Attachment 1

Arts Subject Matter Committee

January 15–16, 2020

Page 1 of 138

# Chart of Public Input (October 1, 2019–December 1, 2019)

**Summary Table of Actionable Public Comments from First 60-Day Review**

Public Input on the Draft Arts Framework

This table provides a summary of the public comments that recommended changes to the content in the current draft 2020 *Arts Education Framework for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Arts Framework*) received October 1, 2019–December 1, 2019. All comments are presented to the Instructional Quality Commission (IQC) in their original form without editing. The comments appear in tables 3–15, in the order that the chapters were posted online, with suggestions specific to the text followed by general comments. The public comments are organized by chapter, page number, and line number. Where possible, page and line numbers for line references are included in the column labeled “Page.” Where possible, specific suggested line edits have each been given their own entry in the table. References were provided by the California Department of Education (CDE), and include the word “line,” and should not be considered text from the associated comment. The “IQC Action” column is included to capture the actions the IQC takes at its January 2020 meeting.

**The following abbreviations are used throughout this document, in accordance with state and federal accessibility guidelines.**

* <bh> = highlighted text begins
* <eh> = highlighted text ends
* <bs> = strikethrough text begins
* <es> = strikethrough text ends

**The following definitions clarify the recommended actions provided throughout this document:**

* **Recommended** = CDE recommends that the Arts Subject Matter Committee (Arts SMC) include the additions, edits, and/or changes as stated in the public comment.
* **Not Recommended** = CDE recommends that the Arts SMC does not include the additions, edits, and/or changes as stated in the public comment.
* **No Motion Recommended** = CDE does not have a recommendation.
* **Writers’ Discretion** = CDE recommends that the Arts SMC permit the Arts Framework writers and CDE staff to determine how to include the additions, edits, and/or changes stated in the public comment.
* **Non-Actionable** = The public comment does not include actionable edits that include additions, edits, and/or changes that can be applied to the framework, and no action is needed.

All recommended actions were made based on the California *Education Code*; the Guidelines for the Arts Education Framework for Public Schools, Kindergarten through Grade Twelve, approved by the State Board of Education in 2019 (<https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/vp/cf/artsfwguidelines.asp>), and the 2019 *California Arts Standards* (<https://www.cde.ca.gov/be/st/ss/>). Questions regarding the recommended actions can be sent to [vapa@cde.ca.gov](mailto:vapa@cde.ca.gov).

## Table 1: Arts Framework Ratings Table

| Rating Area | Excellent | Good | Fair | Poor |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Overall | 7 | 16 | 15 | 3 |
| Format and clarity | 5 | 15 | 16 | 4 |
| Facilitating teaching and learning of The California Arts Standards. | 5 | 12 | 19 | 4 |
| How well the framework provides guidance for instruction for ALL students at all grade/course levels. | 5 | 10 | 20 | 5 |

## Table 2: Input Sources: Includes Survey Respondents and Email Comments

| Source (Name shortened for easy reference in the tables) | Name | Affiliation, Current Position, and Credentials (if applicable) | Input Method: Public input survey (Survey) or email (EM) |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Aujero | Catherine Aujero | Administrative Credential, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Bauguil et al. | Marie-Helene Bauguil, Eileen Beckley, Sharon Dahnert, Jeannine Flores, Michele Guieu, Rebecca Palmer, Elizabeth Unpingco | Santa Clara County Office of Education | EM |
| Barber | Mary Beth Barber | Teaching Artist, Professional Organization Representative | Survey/EM |
| Benavides | Amanda Benavides | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Single Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey |
| Brouillette | Liane Brouillette | Professor, School of Education, University of California, Irvine | EM |
| Brunel | Catherine Brunel | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Single Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey |
| Cauchi | Gary Cauchi | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Single Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Centeno | Rocio Centeno | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Cooley | Patrice Cooley | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Single Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey |
| Cortez | Carmen Cortez | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Cotner | Teresa Cotner | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Single Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Crooks | Pauline Crooks | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Administrative Credential, Single Subject Teaching Credential, San Diego County Office of Education | Survey/EM |
| Dagani | Mary Dagani | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Darnaud | Marita Darnaud | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey |
| Demirdjian | Tina Demirdjian | Information not provided | EM |
| Denton | Judie Denton | District Administrator, Administrative Credential, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Dimapilis | Aliya Dimapilis | College/University Faculty, Community Member, Parent Guardian/Caretaker of TK12 Student | Survey |
| Dunlop | Alisha Dunlop | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Single Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Ellis | Kik Ellis | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey |
| Enciso | Andrea Enciso | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey |
| Engdahl | Eric Engdahl | Chair, Department of Teacher Education, California State University East Bay | EM |
| Fennell | Anne Fennell | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Single Subject Teaching Credential, Single Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey/EM |
| Findley | Dana Findley | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Administrative Credential, Single Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey |
| Garcia | Amanda Garcia | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Gifford | Lori Gifford | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential, Single Subject Teaching Credential, Single Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization, Single Subject Teaching Credential with Secondary Authorization | Survey |
| Goldberg | Merryl Goldberg | Professor of Music at California State University San Marcos | EM |
| Gutierrez | Marcella Gutierrez | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Parent Guardian/Caretaker of TK12 Student, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Hernandez | Jacqueline Hernandez | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Huesca | Ruby Huesca | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Husselstein | Jessica Husselstein | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Single Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Jephcott | Jacqueline Jephcott | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey |
| Landon | Joe Landon | Executive Director, California Alliance for Arts Education | EM |
| Lewis Morris | Erin Lewis Morris | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Lieberman | Gerald Lieberman | Director, State Education and Environment Roundtable | EM |
| Liles | Leslie Liles | Information not provided | EM |
| Marshall | Julia Marshall | College/University Faculty | Survey |
| McNiel | Julie McNiel | Teaching Artist, Parent Guardian/Caretaker of TK12 Student | Survey |
| Mezin-Williams | Anna Mezin-Williams | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Munoz | Christina Munoz | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Administrative Credential, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey |
| Music | Louise Music | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Administrative Credential, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential |  |
| Nidy | Robert Nidy | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Single Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Perini | Elsa Perini | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Administrative Credential, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Pernui | Julie Pernui | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey |
| Piccola | Christine Piccola | CSUSM, Visual and Performing Arts student at Cal State San Marcos, Parent Guardian/Caretaker of TK12 Student | Survey |
| Pilhoefer | Anna Pilhoefer | Santa Barbara Unified School District | EM |
| Potter | Dave Potter | Subject Matter Project Director | Survey |
| Quiroz | Melanie Quiroz | Student at CSUSM and after school program leader for K–12 | Survey |
| Ramirez | Maritza Ramirez | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Reed | Allen Reed | Credentialed TK12 Teacher | Survey |
| Reedy | Patricia Reedy | College/University Faculty, Curriculum Specialist, Teaching Artist | Survey |
| Romano | Lauren Romano | General Elementary Teacher | EM |
| Ruben | Jacqueline Ruben | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization, Single Subject Teaching Credential with Supplemental Authorization | Survey |
| Ruez | Paul Ruez | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Administrative Credential, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey/EM |
| Rust | Heather Rust | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Single Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Segura-Diaz | Martha Segura-Diaz | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Parent Guardian/Caretaker of TK12 Student, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Spangler | Jennifer Spangler | College/University Faculty, County Office of Education Administrator | Survey |
| Stuber | Susan Stuber | Teacher, Vista Unified School District | EM |
| Tanaka | Margaret Tanaka | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Thompson | Kristen Thompson | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Teaching Artist, Single Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Valenzuela | Sierra Valenzuela | CSUSM Fourth Year Student | Survey |
| Van Dewark | Julie Van Dewark | Credentialed TK12 Teacher, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential, Single Subject Teaching Credential | Survey |
| Williams | Laura Williams | Teacher, San Diego Unified School District | EM |

## Table 3: Guide to Reading and Using the Framework

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Cotner | 1 | Line 3, comment: change Kindergarten to Pre-Kindergarten  Line 16, comment: change TK to PK | Not Recommended |
| 2 | Cotner | 2 | Line 25, comment: would you consider mention of museum educators in this list?  Line 26, comment: change TK to PK  Line 31, comment: change TK to PK | Not Recommended |
| 3 | Fennell | 2 | Line 33 - adjust their instructional practices to the new performance standards Change to - adjust their instructional practices to the new California Arts Standards.  34-35 - and to meet the needs and interests of diverse, new generations of students. Change to - and to meet the needs and interests of diverse, new generations of students, as well as support expanding pathways in arts education.  36 - For educational administrators the Arts Framework is clarifying and practical. Change to - For educational administrators the Arts Framework clarifies practical content and applications of the arts as discreet or integrated subject matter. | Recommend: replace sentence and add additional language to read *It is also a reference for more experienced, practicing educators seeking to adjust their instructional practices from the past content standards to the new California Arts Standards. The new arts standards are performance standards that are action and process-oriented allowing teachers to meet the needs and interests of diverse, new generations of students and support expanded pathways in arts education.* |
| 4 | Fennell | 2 | 36 - For educational administrators the Arts Framework is clarifying and practical. Change to - For educational administrators the Arts Framework clarifies practical content and applications of the arts as discreet or integrated subject matter. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 5 | Fennell | 3 | 67-69 - Arts community partners such as museums and or performance venues, or companies with educational components should use the Arts Framework to orient themselves to the standards and the goals of arts education and consider the Change to - Arts community partners such as museums and or performance venues, or companies with educational components should use the Arts Framework to align themselves to the standards and the goals of arts education and consider the | Recommended |
| 6 | Barber | 3 | Line 75 Change “a first-year arts coordinator” to “new arts coordinators”  Reason: Clarity  Note: Match case | Recommended: change to “first-year arts coordinators” |
| 7 | Barber | 4 | Line 96 Change “for, of, and as” to “for, of< and during”  Reason: Clarity  Note: The last “as” didn’t really make sense | Writers’ Discretion |
| 8 | Cotner | 4 | Line 100, comment: change TK to PK | Not Recommended |
| 9 | Cotner | 5 | Line 115, comment: would you consider adding to end of paragraph, "that directly address learning of salient and relevant practices of each discipline.” | Writers’ Discretion |
| 10 | Barber | 6 | Line 136 Consider changing title of “safety links” in appendix to “Safety information websites related to the arts”  Reason: Clarity  Note: The term “safety links” is too informal | Recommended: change title to Safety Information and Resources |
| 11 | Cotner | 6 | Line 141, comment: would you consider recommending reputable peer-reviewed journals of research in each discipline? | Not Recommended: See Appendix J |
| 12 | Brunel | n/a | I grew angry at trying to decipher all the information thrown at me here. Why is this so long? | Non-Actionable |
| 13 | Darnaud | n/a | Accessible curriculum however, current grades 6-8 teachers need musical training and planning time. | Non-Actionable |
| 14 | Mezin-williams | n/a | Accessible yet teachers in grade 6-8 will initially need support and training. | Non-Actionable |
| 15 | Hernandez | n/a | I read Chapter 5 line 429 - 481 I found the Framework easy to read and follow. I liked the continuity from one grade level to the next. I think is doable and in the long run with proper training Multiple Subject teachers could implement 20 - 30 minutes of music a couple of times per week. For now I think that there is a big gap because of the lack of support and training. | Non-Actionable |
| 16 | Potter | n/a | Very good overview! | Non-Actionable |
| 17 | Ramirez | n/a | I was not able to read the entire framework and only read three pages of the part about music. | Non-Actionable |
| 18 | Reedy | n/a | Overall, nice. Especially good "action and process-oriented" line 33-34; inclusion of administration (though I want to read that chapter more thoroughly); nice inclusion of community partners; nice "not prescriptive" line 148 because that was a problem with the prior CA VAPA standards and framework; appreciate focus on inclusion & equity. I like that dance is first. As an underrepresented art form, this is important. | Non-Actionable |
| 19 | Ruben | n/a | Delete the first sentence ''All students have a desire, right, and ability to learn thus schools must offer opportunities for all learners. Emphasize the concept of art as inquiry which, consequently, connects to other academic subjects. Inquiry is buried within this document and needs to be one of the key points. | Non-Actionable: This sentence is not in current draft of chapter |
| 20 | Thompson | n/a | Too Long | Non-Actionable |
| 21 | Van Dewark | n/a | Clear, strong | Non-Actionable |

