Attachment A: Summary Table of Actionable Public Comments from Second 60-Day Review

Instructional Quality Commission Meeting

March 28, 2019

Page 1 of 303

# Summary Table of Actionable Public Comments from Second 60-Day Review

Public Input on the Draft *Health Education Framework*

This table provides a summary of the public comments that recommended changes to the content in the current Draft *2019 Health Education Curriculum Framework for California Public Schools, Transitional Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Health Education Framework*) and are organized by chapter/appendix, page number, and line number. The names of the individuals who submitted each of the comments listed in this table and the date that they were received by the California Department of Education are organized by Attachment Number (Att) in “Attachment C: Index of Public Comments from Second 60-Day Review.”Please email [healtheducationframework@cde.ca.gov](mailto:healtheducationframework@cde.ca.gov) to request access to these comments.

**The following abbreviations are used throughout this document, in accordance with state and federal accessibility guidelines and formatting purposes**:

* cont’d = continued
* <bh> = highlighted text begins
* <eh> = highlighted text ends
* <byh> = yellow highlighted text begins
* <eyh> = yellow highlighted text ends
* <bs> = begin strikethrough
* <es> = end strikethrough
* <brt> = red text begins
* <ert> = red text ends

**The following definitions clarify the recommended actions provided throughout this document:**

* **Recommend** = CDE recommends that the Instructional Quality Commission include the additions, edits, and/or changes as stated in the public comment
* **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** = CDE recommends that the Instructional Quality Commission permit the Health Education Framework writers and CDE staff to decide during the revision process how to include the additions, edits, and/or changes as stated in the public comment
* **Not Recommended** = CDE recommends that the Instructional Quality Commission does not include the additions, edits, and/or changes as stated in the public comment
* **No Motion Recommended** = CDE does not have a recommendation

For printing purposes, the document is formatted for legal-sized paper.

\*All recommended actions were made based on the following criteria: 2019 California *Education Code*, the 2019 *Health Education Framework* *Revision* *Guidelines* approved by the State Board of Education (<https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/he/cf/hecfccguidelines.asp>), and the 2008 *Health Education Content Standards*. Questions regarding the recommended actions can be sent to [healtheducationframework@cde.ca.gov](mailto:healtheducationframework@cde.ca.gov).

| **Framework Chapter or Appendix** | **Comment Numbers in Attachment A** | **Page Numbers in Attachment A** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| General Comments | 1–20 | 3–13 |
| Chapter 1 — Introduction | 15 and 21–107 | 14–49 |
| Chapter 2 — Supporting Health Education | 15 and 108–148 | 49–63 |
| Chapter 3 — Transitional Kindergarten through Three | 15, 16, 17, 18 and 149–273 | 64–117 |
| Chapter 4 — Grades Four through Six | 15, 16, 17, 19 and 274–377 | 117–162 |
| Chapter 5 — Grades Seventh through Eighth | 15, 16, 17, 18, 19 and 378–496 | 163–205 |
| Chapter 6 — Grades Nine through Twelve | 15, 16, 17, 18, 19 and 497–652 | 206–264 |
| Chapter 7 — Access and Equity | 15, 20 and 653–703 | 264–275 |
| Chapter 8 — Assessment | 15, 16 and 704–737 | 275–295 |
| Chapter 9 — Instructional Materials for Health Education | 738–739 | 295 |
| Appendix — Sex Trafficking | 740–747 | 296–299 |
| Appendix — Examples of Standards Based Instruction | 748–757 | 299–303 |

