# FINAL MINUTES OF MEETING: September 22–23, 2021

Instructional Quality Commission

An advisory body to the California State Board of Education

(Commission approved on November 17, 2021)

**Report of Action**

## **Wednesday, September 22, 2021**

### Instructional Quality Commissioners Present:

Manuel Rustin, Chair

Cristina Andre

Mariana Astorga-Almanza

Christine Chapman

Shay Fairchild

Anita Friedman

Linsey Gotanda

Lily Jarvis

Yolanda Muñoz

Danae Popovich

Alma-Delia Renteria

Pamela Williamson

Kimberly Young

Student Member Julianna Garcia

### Commissioners Absent:

Deborah Costa-Hernández, Vice Chair

David Phanthai

Assemblymember James Ramos

Senator Ben Allen

### Interim Executive Director:

Mike Torres

### State Board of Education Liaisons Present:

Cynthia Glover Woods

Patricia Rucker

Ilene Straus

Please note that the complete proceedings of the September 22–23, 2021, Instructional Quality Commission (Commission or IQC) meeting, including closed-captioning, are available on the IQC 2021 Public Meeting Notices, Agendas, Minutes, Webcasts web page, <https://www.cde.ca.gov/be/cc/cd/iqc2021mtgagendas.asp>.

#### Full Instructional Quality Commission

* 1. Call to Order

Commission Chair Rustin called the meeting to order at approximately 10 a.m.

* 1. Salute to the Flag

Commission Chair Rustin led the salute to the flag.

* 1. Administration of Oath of Office

State Board of Education (SBE) Vice President Ilene Straus swore in student member, Julianna Garcia.

* 1. Overview of Agenda

Commission Chair Rustin gave an overview of the agenda.

* 1. Approval of Minutes for the May 19–20, 2021, and August 17, 2021, Commission Meetings (Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Fairchild moved to approve the May 19–20, 2021, and August 17, 2021, Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Chapman seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (14–0). Commissioners Costa-Hernández and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

* 1. Report of the Chair

Commission Chair Rustin gave a report.

* 1. Executive Director’s Report

Interim Executive Director Mike Torres gave a report.

* 1. Report for the State Board of Education

SBE liaisons Rucker and Straus reported on the activities of SBE.

* 1. Approve Proposed Revised 2022 IQC Meeting Calendar (Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Muñoz moved to approve the proposed revised 2022 IQC Meeting Calendar. Commissioner Williamson seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (14–0). Commissioners Costa-Hernández and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

#### Executive Committee

Commission Chair Rustin called the Executive Committee to order.

1. Assignment of Student Member to Subject Matter Committees (Action)

Commission Chair Rustin and the Executive Committee appointed Student Member Garcia to the Arts, History–Social Science, and World Languages Subject Matter Committees (SMCs). There was no public comment.

#### Arts Subject Matter Committee

Committee Chair Astorga-Almanza called the Arts SMC meeting to order.

* 1. Report on the 2021 Arts Education Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials (Information)

The Commission heard an overview of the arts education adoption processes that occurred over the year and the recommendations that were made by each panel during the deliberation process.

* 1. Public Hearing on the Submissions for the 2021 Arts Education Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials (Time Certain – 10:45 a.m.)

Committee Chair Astorga-Almanza opened the public hearing. Each speaker had one minute to speak. Three individuals provided public comment during the public hearing. Committee Chair Astorga-Almanza closed the public hearing.

* 1. Subject Matter Committee Recommendations to the Full Commission on the Submissions for the 2021 Arts Education Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials (Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Fairchild moved to recommend *Arts Attack* for kindergarten through grade eight to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the Instructional Materials Reviewer (IMR)/Content Review Expert (CRE) Report of Findings. Commissioner Popovich seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was rejected by a roll call vote of the members present (0–5). Commissioners Costa-Hernández and Phanthai were absent from the meeting. Student Commissioner Garcia abstained from the vote.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Fairchild moved to recommend Davis Publication, Inc.’s *Explorations in Art, 2nd Edition* for grade one through grade six to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Chapman seconded the motion. After discussion, Commissioner Fairchild moved to recommend Davis Publication, Inc.’s *Explorations in Art, 2nd Edition* for grade one through grade six to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and with the additional identified edits and corrections, social content citations, illustration forms and publisher errata as identified by the SMC. Commissioner Popovich seconded the amended motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (6–0). Commissioners Costa-Hernández and Phanthai were absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Popovich moved to recommend The Art of Education’s *Flex Curriculum* for kindergarten through grade eight to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Chapman seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (6–0). Commissioners Costa-Hernández and Phanthai were absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Chapman moved to recommend OpusYou, Inc.’s *OpusYou Learning* for kindergarten through grade eight to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Rustin seconded the motion. There was committee discussion. There was no public comment. The motion was rejected by a roll call vote of the members present (0–6). Commissioners Costa-Hernández and Phanthai were absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Rustin moved to recommend QuaverEd, Inc.’s *QuaverEd Music* for kindergarten through grade five to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Fairchild seconded the motion. After discussion, Commissioner Chapman moved to recommend QuaverEd, Inc.’s *QuaverEd Music* for kindergarten through grade five to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and with the additional identified edits and corrections, social content citations, and publisher errata as identified by the SMC. Commissioner Popovich seconded the amended motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (5–0). Commissioners Costa-Hernández and Phanthai were absent from the meeting. Student Commissioner Garcia abstained from the vote.

