

California Department of Education

Executive Office

SBE-003 (REV. 11/2017)

tlsb-cfird-nov18item01

# California State Board of Education November 2018 Agenda Item #06

## Subject

2018 Science Adoption of K–8 Instructional Materials: Instructional Quality Commission Recommendations.

## Type of Action

Action, Information, Public Hearing

## Summary of the Issue(s)

*Education Code (EC)* Section 60200(b)(1) calls for the State Board of Education (SBE) to adopt instructional materials in science every eight years. The previous adoption was completed in 2006, but *EC* Section 60200.7 suspended all work on instructional materials adoptions from July 2009 through July 1, 2015. *EC* Section 60212 authorizes the SBE to collect fees from participating publishers to fund the activities of the adoption.

*EC* Section 60204 directs the Instructional Quality Commission (IQC) to study and evaluate instructional materials submitted for adoption and to recommend materials for adoption to the SBE. The IQC has reviewed the 34 instructional materials programs that were submitted by publishers for the 2018 Science Adoption and is recommending 29 of the 34 programs for adoption with edits and corrections and changes to address social content issues that were cited during the process, as well as all publisher errata submitted following panel recommendations.

## Recommendation

The California Department of Education (CDE) recommends that the SBE act on the following two recommendations: (1) adopt the 29 instructional materials programs recommended by the IQC, and (2) direct CDE staff, in conjunction with members of the IQC and/or Content Review Experts (CREs), as needed, to work with publishers to ensure that the edits and corrections and other publisher errata and administrative updates adopted by the SBE have been made to their revised instructional materials.

## Brief History of Key Issues

### Background

The SBE adopted the 2016 Science Framework for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve (*Science* *Framework*) on November 3, 2016. The purpose of the *Science Framework* isto provide guidance on the implementation of a standards-based curriculum for teachers, administrators, other educators, parents/guardians, and other education stakeholders. The *Science Framework* includes significant instructional shifts, with a strong emphasis on alignment to three-dimensional learning as expressed in *the California Next Generation Science Standards*. In addition, the *Science Framework* includes support for the *Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy in History/Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects*, the *Common Core State Standards for Mathematics*, and the *California English Language Development Standards*.

The *Science* *Framework* also includes the *Criteria for Evaluating Instructional Materials: Kindergarten Through Grade Eight.* The criteria serve as the evaluation instrument for determining whether instructional materials align to the content standards, curriculum framework, and the other requirements established by the SBE. The criteria are organized into five categories. Materials that fail to meet the criteria in Category 1: Science Content/Alignment with the Standards will not be considered suitable for adoption. All criteria statements in Category 1 that are appropriate for the grade levels submitted must be met for a program to be adopted. In addition, programs must have strengths in each of categories 2 through 5 to be suitable for adoption.

The SBE-adopted the Schedule of Significant Events for the 2018 Science Adoption on March 8, 2017.

### Adoption Process and Timeline

* **Publisher Briefings:** During the summer of 2017, the CDE conducted five webinars to familiarize publishers with the *Science Framework* as well as the instructional materials adoption process.
* **Appointment of Reviewers:** On November 8, 2017, the SBE appointed 109 Instructional Materials Reviews (IMRs) and 11 CREs recommended by the IQC to serve as reviewers for the 2018 Science Adoption. Pursuant to the *California Code of Regulations, Title 5* [Education] (*5 CCR*), Section 9512, a majority of the IMRs were classroom teachers at the time of appointment.
* **Invitation to Submit Meeting with Publishers:** On January 30, 2018, the CDE conducted a Publishers Invitation to Submit meeting, which outlined the statutory and regulatory requirements for participation in the adoption.
* **Training:** The IQC and CDE staff trained the IMRs and CREs appointed by the SBE at the DoubleTree Hilton in Sacramento on April 17–20, 2018, to prepare them for their independent review and subsequent deliberations. Commissioners trained reviewers in the SBE-adopted evaluation criteria, social content requirements, and the adoption process. On the final day of training, reviewers attended presentations by publishers on their submitted programs.
* **Independent Review:** Starting in May and continuing through July, reviewers conducted their independent review of the submitted programs. Each of the 16 panels of reviewers was assigned two or three programs to review.
* **Deliberations:** The reviewers met in their assigned review panels at the DoubleTree Hilton in Sacramento for deliberations held on July 17–20, 2018. The reviewers discussed the individual notes and citations they had developed while performing their independent reviews. A member of the IQC or another facilitator approved by the SBE was assigned to facilitate each panel. During deliberations, publishers were provided a formal publisher response time to address three to five questions on each of their respective programs posed by the panel members. In addition, at least twice each day, the deliberations process included an opportunity for public comment.
* **Public Comment Hearing:** The IQC hosted a meeting to take public comment on the 2018 Science Adoption on August 13, 2018, in Sacramento. Various publisher representatives provided comment at the meeting. In addition, written public comment was provided by the public throughout the adoption process. Copies of all public comments received were made available to members of the IQC and SBE. Furthermore, all public comments received no later than July 2, 2018, were shared with the appropriate review panels.
* **IQC Action:** On September 20–21, 2018, the members of the IQC considered the recommendations from the IMR/CRE review panels, public comments, and reports from individual Commissioners to determine whether each program satisfied or did not satisfy the SBE-adopted evaluation criteria for this adoption. Prior to action, the IQC conducted two public hearings, one during the Science Subject Matter Committee (Science SMC) meeting on September 20, 2018, and one during the full IQC meeting on September 21, 2018. Public comment was received by the IQC both in writing and in testimony at the public hearings. All public comments received by the IQC throughout the adoption process have been forwarded to the SBE.
* **Edits and Corrections:** Edits and corrections meetings will be scheduled with individual publishers after the SBE takes its final action on the adoption. The process and timeline for edits and corrections meetings are specified in *5 CCR* Section 9525, titled “Post Adoption Edits and Corrections Procedures.” These meetings with publishers will address the edits and corrections identified in the IMR/CRE Report of Findings and approved by the IQC at its September 21, 2018, meeting; those edits and corrections identified by the IQC and included in its recommendation to the SBE; and any additional edits and corrections that are required by the SBE. Publishers whose programs are adopted by the SBE will be required to complete all edits and corrections within 60 days of CDE notification of the results of the edits and corrections meetings pursuant to *5 CCR* Section 9525(e).