| **Comment Number** | **Chapter** | **Source** | **Comment** | **Comment Index** | **Recommended Action** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | General | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | The document “Health Education Framework” is prescriptive and dogmatic. Each paragraph tells the reader what to do. Missing are collaborating with expert teachers in each district, consensus with scholars at major universities and respect for differences in families. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | General | Clell Hoffman on behalf of the Child Nutrition Advisory Council | Document tends to connect being unhealthy with just obesity-thin or "normal" weight individuals may also be unhealthy. There should be more of a focus on what causes individuals to be unhealthy, or increases their chances of being unhealthy-such as being overweight/obese/high BMI, nutrition deficiencies, food insecurity, lack of sleep, high blood pressure, and other health indicators. | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | General | Clell Hoffman on behalf of the Child Nutrition Advisory Council | Where lean protein is mentioned ensure that examples include "lean meats and fish" in addition to beans, soy, etc. | Att 1343b | **Recommended** |
|  | General | Clell Hoffman on behalf of the Child Nutrition Advisory Council | Emphasize the importance of calcium for bone development throughout the framework beginning at an earlier age. | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writers Discretion** |
| 1. (1 of 2) | General | John Meek, Expert in the security industry and criminal laws as a professional | There is an underling agenda in the very construct of the document in its entirety. For example, instructing that it is ok to do things that partner wants that you don't want. This document purports to be a document that promotes choice, yet it attempts to paint the negative choice as bad. That is indoctrination.  Emphasis needs to be made on the lessons learned from the Kavanaugh hearing for Supreme Court Justice. Where Senator Dianne Feinstein, Democrat from California as the ranking member of the Senate Judiciary Committee made startling allegations.  (1) Behaviors you are recommending for individuals under the age of 18 when done invalidated that individual from serving as a Supreme Court Justice. Why. | Att 945b | **Not Recommended** |
| 5 (2 of 2) | General | John Meek, Expert in the security industry and criminal laws as a professional | (cont’d)  (2) Teach your students that behaviors on Social Media and actual actions that you make under the age of 18 will be fare game to Governmental scrutiny in employment.  (3) Teach about the myth of criminal behaviors under the age of 18 are expunged or not assessable to Government.  (4) Teach about allegations of misconduct in the sexual arena are considered true depending upon the sex of the accuser.  (5) Teach logic and burdens of proof, burdens of proof shifting from civil to criminal. (6) More importantly a systematic review of real views of minors in real situations should be examined for the realities of public opinion, political expediency, and law. https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/national/wp/2018/09/27/kavanaugh-hearing-transcript/?noredirect=on&utm\_term=.b5e06b931dd4 the lawthe law3klw (7) What lawmakers truly believe about your privacy requests and protections. | (cont’d) | (cont’d) |
|  | General | Amy Haghighi, Credential Student | After reading and reviewing the Health Science standards for grades K-3, I have some suggestions for the framework’s improvement. On the topic of standard 1.1.8, I believe it would be beneficial to address the 4th R in the 4 R’s which is Rot. Giving basics of composting to young children will encourage less food waste and better divert food from our landfills. It would equally be amazing to have the state mandate composting for all county refuse services and provide each classroom with a green waste bin, but alas that might be too high of an expectation.  Another suggestions is to take a look at the Toolbox curriculum by Dovetail Learning and incorporate more social emotional learning into the early grades. Talking about feelings is much easier with curriculum, and seeing as programs like Toolbox are expensive and only available to districts who shell out the cash, it would be nice to have more framework provided by the state, as you have done such a nice job with in the rest of the revisions. | Att 166 | **No Motion Recommended** |
|  | General | Carolyn Jones | I would like to see for Young Men to learn more about Testicular Cancer. This is a curable cancer if caught on time.  We need to educate these young men to do self checks and to notice the systems on when they need to seek a doctor.  Most Grown Men these days are too embarrassed to go to the doctors. Starting these young men at an early age to seek a doctors will give them the courage as they get older and will save lives of many men. | Att 294 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | General | Scott | Thank you for allowing thoughtful comments on the upcoming state framework for health education. I believe two pieces need to be at the foundation of every level: the role of the family and the role of nutrition. California is trying to develop curriculum that doesn’t focus on the family unit that already exists. Opportunities should be required for teachers and students to interact with the family unit at every level of instruction and in every unit. This must require family involvement for projects, and required communication between teachers and family prior to the teaching of any controversial topics. It might be best to require communication each Monday to effectively communicate with each family; technology allows us to successfully do this today. This develops a socially necessary requirement of personal responsibility of the student and family, before the government and educational environment have to take over in some cases and may help hold some parents and guardians accountable.  Additionally, I would put nutrition second to the family relationship. As we teach and model healthy lifestyles, then the themes of the family and nutrition can be built upon to emphasize the negatives of drug use and other socially negative issues.  Finally, each piece of the curriculum should be based on science. If the scientific method cannot be used to support a piece of the curriculum, then it should not be presented as fact, but instead as alternative current trends in healthy lifestyles.  Again,  #1 Family, Student personal responsibility  #2 Nutrition  #3 remaining health curriculum must be scientifically supported by the scientific method otherwise we a spreading popular or unpopular, but trendy opinions. | Att 365 | **Not Recommended.** |
| 1. (1 of 2) | General | Bob Edwards | As the Draft heads into its final phase, students would be well served if it included a section on reality-based “sex-related issues” (for lack of a better term) whereby the real-world and often lifelong economic, legal and lifestyle impacts of pregnancy, childbirth and child-rearing are imparted to every student.  Instructional material provided by professionals in various areas (doctors, insurance professionals, lawyers, Child Protective Services, human resources professionals, social workers, mental health professionals, etc.) might include information related to the following topics, which is not intended to be a complete list but merely suggestive:  1.A medical overview of pregnancy, including the process of childbirth & a range of mother/child health risks associated therewith  2.A discussion of the financial costs of pregnancy and childbirth, including a discussion of insurance costs and availability  3.A legal overview of parental responsibilities of childrearing, including paternal &maternal obligations to provide child support in or out of marriage and after marriage or family dissolution; include a discussion of Family Court, divorce impacts on parents and children, and the role of Child Protective Services  4.Financial costs of childrearing from birth to age 18, including perhaps alow/medium/high annual budget chart for expenses such as:  ~ food, at various stages of growth  ~ clothing, at various stages of growth  ~ health care, including insurance (including dental and any special medical needs)  ~ child-care costs for working parents  ~ costs of education, including financial preparation for college  ~ recreation  ~ social expectations and related ‘appliances’ (automobiles, electronic devices, etc.)~ family income levels required to provide all of the foregoing (localized for each county or school district)  ~ etc. | Att 374 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion.** |
| 9 (2 of 2) | General | Bob Edwards | (cont’d)  5.A brief exploration of extra and long-term costs and family life impacts attending the birth of a developmentally or otherwise handicapped child, including a brief introduction to the educational obligations of raising and schooling a child with special needs (e.g., the IDEA and Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973)  6.Limitations imposed by the burdens and obligations of child-rearing and family on the life, goals and ambitions of its parents. E.G., restrictions/alterations in plans for travel, higher education, choice of work or professions, social/lifestyle and ‘life options.’  7.The obligations and impacts imposed by a child on its community and the environment.  8.Etc. | (cont’d) | (cont’d) |
|  | General | Mildred Summerlin, grandparent of CA K–12 students; CA resident | 1. Having the review period encompass the fall/winter holidays(including Thanksgiving, Hanukkah, Kwanzaa, and Christmas) was very inconvenient for those wanting time to review these important changes, decisions, etc. The holiday season sees people busy with travel, entertaining, shopping, decorating, attending holiday festivities, etc. Extending the review period might be helpful.  2. The new Health Education Framework seems to replace parental judgment and responsibility with government control.  3. How many fully trained sex ed instructors will each school need to properly fulfill the responsibilities dictated by the new Framework. It seems that quite a few will be needed, as the responsibilities are extensive.  4. The new Framework sends the message that sex is fine, as long as one uses a condom. It even has children practice applying condoms on fake penises. (Please make sure this is not in co-ed situations.). (But, how does one now define non-co-ed.).  The framework needs to talk more abstinence as a healthy safe option. I did not have time to read the entire Framework, but I hope there is some information provided to the children about the emotional issues associated with sexual intercourse. It is not just a mechanical procedure with no ramifications as long as one uses a condom. | Att 1023b | **Not Recommended.** |
|  | General | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **Excerpt from comment submitted. The full comment is included in Att 1243b.**  Excerpt from The Atlantic: *Is One of the Most Cited Statistics About Sex Work Wrong?*  There is little basis for the claim that 13—or 12, as is sometimes asserted—is the age that most sex workers begin working in prostitution.  It's hard to pin down where exactly the age-of-entry claim originated, partly because it's so often repeated without a citation or context, but also because it's become such a ubiquitous part of sexual politics. "I can't really remember a time when I didn't it used, so I think it's been in circulation for quite a while," says Audacia Ray, of the Red Umbrella Project in New York. "And it's definitely used really broadly and without citation. Most organizations, if they refer to a source at all, reference a study released in 2001: The Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in the U. S., Canada and Mexico, by Richard J. Estes and Neil A. Weiner…. | Att 1243b | **Not Recommended.** |
|  | General | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | Include MESH in 4th grade and cyber bullying as a topic to discuss around bullying and underlying causes of negative social, emotional and mental health. | Att 2106 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | General | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | Check all direct quotes to include page numbers throughout the Framework. | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | General | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | Include “early learning” in the framework. | Att 2106 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1,2,3,4,5,6, 7,8 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Caretakers of California Students, Community Members, active and retired California teachers | *\*CDE received 160 emails that highlighted specific sections, sentences, and language in the framework that members of the public oppose. Each of these comments request that specific sections, sentences, and/or language be removed from the framework. In some cases, reasons for the request to remove this content or recommendations for new language are provided. The attachment numbers of these comments are:*  **137b, 143b, 164b, 302, 430, 435, 441, 490b, 492, 535b, 616, 624, 633b, 643, 664b, 674b, 685b, 688b, 693b, 707, 726b, 752, 756b, 776, 780b, 793b, 849b, 871, 934, 965b, 998b, 1005, 1019b, 1022, 1044b, 1046b, 1053b, 1058b, 1066b, 1070b, 1087b, 1088b, 1092b, 1096b, 1100b, 1102b, 1103b, 1108b, 1116b, 1117b, 1123b, 1127b, 1134b, 1139b, 1141b, 1145b, 1147a, 1149c, 1150b, 1155b, 1156b, 1159b, 1161b, 1177b, 1186b, 1187b, 1196b, 1198b, 1199b, 1200b, 1201b, 1301b, 1306b, (1308b, 1311b, 1317b,)1314b, 1319b, 1321b, 1323b, 1326b, 1328b, 1330b, 1331, 1333b, 1334b, 1338b, 1342, 1344a, 1344b, 1345a, 1346, 1349, 1398, 1428, 1434, 1458, 1460, 1497, 1510, 1529, 1530, 1539, 1543, 1545b, 1548, 1555, 1561, 1563, 1568, 1572, 1576, 1601, 1612, 1627, 1644, 1651, 1659, 1644, 1687, 1716, 1749, 1752, 1760, 1791,1797, 1825, 1832, 1841, 1849, 1852, 1859, 1860, 1871, 1872, 1873, 1877, 1883, 1889, 1890, 1902, 1909, 1910, 1923, 1928, 1936, 1950b, 1954, 1956, 1959,1971, 1979, 1995, 1999, 2003, 2004, 2013, 2034, 2035, 2096b** | All Att Numbers are listed in the comment column. | **Not Recommended** |
|  | General for the following chapters 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 8 | Catherine Kellert, RN, Credentialed School Nurse | Also please add "in partnership with parents" to all wording about health educators, teachers and administrators- in regards to mental health and sexual health in chapters 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, and 8. | Att 1545a | **Not Recommended.** |
|  | General Comment AND Chapter 3, 4, 5, 6 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of the Child Nutrition Advisory Council | Chp 3 (P 91, Ln 2370-71; p92, Ln 2377)  Chp 4 (P 41, Ln 1033-34)  Chp 5 (P 19, Ln 517-18)  Chp 6: N/A  When smoothies are suggested, add "but keeping in mind that it is always best to eat fruits and vegetables in their natural form."  --Note: Chp 4, P 41, Ln 102-1023: text including "smoothies" is recommended for deletion (see last comment for Chp 4 below) so is not included here | Att 1343b | **Recommended** |
|  | General and 3, 5, 6 | Matthew B. McReynolds, Senior Staff Attorney, Pacific Justice Institute | Att 994b outlines specific sections of the framework that, “must be revised to be more inclusive of the many families with traditional and religious values.”  The following topics of the framework are addressed in the letter submitted by Pacific Justice Institute:  -Undermining parental and community values on Gender  -Promotion of controversial groups  -“Spiritual abuse”  -How-to demonstration of condoms  Pacific Justice Institute closes their letter with the following statement:  “We urge the Board to make substantial revisions, in accordance with the concerns outlined above, that will return decision-making to the local level where it can be more reflective of parental and community values.”  *\*See Att 994b for the full line edit recommendations submitted to CDE* | Att 994b | **Not Recommended:** Undermining parental and community values on Gender  **Not Recommended:** Promotion of controversial groups  **Recommended with** **Writer’s Discretion:**  “Spiritual abuse”  **Not Recommended:**  How-to demonstration of condoms |
|  | General and Chapters 4,5,6 | Sarah Planche, M.Ed., Education Administrator, Tobacco Use Prevention Education Office | Tobacco including electronic smoking devices are prohibited on CA K-12 public school campuses. Most people aren’t aware that in CA nicotine falls under the category of tobacco. I would suggest a call out box in Chapters 4, 5, 6 so readers understand this definition.  Electronic smoking devices, often called e-cigarettes or vape pens, heat and aerosolize a liquid that contains a variety of ingredients, including flavorings and varying levels of nicotine. According to the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) 2018, use of electronic smoking devices has increased substantially in recent years, particularly among youth. Under California state law, a tobacco product is any product containing , made, or derived from tobacco or nicotine, and any electronic vaping device or component, part, or accessory of a tobacco product\*. The CDC warns that nicotine is highly addictive and can harm adolescent brain development which continues into the early to mid-20s.  \*Nicotine products such as the nicotine patch that the US FDA has approved as cessation products or for other therapeutic purposes are not included | Att 1865 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | General and 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | Global Change- each time “students with disabilities” appears in the framework change to “students with visible and non-visible disabilities”  Examples: Chapter 7, p. 3, line 45- change “students with disabilities” to students with visible and non-visible disabilities  Chapter 7, p. 4, line 65- include students with visible and non-visible disabilities…. | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 2, Line 9**  In the past 20 years, health education has evolved to become a powerful, comprehensive, theory-driven, evidence-based platform from which to educate, inform, and empower youth to make well-informed health decisions that lead to positive practices that promote a lifetime of good health.  Comment: Consider removing evidence-based platform. Much of what is included in this document is not evidence-based. To call it so would be dishonest. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 2, Line 17** – Add “and community partners, such as school-based health center staff.” | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 3, Line 34**  High-risk behaviors such as unhealthy eating,  Comment: If you plan to teach my child about the food pyramid I will just have to deprogram them with real information. I’d love if you would consider removing this topic altogether until we can get real data not driven by government food lobbyists. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 3, Line 35** – “High-risk sexual and violence-related behaviors…are often established in childhood and adolescence” caused by broken families and schools cannot fix broken families. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Heather Hebert del Cuadro, *Oceanside Unified School District: Education Specialist K–12, Master’s Degree in Special Education* | **Page 3, Line 47-48** - Add to: Critical Thinkers and problem solvers when confronting health issues, “emotional regulation and well-being, and stress management.” | Att 914b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 3, Line 50** – “Effective communicators who organize and convey beliefs, ideas, and information about health issues”, Needs addition:…such as Catholic priests and Christian ministers. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 4, Line 68**  Growing trends confirm some adolescents may spend more time using technology-related activities (texting and engaging with online social media on their mobile devices, playing video games, or watching television) than engaged in physical activity, placing them at an increased risk for obesity-related childhood diseases and mental health issues (American Academy of Pediatrics 2017, Rosen et al. 2014).  Comment: Consider adding Growing trends in education force students to use technology related devices when in school are also a huge contributor to these obesity problems. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 5, Line 91** - The Statewide Data should be referenced as (2015-2017). Please use the find and replace function of Word to ensure consistency throughout the document. | Att 1192b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 5, Line 91 and 92** - Correct the insertion and provide more information. “and one nutrition behavior, eating breakfast, in the core module. An optional module, Physical Health and Nutrition, is available to districts that want to identify and assess more student nutrition and physical activity behaviors.” | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 5, Line 97** – “, Approximately 40 percent of seventh grade students reported being harassed or bullied.” Bullying is common to 100% of people who are Christian and pray in church. Bullying is stopped by giving people respect. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Heather Hebert del Cuadro Education Specialist K–12 | **Page 5, Line 99** – Add a new sentence after “ grade students reported being harassed or bullied.” “Increases over time in the number of students experiencing depression symptoms. Percent of high school students who report they felt sad or hopeless almost every day for 2 or more weeks in a row so that they stopped doing some usual activities (during the 12 months before the survey) was 32%.” https://www.hhs.gov/ash/oah/facts-and-stats/national-and-state-data-sheets/adolescent-mental-health-fact-sheets/california/index.html (accessed 1/9/19) | Att 914b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 8, line 170**  nutritious and appealing school meals;  Comment: Consider adding nutritious clean and appealing meals free of pesticides and other chemicals | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 8, Line 183** – After the sentence ending “in middle and high school”, add the following: “When this is not possible, utilizing community partners such as health educators or staff from school-based health centers with specialized training can be an effective alternative.” | Att 680b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment was with identical or similar language | **Page 8, Lines 183-185**  **183** class in middle and high school. Establishing healthy behaviors, practices, and skills  **184** during childhood is the work of all professional educators and more effective  **185** than trying to change well-established behaviors during adulthood….  **Add in Line 184: “**parents/guardians” **Between:** “…the work of all” **and** “professional educators and...”  **Sentence should read:** Establishing healthy behaviors, practices, and skills during childhood is the work of all **parents/guardians** and professional educators and more effective than trying to change well-established behaviors during adulthood.  **Reason**: Healthy practices and habits begins at home, and are ultimately the responsibility of the parents and/or guardians. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 8, 2nd to the last paragraph, 2nd to the last sentence, Lines 190-194**  **REMOVE**  Social and emotional learning (SEL) can help students develop the understanding, strategies, and skills, that support a positive sense of self, promote respectful relationships, and build student capacity to recognize and manage their own emotions and make responsible decisions. SEL provides a foundation for safe and positive learning, and enhances students' ability to succeed in school, careers, and life.  (SEL is a rather new concept that does not have long-term scientific data that shows whether it would benefit our youths. It also encompasses many meditative tools that are more aligned with Hinduism or New Age religion, which is not inclusive of the majority of the population.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 8, line 195**  Research confirms that health education in schools reduces the prevalence of high-risk health behaviors among youth and can positively impact academic performance outcomes, including retention and graduation (Basch 2010, CDC 2014). Children who are physically, socially, and mentally healthy are ready to learn and be productive in school.  Comment: Consider removing that research confirms that this health education outlined here in this document has a positive impact. We don’t know this promotion of LGBT lifestyles will affect them. Based on current research, studies show more drug use both legal and illegal as well as increased rates of suicide. While pushing these students to explore their sexuality, you are pointing them down a path rife with problems. https://www.huffingtonpost.com/brynn-tannehill/the-truth-about-transgend\_b\_8564834.html | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 8, last paragraph, first sentence., Lines 195-197**  **REMOVE**  Research confirms that health education in schools reduces the prevalence of high-risk health behaviors among youth and can positively impact academic performance outcomes, including retention and graduation (Basch 2010, CDC 2014).  **REPLACE WITH**  Research confirms that age-appropriate and medically accurate health education in schools reduces the prevalence of high-risk health behaviors among youth and can positively impact academic performance outcomes, including retention and graduation (Basch 2010, CDC 2014). | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p8 434–445** very appropriate warnings to teachers; wish there were more pages but will suffice. Need to say something about “pets could be welcome but need to make sure students not allergic??? | Att 689b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | Heather Hebert del Cuadro Education Specialist K–12 | **Page 9, line 190 add:** …and emotional well-being. Before: The health education standards are the foundation for  **\*This comment appears exactly as it was submitted to CDE** | Att 914b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 9, Line 204**  As medical research and health information develops quickly, and changes at an even more rapid pace, effective health education instruction must also incorporate the most current, medically accurate, evidence-based, and theory-driven content from reliable resources  Comment: again consider removing evidence-based. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 9, line 207**  Health education instruction and resources must be accessible for all student groups, inclusive, culturally relevant, and age appropriate and must incorporate technology, when available, in support of the 21st century learner.  Comment:  Consider adding Health education instruction resources may be available with parent approval.  You can also remove 21st century learner. Our kids can still learn in the same manor that we did. There really need not be any need to force technology be used unless you need to hide this material from parents. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | R. Loya – CASHE | **P 9 216–217** WHO 2003 citation a bit dated? Like the message but dated. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 10, Line 243** – Insert “physical education and” before physical activity to appropriately reference the construct. | Att 1192b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 10, Line 250** - At the end of the paragraph, we suggest the insert this sentence. “Additionally, numerous school districts have found this model provides guidance as they revise their district’s school wellness policies and regulations to implement wellness throughout school environments and instructional programs for students as well as other programs for students and employees.” This sentence would help districts understand how usage of the WSCC model can affect both instruction and programs. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writers Discretion** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 10, 2nd to the last paragraph, 2nd to the last sentence**  **REMOVE**  Social and emotional learning (SEL) can help students develop the understanding, strategies, and skills, that support a positive sense of self, promote respectful relationships, and build student capacity to recognize and manage their own emotions and make responsible decisions. SEL provides a foundation for safe and positive learning, and enhances students' ability to succeed in school, careers, and life.  (SEL is a rather new concept that does not have long-term scientific data that shows whether it would benefit our youths. It also encompasses many meditative tools that are more aligned with Hinduism or New Age religion, which is not inclusive of the majority of the population.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 10, last paragraph, first sentence.**  **REMOVE**  Research confirms that health education in schools reduces the prevalence of high-risk health behaviors among youth and can positively impact academic performance outcomes, including retention and graduation (Basch 2010, CDC 2014).  **REPLACE WITH**  Research confirms that age-appropriate and medically accurate health education in schools reduces the prevalence of high-risk health behaviors among youth and can positively impact academic performance outcomes, including retention and graduation (Basch 2010, CDC 2014). | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p11 CDC chart** – YUCK not sure if this page vital to the plot. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Katie Nguyen Public School Parent | **Page 12-14, Promoting a Safe, Supportive, and Inclusive Learning Environment**– The content of this section does not fully support the section headline. It covers only the topics of being inclusive for sexuality and gender. Why does it not address other areas of discrimination such as physical and/or learning disability, race, religion? It seems to hold sexuality and gender above all, which, in itself, is discriminatory. This whole section needs to be inclusive of all or removed. | Att 1088b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 12, Line 270** – “A safe inclusive linguistic environment.” The terms “safety” and “environment” need to be defined. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 12, Line 272**  Teachers create an inclusive classroom environment by adopting an asset orientation toward cultural and linguistic diversity and respecting multiple viewpoints and backgrounds, especially when addressing topics where values and expectations are likely to differ across cultural groups, such as sexuality and drug use.  Comment: teachers should focus less on lingual diversity and more on teaching English. Our California classrooms are suffering because we are trying to accommodate everyone and every language/culture. Therefor everyone has to receive less. If you plan to respect multiple viewpoints, you may want to add religious groups. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p13 288–289** “make it relevant…etc” this is so powerful. Make it bold or in read or flashing starts or move up so tis the first bullet. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 14, bullet point, Lines 313-317**  **REMOVE**  Prioritize culturally relevant texts and topics: Use texts that accurately reflect at, <bh>wide range of<eh> students' ethnic, cultural, linguistic, and familial backgrounds, as well as other variables that contribute to their identities, such as <bh>sexual orientation<eh> and gender expression, so that students see themselves as belonging and valued in the school curriculum.  **REPLACE WITH**  Prioritize culturally relevant texts and topics: Use texts that accurately reflect at, <bh>wide range of<eh> students' ethnic, cultural, linguistic, religious, and familial backgrounds, as well as other variables that contribute to their identities, such as <bh>sexual orientation<eh> and gender expression, so that students see themselves as belonging and valued in the school curriculum. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
| 1. (1 of 2) | 1 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment was with identical or similar language | **PPage 14, Lines 313-317**  **313** Prioritize culturally relevant texts and topics: Use texts that accurately reflect a  **314** wide range of students’ ethnic, cultural, linguistic, and familial  **315** backgrounds, as well as other variables that contribute to their identities such as  **316** sexual orientation and gender expression, so that students see  **317** themselves as belonging and valued in the school curriculum. Add Line 316: “and religious beliefs”Reason: religious beliefs fit the description of culturally relevant and contribute to the identities of students. (Ed Code 212.3) “Religion” includes all aspects of religious belief, observance, and practice and includes agnosticism and atheism.) *(Added by Stats. 2007, Ch. 569, Sec. 8. Effective January 1, 2008.)*  (Ed Code 51933 (d)(4) Instruction and materials shall not reflect or promote bias against any person on the basis of any category protected by **Section 220**. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
| 1. (2 of 2) | 1 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment was with identical or similar language | (cont’d) (Sec. 220) No person shall be subjected to discrimination on the basis of disability, gender, gender identity, gender expression, nationality, race or ethnicity, **religion**, sexual orientation, or any other characteristic that is contained in the definition of hate crimes set forth in Section 422.55 of the Penal Code, including immigration status, in any program or activity conducted by an educational institution that receives, or benefits from, state financial assistance, or enrolls pupils who receive state student financial aid. *(Amended by Stats. 2017, Ch. 493, Sec. 3. (AB 699) Effective January 1, 2018.)*  (Ed Code 51933 (i) **DOESN’T** apply here because adding religious beliefs is NOT teaching or promoting doctrine. It is merely adding religious beliefs as culturally relevant in belonging and valued.  **Delete Line 316: “expression” from “gender expression”**  **Reason: “**expression” is unnecessary as it is merely external showing of a factual statement, which doesn’t change the original statement. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **Page 14, Line 316** – Rather than limit the examples to only SOGI, change to “sexual orientation or a particular faith (or religious) expression, so students can see themselves as belonging…” In our state, many students with religious identities see themselves as outsiders and should be included. | Att 1098b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Michael Buechler, Santa Ana College, Associate Professor, parent of two children, TK and grade 3 attending CA public school | **Page 14, Line item 319 through 335** creates unnecessary confusion and is contradictory as “students discover their gender expressions and sexuality” and instructors are then asked to “acknowledge and affirm”? Suggest using the beginning and ending sentences and remove lines 321 through 332. There is no singular form of they/them. Suggest using gender pronouns aligned with biological gender as stated on registration material and allow for teachers to alter on a case by case basis. | Att 615b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Jeff Erickson, retired public school science teacher and principal | **Delete Page 14, Lines 319 to 335** and related language.  Don’t we do our children a great disservice by presuming in the language of this document that there are more than two genders, when the physical evidence does not support this? Gender dysphoria, gender confusion in children usually clears up on its own with the child embracing his/her physical gender as they mature, if given encouragement to do so. That is a healthier approach to take for a health curriculum. | Att 436b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 14 of 30, Line 319-335**  Teachings on sexual orientation are the responsibility of the parents and should not be included in school curricula. Gender should be grounded in scientific fact and should be taught in the context of genetics and chromosomes in the science setting.  It is inappropriate and indecent to discuss sexual orientation and sexual relationships in the classroom setting and these topics should be excluded from curricula. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Mildred Summerlin, grandparent of CA K–12 students; CA resident | **Page 14, last paragraph, 8th sentence, Lines 320-331**  REPLACE “it is similarly important to acknowledge and affirm….  WITH “it is similarly important to acknowledge and make note of…..” | Att 1023b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Katie Nguyen Public School Parent | **Page 14, Line 321-324** – Move to strike these lines from the framework. Changing the English language as part of a social construct is not inclusive of those that do identify as a him or her.  Additionally, this document states the following (see box below) yet still has gender identity teachings prior to middle school. If it is stated int his document that referring to gender outside of male and female is not accommodating to the developmental stage of fifth graders and younger than why is gender identity being taught as young as transitional Kinder in this same document? This is conflicting and violates EDC Article 2 51933 that states “Instruction and materials shall be age appropriate.”  Chapter 4 lines 1466-1469 state: While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.  Finally, It is not lawful to force someone to affirm social constructs. It is an imposition on free speech, liberty, and freedom of religion. It is lawful, however, to require people of all backgrounds and sexualities to show respect for each other. Allowing students and teachers to express preferred pronouns would be an appropriate replacement. | Att 1088b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 14, last paragraph, 4th sentence, Lines 324-325**  **REMOVE**  Gender-neutral pronouns include the singular form of "they/them/theirs."  **REPLACE WITH**  Some students may prefer the gender-neutral pronouns including the singular form of "they/them/theirs." | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 14, last paragraph, 5th sentence, Lines 325-326**  **REMOVE**  When referring to relationships, use the term "partner" or "significant other."  **REPLACE WITH**  When referring to relationships, use the term "partner" or "significant other" in addition to "husband and wife" or "boyfriend and girlfriend". | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 14, last paragraph, 7th sentence, Lines 327-329**  **REMOVE**  It can be helpful for a teacher to state their gender pronouns during classroom introductions and invite students to do the same if they are comfortable doing so.  **REPLACE WITH**  It can be helpful for a teacher to state their gender pronouns during classroom introductions and invite students to do the same, after obtaining parental approval, if they are comfortable doing so.  (Educators of public schools need to be mindful of each family's varying religious values and must notify and obtain parental consent prior to discussing certain topics that may be offensive to some students.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | John Meek, Expert in the security industry and criminal laws as a professional | **Page 14, last paragraph, 7th sentence, Lines 327-329**  **REMOVE**  It can be helpful for a teacher to state their gender pronouns during classroom introductions and invite students to do the same if they are comfortable doing so.  **REPLACE WITH**  It is not helpful for a teacher to state their gender pronouns during classroom introductions and should not invite students to do the same. Pronouns have been made such a hot button issue that the individual's name should always be used.  (Educators of public schools need to be mindful of each family's varying religious values and must notify and obtain parental consent prior to discussing certain topics that may be offensive to some students. Educators need to be reminded that pronouns are a very impersonal and imprecise form of address.  Comment: Note on this form you ask for name. So what if I put down "me." That would be unacceptable. There are immense benefits when children use the other child's specific name. The very idea of using labels is impersonal and insulting. | Att 945b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 14, line 329**  It is similarly important to acknowledge and affirm different sexual orientations and same-sex relationships so that all students feel their experiences and needs are reflected in their health education. Teachers can provide inclusive instruction with examples of varying gender identities and sexual orientations.  Comment: Affirming ones sexual orientation and same sex relationship should not be promoted by teachers. I see this as promoting unhealthy behavior and sending students on a difficult path. You wouldn’t affirm ones first cigarette and promote it as a healthy option when you know its got many health risks as well as addictive. Teachers should not be promoting any sexual behavior or gender expression. The fact that you want to makes me sick to my stomach. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 14, last paragraph, 8th sentence, Lines 329-331**  **REMOVE**  It is similarly important to acknowledge and affirm different sexual orientations and same-sex relationships so that all students feel their experiences and needs are reflected in their health education.  **REPLACE WITH**  It is similarly important to acknowledge and make note of the different sexual orientations and same-sex relationships so that all students feel their experiences and needs are reflected in their health education. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Keith Griffin, RNP, MSN, PhD | **p. 14 of 30, lines 329-335**  “It is similarly important to acknowledge and **affirm** different sexual orientations and same-sex relationships so that **all** students feel their experiences and needs are reflected in their health education. Teachers can provide inclusive instruction with examples of varying gender identities and sexual orientations. Educators must be mindful and proactive in **respectfully** recognizing differences in gender and sexual orientation in order to create a welcoming and inclusive classroom for all students.”  RESPONSE: If an employee of the school, or a speaker approved by the school, positively affirms same-sex relationships, then that means to the average student that this is the school-approved behavior and other positions taken are not so received. This would be, to the average listener, disapproving of traditional historical positions taken by the major theistic religions and will thus undercut making “all students feel their experiences and needs are reflected in their health education,” as stated in this same section of the framework. So, the expression “and affirm” in the first sentence should be deleted, replacing it with “and analyze”. | Att 736b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Katie Nguyen Public School Parent | **Page 14, Line 330** – Remove “affirm” and replace with “respect and teach classmates to respect”. It is not lawful to force someone to affirm social constructs. It is an imposition on free speech, liberty, and freedom of religion. It is lawful, however, to require people of all backgrounds and sexualities to show respect for each other. | Att 1088b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 14, last paragraph, 9th sentence, Lines 332-333**  **REMOVE**  Teachers can provide inclusive instruction with examples of varying gender identities and sexual orientations.  **REPLACE WITH**  Teachers can provide inclusive instruction with examples of varying gender identities and sexual orientations, after obtaining parental approval. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 14, last paragraph, last sentence, Lines 333-335**  **REMOVE**  Educators must be mindful and proactive in respectfully recognizing differences in gender and sexual orientation in order to create a welcoming and inclusive classroom for all students.  **REPLACE WITH**  Educators must be mindful and proactive in respectfully recognizing differences in gender and sexual orientation, along with various religious beliefs and values, in order to create a welcoming and inclusive classroom for all students | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | John Meek Expert in the security industry and criminal laws as a professional. | **Page 14, Line 356** – Add a new sentence after “respectful”: Professional educator training in the benefits of a school requiring uniforms that focus on educat5ion and not their clothing preference. The compulsory education system should focus on very basic concepts like reading, writing, arithmetic, science, and technology.  Comment: This document proves that social agendas are getting greater weight than classical educational standards. | Att 945b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Grace Moi MD, Physician in Family Medicine & MA in Marriage & Family Therapy & Pastor’s wife  Reverend James Moi MA & M Divinity in Theology  John Meek, Expert in the security industry and criminal laws as a professional | **Page 14, Line 356** – Add a new sentence after “respectful”: Professional development and trainings in cultural competency and bias training is Recommended for the educator to understand that their own biases, filters, and perceptions can impact the safety and sensitivity for these discussions. | Att 945b Att 2082a Att 2083b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | Introduction 1 | Danielle Moore, Parent | **Introduction p. 15 Line 8-** Remove “and discover” their identities. | Att 366b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 15, line 336**  The usage of LGBTQ+ throughout this document is intended to represent an inclusive and ever-changing spectrum and understanding of identities. Historically, the acronym included lesbian, gay, bisexual, <bh>and transgender<eh> but has continued to expand to include queer, questioning, intersex, asexual, allies, and alternative identities (LGBTQQIAA), as well as expanding concepts that may fall under this umbrella term in the future.  Comment: Consider removing this entirely, you can’t insert a word description that can transform into what ever you like at anytime. How could we even comment today if this word can change whenever you like later. Do you plan to add pedophilia later? | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 15, line 354**  This learning can begin as early as TK and kindergarten as students explore protective skills such as setting boundaries, identifying emotions, and telling a trusted adult if a boundary is crossed. Because gender stereotypes are often contributors to harassment and bullying, students can also begin challenging gender stereotypes early to set a foundation for more in-depth learning and discussion in higher grade levels. It is imperative that students begin learning about these issues as early as possible to promote their safety and health and to help create a safe and healthy school environment for all students.  Comment: This learning should not begin in TK. In fact this early promotion of LGBTQ curriculum got us to leave public school instruction in 2014. This is entirely too young for this type of material and in fact it is child abuse. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 15, Relationship Violence, Child Sexual Abuse, and Sex Trafficking, first paragraph, 2nd to the last sentence, Lines 359-361**  **REMOVE**  It is imperative that students begin learning about these issues as early as possible to promote their safety and health and to help create a safe and healthy school environment for all students.  **REPLACE WITH**  It is imperative that students begin learning about these issues as early as possible, with proper parental notification and approval, to promote their safety and health and to help create a safe and healthy school environment for all students.  (Many parents do not wish to have their younger age children be taught about different sexual orientations or gender identities. They have the right to exercise their personal and religious freedom to decide when and how to introduce these topics to their children.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Mildred Summerlin, grandparent of CA K–12 students; CA resident | **Page 15 Lines 359-361**  Note: Many parents and grandparents do not want their younger chidren and grandchildren taught about different sexual orientations and gender identities. Parents need to have input, notification, and right of refusal regarding when these concepts are taught to their children. | Att 1023b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 16, Line 384-385** – Replace “school counselors” with “school support staff (such as school counselors, school nurses, and school social workers” to acknowledge the role that many school support staff play in addressing student health education. Also add to the list “and community partners (such as school-based health centers)”. | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | Grace Moi MD, Physician in Family Medicine & MA in Marriage & Family Therapy & Pastor’s wife | **Page 16, Line 407–**There is a need for an introductory statement about having a strong foundation in implementing the health education standards and connecting them with the Common Core Standards in ELA and Literacy and ELD and language development. | Att 2082b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 17, bullet point**  **REMOVE**  Prioritize culturally relevant texts and topics: Use texts that accurately reflect at, <bh>wide range of<eh> students' ethnic, cultural, linguistic, and familial backgrounds, as well as other variables that contribute to their identities, such as <bh>sexual orientation<eh> and gender expression, so that students see themselves as belonging and valued in the school curriculum.  **REPLACE WITH**  Prioritize culturally relevant texts and topics: Use texts that accurately reflect at, <bh>wide range of<eh> students' ethnic, cultural, linguistic, religious, and familial backgrounds, as well as other variables that contribute to their identities, such as <bh>sexual orientation<eh> and gender expression, so that students see themselves as belonging and valued in the school curriculum. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 17, last paragraph, 2nd sentence**  **REMOVE**  In terms of gender and sexuality, using gender-neutral language and not promoting gender stereotypes can help in creating an inclusive classroom.  **REPLACE WITH**  In terms of gender and sexuality, teachers can explain that some people prefer using gender-neutral language to create an inclusive classroom. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 17, last paragraph, 4th sentence**  **REMOVE**  Gender-neutral pronouns include the singular form of "they/them/theirs."  **REPLACE WITH**  Some students may prefer the gender-neutral pronouns including the singular form of "they/them/theirs." | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 17, last paragraph, 5th sentence**  **REMOVE**  When referring to relationships, use the term "partner" or "significant other."  **REPLACE WITH**  When referring to relationships, use the term "partner" or "significant other" in addition to "husband and wife" or "boyfriend and girlfriend.” | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 17, last paragraph, 7th sentence**  **REMOVE**  It can be helpful for a teacher to state their preferred gender pronouns during classroom introductions and invite students to do the same if they are comfortable doing so.  **REPLACE WITH**  It can be helpful for a teacher to state preferred gender pronouns during classroom introductions and invite students to do the same, after obtaining parental approval, if they are comfortable doing so.  (Educators of public schools need to be mindful of each family's varying religious values and must notify and obtain parental consent prior to discussing certain topics that may be offensive to some students and parents.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 17, last paragraph, 8th sentence**  **REMOVE**  It is similarly important to acknowledge and affirm different sexual orientations and same-sex relationships so that all students feel their experiences and needs are reflected in their health education.  **REPLACE WITH**  It is similarly important to acknowledge and make note of the different sexual orientations and same-sex relationships so that all students feel their experiences and needs are reflected in their health education. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 17, last paragraph, 9th sentence**  **REMOVE**  Teachers can provide inclusive instruction with examples of varying gender identities and sexual orientations.  **REPLACE WITH**  Teachers can provide inclusive instruction with examples of varying gender identities and sexual orientations, after obtaining parental approval. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 17, last paragraph, last sentence**  **REMOVE**  Educators must be mindful and proactive in respectfully recognizing differences in gender and sexual orientation in order to create a welcoming and inclusive classroom for all students.  **REPLACE WITH**  Educators must be mindful and proactive in respectfully recognizing differences in gender and sexual orientation, along with various religious beliefs and values, in order to create a welcoming and inclusive classroom for all students. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 18, Line 423**  Child Abuse: Mandated Reporting  Consider: Include the definition of abuse (there is little mention about physical abuse or neglect)-  Child Abuse and/or Child Neglect Can Be Any of the Following:   * A physical injury inflicted on a child by another person other than by accidental means. * The sexual abuse, assault, or exploitation of a child. * The negligent treatment or maltreatment of a child by a person responsible for the child’s welfare under circumstances indicating harm or threatened harm to the child’s health or welfare. This is whether the harm or threatened harm is from acts or omissions on the part of the responsible person. * The willful harming or endangerment of the person or health of a child, any cruel or inhumane corporal punishment or any injury resulting in a traumatic condition. | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 18, line 428**  Guest speakers and media resources including books and videos should always be vetted for appropriateness, for compliance with state statutes, and to ensure the content they are providing is valid, age appropriate, and medically accurate. If a guest speaker is invited to present on topics required under the California Healthy Youth Act, they must have expertise in comprehensive sexual health and HIV prevention education.  Comment:  Replace should always be vetted with shall always be vetted. Remove medically accurate. None of this gender fluidity can be confirmed with science yet.  Guest speakers should be approved by parents, | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 18, Guest Speakers, Food, Plants, and Pets in the Classroom, first paragraph, 2nd sentence, Lines 428-431**  **REMOVE**  Guest speakers and media resources including books and videos should always be vetted for appropriateness, for compliance with state statutes, and to ensure the content they are providing is valid, age appropriate, and medically accurate.  **REPLACE WITH**  Guest speakers and media resources including books and videos should always be approved by parents, guardians, or caretakers, and vetted for appropriateness, for compliance with state statutes, and to ensure the content they are providing is valid, age appropriate, and medically accurate. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 18, Line 433**  Consider: Parent notification is required for any guest speakers invited to speak on subjects under the California Health Youth Act. | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 18, Relationship Violence, Child Sexual Abuse, and Sex Trafficking, first paragraph, 2nd to the last sentence**  **REMOVE**  It is imperative that students begin learning about these issues as early as possible to promote their safety and health and to help create a safe and healthy school environment for all students.  **REPLACE WITH**  It is imperative that students begin learning about these issues as early as possible, with proper parental notification and approval, to promote their safety and health and to help create a safe and healthy school environment for all students.  (Many parents do not wish to have their younger age children taught about different sexual orientations or gender identities. They have the right to exercise their personal and religious freedom to decide when and how to introduce these topics to their children.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 18, Line 446** – This section does an excellent job of explaining the K-12 Health Education Standards but should also include information regarding the absence of Health Education Standards for Pre-K in this section as well as in the Pre-K section. If it is appropriate to make this a Pre-K through 12 Framework, please provide this information in the Introduction. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 19, line 256**  The primary goals of the state-adopted health education standards are to:   * improve academic achievement and health literacy for all students in California, * provide school districts with fundamental tools for developing health education curricula and improving student achievement in this area, and   ensure that all students in kindergarten through high school have access to high-quality health education instruction, providing students with the knowledge, skills, and confidence to lead healthy lives.  Comment: consider restating your goals. What you are promoting and affirming is known to lead to unhealthy lifestyles. Maybe remove that. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 19. Line 449**  The focus of the health education standards is on teaching the skills that enable students to make healthy choices and avoid high-risk behaviors.  Comment: consider removing this as most of this content is promoting and confirming high-risk lifestyles | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p20** the chart of eight overarching…not sure how important the chart is. Reduce it? | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 21, Guest Speakers, Food, Plants, and Pets in the Classroom, first paragraph, 2nd sentence**  **REMOVE**  Guest speakers and media resources including books and videos should always be vetted for appropriateness, for compliance with state statutes, and to ensure the content they are providing is valid, age appropriate, and medically accurate.  **REPLACE WITH**  Guest speakers and media resources, including books and videos, should always be approved by parents, guardians, or caretakers, and vetted for appropriateness, for compliance with state statutes, and to ensure the content they are providing is valid, age appropriate, and medically accurate. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 21, Standard 3: Accessing Valid Information**  **REMOVE**  All students will demonstrate the ability to access and analyze health information, products, and services.  **REPLACE WITH**  All students will, with parental support and approval, demonstrate the ability to access and analyze health information, products, and services. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 24, Standard 3: Accessing Valid Information**  **REMOVE**  All students will demonstrate the ability to access and analyze health information, products, and services.  **REPLACE WITH**  All students will, with parental support and approval, demonstrate the ability to access and analyze health information, products, and services. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p25** the chart eek. Is this chart vital. Seems like too many charts. Will anyone really use or cite some of the charts included. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p26 510–513** good reminder. Make it in bold print. | Att 689b | **Recommended** |
