Allen

Cristina Andre

Mariana Astorga-Almanza

Christine Chapman

Shay Fairchild

Linsey Gotanda

Deborah Costa Hernández

Jose Iniguez

Yolanda Muñoz

Melanie Murphy-Corwin

David Phanthai

Alma-Delia Renteria

Manuel Rustin

Julie Tonkovich

Pamela Williamson

## **Commissioners Absent:**

Assemblymember Shirley Weber

## **Executive Director:**

Shanine Coats

## **State Board of Education Liaison Present:**

Ilene Straus

Please note that the complete proceedings of the January 16, 2020, Instructional Quality Commission (Commission or IQC) meeting, including closed-captioning, are available online at <https://www.cde.ca.gov/be/cc/cd/iqc2020mtgsagendas.asp>.

### **Full Instructional Quality Commission (Commission or IQC)**

* 1. Call to Order

2019 Executive Committee Member Murphy-Corwin called the meeting to order at approximately 9 a.m.

* 1. Salute to the Flag

Commissioner Tonkovich led the salute to the flag.

* 1. Overview of Agenda

2019 Executive Committee Member Murphy-Corwin welcomed the four new State Board of Education (SBE) appointed commissioners to the IQC: Cristina Andre, Mariana Astorga-Almanza, Linsey Gotanda, and Lily Jarvis. She also announced the SBE-appointed student commissioner, Maya Howard, who will officially start her tenure on September 1, 2020.

* 1. 2020 Election of Chair, Vice Chair, and Three Executive Committee Members

2019 Executive Committee Member Murphy-Corwin turned the gavel over to Executive Director Shanine Coats to conduct the elections. There were three elections to conduct. Executive Director Coats opened the nominations for Commission Chair. Commissioner Chapman nominated Commissioner Muñoz. Commissioner Costa Hernández nominated Commissioner Iniguez. Commissioner Williamson nominated Commissioner Fairchild. Commissioner Tonkovich nominated Commissioner Murphy-Corwin. Commissioner Tonkovich also nominated Commissioner Rustin. There were no other nominations. The Commissioners voted by a show of hands. Commissioner Iniguez was elected 2020 Chair of the IQC.

Executive Director Coats opened nominations for Vice Chair. Commissioner Fairchild nominated Commissioner Muñoz. Commissioner Iniguez nominated Commissioner Costa Hernández. Commissioner Williamson nominated Commissioner Murphy-Corwin. There were no other nominations. The Commissioners voted by a show of hands. Commissioner Muñoz was elected 2020 Vice Chair of the IQC.

Executive Director Coats opened the nominations for three members to the Executive Committee. Commissioner Tonkovich nominated Commissioners Murphy-Corwin and Rustin. Commissioner Muñoz nominated Commissioner Fairchild. Commissioner Renteria nominated Commissioner Costa Hernández. There were no other nominations. By a show of hands, Commissioners Murphy-Corwin, Rustin, and Costa Hernández were elected 2020 Executive Committee Members of the IQC. Executive Director Coats turned the gavel over to 2020 Commission Chair Iniguez.

* 1. Approval of Minutes for the November 14, 2019, Commission Meeting (Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Murphy-Corwin moved to approve the November 14, 2019, Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Costa Hernández seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (15–0). Senator Allen was not present for the vote. Assemblymember Weber was absent from the meeting.

* 1. Report of the Chair

Commission Chair Iniguez thanked his fellow commissioners for their support.

* 1. Executive Director’s Report

Executive Director Shanine Coats reported that Commissioner Jose Lara resigned from the Commission. She thanked the Commissioners for their work on the many projects upcoming this year.

* 1. Report for the State Board of Education

SBE liaison Ilene Straus reported on the activities of SBE.