## Table 4: Chapter 1: Vision and Goals for Standards-Based Education

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Williams | 1 | Lines 3-16 I would like to see this introductory paragraph be more persuasive for readers who might not immediately agree with the opening sentence – that the arts are important. I recommend starting with one paragraph about the “outside” (non-arts) benefits of the arts (e.g. 21st century workforce, critical thinking skills, student engagement, etc. – such as the items listed in the last two sentence of the paragraph). Then include a second paragraph that talks about artistic literacy and the life-long appreciation, and the reasons that the arts are important in our lives (e.g. community, expression, etc.). | Writers’ Discretion |
| 2 | Williams | 1 | Lines 10-13 This is a run-on sentence. It either needs a semi-colon in the middle (“…and a life-long appreciation of the arts; it prepares students for…”), separation into two sentences at that point, or minor rephrasing. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 3 | Cotner | 1 | Line 11, comment: consider replacing, "joy, inspiration" with, "intense engagement with",  Lines 14 and 15, comment, consider replacing, "parent and community engagement, positive school culture and climate," with, "parent and community connections to the school culture and climate"  Line 22, comment: change Transitional Kindergarten to Pre-Kindergarten,  Lines 25 and 26, comment: aren't social, cultural and emotional development kinds of cognitive development? as is, it suggests that social skills, cultural identities and appreciations and emotions are not cognitive functions, but some other non-cognitive functions/development. Maybe "critical thinking" or "higher order thinking" instead of "cognitive." You could also include "ethical" development | Not Recommended |
| 4 | Barber | 1 | Line 19 Delete comma after “education” | Recommended |
| 5 | Cotner | 2 | Line 44, comment: can we add some additional verbiage to "Digital Citizenship"? It is a new terminology and sounds kind of trendy. | Not Recommended |
| 6 | Cotner | 2 | Lines 52 and 53, comment: competion and the global economy are both frowned upon by many, maybe we could say something like, "prepared to accomplish their own goals in life and to collaboratively participate in creating safer and ecologically sustainable natural environments and global community." | Writers’ Discretion |
| 7 | Barber | 3 | Line 76 Substitute backslash with “and”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 8 | Cotner | 3 | Line 80, comment: instead of "mental, physical, and emotional," just "mental and physical." | Not Recommended |
| 9 | Barber | 4 | Line 87 Add sentence discussing the importance of constructive dialogue between communities in such as diverse a state as California, and how the arts can serve as a means of communications, understanding and empathy.  Reason: Big idea of the arts  Note: There’s lots of reference to this concept later in the chapter, but the “community engagement” section (Hetland and Eisner references on page 7, for example) here is sparse on this idea in this foundations and lifelong goals section. | Not Recommended: references SBE adopted standards document |
| 10 | Cotner | 4 | Lines 88-95, comment: maybe add something that refers to how many Californians make a living through the arts. | Not Recommended |
| 11 | Cotner | 4 | Line 99, comment: don't understand why this line says, "(CAS 2019)" is this a subheading of "The Arts as Profession”? It's confusing as it is followed by more than a page of text that seems to focus mostly on literacy in the different disciplines. | Non-Actionable |
| 12 | Williams | 4–5 | Lines 106-114 All the disciplines have related academic vocabulary, not just visual art and media art. Music also has a visual representation (notation) system that is an extremely important part of musical literacy. This “symbol system” is our primary mode of literacy, not interpreting a conductor’s gesture. | Writers’ Discretion: revise for clarity |
| 13 | Williams | 5 | Line 117 The phrase “artistically literate individual” is used correctly throughout. However, if using “arts-literate individual,” there needs to be a hyphen between the two words because they are functioning as a compound adjective. | Recommended |
| 14 | Cotner | 5–6 | Lines 139-149, comment 2 ed. codes are mentioned and explained but it seems out of context, needs connection to the flow of this part of the chapter. | No Motion Recommended |
| 15 | Williams | 6 | Line 159 Modify “educators” to include instructional leaders. Administrators are the ultimate evaluators of arts education programs, not educators, and much of the work educators do with the Framework is advocacy with their administrators. Either substitute “educators and administrators” or use something more generic like “educational stakeholders” or “education staff” (neither of which I particularly like, to be honest). | Not Recommended  “educators” includes instructional leaders – if try to delineate all specific terms may leave someone out or a title that an LEA uses |
| 16 | Cotner | 7 | Line 181, comment: I am confused by how headings appear, sometimes bold sometimes in italics. I feel the need for clearer distinctions between different parts of this chapter as it goes along. Also, this part begins to include quotes from renowned educator/researchers/philosophers, it feels different and needs a heading, like "what research is telling us" | Recommended: change heading Why an Arts Education? What Research Tells Us |
| 17 | Williams | 9 | Line 251 “Problem identification” is missing a semi-colon to be the same as the other bullet points. | Recommended |
| 18 | Williams | 9 | Line 271 Missing a space after “disciplines” | Recommended |
| 19 | Williams | 11 | Line 281-283 This is perfect: “Research has shown that dance occupies an important place within a curriculum because it provides support for cognitive development and should therefore not be used merely as a kinesthetic instructional strategy for other subject matter (Giguere 2011).” Yes! | Non-Actionable |
| 20 | Barber | 11 | Line 282 Insert “dynamic” before cognitive development, then end sentence. Delete “and” and insert “Dance” at beginning of next sentence  Reason: Clarity, separation of ideas  Note: Maybe use semicolon instead of period to separate two sentences if the entire idea is attributed to Giguere. Concepts are important, because there’s a dynamic nature to the cognitive development from dance. | Not Recommended |
| 21 | Barber | 11 | Line 304 Add concept sentence at top of paragraph to define the arts discipline. Suggestion: “Students in the twenty-first century live in a media art world and utilize technology-based creative production and design.”  Reason: Summary sentence  Note: Important to define the singular discipline nature of media arts. | Not Recommended |
| 22 | Williams | 12 | Line 331 A comma is needed between “sounds” and “strengthening”: “pattern recognition in information-laden sounds, strengthening the ability to perceive and understand in multiple contexts.” | Recommended |
| 23 | Williams | 13 | Line 343-345 Beginning this paragraph with a sentence about students learning actively instead of “through lecture and worksheets” implies that the reason to teach theatre is to better learn other subject areas. It’s a valid point, but shouldn’t be the focus of the section. I recommend moving this sentence to the end of the theatre section (e.g. line 358), rather than making it the opening. | Recommended |
| 24 | Barber | 13 | Line 350 Delete comma after “way”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 25 | Barber | 15 | Line 399 Delete comma after “art”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 26 | Barber | 15 | Line 406 Insert comma after “approaches”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 27 | Barber | 15 | Line 409 Who is Francis?  Reason: Clarification and reference  Note: These series of levels are also attributed to Francis in the reference, but that concept is not explained. | Non-Actionable |
| 28 | Williams | 18 | Lines 499-510 Within these ten lines, two sentences utilize the Oxford comma, and two sentences do not. Whatever the desired methodology (I happen to be a proponent of the Oxford comma because of the clarity it adds), consistency is key. | Recommended |
| 29 | Barber | 18 | Line 508 New paragraph after “equipment.”  Reason: Clarity  Note: This is a new concept centered on community versus working collaboratively, from the beginning of this paragraph | Not Recommended |
| 30 | Williams | 19 | Lines 518 “Artworks” is a single word. | Recommended |
| 31 | Barber | 20 | Line 538 Insert comma after “perceptions”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended: change to two sentences. *The arts provide insights into others’ experiences and perceptions. By studying varying modes of communication and expression, students build capacity to empathize and connect more deeply and broadly with others.* |
| 32 | Barber | 20 | Line 541 Insert comma after “character”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 33 | Barber | 21 | Line 565 Rewrite “view failure as an opportunity to learn” or include information in previous pages  Reason: Out of Context  Note: This idea has not been introduced previously, yet appears in the “in summary” section. Perhaps page 18 between the paragraphs that end on line 501 and start at 502 | Line 565 is quoted from NCAS.  Recommended:  1. Change lines 558–559 to read:  *In sum, learning in the arts provides opportunities for social and emotional learning, and positively effects school culture and teaching by helping students:* (and then the quoted bullets follow).  2. Move lines 558–572 to be inserted after line 628. |
| 34 | Williams | 21 | Line 585 Remove the comma between “teachers” and “who”. | Recommended |
| 35 | Williams | 22 | Lines 591-594 Format the section on specialist arts teachers with bullet points to make it the same as administrators and teachers bullet points above. | Recommended |
| 36 | Williams | 23 | Lines 631-634 Great quote, and I love how this is followed up by a paragraph on not using the arts only to serve other areas of curriculum. While it might raise test scores, that’s not the reason to teach the arts! This is really important. | Non-Actionable |
| 36 | Barber | 24 | Line 654 Add in “University of California and California State University” before “admission”  Reason: Important detail  Note: Some private universities may not require the exact VAPA requirement – best to cite UC/CSU | Not Recommended |
| 37 | Barber | 25 | Line 676 Add “a society of” after “goal is”  Reason: Words missing  Note: The sentence doesn’t make sense as written | Not Recommended |
| 38 | Barber | 26 | Line 700-706 Pull out this entire paragraph and emphasize it graphically  Reason: Important detail  Note: This paragraph is very important, as it is a completely new concept and the key to the updated standards. If there was a way to put this at the top of the chapter, it should be done. | Not Recommended |
| 39 | Williams | 26 | Lines 707-753 This section on the need for creative thinkers and the creative economy in California is very strong and also very important. | Non-Actionable |
| 40 | Barber | 27 | Line 726 Insert a colon after “in this way”  Reason: Clarity | Recommend revise sentence to:  *The 2018* Otis Report *defines the creative economy as “inclusive of all kinds of creative activities whether expressed as art or innovation. Significant components of the creative economy are the creative industries—a designated set of industries that depend on individual creativity to generate employment and wealth” (2018).* |
| 41 | Cooley | 28 | Line 754 I am surprised to see CTE so directly endorsed in the introduction to the CAS. I would like to see language in this section that shows the value of arts education for the sake of the arts discipline discreetly, specifically for secondary sites that do not have viable AME CTE programs. Consider this 755 “One viable method that may support full preparation of” students for careers in the arts and for postsecondary study of the arts, careful planning of comprehensive, | Writers’ Discretion |
| 42 | Barber | 28 | Line 756 Replace “of” with “is needed between”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 43 | Barber | 28 | Line 766 Insert comma after “curricula”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 44 | Barber | 28 | Line 771 Insert comma after “relevance”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 45 | Barber | 29 | Line 777 Replace “Appendix XXX” with “each of the discipline chapters. Also consider adding the word “potential careers” or some other kind of qualifier. Or delete completely.  Reason: Incorrect  Note: There is not an Appendix of career, and the information in the discipline chapters is suggestive and not definitive. Maybe eliminate completely? Or refine? | Recommended: delete |
| 46 | Barber | 29 | Line 790 New paragraph after “(ESSA 2019)” and before “This places…”  Reason: Clarity  Note: New thought, current paragraph is quite long | Not Recommended |
| 47 | Cotner | 29 | Lines 783 to 790, comment: makes it sound like ESSA is interested in arts history and career tech ed, but not thr=e rest of what we know as the arts. Inclusion of this poorly written section of ESSA weakens our stance. Maybe delete. Maybe this chapter could be renamed, "Why Arts?: Justification, Vision and Goals for Standards Based Arts Education" | Not Recommended |
| 48 | Williams | 29 | Line 800 Remove the comma after “all states”. | Recommended |
| 49 | Barber | 29 | Line 800 Delete comma after “states”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 50 | Barber | 30 | Line 805 Replace “only” with “principally”  Reason: Accuracy  Note: Some data may be gathered from statewide resources and used as a local indicator. | Not Recommended |
| 51 | Williams | 31 | Lines 841-855 Move lines 841-855 (the California Ed Code excerpts about arts education) to after line 826, which talks about the California Ed Code requirements. This would flow much more naturally into the section on the UC/CSU A-G requirements (currently lines 826-840). | Recommended |
| 52 | Barber | 33 | Line 909-917 “Qualified teachers in all five arts disciplines are necessary” reads that individual teachers must be qualified in all of the disciplines, not that there must be a number of teachers and the availability of all five disciplines for students.  Reason: Accuracy  Note: This paragraph could be improved and clarified through a quick rewrite by an editor | Recommend striking *in all five arts disciplines* from the sentence |
| 53 | Williams | 33 | Lines 893-908 It seems vague to have a section that talks about scheduling, but only talks about “sufficient learning time” without giving measures or recommendations. Additionally, point two is “Second, students should receive sufficient time within secondary grade level courses to develop in all four Artistic Processes.” Why is this not the same for elementary students? Don’t they also need to develop in all four Artistic Processes? | Non-Actionable |
| 54 | Barber | 34 | Line 918-925 Small edits: replace “making” with “Creating” or leave with just “learning”; line 923, “professionals”. | Recommend replacing “professional” with “professionals” in line 923 |
| 55 | Barber | 34 | Big edit: the sentence in the middle is muddled. Maybe “Universities and the arts industries have a set of standards for the arts facilities and equipment that should be adhered to at the K-12 level as well, so students are prepared to continue their arts learning beyond the TK-12 grades.”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 56 | Barber | 34 | Line 933-4 Replace “,unlike other subject areas” with “uniquely”  Reason: Accuracy  Note: This sentence pits the arts against other subjects, and immediate invites a conflict for those who believe their subject matter is also demonstrated in a public way, like speech/debate, journalism, even PE | Recommended |
| 57 | Barber | 34 | Line 936 Change “requires” to “require”  Reason: Match case  Line 936 Change “These are” to “Students developing these” and delete “that students” in the next line  Reason: Clarity  Line 937-8 Missing word? Behavioral guidelines?  Reason: Clarity | Writers’ Discretion to revise lines 935–939 for clarity |
| 58 | Barber | 35 | Line 971 Add an example of arts literacy. Suggestion for additional sentence: “Music is the most obvious example of a unique arts language, but all five disciplines have unique literacies and communication means.”  Reason: Example needed  Note: This is a complex topic and providing the example of music as a language and literacy help guide those who are just thinking about this concept | Not Recommended |
| 59 | Barber | 35 | Line 976 Insert comma after “arts”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 60 | Barber | 36 | Line 990 Change “provide feedback” to “the provision of feedback”  Reason: Parallel construction | Recommend changing the first “provide” to “equip” to read: *These attributes equip teachers with a foundation to structure instruction and assessment and provide feedback on learning that is accessible by all students.* |
| 61 | Barber | 36 | Line 993 Insert “that” after “ensure”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 62 | Barber | 36 | Line 996 Replace “to ensure” with a comma followed by “ensuring”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 63 | Barber | 37 | Line 1006 Insert “that” after “ensure”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 64 | Barber | 37 | Line 1017 Delete comma after “museums”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 65 | Barber | 38 | Line 1038 Replace “foremost” with “intellectual property basics, particularly copyright”  Reason: Correction/accuracy | Not Recommended |
| 66 | Barber | 38 | Line 1084 Rearrange sentence so it reads “choreographic notations such as Labanotation.”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 67 | Barber | 39 | Line 1085 Insert comma after “movements”  Reason: Clarity | Recommend |
| 68 | Williams | 39 | Lines 1061-1100 I am so glad to see the list of examples and descriptions of the types of text encountered in the different art forms. This section will be helpful for educators and administrators in discussions of literacy, text, annotation, and close reading within the arts. It doesn’t have to mean that you are reading a book or article in your arts class. | Non-Actionable |
| 69 | Barber | 40 | Line 1086 Insert comma after “choreography”  Reason: Clarity | Recommend |
| 70 | Barber | 40 | Line 1100 In the table, under media arts, delete “a manual or guide for software or applications” and instead insert “Computer interfaces for digital media adjustments”  Reason: Dynamic definition of “text” in media arts  Note: When a media artist is learning the text of an art form, it’s not the manual that is the text, it is the various interfaces that determine the artistic output. For example, when a sound engineer is changing levels of particular tracks, there is a graphic interface showing a two-dimensional representation of the sounds. It is this that the media artist “reads” and changes to adjust or create the artwork. While my suggestion isn’t perfect, the inclusion of a software manual as “text” diminishes the complexities and uniqueness of the media arts. Reading a manual is ELA/ELD. This change was recommended multiple times during the working sessions of the advisory group. | Not Recommended |
| 71 | Barber | 42 | Line 1135 Insert a colon after “citizens”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 72 | Brunel | n/a | There is advocacy of a backwards planning approach, with research to back it up. However, this entire manual is a forward approach. Why is it not consistent with what it advocates? | Non-Actionable |
| 73 | Mezin-williams | n/a | An attainable goal after several years of implementation. | Non-Actionable |
| 74 | Potter | n/a | I appreciate that the first sentence seeks to frame arts education as developing people who will "contribute to the prosperity and quality of life for local and global communities." Arts education is citizenship education, and this section makes this explicit> This is also lovely to read: "Professional artists weave the cultural and aesthetic fabric of communities and cultivate beauty, enjoyment, curiosity, awareness, activism and personal, social, and cultural connection and reflection. This fabric strengthens communities as a whole, enhances the lives of individuals, and inspires the global community. Artistically literate citizens appreciate the value of supporting the arts as a profession by engaging with the arts and by supporting the funding of the arts. Some artistically literate individuals will pursue a career in the arts, thereby enriching local, state, national, and global communities and economies." | Non-Actionable |
| 75 | Reedy | n/a | Overall good. Following sections are weak: Arts as communication section: you should refer to Vygotsky who addresses mediated symbolic learning. Creative personal realization section also weak: refer to Maslow who writes about this at length. Also, self-actualization might be different than expertise in only one medium. Wellbeing section should include empathy. Line 121 is good, "authentic practice." In terms of written for publishers, line 159, you should recommend publishers work/partner with artists or arts organizations because creating textbooks is a linear process and these art forms are anything but...I fear that publishers will take the art out of the art form without being required to listen to artists beyond the scope of this document. | Not recommended |
| 76 | Spangler | n/a | Very good depth of material provided. It will be an excellent resource. I do believe the second to the last section on CTE is redundant. | Non-Actionable |
| 77 | Thompson | n/a | Too Long | Non-Actionable |
| 78 | Van | n/a | Strong rationale for arts education, arts literacy and connections to lived experiences past/present/future. | Non-Actionable |