|  | 1 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 26, line 519**  Educators are encouraged to seek professional learning opportunities to acquire knowledge and skill development in health topics that may be particularly challenging such as comprehensive sexual health, relationship violence, alcohol, tobacco, and other drugs (ATOD), and mental health.  Comment: consider adding educators are encouraged after parental approval. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment was with identical or similar language | **Page 26, Lines 519-523**  519 Educators are  520 encouraged to seek professional learning opportunities to acquire knowledge and skill  521 development in health topics that may be particularly challenging such as  522 comprehensive sexual health, relationship violence, alcohol, tobacco, and other drugs (ATOD), and 523 mental health.  Add in (Line 520) “unbiased, medically accurate” after “professional”  Reason: Educators should be seeking to provide accurate information, rather than personal options since they are required to provide medically accurate and objective information.  Ed Code 51933 (b) All factual information presented shall be medically accurate and objective information.  Add in (Line 520) “, where it does not violate their personal or religious beliefs, ” between “development in health topics” and “that may be particularly”  Reason: To strip educators of their protected rights of individual belief and religion would be violation of the first amendment.  Sentence should read: Educators are encouraged to seek professional, unbiased, medically accurate  learning opportunities to acquire knowledge and skill development in health topics, where it does not violate their personal or religious beliefs …. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 26, Purposes of the Framework, 2nd paragraph, 3rd sentence, Lines 526-528**  **REMOVE**  Educators are encouraged to adapt and implement what works best for their students, classroom culture, and learning environment.  **REPLACE WITH**  Educators are encouraged to adapt and implement what works best for their students, classroom culture, and learning environment after proper parental/guardian notification and approval have been obtained. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 27, last paragraph, 5th sentence, Lines 552-555**  **REMOVE**  The chapters for grades seven and eight and nine through twelve are not grade-level specific, which also reflects the organization of the standards and allows flexibility for teachers and schools to design health education courses and curriculum.  **REPLACE WITH**  The chapters for grades seven and eight and nine through twelve are not grade-level specific, which also reflects the organization of the standards and allows flexibility for teachers and schools, after obtaining proper parental/guardian notification and approval, to design health education courses and curriculum. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Heather Hebert del Cuadro, Education Specialist K–12 | **P28 line 580** add reference for data: California Adolescent Mental Health Facts: https://www.hhs.gov/ash/oah/facts-and-stats/national-and-state-data-sheets/aolescent-mental-health-fact-sheets/california/index.html (accessed 1/9/19) | Att 914b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 30, Purposes of the Framework, 2nd paragraph, 3rd sentence**  **REMOVE**  Educators are encouraged to adapt and implement what works best for their students, classroom culture, and learning environment.  **REPLACE WITH**  Educators are encouraged to adapt and implement what works best for their students, classroom culture, and learning environment after proper parental/guardian notification and approval have been obtained. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 1 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 31, last paragraph, 5th sentence**  **REMOVE**  The chapters for grades seven and eight and nine through twelve are not grade-level specific, which also reflects the organization of the standards and allows flexibility for teachers and schools to design health education courses and curriculum.  **REPLACE WITH**  The chapters for grades seven and eight and nine through twelve are not grade-level specific, which also reflects the organization of the standards and allows flexibility for teachers and schools, after obtaining proper parental/guardian notification and approval, to design health education courses and curriculum. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p3 37–42** so the need for health ed is there and most are doing BUT what do we do for the 25% doing nothing? just tweak it some. | Att 689b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 2 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 3, Line 56**  **REMOVE**  Regarding elementary, multiple subject credential holders and the California Healthy Youth Act, it is permissible to teach knowledge and skills related to comprehensive sexual health and HIV prevention education in grades Kindergarten through grade 6, inclusive. All instruction and materials in grades K–6 must meet the instructional criteria or baseline requirements in *Education Code* 51933.  **REPLACE WITH**  It is not recommended to implement the comprehensive sexual health and HIV prevention education in grades K-6, inclusive. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 3, Line 56,** Is it necessary to teach sex knowledge and skills to young children in kindergarten? Not only it’s controversial, but also harmful to teach children too early about gender identity and sex spectrum etc.  **The original:**  Regarding elementary, multiple subject credential holders and the California Healthy Youth Act, it is permissible to teach knowledge and skills related to comprehensive sexual health and HIV prevention education in grades Kindergarten through grade 6, inclusive. All instruction and materials in grades K–6 must meet the instructional criteria or baseline requirements in *Education Code* 51933.  **Suggested text:**  It is not recommended to implement the comprehensive sexual health and HIV prevention education in grades K-6, inclusive. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 3-4 of 28, Line 56-62**  It is age-inappropriate, indecent and immoral to teach “knowledge and skills related to sexual health and HIV prevention” (1) in the school setting (2) to children of any age (3) outside of the home. Sexual education should focus on scientific facts pertaining to reproduction | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 4, line 56**  Regarding elementary, multiple subject credential holders and the California Healthy Youth Act, it is permissible to teach knowledge and skills related to comprehensive sexual health and HIV prevention education in grades Kindergarten through grade 6, inclusive. All instruction and materials in grades K–6 must meet the instructional criteria or baseline requirements in Education Code 51933  Comment: Consider removing this, If you looks at the list of claimed eradicated diseases. Only mumps has shown itself to reappear recently. Maybe just limit your comment to the mumps and not multiple diseases because that is false.  Comment: Consider changing the elementary school sex lessons. This is why we had to leave our public school in 2014. When I found out they were sharing this stuff with my kindergartner, we pulled her out the following year for a private school. I’m sure you know this but assume many will not be able to escape the system. Please reconsider. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 4, Line 63-64** — Unnecessary comment here.  **The original:**  The competing demands of instruction in other subject areas cannot be a rationale for limiting health instruction.  **Suggested text:**  Remove the sentence. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 4, Line 73**  REMOVE— <bh>A careful review of the health education standards and framework with a team of educators to develop a strategy for providing high-quality health education that is integrated with other curricular areas when appropriate, including physical education, language arts, history and social science, and science is also recommended. Lastly, professional learning for all educators responsible for addressing and integrating the standards and framework is highly recommended. With careful planning and administrative leadership at the district- and school-site levels, health education can be a vital part of the curriculum in every school and for every student<eh>  **REPLACE WITH**  *\*This comment appears exactly as it was submitted to CDE.* | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p4-5 82-104** too bad no quote from U.S. Department of Education where we teachers are more associated with. All those nice bullets but no recommendation for a health COURSE??? I guess some will say it’s implied but at a district level if it isn’t there it isn’t there. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p7 147–??** So boils down to – is a health course recommended or not. I guess not. It is like the boat was missed – the need and value of a health education course which is guided by this framework???sigh | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 7, Line 153** – At the end of the paragraph include a summary sentence that would help guide local boards of education: “While health education currently, at the time of this Health Education Framework adoption, does not fulfill an A-G college requirement, school boards of education do have the authority to use their local control to include health education as a high school graduation requirement. Several districts have exercised this authority to ensure health education goals and legal mandates are met.” | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 2 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 8, line 174**  This is accomplished through their (1) knowledge and implementation of applicable federal and state mandates; (2) knowledge of California health education standards; (3) application of evidence-based instructional and assessment practices; (4) modeling of positive health behaviors; (5) providing developmentally-appropriate and up-to-date resources for teachers and instructional materials for students; (6) monitoring instruction to provide meaningful feedback and opportunities for targeted professional learning; and (7) maintaining community outreach through regular and engaging contacts with parents, guardians, caretakers, and community members.  Comment: consider removing evidenced-based | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 10, line 208**  Comprehensive and regular assessment of the school or school district’s health education program is essential for quality assurance and improvement. Local school board members, administrators, instructional leaders, school health personnel, <bh>community stakeholders, parents/guardians/caretakers working with their LEAs, and student support groups,<eh> have the additional responsibility of periodically evaluating the effectiveness of the health education program to ensure that it is meeting the needs of a diverse student population, including LGBTQ+ students, English learners, and students with disabilities, as well as the needs of the community.  The usage of LGBTQ+ throughout this document is intended to represent an inclusive and ever-changing spectrum and understanding of identities. Historically, the acronym included lesbian, gay, bisexual, <bh>and transgender<eh> but has continued to expand to include queer, questioning, intersex, asexual, allies, and alternative identities (LGBTQQIAA), as well as expanding concepts that may fall under this umbrella term in the future.  Comment: consider adding religious groups. Also your definition of LGBTQ+ as ever an ever changing and morphing meaning is pointless. You need to describe it as it is today and be done with it. Allowing it to morph over time will cause parents problems later down the road when you decide to add things like pedophilia. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **PAGE 10, Line 209-215 —**  The original:  Local school board members, administrators, instructional leaders, school health personnel, community stakeholders, parents/guardians/caretakers working with their LEAs, and student support groups, have the additional responsibility of periodically evaluating the effectiveness of the health education program to ensure that it is meeting the needs of a diverse student population, including LGBTQ+ students, English learners, and students with disabilities, as well as the needs of the community.  Suggested text:  Local school board members, administrators, instructional leaders, school health personnel, <bh>community stakeholders, parents/guardians/caretakers working with their LEAs, and student support groups,<eh> have the additional responsibility of periodically evaluating the effectiveness of the health education program to ensure that it is meeting the needs of a diverse student population, including LGBTQ+ students, <bh>students with religious belief,<eh>English learners, and students with disabilities, as well as the needs of the community.  Add “, “ after “including LGBTQ+ students,”: bh>community stakeholders, parents/guardians/caretakers working with their LEAs, and student support groups,<eh> have the additional responsibility of periodically evaluating the effectiveness of the health education program to ensure that it is meeting the needs of a diverse student population, including LGBTQ+ students, English learners, and students with disabilities, as well as the needs of the community. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 11, line 258-259 –** Revise to: **“**The Youth Risk Behavioral Surveillance System (YRBSS) is a CDC system used to monitor health-related behaviors. Both national and California data are available from the YRBSS and can be used to provide supplemental information on a wide variety of health indicators including sexual health (CDC 2015).”  There are state level data from YRBS, not just national. | Att 1031b | **Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 12, Line 268** – After “drug use,” insert this sentence: “School districts may also locally design the survey by selecting optional module(s) and items(s).” This better explains the value of the CHKS as an assessment tool. | Att 1192b | **Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 13 of 28, Line 307-313**  Sexual orientation, birth control, abortion, and sexually transmitted infection, prevention, and treatment are subjects that should not be taught outside of the home.Gender should be grounded in scientific fact and should be taught in the context of genetics and chromosomes in the science setting. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 13, Line 313**-Add a new sentence after treatment. Teachers must affirm that the rights of a pre-born baby are the same as a child of any other age. | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p15 359–383** Can’t go wrong quoting Jackie Sowers. She has always known her stuff. Last bullet is the best and the entire sentence should be bold. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Katie Nguyen Public School Parent | **Page 15, Line 369-373**–Move to strike these lines from the framework. Advocates are for political and social issues. School is a place of education and social advocates should not be invited into a elementary school education. Also, seeking children to “teach” or “advocate” on a certain subjects is not an acceptable substitute for a professional educator | Att 1088b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 16, Line 388** – “Parents, guardians, and caretakers have the right to excuse their child from comprehensive sexual health education and HIV prevention education (*California Education Cod*e [*EC*] *sections 51938* and *51939*).” This sentence belongs on Page One. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **Page 16, Line 388:** Delete “Differences of opinions are respected, but not at the expense of our students.” Together with the use of the word “bias” prior to this line, it creates a dismissive tone toward those who may have sincerely-held value objections to certain parts of sex-ed curriculum. This sentence can simply be deleted without losing the meaning of the paragraph. Or it could be replaced with “Differences of opinion should be treated with respect.” | Att 1098b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 2 | Katie Nguyen Public School Parent | **Page 16, Line 391**–Replace “medically” with “medically and biologically” accurate | Att 1088b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 16 of 28, Line 423-425**  I strongly disagree that teachers provide any resources and referrals for LGBTQ+ services. Such referrals are inappropriate in the school setting. Sexual health should be addressed in the setting of scientific evidence stating that male-female monogamous, committed relationships are the only way to avoid transmission of sexual diseases. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 17, Line 417** – After the sentence ending “on specific health topics” add this sentence: “Bringing in guest speakers is also an opportunity to bring in partners that can assist students in accessing health services on campus or in the community. Such partners include but are not limited to school-based health centers, federally qualified health centers, community mental health agencies, youth development agencies, and local health departments.” | Att 680b | **Recommended** |
|  | 2 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 17, line 420**  Guest speakers should be vetted prior to their presentation and deemed appropriate for both students and parents, guardians, and caretakers. If a guest speaker is invited to present on topics required under the CHYA, they must have expertise in comprehensive sexual health and HIV prevention education. In middle school and high school, it is required that teachers provide resources for students on sexual health services and referrals for LGBTQ+ services.  Comment; Change should be to shall be. Also add religious groups for referrals | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 17, Line 423-427**-Remove In middle school and high school, it is required that teachers provide resources for students on sexual health services and referrals for LGBTQ+ services. | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 17, Line 423 —**  **The original:**  In middle school and high school, it is required that teachers provide resources for students on sexual health services and referrals for LGBTQ+ services.  **Suggested text:**  In middle school and high school, it is required that teachers provide resources for students on sexual health services and referrals for LGBTQ+ services<bh>religious groups<eh>. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 17, line 458**  District policy should include a process for ensuring that teachers, school nurses, site administrators, and other school personnel and students are aware of state laws that give minors the right to consent to reproductive health services, mental health services, and treatment related to drug and alcohol problems without parental notification or consent and that allow them to leave campus without parental notification or consent in order to obtain these services.  Comment: this is disgusting. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 20, line 487**  Aside from classroom connectivity, students must have opportunities that give them a sense of purpose and belonging to their school and their community. Examples include special interest clubs, LGBTQ+ and ally groups, sports programs, opportunities for student leadership on councils both with other students and as student members of stakeholder groups, participation in service learning programs, and school-sponsored activities that include parents, guardians, caretakers, families and community members.  Comment: consider adding heterosexual groups, monogamy groups as well as different religious groups. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 20, Line 487**  **REMOVE**  Aside from classroom connectivity, students must have opportunities that give them a sense of purpose and belonging to their school and their community. Examples include special interest clubs, LGBTQ+ and ally groups, sports programs, opportunities for student leadership on councils both with other students and as student members of stakeholder groups, participation in service learning programs, and school-sponsored activities that include parents, guardians, caretakers, families and community members.  **REPLACE WITH**  Aside from classroom connectivity, students are encouraged to have opportunities that give them a sense of purpose and belonging to their school and their community. Examples include special interest clubs, sports programs, church involvement, student leadership on councils both with other students and as student members of stakeholder groups, participation in service learning programs, and school-sponsored activities that include parents, guardians, caretakers, families, and community members. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 20, Line 488-492** – Add “peer health educators” as an example of ways students can get involved in campus that is particularly applicable to health education. | Att 680b | **Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 20, Line 496 –** The best way of “creating a safe school environment for LGBTQ+ students…” is to see each student as a child of God and a person capable of loving God in this life and the next. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 21, Line 525**  Consider adding short paragraph on: California’s Social and Emotional Learning Guiding Principals. Social and emotional learning as an essential part of a well-rounded, quality education. The Collaborative for Academic, Social, and Emotional Learning (CASEL) defines social and emotional learning as “the process through which children and adults acquire and effectively apply the knowledge, attitudes, and skills necessary to understand and manage emotions, set and achieve positive goals, feel and show empathy for others, establish and maintain positive relationships, and make responsible decisions.” Importantly, all learning is contextual and relationship- driven and SEL can serve as a lever to enhance equity, build positive climate and culture, and foster a sense of belonging among all community members. https://www.cde.ca.gov/eo/in/documents/selguidingprincipleswb.pdf  Also, may consider the: SEL Core Competency Model Diagram  https://casel.org/core-competencies/ | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 2 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 21, line 527**  Administrative responsibilities also include the wellness of the school community through such actions as verifying vaccines, encouraging healthy lifestyles, promoting a healthy and safe school environment, and helping students and their families connect to appropriate community agencies that can offer assistance with specific concerns.  Comment: consider removing encouraging healthy lifestyles. Your affirmation of LGBTQ lifestyles is known to rife with hurdles, depression, hormone replacement drugs and increased suicide rates. Removing it would be the proper thing to do. Leaving it in there is dishonest. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 21, Line 531** – After the sentence ending “with specific concerns”, add this sentence: “Schools can play a large role in linking students and families to community-based services and can also reduce barriers to access by providing health services directly on campus, through partnerships with community providers and/or implementing school-based health centers.” | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 2 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 24, line 600**  Remove: It is also critical that school personnel create opportunities for parents, guardians, and caretakers to share their culture and expectations related to the health of their children and to provide opportunities for parents, guardians, and caretakers of children with special health care needs such as diabetes, epilepsy, or food allergies to meet and discuss concerns and strategies.  Comment: I’m not really interested in other parents culture and expectations being shared in my childs classroom. I have no idea what this content may be or how my child may see this new information if I’m trying to teach her the way we want. To have another parent and come in and share their LGBTQ lifestyle as an option for my child would be upsetting to me. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 2 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 24, Line 620** – Change to “services from community-based organizations, *such as school-based health centers…*” | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 2 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p25 general comment** – were charter schools ever mentioned anywhere in chapter 1 or chapter 2. Seems like some kind of recommendation should be made even though they are independent of much. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended.** |
|  | 2 | Katie Nguyen Public School Parent | **Page 26, Line 639**–The sentence starting with “because parents…” sounds like opinion and not fact. If there is a not a study on this that can be cited than it should be changed to something similar to: “In an effort to support guardians that may not feel equipped to talk to their children about…” | Att 1088b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 2 | Elena Costa on behalf of the California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program | **Page 57, Lines 1464-1467** – Consider seeking input from CDE’s, TUPE Program on recommendations for age appropriate educational resources which shift the burden of addressing exposure to secondhand smoke in the home to the caregiver, rather than the child.  Thank you for providing a recommendation to reach out to CDE’s TUPE Program for age appropriate resources. In line 1466-1477, the name is listed as California Department of Education’s (CDE’s) Tobacco-Use Prevention Education **Funding (TUPE)**, when it should be listed as California Department of Education, Tobacco-Use Prevention Education **(TUPE) Program**. | Att 684b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 2 | Elena Costa on behalf of the California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program | **Page 99, Line 2586**–Please replace the word “smoking” with “vaping” as the scenario references individuals are utilizing n Electronic Smoking Device and “vaping” more aptly describes the behavior. | Att 684b | **Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Maureen Burness, Mental Health Work Group Public Member; Executive Director of Statewide Special Education Task Force | This chapter did include information on growth and development; mental, emotional, and social health; and personal and community health. However, the section on personal and community health was very limited in scope and should have more on the need for a healthy community and what that would entail. | Att 297c | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Michael Buechler, Santa Ana College, Associate Professor, parent of two children, TK and grade 3 attending CA public school | Framework states “*When providing instruction on sexual and reproductive organs, teachers can introduce the concept that gender does not always match the sexual and reproductive organs described*” which does not delineate gender as theoretical or physiological with no reference to the common term gender dysphoria and reference to DSM-IV. Suggest introducing gender dysphoria when students are able to understand the term concept as one of psychological disorder as it pertains to physiological fact. Or rewording to provide that *“an individuals understanding of their gender does not always match their biological sexual and reproductive organs.”* | Att 615b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Shelley Getty Credentialed math teacher, Taft College faculty member, mother of 2 elementary aged children | Many sections in the framework mention the need for teachers to communicate with parents when there is going to be a topic or activity that may cause health risks or emotional discomfort (i.e. page 116, line 2996 --an activity learning about the sense of taste could create an allergy risk and page 117, line 3030-3031--discussions about death could be very emotional for students who have experienced it). **All** references to discussions regarding gender identity and sex education need to include the need for communication with parents before these activities and discussions are implemented in the class, including which books are being read. Including, but not limited to: page 43-44, line 1104-1131; page 61, line 1582-1602 | Att 1069b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Shelley Getty Credentialed math teacher, Taft College faculty member, mother of 2 elementary aged children | At this age level (TK through 3rd), the wording of this document needs to be very clear about what the boundaries are for what teachers should cover—both minimum and maximum boundaries—since teachers are not developmental psychologists. Some of the concepts introduced about sex, reproductive organs, and gender identity are very mature ideas and could be just as damaging to students as not addressing them at all. Teachers could take these recommendations very loosely and the actual interpretation of them could vary greatly from classroom to classroom.  **Recommendations could say adding something like:**  “stereotypes and asking open-ended questions, such as what are preferred colors, toys, subjects and activities for boys/girls, and then challenging stereotypes if presented. Examples do not have to be exaggerated or overt and should not go into discussions about people who do not feel comfortable identifying with their sex assigned at birth.” (adapted from page 44, lines 1125-1131). | Att 1069b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Jeffrey Price, 30 Year Public School Teacher, CEAI | Everywhere the term “gender” arises such language should include “religious and culture differences” in order to be inclusive in language in the framework.  **Line 174-175** where exists the identifying term “gender” should also be included “ and guidance of gender, religious, and cultural individuals”  **1104-** “Students also learn about individual differences including gender, religious, and culture differences.”  Book title, You Are Special” by author Max Lucado provides story of accepting individual differences. | Att 431b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Jeannine Topalian, Commissioner, Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | page 2-- line 10 add school psychologists  page 4-- line 59 add school psychologists  page 58-- line 1515 add school psychologists  page 62- line 1620 add school psychologists  page 98-- line 2543 add school psychologists  page 110-- line 2829 add school psychologists  page 125-- line 3205 add school psychologists  page 143-- line 3684 add school psychologists  \*\* Thought is that elementary schools most often do not have school counselors or school social workers yet they have a school psychologist assigned to the respective school. | Att 2108 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 2, Line 14 –** Recommend to include language related to child development and overall health & well-being  **Page 2, Line 23-24 –** Rephrase. “Children who are obese are more likely to be bullied or stigmatized (CDC 2016) and at increased risk of obesity in adulthood.” | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | [**page:3, Line: 49]**  **Remove**  some as the most pervasive chronic disease effecting 20 percent  **REPLACE WITH**  some as the most pervasive chronic disease affecting 20 percent | Att 554b Att 800b | **Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 3, Line 52 –** Recommend delete “borderline personality disorder” (not typically diagnosed before age 18)  **Page 3, Line 54 –** Recommend to include that suicide is the 2nd leading cause of death among youth and young adults ages 10-25 (CDC, 2017) and is preventable with mental health awareness, education, and access to services. | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 3, Line 55-58 –** Recommend to include that CASEL has 5 socio-emotional learning competencies aligned with Common Core (social awareness, relationship skills, responsible decision-making, self-management, and self-awareness). | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 4, Line 58 –** Recommend to include that all members of the school community (including students, parents/families, and **all** school staff) are able to provide socio-emotional learning.  **Page 5, Line 71 –** Strategies must be culturally sensitive for diverse learners | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
| 1. (1 of 2) | 3 | Dr. Mike Stewart, Family Member | **Page 6, Line 1008 Abuse Table – Spiritual**  Currently Stated  Using religion to justify abuse, forcing others to adhere to rigid gender roles, forcing partner to do things against their beliefs, mocking beliefs or cultural practices, not allowing partner to do things they enjoy or to better themselves, including interfering with their education.  Substitute Language for Table  “Forcing others to accept one’s religious beliefs in order to treat them with respect and compassion, demeaning the religious beliefs of others in order to force them to do things that they feel are not appropriate for them or their culture.”  Not Spiritual Issues and Should be Placed Elsewhere  “not allowing partner to do things they enjoy or to better themselves, including interfering with their education”  The language in this table is counter to the other descriptions of religion in the document. It can easily be interpreted that traditional religious teaching on human sexuality to be deemed as “abuse” by the authors of this document. This would include the CA students who were from almost all major branches of Christianity, Mormonism, Islam and conservative Jews. This is not respectful of the diversity of the student population. Religious expression is protected speech in the United States.  Chapter 1, p. 259 - instructs the teacher that CA students come from a wide array of religious backgrounds  Chapter 3, p. 20 line 517 – teacher to recognize the religious holidays of their students.  Chapter 4, p. 73 Line 1884 – students are advised to talk with trusted religious leaders (who may not agree with the current interpretation of modern genderism and thus their religious freedom to express this is deemed as abuse by this document). | Att 991b | **Not Recommended** |
| 160 (2 of 2) | 3 | Dr. Mike Stewart, Family Member | (cont’d)  Chapter 7 p. 2 Line 10 – “Ca students represent diverse ethnic and religious background | (cont’d) | **(cont’d)** |
|  | 3 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 7, Line 149-150, 171, 212** – The reference to “whole foods” or “whole nutritious foods” needs to be defined and used consistently throughout the document at each grade level. Provide additional clarification for whole foods (“plant-based” or “unprocessed” and “unrefined”). | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 7. Line 156**  <byh>To help children understand the importance of good nutrition, it is important to explain that there is more than one way to eat healthfully and everyone has their own eating style. Healthy eating patterns encompass all food and beverage choices over time, providing an adaptable, personalized framework tailored to individual preferences, culture, traditions, and budget. Explain the importance of choosing a variety of nutrient-rich foods from all food groups – dairy, fruits, vegetables, grains, and protein foods to help children build strong healthy bodies.<eyh>  Comment: I just don’t see why this needs to fall into the hands a educators. Clearly parents can teach their children how to eat unless that is your curriculum in heavily influenced by food lobbyist. In which case I will have to deprogram your work. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 9, line 198**  Not only will children learn where food comes from, they will also learn that plants need food and water to grow,  Comment: You can add the sun to the list of things needed to grow. Without sunlight we’d all die and plants need it as well. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of the Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 9. Line 206**- Change "California Department of Health Service" to "California Department of Public Health" | Att 1343b | **Recommend** |
|  | 3 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of the Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 10, Line 228**- Change to "water consumption and drinking water quality should be emphasized. | Att 1343b | **Recommend** |
|  | 3 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of the Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 10, Line 231-232-** "National School Lunch and School Breakfast Lunch Programs"- make "Program" plural | Att 1343b | **Recommend** |
|  | 3 | Rose Acosta- CSUN Teaching Student | **Page 11, Line 261-** In this introductory paragraph children darting into traffic is mentioned but not explained as a safety lesson to be taught. | Att 172b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 12, Line 240** - This paragraph needs a topic sentence. Here is a suggestion. “There are a number of activities that can reinforce injury prevention and safety knowledge and skills.” | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 12, Line 240-297 –** This paragraph needs to be edited. Four, sequential sentences begin with “Children.” Two sequential sentences state “Children should also.” The paragraph seems to ramble. If you are going to recommend “Green Light - Red Light and Simon Says,” please encourage teachers not to play them or any game as an elimination game as children need to participate in physical activity and not watch others play. We recommend that a physical educator review all physical activity references to ensure age-appropriate movement suggestions and inclusiveness. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 14, After Line 347**  Consider: Water safety. In California, drowning is a leading cause of injury-related deaths among children under the age of five. Each year, near-drowning incidents result in life-long disabilities. Child injuries are preventable. As summer and warmer weather approaches, children will be participating in water-related activities. Children and their families should be made aware of the measures to take to prevent drowning incidences. The California Department of Disabilities has resources that teachers can access, such as videos, pool safety song, and injury prevention education coloring page.  https://www.dds.ca.gov/Drowning/ | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Dale Gepfrey California resident | **Page 14, Line 356** – Add a new sentence after “respectful”:  Professional development and trainings in cultural competency and bias training is Recommended for the educator to understand that their own biases, filters, and perceptions can impact the safety and sensitivity for these discussions. Please do not teach or bring up to any children LGBTQ in the public school system, allow the parents to guide there own children. | Att 594b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 15, line 372**  Keeping children in school every day at the TK level not only supports children’s learning, it establishes a pattern of school attendance. As noted in the Children’s Report Card, chronic absenteeism in pre-school and kindergarten increases a child’s risk of repeating a grade.  Comment: consider adding keeping children in school also increases the schools funding as well as pattern of funding. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of the Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 16, Line 405-406-** Recommend adding "...such as encourage drinking water and avoid sugary drinks" after "promote healthy behaviors" | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 18, Line 459** Partnering with your Community- Consider: Many local public health departments have water safety programs and resources that schools can download. | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 18, Line 465** – “Share with families what their children are learning.” True. Share everything with families. This sentence belongs on Page One. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 24, Line 618 –** Kindergarten is an opportune time for students to learn how to make healthy choices such as healthy eating and daily physical activity. | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 28, Line 761 –** Emphasize use of physical activity that is age-appropriate and **safe** | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 29, Line 747-750** – Reference the 2018 revised and updated Health and Human Services Physical Activity Guidelines for Americans and they should be included either 1) in the Introduction or 2) in every grade level that has been identified for Nutrition and Physical Activity or 3) both places. Only having the graph with specified content in Kindergarten will not provide support for physical activity discussions in other grade levels.  Here is a copy of the Executive Summary for Pre-K through Grade 12:  Key Guidelines Below are the key guidelines included in the Physical Activity Guidelines for Americans. Key Guidelines for Preschool-Aged Children ƒ Preschool-aged children (ages 3 through 5 years) should be physically active throughout the day to enhance growth and development. ƒ Adult caregivers of preschool-aged children should encourage active play that includes a variety of activity types. Key Guidelines for Children and Adolescents ƒ It is important to provide young people opportunities and encouragement to participate in physical activities that are appropriate for their age, that are enjoyable, and that offer variety. ƒ Children and adolescents ages 6 through 17 years should do 60 minutes (1 hour) or more of moderate-to-vigorous physical activity daily: • Aerobic: Most of the 60 minutes or more per day should be either moderate or vigorous-intensity aerobic physical activity and should include vigorous intensity physical activity on at least 3 days a week. • Muscle-strengthening: As part of their 60 minutes or more of daily physical activity, children and adolescents should include muscle-strengthening physical activity on at least 3 days a week. • Bone-strengthening: As part of their 60 minutes or more of daily physical activity, children and adolescents should include bone-strengthening physical activity on at least 3 days a week.  The Executive Summary can be found at https://health.gov/paguidelines/second-edition/pdf/PAG\_ExecutiveSummary.pdf.  The 2008 graph must be revised as the muscle strengthening and bone strengthening are to be part of the 60 minutes of moderate to vigorous physical activity on at least 3 days per week. The graph you are using can be interpreted to 60 minutes of physical activity plus 60 minutes of muscle strengthening and perhaps also 60 minutes of bone strengthening activity on a given day. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 29, Line 759** –Insert another paragraph with these suggested sentences or concepts OR consider putting them into the introduction. “Physical activity opportunities should be offered more frequently during the school day than just at recess or in physical education to ensure the infusion of movement into other subject matter instruction and to help students better understand the benefits of physical activity (K.1.3.N, Essential Concepts). Teachers can creatively provide numerous opportunities for physical activity during specific subject matter instruction. An example of a teacher created movement challenge during a language lesson is ‘Make yourself as big as you can and now make yourself as small as you can.” Students then explain concepts such as what they can do if they are small (go or reach under objects) or tall (stretch and reach for something high). Teachers can provide teacher-created or a commercially-produced physical activity breaks coupled with an assessment of heart rate change which is related to increased cardio-vascular function. An example of a teacher-created physical break is having students feel their heart beat; move using a specific skill (stretching, walking forward, backward, or sideways, galloping, jumping, hopping, etc.); feel their heart beat after moving, and then identify if their heart beat is faster, slower or the same. An example of a commercially-produced physical activity break is 1-Minute Energizer that can be used in a likewise manner to help students recognize and explain the differences between slow and faster (moderate to vigorous physical activity) movement on heart rate along with identifying the benefits (stronger heart and lungs) of a faster heart rate (K.1.3.N, Essential Concepts). | Att 1092b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **p 32, Line 824**  **Remove;** *You Are a Lion! And Other Fun Yoga Poses* by TaeeunYoo (2012); (Yoga is a form of religious practice that some parents from different religious background do not want their children to be taught.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Dr. Mike Stewart  Family Member | **Page 43, Line 1091 add the words at the bottom of the paragraph“**While this understanding may be limited, students can still begin to challenge gender stereotypes in a way that is age appropriate. While students may not fully understand the concepts of gender expression and identity, some children in kindergarten and even younger have identified as transgender or understand they have a gender identity that is different from their sex assigned at birth. **“The goal is not to cause confusion about the gender of the child but to develop an awareness that other expressions exist.** | Att 991b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 43, line 1104**  Students also learn about individual differences, including gender, from a very early age. Gender socialization begins before children start school—students may believe that different norms are associated with people of particular genders by the time they enter kindergarten. While this understanding may be limited, students can still begin to challenge gender stereotypes in a way that is age appropriate  Comment: This type of instruction is not supported by evidence-based science and it is not appropriate for children of this age. Disgusting. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Shelley Getty, Credentialed math teacher, Taft College faculty member, mother of 2 elementary aged children | **Page 43, line 1104-1118**—I believe part of the paragraph is teaching the educators about how early gender identity and transgender ideas may come up, but it is confusing as to what is educating the educator and what is what needs to be taught to the student. The sentence from line 1108 to 1115 needs to be deleted to avoid that confusion. | Att 1069b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 43, Lines 1104-1118:**  Delete: Line (1105) starting ..”Gender socialization” Ending Line (1115) “and” Line (1115) starting …”My Princess Boy” Ending Line (1118) “about inclusive instruction”  Recommended Paragraph:  Students also learn about individual differences, including gender, from a very early age. All forms of gender expression should be respected.  Reasons: Does not conform to the statement in Chapter 4, page 58,  Line 1108-1109: “Challenging” gender stereotypes can alienate students who enjoy conforming to such stereotypes, while attempting to make non-conforming students feel comfortable. Teachers should not make gender-conforming students feel uncomfortable or bullying them by compelling students to engage in expressions they disagree with it or don’t understand. There is not an age that is appropriate in which to violation of their First Amendment rights.  Line 1115-1118: It is contradictory to tell educators to “challenge gender stereotypes” while at the same time stating that boys who want to dress according to girl “stereotypes” are to be supported. This encourages gender stereotypes. My Princess Boy reflects this irony. The boy is supposedly a “princess” because he conforms to princess stereotypes instead of simply being a boy who wears a dress. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Andrew Alvarez, Teacher | **Page 43, Lines 1104 thru 1131** are exclusionary to families who affirm traditional gender roles. The words “myths” and “stereotypes” are loaded terms that denigrate traditional roles of men and women. The introduction of transgender concepts at this early age is also problematic for parents whose deeply held sincere beliefs agree with the science that there are in fact only two genders. The distinction between “gender nonconformity” and “transgenderism” will be lost on students at this early age | Att 473b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **Page 43-44, lines 1104 – 1131**. Teaching kindergarten students about gender nonconformity through books like “My Princess Boy” is not age appropriate. Educators should rather be encouraged to teach their students to treat each other with respect and kindness regardless of whether they seem different. Introducing these topics at this age is an invitation to gender confusion, especially given that 85-90% of adolescents with gender dysphoria reconcile their identity to be consistent with their biological sex by adulthood. Replace entire section with “Students also learn about individual differences, including gender, from a very early age and should be taught to treat other students with respect and kindness, regardless of differences to encourage acceptance, inclusiveness, and an anti-bullying environment in schools.” Consider the wisdom of the 4-6 grade framework draft: “While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.” | Att 1098b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 43, Line 1108-1113** Remove While students may not fully understand the concepts of gender expression and identity, some children in kindergarten and even younger have identified as transgender or understand they have a gender identity that is different from their sex assigned at birth. This may present itself in different ways including dress, activity preferences, experimenting with dramatic play, and feeling uncomfortable self-identifying with their sex assigned at birth. | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
| 1. (1 of 2) | 3 | Catherine Kellert, RN, Credentialed School Nurse | **[p 43 Line 1108-1113 ] [p 43 Line 1108-1113]**  Remove:  While students may not fully understand the concepts of gender expression and identity, some  children in kindergarten and even younger have identified as transgender or understand they have a  gender identity that is different from their sex assigned at birth. This may present itself in different ways  including dress, activity preferences, experimenting with dramatic play, and feeling uncomfortable self-  identifying with their sex assigned at birth.  This is not supported by science and is just emotionally based. This may cause confusion in other  children who are simply playing. For example, a boy who loves pink may not be transgender. The boy  does not need to be labeled a certain way  3 P. 43 Line: 1115-1118  Remove: My Princess Boy by Cheryl Kilodavis is an age-appropriate book that can be used to  demonstrate gender differences and inclusion.  ( My Princess Boy does not demonstrate gender differences but uses gender stereotypes to identify  transgender.- (ex: if you wear a dress, you are a princess? )  differences, such as colors or toy preferences, can demonstrate acceptance of gender non-conformity.  ( Gender stereotype is subjective depending on their religious or cultural views. Gender non-conformity is  not scientifically proven and should not be forced to be accepted. If concepts like these are forced | Att 1545a | **Not Recommended** |
| 188 (2 of 2) | 3 | Catherine Kellert, RN, Credentialed School Nurse | **(cont’d) 3 [P. 44 Line 1119-1120]**  Remove:  Dispelling myths about gender expectations in kindergarten can lay the groundwork for acceptance,  inclusiveness, and an anti-bullying environment in schools.  What science supports the fact that sex is not male or female?  **3 [P 44 Line 1125-1131**  Remove:  Discuss gender with kindergarteners by exploring gender stereotypes and asking open-ended questions,  such as what are preferred colors, toys, and activities for boys/girls, and then challenging stereotypes if  presented. Throughout this discussion, show images of children around the same age who do not  conform to typical gender stereotypes. Examples do not have to be exaggerated or overt. Simple | Att 1545a | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 43, Line 1109** – “Some children in kindergarten and even younger have identified as transgender or understand they have a gender identity that is different from their sex assigned at birth.” It is a temporary phase and is best nurtured by traditional values. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Theophil Oros; Child care worker at Emanuel Church of God. High School Faculty Member. Family member of child in grades K–3. | **Page 43, Line 1109**—As mentioned, students may not “fully understand the concepts of gender expression and identity” at such a young age. Including such topics in the curriculum will only cause confusion in the students and push them in one direction or another without them even being able to understand the concepts that are being taught to them. These concepts should be removed from the Health education framework for the simple fact that it will cause confusion in children because they simply cannot comprehend the concepts at such a young age. | Att 955b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **p 43 Line 1109-1113**  **Remove**  While students may not fully understand the concepts of gender expression and identity, some children in kindergarten and even younger have identified as transgender or understand they have a gender identity that is different from their sex assigned at birth. This may present itself in different ways including dress, activity preferences, experimenting with dramatic play, and feeling uncomfortable self-identifying with their sex assigned at birth.  This is not supported by science and is just emotionally based. This may cause confusion in other children who are simply playing. For example, a boy who loves pink may not be transgender. The boy does not need to be labeled a certain way | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Tom Hatch, Father | **Page 43, Line 1110,** after “transgender”, a phrase that says something like “display preferences that do not conform to gender stereotypes”  Remove the phrase “understand they have a gender identity that is different from their sex assigned at birth”  “*Why*?” To make the text more philosophically consistent and avoid confusing children. If it is true that gender does not always determine preferences for colors, activities, clothing types, and so on (it is true), it cannot also be true that children would need to challenge their assigned gender, since there are no gender-generating preferences to consider. Rather preferences are independent of gender, and should be considered separately. Why continue to link preferences to gender, if they are not determined by gender? Why submit to and reinforce gender stereotypes by teaching children that they can be boys or girls, when it’s their preferences we want them to accept regardless of gender? If a child (boy or girl) feels like a girl because they want to wear dresses and makeup, we should not teach them to label that as “girl”, but rather just preferences. That is teaching them to challenge gender stereotypes more powerfully than encouraging them to question which gender they are. If a child feels constrained to identify as a different gender based on unexpected preferences, gender labels actually reinforces gender stereotypes, rather than challenge them. | Att 911b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Tom Hatch, Father | **Page 43, line 1114**, Change the term “gender non-conformity” to “unexpected preferences” or “non-traditional preferences”.  Again, it confuses children to teach them to challenge gender stereotypes by resisting calling “pink and princess girl-only” while at the same time telling them that individuals doing so are “not conforming to gender”. Since people of different genders have completely overlapping behavior and preferences, then there are no behavior or preferences that should be labeled as “gender non-conforming”. By telling children that they are resisting, we are telling them that some behaviors are gender-specific. | Att 911b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 43, line 1115**  Remove: My Princess Boy by Cheryl Kilodavis is an age-appropriate book that can be used to demonstrate gender differences and inclusion.  Comment: If my child comes anywhere near this book, I’ll be down at your school to let you know how I feel about your gay religion. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Remove P. 43 Line: 1115-1118**  *My Princess Boy* by Cheryl Kilodavis is an age-appropriate book that can be used to demonstrate gender differences and inclusion.  (My Princess Boy does not demonstrate gender differences but uses gender stereotypes to identify transgender. ex: if you wear a dress, you are a princess?) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 44, line 1119**  Dispelling myths about gender expectations in kindergarten can lay the groundwork for acceptance, inclusiveness, and an anti-bullying environment in schools  Comment: Again, your claim of only using evidence-based science is display here. Where’s the science that supports this stance? | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 44, Line 1119** – “myths about gender expectations” are not myths but common patterns from genetics. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Remove P. 44 Line 1119-1120**  Dispelling myths about gender expectations in kindergarten can lay the groundwork for acceptance, inclusiveness, and an anti-bullying environment in schools.  What science supports the fact that sex is not male or female? | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | Page 44, Lines 1119-1131: **Recommended Paragraph:**  Kindergarten can lay the groundwork for acceptance, inclusiveness, and an anti-bullying environment in schools. As students learn to accept differences and unique characteristics of others, they also learn about the characteristics of bullying and how to avoid being a bully (K.1.3.G, K.1.6.–7.S, Essential Concepts; K.7.2.M, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors). Reason: Under minding and bullying students to feel like their beliefs are myths are false, bias statements. The bias against the diversity of cultures is also reflected in the recommendation to “challenge stereotypes.” | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