* 1. 2020 IQC Goals (Action)

The Commission discussed the proposed 2020 goals as follows:

1. Ensure every member of the IQC follows the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.
2. Provide support for the 2020 Health Instructional Materials Adoption.
3. Provide support for the 2020 revision of the *California Arts Framework,* 2020 revision of the *World Languages Framework,* 2021 revision of the *Mathematics Framework,* and2022 revision of the *Physical Education Framework.*
4. Provide support for the preparation of the 2021 Arts and World Languages Instructional Materials Adoptions.
5. Provide continuing support for the development and implementation of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum.
6. Provide support for the launch events, rollout plans, and professional learning activities of the Health, Science, and History–Social Science Frameworks and support for the collaboration committees’ work associated with the English Language Arts/English Language Development, Mathematics, Health, History–Social Science, and Science Frameworks.
7. Ensure that the IQC’s organization reflects the advisory needs of the SBE.
8. Engage and participate in a continuous improvement protocol as the IQC works through relevant curriculum and instruction issues.
9. Remain informed on the California Statewide System of Support (CAS3) and integrate, as appropriate, guidance aligned with the CAS3.

**Action:** Commissioner Murphy-Corwin moved to approve the proposed 2020 IQC goals. Commissioner Tonkovich seconded the motion. There was no discussion. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (15–0). Senator Allen was not present for the vote. Assemblymember Weber was absent from the meeting.

* 1. Other Matters/Public Comment:

Andrea Bennett, California IT in Education

### **Executive Committee**

Commission Chair Iniguez called the Executive Committee to order.

1. Appointment of Subject Matter Committee Chairs (Action)

Commission Chair Iniguez appointed the Subject Matter Committee (SMC) Chairs as noted below.

1. Assignment of Members to SMCs (Action)

Commission Chair Iniguez and the Executive Committee made the following appointments and assignments: (NOTE: The Commission Chair serves as an ex-officio member of all the Commission’s SMCs and Ad Hoc Committee.)

* Arts SMC

Chair: Commissioner Tonkovich

Members: Senator Ben Allen, as well as Commissioners Astorga-Almanza, Chapman, Costa Hernández, Murphy-Corwin, and Rustin

* Education Technology Committee

Chair: Commissioner Murphy-Corwin

Members: Commissioners Astorga-Almanza and Chapman

* English Language Arts/English Language Development (ELA/ELD) SMC

Chair: Commissioner Phanthai

Members: Commissioners Andre and Jarvis

* Health SMC

Chair: Commissioner Fairchild

Members: Commissioners Andre, Astorga-Almanza, Phanthai, and Renteria

* History–Social Science SMC

Chair: Commissioner Rustin

Members: Senator Ben Allen, as well as Commissioners Costa Hernández, Gotanda, Muñoz, Phanthai, and Williamson

* Mathematics SMC

Chair: Commissioner Chapman

Members: Commissioners Fairchild, Gotanda, Muñoz, Renteria, Tonkovich, and Williamson

* Physical Education SMC

Chair: Commissioner Andre

Members: Commissioners Fairchild, Gotanda, Muñoz, Renteria, Tonkovich, and Williamson

* Science SMC

Chair: Commissioner Fairchild

Members: Commissioners Chapman and Jarvis

* World Languages SMC

Chair: Commissioner Renteria

Members: Commissioners Costa Hernández, Gotanda, Muñoz, Phanthai, and Williamson

* Ad Hoc Committee on California System of Support

Chair: Commissioner Muñoz

Members: Commissioners Costa Hernández and Williamson

1. Designation of Liaisons (Action)

Commission Chair Iniguez made the following liaison appointments:

2020 Commission Liaisons

* + 1. Concurrence Committee for California Subject Matter Project: Commissioner Renteria
    2. Sunshine Club: Commissioners Astorga-Almanza, Fairchild, and Renteria

1. Other Matters/Public Comment:

Gerald Lieberman, State Education & Environment Roundtable

### **Education Technology Committee**

Committee Chair Murphy-Corwin called the Education Technology Committee meeting to order.