### Publisher Fees

Pursuant to *EC* Section 60212, and in accordance with *5 CCR* Section 9517.3, this adoption was financed through one-time fees paid by participating publishers. Based upon CDE estimates of costs necessary to conduct the adoption, the fee was set at $8,000 per program per grade level submitted.

The legislation also included the provision that, upon the request of a small publisher or small manufacturer, the SBE may reduce the fee for participation in the adoption. *EC* Section 60209(e)(2) states that "small publisher" and "small manufacturer" mean an independently owned or operated publisher or manufacturer that is not dominant in its field of operation and that, together with its affiliates, has 100 or fewer employees and has average annual gross receipts of $10 million dollars ($10,000,000) or less over the previous three years. Seven publishers submitted requests for small publisher fee reduction.

### Reports of Findings

The IMRs and CREs worked collaboratively during deliberations to produce a Report of Findings for each program. The reports include findings for each category of the criteria and citations that are exemplary (not exhaustive) to support those findings. The Reports of Findings are posted on the CDE Science Instructional Materials web page and are linked at the end of this item.

Twenty-nine of the 34 submitted programs were recommended by the IMR/CRE panels for adoption, with some recommendations contingent upon satisfactory completion of specified edits and corrections. Edits and corrections are defined as inexact language, imprecise definitions, mistaken notations, mislabeling, misspellings, and grammatical errors. Edits and corrections do not include rewrites, including revisions of sections, chapters, or entire pages, or adding new content to a program. Rewrites are not allowed during the adoption process (*5 CCR* sections 9510[h] and [r] and 9519[f] through [g]). The review panels also provided citations for social content violations when those were found in the programs.

### Instructional Quality Commission Recommendations

On September 20, 2018, the Science SMC held a public hearing and discussed in depth the IMR/CRE Report of Findings. The discussion included the lists of edits and corrections included in the report, social content citations, public comment received, and findings from Commissioners’ own independent reviews.

After the discussion at the Science SMC level, a roll-call vote was taken on the submitted programs. The 34 programs submitted by publishers received individual motions and votes. Each motion was stated in the affirmative in each case. A majority vote from the Science SMC was required for any program to be recommended to the full IQC for adoption.

On September 21, 2018, the full IQC also held a public hearing and discussed the programs in depth. Again, each program received individual roll-call votes. The recommendations to adopt were contingent upon completion of all edits and corrections and social content citations agreed upon by the IQC. Nine Commissioners were required to vote in the affirmative to recommend any program.

The IQC recommended 29 of the programs submitted for adoption. The IQC adoption recommendations to the SBE are included in its advisory report, which is posted on the CDE Science Instructional Materials web page. A link to the report is included in this action item.

### *EC* Section 60200(e) Finding

*EC* Section 60200(e) specifies that the SBE may adopt fewer than five programs per grade level if either fewer than five programs were submitted for adoption or if the SBE specifically finds that fewer than five programs meet the criteria for adoption and conducts a review of the degree to which the criteria and procedures for evaluation were consistent with the SBE-adopted curriculum framework.

In this adoption, the total number of recommended programs provides more than five basic instructional materials for each grade level in kindergarten through grade eight.

## Summary of Previous State Board of Education Discussion and Action

**November 3, 2016:** The SBE adopted the *Science Framework*, including the *Criteria for Evaluating Instructional Materials: Kindergarten through Grade Eight*. At the same meeting, the SBE also approved the Schedule of Significant Events for the adoption and the online application form for IMRs and CREs.

**November 9, 2017:** The SBE appointed 109 IMRs and 11 CREs as recommended by the IQC. The SBE also approved the Standards and Evaluation Criteria Maps and the appointment of several non-IQC members to serve as facilitators for review panels.

## Fiscal Analysis

The 2018 Science Adoption is funded through the collection of publisher participation fees. The cost for supplies, duplicating, conference rooms, travel, hotel accommodations, per diem expenses, and content expert honoraria was approximately $350,000. The costs for adoption were fully covered by publisher fees per *EC* Section 60213(c–e).

## Attachment(s)

Attachment 1: Copy of the draft *2018 Science Adoption Instructional Quality Commission Advisory Report* that was approved by the IQC on September 21, 2018 (335 pages). This attachment is available on the CDE science instructional materials web page at <https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/sc/im/>.

Attachment 2: Copy of the 2018 Science Adoption Review Panel Reports of Findings (34 reports). This attachment is available on the CDE science instructional materials web page at [https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/sc/im/scireportsoffindings.asp.](https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/sc/im/scireportsoffindings.asp)