| 1. (1 of 2) | 3 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | Page 44-45, Lines 1138 - 1151: Delete: Line 1138-1139 ..who defy traditional stereotypes...  Line 1141-1142 ...and myth busters. Be sure to include individuals of all genders, including people who are transgender…  Reasons for Edits:  (1) Students from culturally traditional families are not represented anywhere in the Health Framework. It is biased to characterize children’s traditional cultures as “myths” and “stereotypes” that must be busted and defied. The families of these students need to be included throughout the Framework, so that the students that hold to traditional cultures are NOT being discriminated against.  (2) By seeking only community members that defy traditional values are a violation of (Ed Code 220) “ (No person shall be subjected to discrimination on the basis of disability, gender, gender identity, gender expression, nationality, race or ethnicity, religion, sexual orientation, or any other characteristic that is contained in the definition of hate crimes set forth in Section 422.55 of the Penal Code, including immigration status, in any program or activity conducted by an educational institution that receives, or benefits from, state financial assistance, or enrolls pupils who receive state student financial aid. (Amended by Stats. 2017, Ch. 493, Sec. 3. (AB 699) Effective January 1, 2018.). | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
| 200 (2 of 2) | 3 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | Reason:1) Also violates (Ed Code 212.3) “Religion” includes all aspects of religious belief, observance, and practice and includes agnosticism and atheism.) (Added by Stats. 2007, Ch. 569, Sec. 8. Effective January 1, 2008.)You can take out the portions mention above and still include ALL community members.Line 1141-1142 does not conform to the statement in Chapter 4, page 58, Lines 1466-1469, the Health Education Framework: “While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.”Since Chapter 4 acknowledges that gender should be described as binary for fifth graders, the Framework needs to conform to this in all the earlier grades | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Nancy Yturralde, Retired BCLAD California Teacher K-12; Community Member, Grandmother, Great-Grandmother | **Page 44:Lines 1119-1131**  **Page 61: Line:1582 (“The Great Big Book of Families”)**  **Page 109: Line 2801(“Asha’s Mums: Respecting Differences”)**  The important concept to teach and model to children is that all people should be respected no matter what their differences are. All of us as members of the human race need to develop love, kindness, humility, and patience. This can be done without references to transgenderism and homosexuality, concepts that should be taught at home and not in the public-school system.  Eliminate the references to transgenderism and homosexuality in the above lines. | Att 1040b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 44, line 1125**  Discuss gender with kindergarteners by exploring gender stereotypes and asking open-ended questions, such as what are preferred colors, toys, and activities for boys/girls, and then challenging stereotypes if presented.  Comment: I’m not interested in your exploring my childs gender and then affirming her choice when she says she thinks she might like girls. This crap is just plain grotesque. Public education is infected by satanic forces. You laugh. Go ahead, that’s where this garbage comes from. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Remove P. 44 Line 1125-1131**  Discuss gender with kindergarteners by exploring gender stereotypes and asking open-ended questions, such as what are preferred colors, toys, and activities for boys/girls, and then challenging stereotypes if presented. Throughout this discussion, show images of children around the same age who do not conform to typical gender stereotypes. Examples do not have to be exaggerated or overt. Simple differences, such as colors or toy preferences, can demonstrate acceptance of gender non-conformity.  (Gender stereotype is subjective depending on their religious or cultural views. Gender non-conformity is not scientifically proven and should not be forced to be accepted. If concepts like these are forced to be accepted in public schools, lawsuits are to be expected.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 44 of 147, Line 1138-1142**  Teaching the traditional family unit of a father, mother and children is healthy and appropriate in the school setting. The school setting should honor the traditional family unit and seek to strengthen our society through promoting it. Teaching otherwise will lead to the degradation of our society. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Dr. Mike Stewart, Family Member | **Page 44, Line 1138-1142 ( Edit the words “defy” to “serve in a variety of roles” Partnering with your community:** Members of the community who “serve in a variety of roles” (e.g., women firefighters, male nurses, and <byh>stay-at-home fathers/guardians/caretakers)<eyh> could be invited as guest speakers to share about their jobs and to serve as role models and myth busters. Be sure to include individuals of all genders , including people who are transgender. Comment – This document takes the position that there are an “infinite number of genders” and that the teacher is not to assume gender based on external markers. If this is the official position then it seems impossible for the teacher to achieve a balanced level of speakers. The district should also include what it is describing as “traditional” role players in the list as that “stereotype” is likely not a present reality in many of the children’s lives such as a long term married working father/mother, stay at home mom, etc. What is diversity to you may be normative for me and that only expands some of the students knowledge base. | Att 991b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 44, Line 1141-1142** Remove Be sure to include individuals of all genders, including people who are transgender. | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **Page 44, lines 1141-42.** Delete “Be sure to include individuals of all genders, including people who are transgender.” According to gender theory behind the CHYA, how many genders are there? Encouraging schools to invite speakers of “all” genders to present to TK – 3rd graders may be impossible. The previous lines already would include speakers of a variety of genders. | Att 1098b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Katie Nguyen Public School Parent | **Page 44, Line 1142-1143**–Why is transgender the only demographic highlighted in this concept? It seems to hold sexuality and gender above all, which, in itself, is discriminatory. This whole sentence needs to be inclusive of all or removed. | Att 1088b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 46, Near line 1167** Injury and Prevention- Near line 1167  Consider adding resource: California Department of Disabilities for Water Safety https://www.dds.ca.gov/Drowning/ (note above). | Att 1056b | **Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 46, Line 1182**  Consider: Since children under the age of 8 must be secured in a car seat or booster seat, teachers can generalize their safety lesson to include riding in cars of parents, guardians, grandparents, or friends. https://www.chp.ca.gov/programs-services/programs/youth-programs/child-safety-seats | Att 1056b | **Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Rose Acosta- CSUN Teaching Student | **Page 47, line 120- 1201-** there is no transition from bike safety to stranger danger. It jumps from bike rodeo to children’s dramatic play. | Att 172b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Heather Barney, TK-12 parent in CA public schools | **Page 48, Line 948-949** Replace “Dispelling myths about gender expectations in kindergarten can lay the groundwork for acceptance, inclusiveness, and an anti-bullying environment in schools.” with “Teaching children to respect all people despite their differences can lay the groundwork for acceptance, inclusiveness, and an anti-bullying environment in schools.” | Att 1139b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Heather Barney, TK-12 parent in CA public schools | **Page 48, Line 951-952** Change “accept” to “respect” in the following sentence: “As students learn to accept differences and unique characteristics of others, they also learn about the characteristics of bullying and how to avoid being a bully.”  (Students don’t need to accept behavior, practices or differences of others that are against their religious or moral beliefs. They can respect the differences of others but should not be made to feel that they need to accept them.) | Att 1139b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Heather Barney, TK-12 parent in CA public schools | **Page 49, Line 967-970** Add “Parents should be notified ahead of time of who the guest speakers are and on what topic they will be speaking.” after the following sentence “Members of the community who defy traditional stereotypes (e.g., women firefighters, male nurses, and <byh>stay-at-home fathers/guardians/caretakers)<eyh> could be invited as guest speakers to share about their jobs and to serve as role models and myth busters.” | Att 1139b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 50, Line 1287 –** Rephrase “While students in Kindergarten learn about healthy relationships it is important to discuss safety (including with strangers, and with trusted individuals like friends and family). | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Rose Acosta- CSUN Teaching Student | **Page 50, Line 1272-** Same as before. there is no introduction to gun safety. It starts with “read out louds”. It makes the reading flow choppy. | Att 172b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 51, Line 1304 –** Recommend to include language about “consent” paragraph should also include references to culturally sensitive instruction; some cultures greet with a hug and a kiss, others with a handshake or a wave.  **Page 51, Line 1318 –** Again, recommend to include language about “consent”  **Page 51, Line 1326 –** Typo, period needs to be replaced by a comma | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Grace Moi MD, Physician in Family Medicine & MA in Marriage & Family Therapy & Pastor’s wife | **Page 51, Line: 1326-1328**  Remove:  Some children may experience abuse by a parent. guardian, or caretaker, so it is important to help children identify multiple trusted adults and think critically about what makes an adult “trusted”.  (Not age appropriate. Parents should be the ones who teach their children whom they can trust | Att 2082b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **[P.51, Line: 1326-1328]**  **Remove**:  Some children may experience abuse by a parent. guardian, or caretaker, so it is important to help children identify multiple trusted adults and think critically about what makes an adult “trusted”.  (Not age appropriate. Parents should be the ones who teach their children whom they can trust) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Adya Mishra, a California high school student | **Page 51, Lines 1327-1338** - There is a need for teachers to educate students about threats that children may face from abusers in an attempt to keep them quiet. Students should be encouraged to speak out to a trusted adult and understand that they should not comply with their abuser in an effort to protect their family members (ex. “Tell anyone and I will kill your mom”) and they can receive help from their parents, teachers, etc. | Att 420b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 52, Line 1131**  Abuse comes in many forms and the mention of physical abuse should be included, as it is as common).  Consider: Children should know that it is inappropriate for anyone to physically hurt them, even if they do something wrong. They should feel safe from harm to self. They should be encouraged to tell someone if they are being hurt. | Att 1056b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Rose Acosta- CSUN Teaching Student | **Page 52, Line1345-** Using a pet is a good example for showing appropriate touching. | Att 172b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **[P.52, 53 Line 1354-1357]**  **REMOVE**  Explain that the same can be true for humans too—that sometimes friends and classmates might not say “no,” but that does not mean “yes.” Reference a feelings chart to talk about what facial expressions might indicate that a person does not want a hug or other physical contact  (This is not an age-appropriate concepts. Children aged 5 do not need to look for a facial expression to see if they can hug their grandmother. ) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 54, Line 1391 –** Does this section need to be updated to reflect legalization of marijuana and prevalence of vaping? Is inclusion of opiates relevant? | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Suh Chen Hsiao on behalf of University of Southern California School of Social Work | **Page 54, line 1424**  add “***frustration***” as a part of the complex feelings  Page 54, line 1433  add “***modeling***”. It is important for teachers to model how kindergartners can self-regulate their feelings. | Att 297b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Suh Chen Hsiao on behalf of University of Southern California School of Social Work | **Page 56, line 1469**  Teachers may create “***quiet and safe space*** within or near the classroom). | Att 297b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Suh Chen Hsiao on behalf of University of Southern California School of Social Work | **Page 57, line 1466**  Can we add additional source for substance abuse given that Cannabis is now legal in CA. It will be important to add some content here. https://toogoodprograms.org/products/too-good-for-drugs-kindergarten | Att 297b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 57, Line 1484 –** At this developmental stage, children may have a difficult time identifying and expressing emotions. | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Jennifer Chou on behalf of the California Sexual Health Education Roundtable | **Page 58, line 1470**  Delete **“ideally”.**  EC section 51933 mandates that any instruction in comprehensive sexual health education be age‐appropriate, including instruction in fifth grade. To preface this sentence with “ideally” implies that age‐appropriateness is a suggestion,rather than a requirement. | Att 1207b | **Recommended** |
| 1. (1 of 2) | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 58, Line 1489 –** Learning how to recognize and identify the feelings and needs of self and others  **Page 58, Line 1492 –** Provide students with opportunities to make decisions as age and developmentally appropriate.  **Page 58, Line 1497 –** Recommend after this paragraph to include some of the language SB 330 around mental health awareness and reducing stigma. Students in Kindergarten can learn to identify feelings of self and others, know what “mental health” is (compare it to physical health- teach students ways to take care of mental health). Children learn that mental wellness is important so they are ready to learn. Connect mental health to physical health; in children, mental health conditions such as depression/anxiety may manifest with physical symptoms like headaches, stomachaches, or changes in sleep.  **Page 58, Line 1498 –** Recommend inclusion of “culturally sensitive” instruction of self-awareness. Values of American society may be different than those for children of different cultural backgrounds; children need to recognize and respect the differences. “Students recognize themselves as unique individuals and learn about the similarities and differences between self and others.”  **Page 58, Line 1506 –** Children can begin exploring personal values and beliefs (e.g. “I am kind to myself and others,” “I am honest,” “I am responsible,” “I like to spend time with my family,”)  **Page 58, Line 1515 –** Recommend to include “school staff” as trusted adults to be inclusive (teachers, school nurses, secretaries, bus drivers, etc). Include teaching children that it is okay to ask for help from a trusted adult (SB 330- reducing stigma). Introduce for students the school counselor/school social worker/mental health professional so they know where to seek help for emotional/mental health concerns. | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
| 230 (2 of 2) | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **(cont’d)**  **Page 58, Line 1515 –** May be a good place to include language about role of trusted adults and school personnel in reducing stigma towards | (cont’d) | **(cont’d)** |
|  | 3 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 58 , Line 1514**  Consider to include after community leaders, **medical professionals (doctor, nurse)** | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 59, Line 1520 –** Another option is the “Zones of Regulation” which identifies blue, green, yellow, red zones. Also think it is important to increase the vocabulary of “feeling” words for students; identify more emotions that “happy, mad, sad”  **Page 59, Line 1530 –** Students may also role play scenarios (you see somebody being teased on the playground, you hear your friend say mean words, your friend chooses not to play with you at recess)  **Page 59, Line 1532 –** supporting students’ self-awareness and self-management  **Page 59, Line 1543 –** Other books available specific to mental health   * “The Storm In My Brain- Kids and Mood Disorders,” available free from the Depression and Bipolar Support Alliance * Iris the Dragon series   + “Lucky Horseshoes: A Children’s Book Dealing with ADHD” (Author- Gayle Grass)   + “Catch a Falling Star” (Author- Gayle Grass)   + “Hole in One: A Children’s Book Dealing with the Topic of Anxiety Disorder” (Author- Gayle Grass)   + “I Can Fix It!: A Children’s Book Dealing With Asperger’s Syndrome and Stigma” (Author- Gayle Grass)   + “He Shoots! He Scores!: A Children’s Book Dealing with Child and Youth Mental Health Challenges and Stigma” | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Suh Chen Hsiao on behalf of University of Southern California School of Social Work | **Page 59, line 1561** replace “safe” with “pro-social” or “positive”. Not sure if young children would understand “safe”.  **Page 59, line 1563** safe and kind. Not sure if young children understand “safe”. Recommend to replace “safe” with “***helpful***” or simply just use “kind”  **Page 59, line 1567**  Add after the emotions add ***(empathy)***  **Page 59, line 1574**  Consider to modify this sentence to: “family promotes empathy, care and wellbeing of others”.  **Page 59, line 1575**  Not sure what “symbols” represents in here. Consider to modify this sentence to “Encourage inclusion of traditional cultural celebrations, values and health practices.” | Att 297b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **P. 60, lines 1544 – 1550.** Delete lines. Having 4-6th grade students create a “mock news show” about puberty changes trivializes their sexuality and breaks down appropriate emotional boundaries about early sexual activity. | Att 1098b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 60, Line 1554 –** Dramatic play also teaches effective communication and problem solving/conflict resolution | Att 173b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Remove P. 61, Line 1582~1589-**  After reading the book, *The Great Big Book of Families* by Mary Hoffman (2010) or *Families Are Different* by Nina Pellergrini (1991), students learn that there are different family structures in our society and that all family structures are valid. For example, there are immigrant families; families with lesbian, gay, bisexual, or transgender parents, guardians, or caretakers and children; families of various race and ethnicities; step- and blended families; families headed by single parents, guardians or caretakers; extended families; multi-generational families; families with members with disabilities; families from different religious traditions; foster families; and adoptive families.  REPLACE WITH:  For example, there are immigrant families; families that are not consistent of a father and a mother; families of various race and ethnicities; step- and blended families; families headed by single parents, guardians or caretakers; extended families; multi-generational families; families with members with disabilities; families from different religious traditions; foster families; and adoptive families.  Families that are not consist of a father and a mother.  (How do you explain what lesbian, gay, bisexual, or transgender is to a kindergartener? Lifestyle choices should be excluded from the example of family structures since there are so many variables) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
| 1. (1 of 2) | 3 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 61, Lines 1582-1589** Delete in line 1584: “all family structures are valid.” Add in line 1585: “families with both a mother and a father”  **Modify the order beginning in 1585:** it would be best to order based upon those most relevant to the majority, thus placing sexual topics toward the middle to end would cause it to be more inclusive and accepting while not being as much in the face of those that do not identify their home in ways predominately identified by sexual activity. Reasons:The Health Education Framework must include families with both mothers and fathers. Students from these families need to see themselves represented along with others. Teachers must not marginalize and alienate cultural groups, such as (orthodox Muslims, Jews, Christians, etc.). Remove the phrase that “all family structures are valid” as it offends many cultural beliefs that should be respected and not diminished in school. All family structures should be respected, but it doesn’t mean every person will share the same beliefs.(Ed Code 212.3) “Religion” includes all aspects of religious belief, observance, and practice and includes agnosticism and atheism.) *(Added by Stats. 2007, Ch. 569, Sec. 8. Effective January 1, 2008.)*  **Inconsistent with Chapter 4:** The reference to transgenders in third grade does not conform to the statement in Chapter 4, page 58, Lines 1466-1469, the Health Education Framework: “While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
| 237 (2 of 2) | 3 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.”  Since Chapter 4 acknowledges that gender should still be described as binary for fifth graders, the Framework needs to adhere to this in all the earlier grades | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 61, Line 1584-1589**  **REMOVE**  For example, there are immigrant families; families with lesbian, gay, bisexual, or transgender parents, guardians, or caretakers and children; families of various race and ethnicities; step- and blended families; families headed by single parents, guardians or caretakers; extended families; multi-generational families; families with members with disabilities; families from different religious traditions; foster families; and adoptive families.  **REPLACE WITH:**  For example, there are immigrant families; families that do not include a father and a mother; families of various race and ethnicities; step- and blended families; families headed by single parents, guardians or caretakers; extended families; multi-generational families; families with members with disabilities; families from different religious traditions; foster families; and adoptive families.  How do you explain what lesbian, gay, bisexual, or transgender is to a kindergartener?  Lifestyle choices should be excluded from the example of family structures since there are so many variables. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | MILDRED SUMMERLIN, grandparent of CA K–12 students; CA resident | **Page 61 lines 1584-1589**  DELETE:  families with lesbian, gay, bisexual, or transgender parents, guardians,  HOW DO you explain these terms to a kindergartener, for instance.  INSTEAD: use “families that do not consist of a father and a mother.” | Att 1023b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **[page 62, Line: 1606-1611]**  **REMOVE**  Books like Last Stop on Market Street by Matt de la Pena (2015), Mango, Abuela, and Me, by Meg Medina (2017), and Yo Soy Muslim: A Father’s Letter to His Daughter, by Mark Gonzales (2017), address universal themes that appeal to young children, such as caring and the value of diversity, promote early language and literacy development, and support the development of a healthy sense of self for young children of color.  **REPLACE WITH**  Books like Last Stop on Market Street by Matt de la Pena (2015) and Mango, Abuela, and Me, by Meg Medina (2017) address universal themes that appeal to young children, such as caring and the value of diversity, promote early language and literacy development, and support the development of a healthy sense of self for young children of color.  (It is not a universal theme when it promotes certain religious beliefs such as the Muslim belief) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 62, Line 1620 –** Other areas of support from school social worker/school counselor can include identifying and expressing feelings of self and others, anger management, emotional regulation/coping skills, effective communication & “I-feel” messages. | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 63, Line 1634 –** Other areas to involve family: provide parents/guardians with resources and activities to support students socio-emotional development at home; strategies to encourage children to self-regulate at home. Art activities drawing/coloring different emotional states. | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Kendall Fujioka ACSW, PPSC  CA. Dept of Ed Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup  Project Cal-Well ABC Unified School District | **Page 64, Line 1641 –** One area of personal/community health that I did not see addressed is physical safety during play. Measures such as wearing a helmet while riding a bike, wearing a seatbelt in the car, protective pads when playing sports. | Att 173b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 65, Line 1680**  Consider including the actual time: …”ABC” songs (**for 20 seconds**) Resource: https://www.cdc.gov/handwashing/index.html | Att 1056b | **Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 65, Following Line 1686**  transmission of germs from person to person or person to animal and immunization preventable diseases  Consider including: It is important to discuss that germs can be transmitted from person to person or from animal to person. Many animals can also transmit germs that will get a person sick. The teacher should tell the children about proper handwashing and avoiding mouth to mouth contact with animals should be emphasized.  Consider including: By kindergarten, all children without a medical exemption should have been vaccinated for school entry. Teachers can remind children that the vaccines they received at the doctor’s office will protect them serious illnesses and keep them healthy. | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 66, Line 1715**  Partnering with your school:  Consider adding into this section: Teachers should consult with the school nurse. Oral health, vision, and hearing screenings are mandated to be done during kindergarten (*and second grad*e.) The school nurse can assist with preparation, coordination, and follow-up with students and families to support personal health. Students that fail any of their screenings will require follow up. It is important for students to understand personal oral, vision, and hearing health and to take action, such as wearing glasses daily, to ensure access to their education. | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy, Executive Director | **p. 71, Line 1839-1848.** We recommend the book, “Who Are You?: The Kids Guide to Gender Identity” be removed and not available to TK-3rd graders.  Many parents feel that this is not appropriate and controversial teaching unlimited genders and having parents "make a guess" at a child's gender.  Schools should not be an advocate for gender exploration. Parents should be able to make the decision if they want their child to be exposed to such gender exploration. | Att 171b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 71, line 1846**  Books such as It's Not the Stork! A Book About Girls, Boys, Babies, Bodies, Families and Friends by Robie H. Harris (2008) or Who Are You?: The Kids Guide to Gender Identity by Brook Pessin‐Whedbee (2017) can be shared together.  Comment: These books have nothing to do with health. The teach a religious belief that gender is changeable and a mindset. None of which can be supported by scientific evidence. If you feel compelled to teach this stuff. Open a a church and all the parents that want LGBTQ children can send their kids there for you to attempt to mold them into new genders. What you guys are allowing to be done in public schools should be a crime. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **[page 71, Line: 1846-1848]**  **REMOVE**  Books such as It's Not the Stork! A Book About Girls, Boys, Babies, Bodies, Families and Friends by Robie H. Harris (2008) or Who Are You?: The Kids Guide to Gender Identity by Brook Pessin‐Whedbee (2017) can be shared together.  **REPLACE WITH**  Books such as It's Not the Stork! A Book About Girls, Boys, Babies, Bodies, Families and Friends by Robie H. Harris (2008) can be shared together.  (Who Are You? is a book that does not teach anything about growth and development. It teaches gender spectrum which has no science-based proof) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Shelley Getty, Credentialed math teacher, Taft College faculty member, mother of 2 elementary aged children | **Page 75, line 1951**—strike the word “gender” as none of the rest of the Injury Prevention and Safety section has anything to do with gender. It may be misinterpreted by boards, administrators, and teachers as adding another concept to be taught. | Att 1069b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Rose Acosta, CSUN Teaching Student | **Page 79, Line 2059**- This paragraph offers community speakers to help with safety and physical/sexual abuse. A counselor should be included so they know they are a safe person to talk to about their physical/ emotional safety. | Att 172b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | *CONSTANCE VOYTAS, Multiple Subect Teacher* | **Page 80, Line 2079** – Intro needed for the paragraph as follows: <byh> Exposure to sunshine is critical for growing children. According to the CDC (Center for Disease Control, 2012) one quarter of the US population is low in Vitamin D, the “sunshine vitamin.” Dark-skinned children face higher risk. Obesity, diabetes, and depression are linked to this deficiency. On the other hand, skin <eyh> *cancer is the most common cancer…*[See Exec. Summary, Second National Report on Biochemical Indicators of Diet and Nutrition in the U.S. Population, CDC 2012]. | Att 1205b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | *CONSTANCE VOYTAS, Multiple Subect Teacher* | **Page 80, Line 2094** – Needs more info inserted: …*balm. Students* <byh> should learn that different seasons of the year carry different risk for skin damage, and that local weather reports may include a UV Index showing the daily level of danger. Especially during the spring, summer and fall, <eyh> *students learn that broad-spectrum sunscreen of SPF 30 or higher…* | Att 1205b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 92, Line 2376** – Chocolate milk must be removed from the list of suggested “healthiest beverage choices” because of its added sugar. Replace “Low-sugar or diluted juices” with “unsweetened or diluted 100% juice”. All references to “Low-sugar or diluted juices” should be replaced with “unsweetened or diluted 100% juice.” Please use the find and replace function of Word to ensure consistency throughout the document. | Att 1192b | **Not Recommended** |
| 1. (1 of 3) | 3 | Katherine Hawksworth on behalf of the Center for Wellness and Nutrition, a program of the Public Health Institute  Norma Lisenko on behalf of Healthy Cooking with Kids, Inc.  Thomas Cruz, Concerned California Citizen | **Page 92, Line 2376**— Remove “chocolate milk,” add “unflavored” to plant-based alternative beverages, and replace “low-sugar or diluted juices” with “unsweetened or diluted 100% fruit juice.”  Change to:  Students learn that water, milk, <byh> unflavored plant-based alternative beverages,<eyh> low-sodium soups, <byh>whole fruit and vegetable smoothies mixed with water,<eyh> and unsweetened or diluted 100% fruit juice, are the healthiest beverage choices because they keep them hydrated (which is essential for their brain and body systems to grow and function) and because they have no or small amounts of sugar and calories.  We recommend these changes because milk is already listed as one of the healthiest beverage choices—meaning unflavored milk, which has naturally occurring sugar. Chocolate or other flavored milk has added sugar. It is important to add “unflavored” to plant-based alternative beverages because flavored (e.g., vanilla soy milk), has added sugar. Also, high (naturally occurring) sugar content in juice contributes to increased calorie consumption and the risk of dental caries. In addition, the lack of protein and fiber in juice can predispose to inappropriate weight gain (too much or too little). | Att 1226b  Att 1292b  Att 1307b | **Not Recommended** |
| 255 (2 of 3) | 3 | Katherine Hawksworth on behalf of the Center for Wellness and Nutrition, a program of the Public Health Institute  Norma Lisenko on behalf of Healthy Cooking with Kids, Inc.  Thomas Cruz, Concerned California Citizen | (cont’d) According to the CDC, “Added sugars are sugars and syrups that are added to foods or beverages when they are processed or prepared. Naturally occurring sugars such as those in fruit or milk are not added sugars. The CDC recommends that “Americans should limit their added sugars consumption.” (Accessible at https://www.cdc.gov/nutrition/data-statistics/know-your-limit-for-added-sugars.html)  Also, the CDC Guide to Strategies for Reducing the Consumption of Sugar-Sweetened Beverages, “Sugar-sweetened beverages (SSBs) are the largest source of added sugar and an important contributor of calories in the U.S. diet. SSBs also tend to have few, if any, other nutrients. While the definitions used by researchers have varied, we define SSBs to include soft drinks (soda or pop), fruit drinks, sports drinks, tea and coffee drinks, energy drinks, sweetened milk or milk alternatives, and any other beverages to which sugar, typically high fructose corn syrup or sucrose, has been added. Although the presence of protein and other nutrients differentiates sweetened milk and alternative milk beverages from other SSBs, adding sugar to plain milk can substantially increase the calories per serving without increasing the overall nutrient value of the drink” (http://dhhs.ne.gov/publichealth/documents/guidance\_doc\_sugar\_sweetened\_bev.pdf. Page 4).  Flavored milk specifically, regardless of fat type (in milk), the kcal difference between flavored and unflavored is ~50 kcals. Eliminating 50 kcals on a population level would be substantial for obesity prevention. If we are going to successfully reverse the obesity epidemic, we are going to have to reduce kcal intake and employ every tool possible as this is not an easy thing to reverse. Reducing intake of flavored milk is one tool in our tool chest that we should use. | Att 1226b Att 1292b Att 1307b | **Not Recommended** |
| 255 (3 of 3) | 3 | Katherine Hawksworth on behalf of the Center for Wellness and Nutrition, a program of the Public Health Institute  Norma Lisenko on behalf of Healthy Cooking with Kids, Inc.  Thomas Cruz, Concerned California Citizen | Additionally, according to California law, AB 2084, (2012), all licensed childcare centers and family day care homes are required to comply with healthy beverages standards, which states that no natural or artificial sweeteners added to any beverage. http://www.leginfo.ca.gov/pub/09-10/bill/asm/ab\_2051-2100/ab\_2084\_bill\_20100930\_chaptered.html  “All lines of evidence consistently support the conclusion that the consumption of sweetened beverages has contributed to the obesity epidemic.” (Woodward-Lopez et al, Public Health Nutrition, To what extent have sweetened beverages contributed to the obesity epidemic?, Volume 14, Issue 3, March 2011, pp. 499-509).  Greater sugary beverage consumption is associated with weight gain, obesity , and diabetes.  Important to note that this recommended change would be consistent with Chapter 4, Page 10, Lines 231-235 of the Health Education Framework in which it states: “Through guided discussion, students learn that there are many commercials, media messages, and online images that promote soda, sweetened beverages such as sports and energy drinks, juices, and chocolate milk. Students learn that just because beverages are featured in commercials and online with celebrities and sports figures does not mean these products are good for them.”  Vartanian LR, Schwartz MB, Brownell KD. Effects of Soft Drink Consumption on Nutrition and  Health: A Systematic Review and Meta Analysis. Am J Public Health. 2007;97(4):667-675.  2 Malik VS, Schulze MB, Hu FB. Intake of sugar-sweetened beverages and weight gain: a systematic review. Am J Clin Nutr. 2006;84:274-288.  3 Malik VS et al. Sugar-Sweetened Beverages and Risk of Metabolic Syndrome and Type 2 Diabetes: a meta-analysis. Diabetes Care 33:2477-2483, 2010. | Att 1226b Att 1292b Att 1307b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 96, Line 2496-2497** – Need reference to the 2018 Physical Activity Guidelines for Americans. | Att 1192b | **Recommend** |
|  | 3 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 98, Line 2552** – “farmer’s market” should be changed to “farmers’ market”. Please use the find and replace function of Word to ensure consistency throughout the document.  Is there evidence that “organic or vegetarian” restaurants are healthier? Additionally, low-income students may not have access to “organic or vegetarian” restaurants. | Att 1192b | **Recommend** |
|  | 3 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 98, Line 2560** – “Good health begins with the entire family.” True. This sentence belongs on Page One | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Suh Chen Hsiao on behalf of the USC School of Social Work | **Page 101, Line 2645**  Recommend to replace “Control” to “self-regulate”  **Page 102, line 2651**  Recommend to use “positive” or “pro-social” than “healthy” behavior  **Page 104, line 2690**  Suggest to use “difficulty” or “challenge” instead of “concern”  **Page 107, line 2763**  More a comment here as there is no first grade curriculum to review, I am wondering if the concept of “boundaries” has been covered before.  **Page 109, line 2799**  Recommend to change “in return those people the student” to in return vice versa”. | Att 297b2 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **[page:109, Line:2801-2803]**  **Remove**  Asha’s Mums: Respecting Differences by Rosamund Elwin and Michele Paulse (1990) is a book that can be used to demonstrate respect for individuals and groups.  (Recommended age for this book is 9-12. Therefore, not suitable for 2nd graders.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Shelley Getty, Credentialed math teacher, Taft College faculty member, mother of 2 elementary aged children | **Page 116, line 2989-2995**—The discussion of reproductive organs is inappropriate for this age level and needs to be removed. | Att 1069b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 116. Line 2990**  When providing instruction on sexual and reproductive organs, teachers can introduce the concept that gender does not always match the sexual and reproductive organs described. For example, teachers may share, “In the classroom, we may use the term ‘female reproductive organs’ but some people <byh>who identify as<eyh> male have these organs. The actual anatomical name for organs is utilized.  Comment: remove this unless that is you plan to also teach children that they can also rename their hands to feet and arms as legs if they like. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **[page:116, Line:2990-2995]**  **Remove**  When providing instruction on sexual and reproductive organs, teachers can introduce the concept that gender does not always match the sexual and reproductive organs described. For example, teachers may share, “In the classroom, we may use the term ‘female reproductive organs’ but some people <byh>who identify as<eyh> male have these organs. The actual anatomical name for organs is utilized.  (not scientifically proven to be true. Many people do believe in binary concepts about gender based on science and biology. It is not necessary to use the term ‘female reproductive organs’ in 3rd grade classroom.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 116 of 147, Line 2990-2995**  Teachers should teach scientific facts. Gender always matches sexual and reproductive organs. To teach otherwise is false teaching. | Att 537b 543b  569b  586b  891b  895b  976b  1039b  1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 116, Line 2990-2995** Remove When providing instruction on sexual and reproductive organs, teachers can introduce the concept that gender does not always match the sexual and reproductive organs described. For example, teachers may share, “In the classroom, we may use the term ‘female reproductive organs’ but some people <byh>who identify as<eyh> male have these organs. The actual anatomical name for organs is utilized. | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Seung Mee Lee, parent of CA public school TK–12  Eun Suk Choi, parent of CA public school TK–12 | **Remove page:116, Line:2990-2995**  When providing instruction on sexual and reproductive organs, teachers can introduce the concept that gender does not always match the sexual and reproductive organs described. For example, teachers may share, “In the classroom, we may use the term ‘female reproductive organs’ but some people <byh>who identify as<eyh> male have these organs. The actual anatomical name for organs is utilized.  (not scientifically proven to be true. Many people do believe in binary concepts about gender based on science and biology. It is not necessary to use the term ‘female reproductive organs’ in 3rd grade classroom.) | Att 424 | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | *CONSTANCE VOYTAS, Multiple Subect Teacher* | **Page 116, Line 2991** – Needs to be more precise and more empowering/ focused on choice and self-determination.  Line 2990: …*When providing instruction on* *sexual and reproductive organs, teachers can <byh> indicate that each person’s sexual and reproductive organs develop in a complete set that is either male or female, yet they may not always choose to identify with the set given them, or with either set. <eyh>* | Att 1205b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Katie Nguyen Public School Parent | **Page 116, Line 2991-2995** – Move to strike or edit: “concept that gender does not always match the sexual and reproductive organs described” and strike any language addressing sexual reproductive organs before 5th grade sex education.   1. Teachers may not discuss reproductive organs outside of sexual education that can be opted out of by parents. This violates the Healthy Youth Act that put this type of education into motion. 2. Concept is not an accurate word. Gender as a social construct vs biological gender is a more accurate statement and should be introduced at an age appropriate level. Transitional Kinder – 3rd grade (8 years old) is not an age appropriate time for adults other than legal guardians to be discussing genitalia. | Att 1088b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 116, Line 2997** – “Educators should inform parents, guardians, or caretakers and students before implementing the following activity.” True. This sentence belongs on Page One. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Shelley Getty, Credentialed math teacher, Taft College faculty member, mother of 2 elementary aged children | **Page 116, line 2999-3003**—This activity needs to be deleted as it is not accurate to how the tongue works.  See https://www.smithsonianmag.com/science-nature/neat-and-tidy-map-tastes-tongue-you-learned-school-all-wrong-180963407/ | Att 1069b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | Rose Acosta- CSUN Teaching Student | **Page 117, Line 3022-** This paragraph talks about death in the life cycle. It might be good to add a talk about emotions. When talking about a loved one or pet who’s passed it’s ok to be sad and it’s ok to not be sad and remember happy moments. | Att 172b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 3 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 125, Line 3209** – “Most third graders are very inquisitive and excitable.” False. This is true for all ages. A generalization like this needs statistical support. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 3 | CONSTANCE VOYTAS, Multiple Subect Teacher | **Page 130-31, Lines 3363-66** – This needs expansion and to be specific.  This is a good age to discuss the book GOOD PICTURES, BAD PICTURES, by Jensen about pornography, because porn use can often lead to *hypersexual disorder*, once known as porn addiction. | Att 1205b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Jeannine Topalian, Commissioner, Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **Chapter 4:**  page 25-- line 607 add school psychologists  page 25-- lines 612 & 615 change teachers to All staff  page 29-- line 700 change teachers to All educators  page 73-- line 1883 add school psychologists  page 97--line 2487 add school psychologists | Att 2108 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 1, Line 41-45**  **Page 9, Line 194**  All references to the 2008 Physical Activity Guidelines should be replaced with the revised 2018 Physical Activity Guidelines for Americans. Please use the find and replace function of Word as we have only identified some of the needed changes in our following comments.  The 2008 Guidelines do not reference preschool children. The 2018 Guidelines specifically state that “Preschool-aged children (ages 3 through 5 years) should be physically active throughout the day to enhance growth and development.” The 2008 graphic you are using does not include preschool-aged children. | Att 1192b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 3, Line 44** – Need reference to the 2018 Physical Activity Guidelines for Americans. | Att 1192b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 4, Lines 50-54**  Add Sentences following Line 54:  Students who spend an hour or more on social media websites (Facebook, Instagram, etc.) are more likely to use or misuse substances than students who do not (The National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse at Columbia University, 2011). Research shows students who participate in their religion regularly have higher academic performances, and more likely to graduate high school, and more likely to enroll in college than their unaffiliated counterparts. Also they are less likely to have substance abuse. (See End Notes: Horwitz 2018; Loury 2004; National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse 2010; John Wallace et al., nod). Affirming students’ religious beliefs and encouraging less time spent on social media can have a positive influence and the students’ performance and the school’s success. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Line 5, Line 98 –** “Approximately 32.3 percent of high school students are sexually active,” Needs statistical support. If true, then very sad. Research shows that strong families prepare young people for chastity and diplomas before marriage. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 6, Line 113**  **REMOVE**  Students who feel connected to their school are less likely to smoke cigarettes, drink alcohol, have sexual intercourse, carry weapons, or become involved in violence.  **REPLACE WITH**  Students who feel connected to their school, parents, guardians, and caretakers are less likely to smoke cigarettes, drink alcohol, have sexual intercourse, carry weapons, or become involved in violence. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 6, Line 121** – “Teachers should ensure lessons are linked to standards.” Standards are provided by physics, the Bible and statistical research. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 7, Line 139**  **REMOVE**  to incorporate content areas that are not included for their grade  **REPLACE WITH**  to incorporate content areas, with parental approval, that are not included for their grade | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 7, Line 141** – “Resources to apply the new skills…” Needs accountability. Which Families and which Churches are introducing the new skills? | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 9, Line 187-188** – Define “Sometimes” foods”. A distinction should be made between healthy and unhealthy fats. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 9, Line 190** – Low income students may not have access to “hormone and antibiotic free meat and dairy products”. Federal regulations already prohibit the use of hormones and “hormone and antibiotic free” labeling can be misleading and may not always be the healthiest choice. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 9, Line 194** – Need reference to the 2018 Physical Activity Guidelines for Americans. | Att 1192b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 10, Line 218-230-** Include history of American agriculture, sustainable food systems, influences of immigrants including family recipes/traditions, etc.  Research how groups counterbalance marketing of unhealthy foods. (this comment was accepted but inadvertently left out of the updated draft) | Att 1343b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 10, Line 233-235** – poorly written sentence | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 11, Line 236** – Replace “Low-sugar or diluted juices” with “unsweetened or diluted 100% juice.” Please use the find and replace function of Word to ensure consistency throughout the document. | Att 1192b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 11, Line 263** – The amount of sugar depends on the can size and type of soda. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Lawrence Herrera, Member, Child Nutrition Advisory Committee (CNAC) | **Page 10 of 127, Line 271 –** *Add the following:* These lesson plans should include identifying the six key nutrients (protein, carbohydrates, fat, minerals, vitamins and water) and their functions as they relate to nutrition and physical development. (4.1.1) In groups or pairs students can identify the three forms of carbohydrates (sugars, starch and fiber), what their sources are and how the body converts different carbs into short-term or long term energy. By fourth grade students should be learning about proteins, the best whole food sources of protein and how their bodies need protein for muscle growth as well as growth and maintenance of healthy organs, bloodstream, hair and nails. Students will learn that the best source of vitamins and minerals are fruits, vegetables and protein foods and that vitamins and minerals are needed for the healthy formation of bones and tissues as well as healthy skin, teeth and the maintenance of good eyesight. Students should also learn that fat consumption in moderation is also a part of a healthy diet. Fat is used by the body as a source of energy, it protects tissues and organs and helps in maintaining body heat. Finally, while we continue to encourage students to drink adequate amounts of water in lieu of sweetened drinks or energy drinks we need to emphasize the key function water plays in moving the various nutrients into the cells and removing waste from the cells and ultimately the body. Water also helps regulate body temperature during exercise. (Grade 4, Standard 1 – 4.1.1.N, 1.3.N, 1.6.N) | Att 1270b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 12, Line 287-288** – “a healthy vegetable soup” is not a realistic alternative to pizza. Homemade pizza with vegetable toppings would be a more reasonable suggestion. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 13, Line 301** – Replace “all the colors of the rainbow” with “a variety of colors.” Please use the find and replace function of Word to ensure consistency throughout the document. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 14, Line 318-319-** Add the sentence "Partner with nutrition experts such as the School District's Food Service Department and the school cafeteria for information" after "The National School Lunch and School Breakfast Programs also serve as a resource." In this last sentence change "Program" to "Programs" and "serves" to "serve" | Att 1343b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 25, Line 607**  **REMOVE**  teacher, administrator, parent, guardian, caretaker, school nurse, or<byh>school<eyh> counselor or call a suicide prevention hotline, 9-1-1, or the school police.  **REPLACE WITH**  parent, guardian, caretaker, teacher, school nurse, school counselor, administrator, or call a suicide prevention hotline, 9-1-1, or the school police. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Elena Costa on behalf of the California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program | **Page 35, Lines 863–864**- Please update the word “smoke” with the phrase “use tobacco products” and “electronic cigarettes” with the phrase “Electronic  Smoking Device (ESD)”. | Att 684b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **GRADE 5**  **Page 38, Lines 926-928**  Add Sentence after Line 928:  This includes affirming students’ individual religious beliefs/backgrounds, as studies prove religious participation mitigates substance abuse, increases academic performance, improves child health, vocabulary, reading, math, and social skills, and increases high school completion and college enrollment (See End Notes: Horwitz, 2018; John Wallace et al., nod; Loury, 2004; National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse, 2010; Schottenbauer, et al., 2007).  