Attachment B: Summary Table of Non-Actionable Public Comments from Second 60-Day Review

Instructional Quality Commission Meeting

March 28, 2019

Page 1 of 33

# Summary Table of Non-Actionable Public Comments from Second 60-Day Review

Public Input on the Draft *Health Education Framework*

This table provides a summary of the public comments that do not recommend specific line edit changes to the content in the current Draft 2019 *Health Education Curriculum Framework for California Public Schools, Transitional Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve*. The names of the individuals who submitted each of the comments listed in this table and the date that they were received by the California Department of Education are organized by Attachment Number (Att) in “Attachment C: Index of Public Comments from Second 60-Day Review.” Please email [healtheducationframework@cde.ca.gov](mailto:healtheducationframework@cde.ca.gov) to request access to these comments.

**The following abbreviations are used throughout this document, in accordance with state and federal accessibility guidelines and formatting purposes**:

* cont’d = continued
* CDE = the California Department of Education
* *Health Education Framework* = *2019 Health Education Curriculum Framework for California Public Schools, Transitional Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve*

*For printing purposes, this document is formatted for legal-sized paper.*

| **Comment Number** | **Chapter** | **Source** | **Comment** | **Attachment Numbers**  *The numbers in this column correspond with Attachment C* |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 758 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members | CDE received 146 public comment submissions in Korean requesting that the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* be translated into Korean. Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  제가이렇게편지를하는이유는2019년California Health Framework Draft 를받아서읽고싶은마음에이렇게메일을합니다. 왜냐하면2019년California Health Framework Draft 가우리한국의문화와는논쟁의여지가많이있다고얘기를들었습니다. 하지만2019년California Health Framework Draft 가영어로되어있어서한국어를모국어로하는우리들은이해를하기가힘든상황입니다. 2019년California Health Framework 두번째draft의마감시간이끝나기전에저를포함한많은한국사람들에게이모든문서들을한국어로보내주실수있을까요?그래서우리가모든것을이해할수있고또부모로서우리가어떻게생각하는지우리의의견을알려드리고싶습니다.우리아이들이학교에서무엇을배우는지아는것은부모들에게아주중요한문제입니다. 감사합니다 (Att 139). | 139, 140, 141, 142,143, 144, 145, 146, 147, 148, 149, 150, 151, 152, 153, 154, 155, 156, 157, 158, 162, 178, 179, 180, 181, 182, 183, 184, 185, 186, 187,188, 189, 191, 192, 193, 194, 195, 197, 198, 199, 200, 201, 202, 203, 204, 205, 206, 207, 208, 209, 210, 211, 212, 213, 214, 215, 216, 217, 218, 219, 220, 221, 222b, 223, 224, 225, 226, 228, 229, 231, 232, 233, 234, 235, 236, 237, 238, 239, 240, 241, 242, 243, 244, 245, 246, 247, 248, 249, 250, 251, 252, 253, 254, 255, 256, 257, 258, 259, 260, 261, 262, 263, 264, 265, 266, 267, 268, 269, 270, 271, 272, 273, 275, 276, 277, 278, 279, 280, 282, 283, 286, 288, 296, 308, 309, 337, 339, 341, 342, 343, 353, 355, 370, 371, 389, 414, 507, 528, 813, 824a, 857, 913, 1551, 1605, 2040 |
| 759 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members | CDE received 7 public comment submissions requesting that the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* be translated into Korean. Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  Dear, California Department of Education Framework  It is difficult to understand for me as a parent of children that the 2019 California Health Framework Draft has only English version. Could you please send me a Korean version? (Att 227). | 222a, 227, 230, 344, 377, 678, 2047 |
| 760 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members | CDE received 4 public comment submissions in Spanish requesting that the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* be translated into Spanish. Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  Estimados,Soy un ministro en español a una Iglesia de habla hispana me podrian mandar infornación de "California Health Framework" en español deseamos darles la oportunidad a nuestros padres y miembros de nuestra Iglesia que participen en el proceso de nuestra comunidad (Att 175). | 175, 177, 728, 1467 |
| 761 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members | CDE received 7 public comment submissions in Spanish in opposition of the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework*. Below is one example of the public comment submitted by this group of individuals:  Escribo como ciudadana de California que pago mis impuestos. Suplico al Departamento de Educación, en los términos más fuertes, que rechace en su totalidad el Marco de Referencia del Currículo de Educación de Salud 2019 para Escuelas Públicas de California, de Kinder Transicional al Grado 12, que actualmente se encuentra bajo revision por la Comisión de Calidad de Instrucción (IQC).  Este documento contiene abuso sexual sancionado por el estado, despoja a los padres de sus derechos, y viola las protecciones de conciencia de los maestros y estudiantes bajo la Primera Enmienda y debe ser desechado en su totalidad. Como Californiana que pago mis impuestos, yo no apoyo la adopción de este Marco de Referencia (Att 1675). | 1675, 1683, 1688, 1714, 1812, 1823, 1842 |