## Table 5: Chapter 2: The Instructional Cycle

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Barber | 25 | Line 469 Add comma after “competence”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 2 | Barber | 28 | Line 549 Replace “teacher created” with “teacher-created”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 3 | Barber | 28 | Line 549 insert “or cornerstone” after summative  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 4 | Barber | 29 | Line 564 Insert colon after “factors”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 5 | Barber | 29 | Line 575 Insert comma after “stage”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 6 | Barber | 29 | Line 576 Delete comma after “assessments”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 7 | Barber | 32 | Line 650-2 Delete parenthesis  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 8 | Barber | 36 | Line 745 Add a sentence about the fact that the term “portfolio” has historically had a specific definition in the visual/graphic arts arena, but that there is a broad definition in arts education  Reason: Important term  Note: When I first saw the usage of the word “portfolio” I was confused about the multi-discipline use of it in education. Suggestion may be “The concept of a portfolio has a broad definition in the context of arts education.” | Not Recommended |
| 9 | Barber | 37 | Line 755-759 Use of the word “performance”  Reason: Important term that needs clarifying  Note: See global note | Not Recommended |
| 10 | Barber | 39 | Line 835 Replace “that” with “who”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 11 | Barber | 41 | Line 865 Replace “(above)” with “(previous)”  Reason: Clarity  Note: The section may not be above if it’s on two different pages | Recommended |
| 12 | Barber | 45 | Line 991-992 Delete “Or I could bolt off knocking the chair over on my way off stage ….”  Reason: Safety  Note: Violent actions that involve physical contact with a person or object on stage require stage combat and choreography experience, and should be used sparingly and when necessary. Knocking over chairs can lead to broken equipment and physical accidents – if the chair breaks and splinters go flying, students can get injured. An experience acting instructor can guide students through this kind of situation as safely as possible. Since this is simply an example, its best in this example to simply avoid knocking over chairs here in general. The point has been made with the slamming of the fist – although that needs to be carefully choreographed for safety as well. | Not Recommended |
| 13 | Barber | 56 | Line 1277 Insert comma after “Rubrics”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 14 | Barber | 61 | Line 1405 Insert “for the University of California and California State University” after “descriptions”  Reason: Accuracy  Note: Courses may be classified differently for private schools or out of state institutions | Not Recommended |
| 15 | Barber | 65 | Line 1514 Replace the dash with a comma  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 16 | Barber | 67 | Line 1573 Delete comma  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 17 | Barber | 67 | Line 1577 Delete comma  Reason: Clarity | Recommend delete comma and insert “to” after “and.” |
| 18 | Barber | 67 | Line 1584 Delete comma  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 19 | Barber | 68 | Line 1585 Delete comma  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 20 | Barber | 71 | Line 1674 Insert actual image  Reason: Accuracy  Note: I had to go to the web to see this graphic. As a Note, it does not do its job – there is no explanation of what we are supposed to be looking at. | Not Recommended due to copyright |
| 21 | Barber | 75 | Line 1799 Insert comma after “means of”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 22 | Barber | 77 | Line 1841-2 Replace “poor” with “awkward” ; replace “dragged on” with “seemed” ; and replace “misused sound recording equipment causing some segments to be very difficult to hear” with “times where the sound levels were very low and students could not be heard on the broadcast, likely from misplaced microphones or technical complications during recording.”  Reason: Replacing negative tone and judgmental language with neutral language  Note: The way this is written comes from a place of negativity and deficit versus learning. | Recommended: revise to read *They recognized and share moments of award camera angles, segments that seemed to be too long, and sound issues likely from misplaced microphones or technical complications during recording.* |
| 23 | Barber | 81 | Line 1953 Delete comma after “supplies”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 24 | Barber | 81 | Line 1955 Delete comma/semicolon after “topics”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 25 | Barber | 81 | Line 1966 Delete comma after “assistance”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 26 | Barber | 82 | line 1980 Replace “she” with “The teacher”  Reason: Clarity of subject  Note: Need to differentiate between a female student and the educator | Recommended |
| 27 | Barber | 82 | line 1981 Delete comma after “But”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 28 | Barber | 82 | Line 1982 Delete comma after “front”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 29 | Barber | 82 | Line 1984 Replace “Having” with “With”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 30 | Barber | 82 | Line 1988 Delete comma after “class” and delete semicolon after “learning” and replace with comma  Reason: Clarity | Recommended: delete semicolon, do not replace with comma |
| 31 | Barber | 82 | Line 1989 Delete comma after “art” and change semicolon after “past” to comma  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 32 | Barber | 82 | Line 2000 Insert comma after “design”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 33 | Cooley | n/a | Line 645 Authentic assessment in the arts…. very good to provide examples of assessment types. | Non-Actionable |
| 34 | Marshall | n/a | I have one comment. The arts, particularly the visual arts, drama, creative writing and, often, dance, are essentially integrative. This is particularly true of contemporary art. Contemporary artists explore big ideas and issues, many of which are addressed in the academic disciplines. Separating out integration from the art discipline in the standards perpetuates the misconception that integration is a different (and for some people, lesser) area. If art education is to stay up to date with contemporary art practice, the framework should be emphasize integration and "research-based art", which is so prevalent today. I suggest blending integration into the disciplinary areas. | Non-Actionable |
| 35 | Potter | n/a | "Visual and media arts collaborative working conditions in the contemporary global world take place in both synchronous and asynchronous time and space that require different skill and communication sets." Yes, this is why virtual exchanges are important in arts education. | Non-Actionable |
| 36 | Reedy | n/a | I think this chapter is extremely important. I like the graphic that suggests multiple points of entry. Overall, I think this is fine although I have the same problems with the Essential Questions and Enduring Understandings for Dance in this document that I do in the national document. I know the work of backward design really well and I do not think that the questions they have posed in dance go far enough in the "open" or "complex" characteristics these questions are supposed to elicit. Questions about where choreographers get their ideas from or how they make their choices suggests a linear pathway or speculation from observation--the questions could go further to assure that students can understand and question based on their experience with dance and dance-making. | Non-Actionable |
| 37 | Thompson | n/a | Too Long | Non-Actionable |