Reason:  Assisting students in making responsible decisions that will support a healthy lifestyle, and a lifetime of positive health behaviors, must include affirming students who actively participate in their religion | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 39, Line 974** – “Carbon Dioxide” does not need to be capitalized. | Att 1192b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Lawrence Herrera, Member, Child Nutrition Advisory Committee (CNAC) | **Page 40 of 127, Line 1004 -** *Add the following:* These lesson plans should include identifying the six key nutrients (protein, carbohydrates, fat, minerals, vitamins and water) and their functions as they relate to nutrition and physical development. (5.1.1) In groups or pairs students can identify the three forms of carbohydrates (sugars, starch and fiber), what their sources are and how the body converts different carbs into short-term or long term energy. By fourth grade students should be learning about proteins, the best whole food sources of protein and how their bodies need protein for muscle growth as well as growth and maintenance of healthy organs, bloodstream, hair and nails. Students will learn that the best source of vitamins and minerals are fruits, vegetables and protein foods and that vitamins and minerals are needed for the healthy formation of bones and tissues as well as healthy skin, teeth and the maintenance of good eyesight. Students should also learn that fat consumption in moderation is also a part of a healthy diet. Fat is used by the body as a source of energy, it protects tissues and organs and helps in maintaining body heat. Finally, while we continue to encourage students to drink adequate amounts of water in lieu of sweetened drinks or energy drinks we need to emphasize the key function water plays in moving the various nutrients into the cells and removing waste from the cells and ultimately the body. Water also helps regulate body temperature during exercise. (Gr. 5, Standard 1, 5.1.1.N, 5.1.2.N, 5.1.3.N) | Att 1270b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 41, Line 1021-1022-** End sentence at "...snacks, meals, and beverages." Delete "including water, whole fruit and vegetable smoothies". | Att 1343b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 44, Line 1108** – Change fats to “saturated fats.” | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 45, Line 1142** – How do students identify antibiotic and hormone free foods from misleading and unregulated claims, and is there scientific evidence that demonstrates the negative health impact of consuming foods with traces of antibiotics and hormones? | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 57, Lines 1445-1447-** There are more current YRBS stats available from 2017. Ever had sex before age 13 has decreased to 2.1% https://nccd.cdc.gov/youthonline/App/Results.aspx?LID=CA | Att 1243b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 57, Line 1460**  **REMOVE**  inclusive for students of all races, ethnicities, cultural backgrounds, genders, and sexual  **REPLACE WITH**  inclusive for students of all races, ethnicities, cultural and religious backgrounds, genders, and sexual | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 58, Lines 1466-1469**  Add to Line 1466: after “…not binary…”: “for some”  Line 1466 should read:  While recognizing that gender is not binary for some, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female  Reason:  Stating gender is not binary is not medically proven, and not accurate for majority of students. It will definitely strike confusion in the minds of children so young.  Remove: “More inclusive terms elated to gender identity will be used in higher grades.”  Reason: Stating that you’re going to talk about something not relavant at the specified point is generally considered as distracting. Focus should be topic and points at hand and not refer to items not relevant to the current statement. Saying you’re going to say something is a bit ridiculous. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 58, Line 1466-1469** Remove While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades. | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 58, Line 1466-1469**  Gender is binary. To teach otherwise is mixing conjecture with science. School should teach the facts. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 58, line 1466-1469**  This text box can be deleted in its entirety and replaced with a text box instructing teachers to use accurate and inclusive language, which does not support the binary. Please see reasoning below:  The text box advocates for the use of binary language with children of this age because they are “concrete learners”. This is an inaccurate assumption about the abilities and experiences of young people. Late elementary-aged children absolutely possess the ability to think outside of the gender binary; it is common for children to explore gender expansively, and sometimes kids identify as non-binary or transgender from an early age. Thus, it is critical that all gender identities and expressions be acknowledged and validated from the early grades onward. Additionally, it is confusing, contradictory, and simply bad pedagogy to first teach gender in a binary, then ask young folks to go back and change that misinformation when they’re older. It is absolutely possible to use inclusive language regardless of grade; we do this daily and have had no trouble making the information age-appropriate and understandable. We do this by mirroring children’s language and using accurate terms as a bridge for them to follow. My advice is to replace that text box with some key supportive points for using inclusive language for younger grades.  Furthermore, this is in direct contradiction with some of the other recommendations in this section. For instance, pg. 60, line 1539, instructs educators to create inclusive classrooms that challenge the gender binary. | Att 1243b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 58, Lines 1470-1475**  **Remove Entire Section (1470-1475)**  Reason:  This is pulled directly from AB329 (CHYA) and reworded. This is not mandatory until 7th grade. This should not be in Framework until 7th grade.  If sections not removed, Add Sentence:  At the end of Line 1475:  “…gender nonconformity, and sexual relationships.”  **Revised Sentence would Read:**  Comprehensive sexual health instruction must also include gender, gender expression, gender identity, and the harmful outcomes that may occur from negative gender stereotypes, gender nonconformity, and sexual relationships.  Reason:  Harmful outcomes should include the possible harmful results from gender dysphoria and sexual relationships. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Katie Nguyen Public School Parent | **Page 58, Line 1471-1473**– Remove “affirm” and replace with “respect and teach classmates to respect”. It is not lawful to force someone to affirm social constructs. It is an imposition on free speech, liberty, and freedom of religion. It is lawful, however, to require people of all backgrounds and sexualities to show respect for each other. | Att 1088b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 58, Line 1471-1475**  Instruction on sexual health should not promote or affirm sexual orientations but should simply discuss reproductive facts associated with anatomy | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 58, Line 1471-1475** Remove Instruction on sexual health content must affirm diverse sexual orientations and include examples of same-sex relationships when discussing relationships. Comprehensive sexual health instruction must also include gender, gender expression, gender identity, and the harmful outcomes that may occur from negative gender stereotypes (EC section 51933[d][6]). | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Keith Griffin, RNP, MSN, PhD | **Page 58, Line 1471-1475**  “Instruction on sexual health content **must affirm** diverse sexual orientations and include examples of same-sex relationships when discussing relationships. Comprehensive sexual health instruction must also include gender, gender expression, gender identity, and the harmful outcomes that may occur from negative gender stereotypes (EC section 51933[d][6]). Sexual health instruction is most effective when provided in an open, safe, supportive, inclusive, and **judgment-free** learning environment. While some teachers may prefer to separate male and female students during sexual health education, this is not recommended. Receiving puberty and sexual health education separately can **foster anxiety and misinformation** between males and females and allow for some students to be misgendered, or placed in **a group** that does not reflect their gender identity.  RESPONSE: If the schools’ instructors “must affirm” same-sex relationships, then they are bluntly saying that students who hold to traditional historical positions taken by the major theistic religions about same-sex relationships may not make a negative ethical judgment about them. In essence then, to these students, the school has affirmed that they are wrong in their judgments and the school is requiring these students to remain “judgment-free” about them. The words “must affirm” should be deleted and replaced with the neutral word “acknowledge”; also, the words “judgment-free” should be deleted and replaced with the word “neutral”, otherwise the school is denying validity to the ethical judgments of many of their students, and hence itself is not remaining judgment-free. | Att 736b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **P. 58, lines 1477 – 1484**. Replace with “Teachers should consider their specific student populations in deciding whether or not to separate boys and girls during sexual health education.” Encouraging schools to include boys and girls together for sexual health education for 4-6 graders has the likely effect of breaking down appropriate boundaries and normalizing sexual activity, placing young girls especially at risk. Educators should be empowered to discern what’s appropriate for their students. | Att 1098b | **Not Recommended** |
| 1. (1 of 2) | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 58, line 1478**  This sentence is phrased so gender segregated classes are frowned upon but is up to teachers’ discretion. This statement should encourage teachers to not separate students based on gender. Students should never be separated by gender. Keeping students together reduces stigma, reduces shame, and provides an opportunity for students to see bodies, body processes, sexual health, and communicating with different genders as normal and not secretive. Keeping all students together allows them to learn from each other and with each other. This includes allowing them to practice communicating with each other about these topics - a skill that is vital to develop. It also encourages the development of empathy and understanding of the experiences of folks with different bodies and different genders, and underscores the similarities and experiences that many young people share, regardless of gender. Furthermore, gender is a spectrum, and not limited to just two possibilities, therefore gender is not binary. If the class is segregated into two groups, this may leave many students out, or force them to select a group that does not feel comfortable to them (or worse yet, be assigned to a group based on assumed gender). Oftentimes gender segregation leads to teaching different content with the assumption that gender and sex are the same things (assuming all students are cis). Keeping students together ensures they receive the same content. Separation leads to increased stigma and conveys the message that there is something secretive or shameful happening. It tells young people that they cannot talk about these topics in mixed-gender company or with someone who has a different gender than they do. We know communication with adults leads to healthier outcomes. Giving young people the message that there are only some adults they can communicate with about sex/sexuality places an unnecessary and harmful barrier to communication. | Att 1243b | **Recommended** |
| 314 (2 of 2) | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | Separation enforces the message that "boys" and "girls" are different. This perpetuates binary thinking and harmful gender roles and stereotypes. Educating together promotes open, shame-free dialog about sex/bodies/sexuality. Lastly, all topics taught in sex ed are important to folks of all bodies/genders. All young people will benefit from learning about STIs, birth control, anatomy, consent, etc. There are not "boy" topics and "girl" topics. Segregating tells young people there are only certain elements of development and sexual health they need to pay attention to. For example, if the "boys" group doesn't receive as much information about birth control as the "girls" group, then they are receiving the message that birth control is something only "girls" need to be concerned with. If those participants decide to engage in the kind of sex that could cause a pregnancy then they will need that information.  Teachers should be instructed to strive for gender equity in their classrooms and schools, and to discuss the influence gender stereotypes can have. | Att 1243b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | CONSTANCE VOYTAS, Multiple Subect Teacher | **Page 59, Line 1505** – There is a need to insert other authorities on the topic of sexual health: Liberal parents make great confidantes and should not be marginalized, and teachers are not medical professionals. A sizeable number of parents can unburden the teacher and will engage this topic with children once the child is provided with the necessary vocabulary to get the ball rolling. Insert the following:  <byh> Parents, nurses and doctors can help with these questions as well, since new concerns may arise at a later date. <eyh> | Att 1205b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 59, Lines 1507-1514-** Listing these resources for teachers is very helpful. Rather than having the non-inclusive books be the default and come first, it is recommended to list the inclusive books first. Let’s make inclusivity the default. The books that are not-inclusive should be labeled as such (“Not-inclusive books”) rather than have the default be a lack of inclusivity. | Att 1243b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Shelley Getty, Credentialed math teacher, Taft College faculty member, mother of 2 elementary aged children | **Page 59, line 1521**—Encouraging web searching about puberty is not a developmentally safe way for students to gather accurate information about their bodies and the changes associated with them. That option should be deleted. | Att 1069b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Jocelyn Brown, credentialed teacher TK–12, Biology & AP Biology teacher for SVUSD | **Page 60, line 1528** – This is the only mention of menstruation anywhere in the standards K-12 that I can find. Specific instruction on menstruation for all children in 4-6th grade is needed, prior to students or their peers physically menstruating themselves. All children need instruction about what menstruation is, why it happens, and to normalize its function as part of biology. The silence in society of discussing menstruation leads to ignorance and an unspoken shame for women about a natural body function. Students need to be taught that any myths or associations with menstruation as being “unclean,” gross, or dirty need to be dispelled as it can lead to long lasting mental harm to females’ perceptions of their natural functions as well as damage to relationships by males’ ignorance about menstruation. Males also need instruction on menstruation to encourage empathy for females who are learning how to cope with first experiencing menstruation as it can lead to embarrassing situations of bloodied garments. | Att 336b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 60, Line 1528-** This section divides folks into people who “experience menstruation and breast development” and people who “experience facial hair growth and erections,” again reinforcing an inaccurate and harmful binary. Regardless of sex, people may experience breast development, grow facial hair, and experience sexual arousal (the penis and clitoris are homologous structures, and both experience erections). Because of complex and unique relationships between hormones and genes, bodies have a range of experiences at puberty. At this stage, it is important to normalize all bodies, and help students understand that most puberty changes happen to all bodies. | Att 1243b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Jocelyn Brown, credentialed teacher TK–12, Biology & AP Biology teacher for SVUSD | **Page 60, line 1529** – “Erections” in this sentence is mentioned as if it is experienced by those who also experience facial hair, i.e., boys; this assumption promotes the understanding that only boys experience erections and/or arousal. Language like this promoting an understanding of erections as “male,” completely dismisses female arousal experience and dismisses the importance of female arousal as being just as normal and natural as male arousal. Erections should be expressly taught to include both males and females and to normalize it as such. All children should be expressly taught the biology that erections are experienced for both the penis and the clitoris. | Att 336b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 60, Lines 1530-1532-** To remain inclusive, an age-range can be used instead of differentiating based on sex assigned at birth. | Att 1243b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Jocelyn Brown, credentialed teacher TK–12, Biology & AP Biology teacher for SVUSD | **Page 60, line 1536-1537** – The term “if” is used to indicate that only if students bring up masturbation will the topic be discussed. Why is it not to be expressly taught to all students as a normal process for any person? Should it not be taught to all students? In addition, the word choice specifying “physically harmful” implies that masturbation may be harmful in some other way, such as that masturbation might be “mentally harmful”? Masturbation research has shown positive health benefits and that it is a part of healthy sexual development. The sentence as currently written reflects unconscious biases against masturbation as if there is a moral aspect to avoiding masturbation, promoting its stigma. The sentence should be changed to, “Teachers should explain what masturbation is, confirm that masturbation is a healthy part of sexual development for anyone, and masturbation is not mentally or physically harmful.”  https://www.medicalnewstoday.com/articles/320265.php  https://www.webmd.com/prostate-cancer/ejaculation-prostate-cancer-risk#1  https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/21293916  https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/m/pubmed/30260677/?i=9&from=masturbation  https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3761219/ | Att 336b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 60, line 1537**  This is also an important time to discuss gender, gender roles, and gender expression as puberty can be a difficult time for young transgender students. Educators should acknowledge this and create an environment that is inclusive and challenges binary concepts about gender.  Comment: Please consider that some students may not believe in non-scientific beliefs about gender concepts | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 60, Line 1537-** The language around masturbation labels it as “not physically harmful.” This seems unnecessarily negative. Instead, it is recommended to say masturbation is safe.  Masturbation should be included in the curricula to be addressed in a straightforward manner instead of waiting for the possibility of masturbation being brought up by a student | Att 1243b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 60, Line 1537-1539**  Binary concepts about gender are true and factual and should be taught as such. Factual research about genetics should be taught | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 60, Line 1537-1541** Remove This is also an important time to discuss gender, gender roles, and gender expression as puberty can be a difficult time for young transgender students. Educators should acknowledge this and create an environment that is inclusive and challenges binary concepts about gender. | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Keith Griffin, RNP, MSN, PhD | **p. 60, Line 1537-41**  “This is also an important time to discuss gender, gender roles, and gender expression as puberty can be a difficult time for young transgender students. Educators should acknowledge this and create an environment that is inclusive and **challenges binary concepts about gender**.”  RESPONSE: Educators in public school can challenge “binary concepts about gender” only so long as they present those challenges scientifically and biologically. I.e., when issuing those “challenges” the complete statistical analysis must be included (percentages of the population affected by ‘non-binary’ gender self-identification) as well as the biological basis of the human species. The expression “challenges binary concepts about gender” should be deleted and replaced by the expression “analyzes multiple perspectives concerning gender.” | Att 736b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 60, Line 1538-** The importance of talking about gender is framed as being due to the difficulties that transgender students encounter during puberty. This framing implies that understanding gender is less important for cisgender (not transgender) students. The need for education around gender is universal and would benefit all students. | Att 1243b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 60, Line 1539-** please delete the word “transgender” from the sentence. Sentence should read “ This is also an important time to discuss gender …. puberty can be a difficult time for young students.” Puberty can be a challenging time for all students not just transgender students. As noted in previous comment. | Att 1243b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 60, Line 1539-1541**  **REMOVE**  Educators should acknowledge this and create an environment that is inclusive and challenges binary concepts about gender.  **REPLACE WITH**  Educators should acknowledge this and create an environment that is inclusive and note that some people do not believe in binary concepts about gender. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 61, Lines 1560-1561-** Including acne facial soap and a razor w/o the blade in the “puberty hygiene kit” can imply that all students should be using acne soap and all students should be shaving. I would recommend removing these two products from the puberty kits and instead be verbally noted that acne soap and shaving razors are products that some people might choose to use and advocating for students to discuss shaving and acne products with their trusted adults. | Att 1243b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 63, line 1608-** Delete “discover” replace with “learn” or “understand”  **p. 63, line 1613-** Typo: “Such as” is repeated  **p. 63, line 1625-** Here the question is asked “can you get a broken arm from someone?” as part of an exercise around communicable diseases. The answer is stated as “no.” This strikes me as inaccurate and not particularly trauma informed since in fact someone can totally break another person’s arm. My suggestion is to delete that example. | Att 1243b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 64, line 1648-** “rectal” should be defined if it is to be mentioned or teachers should have a note on how to define this word when students ask.  **p. 64, line 1650**- Change “mother” to “the person giving birth has HIV.” | Att 1243b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Keith Griffin, RNP, MSN, PhD | **p. 65, Line 1666-67**  “**Most people are at some risk for HIV** and the only way to know for sure if someone has HIV is to get tested.”  RESPONSE: This sentence is misleading medically and statistically. “Some risk” must be accurately presented in, meaning that it is very small for most people statistically. The expression “most people are at some risk for HIV” should be deleted and replaced by the clause “Some sub-populations of people are at more risk for HIV”. | Att 736b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Katie Nguyen Public School Parent | **Page 65, Line 1672-1675**– This suggested activity violates the rights of parents and students who have opted out of sexual and HIV/AIDS education. Posting posters around the school on these topics takes away the rights of parents wishing to exclude their children from such exposure at school. REMOVE this suggested activity and replace with an appropriate one.  Students’ educational posters are displayed around the room or school to commemorate World AIDS Day, National Latino AIDS Awareness Day, or National Youth HIV & AIDS Awareness Day. | Att 1088b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 65, Line 1688**  Fifth-grade students will have an opportunity to learn that gender is not strictly defined by physical anatomy or sex assigned at birth.  Comments: Please also teach the 5th graders that they can also call their anus a mouth and their nose a penis if they feel like it. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 65, Line 1688-1690**  **REMOVE**  Fifth-grade students will have an opportunity to learn that gender is not strictly defined by physical anatomy or sex assigned at birth.  **REPLACE WITH**  Fifth-grade students will have an opportunity to learn that some people believe that gender is not strictly defined by physical anatomy or sex assigned at birth. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | MILDRED SUMMERLIN, grandparent of CA K–12 students; CA resident | **Page 65, Line 1688-1690**  REPLACE: …”to learn that gender is not strictly defined”  WITH: “….to learn that, for some people, gender is not strictly defined…” | Att 1023b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 65-66, Line 1688-1694** Remove Fifth-grade students will have an opportunity to learn that gender is not strictly defined by physical anatomy or sex assigned at birth. Rather, students understand that gender refers to attitudes, feelings, characteristics, and behaviors that a given culture associates with being male or female, sometimes labeled “masculine” and “feminine.” Moreover, a person’s gender identity refers to their sense of self, while gender expression refers to their outward gender presentation including physical appearance and behaviors. | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 65-66, Line 1688-1694**  Fifth grade students need to know that gender is indeed defined by physical anatomy or sex assigned at birth. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 65, Line 1690-1692**  **REMOVE**  Rather, students understand that gender refers to attitudes, feelings, characteristics, and behaviors that a given culture associates with being male or female, sometimes labeled "masculine" and "feminine."  **REPLACE WITH**  Rather, students understand that for some people, gender refers to attitudes, feelings, characteristics, and behaviors that a given culture associates with being male or female, sometimes labeled "masculine" and "feminine." | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
| 1. (1 of 2) | 4 | Catherine Kellert, RN, Credentialed School Nurse | **Page 65, Line 1690~1692**  REMOVE  Rather, students understand that gender refers to attitudes, feelings, characteristics, and behaviors that a given culture associates with being male or female, sometimes labeled  &quot;masculine&quot; and &quot;feminine.&quot;  REPLACE WITH  Rather, students understand that,<bh>for some people<eh>, gender refers to attitudes, feelings,  characteristics, and behaviors that a given culture associates with being male or female,  sometimes labeled &quot;masculine&quot; and &quot;feminine.&quot;  **Page 69, Line 1794**  REMOVE  “We don’t have to fit into boxes and neither do our friends or peers.”  REPLACE WITH  &quot;Some people may not fit into boxes. But we all should be kind to everyone.&quot;  **Page 69, Line 1790~1792**  REMOVE  Ms. J explains that family members and parents, guardians, and caretakers influence our ideas about  gender before we are able to explore and make decisions about what colors, toys, or activities we like.  REPLACE WITH  Ms. J explains that various people in our lives sometimes influence our ideas about gender before we are  able to explore and make decisions about what colors, toys, or activities we like. | Att 1545a | **Not Recommended** |
| 342 (2 of 2) | 4 | Catherine Kellert, RN  Credentialed School Nurse | **(cont’d)**  **Page 75, Line 1902~ Page 76, Line 1904**  REMOVE  Ask the teacher librarian to introduce students to the book and encourage students to borrow the books.  REPLACE WITH  Ask the teacher librarian to introduce students to the book, after obtaining | Att 1545a | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 65, Line 1692, Page 66, Line 1694**  **REMOVE**  Moreover, a person's gender identity refers to their sense of self, while gender expression refers to their outward gender presentation including physical appearance and behaviors.  **REPLACE WITH**  Moreover, some people believe that a person's gender identity refers to their sense of self, while gender expression refers to their outward gender presentation including physical appearance and behaviors. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Katie Nguyen Public School Parent | **Page 66, Line 1697-1700**– This document previously states the following:  Chapter 4 lines 1466-1469 state: While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.  If it is stated in this document that referring to gender outside of male and female is not accommodating to the developmental stage of fifth graders and younger than these lines conflict with that conclusion. This also violates EDC Article 2 51933 that states “Instruction and materials shall be age appropriate.”  Move to strike: “Teachers should be mindful of personal biases and use gender neutral language when discussing peer and romantic relationships to be inclusive of all students in terms of gender identity, gender expression, and sexual attraction. For example, use “they” instead of using “he/she.” | Att 1088b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 66, Line 1697-1700**  **REMOVE**  Teachers should be mindful of personal biases and use gender neutral language when discussing peer and romantic relationships to be inclusive of all students in terms of gender identity, gender expression, and sexual attraction. For example, use "they" instead of using "he/she."  **REPLACE WITH**  Teachers should be mindful of various beliefs surrounding genders and explain that some people prefer to use gender neutral language when discussing peer and romantic relationships to be inclusive of all students in terms of gender identity, gender expression, and sexual attraction. Note that some people prefer to use "they" instead of using "he/she." | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 66, line 1700-** Add example for gender neutral words like crush or partner when talking about romantic feelings or relationships. | Att 1243b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 68, line 1759-** Delete this activity. This activity suggests brainstorming offensive, hateful language in order to “demonstrate their negative impact.” However, bringing such violent words into a classroom creates an unsafe environment, particularly for young people who may already have trauma around violent words. Kids know what words hurt others; they hear them all the time and can talk about them without using them. I have seen this activity done in various settings, and it was never helpful or appropriate. | Att 1243b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 69, Line 1790~1792**  **REMOVE**  Ms. J explains that family members and parents, guardians, and caretakers influence our ideas about gender before we are able to explore and make decisions about what colors, toys, or activities we like.  **REPLACE WITH**  Ms. J explains that various people in our lives sometimes influence our ideas about gender before we are able to explore and make decisions about what colors, toys, or activities we like. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 69, Line 1794**  **REMOVE**  “We don’t have to fit into boxes and neither do our friends or peers.”  **REPLACE WITH**  "Some people may not fit into common boxes. But we all should be kind to everyone." | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 69, Line 1790~1792**  **REMOVE**  Ms. J explains that family members and parents, guardians, and caretakers influence our ideas about gender before we are able to explore and make decisions about what colors, toys, or activities we like.  **REPLACE WITH**  Ms. J explains that various people in our lives sometimes influence our ideas about gender before we are able to explore and make decisions about what colors, toys, or activities we like. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 70, line 1815** – “…from a magazine <bh> or a screenshot of someone famous they follow online.”<eh> Recommend this to keep up with how folks consume media now. | Att 1031b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 70, lines 1828-1830-** For this activity, students are prompted to identify themselves and mentions that students might write negative things about themselves and later the students must do self-reflection to cross those out and replace with positive views. This in itself can lead students who are already struggling with positive self-image an opportunity to put themselves down in front of their peers and can make some students feel vulnerable and unsafe. Instead, to encourage growth of high self-esteem , students should be prompted to list things they like about themselves or goals that they have. | Att 1243b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 73, lines 1870-1873-** This phrasing gives the implication that if students do not have strong personal boundaries they will be sexually exploited; if there is no research to support this claim, I would recommend this statement be deleted. There are many reasons students should practice refusal skills aside from preventing unwanted touch. This seems to blame the survivors of sexual assault and exploitation.  **p. 73, line 1874**- This is a much-used, but incorrectly cited statistic about entry into the sex trade. Below I have pasted an excerpt from an article about that statistic from the Atlantic. I didn’t include the full text but it can be found at this link: https://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2014/09/is-one-of-the-most-cited-statistics-about-sex-work-wrong/379662/ | Att 1243b | **Not Recommended**  **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 73, line 1884-** In the listing of trusted adults, law enforcement is mentioned as an option. Given the history of police violence in many marginalized communities, law enforcement may not be considered trustworthy. If it is included, that reality should be unpacked.  **p. 73, line 1885-** To help address the reality mentioned above, the line, “It is important to note that some students may have experienced abuse by adults that others identify as safe,” could end with the following: “...safe, such as law enforcement or parents.” | Att 1243b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 75, Line 1902, Page 76, Line 1904**  **REMOVE**  Ask the teacher librarian to introduce students to the book and encourage students to borrow the books.  **REPLACE WITH**  Ask the teacher librarian to introduce students to the book and encourage students to borrow the books., after obtaining parental consent | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 76, Line 1910-1911**  **REMOVE**  All recommended online resources must be vetted for appropriateness  **REPLACE WITH**  All recommended online resources must be vetted for appropriateness and approved by parents/guardians | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 76, Edit Lines 1917-1929**  Edit:  Add to line 1917 after “Partnering with the Family”:  Foster good relationships between students and parents. Affirm each student’s familial backgrounds and/or religious beliefs, as family attendance at religious [or] spiritual programs [is] significantly correlated with improved child health, vocabulary, reading, math, and social skills (Schottenbauer, et al., 2007).  Reason:  Teachers must be aware of the tremendous value a family’s religious ties and orientation have on the students and the school as a whole, and affirm such behavior regardless of religious affiliation. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Grade 6, Page 94, Lines 2410-2413**  Revised Lines 2410-2413 Should Read:  Sometimes weapons are used to intentionally harm people out of anger, hate, frustration, revenge, or a deeply held belief. Sometimes innocent people are killed as a result of intentional or unintentional weapon use, although deaths from unintentional weapon use are very rare (4.2.2 S, Analyzing Influences). Sometimes firearms are used in instances of self-defense, where criminal acts were mitigated, prevented, or deterred.  Reason:  The description of the use of firearms is biased and solely negative, which paints a picture of weapons in the US that is not reflective of reality. While people will sometimes use firearms for evil, most of the time people use them in their employment to prevent harm at the hands of another (rape, murder, theft, etc.). Additionally, statements not supporting the second amendment of the constitution could be considered as being in opposition of the constitution and teaching students to oppose the government and **disagree with the founding principles of our country.** | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 95, Lines 2414-2417**  Add to Line 2415 after “…weapon violence.”:  Students also learn that families and friends experience sustained life from instances of justified, defensive use of firearms.  Add to Line 2416 after “weapons safety”  “…and appropriate protections for the Second Amendment.”  Revised Lines 2414-2417 Should Read:  Students learn that families and friends experience sustained loss and pain from weapon violence through research of occurrences of weapon violence. Students also learn that families and friends experience sustained life from instances of justified, defensive use of firearms. They then list the laws or policies they would propose on weapon safety and appropriate protections for the Second Amendment, if they were an elected official in their community.  ***\*See Att 1134b for list of references submitted with this comment.*** | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Elena Costa on behalf of the California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program | **Page 106, Line 2744**- Please update the word “smoking” to “tobacco”. This term will apply more broadly to what policies are being referenced in this excerpt.  **Page 106, Lines 2745- 2746**- Please remove the phrase “electronic cigarettes” in this phrase given that these are a tobacco product which is covered under the phrase “Electronic Smoking Devices” in this sentence already. | Att 684b | **Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 108, Line 2788**  they **may be** able **to identify** and understand the range of emotions and what is causing them  **Page 108 Line 2794-5** *management* is also evolving as students are able to <bs>~~recognize~~<es> **manage** their emotions and better control impulses.  **Page 108 Line 2797**  regulation of moods **and stress reactions** can still be a challenge | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Daniel McCarthy on behalf of the Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **On page 109 line 2812-2813**, add “and other educators” after teachers | Att 297f | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 110, Line 2838**  Students learn this is the body’s fight ~~or,~~ flight **or freeze** response to…  **Page 110, Line 2840**  something, being bullied, or losing a friend or loved one also cause the body and mind stress | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 111, Line 2841**  (6.1.1.M, Essential Concepts). **Students need to learn to identify their stress triggers, their signs and symptoms of stress, and learn healthy stress coping skills.** Students identify healthy… | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 111, Line 2843~2846**  **REMOVE**  Examples of healthy stress management include physical activity, journaling, finding quiet time, meditation, taking a walk, exercising, deep breathing, doing yoga, hanging out with friends, crying, and talking to their parent, guardian, or caretaker.  **REPLACE WITH**  Examples of healthy stress management include physical activity, journaling, finding quiet time, praying, meditation, taking a walk, exercising, deep breathing, doing yoga, hanging out with friends, crying, and talking to their parent, guardian, or caretaker. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 112, Line 2893**  Students **can be** <bs>~~are~~<es> introduced to the <bs>~~concept~~<es> **practice** of mindfulness for managing stress: <bs>~~being~~<es> **coming into the** present moment, being aware of emotions **and bodily sensations**, with non-judgment and curiosity <bs>~~focusing on peace and meditation~~<es>, <bs>~~even if only briefly, and taking time for oneself.~~<es> | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Daniel McCarthy on behalf of the Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **On page 112 line 2893-2895**, there should also be an insertion of a section on the Students should be introduced to the concept for mental health treatment and the professionals that are involved. | Att 297f | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 112, Lines 2897-2898** <bs>~~The Self Esteem Workbook for Teens (2013) by Lisa Schab~~<es> and  **the Mindful Child by Sue Kaiser Greenland** provide valuable resources for…[the Schab book is not an appropriate resource on mindfulness or stress management]. | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 114, Line 2953-2956**  **REMOVE**  As students learn about bullying and its harmful effects, they also learn to object appropriately to teasing or bullying of peers that is based on personal characteristics, gender, gender expression, and sexual orientation.  **REPLACE WITH**  As students learn about bullying and its harmful effects, they also learn to object appropriately to teasing or bullying of peers that is based on personal characteristics, religious values, gender, gender expression, and sexual orientation. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 115, Lines 2959-2962**  While analyzing influences on attitudes and behavior, students use introspection to also analyze prejudice and bias they may have, **including mental health stigma**. As part of this conversation, students describe how prejudice, discrimination, and bias can lead to violence **, or in the case of mental health stigma, reticence to ask for and receive help** (6.4.2.M, Interpersonal Communication). | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 115, Lines 2964-65**  For example, “Step inside the circle if you speak another language” **or “Step inside the circle if you have ever felt sad for many days.”** | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 119, Line 3070-3071** On day one, Ms. L first identifies and explains what stress is. She explains that stress is a feeling of being overwhelmed, worried, ~~or~~ run-down **or loss of control.** | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 120, Lines3087-3088**  Students are encouraged to add their own stress management ideas as well. **Ensure that research-based stress coping skills are on the list such as diaphragmatic breathing and progressive muscle relaxation practices.** | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 121, Lines 3137-3138** • <bs>~~visualization~~<es> **imagery practice** (Using your senses, imagine the sights, sounds, smells, and feelings of a calm and soothing place <bs>~~Take a mental vacation for 1–2 minutes by picturing something as~~<es> like a beach or <bs>~~quiet~~<es> mountain.) | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 121, Line 3140**  **ADD ANOTHER BULLET POINT AS SHOWN**   * praying (This works well for those who hold strong religious values.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 121, Line 3140**  • <bs>~~meditation (Sit in a quiet room with eyes closed.)~~<es> Mindfulness practice (Examples: Sit in a quiet room and listen to the sounds of the room or pay attention to your in-breath and out-breath) | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 4 | Dr Lucy Vezzuto, Coordinator, Student Mental Health & Social-Emotional Learning, Orange County Dept of Education; Member of the CDE Student Mental Health Policy Workgroup | **Page 122, Lines 3164-3166**  The discussion should cover common mental health issues facing pre-teens, **such as anxiety and mood disorders,**  and how to inform a trusted adult if they or someone they know is experiencing a mental health issue | Att 297k | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 2, Introduction, Line 4**  **ADD**  "parents, caretakers, and " after "mentorship, and support from " | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Zara Plakakis, on behalf of Parents | **Page 3, lines 38, Add:**  Students should be taught the benefits of abstinence.  This topic is only barely mentioned throughout this chapter. What is wise and protective for every student is to learn that they are too young to actually practice sexual behavior. Teachers should enforce that wisdom lies with waiting until they are older and can truly understand the consequences of their actions. | Att 960b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 3, Line 39**  **REMOVE**  "it is important for students to learn more"  **REPLACE WITH**  "it is important for some students to learn more" | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 3, Line 44**  **REMOVE**  **"**Educators play a key role in preparing students for"  **REPLACE WITH**  "Parents, caretakers, and educators play a key role in preparing students for" | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p.3, Line 46-48-** Include discussion about how and why certain nutrients (fats, sugars, caffeine, etc.) trigger similar responses in the brain as certain drugs .-this comment not recommended in previous draft.  IQC needs citation(s) to back up claim before considering. See citations:  1.Inhibitions of Nucleus Accumbens Neurons Encode a Gating Signal for Reward-Directed Behavior Sharif A. Taha, Howard L. Fields Journal of Neuroscience 4 Januar:y 2006 , 26 (1} 217-222 ; DOI: 10. 1523/JNEUROSCI .3227-05 .2006  2.Colantuoni, C., Rada, P., Mccarthy, J., Patten, C., Avena, N. M., Chadeayne, A., & Hoebel, B. G. {2012}. Evidence That Intermittent, Excessive Sugar Intake Causes Endogenous Ogioid Degendence. Obesity Research, 10{6}, 478-488 . doi: 0.1038/oby.2002.66  1.Oginsky, M. F., Goforth, P. 8., Nobile, C. W., Logez-Santiago, L. F., & Ferrario, C . R. (2016} . Eating 'Junk -Food' Produces RaQid and Long-Lasting Increases in NAc CP-AMPA ReceQtors : lmQlications for Enhanced Cue- Induced Motivation and Food Addiction . Neurog\_s'{.chog\_harmacolog'{. : official g\_ublication of the American College of Neurog\_s'{.chog\_harmaco/og'{.. 41(13}, 2977-2986.  2.Avena, N. M., Rada, P., & Hoebel, B. G. (2009} . Sugar and fat bingeing have notable differences in addict ive- like behavior. The Journal of nutrition, 139(3}, 623-8. | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 4, Lines 59-62**  Remove: Line 61 “school counselors”  Add: Line 61, “Parents, guardians and caretakers are the best resource, although” before “school nurses”  Should read: Parents, guardians and caretakers are the best resource, although school nurses can be an important resource for health instruction as well.  Reason: (1) School counselors are not licensed health educators nor are they eligible to receive a  supplementary authorization to teach health education (Commission on Teacher Credentialing  [CTC], 2018), (Per CA Health Ed. Framework Ch.1, pg. 17, Line 395-397.  (2) Parents, guardians and caretakers are their children’s first and best resource. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 4, Line 61**  **REMOVE**  "School nurses and school counselors can"  **REPLACE WITH**  "Although parents and caretakers are the best resources for their children, school nurses and school counselors can" | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 4, under Health Education Standards for Grades Seven and Eight, Line 80**  **REMOVE**  "will need instructional support, guidance,"  **REPLACE WITH**  "will need parental aid, instructional support, guidance," | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 4, Line 84**  **REMOVE**  "Educators play a key role in empowering"  **REPLACE WITH**  "After parents and caretakers, educators play a key role in empowering" | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 5, Paragraph 98-122**- break this paragraph into two distinct paragraphs- one based on obesity and the other on nutrition deficiencies.  Reorganization of sections: Middle of line 108- "some seventh and eighth graders" begin a new paragraph, using lines 117-122. Then present lines 112-116 (starting with "most adolescents"). And end with a sentence that recommends that the teachers teach adolescents to consume the proper amounts of zinc, calcium, iron,etc ... | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 5, Line 110-111**- Add semicolons after "fruits and vegetables" after "seeds" after "calcium-rich foods" after "whole grains." Delete comma between "nuts, and seeds." Sentence to read: "...fruits and vegetables; lean proteins including beans, peas, soy, buts and seeds; calcium-rich foods; whole grains; and foods low in sugar | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 9, Line 240** – Need to cite physical activity standard 7-8.7.3.N, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors as well 7-8.7.1.N. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 10, Line 242-244**  **REMOVE**  "Teachers should be aware of students who may be at risk of this and assist students by connecting them to school and community resources."  **REPLACE WITH**  "Teachers should be aware of students who may be at risk of this and assist students by alerting parents before connecting parents and children to school and community resources." | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 12, Line 304-306**  **REMOVE**  "From additional instruction, students learn that if they or someone they know is suffering from an eating disorder or is concerned about their weight, to contact a trusted adult such as their teacher, the school nurse, or school counselor for help."  **REPLACE WITH**  "From additional instruction, students learn that if they or someone they know is suffering from an eating disorder or is concerned about their weight, to contact a trusted adult such as their parent, caretaker, teacher, the school nurse, or school counselor for help." | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 12, Line 304~306**  "From additional instruction, students learn that if they or someone they know is suffering from an eating disorder or is concerned about their weight, to contact a trusted adult such as their teacher, the school nurse, or <byh>school<eyh>counselor for help."  Comment: If I find that my kid were to go to counselor for help before I was notified, I’d be very upset. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 13, Line 369-370** – Remove the insert of “nutrition” as this paragraph is only about physical activity. 7-8.1.8.N refers to food preparation. The correct standard references are 7-8.1.12.N, Essential Concepts, and 7-8.5.4.N, Decision Making, and it should be stated in the positive: “identify the immediate and long term effects and benefits of physical activity.” | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Pages 20-21, Lines 551-581** – These sections currently begin with a topic sentence reference to physical activity. There are nutrition inserts for both sections. The first paragraph ends with “Consider distributing the guide to other students in the school or posting to the school’s Web site to encourage peers to eat healthy foods and be physically active.” If you want to keep both physical activity and nutrition references, then please change the topic sentences; put the physical activity and nutrition suggestions into separate paragraphs; and cite nutrition standards as well as those identified for physical activity. **These inserts are examples of edits taken verbatim without editorial oversight.** If you want to just give physical activity examples, then you may want to edit the last sentence on line 556. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 22, Line 598-601**  **REMOVE**  Instruction in all grades is required to be age-appropriate, medically accurate, and inclusive of students of all races, ethnicities, cultural backgrounds, genders, and sexual orientations, as well as students with physical and developmental disabilities and students who are English learners.  **REPLACE WITH**  Instruction in all grades is required to be age-appropriate, medically accurate, and inclusive of students of all races, ethnicities, cultural backgrounds, religious affiliations, genders, and sexual orientations, as well as students with physical and developmental disabilities and students who are English learners. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 22, Line 603-605** Remove Instruction and materials on sexual health content must affirmatively recognize diverse sexual orientations and include examples of same-sex relationships and couples. | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 22, Line 603-608**  Instruction and materials on sexual health content should teach fact-based information on the male gender and female gender that are true and based on scientific fact. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Keith Griffin, RNP, MSN, PhD | **Page 22, Line 603-608**  “Instruction and materials on sexual health content **must affirmatively** **recognize** diverse sexual orientations and include examples of same-sex relationships and couples. Comprehensive sexual health instruction must also include gender, gender expression, gender identity, and the harmful outcomes that may occur from **negative** gender stereotypes.”  RESPONSE: The expression “must affirmatively recognize” should be replaced with the expression “acknowledge” in order school district to remain neutral with regard to sexual behavior outside the statistical norm. Also, the word “negative” should be used in such a way that the school or its employees cannot be seen as attempting to cast many students’ ethical or religious beliefs as harmful. | Att 736b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 22, Line 606-608**  **REMOVE**  Comprehensive sexual health instruction must also include gender, gender expression, gender identity, and the harmful outcomes that may occur from negative gender stereotypes.  **REPLACE WITH**  Comprehensive sexual health instruction must also include gender, gender expression and gender identity as a belief but not fact, and the harmful outcomes that may occur from negative gender stereotypes. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Lauren Chung, parent of CA public school TK–12 | **Page 22, Line 606 ~ 608**  **REMOVE**  Comprehensive sexual health instruction must also include gender, gender expression, gender identity, and the harmful outcomes that may occur from negative gender stereotypes.  **REPLACE WITH**  Comprehensive sexual health instruction must also include gender, gender expression and gender identity as a belief but not fact, and the harmful outcomes that may occur from negative gender stereotypes. | Att 424 | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Catherine Kellert, RN, Credentialed School Nurse | **Page 22, Line 606 ~ 608**  REMOVE  Comprehensive sexual health instruction must also include gender, gender  expression, gender identity, and the harmful outcomes that may occur from  negative gender stereotypes.  REPLACE WITH  Comprehensive sexual health instruction must also include gender, gender  expression and gender identity as a belief but not fact, and the harmful  outcomes that may occur from negative gender stereotypes.  **5 Page 31, LINE 856 ~ 858**  REMOVE  A condom (internal/female and external/male condom) and dental dam  demonstration is provided. After the demonstration, students individually practice  the step-by-step process on a penis model or their fingers.  REPLACE WITH  A condom (internal/female and external/male condom) is shown for an example. | Att 1545a | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Andrew Alvarez, Teacher | **Page 23, Lines 614 and 615**---For students from religious traditions that affirm a traditional view of sexuality, “healthy attitudes” toward sexuality are limited to the restriction of sexual contact to the bounds of marriage (defined as between a man and a woman). Labeling other behaviors as “healthy” would be exclusionary to those students. Add a statement that states that care must be taken to honor and respect the closely held beliefs of students who affirm a traditional view of sexuality and marriage. | Att 473b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 23, line 621-** Typo:“Psexual” should be “sexual”  **p. 23, line 633-** Change the word “children” to “students”. Throughout the framework the term students is used; please reword to remain consistent with the rest of the text. | Att 1243c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy, Executive Director | **p. 24, Line 643 - 648.** “The usage of LGBTQ+ throughout this document is intended to represent an inclusive and ever-changing spectrum and understanding of identities.”  Teaching an “ever-changing spectrum and understanding of identities” will bring confusion to students, not inclusion. If we start labeling students at this young age before they have matured and developed naturally, we are doing a disservice to them causing undo damage emotionally and possibility physically.  We can be too quick to start labeling behavior when we should just wait for nature to take its course. | Att 171b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 24, Line 653**  **REMOVE**  "Heath education teachers serve as a resource to students"  **REPLACE WITH**  "Parents, caretakers, and health education teachers serve as a resource to students | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 24, Line 663-665**  **REMOVE**  "Although data confirms a low rate of sexual activity among California students age 13 and younger, healthy practices that are established during adolescence can have a lifetime of positive implications for one's sexual health and development."  **REPLACE WITH**  "Although data confirms a low rate of sexual activity among California students age 13 and younger, abstinence or healthy practices that are established during adolescence can have a lifetime of positive implications for one's sexual health and development." | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Jocelyn Brown, credentialed teacher TK–12, Biology & AP Biology teacher for SVUSD | **Page 25, line 670-672** – See above comment regarding the term “if” and the inappropriate implication that masturbation can be harmful in other ways. | Att 336b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 25, lines 671-672-** Masturbation is referred to as “not physically harmful”, this should be reframed to provide teachers with a definition of masturbation (touching or intentionally stimulating one’s own body out of curiosity and/or for the purpose of pleasure) and note that masturbation is safe and normal. Instructors should structure talking about masturbation into their lesson. | Att 1243c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 25, Lines 678**  **REMOVE**  "Writing research papers and making presentations using digital"  **REPLACE WITH**  "With parental and educator supervision, writing research papers and making presentations using digital" | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 25, Line 682**  **REMOVE**  "Case studies are effective instructional tools for illustrating"  **REPLACE WITH**  "Age-appropriate and unbiased case studies can be effective instructional tools for illustrating" | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 25, Line 685** Remove, gender expression, gender stereotypes, and sexual orientation. | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 26, Line 713**  **REMOVE**  "Students first research valid and reliable resources online"  **REPLACE WITH**  "Under parental and educator direction, students first research valid and reliable resources online" | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 26, Line 719-721**  **REMOVE**  "The panel should be diverse and include individuals of different genders and sexual orientations and be representative of the range of races, ethnicities, and national origins of the students."  **REPLACE WITH**  "The panel should be diverse and include individuals of different genders, sexual orientations, and religious beliefs, and be representative of the range of races, ethnicities, national origins, and religious beliefs of the students." | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Grades 7th-8th, Page 26, Lines 719-721**  Recommended change - include “religions”: “representative of the range of races, ethnicities, religions, and national origins of the students.”  Remove: “and sexual orientations” as children not yet exposed to alternate lifestyles would be made to be uncomfortable or to feel that they are opposing family or personal beliefs or religious stands. Representing each culture and gender should be sufficient for lower grades.  Reason:  The U.S. Department of Education’s National Center for Education Statistics (NCES) reported that, 80 percent of high school seniors indicate that religion plays a role in their lives. It reported that 55 percent consider their religion as “very important” or “pretty important.” It is reasonable to assume this is similar, if not higher, for middle school students. (Aud, S., Kewal Ramani, A., and Frohlich, L. (2011). America’s Youth: Transitions to Adulthood (NCES 2012-026).  U.S. Department of Education, National Center for Education Statistics. p.112) | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Andrew Alvarez, Teacher | **Page 26, Lines 719-726**--- A diversity of opinion on sexual behavior and gender should also be included. Panels should include members holding to a traditional view of gender and sexuality as well as those who do not. | Att 473b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 27, line 730** – Possibly missing a comma, but “local health department sexual health clinic” is very specific and fairly non-existent. It’s broader and more appropriate to just bring in someone from the local health department since many staff there have the expertise and capacity to be a guest speaker. Remove “sexual health clinics” | Att 1031b | **Recommended** |