| 762 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members | CDE received 7 public comment submissions requesting that the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* be translated into Spanish. Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  I am a Hispanic Single Mom. I have many Spanish Speaking Friends who are not fully proficient in English. They all want to give input about this Framework Content because it is introducing controversial teachings to children about gender and sexuality. Can you please provide equitable access to Spanish Speaking parents and provide the Health Framework Document in Spanish for them so they can fully comprehend its contents? (Att 1471) | 169, 386, 455, 456, 668, 1471, 1770 |
| 763 | General | Community Members | CDE received 2 public comment submissions requesting that the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* be translated into Vietnamese. Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  I am a Pastor of a Vietnamese Church and I would like to know if the Calif Health Framework is available in Vietnamese. The members in my congregations would like to participate in the Community Input Process, however many of them are not fluent yet in English. Thank you for your prompt response, as the January 11th deadline to give input is quickly approaching (Att 190). | 176, 190 |
| 764 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 2 public comment submissions requesting that the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* “be translated.” Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  **From:** Anonymous  **Subject**: I need the translation for the curriculums of sex education.  please email me.  thank you! (Att 348) | 348, 452 |
| 765 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 8 public comment submissions in support of the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* particularly due to the “inclusive language” in this document. Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  I am a recent college graduate who participated in the previous health curriculum, and I would like to comment that the revisions to the framework that incorporate sexuality and LGBTQ+ inclusion are incredibly positive and incredibly important. There may be some pushback from from un-inclusive or conservative stakeholders but I would encourage the most comprehensive, stringent standards possible. The safety and wellbeing of young LGBTQ+ students depends on them (Att 347). | 347, 404, 469, 513, 1008, 1598, 1599, 1648, 1835 |
| 766 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 3 public comment submissions in support of the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* that cited the usefulness of the document. Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  I think the STDs and pregnancy consequences and relationship expectations/behaviors is great for kids in high school. I have two high school daughters who took a course. Both benefitted and walked away with the understanding that abstinence is always an option; which is what my husband and I want them to think is the only option right now. But they know kids have sex, so the class probably did a better job at keeping life real. They know now abstinence can be chosen at any time, by anyone, even in a relationship where sex has already occurred (Att 469). | 469, 1031a, 1822 |
| 767 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 246 public comment submissions in opposition of the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* due to the belief that some of the content is not “age appropriate.” Specifically, the topics of gender, gender expression, and sexual orientation are most frequently cited as being “too much, too soon” and “oversexualized.” Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  I am unpleasantly surprised by the proposed changes in the Health Education Framework regarding teaching on gender dysphoria. As a parent and former teacher, I do not believe the material is age appropriate since young children don't understand the far-reaching and lifelong implications of sex-change operations and should not be encouraged to think they are transgender or trapped in the wrong body. It is not appropriate to force an ideology on children and families by inviting transgender guest speakers or reading books that promote transgenderism (like the suggested book My Princess Boy). This does not respect the households that do value traditional gender roles. I would appreciate a revision of the framework