* 1. Election of Vice Chair (Action)

Committee Chair Murphy-Corwin called for nominations for vice chair of the committee. Commissioner Chapman nominated Commissioner Astorga-Almanza. With no further nominations, Commissioner Astorga-Almanza was elected vice chair of the Education Technology Committee by acclamation.

* 1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **English Language Arts/English Language Development (ELA/ELD) Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Phanthai called the ELA/ELD SMC meeting to order.

* 1. Election of Vice Chair (Action)

SMC Chair Phanthai called for nominations for vice chair of the committee. Commissioner Andre nominated Commissioner Jarvis. With no further nominations, Commissioner Jarvis was elected vice chair of the ELA/ELD SMC by acclamation.

* 1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **Health Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Fairchild called the Health SMC meeting to order.

1. Election of Vice Chair (Action)

SMC Chair Fairchild called for nominations for vice chair of the committee. Commissioner Renteria nominated Commissioner Phanthai. With no further nominations, Commissioner Phanthai was elected vice chair of the Health SMC by acclamation.

1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **Mathematics Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Chapman called the Mathematics SMC meeting to order.

1. Election of Vice Chair (Action)

SMC Chair Chapman called for nominations for vice chair of the committee. Commissioner Gotanda was nominated by Commissioner Tonkovich. With no further nominations, Commissioner Gotanda was elected vice chair of the Mathematics SMC by acclamation.

1. IQC Members’ Attendance for Curriculum Framework and Evaluation Criteria Committee (CFCC) meetings (Information)

Jonathan Lee, California Department of Education (CDE) staff, reported that work will be starting on the Mathematics CFCC. He queried committee members to see who would attend which CFCC meetings. The CFCC meeting dates are:

* February 26–27, 2020
* March 25–26, 2020
* April 29–30, 2020
* May 27–28, 2020
* June 24–25, 2020
* August 5–6, 2020

1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **Physical Education Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Chapman called the Physical Education SMC meeting to order.

1. Election of Vice Chair (Action)

SMC Chair Chapman called for nominations for vice chair of the committee. Commissioner Murphy-Corwin nominated Commissioner Gotanda. With no further nominations, Commissioner Gotanda was elected vice chair of the Physical Education SMC by acclamation.

1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **Science Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Fairchild called the Science SMC meeting to order.

1. Election of Vice Chair (Action)

SMC Chair Fairchild called for nominations for vice chair of the committee. Commissioner Chapman nominated Commissioner Jarvis. Commissioner Jarvis nominated Commissioner Chapman. With no further nominations, the committee members voted by a show of hands. Commissioner Chapman was elected vice chair of the Science SMC.

1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **Ad Hoc Committee on California System of Support**

Committee Chair Muñoz called the Ad Hoc Committee on California System of Support meeting to order.

1. Election of Vice Chair (Action)

Committee Chair Muñoz called for nominations for vice chair of the committee. Commissioner Williamson nominated Commissioner Costa Hernández. With no further nominations, Commissioner Costa Hernández was elected vice chair of the Ad Hoc Committee by acclamation.

1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **History–Social Science Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Rustin called the History–Social Science SMC meeting to order.

1. Election of Vice Chair (Action)

SMC Chair Rustin called for nominations for vice chair of the committee. Commissioner Phanthai nominated Commissioner Muñoz. With no further nominations, Commissioner Muñoz was elected vice chair of the History–Social Science SMC by acclamation.

1. Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum (Information)
   1. Update on the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum (Information/Discussion)

Deputy Superintendent Stephanie Gregson and IQC Executive Director Shanine Coats gave an update on the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum.

1. Other Matters/Public Comment:
2. Oussama Mokeddem, Council on American-Islamic Relations, California
3. Brendon Berg, The EMC Shop
4. Nia Gregory, Sacramento State

### **Arts Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Tonkovich called the Arts SMC meeting to order.

1. Election of Vice Chair (Action)

SMC Chair Tonkovich called for nominations for vice chair of the committee. Commissioner Chapman nominated Commissioner Murphy-Corwin. With no further nominations, Commissioner Murphy-Corwin was elected vice chair of the Arts SMC by acclamation.