|  | 5 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 27, Line 730**  "Guest speakers from your local public health department sexual health clinic, or local nonprofit organizations, such as Planned Parenthood, may have well-informed sexual health educators and age-appropriate materials to support comprehensive sexual health education."  **Comment:**  I would not be happy about my school allowing an organization into my school to promote a practice with one I highly disagree with and two they profit. Both are unacceptable in my opinion. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Joan Jensen, Community member | **Page 27 Line 730** There should be a more balanced approach to speakers to be invited in. There is no mention of Christian leaders to give their perspective. | Att 165b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 27, Line 730-733**  **REMOVE**  "Guest speakers from your local public health department sexual health clinic, or local nonprofit organizations, such as Planned Parenthood, may have well-informed sexual health educators and age-appropriate materials to support comprehensive sexual health education."  **REPLACE WITH**  "Physicians who specialize in adolescent health are excellent panel experts, and they have the most relevant and age-appropriate materials to support an informed sexual health education. Speakers from local nonprofit organizations, such as Planned Parenthood, may be biased to influence students towards beliefs and ideas which correspond to their particular organizations, and these speakers should be avoided." | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Andrew Alvarez, Teacher | **Page 27, Line 731**----Add “crisis pregnancy centers” to the list of organizations. These centers emphasize alternatives to abortion. Students should be aware that these centers exist as well. | Att 473b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Andrew Alvarez, Teacher | **Page 28, Line 754-809**----Add a line emphasizing that similar scenarios should be explicitly shared with parents before the students participate. | Att 473b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Keith Griffin, RNP, MSN, PhD | **Page 28, Line 763-769 and Page 29, Line 783-787** (acting out scenarios)  “Some of the scenarios Ms. G shares are:   * Two students are at a party. One asks the other for oral sex….. * A couple is dating and one partner wants to have sexual intercourse. The other partner does not…… * Ms. G reemphasizes the point that if students find themselves in similar situations, they can rely on the communication and decision-making skills such as the models learned throughout the semester and in this activity. **Ms. G also reiterates that there is not one correct answer** and often more than one answer as every situation is unique to each individual student.”   **RESPONSE:** This suggested scenario puts the teacher example, “Ms. G”, in the position of actually promoting ethical relativism when she is represented as reiterating (i.e. more than once!) “that there is not one correct answer” when a student is confronted by another student seeking fornication: implying that there is no single right ethical choice for students without regard to those students that hold to traditional theistic morals. Thus this would represent the teacher as promoting immorality to such students. That sentence should simply be deleted entirely and not replaced. | Att 736b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 28, line 776** – Revise for clarity to “A student receives a text of unwanted nude photos of another student (sexts).” | Att 1031b | **Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 29, Line 791-802**  Concepts in relationships such as oral sex and getting tested for STI/HIV together are inappropriate to be taught in school. These are topics that exclusively should be taught in the home. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 29, Line 794** Remove , oral sex, sexual intercourse, having an exclusive relationship, | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  This comment was submitted through a form email with slight variations by seven individuals | **Page 30, Line 780:**  Recommended Change: Similar to Page 71, Lines 1717-1725, insert Essential Concepts 7-8.1.3.G “Explain the effectiveness of abstinence in preventing HIV, other STDs, and unintended pregnancy.”  Similar to Lines 1631-1642, include the following: “Everyone is doing it…Students predict what the state of California and national percentage rates are for sexual activity by youth in their age group. Students’ data predictions are captured on the white board or an electronic software program and projected for all students to see. Working in pairs, students investigate, compare, and analyze the actual rates of sexual activity using the CDC’s data for California and the California Healthy Kids Survey data available online. Students learn that most other adolescents their age are “not doing it.”  From the Health Education Framework, Chapter 4, Page 5, Lines 97-100: “An estimated 3.1 percent of California high school students reported being sexually active before the age of 13. Approximately 32.3 percent of high school students are sexually active, making sexual health education a critical content area in late elementary (CDC 2015c).” | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Phoebe J. Rhee, parent of CA public school TK–12 | **Remove page 31, LINE 856 ~ 858**  A condom (internal/female and external/male condom) and dental dam demonstration is provided. After the demonstration, students individually practice the step-by-step process on a penis model or their fingers. | Att 424 | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 31, LINE 856-858**  **REMOVE**  A condom (internal/female and external/male condom) and dental dam demonstration is provided. After the demonstration, students individually practice the step-by-step process on a penis model or their fingers.  **REPLACE WITH**  A condom (internal/female and external/male condom) is shown for an example. | Att 457b Att 554b Att 644b Att 800b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Ange Kim, parent of CA public school TK–12 | **Page 31, Line 856-858**  Original  A condom (internal/female and external/male condom) and dental dam demonstration is provided. After the demonstration, students individually practice the step-by-step process on a penis model or their fingers.  Revise  A condom for both female and male is shown for an example. | Att 706b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 31, Line 856-860** A condom (internal/female and external/male condom) and dental dam demonstration is provided. After the demonstration, students individually practice the step-by-step process on a penis model or their fingers. Alternatively, students can place the steps, displayed on cards, in the correct order and show examples of internal/female and external/male. | Att 494b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 31, Line 856-860**  Demonstrating the use of a condom is inappropriate in the school setting and should be excluded from curricula. The use of condoms is offensive to many and contrary to many people’s beliefs. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 31, Line 860-862**  **REMOVE**  For teaching methods, health education teachers should reference current medically-accurate instructional resources online and show examples of male and female condoms and dental dams.  **REPLACE WITH**  For teaching methods, health education teachers should reference current medically-accurate instructional resources online and show examples of male and female condoms. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 31, Line 860 ~ 862**  For teaching methods, health education teachers should reference current medically-accurate instructional resources online and show examples of male and female condoms and dental dams.  **Comment:**  Seems to me teaching them there are male and female condoms but gender is also choice would be highly confusing. Which is it? Are their male and female genitals are not? This religion is crazy stuff. Boy are these kids gonna be a mess by the time you guys are done with. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Andrew Alvarez, Teacher | **Page 33, Line 912-914**----These lines are controversial at best and unscientific at worst. Many families and students affirm that there are in fact two genders. Add a line that affirms respect for students with those closely held beliefs. | Att 473b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Joan Jensen, Community member | **Page 33 line 919**. Remove this portion—there is no basis for it in biology | Att 165b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy, Executive Director | **p. 33, Line 919 – 922.** Using “They, Them and Theirs” as a singular pronoun.  Should we be promoting using a plural pronoun as a singular pronoun? Isn’t this distorting grammar rules? Are we teaching our children to require the use of language that overtly contradicts certain opinions or ideas in an effort to be inclusive of various personal identities?  We request the removal of these pronouns. | Att 171b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Nazle Spence, Parent | **Page 34, line 925-** Use of the term non-monogamous and teaching students about polyfidelity is incredibly problematic for our family. Why is it ok to teach kids about engaging in polyamorous relationships, and yet not providing them the same amount of information regarding monogamous relationships? Is there a curriculum and/or framework available to inform students about relationships between two committed individuals? If not, that should be equally included in the framework. At minimum, we should be allowed to make our children exempt from the material. I would make every necessary adjustment needed in order to pull my child from public education if this problematic framework is not at least left up to the parent to include or exclude. | Att 641b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Zara Plakakis, on behalf of Parents | **Page 34, line 925,** Omit and Change  Some students may be non-monogamous and the term “partner(s)” may also be used to be more inclusive.  Change to *Some students may prefer the term “partner(s)” to be more inclusive.* Non-monogamous relationships are damaging and the curriculum should promote that idea. | Att 960b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy, Executive Director | **P. 34, Line 925-926.** We suggest removing this sentence: “Some students may be non-monogamous and the term “partner(s)” may also be used to be more inclusive.”  Advocating or teaching that having a relationship with multiple partners is okay and suitable to teach 7th graders is not acceptable. | Att 171b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 35, line 942-** Physical Affection is listed as a component of a healthy relationship. It is recommended to add consent to this. Physical affection without consent is not healthy. | Att 1243c | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 36, line 954-956-** Asking students to research effects of abusive relationships is not trauma-informed and can trigger students who experience trauma and abuse outside of romantic relationships. Precautions should be taken to ensure this activity is done in a trauma-informed manner or the activity should be cut. | Att 1243c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **P. 41, lines 1052-53.** Delete “insisting on rigid gender roles.” While I sympathize with this inclusion and see how some examples of this could be abusive, given the description by this framework of traditional gender roles as “myths” or “stereotypes” to be challenged, it is difficult to see how anyone who believes, according to their faith, in a more traditional understanding of gender, will not be labeled as a potential abuser. This could potentially set a dangerous precedent of viewing people of faith as likely abusers if they prefer to date others who share their views on gender or express those preferences to a partner. | Att 1098b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy, Executive Director | **p. 41, Line 1052-1056.** “Examples for spiritual abuse using religion to justify abuse, insisting on rigid gender roles ...”  Does this mean that if I am a practicing Mormon, Catholic, Orthodox Jew, Muslim, or Evangelical Christian and I don’t agree or believe in “unlimited genders” I would be labeled “abusive” and “rigid”? The term Spiritual Abuse is a dangerous statement and a very dangerous term that can be misinterpreted, causing conflict between parents and children based on what is taught in the home and what is being taught in the schools. Respect and tolerance can be achieved without endorsement or affirmation. | Att 171b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Keith Griffin, RNP, MSN, PhD | **p. 41, Line 1052- 1056.** ---classroom examples. “Examples for **spiritual abuse include using religion to** **justify** abuse, **insisting on rigid gender roles**, forcing boyfriend/girlfriend/partner(s) to do things against their beliefs, mocking beliefs or cultural practices, mocking or banning the language or dialect they speak, not allowing boyfriend/girlfriend/partner(s) to do things they enjoy or to better themselves, including interfering with their education.”  RESPONSE: For the school or its employees to define “insisting on rigid gender roles” as spiritual abuse places the public school in the untenable position of assuming authority as to theological/ethical decisions and perceptions that their students make concerning gender roles. Several common religions support rigid gender roles. The clause “insisting on rigid roles” should be simply deleted from this section. | Att 736b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Andrew Alvarez, Teacher | **Page 42, Line 1076**---- The middle chart needs to be more clear. Of course students will have parent permission (in the end) to be with certain friends. Students may interpret parent involvement in their social lives as de facto “abusive.” | Att 473b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 43, Lines 1090-1095**  Add: (Line 1093) “such as parents, guardians and caretakes, as well as”  Remove: (Line 1093) “and encourages students to utilize school resources such as”  Should Read Line 1092 – 1095 Ms. L shares that there are safe and trusted adults such as parents, guardians, caretakers, as well as at school, including herself, the principal, school nurse, school counselor, school social worker, or school psychologist.  Reason: Parents, guardians and caretakes are ultimately responsible and the best resource for their children. Schools should be coming along side of parents to protect children, not the other way around. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 43, Lines 1095- 1099**  Add: (Line 1096) “with their parents, guardians and caretakers or” before “on their own”  Reason: current framework wording guides students to exclude parents, guardians and caretakers.  Add: (Line 1098) “such as parents, guardians and caretakers” after “supports”  Reason: Parents and guardians are the best resource for caring and protecting their children, as well as being the ones that are ultimately responsible for them. Schools should be coming along side of parents to protect children, not the other way around | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 43, Line 1108 ~ 1109**  **REMOVE**  This includes the campus LGBTQ+ club, as dating abuse can be found in any type of relationship.  **REPLACE WITH**  This includes the varying sexual preference clubs, as well as religious clubs, as dating abuse can be found in any type of relationship. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p.44, line 1132-1133-** Students should not have to share their boundaries out loud with their classmates. If the instructor wants to do a crowdstorm of various boundaries a person might have, the instructor should have a list ready to begin the crowdstorm and ask for volunteers to share boundaries others might have. Shifting the lens from the personal to a  *\*Comment appears exactly as it was submitted to CDE* | Att 1243c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 46, line 1161** – Unlawful sex with a minor is child abuse and reported as child abuse. I recommend to remove this from this column.  I’m also fairly sure that some of the examples of physical sexual harassment fall into the category of sexual assault. I defer to the WEAVE folks on this but I think grabbing and groping are sexual assault and could be moved to the sexual assault column. | Att 1031b | **Not Recommended**  **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 46, line 1161 (table)-** Change “catcalling” to “street harassment.”  Rape is defined as (forcing penetration of the victim’s body) this is a very limiting definition of what rape is. It is recommended to expand this definition to be more clear.  **p. 46, Line 1166-** Students are asked to brainstorm what they would do if they were pressured to participate in a sexual behavior and asked to role play refusal. This is not trauma informed. Asking students to role play this can be very triggering for students, especially students who have experienced sexual assault. Please cut this activity. | Att 1243c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 48, like 1182** – I’m confused about cervical cancer as a physical impact of sexual assault. I recommend to remove this because HPV could result from sexual assault, and that is covered in STIs as a physical impact. The subsequent step of cervical cancer is too distal; HPV is incredibly common and not specifically linked to assault. Cervical cancer is something that can be really well addressed with screening and intervention. Also, I think a different iteration of this document had “unintended pregnancies.”  This table seems to be pulled directly from the CDC but now that there are additions and omissions from the CDC original content. I would suggest, without the context provided on the CDC source page, **removing cervical cancer and adding “unintended” before “pregnancy” to this table.** | Att 1031b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 48, line 1182 (Table)-** Under social/ emotional impact category, “lower likelihood of marriage” is listed. This claim, though from the CDC website, it not well founded. One study found that in a survey people who were sexually assaulted were less likely to be married than those who were not. (Golding JM, Wilsnack SC, Cooper ML. Sexual assault history and social support: six general population studies. Journal of Traumatic Stress 2002;15(3):187-97) However the CDC does not cite any other studies that support this claim. Recommend to delete this point. | Att 1243c | **Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 50, line 1192** – this graphic doesn’t advance the point and is not accurate. You can have all of these co-factors and it is not sex trafficking. People can experience sex trafficking as adults without child abuse, as an example of this being inaccurate at times. Using a Venn diagram is perhaps the confusing part. Venn diagrams imply a relationship between the various circles. I think the text above the image does a better job of relaying this information without the image. **Suggest to remove or replace** with a continuum graphic to show the evolution of unhealthy dating, grooming to sex trafficking. | Att 1031b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 50, line 1197-** This is an inaccurate statistic about the age of entry into sex work. See https://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2014/09/is-one-of-the-most-cited-statistics-about-sex-work-wrong/379662/. This statistic should be discarded in the interest of accuracy. | Att 1243c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 51, line 1216**  Consider adding- Warning Signs of Sex Trafficking “***Or Exploitation”***  In Diagram/chart:  Add in column for student: Exchanging sex for food or housing | Att 1056b | **Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 51, line 1216 (table)-** In the included table used for teachers recognizing signs of trafficking it says, “Dresses provocatively or inappropriately for age.” This is subjective, along with being based in gendered double standards that shame young women by suggesting their fashion decisions are linked to something dangerous/unhealthy, as opposed to self-expression. | Att 1243c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 52, line 1219-** Here the subject of “pimps” is introduced. While often used as part of discussions around sex trafficking, the emphasis on the word “pimp” and the associations that surround that word are problematic. In popular culture, ideas about “pimps” arise from Blaxploitation films/hip hop culture. These ideas are intimately linked in people’s minds with stereotypes about Black people. The link between rap and sexual exploitation is racist. Line 1225, “students become aware that glorification of this lifestyle (money/girls/expensive cars/rap/ gold chains) can promote sexual exploitation of youth,” is dismissing, demeaning, and plain old racist. Please delete lines 1219-1226.  Excerpt from “Pimping: A Symbolic Manifestation of Racism and Street Culture” (https://repsub13.wordpress.com/projects/pimping/) – included in attachment 1243c | Att 1243c | **Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Jeannine Topalian, Commissioner, Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **Chapter 5:**  **page 53-- line 1247** change teachers to All staff | Att 2108 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **P. 54, Lines 1254-58.** Delete paragraph. Student-led clubs are to be student-led. When specific clubs are explicitly encouraged by the state, it challenges the notion of student-led (Would the state of California encourage religious student-led clubs?), and creates a potentially chilling hierarchy of “government approved” clubs vs. others clubs. | Att 1098b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 54, Line 1254 ~ 1258** - There is a need to include partnering with religious organizations to create religious student-run clubs (unbiased comprehensive) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 55, Line 1261**  **REMOVE**  those who provide services to LGBTQ+ students for reproductive and sexual health  **REPLACE WITH**  those who provide services to students with varying sexual preference and/or belief systems for reproductive and sexual health | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 56, Line 1292**  Consider adding to the sentence: …have their student excused “**from participation from all or part of”** comprehensive sexual health education…. | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 56, Line 1294-1301**  Parents’ and guardians’ care, support, and knowledge of their children is essential to the well being of the child. The school must require parent or guardian consent to attend confidential medical appointments and must notify parents or guardians | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 56, Lines 1294-1301**  Remove: (Lines 1296-1299) The school cannot require that the student have parent or guardian consent in order to attend the appointment and cannot notify parents or guardians. Confidential appointments are appointments to receive services that minors can obtain on their own consent under state or federal law.  Replace: (Line 1296 – 1299) “school authorities may excuse any pupil from the school for the purpose of obtaining confidential medical services without the consent of the pupil’s parent or guardian.  Reason: Using “cannot” throughout the paragraph encourages minors to leave campus, rather than informing them they’re able to leave if needed. Ed code authorizes schools that they MAY excuse students for confidential medical service, but it’s not required as wording makes it sound.  (Ed Code 48205(a)(3)) For the purpose of having medical, dental, optometrical, or chiropractic services rendered.  (Ed Code 46010.1.) Commencing in the fall of the 1986–87 academic year, the governing board of each school district shall, each academic year, notify pupils in grades 7 to 12, inclusive, and the parents or guardians of all pupils enrolled in the district, that school authorities may excuse any pupil from the school for the purpose of obtaining confidential medical services without the consent of the pupil’s parent or guardian.  Personally, it is shocking that the state of California believes a 12-year old student is capable of making life-changing medical decisions on their own without parent/guardian consent. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 56, Line 1296** Change ‘The school cannot require that the student have’ to ‘The school must require that the student have’ | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 56, Line 1297-1298** Remove and cannot notify parents or guardians | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 57, Line 1346**  **REMOVE**  One strategy may be to ask students to identify a recent conflict they viewed in a movie or on a television show.  **REPLACE WITH**  One strategy may be to ask students to identify a recent conflict they viewed in a PG-13 movie. (Class discussion about R rated movies and non-rated TV shows should not be allowed without parental approval). | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 58, Line 1372**  Consider including: Twenty nine percent (29%) of seventh grade students reported they have ridden in a car driven by someone who had been drinking (California Healthy Kids Survey 15-17). | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Maureen Legg, Eric A Paredes Save A Life Foundation | **CHAPTER 5 - PAGE 58 - LINE 1403**  Injury Prevention and Safety Learning Activities  Insert this Classroom Lesson: Essential Concepts 7–8.1.10.S and Practicing Health Enhancing Behaviors 7–8.7.1.S  Classroom Lesson – Learn the Facts – Cardiac Arrest and CPR  Objective – Students to identify, assess, and learn to respond to a cardiac arrest emergency situation using cardiopulmonary resuscitation (CPR).  Materials Needed:  Computer  Projector  Screen  Student handouts (Hand Only CPR)  Lesson Introduction:  Anyone can learn CPR– and everyone should! That is what we will be doing for the next two days! Our lesson objective is that you will be able to identify, assess and respond to an emergency situation using CPR – cardiopulmonary resuscitation. You will also learn about an automated external defibrillator (AED) in class tomorrow.  Ask: Have any you ever used CPR or watched someone else use CPR to save a person’s life?  Lesson Information:  Use the musical video found at http://handsonlycpr.org/ to create interest in the topic of CPR OR use this YouTube video featuring students on a playground or both – http://www.YouTube.com/watch?v=GMjXrFig7M4  ***Please see Att 1666 for the rest of the actionable edits recommended to this classroom lesson example*.** | Att 1666 | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Marc Berman, Assemblymem-ber, 24th District | **p. 60, Line 1412-1419-** In reading over Chapters 5 and 6, there are a few areas that may be better utilized to highlight the importance of youth mental health and provide more concrete examples of suicide prevention in schools, including having students identify and discuss their school’s pupil suicide prevention policy. The Section labeled *Policy Practice*, students are asked to investigate their school’s or district’s harassment policy. I recommend that the Mental, Emotional, and Social Health section include a similar opportunity for students. Specifically, I recommend that the Framework include a scenario in which students investigate and discuss their school’s or district’s pupil suicide prevention policy. | Att 1042b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | **CHAPTER 5 - PAGE 62 - LINE 1500**  Insert the following:  Warning signs of a potential heart condition could include fainting (number one sign of a potential heart condition), chest pain, shortness of breath, racing or fluttering heartbeat (palpitation, especially at rest), dizziness or lightheadedness and extreme fatigue (tiredness). These factors can be easily disregarded or confused with other reasons why they are experiencing them. Rick factors for a potential heart condition include a family member with known heart abnormalities or who experienced sudden death before age 50, and the student’s own use of stimulants, inhalants, unprescribed medication, performance-enhancing supplements or excessive energy drinks. | Att 1666 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 66, Line 1563-1564** Remove , sexual orientation, or gender identity | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 66, Line 1564**  **REMOVE**  Consider hosting a student-led campus-wide No Name Calling week at your school to address bullying and harassment. Visit the No Name Calling week Web site for inspiration, lesson plans, and resources  **REPLACE WITH**  Consider hosting a student-led campus-wide Anti-Bully week at your school to address bullying and harassment. Visit the StopBullying.gov website for inspiration, lesson plans, and resources. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Rachael Gonzales, CSUS | **Page 78, Line 1881-1889** – flow of sentence –  **Line 1881 -** …”moody” as they experience the many physiological changes their bodies are going through.  **Line 1886** - At this age students are feeling many emotions but may not realize how these emotions impact their behavior.  **Line 1884-** As a health education teacher, administrator, or other educator, you are in a unique role to support and encourage your students during a physically and emotionally challenging time.  **Line 1887** – Building self awareness through standards-based instruction on mental, emotional, and social health can foster academic success and emotional wellbeing for a lifetime.  **Line 1882** – Students may enjoy peer groups, courses, activities or clubs they did not consider when they were younger (CASEL,2015)  **Line 1889** – Learning activities that include goal setting assist students in self discovery of their strengths and can be particularly important at this juncture. | Att 297d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Rachael Gonzales, CSUS | **Page 79, Line 1901** – **period** needed after (CDC, 2017).  **Page 79, Line 1906** – **ampersand** needed (Mojtabai, Olfan, & Han 2016) | Att 297d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Marc Berman, Assemblymem-ber, 24th District | **p. 79, Line 1911-1913-** Last year I authored AB 2639, which builds upon this existing requirement. The new law requires schools to review its pupil suicide prevention policy at minimum every five years and, if necessary, update its policy. Requiring schools to review and reevaluate their pupil suicide prevention policies will ensure that these policies remain relevant and continue to support students’ mental health needs, including those of high-risk groups such as LGBTQ youth. Since the Framework references *Education Code* Section 215 and describes the requirement, the Framework should also specify the new requirement that the policy is reviewed every five years and, if necessary, updated.  *\*This comment was also submitted for Chapter 6, p. 89, Lines, 2179-2181* | Att 1042b | **Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 79, Line 1917**  With the passing of recent legislation, suicide prevention hotline numbers will be printed on the back of all school identification cards. Additionally, parent/guardians and students will also be notified twice annually about local mental health services at school and within their community. The inclusion of these measure will help to reduce the stigma of mental health and the discussion of suicide (Ed. Code 215.5). | Att 1056b | **Recommended** |
|  | 5 | R. Gonzales, CSUS | **Page 80, Line 1938** – add School Social Workers, Nurses | Att 297d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 81, Line 1959 ~ 1964**  **REMOVE**  Students learn coping mechanisms for stress management from their peers and teacher and are encouraged to identify goals for handling stress in healthy ways such as meditation; talking about your problems or worries to a trusted adult; or exercise such as running, swimming, or hiking in local natural areas and parks (7–8.6.1.M, Goal Setting; 7–8.7.1.M; Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors).  **REPLACE WITH**  Students learn coping mechanisms for stress management from their peers and teacher and are encouraged to identify goals for handling stress in healthy ways such as meditation; talking about your problems or worries to a trusted adult; praying; or exercise such as running, swimming, or hiking in local natural areas and parks (7–8.6.1.M, Goal Setting; 7–8.7.1.M; Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors). | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | R. Gonzales, CSUS | **Page 81, Line 1979** – After learning about warning signs, **symptoms, and the stigma surrounding mental health**, students can | Att 297d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | R. Gonzales, CSUS | **Page 82, Line 1983** – Students learn that people with mental health disorders often do not seek help **due to the stigma associated with mental health** | Att 297d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | R. Gonzales, CSUS | **Page 83, Line 2023** – add after write down… **or a visual representation of at least two.** | Att 297d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | R. Gonzales, CSUS | **Page 84, Line 2031** – **add culturally appropriate**  **Page 84, Line 2040** – **add also an opportunity to address stigma** | Att 297d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | R. Gonzales, CSUS | **Page 85, Line 2063 –** do not recommend that lights be turned off as this can cause students stress - **recommend to dim lights** | Att 297d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 85, Line 2064**  **REMOVE**  Students are encouraged to meditate, deep breathe, or just unwind before beginning class or anytime they feel stress or anxiety  **REPLACE WITH**  Students are encouraged to meditate, deep breathe, pray, or just unwind before beginning class or anytime they feel stress or anxiety | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | R. Gonzales, CSUS | **Page 86, Line 2098** – **add website** http://www.leadershipchallenge.com/resource/challenging-the-process-with-the-marshmallow-challenge.aspx | Att 297d | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 87, Line 2102 ~ 2104**  **REMOVE**  Students share a series of photos of healthy and unhealthy ways anger is expressed. Examples of healthy ways include talking to one another, taking a deep breath or time out, writing a letter, or exercising  **REPLACE WITH**  Students share a series of photos of healthy and unhealthy ways anger is expressed. Examples of healthy ways include talking to one another, taking a deep breath or time out, praying, writing a letter, or exercising | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 5 | R. Gonzales  CSUS | **Page 87, Line 2122 –** choose from age appropriate and **cultural relevant** list  **Page 87, Line 2127** – the term people has not been used before do you want to stay with the term **students** | Att 297d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Marc Berman, Assemblymem-ber, 24th District | **p. 89, line 2168-2179-** Again, in the *Partnering with your school* sections (found in Chapter 5, in lines 2168-2179 and Chapter 6 lines, 2457-2478) there are opportunities to highlight the use of the school’s pupil suicide prevention policy. These sections offer example lessons for the corresponding standards, and I recommend they be used to specify the use of the pupil suicide prevention policy that all schools must create. Ensuring that the pupil suicide prevention policy is explicitly mentioned in these sections will support teachers in bringing awareness of available resources to their students as well as provide both teachers and students the tools to recognize and respond to warning signs when students need help.  *\*The Comment was also submitted for Chapter 6, page 99, lines 2457-2478* | Att 1042b | **Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 90, Line 2194**  Mental health notices and resources should be visible in class and readily available for student and parent/guardian access. Education Code requires notification to parents and students twice annually about how to initiate mental health services on campus or in the community (Ed. Code 49428). | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 95, Line 2335**  Consider adding/rewording to include: Students can consider examining immunization preventable diseases, various other illnesses, or foodborne illnesses. | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 97, Line 2362**  Consider adding: Establishing wellness through dental care, regular physical check-ups, and immunizations. | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 97, Line 2366**  Consider adding to sentence:… amplified music **to prevent permanent hearing loss**. | Att 1056b | **Recommended** |
|  | 5 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 97, Line 2366**  Consider including information about backpack weight: Weight of back pack should be no more than 10% of body weight. This would also be a good activity. | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 5 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 101, Line 2477**  Consider adding; Contact your local Public Health Child Health and Disability Programs (CHDP) to provide available resources for physicals, dental, and vision follow up. | Att 1056b | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | R. Loya – CASHE | **GENERAL COMMENT:** seems like too much on nutrition and physical education as opposed to health education???? sex education also heavy but can understand and writers did give warning at start that framework was only example. I fear that too often when topic is left out, then I really don’t need to teach about it??? Did anyone ever count how many pages were given to each content area? | Att 689b | **Not Recommended.** |
|  | 6 | R. Loya – CASHE | **GENERAL COMMENT**: health education gets rather personal at times due to the content. Tis a shame to use examples for such a sensitive subject such as **mr. g or ms k or mrs z**. I know department is doing this all over but this is one time they should say **mr. Garcia** and **ms ketchum** and **mrs zonker**. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended.** |
|  | 6 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 2, Line 4-8** – This sentence contains two different sentences. Suggestion: Put a period after “members” on line 6 and create a new sentence: “Therefore, standards-based competencies and instructional strategies, that foster responsible decision making, are a critical component of health education (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services [USDHHS] 2017). Check the reference. Is it for adult-like behaviors or for standards-based competencies and instructional strategies or both? | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 2, Line 12**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  health education teachers AND PARENTS AND/OR GUARDIANS continue to play a critical role | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 2, Lines 12-14**  Add: (Line 13) “parents, guardians, caretakers and” before “health education”  Reason: Parents and guardians are ultimately responsible for their children  (Ed Code 51937) “…The Legislature recognizes that while parents and guardians overwhelmingly support medically accurate, comprehensive sex education, parents and guardians have the ultimate responsibility for imparting values regarding human sexuality to their children. (Amended by Stats. 2015, Ch. 398, Sec. 13. (AB 329) Effective January 1, 2016.) | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 2, Line 15**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  Health education instruction<byh>is best<eyh>provided by, IN STRONG PARTNERSHIP WITH PARENTS AND GUARDIANS | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 2, Line 18** – Add a sentence after “…effective health education.” to read:  “When this is not possible, utilizing community partners such as health educators or staff from school-based health centers with specialized training can be an effective alternative.” | Att 680b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Maureen Ufkes, public adult school teacher; parent | **Page 2, Lines 25-29**  In regards to educating students about hormone-blocking medication and surgery, please include in the curriculum the book Trans Life Survivors, by Walt Heyer. Heyer had the complete gender reassignment surgery and now urges others to rethink their decision to do the same. He compiled testimonies of many people who have regretted taking hormones and going through with the surgeries. Students should be taught that there are varying results with hormone blocking medication and sexual reassignment surgery. Both sides of the story must be told. | Att 1006b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Steven J. Boggs – Private Citizen, voter | **Page 2, Last sentence**  **Original statement** Decisions on which instructional strategies to use in their classrooms are best left to credentialed health education teachers and local administrators.  **Revised statement (add with the approval of parents)**  Decisions on which instructional strategies to use in their classrooms are best left to credentialed health education teachers and local administrators, with the approval of parents. | Att 644b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | R. Loya – CASHE | **p3 30–46** no way to keep up to date in a long overdue framework with all sorts of new health issues happening all the time. Possible to cite opioid crisis? | Att 698b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 3, Line 32** – Correct CHKS reference is (2015-2017). | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 3, Line 44**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  Health education teachers and administrators IN PARTNERSHIP WITH PARENTS AND GUARDIANS play a pivotal role | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 3, Line 44** – Edit sentence to read: “Health education teachers, administrators, and *school support staff (such as school counselors, school nurses, and school social workers)* play…” | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 3, Lines 44-46**  Add: (Line 44) “Parents, guardians, caretakers, as well as” before “Health education teachers”  Reason: Parents and guardians have the greatest influence over their child’s behavior by leading by example, which plays the ultimate lifelong role. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 3, Line 50-51**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  Because sexual health education is thoroughly discussed in ninth through twelfth grades, (CHYA REQUIRES SEX ED TO BE TAUGHT ONCE IN HIGH SCHOOL) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 3, line 54-** Please include evidence to support the claim that sex trafficking is a “growing global problem.” In the literature there is a lack of agreement on if this is a growing problem or not. It is essential to underscore sex trafficking as a problem, but do so accurately.  *\*Excerpt from “Special Report: Money and Lies in Anti-Human Trafficking NGOs”*  *(https://truthout.org/articles/special-report-money-and-lies-in-anti-human-trafficking-ngos/) included in Att 1243e* | Att 1243e | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion.** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 4, Line 77-78**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  Mental, emotional, and social health education is a critical part of ensuring that all students are able to learn and thrive in high school and beyond, WHICH IS WHY PARENTS AND GUARDIANS PLAY SUCH A PIVOTAL ROLE IN PROTECTING THEIR CHILDREN FROM POTENTIALLY HARMFUL OR PREMATURELY MATERIAL. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 5, Line 95**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  Health instruction <byh>is best<eyh> provided by IN STRONG PARTNERSHIP WITH PARENTS AND GUARDIANS | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 5, Line 98** – Add a sentence after “…education.” to read:  “When this is not possible, utilizing community partners such as health educators or staff from school-based health centers with specialized training can be an effective alternative.” | Att 680b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 5, Line 99-100**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  the primary instruction is the responsibility of the credentialed health education teacher, USING MATERIALS THAT HAVE BEEN FULLY VETTED AND APPROVED BY PARENTS | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 5, Line 100-103**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  Guest speakers and media resources including books and videos <bs>~~should always~~<es>MUST be vetted for appropriateness, for compliance with state statutes, and to ensure the content they are providing is valid, age appropriate, and medically accurate. ALL SUCH MATERIALS – VIDEOS, BOOKS, GUEST SPEAKERS, MEDIA RESOURCES – SHALL BE PARENT APPROVED. IF AN EDUCATOR / SCHOOL DISTRICT USES CURRICULUM THAT IS NOT VALID, MEDICALLY ACCURATE AND, INAPPROPRIATE, SUCH EDUCATOR/SCHOOL DISTRICT SHALL FACE CONSEQUENCES AND PARENTS SHALL BE NOTIFIED OF SUCH A BREECH OF TRUST SO THEY CAN DEAL WITH THE CONSEQUENCES OF THEIR CHILDREN HAVING BEEN EXPOSED TO ILLICIT AND INAPPROPRIATE MATERIAL | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **No Motion Recommended** |
|  | 6 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 5, Line 100-103**  Guest speakers and media resources including books and videos should always be vetted for appropriateness,  Comment: Change should to shall | Att 834b | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 6, Line 128-** Remove "campus stores" because the USDA has set nutrition standards for items sold to students on school campus. | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 7, Line 147**  High amounts of screen time are linked to an increased level of obesity and decreased levels of exercise among adolescents (Rosen et al. 2014). AND SCHOOL DISTRICTS SHOULD NOT REQUIRE STUDENTS TO COMPLETE ALL OF THEIR HOMEWORK ONLINE, WHICH ONLY FURTHER ENCOURAGES COMPUTER USE | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 7, line 150-** Make reference to knowing how to cook and prepare your own foods to support healthy eating**.** | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 7, Line 151**  Consider adding: …vegetables **(leafy greens),…** | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 7, line 155-** Delete "Since" as this does not make a complete sentence. | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 7, Line 156**  Consider including folate into the sentence…Since most teens do not receive their recommended amount of calcium, iron, **folate,** and zinc.  Line 160. Folate can help prevent reduce the risk of prenatal neural tube defects and other birth defects. | Att 1056b | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 7, line 157-** Change to "Calcium, vitamin D, and weight-bearing exercise are critical. .." | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 7, Line 161**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  Through programs, policies, and learning opportunities, schools AND PARENTS play a key role in | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 7, Lines 161-164**  Add: (Line 161) “parents, guardians and caretakers” after “schools”  Should read: Through programs, policies, and learning opportunities, schools, parents, guardians and caretakers play a key role | Att 1134b  Att 1143b  Att 1145b  Att 1150b  Att 1187b  Att 1198b  Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 7, Line 164-165-** Change to: "School and districts policies are able to address food allergies..." | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 7, Line 167**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  SCHOOL AND DISTRICT POLICIES SHOULD BAN VENDING MACHINES AND LUNCH OFFERINGS SELLING High-sugar and high-fat food and beverages | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Steven J. Boggs – Private Citizen, voter | **Page 7, Example of Standards-Based Instruction: Grade Five**  **Original statement** 5.1.1.P Identify effective personal health strategies that reduce illness and injury (e.g., adequate sleep, ergonomics, sun safety, hand washing, hearing protection, and tooth brushing and tooth flossing.)  **Revised statement (add physical)**  5.1.1.P Identify effective personal health strategies that reduce physical illness and physical injury (e.g., adequate sleep, ergonomics, sun safety, hand washing, hearing protection, and tooth brushing and tooth flossing.) | Att 644b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 8, line 178-** Change to "Students can apply this knowledge by researching and critically analyzing nutrition..." | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Steven J. Boggs – Private Citizen, voter | **Page 9, Second to the last paragraph, first sentence**  **Original statement**  He then shows a short video clip such as TedEd, *Why Do We Have to Wear Sunscreen?*  **Revised statement (add second statement)**  He then shows a short video clip such as TedEd, *Why Do We Have to Wear Sunscreen? If teachers choose an alternative video, parent notification and approval is needed.* | Att 644b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 9, line 218-** Change to "An example of an activity is to have students work in pairs to assess their personal nutrition needs..." | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 9, Line 225**– Add “and 9–12.7.5.N” after 9–12.7.2.N for a physical activity standard under Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 11, Line 275** – Add in “tennis, golf,” as these are examples of sports that can be played individually or with a small group or team. They are played in adulthood. | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Steven J. Boggs – Private Citizen, voter | **Page 12, Line 175 , Grade Level 4**  The assignment for grade level 4 should give students the opportunity to critically consider both sides of the gun issue. The phrase “the dangers of having weapons at school, at home, and in the community” should read “the advantages and disadvantages of having weapons at school, at home, and in the community” | Att 644b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 12, Line 295** – Delete “and nutrition” as the lesson is only about physical activity. Or, include nutrition in the lesson and reference the additional standards. | Att 1192b | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Steven J. Boggs – Private Citizen, voter | **Page 13, Line 175, Grade Level 5**  The assignment for grade level 5 should be deleted. “Describe how HIV is and is not transmitted.” This assignment is age inappropriate for 5th graders. | Att 644b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Maryam Shayegh, MPA, RD, and Joanie Verderber, Ph.D., on behalf of LACOE | **Page 13, Line 335-337** – Awkward sentence with insert. Change to: “Extensions of this activity may include a healthy cooking demonstration to sample healthy foods and <byh>student research on the the physiological and neurophysiological effects of foods high in sugar.<eyh>” | Att 1192b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Steven J. Boggs – Private Citizen, voter | **Page 17, Line 187, Grade Level 7-8** “Who are the adults on campus who are trusted and you can tell if people are in danger of hurting themselves or others?” Add “at home, in the community…” | Att 644b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Steven J. Boggs – Private Citizen, voter. | **Page 17, Example of Standard-Based Instruction: Grades Nine Through Twelve, Select a standard(s): , 9-12.7.3.M**  **Original Statement**  9–12.7.3.M Discuss suicide-prevention strategies.  **Revised Statement** (add statement after the original statement)  9–12.7.3.M Discuss suicide-prevention strategies. If teachers choose to include additional strategies outside of what are listed in this framework, teachers must inform parents of the suicide-prevention strategies teacher will present prior to the lesson. | Att 644b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Clell Hoffman on behalf of The Child Nutrition Advisory Council | **p. 17, line 446-** Add finding time effective options to eat breakfast. Time is a major factor for why adolescents' do not eat breakfast. "Find time effective and easy to prepare healthy breakfast meal options.  Prepare ahead of time. Examples may include chia pudding, overnight oats, breakfast burritos with whole grain tortilla, unsweetened yogurt with fresh fruit and nuts. Students are encouraged to research other quick, healthful options." | Att 1343b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Steven J. Boggs – Private Citizen, voter | **Page 22, Line 221, Grade Level 5**  “Use healthy and respectful ways to express friendship, attraction, and affection. 5.4.2.G” The word “attraction” should be deleted as age inappropriate for 5th graders. | Att 644b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 22, Lines 576 -581**  Add: (Line 581) after “STI’s” “information on abstinence from sexual activity, and the value of delaying sexual activity”  Ed Code 51934 a (3) Information that abstinence from sexual activity and injection drug use is the only certain way to prevent HIV and other sexually transmitted infections and abstinence from sexual intercourse is the only certain way to prevent unintended pregnancy. This instruction shall provide information about the value of delaying sexual activity while also providing medically accurate information on other methods of preventing HIV and other sexually transmitted infections and pregnancy. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187 Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 22-33, Lines 589-594**  Add: (Line 594) after “order to receive the instruction” “INSERT ED. CODE 51939”  Ed Code 51939.  (a) A pupil may not attend any class in comprehensive sexual health education or HIV prevention education, or participate in any anonymous, voluntary, and confidential test, questionnaire, or survey on pupil health behaviors and risks, if the school has received a written request from the pupil’s parent or guardian excusing the pupil from participation.  (b) A pupil may not be subject to disciplinary action, academic penalty, or other sanction if the pupil’s parent or guardian declines to permit the pupil to receive comprehensive sexual health education or HIV prevention education or to participate in anonymous, voluntary, and confidential tests, questionnaires, or surveys on pupil health behaviors and risks.  (c) While comprehensive sexual health education, HIV prevention education, or anonymous, voluntary, and confidential test, questionnaire, or survey on pupil health behaviors and risks is being administered, an alternative educational activity shall be made available to pupils whose parents or guardians have requested that they not receive the instruction or participate in the test, questionnaire, or survey.  (Amended by Stats. 2015, Ch. 398, Sec. 15. (AB 329) Effective January 1, 2016.) | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Barbara Cavanagh. Teacher | **Page 22-23, line 591-594**  Passive consent is a highly ineffective way to inform parents. Passive consent forms rarely make it home at all, leaving parents in the dark about highly sensitive material. Passive consent ensures that most, if not all, students participate in instruction whether parents would approve of such instruction or not. I believe that this is a highly manipulative practice. Signed permission slips are more effective in ensuring that all parents are informed. | Att 961b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Maureen Ufkes, public adult school teacher; parent | **Page 23, Lines 602-607**  Please use science/biology-based, not feelings based, logic in instruction. If we allow students to choose their “alternate” identities, what will prevent a 17 year-old white male from “identifying” as a 9 year- old Latina? Instructing students that identity is fluid sets a dangerous precedent. Please proceed with caution. Let students know that some people might do this, but it is not necessarily a positive decision | Att 1006b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 23, Line 608**  **REMOVE STRICKEN WORD AND REPLACE WITH LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  Instruction and materials on sexual health content must <bs>~~affirmatively~~<es> PROVIDE FACTUAL INFORMATION AND recognize diverse | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 23, Line 611**  **AND LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  and the harmful outcomes that may occur from ENGAGING IN RISKY SEXUAL BEHAVIOR OR RISKY SEXUAL LIFESTYLE CHOICES | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Tom Vogt; Public High School Administrator | **Page 24, Line 636** – Add “or religious leaders" after “Title IX coordinator”. Religious leaders are often highly trusted and caring influences in the lives of young people and can be a valuable asset to students who are developing their identity. | Att 873b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 25, Line 649**  **REMOVE STRICKEN WORD AND REPLACE WITH LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  environment is welcoming, inclusive, and safe for <bs>~~LGBTQ+~~<es>ALL students | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Rod Earls, community member and online graduate teacher | **Pg. 25, line 651,** Add an additional sentence: The school should equally support teachers presenting a moral view of abstinence being a healthy alternative for young people. | Att 860b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 25, Lines 672-675**  Add: (Line 673) Parents, guardians, caretakers” after “teachers”  Reason: parents and guardians have the ultimate responsibility for imparting values regarding  human sexuality to their children  (Ed Code 51937) “…The Legislature recognizes that while parents and guardians overwhelmingly support medically accurate, comprehensive sex education, parents and guardians have the ultimate responsibility for imparting values regarding human sexuality to their children. (Amended by Stats. 2015, Ch. 398, Sec. 13. (AB 329) Effective January 1, 2016.) | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 25, Line 676-678**  Add: (Line 677) after “reproduce options” add “abstinence from sexual activity, and the value of delaying sexual activity, as well as”  Reason: Abstinence has to be taught per Ed Code 51934 a (3) Information that abstinence from sexual activity and injection drug use is the only certain way to prevent HIV and other sexually transmitted infections and abstinence from sexual intercourse is the only certain way to prevent unintended pregnancy. This instruction shall provide information about the value of delaying sexual activity while also providing medically accurate information on other methods of preventing HIV and other sexually transmitted infections and pregnancy. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 26, 682-685**  Add: (Line 683) “the value of delaying sexual activity” after “during adolescence”  Reason: Only certain way to prevent HIV, SDI’s and pregnancies which could otherwise have a lifetime effect in a negative way.  Ed Code 51934 a (3) Information that abstinence from sexual activity and injection drug use is the only certain way to prevent HIV and other sexually transmitted infections and abstinence from sexual intercourse is the only certain way to prevent unintended pregnancy. This instruction shall provide information about the value of delaying sexual activity while also providing medically accurate information on other methods of preventing HIV and other sexually transmitted infections and pregnancy. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 26, Line 683**  **ADD**  "such as PRACTICING ABSTINENCE AND safer sex precautions….” | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