that respects all families and backgrounds and does not push this agenda (Att 135) | 132, 133, 135, 160, 311, 338, 350, 351, 354, 357, 358, 359, 360, 361, 363, 364, 367, 368, 373, 375, 378, 382, 383, 387, 392, 395, 399, 400, 401, 402, 405, 407, 410b, 412, 417, 419, 421, 425, 426, 432, 439, 444, 445, 447, 448, 449, 451, 453, 455, 459, 461, 476, 481, 486, 491, 498, 499, 500, 502, 504, 508, 509, 511, 512, 514, 516, 520, 523, 524, 526, 529, 532, 539, 540, 541, 542, 547, 548, 550c, 550d, 555, 562, 565, 575, 577, 582, 598b, 599b, 607, 608, 611, 612, 619, 620, 622, 652, 654, 659, 663, 665, 681, 696, 698, 715, 716, 179, 730, 740, 741, 746, 762, 765, 773, 789, 792, 815a, 815b, 816, 818a, 818b, 835, 845,847, 851, 853, 854b, 855, 859a, 865, 868, 882, 883, 888, 892, 904, 908, 915, 916a, 918, 921a, 939, 942, 943, 949, 968, 981, 1000, 1004, 1014, 1020a, 1034, 1041a, 1051a, 1057b, 1064a, 1070a, 1075a, 1114a, 1114b, 1123a, 1127a, 1170a, 1181b, 1185a, 1186a, 1308a, 1317a, 1332b, 1335b, 1347, 1366, 1374, 1381, 1394, 1395, 1400, 1424, 1425, 1429, 1430, 1432, 1441, 1468, 1474, 1523, 1534, 1534, 1535, 1546, 1552, 1554, 1556, 1560, 1574, 1588, 1593, 1603 1630, 1632, 1637, 1638, 1639, 1641,1643, 1645, 1647, 1650, 1658, 1703, 1707, 1712, 1723, 1736, 1754, 1767, 1802, 1803, 1809, 1816, 1817, 1851, 1864, 1876, 1881,1884, 1886, 1888, 1894, 1912, 1917, 1921, 1922, 1931, 1932, 1955, 1960, 1965, 1983, 1991, 1992, 1993, 1997, 1998, 2005, 2019, 2077 |
| 768 (1 of 2) | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 195 public comment submissions in opposition of the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework.* Some of these comments include specific reasons for their opposition such as “personal beliefs, religious beliefs, and feelings that conservative values are being bullied” while others voice their opposition without an explanation. Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  I do not approve of the proposed framework. As a public school educator with 4 children in the public school system this curriculum is against my beliefs. I believe that I as the parent not the school system should be teaching my own children what they need to know about what the Bible says about sexuality. If this passes I will either leave the state or pull my children out of public school. There needs to be an opt out and parent notification if these things are going to be discussed in any classes in k-12. | 289, 356, 369b, 379, 380, 396, 403, 418a, 418b, 429, 437, 440, 442, 443, 460, 463, 464, 465, 466, 467, 468, 470, 478, 479, 483, 488, 489, 495, 515, 518, 552, 557, 558, 561, 583, 588, 598a, 605, 613, 617, 625, 628, 630, 634, 635, 637, 645, 669a, 679, 692, 709, 710, 724, 733, 749, 750, 751, 757, 758, 759, 763, 767, 774, 778, 784, 801, 808, 821, 823, 827, 836, 844, 881, 901, 909, 920, 922, 935, 937, 938, 950, 951, 969, 970, 972, 973, 974, 977, 982b, 986, 987, 990, 1012, 1013, 1024, 1027, 1117a, 1158a, 1162b, 1171a, 1350, 1351, 1387, 1396, 1397, 1421, 1422, 1423, 1426, 1433, 1449, 1452, 1453, 1463, 1464, 1469, 1476, 1477, 1482, 1484, 1486, 1491, 1495, 1498, 1499, 1507, 1521, 1522, 1536, 1538, 1549, 1553, 1565, 1567, 1578, 1583, 1586, 1595, 1608, 1662, 1664, 1665, 1667, 1668, 1691, 1694, 1697, 1709, 1711, 1713,1725, 1739, 1743, 1751, 1756, 1776, 1788, 1795, 1839, 1857, 1862, 1867, 1868, 1869, 1870, 1874, 1903, 1904, 1906, 1908, 1915, 1916, 1920, 1927, 1929, 1933,1945, 1968, 1970, 1981, 1986, 2000, 2001, 2008, 2010, 2016, 2021, 2022, 2023, 2029, 2031, 2039, 2068, 2073, 2074 |
| 768 (2 of 2) | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | (cont’d)  Plus you are delusional If you think administrators are going to be able to enforce that there teachers are going to be willing to teach this crap. If I was still teaching in the classroom I would not teach any of it as it is against my faith. As an admin I would force my teachers to inform parents so that can opt out. How are you going to enforce something without first determining the readiness of the educators to teach this crap. It’s is not the states job to teach my kids this. As a school PE and Health Teacher and school administrator for over 10 years this is ridiculous (Att 478). | (cont’d) |