1. 2020 *California Arts Framework for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve (Arts Framework)* (Information/Action)

1**.** Report on Survey Results and Comments Received During the First 60-Day Public Review and Comment Period

CDE staff, Letty Kraus, reviewed the summary table of public input on the draft *Arts Framework* that the SMC would use to guide their discussion. SMC Chair Tonkovich then opened the public hearing.

2. Public Hearing on the Draft *Arts Framework*

Each speaker had two minutes to speak. The following individuals provided public comment during the public hearing:

* Gerald Lieberman, Director, State Education & Environment Roundtable
* Mary Beth Barber, Visual & Performing Arts Curriculum Framework and Evaluation Criteria Committee Member

3. Recommendation to the Commission on the Approval of the Draft *Arts Framework* (Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Murphy-Corwin moved to recommend the draft Framework with suggested edits on which the Arts SMC reached consensus to the full IQC. Commissioner Chapman seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the committee members present (7–0). Senator Allen was absent for the vote.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Murphy Corwin moved to change the title of the *Arts Framework* to the *2020 Arts Education Framework for California Public Schools, Transitional Kindergarten to Grade Twelve*. Commissioner Rustin seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the committee members present (8–0). Senator Allen was absent for the vote.

C. 2021 California Arts Adoption of Instructional Materials, Kindergarten Through Grade Eight (Information/Action)

1. Schedule of Significant Events (Information/Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Murphy-Corwin moved to recommend the Schedule of Significant Events for the 2021 Arts Education Instructional Materials Adoption to the full IQC. Commissioner Costa Hernández seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion passed by a unanimous vote of the committee members present (8–0).

2. Online Instructional Materials Reviewer Application Questions (Information/Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Murphy-Corwin moved to approve the draft reviewer application for the 2021 Arts Education Instructional Materials Adoption, as amended, to the full IQC. Commissioner Astorga-Almanza seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion passed, as amended in committee, by a unanimous vote of the committee members present (8–0).

D. Other Matters/Public Comment:None

### **World Languages Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Renteria called the World Languages SMC meeting to order.

1. Election of Vice Chair (Action)

SMC Chair Renteria called for nominations for vice chair of the committee. Commissioner Gotanda nominated Commissioner Jarvis. With no further nominations, Commissioner Jarvis was elected vice chair of the World Languages SMC by acclamation.

1. 2020 *World Languages Framework for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve (WL Framework)* (Information/Action)
2. Report on Survey Results and Comments Received During the First 60-Day Public Review and Comment Period

CDE staff, Alejandro Hernandez, reviewed the summary table of public input on the draft *WL Framework* that the SMC would use to guide their discussion. SMC Chair Renteria then opened the public hearing.

1. Public Hearing on the Draft *WL Framework*

There were no speakers to give public comment.

1. Recommendation to the IQC on the Approval of the Draft *WL Framework* (Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Phanthai moved to recommend the draft Framework with the suggested edits on which the WL SMC reached consensus to the full IQC. Commissioner Williamson seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the committee members present (8–0).

1. 2021 World Languages Instructional Materials Adoption, Kindergarten Through Grade Eight (Information/Action)
2. Schedule of Significant Events (Information/Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Gotanda moved to approve the 2021 World Languages Schedule of Significant Events to the full IQC. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (8–0).

1. Online Instructional Materials Reviewer Application Questions (Information/Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Gotanda moved to approve the 2021 World Languages Online Instructional Materials Reviewer Application to the full IQC. Commissioner Phanthai seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (8–0).