## Table 6: Chapter 3: Dance

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Findley | 1 | Line 16-17. It needs to be accessible to a multi-subject teacher, as well as a dance teacher (with a dance degree) Vignettes would make more sense to be before the standards they meet (list the vignette and then all the standards they met in that lesson after the vignette). At TK-5 pedestrian creative movement makes sense, but at the MS/HS levels, improvisation and choreography within technique is being taught besides pedestrian creative movement. There doesn't seem to be equal emphasis on codified technique vs. creative movement. Inspirational quotes to use in class is helpful, but there doesn't need to be text boxes before sections that don't necessarily relate to the paragraph following it. | Non-Actionable |
| 2 | Barber | 16 | Line 318 Comma after “motion”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 3 | Jephcott | 17–18 | I agree with lines 333 and onward on page 17-18. I like the emphasis on exploring. Teaching through movement and play. | Non-Actionable |
| 4 | Barber | 21 | Line 411 Delete comma after “artwork”  Reason: clarity | Recommended |
| 5 | Barber | 21 | Line 434 Semi-colon after “time”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 6 | Barber | 35 | Line 735 Explanation of “Laban effort qualities”  Reason: Specific term  Note: This may not be a known term for some and explaining it is helpful | Recommend inserting the following note after line 740  *Laban movement action/quality refers to Laban's Efforts. There are eight types of efforts that are found during action (dabbing, flicking, floating, gliding, pressing, slashing, thrusting, wringing). The action/quality produces a feeling or a sensation for the dancer executing the action as well as for anyone viewing a movement.* |
| 7 | Barber | 37 | Line 787 Delete entire sentence that starts with “The teacher supports this application …”  Reason: Distraction from arts  Note: This particular sentence brings up health issues, particularly eating disorders. As a parent I feel uncomfortable about a teacher who is not a health professional monitoring my child’s food habits. The sentence may not be necessary and may be a distraction from the main point of journaling for health habits that can influence dance. | Not Recommended: healthy choices is a critical aspect of dance and is specifically identified in the standard being addressed |
| 8 | Barber | 46 | Line 1022 Remove PowerPoint and Prezi and replace with “digital presentation”  Reason: Product placement  Note: By referencing a specific software, the CDE is unfairly promoting a specific business | Recommended |
| 9 | Barber | 51 | Line 1157 Remove comma after “such as”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 10 | Barber | 51 | Line 1159 Period after “rubrics. Add new sentence “Chapter 2: The Instructional Cycle has further guidance on assessment and scoring tools.”  Reason: Importance  Note: That more info is in another chapter should be part of main text, not an aside with parenthesis. Also, stylistically the full chapter name title should be included. | Recommended |
| 11 | Barber | 51 | Line 1174 Remove comma after “learning”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 12 | Barber | 52 | Line 1204 Add “and guardians” after parents  Reason: Inclusion | Recommended |
| 13 | Barber | 58 | Line 1289  Add quotation end after “happening?”  Reason: Typo | Recommended |
| 14 | Barber | 60 | Line 1346 Delete comma after “say”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 15 | Barber | 61 | Line 1386 Insert “be utilized through” after may  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 16 | Barber | 63 | Line 1448 Delete comma after schools, delete “increases the” and insert “leads to more”  Reason: Clarity  Note: The word “increase” is used already in the sentence concerning diversity | Writers’ Discretion |
| 17 | Barber | 95 | Line 2052 Delete comma after “space”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 18 | Barber | 96 | Line 2105 Insert period after “mindset” and create new sentence “Words matter.”  Reason: Emphasis  Note: This important statement should stand alone for impact | Recommended: revise to read *The words one uses and hears has a tremendous impact on one’s mindset.* |
| 19 | Barber | 97 | Line 2126 Insert “and” after “abilities,”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended: insert a semicolon instead of “and” |
| 20 | Barber | 108 | Line 2392 New paragraph after sentence ending “create”  Reason: Emphasis  Note: The definition of intellectual property should stand alone | Recommended |
| 21 | Barber | 108 | Line 2418 Insert “with copyright protected works incorporated” after “performance”  Reason: Clarification  Note: This current statement says that ALL recordings are not allowed, which isn’t true for pure student-created work including music. Consider adding in a statement along the lines of “While chorography may be completely created by the student, the music recording may not be, and recordings including these copyright protected music are not allowed.” | Not Recommended |
| 22 | Barber | 109 | Line 2419 Eliminate parenthesis around “unless a special license has been paid to do so” – also eliminate the word “paid” and substitute with “granted”  Reason: Emphasis  Note: This fact should not be a sidenote, and sometimes licenses are granted without payment needed | Recommended revise to read:  *Recording a performance is only permissible for school and/or district archival purposes (unless a special license has been acquired).* |
| 23 | Barber | 115 | Line 2553 Include a definition of “choreography”  Reason: Technical term  Note: Needed term | Recommended: add definition from 2004 framework  *Choreography: the art of composing dances, including shaping movement, structuring phrases, and revising and refining dances.* |
| 24 | Barber | 116 | Line 2616 Definition of Laban Movement Analysis is needed  Reason: Technical term  Note: This term is included in the text without definition. Also related to choreography | Recommended: see earlier comment |
| 25 | Brunel | n/a | The dance frameworks are not readable, especially to a young or beginning teacher. The exclusion of any articulation about specific, codified dance forms (jazz, ballet, African, etc.) and its heavy emphasis on modern vocabulary (exploring pathways, the efforts, etc.) will confuse the many, many dance teachers who hail from a studio background and not a collegiate one. It also alienates those schools are are focused on competition work--pathway exploration isn't going to get them a gold. | Non-Actionable |
| 26 | Findley | n/a | In general, it is too lengthy and repetitious. I want to open it and use it to support my teaching. I do not want this document to sit on the shelf and be too overwhelming for other audiences to read it. Need a quick start up guide that has the most important takeaways. | Non-Actionable |
| 27 | Potter | n/a | Dance is a kinetic expression of global education .... I like this: "Dance literate citizens seek and support dance from a variety of cultures, societies, historical periods, communities, and perspectives in a variety of settings including informal, formal, and social. They engage in dance by participating, watching, and discussing various forms and genres using dancer terminology. They continue the legacy of dance by engaging local, state, national, and global communities as well as future generations in dance" | Non-Actionable |
| 28 | Reedy | n/a | 1) Communication needs to say something about communicating that which cannot be said in words. 2) Creative personal (46) clashes with profession--need to make it a lifelong appreciation of and not expert oriented. 3) Culture-needs to explicitly state dance has been a fundamental part of most cultures since the beginning of time. 4) I love the graphic on page 161--it is dance! 5) I have similar problems with enduring understandings. The EQs of perform, respond, and connect are fine--the EQ for creativity is weak and should be changed (nationally, too). 6) The High school Advanced should be equated with AP classes in other subjects eventually. 7) The TK-2 is too broad and therefore misleading expectations; for example, sequencing & structuring is right at 2nd grade--inappropriate expectation younger--educators will be confused; 8) The examples typically have too much talking and too much teacher-directed talking instead of dancing/moving/making which is the point of arts learning. | Items 1,2,3,5 not recommended as they are from the 2019 Arts Standards. Items 4,6,7,8 are non- actionable. |