| 769 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 28 public comment submissions in opposition to the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* due to “religious beliefs, religious freedom, and the belief that conservative values are being bullied.” Below is one excerpt from one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  The only way to stop bullying is to teach every child that they are a valuable creation of God and that as such they, and every other human being, is worthy of respect and dignity. I know that that is not politically correct, but the denial of God as our creator and sovereign Lord is the reason that things are in such a mess and that people feel the need to invent new ways of identifying themselves...because we have taught them that there is no purpose to their lives and nothing greater to live for than this world.  You may disagree with me personally on some of this, but please do not indoctrinate generations of children with passing "popular" philosophies that have not stood the test of time. We have yet to see the long-term implications of such indoctrination...though evidence is coming out of the regret and damage of encouraging transgender behavior and the real child abuse of allowing children to undergo transitioning from one gender to another (Att 731). | 413, 415, 422, 427, 458a, 477, 484, 572, 639, 691, 731, 755, 787, 796, 799, 877, 894, 958, 996, 1333a, 1562, 1787, 1815, 1845, 1879, 1919, 2017, 2079 |
| 770 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 164 public comment submissions in opposition of the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* due to the misconception that “parents do not need to be notified at any grade level and there is no opt-out” regarding lessons that include topics on “gender, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression” and other topics included in the comprehensive sexual health standards. Below is one excerpt of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  The teaching of sexual health is not the responsibility of the schools. Sexual orientation, gender, birth control and abortion should not be taught. This can be misconstrued to very vulnerable children. It is absolutely unreasonable to begin setting up this framework for very young children. Parents set up their teachings at home and in the church which the schools should not be a part of! To think that parents cannot even be notified is outrageous! Please do not set up this very liberal way of thinking. Not all parents agree and they are the ultimate people responsible for their children! (Att 1705) | 134, 159, 345, 384, 386, 388, 408, 416, 428, 433, 454, 455, 471, 472, 474, 475, 492, 493, 497, 501, 503, 505, 506, 510, 519, 521, 522, 525, 527, 530, 533, 534a, 534b, 544, 545, 546, 551, 559, 563, 564, 567, 570, 573, 576, 596, 597, 601, 606, 609a, 614, 618, 621b, 626, 629, 633a, 647a, 650b, 674a, 700, 703a, 726a, 727a, 729, 739, 748, 754, 760, 764, 766, 768, 770, 777, 781, 785, 791, 793a, 795, 806, 819, 822, 828, 831, 840, 842, 852, 861, 863, 879b, 889a, 900, 930, 979, 984b, 985a, 1001b, 1007, 1016, 1025, 1038, 1122b, 1140a, 1151a, 1151b, 1155a, 1172a, 1300a, 1305a, 1305b, 1348a, 1457, 1466, 1478, 1488, 1513, 1515, 1517, 1533, 1571, 1579, 1584, 1585, 1592, 1602, 1625, 1635, 1636, 1649, 1653, 1654, 1657, 1643, 1677, 1684, 1696, 1705, 1706, 1718, 1735, 1738, 1740, 1745, 1746, 1747, 1748, 1764, 1785, 1794, 1819, 1833, 1866, 1897, 1905, 1907, 1940, 1943, 1947, 1966, 1974, 1976, 1996, 2006, 2026, 2028, 2059 |
| 771 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 5 identical or similar submissions of a public comment that opposes the “Healthy Youth Act.” Below is one excerpt of the public comment submitted by this group of individuals:  As a concerned parent, I am extremely opposed to the proposed framework of the "Healthy Youth Act". There are number of highly controversial and non-factual concepts that have no place in the curriculum of Kinder through 12th grade. They undermine parental involvement and family values and are based in the interests of political ideals rather than science and fact. I plead you to make changes to this proposed framework and return these specific decisions to the local level where it can best represent the community and parental values (Att 1729). | 1729, 1742, 1744, 1758, 1768 |
| 772 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 4 identical or similar submissions of a public comment that opposes the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework.* Below is one excerpt of the public comment submitted by this group of individuals:  I am totally opposed to providing classroom instructio reproductive organs to children in public schools from Grade Three. The focus on education at this age chil reading, writing, arithmetic skills, and the other traditio school educational skills. Teaching respect for others different from your own, is appropriate (Att 815a). | 815a, 815b, 818a, 818b |
| 773 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 2 identical or similar submissions of a public comment that opposes the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework.* Below is one excerpt of the public comment submitted by this group of individuals:  In my opinion, I believe this Framework goes way beyond the law, including AB 329 (The Calif Healthy Youth Act). No law says we must teach unlimited, ever-expansive gender identities. No law says we must teach unlimited, ever expansive sexual orientations either. In my opinion, this Framework embellishes the terms “gender identity and sexual orientation” to the nth degree. It goes way beyond the boundaries of SB 48 or AB 329. | 620, 623 |