| 1. (1 of 3) | 6 | Catherine Kellert, RN, Credentialed School Nurse | **Page 26, Line 683**  ADD  &quot;such as PRACTICING ABSTINENCE AND safer sex precautions….”  6 Page 26, Line 698  ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS  students explore sexual health topics including ABSTINENCE, STI/HIV  Public Input Template–2019 Health Education Framework  Page 29 of 35  6 Page 28, Line 742-746  PARENTS SHOULD BE GIVEN NOTICE TO WATCH THESE FILMS LISTED HERE AND ANY ADD’L FILMS AND DETERMINE WHETHER THEIR CHILD SHOULD BE OPTED OUT.  6 Page 28, Line 752  The panel members must be vetted to meet both statutory and district requirements AND BE APPROVED BY PARENTS / GUARDIANS.  6 Page 29, Line 773  STRIKE OUT such as Planned Parenthood. NOT ALL PARENTS AGREE WITH HAVING SUCH A POLITICALLY CHARGED ORGANIZATION INVOLVED IN THIS PROCESS. ALL ORGANIZATIONS SHOULD BE POLITICALLY NEUTRAL. | Att 1545a | **Not Recommended** |
| 557 (2 of 3) | 6 | Catherine Kellert, RN, Credentialed School Nurse | **6 Page 29, Line 779**  STRIKE OUT. IT’S NOT CLEAR HOW/WHO DETERMINED IT’S “EVIDENCE INFORMED” AND EVERY DISTRICT SHOULD BE ENCOURAGED TO DEVELOP WHAT’S APPROPRIATE FOR THEIR STUDENTS  Evidence-informed comprehensive sexual health resources such as San Francisco Unified School District’s Be Real. Be Ready. Smart Sexuality Education and Advocates for Youth 3Rs: Rights, Respect, Responsibility  6 Page 31, Line 829-832  ADD THAT PARENTS PLAY A KEY ROLE IN HELPING STUDENTS WITH THESE DECISIONS AND PARENTS SHOULD BE THE FIRST POINT OF CONTACT. ALSO, NOTE THAT PARENTS CAN OPT OUT FROM DISTRICTS REMOVING THEIR CHILDREN FROM SCHOOL FROM SUCH SERVICES.They also research California laws regarding minors’ access to reproductive health care, including the right to excuse themselves from campus to obtain confidential medical services without parental permission or notification and the right to confidentiality in insurance under the Confidential Health Information Act. | Att 1545a | **Not Recommended** |
| 557 (3 of 3) | 6 | Catherine Kellert, RN, Credentialed School Nurse | **6 Page 61, Line 1430**  REMOVE STRICKEN WORDS.Students identify local resources for reproductive and sexual health and evaluate laws related to sexual involvement with minors by inviting the local American Civil Liberties Union chapter, local Planned Parenthood, CDPH, CDE, &lt;byh&gt;or other verified medically accurate organizations&lt;eyh&gt; CAN provide a professional development presentation on the California Healthy Youth Act for teachers, administrators, school board members, and parents, guardians, and caretakers  7 Page 36, Lines 755-757 “Consider hanging a small rainbow pride flag or safe zone sticker that signifies that all gender identities and expressions are | Att 1545a | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 26, Lines 686-689**  Edit: Add after line 689:  Such instruction must also be inclusive of religious families, beliefs, and backgrounds, to ensure that students of such backgrounds feel equally represented in the coursework. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 26, Line 698**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  students explore sexual health topics including ABSTINENCE, STI/HIV | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 26, Lines 698-699**  Add: (Line 698) “abstinence” after “ including”  Reason: Ed Code 51934 a (3) | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 27, line 711-** This section states that case studies are effective tools for practicing “assessing situations that could lead to pressure for sexual activity.” This idea promotes rape culture, as the examples imply that women, rather than perpetrators, are responsible for sexual pressure and violence. | Att 1243e | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 27, Line 722**  **ADD LANGUAGE IN CAPS**  written by the students and reviewed by their teacher AND PARENTS/GUARDIANS | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 27, line 731-** Using these “pregnancy option vignettes” may give space for abortion stigma to enter the classroom. Support should be provided to address this stigma if it arises. | Att 1243e | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 28, line 742**  Students develop as global citizens by watching documentaries such as No Woman, No Cry (2010) that shows how women in different countries struggle with access to care and maternal health issues, including women in the United States;  Comment: Not sure why you need to teach them that they need to be global citizens. There is no science anywhere supporting better longterm health outcomes from this instruction. I’m sure its more lobbyist bs that gets into our materials. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 28, Line 742-746**  **PARENTS SHOULD BE GIVEN NOTICE TO WATCH THESE FILMS LISTED HERE AND ANY ADD’L FILMS AND DETERMINE WHETHER THEIR CHILD SHOULD BE OPTED OUT.** | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 28, Lines 742-746**  Add: (at the end of Line 746) Parents or guardian will be given no fewer than 14 days notice in order to inspect documentaries, audiovisual educational material prior to students watching.  Ed Code 51938 (c) | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 28, line 750-** In the discussion of having a panel to address students’ sexual health questions, I’m concerned that this situation may inspire inappropriate personal disclosure if that issue isn’t specifically addressed. Insert line discouraging personal disclosure. | Att 1243e | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 28, Line 752**  The panel members must be vetted to meet both statutory and district requirements AND BE APPROVED BY PARENTS / GUARDIANS. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Tom Vogt; Public High School Administrator | **Page 28, Line 759** – Add “religious beliefs” after “ethnicities”. Religious values are an important part of decision-making. | Att 837b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 29, Line 773**  **STRIKE OUT**  such as <bs>~~Planned Parenthood.~~<es> NOT ALL PARENTS AGREE WITH HAVING SUCH A POLITICALLY CHARGED ORGANIZATION INVOLVED IN THIS PROCESS. ALL ORGANIZATIONS SHOULD BE POLITICALLY NEUTRAL. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 29, Line 779**  **STRIKE OUT. IT’S NOT CLEAR HOW/WHO DETERMINED IT’S “EVIDENCE INFORMED” AND EVERY DISTRICT SHOULD BE ENCOURAGED TO DEVELOP WHAT’S APPROPRIATE FOR THEIR STUDENTS**  <bs>~~Evidence-informed comprehensive sexual health resources such as San Francisco Unified School District’s~~ *~~Be Real. Be Ready. Smart Sexuality Education~~* ~~and~~ *~~Advocates for Youth 3Rs: Rights, Respect, Responsibility~~*<es> | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 29, Lines 779-782**  Remove: (Lines 780-781) “such as San Francisco Unified School District’s Be Real. Be Ready. Smart Sexuality Education and Advocates for Youth 3Rs: Rights, Respect, Responsibility”  Add: (Line 782) “find out what curriculum your district is using and how to” before “access or”  Reason: Per AB329 CHYA it is up to each school district to decide what is evidence informed for their district. It is not up to CDE to decide was is evidence based, especially with the above mentioned curriculums teaching beyond what the law requires. The above curriculums are bias and taught progressively, leaving out much of the demographics within the school districts.  Ed Code 51933 (b) All factual information presented shall be medically accurate and objective.  Ed Code 51933 d (4) Instruction and materials shall not reflect or promote bias against any person on the basis of any category protected by Section 220. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Caretakers of California Students, Community Members, active and retired teach*e*rs  88 individuals submitted this comment | Page 29, Lines 780-781: The suggested curricula – San Francisco Unified School District’s Be Real. Be Ready. Smart Sexuality Education and Advocates for Youth 3Rs: *Rights, Respect, Responsibility* – both include sexual information that goes beyond what is necessary to teach children in a classroom setting and in my opinion crosses the line for appropriate classroom instruction. Many topics should be rightly reserved for parents to discuss with their children. Please remove these curricula as examples of acceptable curricula to use in teaching on this topic.  *\*In addition to the individuals previously listed in this table 88 individuals also submitted this comment. The attachment numbers of these comments are:* **300, 290, 291, 292, 293, 303b, 305, 306, 307, 310, 312, 313, 314, 315, 316, 317, 318, 319, 320, 321, 322, 323, 324, 325, 326, 327, 328, 329, 330, 331, 332, 333, 335, 340, 346, 385, 409, 434b, 458b, 462, 538, 566, 592b, 602b, 604a, 604b, 633b, 636b, 636c, 648, 649, 657, 658, 660, 682, 683, 686b, 690, 695, 701, 702, 721, 734a, 734b, 742b, 745, 769, 830a, 830b, 880, 952, 999b, 1029b, 1094a, 1094b, 1190b, 1313b, 1349, 1480, 1569, 1577, 1580, 1609, 1720, 1761, 1944, 1978, 1980** | Att Numbers are listed in the Comment Column | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 29, line 790-793** – this is redundant with earlier text in 664-666 of this same section. Recommend just highlighting this text in a text box to draw attention to this shift from STD to STI throughout the chapter since it occurs throughout. | Att 1031b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 30, line 800** – Change from “including oropharyngeal cancer” to “primarily cervical cancer” since cervical cancer is overwhelming the impactful health outcome that results from HPV infection. | Att 1031b | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 30, line 803-** Students are given prompts for reflection including “when I hear the words STI, I think/feel...” which I think will likely serve as an entrance for stigmatization. Students may associate STIs with feelings like “disgusting” or “gross”. The stigmatization of STIs leads to negative health outcomes because people are less likely to get tested/treated if they feel ashamed. This framework should provide language to support instructors in providing education that addresses and minimizes stigma.  **p. 30, line 806-** “Some common symptoms of an STI are...” obfuscates the fact that the most common symptom is no symptom at all, which is why it’s so important to get tested. I would recommend omitting both examples. | Att 1243e | **Not Recommended.**  **p. 30 line 806 - Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 31, line 817** – Change from “disease” to “infection” | Att 1031b | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 31, Line 825-832**  Parents’ and guardians' care, support and knowledge of their children is essential to the well being of the child. The school must require parent or guardian consent to attend confidential medical appointments and must notify parents or guardians. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 89 1b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | David Ball, Father of a 4th Grader in Private School | **Page 31, line 829**  They also research California laws regarding minors’ access to reproductive health care, including the right to excuse themselves from campus to obtain confidential medical services without parental permission or notification and the right to confidentiality in insurance under the Confidential Health Information Act. Students strategize on creative and concise ways to disseminate the information.  Comment: this practice is completely disgusting to me, one that you disguise abortion and drugs with the word “reproductive health care” and second that you would allow my child to use these services behind my back. Nothing but pure disgust for your profession. | Att 834b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 31, Line 829-832**  ADD THAT PARENTS PLAY A KEY ROLE IN HELPING STUDENTS WITH THESE DECISIONS AND PARENTS SHOULD BE THE FIRST POINT OF CONTACT. ALSO, NOTE THAT PARENTS CAN OPT OUT FROM DISTRICTS REMOVING THEIR CHILDREN FROM SCHOOL FROM SUCH SERVICES. They also research California laws regarding minors’ access to reproductive health care, including the right to excuse themselves from campus to obtain confidential medical services without parental permission or notification and the right to confidentiality in insurance under the Confidential Health Information Act. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 31, Line 829-833** Remove They also research California laws regarding minors’ access to reproductive health care, including the right to excuse themselves from campus to obtain confidential medical services without parental permission or notification and the right to confidentiality in insurance under the Confidential Health Information Act. Students strategize on creative and concise ways to disseminate the information. | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 32, line 862-** Asking students to “line up from least safe to most safe when considering possible side effects” various birth control methods is confusing. What metric will they use to rate the severity of different side effects? How will they determine how safe or not safe various side effects may be? | Att 1243e | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Linda Cone, retired teacher | **Page 32, Lines 849-851** –**Essential Concepts:** 9–12.1.12.G Evaluate the safety and effectiveness (including success and failure rates) of <byh>FDA-approved contraceptives<eyh> in preventing HIV, other STDs, and pregnancy  **Add the following line:** Students should be told that there are NO FDA-approved condoms for anal sex.  NOTE: This line should be added any time the framework addresses condom use. | Att 653b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Linda Cone, retired teacher | **Page 33, Lines 873–876** – Barrier Method Demonstration  A condom (internal/female and external/male condom) and dental dam demonstration is provided. After the demonstration, students individually practice the step-by-step process on a penis model or their fingers.  **Delete these lines.** Parents overwhelming have approved the teaching of the health and social risks of sexual activity. Many do not approve of condom races and demonstrations. Do not place parents in the position of having to opt their children out of instruction to avoid graphic and embarrassing demonstrations or games. | Att 653b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6  Grades 9–12 | Diane Farthing, Credentialed Health Educator | **Page 33**  **Starting at line 874**  *In order to correctly put on a condom, the tip needs to be pinched and then the condom rolled down the penis. This is impossible for a student to do if they are using their fingers as a model. Test tubes might be an option but fingers should be removed.*  A condom (internal/female and external/male condom) and dental dam demonstration is provided. After the demonstration, students individually practice the step-by-step process on a penis model or their fingers. Alternatively, students can place the steps | Att 163b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 34, line 897-** Teachers have “students brainstorm a list of situations that might lead to non-consensual sexual activity,” i.e. rape.. There are no situations that lead to rape, other than being around a rapist; this activity promotes rape culture. The examples given are underage drinking and renting a hotel room after a dance, followed by a discussion about why those situations could place someone at risk for sexual assault. These examples place responsibility on the potential victim as opposed to the perpetrator. Problem solving then consists of “ways to lessen risk for each situation.” The example being using the buddy system. Asking bystanders and potential victim to do the work of preventing assault is part of what perpetuates rape culture. | Att 1243e | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 34, line 898** – Change from “pregnancy” to “unplanned pregnancy” | Att 1031b | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Tom Vogt; Public High School Administrator | **Page 34, line 899-904** – Eliminate “…situations that might…for each other.” Replace with “activities that develop virtues and talents that will lead to productive and satisfying lives, such as working at a job, developing supportive relationships with peers, engaging in non-threatening social activities, participating in sports or other extra-curricular activities, or volunteering for causes they are interested in. Students may discuss why engaging in these activities will give them advantages both in their immediate circumstances and their futures. They may also suggest ways to get started in these activities or share stories about the impact these activities have had in their lives.” For example, students might share about steps they took to get a job. | Att 873b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Jennifer Chou on behalf of the California Sexual Health Education Roundtable | Page 34, line 900  Add **“Teachers should remind students that the blame for sexual assault and non‐consensual sexual activity lies solely with the perpetrator and that the purpose of this activity is to empower students to evaluate, avoid, and mitigate risky situations—not shame victims for situations they may find themselves in.”**  Especially in light of recent conversations stemming from the confirmation of Supreme Court Justice Brett Kavanaugh, it is important to be clear that this activity is intended to support skills‐building for students to navigate challenging real‐life scenarios. Without context, it could be perceived as an attempt to establish a moral baseline for “right” and “wrong” situations. The suggested additional language also supports later discussion about rape culture at pp. 48‐50, particularly line 1163 | Att 1207b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 34, line 914** – The addition of the “Yes Means Yes” law is confusing in this way. This is not a law directly related to minor consent health services, nor confidentiality. Recommend to modify this section to read (**starting line 911**): “having a conversation with their partner <byh>about<eyh> boundaries, including discussing and modeling affirmative consent (“yes means yes”) and the related California laws around consent;…” then omit the addition of the highlighted Yes Means Yes on line 914. The goal is still to address this and leave it in, but make it clearer. | Att 1031b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Joan Jensen, Community member | **Page 34 Line 919.** Mention should be made out of respect to Christian parents that the Bible says God created male and female—nothing else. | Att 165b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 34, line 919-** Gender identity is conflated with sex assigned at birth. This can lead to confusion. Gender is listed as a “deeply-held sense of being male, female, neither of these, both or other gender(s) and may not necessarily correspond with an individual’s sex assigned at birth.” Female and male are being used as gender identities where woman/girl, man/boy, non-binary (not an extensive list) can be used in place of F/M. Female/Male/Intersex are more widely accepted as terms for biological sex categories (rather than gender identities). | Att 1243e | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy, Executive Director | **p. 34, Line 919-921**. We are concerned about the wording, “other gender(s) and may not necessarily correspond with an individual’s sex assigned at birth.”  There is no scientific research to back up this claim of having “other gender(s).” There are rare cases of physical anomalies when someone is born with both genitalia, yet a physical anomaly does not equate new genders. We think this should be removed and not be taught. | Att 171b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Keith Griffin, RNP, MSN, PhD | **p. 34, Line 919-921**  “Gender identity refers to one’s internal, deeply-held sense of being male, female, neither of these, both, or other gender(s) and may not necessarily correspond with an individual’s **sex assigned at birth**…”  RESPONSE: The expression “sex assigned at birth” misrepresents the common distinction made at birth through out the world. When a baby is born, the parents and medical personnel without exception say that “you’ve got a boy or a girl!” They are simply using their eyes to correlate with reality of biological genetics. This expression “sex assigned at birth” should be replaced by “biological sex at birth”. | Att 736b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 34, line 921**– WEAVE is not an appropriate resource for the definitions of sexual orientation and gender identity. Although the definition seems fine, there are national bodies who do work on LGBTQ issues that should be given credit for providing these definitions and will be a more appropriate resource for folks looking to follow through on a citation. GLSEN, HRC, Gender Spectrum, GSA Network, Welcoming Schools, even APA has these definitions. | Att 1031b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 34, line 924-**  Female and Male again are used as gender identities where woman/girl, man/boy, non-binary, etc. may be more appropriate. | Att 1243e | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 35, line 937 (table**)- Pronouns are incorrectly connected to Sex/Gender expression and listed as “normative” or not. This is incorrect as, for example, not all folks who identify as Males use he/him pronouns. This is also stigmatizing of folks whose pronouns are they/them as this is shown here to be non-normative.  p. 35, line 938- The definition for Heterosexual is inaccurate and confusing. It is listed as attraction to “different sex or gender.” In this definition a person who is non-binary and attracted to women would be labeled heterosexual (since this is an attraction to a different sex or gender). Further in the table bisexual is defined as “both opposite and same sex or gender” attraction. The use of opposite supports binary thinking which is problematic and counterproductive to creating an inclusive classroom.  There are many other resources that provide more accurate and up to date definitions of sexual orientations. It is recommended to see a different resource: https://www.thetrevorproject.org/trvr\_support\_center/glossary/#sm.000i59oz7p6bcou10um2l6ann3m11 | Att 1243e | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Linda Cone, retired teacher | **PP 35-37, Lines 928-951.** Delete this passage.  The philosophy of this passage is to elevate emotions and feelings over biological fact. There is also a fundamental contradiction in the passage: Earlier in line 919, gender identity is described as a “deeply held sense”. In line 939, “gender and sexuality are often fluid…” The text goes on to acknowledge that “This can be challenging for some to grasp…” Exactly! This is why presenting such an emotional concept is inappropriate. We are all unique and do not need an ever expanding list of labels to diminish our unique identities. More important is the problem that teachers are to **affirm** these identities (line 928). Highly problematic is the list of **Common Sexual Orientations** (line 938)which includes bisexual, pansexual, and polysexual. Where is the evidence that these are common orientations? More important, is there any concern that affirming the implied behaviors of these orientations might conflict with some very basic values held by most parents? Add that the law states that parents may not opt children out of lessons on gender/sexual orientation/identity. | Att 653b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy, Executive Director | **p. 35-36, Line 938.** Remove sexual orientations such as Pansexual, Asexual, Polysexual. Not all parents want to open their children to be learning a growing list of sexual orientations. This is very controversial and contrary to many families' fundamental core values, especially if this is required material and mandatory, and no way to opt out. | Att 171b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Zara Plakakis, on behalf of Parents | **Page 35, line 938**, Omit  Table of Sexual Orientation terms “pansexual” and “polysexual”. Redundant and ridiculous. We don’t need to imagine things up. | Att 960b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Steven J. Boggs – Private Citizen, voter | **Page 36, Lines 755-757** “Consider hanging a small rainbow pride flag or *safe zone* sticker that signifies that all gender identities and expressions are welcome in the classroom.” Cut this line. Rainbow pride flags and safe zone stickers are NOT inclusive. | Att 644b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Keith Griffin, RNP, MSN, PhD | **p. 37-38, Lines 946-953**  “Invite a guest speaker from a local LGBTQ+ center to provide support and information regarding gender and sexuality. . . It can also help other students understand that differences in sexual attraction and gender expression are **normal and respected** (9–12.5.5.G, Decision Making; 9–12.1.10.G, Essential Concepts). Talking about these differences can be related to discussion about prejudice and discrimination.”  RESPONSE: This section (again) states gender differences in a misleading light. If the word “normal” is placed in a mathematical-statistical perspective, it is a false statement. LGBTQ behavior is outside of the statistical norm for gender differences. The expression “normal and respected” should be replaced by the word “acknowledged”, and the complete statistical incidence of ‘non-binary’ behaviors and identifications be presented honestly. Also, if students’ religious beliefs lead them to not respect ‘non-binary’ gender differences as something good or healthy, then for the school to attempt to force them to do so is religious discrimination and bullying. The expression “normal and respected” should be replaced with the word “acknowledged” so the school can remain neutral. | Att 736b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **P. 37, Lines 947-48.** Change to “It is beneficial to have representatives from different organizations and diverse cultures, ethnicities, and religious backgrounds.” This is more inclusive and reflective of our student population. | Att 1098b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **P. 38, Lines 965-66**. Delete “If a student club does not exist, teachers can consider leading an effort to begin one with students.” Clubs on high school campuses are properly student-led. | Att 1098b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 38, lines 965-966-** This portion encourages students to start a Gay-Straight-Alliance (GSA) club, it would be helpful to include a resource to help support those efforts such as a guide provided by GLSEN: https://www.glsen.org/jumpstart | Att 1243e | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 39, Line 790-813**  Glorifying professionals who emphasize their sexuality is inappropriate in the school setting. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not recommended** |
|  | 6 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 39, line 995** – These are very old data if it’s from 2003. While compelling, I would prefer the document have as much new data as possible. The YRBS shows a national decline in dating violence since 2013. I love having a data point included here, because I know this is a huge issue, but I think it undermines the strength of the data to include something over 15 years old. | Att 1031b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **P. 41,** chart. Delete “forcing others to adhere to rigid gender roles”. While I sympathize with this inclusion and see how some examples of this could be abusive, given the description by this framework of traditional gender roles as “myths” or “stereotypes” to be challenged, it is difficult to see how anyone who believes, according to their faith, in a more traditional understanding of gender, will not be labeled as a potential abuser. This could potentially set a dangerous precedent of viewing people of faith as likely abusers if they prefer to date others who share their views on gender or express those preferences to a partner. | Att 1098b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Maureen Ufkes, public adult school instructor; parent | **Page 41, Table Examples of Abuse**  **Remove**  Using religion to justify abuse, forcing others to adhere to rigid gender roles, forcing partner to do things against their beliefs, mocking beliefs or cultural practices, not allowing partner to do things they enjoy or to better themselves, including interfering with their education  **Replace**  Using religion to justify physical or sexual abuse; or forced participation in a cult; mocking traditional beliefs or cultural practices  Note: Families that encourage their children to allow religious faith to influence their beliefs about sexuality are not abusive. Families that do not agree with the state-sponsored doctrines on human sexuality/gender fluidity and who encourage students to value gender roles and celebrate gender differences (as most cultures in human history have done) are not abusive. | Att 1006b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Maureen Ufkes, public adult school instructor; parent | **Page 46, Lines 1129-1131**  Students who find their identity in their religion/spirituality are also the targets of abuse, being called “bigots”, “hateful”, “closed-minded”, “discriminators, “on the wrong side of history”,etc. when they do not agree with culturally dominant sexual beliefs . Educators must not pressure students to adopt the state-sponsored views about sexuality by disparaging families who encourage their religious faith to influence their beliefs. K-12 students should not be shamed or silenced, as many students on public university campuses currently are. | Att 1006b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p.48, line 1143-** This section addresses the relationship between harassment and assault and addresses rape culture—absolutely necessary! However, in the table of “comments that reflect Rape Culture,” (starting on line 1157) there are some examples that, in fact, show up in this same framework. “They shouldn’t have had so much to drink,” corresponds to the idea that drinking puts one at risk which showed up on pg 34. “They shouldn’t put themselves in risky situations,” is exactly what pg 34 asserts. These are contradictions.  **On pg 49, line 1167**, it states that “ much of rape culture has to do with victim blaming, lack of bystander intervention and an overall lack of empathy as illustrated in these examples.” I would add misogyny and harmful gender roles to that list. | Att 1243e | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Jennifer Chou on behalf of the California Sexual Health Education Roundtable | Page 48, line 1144  Replace “*Rape culture* also contributes to sexual violence and is an important concept to discuss with students in ninth through twelfth grades. Normalization, desensitization, and acceptance of sexual violence are the essence of rape culture.”  With **“*Rape culture*—the normalization, desensitization, and acceptance of sexual violence and sexual aggression—contributes to sexual violence and is an important concept to discuss with students in ninth through twelfth grades.”**  Recommended change to streamline language and introduce the definition of “rape culture” earlier. | Att 1207b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Jennifer Chou on behalf of the California Sexual Health Education Roundtable | Page 48, line 1150  Replace “Objectification of men and concepts of extreme forms of masculinity may also be problematic if it promotes harmful and rigid gender stereotypes.”  With **“Extreme standards for masculinity, also referred to as** **toxic or traditional masculinity, support rape culture and can** **negatively impact the mental health and psychological** **development of men by promoting rigid gender stereotypes that normalize aggression and disparage the appearance of weakness.”**  Suggested language to more clearly explain the connection between toxic masculinity and rape culture and to underscore the negative impact toxic masculinity may have on men. *See,* *e.g.*, AMERICAN PSYCHOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION, *APA Guidelines for the Psychological Practice with Boys and Men* (Aug. 2018), https://www.apa.org/about/policy/boys‐men‐practiceguidelines.pdf. | Att 1207b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 48, line 1150** – Revise: <byh>Objectification of men and concepts of extreme forms of masculinity may also be problematic if it promotes harmful and rigid gender stereotypes.<eyh> to: “Stereotypes about masculinity and unrealistic expectations around masculinity (e.g. “men don’t cry”) are also problematic because they contribute to rape culture by prescribing rigid gender roles.”  Objectification relates to dehumanizing a person based on minimizing their worth down to body parts. While men may be sexualized, cis men are most often, as a function of their privilege, still seen as whole people. This is not to say they don’t experience rape culture and that individual people may feel like objects, but the systemic oppression of women results in objectification and rape culture and this doesn’t happen – systemically – to cis men. | Att 1031b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 52, line 1250-**  Here again law enforcement is listed as a resource, outside of the previously mentioned concerns around cultural humility, there is also the problematic epidemic of law enforcement lackluster response towards assault victims. Many say that the process of reporting their assault was re-traumatizing. Rape kits go untested etc. If law enforcement is included, then there should be some sort of disclaimer added. | Att 1243e | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 53, line 1265-**  There is no evidence shown to support that sex trafficking is a “growing global problem.” In deference to that lack of data, please delete, “growing.”  Excerpt from “Special Report: Money and Lies in Anti-Human Trafficking NGOs”(https://truthout.org/articles/special-report-money-and-lies-in-anti-human-trafficking-ngos/) included in Att 1243e  **p. 53, line 1266-** This is an inaccurate statistic about the age of entry into sex work. See https://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2014/09/is-one-of-the-most-cited-statistics-about-sex-work-wrong/379662/. This statistic should be discarded in the interest of accuracy. | Att 1243e | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 56, line 1344-** “Gang involvement can also put youth at risk, as gangs often view women and girls as property and see potential profit in exploiting them.” It seems that gangs are getting blamed for what is actually endemic to our culture. This may also reinforce racist stereotypes about people involved in trafficking.  Excerpt from “Gangs and Sex Trafficking: How the Movement Against ‘Modern Day Slavery’ Targets Descendents of Slavery as its Primary Perpetrators” included in Att 1243e | Att 1243e | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 58, line 1379- “**Students research the prevalence of sex trafficking and are alarmed at how widespread it is.”  Since there is very little accurate data around sex trafficking, and what little data exists supports that it is not, in fact, as widespread as one might believe, it is suggested to encourage teachers to discuss with their students why sex trafficking is a problem, what factors contribute to sex trafficking, and how learning about sex trafficking makes the students feel.  Excerpt from “Attacking Sex Trafficking By Attacking... Who?” (https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/sexual-intelligence/201409/attacking-sex-trafficking-attackingwho )included in Att 1243e | Att 1243e | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 58, line 1381-**  Line 1381 blames sex trafficking on the “overt hypersexualization and objectification of women portrayed by the media.” The data to support that claim is not cited. | Att 1243e | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 58, line 1383-**1393 – This section continues to imply that consumption of pornography leads to sex trafficking which is problematic because we know many students watch pornography. We can increase their awareness of reality and fiction without saying they are traffickers. Implying they are traffickers is a highly stigmatizing approach to take with students and may undermine the very important issues of trafficking if applied to much lesser infractions.  I recommend the following edits: “*They further evaluate the <bh>relationship<eh>between pornography <bh>and<eh> sex trafficking <bh>by discussing how pornography may create more<eh> demand from the buyers of sex. Pornography may normalize sexual violence and its viewers may become desensitized to its impact, not understanding that many individuals featured in the photographs or videos are actually being trafficked as minors or otherwise forced or manipulated into participation. It is not uncommon for pornography to reflect rape culture, and it can sometimes be a form of sex trafficking. In analyzing this concept, many students <byh>may<eyh> <bh> conclude that some people who participate in the sex industry may be coercive or be coerced and that this may promote sex trafficking.”<eh>*  I removed the portion about economics and supply and demand because it seems possible that sex trafficking has been around longer than pornography, so I’m not sure that eliminating pornography will eliminate sex trafficking, as is implied. | Att 1031b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | EB Troast, MPH, Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 58, line 1392-**  There is no data cited to show the connection between pornography and sex trafficking. This association is often falsely cited by the religious right.  Excerpt from “The GOP’s Sex Trafficking Shell Game: How Laws Against ‘Sex Trafficking’ End Up Hurting Women (https://www.thedailybeast.com/the-gops-sex-trafficking-shell-game-how-laws-against-sex-trafficking-end-up-hurting-women) included in Att 1243e  “In analyzing this concept, many students conclude that even willing participation in the sex industry may promote sex trafficking.” This is particularly egregious stigmatizing of sex workers. Stigma around sex work is part of what makes it so hard for people who have been trafficked to heal from their experiences. Also, there is no data to support this claim. | Att 1243e | **Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 61, Line 1430**  **REMOVE STRICKEN WORDS.**<bs>~~Students identify local resources for reproductive and sexual health and evaluate laws related to sexual involvement with minors by inviting the local American Civil Liberties Union chapter, local Planned Parenthood~~<es>, CDPH, CDE, <byh>or other verified medically accurate organizations<eyh> CAN provide a professional development presentation on the California Healthy Youth Act for teachers, administrators, school board members, and parents, guardians, and caretakers | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 61, Lines 1430-1435**  Remove (Lines 1432-1433):  Remove the names of the listed organizations (ACLU, Planned Parenthood, CDPH, or CDE)  Reason: Demonstrates bias by directing students to specific organizations; such references are not inclusive, but exclusive. Remove: (Lines 780-781) “such as San Francisco Unified School District’s *Be Real. Be Ready. Smart Sexuality Education* and *Advocates for Youth 3Rs: Rights, Respect, Responsibility”* **Add: (Line 782)** “find out what curriculum your district is using and how to” **before** “access or”  **Reason:** Per AB329 CHYA it is up to each school district to decide what is evidence informed for their district. It is not up to CDE to decide was is evidence based, especially with the above mentioned curriculums teaching beyond what the law requires. The above curriculums are bias and taught progressively, leaving out much of the demographics within the school districts.  Ed Code 51933 (b) All factual information presented shall be medically accurate and **objective**.  Ed Code 51933 d (4) Instruction and materials shall **not reflect or promote bias** against any person on the basis of any category protected by Section 220.  Add: “It is still considered unlawful for any minor under the age of 18 to participate in sexual activity and that it is a dangerous practice especially to involve onself sexually with anyone over the age of 18 as they can receive punishment of anywhere from 1 year in prison or more PC 261.5.” | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **P. 61, line 1432**. Delete “local American Civil Liberties Union chapter”. The ACLU is not an established authority on reproductive and sexual health, and is politically controversial. | Att 1098b | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | David Schmus, Executive Director of Christian Educators Association International, credentialed secondary social science educator with 15 years of CA classroom teaching experience and adjunct professor of education at Biola University. | **P. 61, Line 1433.** Edit “or other verified medically accurate organizations”. Who verifies these organizations? Better to say, “or other respected, medically-accurate organizations.” | Att 1098b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 61, Line 1433** – Edit sentence to read: “…minors by inviting the local American Civil Liberties Union chapter, local Planned Parenthood, CDPH, CDE, *school-based health center*…” | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 69, Line 1662**  Comment-CPR instructor qualification for compression-only CPR for schools has not been determined by the CDE (according to the web site). Clarification for the CDE is needed to determine who will be teaching compression-only CPR. This should be included into the framework. | Att 1056b | **Not recommended** |
|  | 6 | Maureen Legg, Eric A Paredes Save A Life Foundation | **CHAPTER 6 - PAGE 69, LINE 1663,** INSERT THIS LESSON:  9-12.1.1.S and 9-12 1.3.S (Essential Concepts) TO SUPPORT VARIED REQUIREMENTS FOR CPR TRAINING IN SCHOOLS  Classroom Lesson  – Learn the Facts – Cardiac Arrest and CPR  Objective – Students to identify, assess, and learn to respond to a cardiac arrest emergency situation using cardiopulmonary resuscitation (CPR).  Materials Needed:  Computer  Projector  Screen  Student handouts (Hand Only CPR)  Lesson Introduction:  Anyone can learn CPR– and everyone should! That is what we will be doing for the next two days! Our lesson objective is that you will be able to identify, assess and respond to an emergency situation using CPR – cardiopulmonary resuscitation. You will also learn about an automated external defibrillator (AED) in class tomorrow.  Ask:  Have any you ever used CPR or watched someone else use CPR to save a person’s life?  Lesson Information:  Use the musical video found at http://handsonlycpr.org/ to create interest in the topic of CPR OR use this YouTube video featuring students on a playground or both – http://www.YouTube.com/watch?v=GMjXrFig7M4  ***\*See Att 1666 for the rest of the actionable recommendations for this classroom lesson example.*** | Att 1666 | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Maureen Legg, Eric A Paredes Save A Life Foundation | **CHAPTER 6 - PAGE 72 - LINE 1781**  Insert this information to support page 70 reference to sudden cardiac arrest warning signs and risk factors  Analyzing Health Influences 9-12.2.1.S  Practice health literacy by reviewing warning signs and risk factors of a potential heart condition and encourage students to advocate for themselves.  Sudden Cardiac Arrest occurs from a heart condition that is often undiagnosed because youth don’t necessarily recognize the warning signs of a potential heart condition, or, they don’t want to feel different or feel left behind because they can’t keep up. They often don’t want to jeopardize they ability to participate in activities if they complain about not feeling well. Teach students to recognize warning signs and speak up about a potential health problem they are experiencing.  Warning signs of a potential heart condition could include fainting (number one sign of a potential heart condition), chest pain, shortness of breath, racing or fluttering heartbeat (palpitation, especially at rest), dizziness or lightheadedness and extreme fatigue (tiredness). These factors can be easily disregarded or confused with other reasons why they are experiencing them. Rick factors for a potential heart condition include a family member with known heart abnormalities or who experienced sudden death before age 50, and the student’s own use of stimulants, inhalants, unprescribed medication, performance-enhancing supplements or excessive energy drinks. | Att 1666 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  7 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 76, Lines 1859-1862**  Add (Line 1862) at the end of sentence  Research shows students who participate in their religion regularly have higher academic performance, are less likely to abuse substances, more likely to graduate high school, and more likely to enroll in college than their unaffiliated counterparts (See End Notes: Horwitz 2018; Loury 2004; National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse 2010; John Wallace et al., nod). Affirming students’ religious beliefs and encouraging less time spent on social media can have a positive influence and the students’ performance and the school’s success. | Att 1134b Att 1143b Att 1145b Att 1150b Att 1187b Att 1198b Att 1323b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Elena Costa on behalf of the California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program | **Page 79, Lines 1929-1930**- Please consider removing the example pertaining to the concept of “community risk” which references hookah. It may be interpreted as culturally insensitive and appears to imply that tobacco use in the home with <bh>underage individuals is a “value” or “norm” in Middle Eastern cultures.<eh>  **Page 80, Line 1967**-Please replace the word “smoking” with the word “tobacco” as it will be more inclusive of all tobacco products covered under California’s legislative definition of “tobacco products.” | Att 684b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Elena Costa on behalf of the California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program | **Page 80, Line 1967**-Please replace the word “smoking” with the word “tobacco” as it will be more inclusive of all tobacco products covered under California’s legislative definition of “tobacco products.”  **Page 83, Lines 2030-2031**- Given that in 2016 California law deemed it illegal for individuals under the age of 21 to purchase all tobacco products (including ESDs), consider proposing an alternate exercise which asks students to present arguments on the benefits to banning the sale of tobacco products to those born <bh>after a certain year<eh>  **Page 83, Lines 2030-2031**- Please replace “e-cigarettes” with “Electronic Smoking devices” to align with the most current terminology for these types of products. | Att 684b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Gustavo Loera on behalf of Cal-HOSA | **Pages 87-100** – Overall, the missing element throughout this document are the lived/life experiences of students and the implement these lived/life experiences that make it more real and meaningful to students. Through sharing one’s personal stories based on lived/life experiences, resiliency is discovered and presents a great opportunity for teachers to help students build upon that discovery. Storytelling can be a strategy where students share their story and within their story discover their personal and cultural assets/strengths. Teachers can then guide students on how to use their assets and strengths as protective factors or strategies to cope with or overcome risk factors associated with mental health issues.  Organization of the information in the document is also an issue. For this document to have utility, it has to be organized as a framework that makes it easy to align to academic standards. | Att 297i | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Marc Berman, Assemblymem-ber, 24th District | **P. 89, Line 2179-2181**- Last year I authored AB 2639, which builds upon this existing requirement. The new law requires schools to review its pupil suicide prevention policy at minimum every five years and, if necessary, update its policy. Requiring schools to review and reevaluate their pupil suicide prevention policies will ensure that these policies remain relevant and continue to support students’ mental health needs, including those of high-risk groups such as LGBTQ youth. Since the Framework references Education Code Section 215 and describes the requirement, the Framework should also specify the new requirement that the policy is reviewed every five years and, if necessary, updated.  *\*This Comment was also submitted for Chapter 5, p. 79, Line 1911-1913* | Att 1042b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 89, Line 2181**  Consider adding: With the passing of recent legislation, suicide prevention hotline numbers will be printed on the back of all school identification cards. | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 89, Line 2193** – Edit sentence to read: “…inside classrooms, *and any health service area such as the school-based health center or school nurse office*.” | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Gustavo Loera on behalf of Cal-HOSA | **Pages 89-92, Line 2168, 2248, 2272** – The word “stress” is often used too loosely and left for interpretation. It may be a good idea to reframe stress as a risk factor associated with mental health issues. That is, first understanding the causes of stress or toxic stress and how it can lead to a mental illness if left unresolved. Can stress sometimes be healthy? | Att 297i | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Linda Cone, retired teacher | **Page 89-90, Lines 2195-2196 -** GLSEN has developed a Safe Space Kit for teachers and other school staff that is available online at no cost.  **Delete this sentence.** Safe zones should be inclusive. Any sign that invites only the members of a specific group should be prohibited. | Att 653b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Gustavo Loera on behalf of Cal-HOSA | **Page 90, Lines 2201, 2222** – Too often students watch a video or are given a case study of a person suffering from schizophrenia or bipolar disorder and instructed to work in groups to analyze and diagnose the case. The outcome can sometimes create more stigma than awareness.  Focusing on helping behaviors such as listening, communication, showing compassion, empathy, relationship building, etc. can be the foundation to better understanding the social determinants of mental health and the role that students and teachers play in promoting mental health wellness and recovery. | Att 297i | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Catherine Ellis, Department of Health Care Services, Interagency Prevention Advisory Council, Suicide and Depression Prevention Workgroup  Public Member of SMHPW | **Page 90, Line 2214** – Activities to include appropriate language; for example, “Mental Health Matters: 8 Stigmatizing Phrases to Stop Using” discusses.  **Page 90, Line 2224** – Show the video *It’s Real College Students and Mental Health* produced by American Foundation for Suicide Prevention, featuring actual students, designed to raise awareness about mental health issues commonly experienced by students, and to be used as part of a school’s educational program to encourage help-seeking. | Att 297j | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 91, Line 2238**  Consider adding: The school will notify parent/guardians and students twice annually about local mental health services at school and within their community. | Att 1056b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | Gustavo Loera on behalf of Cal-HOSA | **Page 91, Line 2239** – I recommend promoting interviewing skills where students develop an interview protocol and engage members of their community in conversations about mental health and in the process discover how communities are diverse in their views, perceived challenges, and approaches to dealing with mental health problems. Students will learn more from these real-life experiential learning opportunities. Plus, students may be more intrinsically driven because they are studying their own community. Students can then share their findings from their community-defined challenges and solutions to mental health issues and discover how there is no “one-size-fits all” approach to mental health. | Att 297i | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Gustavo Loera on behalf of Cal-HOSA | **Page 93, Line 2282** – Journal writing is a great strategy to do with students, I’m just not convinced that prompts like “I hope…; or I am most cheerful when…” listed on pages 92 and 93 will get students to write. The writing prompts must be relevant to student’s real-life experiences. | Att 297i | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Catherine Ellis, Department of Health Care Services, Interagency Prevention Advisory Council, Suicide and Depression Prevention Workgroup  Public Member of SMHPW | **Page 96, Line 2374** – add “using substances” after outbursts of anger. | Att 297j | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Marc Berman, Assemblymem-ber, 24th District | **p. 99, lines 2457-2478**- Again, in the Partnering with your school sections (found in Chapter 5, in lines 2168-2179 and Chapter 6 lines, 2457-2478) there are opportunities to highlight the use of the school’s pupil suicide prevention policy. These sections offer example lessons for the corresponding standards, and I recommend they be used to specify the use of the pupil suicide prevention policy that all schools must create. Ensuring that the pupil suicide prevention policy is explicitly mentioned in these sections will support teachers in bringing awareness of available resources to their students as well as provide both teachers and students the tools to recognize and respond to warning signs when students need help.  *\*This Comment was also submitted for Chapter 5, page 89, Lines 2168-2179* | Att 1042b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 6 | R. Loya – CASHE | **100–113** seems like personal and community health (diseases) and the environment were barely touched upon compared to nutrition. Almost seems like some writers feel that a health class is a nutrition education course?? For many kids tis the gun shots they hear at night down the street that makes them wonder what this world is about or all the smog days and wondering why this asthma stuff is. Too late now but personal and community health and the environment seem short changed in this section. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page100, Line 2483**  The American Foundation for Suicide Prevention has school-based programs and student training resources. | Att 1056b | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 102, Line 2533**  Consider adding into the sentence: Students can also research **immunization preventable diseases** and the most common infectious diseases affecting young people in their age group **around the world** and in their community…. | Att 1056b | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 102, Line 2551**  Consider adding to the sentence: and minimizing exposure to loud noises such as amplified music from headphones or ear buds **to prevent permanent hearing loss.** | Att 1056b | **Recommended** |
