This advisory recommendation has not been approved by the Instructional Quality Commission or the State Board of Education

# **REVIEW PANEL ADVISORY RECOMMENDATION** **2021 WORLD LANGUAGES INSTRUCTIONAL MATERIALS ADOPTION**

| **Publisher** | **Program** | **Proficiency Level(s)** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Carnegie Learning Inc. | *En voz alta, Español para hispanohablantes* | Novice, Intermediate |

## Program Summary:

*En voz alta, Español para hispanohablantes*, includes the following: Student Edition (SE), Teacher guide (TG), and Workbook (WB).

## Recommendation:

*En voz alta, Español para hispanohablantes* is recommended for adoption because the instructional materials include content as specified in the *World Languages Standards for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*World Languages Standards*), and meet all the criteria in category 1 with strengths in categories 2–5.

### **Criteria Category 1: World Languages Content/Alignment with Standards**

The program supports instruction designed to ensure that students master all the *World Languages Standards* for the intended proficiency level(s), and *meets* all of the evaluation criteria in category 1.

#### Citations:

* WL.CM1.N: SE pp. 104–105. Students read an authentic text about a common topic, demonstrate understanding of vocabulary, and complete comprehension activities demonstrating understanding of the general meaning and some basic information.
* WL.CM2.I: SE pp. 23, 64, 93. Situaciones de la vida real/ Español en el trabajo/ Comprensión oral. Several activities call for students to participate in real-world conversations related to self and the immediate environment as well as to create sentences and strings of sentences to ask and answer a variety of questions in transactional and informal settings.
* WL.CM3.N: SE p. 98. This lesson has students imagine they are organizing a job fair for the school. Students create a poster with visual elements and information in the target language using sentence level language and present their posters to the class.
* WL.CM4.I: SE p.129. Conecta con tu comunidad. This lesson includes activities for students to use age-appropriate, culturally authentic, real-world and academic language in transactional and some informal settings within target-language communities.
* WL.CM5.N: SE p. 21. Based on the preceding “Blog de los viajeros” reading, students show a receptive understanding of language structures in their ability to connect sentence starters with sentence conclusions and other comprehension questions.
* WL CM6.I: SE p. 89. Students communicate, either in writing or orally, about one of two topics which discuss how they relate to their culture and ancestral traditions in their immediate environment while using basic sentence-level elements of morphology and syntax.
* WL.CM7.N: SE p. 24. Students compare English and Spanish by brainstorming Spanish language cognates for the given English counterparts.
* WL.CL1.N: SE pp. 34, 61, 68, 76. These sections call for age-appropriate gestures and expressions in paired and small group activities, which reflect “culturally appropriate interactions”—as exemplified by the structured oral communication activity, debate about theme-related issues, including cultural traditions and customs, cultural appropriation, and cultural arts.
* WL.CL2.1: SE pp. 1, 23, 28–29. Several activities ask students to make cultural connections and tap into a student’s cultural wealth and relevant essential questions for students to consider. There is a focus on empathy and social inequalities, cultural diversity, and connections to community.
* WL.CL3.N: SE pp. 34, 61. Some activities prompt students to discuss similarities and differences among very familiar, common daily products, practices, and perspectives, such as adolescent challenges faced here in the US and other Spanish-speaking countries and communities. Also discussed are cultural values of US adolescents and those of other Spanish-speaking countries.
* WL.CL.4.1: SE pp. 23, 68, 69–70. Students are given opportunities to state reasons for cultural borrowings when they consider the influence of the Spanish language and cultural borrowings, the role of Spanglish in the social and academic lives of Latinx students, and factors that determine Latinx identity.
* WL.CN1.N: SE, p. 23. Students acquire, exchange, and present information about designing a trip to New York in the target language; students discuss details such as how they will travel and where they will stay.
* WL.CN2.I: SE p. 111. Students are provided a website where they can read authentic texts about the history and distinctive viewpoint of chocolate’s origin, importance, and how its preparation has evolved over time in different locations.
* Criterion 1.3: Novice/Intermediate, TG, pp. x, xi–xxi, xxii–xxiv, 4. The materials reflect research-based practices and alignment to the World Languages Framework. There are multiple opportunities for students to engage with thematic units that are age-appropriate and culturally relevant, and include numerous authentic texts that integrate technology into instruction.
* Criterion 1.5: Novice/Intermediate, SE pp. 199–211. The text provides accurate grammatical descriptions of the language, including the updated Spanish alphabet and some accepted dialectal variations.
* Criterion 1.6: Novice/Intermediate, SE pp. 14, 23, 28, 89, 106, 110, 170. There are multiple opportunities for students to connect with age-appropriate academic disciplines, including history/social sciences, music, literature, health, math, environment/ecology, geography, speech/debate, engineering, design, and cultural studies.
* Criterion 1.8: Novice/Intermediate, SE Unit 5. The materials encourage students to explore humanity’s custodial role in the ecosystem throughout the unit in interpersonal conversations, interpretive readings, audio/video, presentations, and grammatical exercises.

### **Criteria Category 2: Program Organization**

The organization and features of the instructional materials *support* instruction and learning of the standards.