| 774 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 11 identical or similar submissions of a public comment that quotes specific sections of the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* that are “serious concerns.” Below is one excerpt of the public comment submitted by this group of individuals:  **SOME SERIOUS CONCERNS:**  • **TEACHERS:** …teachers can introduce the concept that **gender does not always match the sexual and reproductive organs described.** (Chapter 3, Page 116 of 147, Line 2990-2995)  • **TEACH:** For pre-K–3rd graders. …**genders are unlimited** and **ever-expanding, rather than confined to two biological genders**. (Chapter 3, Line 1847, the draft recommends the book *Who Are You?*)  • **TEACH:** In terms of gender and sexuality, **using gender-neutral language** and **not promoting gender stereotypes** can help in creating an **inclusive classroom**.(Chapter 1, Page 14 of 30, Line 319-335) | 381, 384, 390b, 397, 438, 550a, 672, 717, 743,1846, 1930 |
| 775 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 16 identical or similar submissions of a public comment that quotes specific sections of the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* that include “controversial teaching.” Below is one excerpt of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  Here are specific areas of concern in the proposed framework:  **Introduction: [page 14, lines 319–341]**  Gender Pronouns – “In terms of gender and sexuality, using gender-neutral language and not promoting gender stereotypes…”  Examples – “It is similarly important to acknowledge and affirm different sexual orientations and same-sex relationships so that all students feel their experiences and needs are reflected in their health education. Teachers can provide inclusive instruction with examples of varying gender identities and sexual orientations.” | 391, 393, 394, 723, 898, 1626, 1663, 1847, 1878, 1934, 1935, 1937, 1939, 1941, 1942, 1948 |
| 776 | General | California Residents | CDE received 92 identical or similar submissions of a public comment that quotes specific sections of the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* that are “concerning.” Below is one excerpt of the public comment submitted by this group of individuals:  I am very concerned about many parts of this draft. It appears that, in the name of being anti-bullying and accepting, those with conservative values are being bullied by this framework, by going against our values. Some of these include:  Must affirm diverse sexual orientations and include examples of same-sex relationships (Chapter 1, Page 14 of 30, Line 319-335) | 531b, 556b, 1337, 1340, 1547  *Note: Att 1137 includes 88 individual submissions of this public comment*. |
| 777 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 6 identical or similar submissions of a public comment that shares the belief that the “framework discourse belongs in the home between Family Members, not in a classroom.” Below is one excerpt of the public comment submitted by this group of individuals:  •the framework encourages schools to bring community members in to speak tostudents and specifically recommends inviting transgender individuals. (Thistopic should be reserved for the family to discuss at the appropriate time)  •the framework encourages using images to break gender stereotypes andreading books promoting LGBT lifestyles.  •the framework pushes teaching sex education and HIV prevention beginning inkindergarten instead of 7th grade. | 753, 775, 782, 804, 910, 944 |
| 778 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 330 identical or similar submissions of **Form Email 2**, which is included below:  I am writing as a concerned citizen and California taxpayer. I urge the California Department of Education, in the strongest terms, to reject the entire document of the 2019 Health Education Curriculum Framework for California Public Schools, Transitional Kindergarten through Grade 12, that is currently under review by the Instructional Quality Commission.  This document contains state-sanctioned sexual abuse, strips away parental rights, violates teachers' and students' First Amendment conscience protections and should be thrown out entirely. As a California tax-payer, I do not support the adoption of this document (Att 1352). | Each individual comment is listed in Attachment C under **Form Email 2** |
| 779 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 20 public comment submissions that oppose legislation (The California Healthy Youth Act), state policy, the state of California, or the California Department of Education. Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  If these LGBTQQAAIIXYZ (excuse my facetiousness) concepts are taught. And every view is acceptable when will it end? Who’s views are valid enough? Does the group have to be big enough? Is that what it is? If this comes through my family will leave California or enroll in private school. It’s unfathomable to me how a certain group LGBTQ, is now elevated among the scrutiny. Sad for California.  Thank you | 646, 761, 794, 797, 814, 906, 917, 924, 1384, 1509, 1527, 1532, 1541, 1750, 1757, 1777, 1782, 1850, 2052a, 2078 |