|  | 6 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 109, Line 2723-2733** Remove Global Citizens  Students develop as global citizens by watching documentaries such as: (1) PBS’s Sick Around the World (2008) that compares the U.S. healthcare system to five other countries medical systems; (2) PBS’s RX for Survival: A Global Health Challenge (2005) that documents key milestones in public health; (3) Unnatural Causes: Is Inequality Making Us Sick? (2008) that examines the racial and socioeconomic disparities in health; (4) Straight Laced that features teens speaking about gender and sexuality; and (5) 13th (2016) a documentary on the intersection of race, justice, and mass incarceration in the U.S. Thoughtful teacher-facilitated discussion and students’ reflection papers reinforce what the students learn from the documentaries. (This activity also connects to the <bbh>CA CCSS for ELA/Literacy, W.9–12.7–9.)<ebh> | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Parents, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens  9 individuals submitted this comment with identical or similar language | **Page 109, Line 2724-2731**  I strongly object to the documentary “Straight Laced” being shown in school. Such content is inappropriate. | Att 537b 543b 569b 586b 891b 895b 976b 1039b 1132b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 6 | Dawn Anderson, Director, Health and Prevention Programs- Ventura County Office of Education | **Page 114, Line 2849**  In resources- Consider adding: American Foundation for Suicide Prevention: https://afsp.org/ | Att 1056b | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | R. Loya – CASHE | **GENERAL COMMENTON CHAPTER** &. Expand this chapter by 30 pages and trim others accordingly, good luck with that. This chapter is so vital and so current taking one right into the future as opposed to the past. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 2, Line 19** – Edit sentence to read “Teachers, administrators, specialists, expanded learning leaders, parents, guardians, caretakers, families, *school support staff (such as school counselors, school nurses, and school social workers), community partners (such as school-based health centers)*, and the broader school community need the support of one another to best serve all students.” | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | R. Loya – CASHE | **P2 23–34** all nice but to use the term culture more where appropriate. What is there will suffice. | Att 689b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | R. Loya – CASHE | **P3 38–46** I wonder about this term “culturally diverse” sometimes. Almost seems negative in tone? Almost like to be “diverse” is to have an illness? Anything more positive in tone out there? GREAT to see disabilities and experienced trauma on the list – long overdue | Att 689b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Kristin Brooks, Supporting Inclusive Practices (SIP), Riverside County Office of Education | **p.4, lines 71-72**  Strike lines 71 and 72 beginning with “…prevents the need for follow-up instruction, and reduces the need for alternative instruction,” as a hallmark of UDL is the opportunity for review and redo to become an expert learner (the ultimate goal!). | Att 2098a | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 4, line 71-72**- remove “prevent the need for follow up instruction” and change to “reduces the need for follow up instruction and the need for alternative inclusion.” | Att 2106 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Kristin Brooks, Supporting Inclusive Practices, Riverside County Office of Education | Updated UDL Guidelines version 2.2 to replace page 5, line 78 (PDF attached)  Interactive UDL Guidelines accessible at this link as well: http://udlguidelines.cast.org/?utm\_medium=web&utm\_campaign=none&utm\_source=cast-about-udl  Consider directing the reader to www.cast.org, founders of UDL, where the most current information, resources, and Guidelines can be found and explored.  ***Please see Att 2014b for the updated UDL Guidelines that were submitted with this comment*** | Att 2098a Att 2098b | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 4, line 76-** Changing the “National for UDL” to “National Center on UDL” | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 5, line 82-** change “teachers” to “all school staff” | Att 2106 | **Recommended with Writher’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 5, line 79**- update the CAST Principles from 2011 to newer version (maybe 2018) | Att 2106 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 5, Line 84** – Edit sentence to read “This requires teachers, *support staff (such as school counselors, school nurses, and school social workers*), specialists, administrators, *and community partners (such as school-based health centers)* to adopt a stance of inquiry toward their practice and to engage in ongoing, collaborative discussions with their colleagues about challenging issues, including race, culture, language, and equity. | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 7, line 138**- add “cultural, linguistic, and disability assets…” | Att 2106 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 9, line 184**- add “mental health” to end of line 184 | Att 2106 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | R. Loya – CASHE | **P14 285–329** speaking of denying culture – is Ms. G possibly a Ms. Gonzalez and we don’t want to admit that? It’s like an overkill on this Ms. G and Mr. T and Mrs. K stuff. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 7 | R. Loya – CASHE | **P16–17 334–335** the boxed items. At the end “organic foods are more nutritious, safer for our bodies, and better for the environment” I am still not sure if that applies to all organic foods. I guess no way is it possible to have some brand of non-organic bread that I can afford as opposed to having only organic bread that I can’t afford. Yes include organic foods in school lunch programs but e prepared for a higher cost? AND no way does organic liver taste good!!! I mean to say organics always taste better just is too general of a claim. | Att 689b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 20, line 414**- check that the acronym ATOD is spelled out earlier and if not please write out the words. | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 20,** Commissioner Mills will add recommendations for section on this page | Att 2106 | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 7 | R. Loya – CASHE | **P21 431–441** some new data indicated that Hispanics in California out number the whites. That new fact kind of gets lost in the opening line. | Att 689b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 21, line 436**- do students with visible and non visible disabilities fit in here? | Att 2106 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | R. Loya – CASHE | **P21 442–447** ah on target. Perhaps more on HOW to ensure inclusion and a safe classroom environment. This is a hard one for many teachers to deal with I fear. | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 21, line 456**- ensure the Department of Labor Statistics is the most up to date citation (currently 2016). ACSE also supports the inclusion of this content. | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | R. Loya – CASHE | **P22 468 et al**. love that this section exists a does next section on disadvantage and homeless. All vital. But might merit more pages on each? | Att 689b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 23, Line 506** – Edit sentence to read “Schools can support undocumented students and families by creating a safe and supportive environment, *linking to* resources available to undocumented students and families, *such as community providers like school-based health centers*, and being open minded and ready. | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 24, Line 525** – Edit sentence to read“For students you suspect are homeless or in a transitional living situation, work with *school support staff (such as school counselors, school nurses, and school social workers), community partners (such as school-based health centers)* or administrators to connect students and families with the McKinney-Vento Homeless Assistance Act lead for your district. | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 24, line 543-547**- check the citation of Moore, 2013 | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 25 line 570** – add page numbers from the citation | Att 2106 | **Not** **Recommended**. |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 26, lines 578-584** - Gorski work and substitute students with disabilities…. Can we use Gorksi’s work to include students with disabilities? This comment may be applicable to the students with disabilities section of this chapter. | Att 2106 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 31, line 587**- be consistent with people first language (foster youth) | Att 2106 | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 31, line 594-596**- Look for more current citation than Wiegmann et al. 2014. Use the 2015 Special Education Taskforce Report as a possible source for more up to date information.  Remove the word “diagnose” | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 31, Line 608** – Edit sentence to read “This may require teachers, district staff, *school support staff (such as school counselors, school nurses, and school social workers), and community partners (such as school-based health centers)* to coordinate communication with case managers to make sure a student is not missing out on critical course content, and in some instance may require a community of providers to supplement education to meet this need.” | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 31, Line 625** – Edit sentence to read “Ask *school support staff (such as school counselors, school nurses, and school social workers) or community partners (such as school-based health centers)* about connecting students in to the district foster youth liaison to obtain additional learning resources and health services for students. | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 32, line 624/625-** add school administrator and school social worker | Att 2106 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 33, line 643-** change teachers to “teachers and school support staff” (align to rest of framework) | Att 2106 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 33, Line 673** – “Many students do not feel supported in expressing their gender, gender identity, and sexual orientation.” Needed is the documentation of a thousand cases that support the thesis about many students not geeling supported. | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 36, Lines 755-757**  **REMOVE**  “Consider hanging a small rainbow pride flag or *safe zone* sticker that signifies that all gender identities and expressions are welcome in the classroom.” Cut this line. Rainbow pride flags and safe zone stickers are NOT inclusive. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 37, line 753** – “diverse others” reads potentially stigmatizing and othering. Please revise to something like “…treat everyone with dignity and respect” instead of “diverse others”. | Att 1031b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Linda Cone, retired teacher | **Page 37, Lines 755-757** “Consider hanging a small rainbow pride flag or *safe zone* sticker that signifies that all gender identities and expressions are welcome in the classroom.”  Cut this line. Rainbow pride flags and safe zone stickers target one specific group and are NOT inclusive. Children are bullied for many reasons. A frequently targeted group are special needs kids. They should not be made to feel like they must be LGBTQ to be entitled to safe zones/spaces. | Att 653c | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 7 | James Gonzales community member | **Page 38, Line 789-802** Remove <bh>Learning from Diverse Role Models in High School  The teachers at the Helen Rodriguez-Trías Health Professions High School work together to ensure that their students learn about role models in health professions in order to inspire their students to persevere in academic coursework and pursue careers in health fields. The role models the teachers select reflect the cultural, ethnic, gender, LGBTQ+, and other aspects of diversity of students in the school. One of the role models students learn about is teen scientist Jack Andraka. When he was a high school student, he invented an inexpensive early detection test for pancreatic, ovarian, and lung cancers and has won numerous awards. In addition to learning about Andraka’s contributions to health sciences, they also learn how the young inventor and scientist, openly gay since the age of 13, has earned international praise for sharing his personal and motivational story—in multiple documentaries, journal articles, and a memoir—depicting his experiences of bullying, depression, rejection, and ultimately international success. <eh> | Att 494b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch | **Page 39, line 794** – the use of LGBTQ+ in this sentence is off. Revise to say “…gender, gender identity, sexual orientation and other aspects of diversity…” | Att 1031b | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 40, line 838-849**, Temple Grandin is overused as a person who is an example of a person with disabilities who have achieved. ACSE will provide some additional examples to include instead of Temple Grandin. Commissioner Mills will submit new examples. | Att 2106 | **No Motion Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 41, line 857**- start with the fact that “one out of four people are people with disabilities.” Treat Students with Disabilities as a Cultural Group. The current language begins with the law of IDEA and not how other groups are included. Commissioner Mills will submit recommendations for additional language. | Att 2106 | **No Motion Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 41, line 875**- A disability category – strike the word “membership” and add at the end of the sentence “for special education purposes” | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 41, line 876**- remove “severity” from spectrum of disability | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 43,** section on students with visible and non visible disabilities regarding teaching sexual health education to students with disabilities and intellectual disabilities are called out-explain why. Commissioner Mills will provide recommendations for additional language. | Att 2106 | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 46, Line 943** – After the sentence ending “…caregivers” add: “School staff should be mindful of a delicate balance between sharing information to keep a student safe and maintaining a student’s confidentiality.” | Att 680b | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 46, Line 946** – Edit sentence to read “*Health education teachers, teachers, peer health educators, or health educators from community agencies* may be in a position to suggest helpful resources and connect students to school supports including the school nurse, social worker, or counselor. | Att 680b | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Danielle Molé, Senior Policy Advocate, California Alliance | **p. 47, “Students Who Have Experienced Trauma”**  **Please add the following content to this section:**  Trauma may be triggered by sights, sounds or smells that bring up the memory of the traumatic incident(s). When this happens, educators need to help the student feel safe in order to calm the student. | Att 2103 | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 47, line 944-** add school psychologist  **line 954-** “provide professional development to all school staff” | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 48, line 961-** use full name of MTSS- Multi-Tiered System of Support (MTSS) | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | 7 | Lisa Eisenberg on behalf of the California School-Based Health Alliance | **Page 48, Line 1001** – Edit sentence to read “.All health educators, *school support staff (such as school counselors, school nurses, and school social workers), community partners (such as school-based health centers)*, and administrators are encouraged to play an integral role and collaborate with the specialized team to advocate and represent the student’s health education needs.” | Att 680b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 7 | Gina Plate on behalf of the Advisory Council on Special Education (ACSE) | **p. 49, line 996**- add school social workers | Att 2106 | **Recommended** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES – I am responding as an expert in health education assessment. I was a subject-matter expert for the CCSSO SCASS Health Education Assessment Project (HEAP) funded by CDC. | **GENERAL COMMENTS:**  All my comments are focused on the alignment of assessment to standards. Additionally, I have analyzed and edited all the columns so that they all work together. Since I feel it is hard to see all of this come together, I have created a new document of the entire table with all my comments. Changes are in itals.  1. The Assessment column he as assessment prompts, but it does not have assessment criteria. I suggest you put a small bold ”Prompt” heading in the Assessment column. Then add another heading called “Criteria” and add criteria. I have written criteria for all the example tasks. Criteria is what teachers need to be able to judge/assess the evidence.  2. Since all the prompts are in the assessment column, it reads oddly that evidence is before the prompt. I recommend that the Evidence column and Assessment column be switched. I have provided an example of this in the entire Standard 1 of my revised table.  3. In many cases, the assessment task just it not work in that they did not address the skill in the standard. I have provided suggested revisions. In a few cases, I could not figure out how to make it work.  4. Please find and example of the proposed layout in the attached file**.** | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **p. 9, line 176-**  Grade K   1. Evidence column. Add the following to the front of the sentence: *Student work product* …   Assessment column.  ***Criteria:*** *Students sentences should include at least one helpful* *statement and one harmful statement. The statements are accurate*. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 10, Line 176—**  Grade 1   1. Evidence column. Delete: Identification of. Add the following to the beginning of the sentence: *Student work product is a worksheet identifying* 2. Criteria needed in the Assessment column. ***Criteria:*** *Students should accurately identify all the ways to reduce injury in an automobile.*   Grade 2:   1. Evidence column. Delete: List. Add the following: *Student work is a list of Add examples: (e.g spending time together, helping each other).* 2. Add criteria to the Assessment column: ***Criteria:*** Student lists are accurate and appropriate ways to express friendship for their age**.** | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 11, Line 176 –**  Grade 3  1. Evidence column. Add: Student work product is a written …  2. Criteria needed in the Assessment column:  Criteria: Student responses should demonstrate comprehensive descriptions of responsibilities in both family and community. Response should identify accurate sources as evidence.  Grade 4  1. Evidence column. Delete text. Revise: Student work product is a report about the dangers of having weapons at school, at home, and in the community.  2. Add criteria:  Criteria: Student work should demonstrate relevant descriptive details and accurate facts about the dangers of weapons. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 12, Line 175 ,** Grade Level 4  The assignment for grade level 4 should give students the opportunity to critically consider both sides of the gun issue. The phrase “the dangers of having weapons at school, at home, and in the community” should read “the advantages and disadvantages of having weapons at school, at home, and in the community” | Att 554b Att 800b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 8 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 13, Line 175, Grade Level 5**  **REMOVE**  The assignment for grade level 5 should be deleted. “Describe how HIV is and is not transmitted.” This assignment is age inappropriate for 5th graders. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 12, Line 176**—  Grade 5   1. Evidence column. Delete: using precise language and domain specific vocabulary. Add to the beginning: *Student work product* … 2. Criteria are in the wrong column. Move to Assessment column. **Criteria:** *Student work should provide descriptions for both how HIV is transmitted and how it is not. Relevant information from print and digital sources should be evident and accurate.*   Grade 9—12   1. Evidence column. Delete entire text and replace: *Student work product is a written paragraph about why people with eating disorders need professional help.*   Criteria are in the wrong column. Add criteria to Assessment column: **Criteria**: *Student work should demonstrate precise language and domain-specific vocabulary. The response should be comprehensive, accurate, and draw a conclusion*. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 13, Line 182**  ***Important: This task needs to be deleted or replaced. The assessment task describes Core Concepts not Analyzing Health Influences.***  **Grade 1**  The Evidence and Assessment columns do not assess Standard 2, which is Analyzing Health Influences. The descriptions provided only assess Core Concepts. I would not use 1.2.1.G as an example here in the Framework. Even though it is coded for Standard 2 (Analyzing Health Influences), it does not support that standard. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 14, Line 182**  Grade 6 –   1. The Evidence column is simply a restatement of the language in the standard. Delete the text and revise: *A written description of an advertisement that analyzes how the advertisement was designed to influence them to use alcohol.* 2. Assessment column. Delete text and revise: *Using an advertisement for alcohol, write a description of how the images writing in the ad were chosen to influence them to use alcohol. Consider the use of role models as a possible influence.* **Criteria:** *Student work should include a description about how alcohol advertisers are specifically placing images in ads that make alcohol use look attractive and fun. Responses should demonstrate an understanding of the intention of advertisers to influence them and others to use alcohol*. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 14, Line 182**  Grade 7-8  The Evidence column simply restates the standard. The Assessment (prompt) is very simple and does not have students evaluating. Students simply “list.” Both columns need revision.   1. Revise the Evidence column: *A written list of food choices and a description of the influence(s) on each choice. (e.g. A breakfast burrito: I was influenced to make this choice because I was very hungry. That was an internal influence of my choice. Also, I could smell the food from the food truck as I walked by. That was an external influence.)* 2. The Assessment column needs revision. Delete everything after the word “list”. Insert the following text: *Write a description about why you made that choice. Think about what influenced you to make the choice. Include both internal and external influences as appropriate.* **Criteria:** *Student work should demonstrate evaluation of internal and external influences in their descriptions about why they made the food choice they made. The response should demonstrate personal insight about the things that affect health choices* | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 15, Line 182**  Grade 9-12—General comment: This is a great activity but, the emphasis is not on Standard 2: analyzing health influences. It does have students demonstrating two other standards. Standard 4: Interpersonal Communication and, Standard 8: Health Promotion.   1. Evidence column: Currently it is a statement that is almost exactly the same as the standard. Rewrite: *A verbal explanation about ways others can influence you to make decisions that impact your health and the health of others when traveling as a passenger in a vehicle.* 2. Assessment column: Add to the end of the first paragraph: *Explain how your health or the health of others could be impacted by positive and negative influences of others.* 3. Leave in the third paragraph. Then add criteria. 4. **Criteria*:*** *Student work should explain the health impact of several influences. Work should demonstrate that they can build on the ideas of others and express their own ideas clearly and persuasively.* | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 16, Line 188**  Grade 4  1. Evidence column is simply a restatement of the standard. Revise: A chart that compares the amount of sugar (in grams) of several different types of food and a conclusion statement.  2. Assessment column is vague and assumes teacher has a worksheet. Revise: Create a chart, using different food labels to show how many grams of sugar are in different foods. Then write a conclusion regarding your findings. (What did you learn from your chart?)  3. Criteria: Observe students as they work to determine if they can access accurate information from food labels. Student work should accurately display the information in the chart. The conclusion statement should be well thought out and include details from their findings.  4. Notes column needs to be in active voice. Delete the word ”Teacher” in the first line. Delete the words “They also” in line 5 | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 16, Line 188**  Grade 7-8  1. The Evidence column needs to identify the kind of product the student will provide. In this case, it is a list. Delete the word “Identification” Revise to say: A list of …  2. Assessment column needs a direction at the end of the paragraph. Add: Create a list of people you could use. If you don’t know their name, use their title. (e.g. counselor)  Criteria: Student lists should include several appropriate adults. These lists should identify only adults. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 17, Line 187 , Grade Level 7-8**  “Who are the adults on campus who are trusted and you can tell if people are in danger of hurting themselves or others?” Add “at home, in the community…” | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 17, Line 188**  Grade 9-12  1. The Evidence column needs to identify the kind of product the student will provide. Delete and revise: In the form of a brochure or a slide show, student work describes valid local resources for FDA-approved contraceptives are identified.  2. Assessment column. Add two new sentences to the end of the first paragraph: Create a brochure or slide show that presents options of valid resources. Identify the services provided for at least three and explain why they are appropriate and valid sources for students.  Criteria: Student work should demonstrate a description of services for at least three sources. Work should provide an accurate description of the sources. The work should describe what criteria they used to determine the source appropriate and valid | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 19, Line 222**  Grade K  Important: This task is categorized under Interpersonal Communication Standard 4. However, the assessment task aligns with the Health Behavior Standard 7. All edits make the assessment align with the Interpersonal Communication Standard 4.  1. Evidence column is simply a restatement of the standard. Revise as follows: Student work provides an oral demonstration of a dialog with a 911 operator.  2. Assessment column. Use the following to replace the text so that is focuses on communication: Call 911 and to answer questions from a 911 operator.  Criteria: Students should demonstrate the ability to interact with the operator providing the operator with accurate responses to the questions from the operator.  3. Notes column needs to be rewritten to focus on communication. Delete all text and revise: This assessment task focuses on student ability to communicate as a part of dialing 911. Use a telephone that is not connected so students can dial 911. Someone must act as a 911 operator to ask questions so students can reply. The use of smart phones requires more instruction to make the numbers screen visible. All phones are different. This is a good opportunity to communicate with parents about your current lesson and suggest they help their child learn how to access the appropriate screen on their phone | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 20, Line 222**  Grade 2  1. Evidence column. Delete text and revise as follows: Student work should demonstrate an oral dialog alerting an adult about an unsafe situation involving drugs or medicines.  2. Assessment column:  Criteria: Student dialogs should contain a) a clear message, b) detailed information about the situation, c) appropriate answers to questions from the adult. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 21, Line 222**  Grade 5  Important This task is categorized under Interpersonal Communication Standard 4. So, the task needs to specifically address the communication aspect of the standard. Right now, all three columns are pretty much the same statement.  1. Evidence column. Delete and revise: Through demonstrations in role-plays, student work should demonstrate healthy and respectful expressions of friendship, attraction and affection.  2. Assessment column. Delete and revise: During your participation in role-plays, show actions that respectfully communicate healthy expressions of friendship, attraction and affection.  **Criteria**: Student work during role plays should demonstrate positive communication skills including:  eye contact  smiles  empathy  active listening  warm/respectful tone of voice  inquiry of needs (what can they do for them?)  3. Notes column. Add the following new sentence at the beginning: This task focuses on communication skills that are common to all three situations, friendship, attraction, and affection | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 21, Line 222**  Grade 6  1. Evidence column. Delete and revise: Student work is in the form of a role-play. In pair, students demonstrate specific communication skills that can be used to avoid risky situations.  2. Assessment column, Delete and revise: Imagine that you have been invited to a party that you know could be risky because no adult supervision will be there. With a partner, demonstrate communication skills you would use to avoid going to the party. One of you pressures the other to go. Demonstrate clear refusal communication skills to avoid going while being pressured to go. Then switch roles.  Criteria: Observe students demonstrating refusal communication skills:  Say “no” with strong intent.  Repeat the no when pressured.  Provide reasons not to go.  Provide an excuse.  Walk away.  3. Notes. Delete and revise: Teachers need to provide students with prompts about being pressured to get involved in a risky situation for the role-plays. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 22, Line 221, Grade Level 5**  “Use healthy and respectful ways to express friendship, attraction, and affection. 5.4.2.G” The word “attraction” should be deleted as age inappropriate for 5th graders. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 22, Line 222**  Grade 7-8  1. Evidence column. Revise: Student work product is in the form of a role-play that demonstrates the differences between passive, aggressive and assertive communication styles.  2. Assessment column. Add criteria.  Criteria: Observe students demonstrating the three different communication styles. Look for behaviors such as:  Passive –Little or no eye-contact, doesn’t speak up, wants others to make decisions, appears meek  Aggressive –Poor listener, interrupts, bullies others, puts others down, know-it-all attitude  Assertive—Good eye contact, active listener, speaks up but open to the opinions of others, confident  3. Notes column: Delete and replace with the following: Teachers should provide potential topics for student to use for role plays. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | ***Note from Kathleen:*** this standard uses role-play in almost every grade level. While I think the task described is an excellent teaching activity, it is difficult to assess every student in the class using this method. I have changed Grade 9-12 to a written response.  **Page 22, Line 222**  Grade 9-12   1. Evidence column. Delete: Demonstration of. Insert: *Student work is a written dialog that demonstrates* . . . 2. In the Assessment column it is necessary to limit the demonstration to one thing. I have chosen alcohol. Delete: In a role-playing situation. Insert: *Using the situation provided, write a dialog that . . .Delete: tobacco, and other drugs.* **Criteria:** *Student work should demonstrate effective refusal skills. The dialog presents at least two of the following:  - A firm and clear “no.” -Detail about why not..  Other possible refusal strategies  -Provide an excuse. -Walk away. -provide another option. Detail about reasons for the refusal should be presented in the dialog.* 3. Notes column. Delete all text and replace. *Teachers should create the prompt describing a situation where a teen is being pressured to go use alcohol with others.* | Att 1339 Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | ***Important: This task needs to be deleted or replaced. The assessment task describes Core Concepts not DM***  **Page 23, Line 228**  Grade 6  This task is NOT about decision-making, Standard 5. It is core concepts, Standard 1. A different example needs to be identified. I will write the task when identified. It does do a nice job with the literacy standard. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 24, Line 228**  Grade 7-8  Important: Given the current epidemic of teen vaping, this task gives us a great opportunity to investigate decisions about vaping as an “other drug.”  1. Evidence column. Delete text and insert. Student work will be in the form of a video or other electronic visual presentation. The work should describe the decision-making steps used when considering vaping.  2. Assessment column. Make a video or another type of electronic visual presentation about the decision-making steps teens should go through before making a decision about vaping. Use all the decision-making steps and provide accurate data for Step 3, Outcomes.  Criteria: Student work should include every step in the decision-making process. The Outcomes in Step 3 should include an accurate description of both positive and negative outcomes. Step 5 Reflection should demonstrate thoughtful consideration.  3. Notes column. Delete entire text and insert the following: This task can be used for decisions about alcohol, tobacco, or any other drug. It should be modified so that it is current and reflects the ATOD concerns that are occurring in your community | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 24, Line 228**  Grades 9-12  Important: This task is NOT about decision-making either. The way the standard is written it looks like core concepts. However, since it is categorized as DM, we can “assume” the decision is about which coping mechanism works best for the student. That is what I have done to make sure we are assessing DM and not CC.  1. Evidence column. Student work is in the form of an essay that describes the decision-making process for identifying a coping mechanism that is the best for them.  2. Assessment column. Delete all text and replace with the following: Using the information you researched about various coping mechanisms for managing stress, apply the decision-making process to the following question. Which coping mechanism is the best decision for me? Write an essay that describes your decision-making process.  Criteria: Student essays should include all of the five decision making step. Significant detail about the different coping mechanisms should be provided in both Step 2 Options and Step 3 Outcomes. The description of their reflection in Step 5 should demonstrate genuine introspection.  3. Notes column: Prior instruction about various coping mechanism and the decision-making process is required. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 25, Line 234**  Grade 3  1. Evidence column. Delete text and insert: Student work will be in the form of a worksheet demonstrating a short-term goal for positive health practices.  2. Assessment column. Delete text and insert: Write a short-term goal on the worksheet provided. It must be about a positive health practice that you want to work on. You also must explain why this goal is good for your health.  Criteria: Student work response should contain:  a stated goal that is clear and specific  a goal that can be completed in the short-term  a goal is a positive health practice  explanation about how this health behavior is good for health  3. Notes column. Delete text and replace: Prior instruction should include positive health behaviors that can be measured over time. One idea is to use a bulletin board showing ideas from students about positive health habits that are written on index cards. Discussions about why each health practice is healthy can be done over time. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 25, Line 234**  Grade 5  1. Evidence column. Delete text and replace: Student work will be in the form of a list that identifies next steps needed to move forward toward a goal for protecting the environment.  2. Assessment column. Add criteria.  Criteria  Student work should demonstrate next steps that are logical, doable and demonstrate an understanding of the goal-setting process | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 26, Line 234**  Grade 7-8  This task as written is not Goal Setting, Standard 6. As written it is Health Promotion, Standard 8. It can be revised to be GS. But, I am concerned about the Literacy Standard it is linked to. It will not link up after revision. Perhaps that link can go with a task in HP. Please let me know if you want me to rewrite.  Should I revise this to be GS rather than HP? | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 27, Line 241**  Grade K  1.Evidence column. In front of the sentence add the following: Student work shows a …  2.Assessment column. In front of the sentence add: From the group of snacks you see, …  Criteria: Student work should show an assortment of healthy snacks such as fruit, nuts, vegetables  3. Notes column: Delete text and add: Teachers need to provide a group of snack foods. Include both healthy snacks and less healthy snacks. | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 28, Line 241**  Grade 1  1. Evidence column. Delete “and flossing.” In front of the sentence add: Student work is a …  2. Assessment column.  Criteria: Student work should show the ability to correctly use techniques for brushing teeth:  Hold brush at a 45-degree angle.  Brush all surfaces including the chewing surface.  Clean the sides by tilting the brush vertically.  Brush your tongue.  3. Notes column. Delete and replace: Instruction should include demonstration and practice of brushing teeth using a real toothbrush  ***Can Grade K students floss? Are they old enough? I removed it from the task*** | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 29, Line 247**  Grade 2  1. Assessment column. Add criteria.  Criteria  Student work should demonstrate state a clear opinion, provide details to back up that opinion, demonstrate that it is a strong opinion  2. Notes column: Delete the word “content” on last line and replace with “health skills | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 30, Line 246**  Grade 4  1. Evidence column. Delete text. Replace: Student work is in the form of a skit or oral presentation that encourages (persuades) others to be tobacco-free.  2. Assessment column. At the end of the sentence add. Be persuasive.  Criteria: Student work should demonstrate a clear stand to be tobacco-free. Details about reasons why should be provided. Response demonstrates knowledge of the audience (other students). The presentation should demonstrate persuasiveness.  3. Notes column. Replace the word “encourage” in the second line with “persuade” | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 30, Line 246**  Grade 7-8  Important: The task as written a good precursor activity to the assessment, but it does not address the skill of HP. It addresses CC that can be used as detail to persuade others to take responsibility. I have revised to address the skill.  1. Evidence column. Student work will be in the form of a letter to the editor that persuades others to take personal responsibility for conserving natural resources.  2. Assessment column. Using a list of natural resources you and others use every day, write a letter to the editor that encourages others to conserve natural resources. Include details about strategies that people can incorporate into their everyday lives. Be persuasive about how important it is.  Criteria: Student work takes a clear stand on the importance of conservation. The work provides details about strategies that can be used. The response is persuasive and provides knowledge of the audience (adults).  3. Notes column. Delete | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 8 | Kathleen Middleton MS, MCHES | **Page 30, Line 246**  Grade 9-12   1. Evidence column. Delete and revise: *Student work provides a visual product that translates technical information from text and an essay. The work is used to persuade officials to develop a new community space that provides environmental conditions that benefit health*. 2. Assessment column. Delete and revise:  *Using written technical information, create a visual educational piece that you can use to persuade city officials to create a community space that benefits both the environment and health. Write your educational and persuasive argument as an essay.* **Criteria:** *The work shows knowledge of the audience (city officials) and provides accurate technical information in the form of a visual. The work is persuasive and takes a clear stand.*   Notes column. Add the following new sentence at the beginning: *Instruction should include techniques to use to find appropriate technical information for this task.* | Att 1339b Att 1339c | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | 9 | Theodore Faulders, Faculty Association of CA Community Colleges | **Page 5. Line 83** – “Instructional materials include content as specified in the CA Health Education Content Standards.” This contradicts Chapter 4, Page 59, Line 1453 – “The school must also notify parents and guardians of their right to excuse their child from comprehensive sexual health education by stating their request in writing to the school district.” | Att 965b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | 9 | Theophil Oros; Child care worker at Emanuel Church of God. High School Faculty Member. Family member of child in grades K–3. | **Page 8, Line 172**—Teachers should not be the ones delivering the information to the students. They should deliver the information to the parents who can then have the discussions with their children. This not only allows the parent/guardian the opportunity to communicate with their children, but it also protects the teachers. Instead of saying that teachers can provide the students with the resources ad information, have them “provide the students’ parent/guardian with the information.” | Att 955b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | Appendix: Sex Trafficking [November 2018 Revision] | Laurel Botsford, Founder and President, Wisdom International – Help2Others [no website yet]; 5 years as Trained Volunteer for Shared Hope International, [https://sharedhope.org/]; Community member  Maria Aguila, Novato Unified School District Board Member Trustee | **Page 1, Line 8:** Updated words in <brt>red<ert>: “There are many California students <brt>, both male and female,<ert> who are…”  *NOTE: \*\*Supporting thought: One mention of both sexes as trafficking victims is good, then “youth” may be used throughout as is already in the draft.*  Please add the mention of gender as male and female at least once and afterwards use the word youth. | Att 837b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | Appendix: Sex Trafficking | EB Troast, MPH,Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 2, line 8- “**There are many California students who are or have been a victim of sex trafficking.” Please include a source to support this. Sex trafficking is a highly concerning issue and needs to be accurately represented to our students. | Att 1243d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | Appendix: Sex Trafficking | Laurel Botsford, Founder and President, Wisdom International – Help2Others [no website yet]; 5 years as Trained Volunteer for Shared Hope International, [https://sharedhope.org/]; Community member  Maria Aguila, Novato Unified School District Board Member Trustee | **Page 3, Line 34:** Updated words in<brt> red<ert>: “Global Slavery Index <brt>(2018)<ert> estimates that <brt>40.3 <ert> million people are enslaved or trafficked worldwide, of which women and children are the primary victims <brt>(based on data from 2016).<ert>  *NOTE: \*\* Supporting evidence: While the original data mentioned in the 1st draft was not incorrect, 40.3 million is the number we now use. The difference is because, at times, two or more different agencies offering different services gave their data, not realizing they were reporting on the same person. Therefore there appears to be a ‘reduction’ in the total numbers of globally trafficked persons, but instead the data is reported more accurately.*  *[see: https://www.globalslaveryindex.org/2018/findings/highlights/]*  Please update the current number of global slaves to the latest data.  Overall it looks very professional and shows much effort. Congratulations! | Att 837b | **Recommend** |
|  | Appendix: Sex Trafficking | EB Troast, MPH,Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 4, line 64-** The language and terms associated with trafficking are also commonly used in rap songs and as part of the urban vernacular. This, like the talk about pimping, unfairly targets communities of color.  The terms “provocatively” and “inappropriately” are both subjective and would benefit from being replaced with objective terminology or being defined. | Att 1243d | **Not Recommended** |
|  | Appendix: Sex Trafficking | EB Troast, MPH,Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 6, line 95-** Listing STIs as a “Physical Trauma” is highly stigmatizing. Given that teachers reading this framework are later expected to present about STIs in a bias-free and non-judgmental manner, talking about STIs as physical trauma here, and linking them to impacts such as suicidal ideation and PTSD, will make it challenging to be unbiased and non-judgemental later. It is important to note that folks who are trafficked may experience STIs, it is recommended to use less stigmatizing language to make this point. This same point holds true for unwanted pregnancy.  Recommend to add the language “Reproductive coercion” before forced abortion/forced birth. | Att 1243d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | Appendix: Sex Trafficking | EB Troast, MPH,Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 7, line 117-** “The magnitude of the issue” is not clearly defined and no sources are cited. Please include sources for teachers to better understand what this means. | Att 1243d | **Not Recommended** |
|  | Appendix: Sex Trafficking | EB Troast, MPH,Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 8, line 149-** Students “sometimes do not recognize their experience as abuse or self-identify as a victim.” The ethics of assigning victimhood to those who don’t perceive themselves to be victims is murky at best and play into the problematic framing of “rescue.” This language could be rephrased to honor that many youth being trafficked do not identify their experience as abuse, as it would be labeled by the law. It is a young person’s right to identify their experience in a way that works for them, however not identifying their experience as abuse may prohibit them from seeking support. We need to be mindful of this when supporting young people who are, or may be, sex trafficked. Excerpt from “Rescue is for Kittens” Ten Things Everyone Needs to Know about ‘Rescues’ of Youth in the Sex Trade (http://eminism.org/blog/entry/400) included Att 1243d | Att 1243d | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | Appendix: Sex Trafficking | EB Troast, MPH,Senior Education Manager, Planned Parenthood Northern California | **p. 9, line 1723-** In the image “Law enforcement” is larger than the other circles. Make this the same size as the other circles | Att 1243d | **Recommended** |
|  | Appendix: Examples of Standards-Based Instruction | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 2, Last Sentence**  **REMOVE**  Decisions on which instructional strategies to use in their classrooms are best left to credentialed health education teachers and local administrators.  **REPLACE WITH**  Decisions on which instructional strategies to use in their classrooms are best left to credentialed health education teachers and local administrators, with the approval of parents. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | Appendix: Examples of Standards-Based Instruction | Ange Kim, parent of CA public school TK–12 | Page 2, Last Sentence  Original  Decisions on which instructional strategies to use in their classrooms are best left to credentialed health education teachers and local administrators.  Revise  Decisions on which instructional strategies to use in their classrooms are best left to credentialed health education teachers and local administrators, with the proper approval and notification of parents/guardians. | Att 706b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | Appendix: Examples of Standards-Based Instruction | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 7, Example of Standards-Based Instruction: Grade Five**  **Original statement** 5.1.1.P Identify effective personal health strategies that reduce illness and injury (e.g., adequate sleep, ergonomics, sun safety, hand washing, hearing protection, and tooth brushing and tooth flossing.)  **Revised statement (add physical)**  5.1.1.P Identify effective personal health strategies that reduce physical illness and physical injury (e.g., adequate sleep, ergonomics, sun safety, hand washing, hearing protection, and tooth brushing and tooth flossing.) | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | Appendix: Examples of Standards-Based Instruction | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 9, Second to the last paragraph, first sentence**  **Original statement**  He then shows a short video clip such as TedEd, *Why Do We Have to Wear Sunscreen?*  **Revised statement (add second statement)**  He then shows a short video clip such as TedEd, *Why Do We Have to Wear Sunscreen? If teachers choose an alternative video, parent notification and approval is needed.* | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | Appendix- Examples of Standards-Based Instruction | Diane Farthing, Credentialed Health Educator | **Page 9**– The chart for the students to log sun safety is missing.Chart for students to log sun safety is missing | Att 163b | **Not Recommended** |
|  | Appendix- Examples of Standards-based Instruction | Diane Farthing, Credentialed Health Educator | **Page 14-** The chart used to determine valid information is missing.  Chart used to determine valid information is missing | Att 163b | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | Appendix: Examples of Standards-Based Instruction: Grades Nine Through Twelve | Gordon Doughty, American Foundation for Suicide Prevention | **Page 17**, 9-12.1.10M – Assumes students know signs of potential suicide, all may not.  There is a need for an introductory discussion on stressors that may lead to behavioral signs of suicide and how they differ somewhat between male and female. Example: Middle and High School females have societal stressors involving fashion which male usually do not. Students should discuss what type stressors affect each sex.  Suggested language: Students will discuss the different societal stressors affecting each sex (male and female) and discuss why they are different and how they could lead to one displaying a suicidal behavior. | Att 297g | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | Appendix: Examples of Standards-Based Instruction: Grades Nine Through Twelve | Kathleen Snyder, MSW, California Representative, LivingWorks Education | **Please see Att 297e for line edit recommendations to pages 17-22** | Att 297e | **Recommended with Writer’s Discretion** |
|  | Appendix: Examples of Standards-Based Instruction | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Concerned Citizens, Active and Retired Teachers  330+ individuals submitted this comment through **Form Email 1** with identical or similar language | **Page 17, Example of Standard-Based Instruction: Grades Nine Through Twelve, Select a standard(s): , 9-12.7.3.M**  **Original Statement**  9–12.7.3.M Discuss suicide-prevention strategies.  **Revised Statement** (add statement after the original statement)  9–12.7.3.M Discuss suicide-prevention strategies. If teachers choose to include additional strategies outside of what are listed in this framework, teachers must inform parents of the suicide-prevention strategies teacher will present prior to the lesson. | Form **Email 1** Att Numbers are listed in Att C | **Not Recommended** |
|  | Appendix: Examples of Standards-based Instruction | Ange Kim, parent of CA public school TK–12 | **Page 17,** Example of Standard-Based Instruction: Grades Nine through Twelve, Select a Standard(s): 9-12.7.3.M  Original  9-12.7.3.M Discuss suicide-prevention strategies.  Revise  9-12.7.3.M. Discuss suicide- prevention strategies that teachers have informed parents prior to the lesson. | Att 706b | **Not Recommended** |

California Department of Education, March 2019