Committee Chair Astorga-Almanza adjourned the Arts SMC.

Commission Chair Rustin recessed the meeting for lunch.

#### World Languages Subject Matter Committee

Committee Chair Renteria called the World Languages SMC to order.

* 1. Report on the 2021 World Languages Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials (Information)

The Commission heard an overview of the world languages adoption processes that occurred over the year and the recommendations that were made by each panel during the deliberation process.

* 1. Public Hearing on the Submissions for the 2021 World Languages Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials (Time Certain – 1 p.m.)

Committee Chair Renteria opened the public hearing. There were no speakers. Committee Chair Renteria closed the public hearing.

* 1. Subject Matter Committee Recommendations to the Full Commission on the Submissions for the 2021 World Languages Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials (Action)

**ACTION:** Committee Vice Chair Jarvis moved to recommend Carnegie Learning, Inc.’s *¡Que chévere!* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Gotanda seconded the motion. There was committee discussion. There was no public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (8–0). Commissioner Phanthai was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Committee Vice Chair Jarvis moved to recommend Carnegie Learning, Inc.’s *En voz alta- Español para hispanohablantes* for the novice and intermediate proficiency levels in Spanish to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the motion. There was committee discussion. There was no public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (8–0). Commissioner Phanthai was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Committee Vice Chair Jarvis moved to recommend Rosetta Stone, Ltd.’s *Rosetta Stone Foundations* for the novice, intermediate, and advanced levels of proficiency in Spanish to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Gotanda seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was rejected by a roll call vote of the members present (0–8). Commissioner Phanthai was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Committee Vice Chair Jarvis moved to recommend Vista Higher Learning’s *Senderos, CA Edition* for the novice and intermediate proficiency levels in Spanish to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Williamson seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (8–0). Commissioner Phanthai was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Committee Vice Chair Jarvis moved to recommend Vista Higher Learning’s *Encuentros* for the novice and intermediate proficiency levels in Spanish to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (8–0). Commissioner Phanthai was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Gotanda moved to recommend Klett USA, Inc.’s *Alba y Gael* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Student Commissioner Garcia seconded the motion. After discussion, Commissioner Gotanda moved to recommend Klett USA, Inc.’s *Alba y Gael* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and with the additional identified edits and corrections, social content citations, and publisher errata as identified by the SMC. Committee Vice Chair Jarvis seconded the amended motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (8–0). Commissioner Phanthai was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Committee Vice Chair Jarvis moved to recommend Klett USA, Inc.’s *Mapas* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Young seconded the motion. After discussion, Committee Vice Chair Jarvis moved to recommend Klett USA, Inc.’s *Mapas* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and with the additional identified edits and corrections, social content citations, and publisher errata as identified by the SMC. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the amended motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (8–0). Commissioner Phanthai was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Committee Vice Chair Jarvis moved to recommend Klett USA, Inc.’s *Reporteros* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and with the additional identified edits and corrections, social content citations, and publisher errata as identified by the SMC. Commissioner Rustin seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (8–0). Commissioner Phanthai was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Committee Vice Chair Jarvis moved to recommend Vista Higher Learning’s *¡Listos! + Antología* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Gotanda seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (8–0). Commissioner Phanthai was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Muñoz moved to recommend Carnegie Learning, Inc.’s *T’es branche?* for the novice proficiency level in French to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Williamson seconded the motion. There was committee discussion. There was no public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (8–0). Commissioner Phanthai was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Williamson moved to recommend Vista Higher Learning’s *D’accord* for the novice proficiency level in French to the full Commission with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (8–0). Commissioner Phanthai was absent from the meeting.

Committee Chair Renteria adjourned the World Languages SMC.

ADJOURNMENT FOR THE DAY

Commission Chair Rustin adjourned the meeting for the day at approximately 1:40 p.m.