| 780 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 12 public comment submissions regarding a “Sex Ed Sit Out.” Below is one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  My husband and I DO NOT APPROVE of the AB Bill 329. We REJECT the CA Framework, it is offensive, appalling and disgusting. This is not the basic health education class of long ago. It is corrupt, demoralizing and strips our children of their innocence. As Christian parents my husband and I will decide what should and needs to be conveyed to our children. This new agenda is elicited and unnecessary!!! Therefore, we are participating in the CA Statewide Sex Ed Sit Out on February 19, 2019 and my son Brandon Hansen will not be attendance at school (Att 2052a). | 2052a, 2052b, 2053a, 2053b, 2062, 2063, 2069a, 2069b, 2070, 2075a, 2075b, 2080 |
| 781 | General | Family Members, Legal Guardians, Community Members, Active and Retired Teachers | CDE received 12 public comment submissions regarding the process of the Draft 2019 *Health Education Framework* revision and adoption. Below is one excerpt of one example of the public comments submitted by this group of individuals:  I am the father of 3 Chino Valley Unified School District children. I understand that there is a 60 day comment period until 1/11 regarding the proposed school health curriculum, but what influence will our comments have and what are the mechanisms and processes available for parents to edit or remove content that we fell is harmful to our children? Also, can you please clarify exactly when (month/year) these proposed changes will take effect at the school site if unchallenged? (Att 334). | 334, 352, 553, 884, 899, 1022, 1037, 1045a, 1079a, 1420, 1540, 2011 |
| 782 | General | Andre Van Mol | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 1191a and Att 1191b for the full comment.  Dear CDE representatives,  I am one of the authors of this amicus brief to the 11th Circuit Court in a current case addressing trans-affirmation issues in schools. The science we present is of importance to you. | 1191a, 1191b |
| 783 | General | Gheorghe Rosca Jr., Pastor, New Hope Christian Ministries | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 138 for the full comment.  I am an ordained minister at New Hope Christian Ministries in Placentia, CA, a Romanian-American community that has been serving Placentia for over 7 years. It has come to my attention through the various members of our community that are involved in California’s education system that the California Healthy Youth Act, enacted in January 1, 2016 has triggered the drafting of a new Health Framework. Now it is on its 2nd round of public comment. Unfortunately many parents in the Romanian Community throughout the State have not been informed because it is not provided in their language. During this second community input phase, given the emphasis that is placed on **respecting diversity in this state**, is the CDE making the Framework available in the Romanian language? | 138 |
| 784 | General | Lallia Allali, Master of Art in Leadership Studies, Leadership Coach, SDUSD DELAC Chair | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 285 or Att 295 for the full comment.  My name is Lallia Allali, I am a DELAC Chair (District English Learners Advisory Committee), I am the voice of more than 21,000 English Learners enrolled in San Diego Unified School District, I am writing to you expressing my disappointment as a parent and parent advocate, I recently knew about the Health Education Framework that is posted for parents' review. As an active parent I was expecting to be notified by the state and local district which never happened. Additionally, many of the parents within California and specifically San Diego schools are not fluent in English, How are these parents included in the review opportunity if they don't master English Language, this is a clear exclusion of immigrants and refugees. As a member of Californians' Together Organization, I am deeply disappointed to see the state acting against prop 58 that our organization initiated and you agreed on it and promised to move towards multilingualism by adopting Global California 2030, previous state superintendent of instruction Tom Torlackson clearly says: " We are inviting educators, parents, legislators, and community and business leaders to join us on the road to multilingual California". | 285, 295 |