#### Citations:

* + Criterion 2.1: Novice/Intermediate, SE pp 164–170. The “Pensamiento crítico, comunicación y conexión con mi herencia” activities provide logical and coherent structure to facilitate effective teaching and learning within the lesson. Also, TG pp. iii–xxv shows the organization of the program is consistent with the guidance in the World Languages Framework.
  + Criterion 2.6: Novice/Intermediate, SE p. 32; TG pp. xxii–xxiv, xxv, 4–5, 11, 12–15, 16, 18–23. The Program Overview and Century Skills Map provide opportunities for students to gain practice in the three modes of communication aligned with the World Languages Standards.
  + Criterion 2.8: Novice/Intermediate, SE pp. 3–4, 35–36. Repaso de gramática. These lessons provide students opportunities to revisit previously learned language concepts from which to build upon.
  + Criterion 2.9: Novice/Intermediate, TG p. vi. The Program Overview section provides effective articulation between courses allowing for multiple entry points in a variety of course and program models.

### **Criteria Category 3: Assessment**

The instructional materials *provide* teachers with assistance in using assessments for planning instruction and monitoring student progress toward mastering the content.

#### Citations:

* + Criterion 3.1: Novice/Intermediate, SE p. 23. Students are provided with multiple opportunities to voice prior knowledge of culture and appropriate academic content and communicative, cultural and intercultural proficiencies by responding to questions orally or in writing.
  + Criterion 3.4: Novice/Intermediate, SE p. 123. Students are given the opportunity to apply world language proficiencies described in the World Languages Standards by completing the tasks such as choosing the correct formal or informal term, applying correct grammar to samples of emails and conducting collaborative conversations to determine correct sentence completion.
  + Criterion 3.5: Novice/Intermediate, TG pp. xiii–xxi. The materials in the teacher guide include additional digital resources and tools for adapting instructions on the basis of evidence from assessment and making adjustments that yield immediate benefits to students learning for quizzes, tests, Integrated Performance Assessments, the three modes of communication, and authentic resources.
  + Criterion 3.6: Novice/Intermediate, SE p. 136. There are multiple opportunities for utilizing guiding questions to monitor students' receptive and productive proficiencies in the “Antes de leer” sections of each “Lectura”.

### **Criteria Category 4: Access and Equity**

Program materials *ensure* universal and equitable access to high-quality curriculum and instruction for all students and *provide* teachers with suggestions for differentiation for students with special needs.

#### Citations:

* + Criterion 4.5: Novice/Intermediate, SE p. 114. Students are provided multiple strategies to improve literacy skills throughout the text. This activity explains how to use word families to figure out the meaning of unknown words.
  + Criterion 4.6: Novice/Intermediate, SE p. 160. Students are provided multiple support strategies in the text as they develop their communication skills. This activity gives oral communication strategies including sentence starters and organizational tips.
  + Criterion 4.8: Novice/Intermediate, SE p. 28. These materials contain an abundance of strategies to help heritage and native speakers maximize their learning, as well as strategies that can be transferred to the learning of additional languages. This lesson includes interpretative discussion questions, a debate topic, sentence frames, and a presentation related to the topic.
  + Criterion 4.9: Novice/Intermediate, SE pp. 77, 95, 149. The images in the text are age appropriate and reflect the diversity of California’s students. The materials include affirmative inclusion of a range of individuals.

### **Criteria Category 5: Instructional Planning and Support**

The instructional materials *contain* a clear road map for teachers to follow when planning instruction and are designed to help teachers provide effective standards-based instruction and ensure opportunities for all students to learn the essential skills and knowledge specified in the standards.

#### Citations:

* + Criterion 5.3: Novice/Intermediate, TG pp. xiii–xxi. The material includes a variety of pedagogical strategies aligned to the World Languages Standards.
  + Criterion 5.4: Novice/Intermediate, SE pp. 7, 56, 89. The material includes suggestions for connecting world languages education content with examples of interdisciplinary instruction within the appropriate grade level such as music, history, and art.
  + Criterion 5.7: Novice/Intermediate, WB pp. 49–62. Students are given opportunities for additional practice and extension of skills that have been taught.
  + Criterion 5.9: Novice/Intermediate: SE pp. 28–29, 63, 95. Students are given guidance for the use of language learning strategies with opportunities to use them in context.

## Edits and Corrections:

The following edits and corrections must be made as a condition of adoption:

| # | Proficiency Level | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for edit |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | All Levels | SE | p. 65 | Emma Gonzalez is referred to as a “defensor**a**” | Find an appropriate alternative, perhaps as a footnote, to acknowledge their gender-neutral nature in the suffix: -@, -x, -e.  Paladín might be another acceptable, gender-neutral, alternative. | Emma Gonzalez has used “they” pronouns since 2021. |
| 2 | Novice | Resources Evaluaciones Unidad 2 | 24 | 1.A Las competiciones de matemáticas son tan competitivas como el fútbol en México | Las competencias de matemáticas son tan competitivas como el fútbol en México. | Competencia is used frequently with a wide range of meaning whereas competición is more strictly used in sports settings. |

## Social Content Citations:

The panel identified the following social content violations:

| # | Proficiency Level | SC Code | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for citation |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | All Levels | C.4. | SE  (first noticed instance) | p. 2  (first noticed instance), glossary, etc. | The term **padres** is solely used to refer to one’s parents collectively.  This correction would need to be made for any instance in which students are presented with the term “padres” as the only acceptable term for “parents” and any times in the program that students are prompted to talk about their “padres (parents)”. | The term **madres** needs to be included throughout the series alongside **padres**. | Same-sex couples exist and frequently have children. “Padres” would not be accurate for two female parents. |

California Department of Education, August 2021