**Report of Action**

## **Thursday, September 23, 2021**

### Instructional Quality Commissioners Present:

Manuel Rustin, Chair

Cristina Andre

Mariana Astorga-Almanza

Shay Fairchild

Linsey Gotanda

Lily Jarvis

Yolanda Muñoz

Danae Popovich

Alma-Delia Renteria

Pamela Williamson

Kimberly Young

Student Member Julianna Garcia

### Commissioners Absent:

Deborah Costa-Hernández, Vice Chair

Christine Chapman

Anita Friedman

David Phanthai

Assemblymember James Ramos

Senator Ben Allen

### Interim Executive Director:

Mike Torres

### State Board of Education Liaisons Present:

Cynthia Glover Woods

Patricia Rucker

Ilene Straus

#### Full Commission Reconvenes

Commission Chair Rustin reconvened the full Commission at approximately 9 a.m.

* 1. Public Hearing on the Submissions for the 2021 Arts Education Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials (Time Certain – 9 a.m.)

IQC Chair Rustin opened the public hearing. There were no speakers. Commission Chair Rustin closed the public hearing.

* 1. IQC Recommendation to the SBE the Submissions for the 2021 Arts Education Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials (Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Astorga-Almanza moved to recommend *Arts Attack* for kindergarten through grade eight for adoption by the SBE. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the motion. Commissioner Fairchild amended the motion to recommend *Arts Attack* for kindergarten through grade eight for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the California Department of Education (CDE). Commissioner Muñoz seconded the amended motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was rejected by a roll call vote of the members present   
(0–10). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen. Commissioners Garcia and Gotanda were absent from the vote.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Astorga-Almanza moved to recommend Davis Publication, Inc.’s *Explorations in Art, 2nd Edition* for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Williamson seconded the amended motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (10–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen. Commissioners Garcia and Gotanda were absent from the vote.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Astorga-Almanza moved to recommend The Art of Education *FLEX* for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Popovich seconded the amended motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (10–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen. Commissioners Garcia and Gotanda were absent from the vote.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Astorga-Almanza moved to recommend QuaverEd Inc. *QuaverEd Music* for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Williamson seconded the amended motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (10–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen. Commissioners Garcia and Gotanda were absent from the vote.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Astorga-Almanza moved to recommend OpusYou, Inc.’s *OpusYou Learning* for kindergarten through grade eight for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Fairchild seconded the amended motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was rejected by a roll call vote of the members present (0–10). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen. Commissioners Garcia and Gotanda were absent from the vote.

* 1. Public Hearing on the Submissions for the 2021 World Languages Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials (Time Certain – 10 a.m.)

IQC Chair Rustin opened the public hearing. There were no speakers. Commission Chair Rustin closed the public hearing.

* 1. IQC Recommendation to the SBE the Submissions for the 2021 World Languages Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials (Action)

**ACTION:** Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend Carnegie Learning, Inc.’s *¡Que chévere!* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (12–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend Carnegie Learning, Inc.’s *En voz alta- Español para hispanohablantes* for the novice and intermediate proficiency levels in Spanish for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Astorga-Almanza seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (12–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend Rosetta Stone, Ltd.’s *Rosetta Stone Foundations* for the novice, intermediate, and advanced levels of proficiency in Spanish for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Williamson seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was rejected by a roll call vote of the members present (0–12). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend Vista Higher Learning’s *Senderos, CA Edition* for the novice and intermediate proficiency levels in Spanish for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Jarvis seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (12–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend Vista Higher Learning’s *Encuentros* for the novice and intermediate proficiency levels in Spanish for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (12–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend Klett USA, Inc.’s *Alba y Gael* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (12–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend Klett USA, Inc.’s *Mapas* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Young seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (12–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend Klett USA, Inc.’s *Reporteros* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Astorga-Almanza seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (12–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend Vista Higher Learning’s *¡Listos! + Antología* for the novice proficiency level in Spanish for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (12–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend Carnegie Learning, Inc.’s *T’es branche?* for the novice proficiency level in French for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Williamson seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (12–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

**ACTION:** Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend Vista Higher Learning’s *D’accord* for the novice proficiency level in French for adoption by the SBE with edits and corrections and social content citations as noted in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and changes identified by the SMC, with any other edits and corrections, social content edits, and any publisher submitted errata (printing errors) identified by the SMC, and with any administrative updates that were submitted to the CDE. Commissioner Williamson seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a roll call vote of the members present (12–0). Commissioners Chapman, Costa-Hernández, Friedman, and Phanthai were absent from the meeting, as well as Assemblymember Ramos and Senator Allen.

* 1. Clearinghouse for Specialized Media and Technology (CSMT) Presentation

The Commission heard a presentation on the services provided by CSMT. There was no public comment.

* 1. Adjournment of Meeting

Commission Chair Rustin adjourned the meeting at 11:08 a.m.

California Department of Education, November 2021