| 785 | General | Brenda Lebsack, Public School Teacher, Trustee, CTA member | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 274 for the full comment:  I wanted to clarify a former phone conversation we had about the community input process. I realize the draft is only available in English, but when I asked if community members could give input in their Native language, such as Spanish, you said that they could, but that only English responses would be guaranteed to be read and included in the comment summary provided to the State Board of Education. | 274 |
| 786 | General | Brenda Lebsack, Public School Teacher, Trustee, CTA member | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 372 for the full comment.  On a link describing the Health Framework Adoption Process, you were mentioned as one to contact if a person had a question about the Community Input Process for the Health Framework. https://www.cashe.org/observations-and-comments  I have a question. In reading through the CDE Link about this public review and comment process it states: https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/he/cf/ | 372 |
| 787 | General | Brenda Lebsack, Public School Teacher, Trustee, CTA member | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 532 for the full comment.  Based on this article I just wrote, here are some concerns I have about the PROCESS and content of this Framework Adoption Phase. https://edsource.org/2018/parents-educators-should-scrutinize-concepts-of-gender-and-sexual-identity-in-states-health-education-framework/606025  First of all, I'd like to know WHY the CDE is already implementing controversial gender identity books for K-3 graders that are mentioned in the Framework, when the State Board of Education has not even voted on its adoption yet?  The WHO ARE YOU book (CH 3, Line 1847) is mentioned in the Framework, however this book is in the Digital Library that has already been GIFTED to districts, from the Calif Dpt of Education, WITH Lesson Plans!  Is this process a total SHAM? Why are you asking for statewide input when you are going to implement some of the most controversial materials BEFORE the process is even completed? | 532 |
| 788 | General | Brenda Lebsack, Public School Teacher, Trustee, CTA member | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 878 for the full comment.  I am in contact with news outlets concerning the discrimination taking place against our Non-English parents during this statewide Community Input Process. Apparently NBC of Telemundo (Martin) contacted you yesterday or today asking if the Framework was available in Spanish so Spanish Speaking parents could also give input about the Framework. A representative from CDE told him there is a Spanish Brochure about the Framework provided to parents. Does this brochure cover all the contents of the 1000 page Framework document? May I please receive a copy of this brochure that has apparently, all of a sudden, solved the problem of equitable access? | 878 |
| 789 | General | Brenda Lebsack, Public School Teacher, Trustee, CTA member | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 1505 for the full comment.  Apparently this democratic process of Community Input of the Health Framework is just a "formality". Torlakson announced BEFORE the Health Framework has even been ADOPTED that "the assumption underlying Calif Policy is that GENDER IS A SPECTRUM" Meaning Gender is "ever-expanding and UNLIMITED" such as was shared in the WHO ARE YOU? book for K-3rd graders, defining the "gender spectrum".  You can be BOTH genders, NEITHER gender, Gender FLUID, Gender NON CONFORMING, etc, etc, etc, to infinity and beyond.  Just curious why we even have a Community Input Process, when the CDE has already established these unprecedented terms as "assumptions" underlying their policies? They have "implemented" these new terms of "unlimited genders" BEFORE the adoption, and have even announced it in a NEWS RELEASE.  Do you really think the American People are THIS STUPID?! Do think we are going to allow this corruption and deception to go unchecked? The arrogance is mind boggling. Californians of every lingual group are awakening, and you are going to have a revolt on your hands. Our kids do NOT belong to the state for your experimentation. | 1505 |
| 790 | General | Denise Pursche, Parent | CDE received 7 public comment submissions containing cited research and opinions. Below is an excerpt of one of these comments. Please see Att 136a, 136b, 136c, 136d, 136e, 136f, and 168 for the full comments.  First of all, children who are having sex before age 13 have either been raped, sexually groomed, sex trafficked, or molested by an adult they know. These statistics are not children before age 13 having sex with children 2 years or younger than their age. And, if they are having sex with another child more than 2 years beyond than their age, then this is rape and must be punishable by up to a year in prison (Att 136a). | 136a, 136b, 136c, 136d, 136e, 136f, 168 |