## Table 7: Chapter 4: Media Arts

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Barber | 3 | Line 70  Add comments about the use of media arts to bring communities together as well as interact with other communities  Reason: ELL learners can thrive in media arts  Note: See notes later in chapter for sentence possibilities | Recommended: add sentence *Media arts-driven engagements can bring communities together to interact with each other in new and different ways.* |
| 2 | Barber | 8 | Line 192  Start new paragraph after “performance”  Reason: Clarity  Note: Paragraph is too long, new topic with the music component | Writers’ Discretion |
| 3 | Barber | 8 | Line 202  Put a close parenthesis after “recording issues”  Reason: Correction | Recommended |
| 4 | Ruez | 15 | My comments are offered to expand the Draft by re-incorporating certain essential competencies which were capstones in the former State of California ROP Competencies. For clarity and alignment with skill sets that are universally required for employment and retention in professional workplaces this re-wording is suggested. This also aligns with UC A-G courses where these skill sets are approved.  Job Finding was a fundamental in the former competencies. So were Workplace Skills. To better meet today’s industry requirements, I suggest re-incorporating these essential skills now. My suggestions are as follows. My additions are in yellow (highlighted).  Line 367 various roles and to master varying skills in media arts production <bh>and fundamental workplace skills<eh>, including  Line 368 responsibility to a collaborative and coherent process, <bh>setting goals, decision making and resolving conflicts.<eh> | Writers’ Discretion |
| 5 | Barber | 21 | Line 527 Replace “XXX” with 4.3  Reason: Correction | Recommended |
| 6 | Barber | 38–39 | Line 957-59 Add sentence concerning copyright and recording  Reason: Digital Citizenship and Intellectual Property  Note: This example is great … if copyright issues regarding the music used and other rights issues are incorporated. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 7 | Ruez | 59 | Line 1488 QUESTION & COMMENT Regarding Disabilities  How or where in our Standards will these students learn, especially with the growing epidemic of students who are highly addicted to an avalanche of distractions. Students who become unwilling and unable to participate positively in hands-on projected-based CTE learning are a growing serious concern. This is not a site issue it is a national epidemic.  The 1488 section offers a very good beginning to answer this urgent question. I suggest that the Workplace Skills: Goal Setting, Decision Making and Conflict Resolution give the 1488 strategies more traction to help the students cut through the afflicted drama and identify the needs behind their behavior and start to take responsibility for the choices they are making.  Once they learn these skills, and start to get a handle on their behavior, their academic, personal and career lives will show a lot more promise and the learning environment will become much more productive.  Deploying Workplace Skills effectively can also reduce toxic stress. Dr. Nadine B. Harris, California’s new Surgeon General is championing toxic stress as a key hot issue which we are going to be mandated to remedy. | No Motion Recommended |
| 8 | Ruez | 87 | Line 2283 change things for the better <bh>through the use of industry required essential Workplace Skills: Decision Making, Goal Setting and Conflict Resolution.<eh> | Not Recommended |
| 9 | Ruez | 89 | Add Job Finding: Using research and self-marketing the job seeker creates a professional Job Application, Resume and Cover Letter and follows proven strategies to find a desired career path job. | Not Recommended |
| 10 | Ruez | 90 | Line 2381 <bs>~~Soft skills~~<es> Essential Workplace Skills: Goal Setting, Decision Making, Conflict Resolution and Job Finding. This includes diverse organizational | Not Recommended |
| 11 | Barber | n/a | Global/insert – Include “Instructional Strategies, Accommodations, and Modifications to Provide Multiple Means of Engagement” tables, such as the ones on page 90, 91 in the visual arts chapter | Writers’ Discretion |
| 12 | Barber | n/a | Global/insert – include “Instructional Strategies, Accommodations, and Modifications to Provide Multiple Means of Representation” chart such as the one in the visual arts chapter on pages 92-94 adjusted for the media arts discipline | Writers’ Discretion |
| 13 | Barber | n/a | Consideration – can a table similar to the one in the visual arts chapter on pages 95-99 titled “Instructional Strategies, Accommodations and Modifications to Provide Multiple Means of Action and Expression” be included with recommendations in the media arts? | Writers’ Discretion |
| 14 | Barber | n/a | (didn’t get past page 46 – will do so for the next round) | Non-Actionable |
| 15 | Potter | n/a | "As a student-centered arts discipline, media arts facilitates the development of the student’s creative empowerment and cultural agency within real world contexts and a globally interconnected digital culture." This is correct and vitally important. | Non-Actionable |
| 16 | Ruez | n/a | My comments made on the Framework Public Input Template are offered to expand the Draft by re-incorporating certain essential competencies which were capstones in the former State of California ROP Competencies. For clarity and alignment with skill sets that are universally required for employment and retention in professional workplaces this re-wording is suggested. This also aligns with UC A-G courses where these skill sets are approved. Job Finding was a fundamental in the former competencies. So were Workplace Skills. To better meet today’s industry requirements, I suggest re-incorporating these essential skills now. As a follow up I feel it is important to mention that Deploying Workplace Skills effectively may also reduce toxic stress. Dr. Nadine B. Harris, California’s new Surgeon General is championing toxic stress as a key hot issue which I predict we are going to be mandated to remedy. | Non-Actionable |