1. Other Matters/Public Comment:None

### **Full Commission Reconvenes**

* 1. Reports/Action from Subcommittees

Arts Subject Matter Committee

1. 2021 Arts Adoption Schedule of Significant Events (Action)

**ACTION:** Arts SMC Chair Tonkovich moved that the IQC forward the Schedule of Significant Events for the 2021 Arts Education Instructional Materials Adoption to the SBE. Commissioner Murphy-Corwin seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the commissioners present (14–0). Senator Allen and Commissioner Gotanda were absent for the vote, and Assemblymember Weber was absent from the meeting.

1. 2021 Arts Adoption Online Instructional Materials Reviewer Application (Action)

**ACTION:** Arts SMC Chair Tonkovich moved that the IQC forward the reviewer application as amended by the SMC for the 2021 Arts Education Instructional Materials Adoption to the SBE. Commissioner Murphy-Corwin seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the commissioners present (14–0). Senator Allen and Commissioner Gotanda were absent for the vote, and Assemblymember Weber was absent from the meeting.

World Languages Subject Matter Committee

1. 2021 WL Adoption Schedule of Significant Events (Action)

**ACTION:** WL SMC Chair Renteria moved that the IQC forward the Schedule of Significant Events for the 2021 World Languages Instructional Materials Adoption to the SBE. Commissioner Phanthai seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the commissioners present (14–0). Senator Allen and Commissioner Gotanda were absent for the vote, and Assemblymember Weber was absent from the meeting.

1. 2021 WL Adoption Online Instructional Materials Reviewer Application (Action)

**ACTION**: WL SMC Chair Renteria moved that the IQC forward the reviewer application for the 2021 World Languages Instructional Materials Adoption to the SBE. Commissioner Costa Hernández seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the commissioners present (14–0). Senator Allen and Commissioner Gotanda were absent for the vote, and Assemblymember Weber was absent from the meeting.

1. Public Hearing on the Draft *Arts Framework*

There were no speakers to give public comment.

1. IQC Recommendation to the SBE the Draft *Arts Framework* (Action)

**ACTION:** Arts SMC Chair Tonkovich moved that the IQC recommend the draft *Arts Framework* to the SBE with the suggested edits on which the SMC reached consensus. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the motion. There was no additional discussion or public comment. A roll call vote was taken. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the commissioners present (15–0). Commissioner Gotanda was absent for the vote, and Assemblymember Weber was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Arts SMC Chair Tonkovich moved that the IQC delegate to the Arts SMC Chair and Vice Chair the review and approval of the agreed-upon changes to the draft framework as well as any minor edits identified by CDE staff or the writers (e.g., grammar, punctuation, word order, citations) before the framework is posted for its second 60-day public review and comment period. Commissioner Murphy-Corwin seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the commissioners present (15–0). Commissioner Gotanda was absent for the vote, and Assemblymember Weber was absent from the meeting.

1. Public Hearing on the Draft *WL Framework*

There were no speakers to give public comment.

1. IQC Recommendation to the SBE the Draft *WL Framework* (Action)

**ACTION:** WL SMC Chair Renteria moved that the IQC recommend the draft *WL Framework* to the SBE with the suggested edits on which the SMC reached consensus. Commissioner Phanthai seconded the motion. There was no additional discussion or public comment. A roll call vote was taken. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the commissioners present (14–0). Senator Allen and Commissioner Gotanda were absent for the vote, and Assemblymember Weber was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** WL SMC Chair Renteria moved that the IQC delegate to the WL SMC Chair and Vice Chair the review and approval of the agreed-upon changes to the draft framework as well as any minor edits identified by staff or the writers (e.g., grammar, punctuation, word order, citations) before the framework is posted for its second 60-day public review and comment period. Commissioner Williamson seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the commissioners present (14–0). Senator Allen and Commissioner Gotanda were absent for the vote, and Assemblymember Weber was absent from the meeting.

1. Other Matters/Public Comment
2. Mario Galvan, Save California Ethnic Studies Coalition
3. Manuel Lares, Sacramento resident
4. Adjournment of Meeting

Commission Chair Iniguez adjourned the meeting at approximately 4:46 p.m.

California Department of Education, April 2020