| 791 | General | Rebecca Lange, CSUN Student–Liberal Studies | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 196b for the full comment.  I love the various activates planned for healthy eating lessons. They allow students to find their own way towards healthy eating. One of my favorites is Breakfast around the world – breakfast in my world. I love the duality of this activity because there’s a big chance the breakfasts from around the world are also present in the classroom. Students will learn about different cultures while learning how to be healthy. Love it. | 196b |
| 792 | General | Milagro Jones, Program Assistant - Koreatown Youth and Community Center Alumni - National Youth Forum on Homelessness Alumni - Public Allies Milwaukee 2015/2016 AmeriCorps Program | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 581 for the full comment.  My daughter is still in preschool but she will be starting school soon. The church I attend, Desert Reign Assembly of God has a “Ministry” that focuses on legislative issues and they asked members of the Church to sign a petition and contact County Supervisors to ask for changes in your current draft of of The CDE Health Education Framework. I found the criticisms they made of your current draft to be very misinformed and upon reading much of your draft for myself I have opted out of signing their petition and would like to instead apologize on behalf of my church for the inflammatory language in their petition and the discriminatory nature of their requests | 581 |
| 793 | General | Lara Kanter, Director of Policy and Advocacy at the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender Community Services Center of Orange County (LGBT Center OC) | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 1753 for the full comment.  I write my response today with some urgency about the efforts of anti-LGBTQ and evangelical lobbying groups to not only prevent the implementation of the California Healthy Youth Act, but to stop our schools from appropriately recognizing and ensuring equal educational access for transgender and gender nonconforming students overall.  Beginning in early 2017, these groups began attending school board meetings where they spread misinformation about CHYA and other Ed. Code laws aimed at inclusivity and at improving educational and life outcomes for LGBTQ students. They used blatantly homophobic and transphobic rhetoric, shared fake examples of teaching plans, and made misleading statements about California Ed Code laws that are in place to protect LGBTQ students. These groups are trying to take away the rights of LGBTQ students to receive the education they need to succeed both in and out of school by spreading misinformation and inciting confusion and fear. | 1753 |
| 794 | General | Ms. Pinky Stanseski, Throop, PA | I am a woman who is a University of Scranton student who was born with health nightmares. I read about the draft health education framework, and I support it because it is 2019! I wish California’s Healthy Youth Act and the draft health framework were the Law when I was in Kindergarten, middle and high school! Hopefully, California’s Healthy Youth Act and the draft health education framework will be the Law nationwide! | 1843 |
| 795 | General | Cheryl Nelson, San Francisco Unified School District Teacher on Special Assignment, Health Ed Team | Inclusive, comprehensive, non-shaming, fact-based health education is a right for all students. | 304 |
| 796 | General | Bob McGlenn, Ph.D. | Below is an excerpt of an email submitted. Please see Att 2033 for the full comment.  I and some of my colleagues have been working on a proposal to require a mental health awareness class for graduation. I just discovered that much of the curriculum we have been considering, you are including in the 2019 Revision of Health Education. This is definitely a natural place for mental health to be taught. It is great that you are going in that direction. The one question I have is, will a health class be required for graduation? I have seen many very effective programs in my years in education that are dropped due to a lack of funding. If it is mandatory, then it will be funded. There are some districts that don't even have a health class as an elective. That is the case in the Grossmont Union High School District where I used to work. You can have great curriculum but if not all students are exposed to it, what good is it? | 2033 |
| 797 | General and Chapters 1, 2, 5, 6, 7 | R. Loya– CASHE | CDE received actionable and non-actionable comments in Att 689b. Each of the actionable comments from Att 689b are included in Attachment A. Below is one example of one of the non-actionable comments submitted:  **Chapter 2, p. 10, line 216-221**  Hooray for LGBTQ inclusion. | 689b |

California Department of Education, March 2019