## Table 8: Chapter 5: Music

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Stuber | 1 | Line Please note at line 11, did you mean “inquiries” instead of “inquires”. | Recommended: correct to *inquiries* |
| 2 | Crooks | 1 | Line 45–47 Please adjust the punctuation and/or grammar in this sentence for clarity. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 3 | Williams | 3 | Lines 52-54 The second sentence (“Individuals who have discovered the joy, depth of knowledge, and creative connections will pursue a career in music…”) seems to indicate that everyone who discovers the joy, etc. will pursue a music career. This is obviously not the case. Perhaps say “many individuals”? | Recommended |
| 4 | Liles | 7 | Table 5.1: Process Components for Music - This is very helpful, the verbs aligned with each of the processes - creating, performing, responding and connecting. This will help me in planning lessons. I can see how this corresponds to the DOK levels. | Non-Actionable |
| 5 | Stuber | 8 | I appreciate your clarifying the Student Performance Standards as end-of-the-year expectation (line 183), as well as stating clearly that “Teachers determine music content and pedagogy ….” (lines 186-187). These are very important clarifications. | Non-Actionable |
| 6 | Williams | 9 | Lines 190-196+ This section does not accurately reflect how the standards are divided. There are standards for general music in grades PK-8. The standards for ensembles and harmonizing instruments encompass five levels, beginning at Novice (roughly 5th grade). The Novice and Intermediate levels are not mentioned in this section, or anywhere in the next few paragraphs, until line 226+. | Writers’ Discretion: revise for clarity |
| 7 | Williams | 10 | Line 209 This chart would more accurately be called “High School Music Student Performance Standards Proficiency Levels.” It is a good chart, but would be a better chart if it included all five proficiency levels (in which case the name change is not necessary). | Not Recommended |
| 8 | Williams | 12 | Lines 223-225 For clarity, this sentence should say these standards are designed for use ONLY in high schools. (This is the way it is stated later in lines 587-588.) | Not Recommended |
| 9 | Williams | 13 | Lines 253-255 This sentence is really nicely written and helpful for teachers in applying the proficiency levels: “In secondary education proficiency levels are student-dependent, and should by applied by teachers with an appropriate understanding of the student.” Even though there are approximations of grade levels given, one must meet your students where they are. This also allows for high schools where students have not taken their ensemble during grades 5-8, whose teachers might have to scaffold starting at the novice level. | Non-Actionable |
| 10 | Williams | 14 | Lines 273-276 For each of these charts of sample enduring understandings and essential questions, list the anchor standard. For example, the heading of Table 5.2: Artistic Process – Creating needs a subheading that says “Anchor Standard 1: Generate and conceptualize artistic ideas and work.” This will make it clear to the reader that these are just some of the many EUs and EQs, and that there is one per anchor standard. Otherwise, these EUs and EQs are out of context. | Recommended: add anchor standard to the examples charts, as needed, in all discipline chapters. |
| 11 | Dunlop | 16 | Chapter 5 makes references to PK music near page 16, but PK is not listed when a description of grade level content begins at line 330. After that initial reference to PK, they seem to vanish. Is there a difference in the content that is taught to TK and K? Should there be? There is nothing in the document that separates the two, despite the students being a year apart in age, maturity, and intellectual development. The content taught in their regular classroom instruction is different to account for the developmental differences. Can an example be added of what modifying a K lesson would look like for TK students? Every grade level needs an example of an appropriate lesson to meet each anchor standard. This framework needs to be able to help both existing and new music teachers learn to implement the new standards in their classrooms, and examples are a great way to provide that support. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 12 | Liles | 16 | “Additional Codes for Music Standards  Unlike the other arts disciplines, there are five sets of performance standards for music. A one-letter code is added after the artistic discipline code for all but one set of the performance standards (PK–8) as follows: Harmonizing Instruments (H), Ensembles (E); Composition and Theory (C), Technology (T).  In addition, the two additional levels in the Harmonizing and Ensembles performance standards are indicated in the parentheses:   * Novice (Nov), nominally assigned to the fifth-grade level * Intermediate (Int), nominally assigned to the eighth-grade level”   This is a bit confusing to me. It is difficult to know when students become “novices.” I am teaching fourth grade and we have begun harmonizing, singing rounds and partner songs in a vocal ensemble. Would I classify as “novices”? Also, composition and theory are integrated into the general music curriculum from a very early age. | Non-Actionable |
| 13 | Dunlop | 19 | Line 373 has a typo (1.MU:Cr2b instead of K.MU:Cr2b) | Recommended |
| 14 | Williams | 19 | Lines 373-374 Why is a first grade standard being used for a kindergarten lesson? Do you mean K.MU:Cr2b? | Recommended |
| 15 | Stuber | 19 | Please note, Line 373 labels the performance standard as a first grade standard. However, the standard listed is Kindergarten so I believe the “1” is an error and should be replaced with a “K” especially since the vignette is focused on kindergarten. | Recommended |
| 16 | Williams | 19 | Lines 361-374 The two “chunks” of information need to be separated somehow, by indents, bullet points, lines/boxes, etc. There are too many headings for the reader to comprehend what they’re looking at. Also, line 361 and line 368 should be written the same way, and line 366 and 373 should be written the same way. | Recommended: add Creating— before Anchor on line 368 |
| 17 | Liles | 20 | I do not teach my students the stick notation, but I include the note heads in notation. My students have indicated that they find the stick notation confusing. Our curriculum does not use stick notation. (Refers to the graphic at line 390) | Non-Actionable |
| 18 | Williams | 20 | Lines 377-379 I’m not sure what “pear, pear, apple, pear” is in reference to in this sentence. I understand the reason these words are used later to indicate rhythm (e.g. one sound to a beat = one syllable, two sounds to a beat = two syllables). However, in this sentence, it sounds like you’re listing the sample words in the book, which doesn’t make a lot of sense. If apple and pear are two of the words, then just list the two, not in rhythmic form. | Recommended:  change sentence to read…*such as in a book with four words including, pear and apple.* |
| 19 | Williams | 20 | Lines 386-394 It is VERY unusual to use Kodaly stick notation with kindergarten; it is more commonly used with first grade. Kindergarteners should use graphic notation (pictures) rather than stick notation. This is a good lesson but if used as is, it should be first grade. Or to keep it a kindergarten lesson, use a picture of a pear to indicate one sound per beat, and two small apples to represent two sounds per beat (or a similar means of representation). | Not Recommended |
| 20 | Williams | 22 | Lines 434-437 I appreciate so much that it is called out that music is not about the product/performance, but about the process. It might also be good to say that especially at the younger grade levels (TK, K, 1) that a performance can be on a small scale, in a classroom. It doesn’t have to be onstage and formal. | Non-Actionable |
| 21 | Liles | 22 | I think it is interesting that performance of music alone is not introduced until fifth grade. I have students performing short solos in kindergarten, although not in a formal setting. (Refers to Table 5.6: Process Component Performing) | Non-Actionable |
| 22 | Liles | 23 | Thank you. You have given me an idea of an activity for my fourth grade recorders class.(Refers to lines 468–475) | Non-Actionable |
| 23 | Williams | 23 | Line 461 The words “eight-measure” need a hyphen. | Recommended |
| 24 | Williams | 23–24 | Lines 461-481 It needs to be called out that students are playing recorder. Fingerings are mentioned in line 463, and holes mentioned in line 478, but the term recorder is never mentioned. | Recommended: change Line 461 to read *In music class the students on their recorders are learning to play an eight-measure piece of music.* |
| 25 | Stuber | 26 | Please note at line 550, I believe you can eliminate the first “each” so that the phrase reads, “two groups will each have the same song.” | Recommended |
| 26 | Williams | 26 | Line 552 The phrase “researching through an article their song” is clunky. How about “researching their song” or “research their song using contextual material found in an article”? | Recommended: change line 552 to read…*or researching their song using contextual material found in an article.* |
| 27 | Williams | 28 | Lines 592-606 Generally, this paragraph is not cohesive and needs to be rewritten.  1. The first sentence is a really long, complicated sentence. 2. The clause “two sets” is incomplete. If it is a needed sentence, rephrase to something like “Two sets of standards, Harmonizing Instruments and Ensembles, can be utilized…” 3. Change the word “elect”. In some districts, all students take an ensemble class at the elementary level. Just say “when students take additional music classes.” 4. Remove the sentence in lines 597-598 because it repeats the sentence before it. 5. There is a contradiction between the first sentence (which says those standards can be used in conjunction with the PK-8 general music standards) and the sentence in lines 598-600 (which seem to indicate that the Harmonizing Instrument standards can be used in lieu of the general music standards). If you are using instruments in general music (harmonizing or melodic, and additional types not mentioned like recorder and Orff ensembles), these instruments are supplemental to the general music curriculum. The instruments are a tool to experience the general music standards. The other standards should play a minimal role. 6. Include elementary in the sentence in lines 600-601, as ensemble and harmonizing standards are for approximately 5th grade and up, not just middle and high school. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 28 | Williams | 28 | [*Comment 28 continued*] Here’s a version of a completely rewritten paragraph: “Standards in Ensembles and Harmonizing Instruments can be used for elementary, middle, and high school students, independent from (or sometimes in conjunction with) the general music TK-8 standards. An ensemble is a group of melodic-based instruments: choir, orchestra, band, mariachi, modern band, etc. Harmonizing instruments are instruments that play multiple notes simultaneously and that often function as solo instruments: guitar, ukulele, piano/keyboard, etc. The Ensembles and Harmonizing Instruments standards are structured in five proficiency levels: Novice, Intermediate, Proficient, Accomplished, and Advanced.” | Writers’ Discretion |
| 29 | Williams | 28 | Lines 607-661 The way the harmonizing instrument strand is described is very thorough. Teachers and districts can use this description as a template for writing courses. I appreciate that it purposefully encompasses “non-traditional” elements of music, including composition, recording, tab notation, and a wider student role in performance planning. | Non-Actionable |
| 30 | Williams | 29 | Line 627 Add “historical” and “diverse” to the list of types of music that students play. | Recommended: add historical but not diverse (as cultural and social is listed). |
| 31 | Williams | 30 | Line 653 Change “a part of all the pre-performance process” to one of these: “a part of all the pre-performance processes” or “a part of every pre-performance process” or “involved in the pre-performance process.” | Recommended: change to *…a part of all the pre-performance processes.* |
| 32 | Williams | 33 | Lines 754-755 The exact same phrase was used in lines 621-622 with single quotation marks. Formatting should be the same here, whether that is addition of the single quotation marks, or removal of the marks in lines 621-622 (they don’t seem necessary, but aren’t a dealbreaker). | Recommended: add single quotes around ‘natural music learning’ on line 754 |
| 33 | Williams | 34 | Lines 785-799 There are many wonderful things said in this paragraph, but I am not sure that they are specific to elementary school students. All ensembles focus on process as well as product, though performances are also significant. Musicians strive to learn the fundamentals of their instrument whether they are in elementary school or taking the first year of their instrument in high school. All ensemble music courses provide strong personal habits, not just elementary. The opening sentence says that elementary ensembles look different from middle and high school. However, the evidence in the paragraph does not back that up, as the criteria are applicable to ensembles at every level. | Writers’ Discretion: revise/add language to strengthen paragraph |
| 34 | Williams | 36 | Lines 821-824 I like how the terms “purpose” and “context” are defined and broken down below the standard. That is helpful to the reader. | Non-Actionable |
| 35 | Williams | 38 | The semi-colon after “as” should be a regular colon. | Recommended |
| 36 | Williams | 40 | Line 931 This is a run-on sentence. It needs an “and” in the middle: “When the song finishes, the students share what they heard, and what they realized about the piece…” Additionally, the semi-colon before the list of guiding questions needs to be a regular colon. | Recommended |
| 37 | Crooks | 40 | Line 936 Remove the word “to” in the sentence: “The students to list” to make it grammatically correct. | Recommended |
| 38 | Crooks | 41 | Line 954 This is not a sentence: “Review student notes, and identify areas of growth.” Perhaps this belongs with the previous sentence or is missing words, but this section lacks clarity as currently written. | Recommended  correction: line 954 *Review*…. Take out period after *peers* insert a comma and lowercase *R*. |
| 39 | Crooks | 43 | Line 1017 Remove the word “to” in the sentence: “. . . discussion about to what gives them a good feeling . . .” to make it grammatically correct. | Recommended |
| 40 | Stuber | 43 | Please note at line 1017, the word “to” should be eliminated. The sentence should read “Students and teacher engage in a class discussion about what gives them a good feeling …”. | Recommended |
| 41 | Williams | 44 | Lines 1041-1069 Love this section! Student-centered classrooms are so needed in a domain that has long been director-centered and in some cases authoritarian. | Non-Actionable |
| 42 | Crooks | 47 | Please add the word “when” to the sentence: “A strong culture of trust and respect must also be part of the classroom (when) using digital . . .” for clarity. The students are using the digital devices and not the classroom. | Recommended |
| 43 | Crooks | 48 | Change “devises” to “devices” for accuracy. | Recommended |
| 44 | Crooks | 50 | Line 1223 Should the word “and” be added to the list “cultural, social, historical context” to make it grammatically correct? | Recommended |
| 45 | Williams | 50 | Lines 1181-1218 This is an excellent vignette for proficient-level composition. | Non-Actionable |
| 46 | Crooks | 53 | Lines 1294-1296 The opening parenthesis is missing here. Please add in the appropriate place. | Writers’ Discretion: entire vignette to be revised |
| 47 | Williams | 53 | Lines 1291-1293 Please remove the last half of the sentence: “To prepare the teacher finds or creates some short film clips with the sound removed <bs>~~or removes the sound by dropping into DAW and removing the sound track—exporting the movie back out as M4v)~~.”<es> This is covered in the first part of the sentence, which says “… the teacher finds or creates…” We don’t need explicit directions in how to do that. | Writers’ Discretion: entire vignette to be revised |
| 48 | Williams | 53–55 | Lines 1286-1347 Move lines 1294-1295 (how partners are assigned) to line 1319 where students partner-up. (Or line 1326, if that is where the partners are assigned? It isn’t clear.)  Move lines 1296-1297 (description of the final presentation) and 1304-1307 (how they will be assessed) to around line 1343, where those paragraphs would be more appropriate. | Writers’ Discretion: entire vignette to be revised |
| 49 | Crooks | 56 | Line 1399 Does the use of the word “playing” exclude vocalists? I would imagine it is intentional to not use the word “performing” so perhaps it could be changed to “playing or singing” to be inclusive. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 50 | Williams | 57 | Lines 1400-1402 “The music standards call for multiple approaches in the way students are assessed. The product of what students create, such as a performance or a composition, is not the sole measurement of student learning and growth.” Yes, yes, yes! When we teach to the standards, we must assess much more than just showing up to a concert. | Non-Actionable |
| 51 | Williams | 59 | Lines 1447-1448 The sentence “…allowing the teacher to use a students’ Zone of Proximal Development…” has the apostrophe in the wrong place. One student = “use a student’s ZPD…” vs. many students = “use students’ ZPD…” (no “a” before “students”). | Recommended |
| 52 | Crooks | 60 | Line 1476 Please remove the word “the” at the start of the line for clarity.  Line 1485 The sentence appears to be missing a word. I would suggest adding the word “to” so the final phrase reads “feedback is essential to learning (in) music.” Please adjust the punctuation and/or grammar in this sentence for clarity. | Recommended |
| 53 | Crooks | 60 | Line 1502 Please adjust this sentence for clarity. It is not clear what the author is saying so it is difficult to suggest a specific change. Perhaps changing “identifying” to “identify” and then starting a new sentence after the word “producing” would help | Recommended: change to *identify*, put a period after *producing*, and start next sentence with *The teacher can then lead…* |
| 54 | Crooks | 61 | Lines 1503–1505 Please adjust this sentence for clarity. It sounds redundant the way it is currently written. | Not Recommended |
| 55 | Crooks | 62 | Line 1536 Consider adding “hand position” to read “fingering or hand position?” to be inclusive of string students.  Line 1542 Change “or how to adjust something” to “or suggestions on how to adjust something” for clarity. | Recommended |
| 56 | Crooks | 63 | Line 1607 Please correct the spelling of the word “music”.  Line 1615 Please remove the first word “to” for clarity.  Lines 1616-1617 It seems that a phrase is missing from the end of this sentence. It is not clear what is being provided.  Line 1622 Please remove the second word “or” from the sentence for clarity.  Line 1624 Please remove one of the “in”s from the end of the sentence for clarity. | Writers’ Discretion: will revise for clarity |
| 57 | Liles | 65 | Line 1629 Thank you for putting this in the framework. It is important that administrators know what to expect regarding assessment for younger students. | Non-Actionable |
| 58 | Crooks | 68 | Line 1702 Please make a change: “grading process helps develop” or “grading process can help” because the use of “can helps” is not grammatically correct. | Recommended: change to *help* |
| 59 | Stuber | 68 | Please note at line 1702, either eliminate the “s” on the word “helps” or eliminate the word “can”. | Recommended |
| 60 | Williams | 68 | Lines 1695-1706 This is a nice little section on the Growth Model of Grading. It’s a paradigm shift for music teachers, but worth talking about. Assessment doesn’t always correspond to grading, but it should be closer. For years, music teachers have graded based on what’s important to them: performances. We need to demonstrate that we value many other skills as well, and a standards-based model of grading is one of those ways. | Non-Actionable |
| 61 | Crooks | 71 | Line 1787 Can suggestions be added for students for whom social skills are challenging either here or in the next paragraph? Music can indeed develop social skills, but this doesn’t happen naturally for all students and this is not addressed here. | Not Recommended |
| 62 | Crooks | 72 | Lines 1790-1800 The examples here only represent physical disabilities. Could at least one example be added to represent another type of disability? | Writers’ Discretion |
| 63 | Liles | 72 | These are helpful suggestions and very specific. (Refers to lines 1791–1795) | Non-Actionable |
| 64 | Williams | 72 | Lines 1812-1816 This is one long, incomprehensible sentence. Try shortening it, perhaps like this: “Teachers have a unique opportunity in creating these relationships, since they may have the same students over a period of several years, such as in elementary general music (PK-5), or through ensembles during middle school or high school.” | Recommended: change to *Music teachers have unique opportunities in creating these relationships, since they may have the same students over a period of several years, such as in elementary general music (PK-5), or through ensembles during middle school or high school.* |
| 65 | Liles | 73 | Although this is true, it is incredibly difficult to learn 600 names of students you see once or twice per week. It is odd to me that this is included in the framework. (Refers to line 1825) | No Motion Recommended |
| 66 | Crooks | 73 | Line 1833 Please change this line to be grammatically correct. | Recommended |
| 67 | Williams | 74 | Line 1857 Does this quote need punctuation at the end? | Recommended: add a period |
| 68 | Liles | 75 | I am glad that the text indicates that this is one teacher’s approach. The snapshots are helpful, generally, but I would be careful about expressing different approaches in such a way that it is read as fact. (Refers to Snapshot: One Choral Teachers Approach to a Student’s Changing Voice) | Non-Actionable |
| 69 | Williams | 75 | Lines 1875-1882 Calling out gender-specific vocal ensembles is not appropriate. Yes, it is important to encourage young singers and provide representation and diversity to show that everyone can be a singer. But our language in how we do that is important. Every student must have a place in a vocal-choral class. Using the terminology “gender-specific” is not inclusive for students who do not identify with a binary gender; on the contrary, it is exclusive language. How does this system work with students who are transgender, and whose voice part doesn’t match their identity? Describe these groups instead as part-based ensembles (e.g. treble ensemble, tenor-bass ensemble), or use different descriptive language entirely (e.g. “opportunities to sing with voices similar to their own”, etc.). The whole next section of writing speaks of sensitivity to LGBTQ+ students, yet in these lines gender is the criterion for dividing one’s ensembles, which is extra insensitive. | Recommended: delete *gender* *specific* in lines 1881 and 1885. |
| 70 | Crooks | 75 | Line 1907 Could a word be added to “singing past elementary” such as level or school to make the sentence more clear? | Recommended: add *school* after *elementary* |
| 71 | Crooks | 75 | Lines 1862–1887 Could information be added here to assist teachers with gender identity and gender specific choral ensembles? | Not Recommended |
| 72 | Crooks | 76 | Line 1906 Please change “become” to “became” for clarity. | Recommended |
| 73 | Crooks | 79 | Line 2001 Please change the beginning of this line to read either “struggling in making” or “struggling to make” for clarity. | Recommended |
| 74 | Crooks | 79–80 | Lines 2016-2022 Please adjust the tenses in this paragraph so they match. The first half is in the present tense and the second half is in the past tense. | Recommended: in line 2016 change *designs* to *designed* |
| 75 | Williams | 81 | Lines 2058-2064 The word “wheelchair” is one word (no spaces). Also, on line 2059, I had to read “music and mic stands that can lift easily” several times before realizing that it referred to music stands and mic stands. This could be confusing to other readers. | Recommended: line 2062, correct to *wheelchairs,* line 2062 add *music stands and microphone stands* |
| 76 | Liles | 83 | This is interesting. I would love to see the research.(Refers to lines 2101–2114) | Non-Actionable |
| 77 | Williams | 96 | Line 2229 Remove the commas in the phrase “…students begin the composition process through audiation, to hear, their composition within their own minds” so it becomes “students begin the composition process through audiation to hear their composition within their own minds.” | Recommended |
| 78 | Williams | 97 | Lines 2241-2243 Rephrase “The Kodaly method uses John Curwen (1843) solfege hand signs …” We call them Curwen hand signs, but if you’re using Curwen as the originator’s name, it needs to be possessive. Two options:  1. “The Kodaly method uses John Curwen’s solfege hand signs (1843) … “  2. “The Kodaly method uses the solfege hand signs created by John Curwen in 1843 …” | Recommended: change to *The Kodaly method uses the solfege hand signs created by John Curwen in 1843.* |
| 79 | Stuber | 103 | Please note at line 2409, even though this is a quote, I believe the word “is” is missing between music and brought so that the phrase should read “music is brought to life ...”. | Recommended: additional correction to line 2410, change *education* to *educational* |
| 80 | Stuber | 104 | Please note lines 2455-2456 read awkwardly. Do you mean to say “All humans want to be seen and heard and to participate in a positive creative environment that supports these very needs.”? | Recommended |
| 81 | Liles | 106 | This is very good as a guide for districts, particularly administrators and those who determine the music budgets and oversee spending. (Refers to lines 2508–2524) | Non-Actionable |
| 82 | Williams | 106 | Lines 2503-2505 Add the word “and” to this sentence: “Small percussion instruments, such as hand drums, rhythm sticks, tambourines, and found sounds, can be used by students to…” | Recommended |
| 83 | Stuber | 106 | Please note at line 2512, the “s” should be eliminated from “respects”. | Recommended |
| 84 | Crooks | 107 | Lines 2457-2458 Please change this sentence for clarity. | Not Recommended |
| 85 | Crooks | 109 | Line 2514 Please change “respects” to “respect” for grammar. | Recommended |
| 86 | Williams | 109 | Lines 2573-2574 I am glad to see recognition of the sound requirements for safe music classrooms. It might be noted that over 85 is considered unsafe, and OSHA says 90 decibels requires hearing protection. (Some information about OSHA standards is referred to later in lines 2591-2596.) | Not Recommended |
| 87 | Crooks | 113 | Line 2635 Remove the word “can” at the end of the line and replace it with the word “to”. | Recommended |
| 88 | Liles | 118 | This is an excellent lesson and would be very successful in a secondary music classroom. (Refers to lines 2832–2840) | Non-Actionable |
| 89 | Liles | 122 | This is something that should be discussed by district and school administration in regards to performances of religious works. I have worked in districts with different policies regarding the performance of religious music. I agree that it should be allowed, and I have perceived that sacred music sometimes makes students uncomfortable. I have questioned whether I should introduce spirituals for this reason. Particularly in the secondary learning environment, students should study the great composers. Many of these works are sacred. (Refers to lines 2908–2927) | Not Recommended |
| 90 | Liles | 123 | This is excellent. Many schools and districts are cautious about recording student performances due to privacy concerns. We have been instructed not to record and share performances. I would like to see this addressed. (Refers to line 2947–2951) | Not Recommended |
| 91 | Williams | 124 | Lines 2980-3004 It is necessary to call out specifically that music educators must also abide by copyright law for using sheet music, ASCAP licensing for performing music, and mechanical licenses (audio) or synchronization licenses (video) for legally recording school performances. | Not Recommended |
| 92 | Liles | 125 | Please don’t overlook music education as a career (teacher). (Refers to line 3010) | Not Recommended |
| 93 | Crooks | 125 | Line 3013 Remove “such as” and replace with “by” or “through” for clarity. | Recommended |
| 94 | Williams | 125 | Lines 3005-3041 It is great to have this section about the creative economy in California, and the fact that the careers in music are lucrative. | Non-Actionable |
| 95 | Liles | 128 | This is very helpful. (Refers to Glossary of Terms for California Arts Standards: Music) | Non-Actionable |
| 96 | Barber | n/a | (did not review, ran out of time) | Non-Actionable |
| 97 | Benavides | n/a | This is only realistic if a school district has a fully employed music faculty at each site that can teach sequential music. Otherwise, beginning groups in middle school and/or high school will have to use standards that are at an elementary level. | Non-Actionable |
| 98 | Cauchi | n/a | Much more specific vignettes need to be included for each standard at each level, i.e. sample lesson. | Not Recommended |
| 99 | Centeno | n/a | As a kindergarten teacher, I found that the aim of the music program at this age level is attainable because it encourages students to experience and explore music through movement. Children at this age learn best by being engaged in a fun manner. I also liked the fact that skills are built upon. The Vignette itself in the example seems a little unrealistic to accomplish in one lesson but can be broken down and completed in a few days. | Non-Actionable |
| 100 | Cortez | n/a | "Singing and music literacy skills." What are the literacy skills? | Non-Actionable |
| 101 | Darnaud | n/a | Grades 6-8 teachers need a strong musical background to teach the curriculum. | Non-Actionable |
| 102 | Ellis | n/a | It would be beneficial to have concrete examples of each standard so that teachers can use these a s a springboard to creating their own standards based lesson plans. | Not Recommended |
| 103 | Enciso | n/a | After reading pages 17-21, the information presented does not seem relatable for a teacher who does not have any music background information. There is a lot of information of what you will do or are expected to do, but does not tell you how to do it. Our district has been providing TELA for some teachers, being part of this has helped gain experience on how to teach music to students, if I were to have read the framework with out my professional development provided I would not know what the framework was talking about or how to approach it. Teachers do sing and chant in their classrooms. Make the vignette relatable to content that teachers are already teaching. Instead of using the example about bubble gum (pg 20) and brainstorming different bubble gums, tell the teacher to take content and turn it into a rhythm/beat. If teaching about solar system, then use that as your example, sun, sun, solar system, solar system.. Make it relatable. | Not Recommended |
| 104 | Garcia | n/a | The chapters within chapters are a confusing. I read the vignette starting on line 506. The organization of the lesson is not clear. Student groupings and number of groups should be at the beginning. Students are required to have a lot of background knowledge regarding music, singing, and melodic harmonies. Asking a group of 6th graders to complete these tasks is not realistic, I feel. The vignette does not make it clear how students should go about combining songs. As an adult, I feel I would struggle with this task as well. Is there are time recommendation for these lessons? | Non-Actionable |
| 105 | Gutierrez | n/a | The wording in the framework was very difficult to follow. For students that have little to no background knowledge because they have had no music instruction, this is not possible to teach to students in the upper grades. For teachers who are not a single subject teacher in this subject, it is very difficult or impossible to understand or even try to plan a lesson. The verbiage used is specific to this content but most teachers do not have this knowledge. | Non-Actionable |
| 106 | Hernandez | n/a | I think that having the opportunity to create content based music pieces is very helpful and it will help students make a connection. It also helps the teacher include music in the curriculum since it is connected to the content at hand. | Non-Actionable |
| 107 | Huesca | n/a | As a Tk teacher I agree with allowing students to explore and experience music through movement and play with teacher guidance. As they get more familiar with music and instruments you can gradually let students create on their own with less guidance. | Non-Actionable |
| 108 | Husselstein | n/a | God Bless whoever remembered to include the information on FACILITIES. Thank you, Thank you. Please consider adding in this section as well as the implementation section, that our spaces should include wash stations for sanitation purposes. (We band folk deal with a lot on mouthpieces and reeds. Ewww.) Grade level expectations could be more clearly defined, both visually, in the presentation on the page they get a little lost between the vignettes, and in content. Words and phrases repeated so many times across grade level spans make it hard to identify the new skills or DOK. If this document is going to be usable by the overwhelmed music instructor, it needs to be more accessible. We are often the only person in our discipline within a district and even with the increased funding, not all districts are giving the time for PD. | Non-Actionable |
| 109 | Lewis Morris | n/a | The vignettes need to link what is already occurring in the classroom and not be a separate activity for multiple subject teachers. For example in the vignette on pages 17-21, the teacher is using the words apples, pears then bubble gum but it needs to relate to what the students are learning. It is also unrealistic for the general teacher who does not have a musical background to read and implement. Just the music section would take all the time we have much less adding in all the other sections. Is the state going to fund visual and performing arts teachers at all elementary schools throughout the state? If not, then this needs to be reworked to be teacher friendly. | Non-Actionable |
| 110 | Mezin-williams | n/a | Vignettes could be implemented with support and training. There seemed to be some redundances. | Non-Actionable |
| 111 | Munoz | n/a | As a general education teacher, I feel that this would be beneficial to have a music teacher assisting and directing the music lessons. Just being honest, as a teacher with little or no background in music, I feel that this would be difficult to teach. As a TELA teacher, I have been exposed to some strategies and have found that using vocabulary that is being taught is one of the best means of teaching the strategies. | Non-Actionable |
| 112 | Perini | n/a | As a first grade teacher I am pleased to know that I am giving my students an opportunity to experience music activities that will build their success. I have been able to do this because I have the privilege to be a part of the TELA group in my district. This has given me training needed to be able to feel comfortable to teach with confidence. If I had not been able to do the training I would not feel comfortable to give my students a successful lesson. | Non-Actionable |
| 113 | Potter | n/a | Important connection of arts education, global competence, and social-emotional learning: "Given the diversity of the music classroom, all instruction should be culturally relevant to the students so that students see themselves and hear the music of their culture and social identity within their educational system. This validates the students as they see that who they are is found within the world of music and that all music, created by all people, is equally important." | Non-Actionable |
| 114 | Ramirez | n/a | The music framework was specific to the needs of our students, however California teachers have not received much training on teaching music. When I completed my credential program in 2006 only one unit of VAPA was required and I didn't explore any musical instruments, only a little bit of art and painting. I am not sure what is required nowadays for teachers receiving credentials but know that teachers who have already received their credential might not feel competent to teach this. | Non-Actionable |
| 115 | Segura-Diaz | n/a | In an IDEAL setting, this would be grandiose. In reality, this part of the document is "bloated."- totally unrealistic to do because of lack of training, lack of knowledge, and lack of time. For one, the language for a teacher who is not a music major is undefined. Students have little to no background knowledge and as a 6th grade teacher, I would be inclined to start with kindergarten to build knowledge through the grades. The examples do not relate to any of the content we teach and there are no strategies to help the teacher. My district is in a low SES area and I believe this is written for the middle to upper class white communities. Our state is multicultural and I do not feel that English Learners were addressed. I cannot afford to purchased my own materials or take educational classes to learn this. | Non-Actionable |
| 116 | Stuber | n/a | I have been a music teacher at the middle school level for 15 years and at the elementary school level for 7 years, as well as a 2nd grade classroom teacher for 6 years in the Vista Unified School District. I feel that Chapter 5: Music is thoroughly written, encompassing a wide breadth of topics pertinent to standards-based music education.  I appreciate the vignettes. They definitely help move the standards from abstract to concrete examples. | Non-Actionable |
| 117 | Tanaka | n/a | To be comfortable teaching music to K-6, even with some musical background, I would like a music specialist to assist me or have an Inservice to review musical terms, rhythm, and strategies to teach. Just like we have in services to review ELA, Math, Science, and ELD methodologies. | Non-Actionable |
| 118 | Thompson | n/a | 142 pages, really? This must be edited down, remove the lesson plans, that's the TEACHER's job. | Not Recommended |
| 119 | Williams | n/a | While there are things in this chapter that I suggest modifying, the music chapter overall addresses what it needs to. There were many sections that were comprehensive and well-written, and I called out a few of the most outstanding examples in my notes below. In general, I was impressed with the forward-thinking nature of this chapter, especially where it comes to technology, inclusion, and the shift of thinking required for educators to teach the new standards. | Non-Actionable |

## Table 9: Chapter 6: Theatre

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Brunel | 1 | The opening quote claiming, "[Acting] is not rocket science" is offensive. There are millions of quotes to use--please find one that doesn't immediately discount the difficult art of theatre. Again, all of your samples should be backward planned/presented, not forward as given. Stick to one format--you either want people to backward plan (in which case the samples should model that) or you don't. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 2 | Barber | n/a | (did not review, ran out of time) | Non-Actionable |
| 3 | Potter | n/a | Exactly: Essential Question: What happens when theatre artists allow an understanding of themselves and the world to inform perceptions about theatre and the purpose of their work? | Non-Actionable |

## Table 10: Chapter 7: Visual Arts

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Van Dewark | 1 | Line 11 “support their unique voices” to “support students’ unique voices” | Recommended |
| 2 | Van Dewark | 2 | Line 26 “that will support students” to “that support students | Recommended |
| 3 | Barber | 36 | Line 687 Delete comma after “architecture”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 4 | Barber | 37 | Line 730 Change phrase “copyright versus fair use” to “copyright, fair use and public domain.”  Reason: Intellectual property concepts  Note: First, fair use is a component of the aspects of copyright protections, not an adversarial status. Second, the inclusion of the term and concept of public domain should be included so educators and students have a clear understanding that older works and/or works that are voluntarily in the public domain have much more flexibility when it comes to usage and appropriation. | Recommended |
| 5 | Barber | 40 | Line 807 Change “One approach to centers” to “One approach to the centers model”  Reason: Clarity  Note: Confusion of centers the noun and centers the verb | Recommended: revise sentence to read *One approach is the use of centers to provide a new…* |
| 6 | Van Dewark | 43 | Line 868 “The student move as a team” to “Students move as team” | Recommended |
| 7 | Barber | 45 | Line 926 Add “public domain” after “copyright”  Reason: Intellectual property concepts  Note: Needed concept for IP | Recommended |
| 8 | Barber | 57 | Line 1251 Bold “Understanding”  Reason: Typo | Recommended |
| 9 | Barber | 65 | Line 1456-7 Should be “Chapter 2: Instructional Cycle”  Reason: Consistent style | Recommended |
| 10 | Barber | 65 | Line 1471 Delete comma after “Students” and comma after “visual arts”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended: revise to read *Visual arts students are required to assess…* |
| 11 | Barber | 82 | Line 1890 Insert “a” before “time-honored  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 12 | Barber | 82 | Line 1892 Insert comma after “available”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended: revise to read *When space is not available, a camera can be used to project the demonstration to the class and a thoughtful seating chart can be used to support and benefit all students.* |
| 13 | Barber | 82 | Line 1893 Insert “the action” after “project” and delete “the” before “thoughtful”  Reason: Clarity | Writers’ Discretion |
| 14 | Barber | 86 | Line 1992 Insert comma after “support”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 15 | Barber | 87 | Line 2017 Delete comma after “Affective”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 16 | Barber | 87 | Line 2022 New paragraph after “should look like.”  Reason: New thought  Note: Paragraph on perfectionism issue important and should stand separate from the other emotional sensitivity issues. | Not Recommended |
| 17 | Barber | 87 | Line 2022 Delete “the double-edged sword of giftedness”  Reason: Subjective statement  Note: Not necessary, and perfectionism does not apply solely to students categorized as gifted and talented – see next comment | Recommended |
| 18 | Barber | 87 | Line 2023 Add in comment that perfectionism does not only affect those who have been characterized as gifted and talented learners. Suggestion: “Perfectionism may drive all learners, especially advanced learners, and may torment them when the results do not fulfill their expectations of perfection.”  Reason: Inclusive, clarity  Note: This paragraph was initially troubling because of the assumption that only gifted and talented suffer from the perfectionism issue. Recommend inclusivity for this topic | Writers’ Discretion |
| 19 | Barber | 103 | Line 2218 Add comma after “ceramics and,”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended: revise to read *All schools should have access to kilns for firing ceramics. At the high school level school should have welding spaces for working in metals.* |
| 20 | Barber | 103 | Line 2224-5 Adjust sentence for clarity – recommend: “Use and safety rules must be posted by all equipment to remind students that when equipment is in use, what required actions are necessary in case of a malfunction or emergency, including shut-off safety valves and other safety procedures.”  Reason: Clarity  Note: Current sentence is awkward | Recommended |
| 21 | Barber | 104 | Line 2236 Replace “teachers” with “educators”  Reason: Inclusive of all staff  Note: Other educators such as teaching aids, teaching artists, administrators, etc may be applicable here. | Not Recommended |
| 22 | Barber | 105 | Line 2251 Replace “Teachers” with “Educators”  Reason: Inclusive of all staff  Note: Safety protocols are not just the responsibility of the classroom teacher, but of all school (and sometimes district) staff. | Not Recommended |
| 23 | Barber | 105 | Line 2260 Insert comma after “clean-up”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 24 | Barber | 105 | Line 2264 End sentence after “spray guns”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 25 | Barber | 105 | Line 2268 Replace “Teachers” with “Educators”  Reason: Inclusive of all staff  Note: See previous note. Important here because sometimes the classroom teacher has to coordinate with staff who order supplies | Not recommended. |
| 26 | Barber | 105 | Line 2277 Replace “problems with dusty…” with “medial issues with dusty …”  Reason: Clarity  Note: The word “problem” already used in sentence, and “problem” not specific enough to clarity the medical issue | Recommended: *…with medical issues with dusty….* |
| 27 | Barber | 106 | Line 2280 Insert comma after “charcoal”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 28 | Barber | 106 | Line 2286 Change “asthmas” to “asthma”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 29 | Barber | 106 | Line 2288 Change “used” to “utilized in instruction”  Reason: Clarity  Note: “Use” is in current sentence twice | Recommended |
| 30 | Barber | 106 | Line 2292 Delete “Don’t” and insert “Teach students to not …”  Reason: Clarity  Note: is for the students, but sentence reads for the educator | Not Recommended |
| 31 | Barber | 106 | Line 2297-9 Adjust sentence(s) for clarity: “Permanent felt tip markers contain solvents. While newer brands contain the less-toxic propyl alcohol, this can be an eye, nose and throat irritant nonetheless.”  Reason: Clarity and emphasis of important detail  Note: Adjusted sentences: | Not Recommended |
| 32 | Barber | 106 | Line 2303 Add “permanent” after “alcohol-based” “than other permanent markers with different solvents”  Reason: Clarity  Note: Water based are safer than permanent, but this sentence before edit implies that alcohol-based are less than water based | Not Recommended |
| 33 | Barber | 107 | Line 2321 Put semicolon after “glazes”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 34 | Barber | 108 | Line 2326 Put comma before “even electric kilns”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 35 | Barber | 108 | Line 2333 Delete “the teach and the student artist” and insert “the educators and the student artists”  Reason: Clarity, inclusive of all staff | Not Recommended |
| 36 | Barber | 110 | Line 2399 Add beginning sentence in paragraph that is inclusive of multiple mediums, such as “Students and educators must be aware of the proper protocols and legalities of the use of copyright-protected works in the visual arts, including the use of components for collage, assemblage, found-object and social-commentary artwork.”  Reason: Include copyright issues not yet addressed  Note: This is important! | Recommended |
| 37 | Barber | 110 | Line 2407 New paragraph before “The very concept”  Reason: Stand-alone importance  Note: This is a new thought, needs new paragraph | Recommended |
| 38 | Barber | 110 | Line 2409 Delete comma after “they”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 39 | Barber | 111 | Line 2411 Inclusion of new sentence and terms like public domain, fair use, trademark protection, copyright, et. Also address the issue of assigning rights and conflicts that can occur with artwork that has many contributors. Also mention public-art requirements and protections – very important for visual arts programs that produce artwork that is incorporated into school buildings and grounds  Reason: Needed topic  Note: The issues here are very important! Please include. For suggested language see the media arts chapter; new language needed for the public art and multiple-contributor artwork issue | Writers’ Discretion |
| 40 | Barber | 111 | Line 2423 Heading needed: “Digital Citizenship”  Reason: Clarity?  Note: This feels like a section | Not Recommended |
| 41 | Barber | 111 | Line 2427 Additional information about the importance of digital citizenship when considering the personal nature of sharing artwork.  Reason: Needed topic  Note: Suggestion: “Clearly explaining digital citizenship expectations from students can be very important when considering the personal nature of visual art creation and reflection.” | Recommended |
| 42 | Barber | 112 | Line 2445 Delete “such as Apple, Disney and Google”  Reason: Product placement  Note: Sentence acts as an advertisement for these companies; inappropriate | Recommended |
| 43 | Van Dewark | 112 | Line 2445 “Creative companies, such as Apple, Disney, and Google, look for” consider omitting specific company names. | Not Recommended |
| 44 | Barber | 112 | Line 2452 Replace “with” with “and”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 45 | Van Dewark | 113 | Anni Albers quote used on 4 & 113 | Not Recommended |
| 46 | Barber | 116 | Line 2557 Inclusion of copyright internationally  Reason: Important concept  Note: (?? Not sure, see what Library of Congress says?)  Line 2558 Note that “Creative Commons” is a nonprofit organization that provides copyright license templates  Reason: Important concept  Note: Creative Commons is also trademarked, I believe  Line 2607 Inclusion of definition of Intellectual Property  Reason: Important concept  Note: See global note | Not Recommended |
| 47 | Cooley | n/a | Thoroughly comprehensive! Snapshots and vignettes add real life context and examples that will support instruction and learning | Non-Actionable |
| 48 | Potter | n/a | Another Important connection of arts education, global competence, and social-emotional learning: "The visual arts standards ask students to work in collaboration and to brainstorm which are both necessary skills for a global society. Teachers of visual arts nurture in students’ qualities of social awareness, considering the perspectives of others, and empathy through teaching toward the arts standards." | Non-Actionable |
| 49 | Ruben | n/a | The Essential Questions and Enduring Understandings are well written and encourage open-ended thinking. However, the standards in each of the categories are too open-ended to the point of being considered vague. More guidance with art projects needs to be provided. Otherwise, I'm concerned that many teachers will ignore the Core Standards and teach familiar and outdated projects. New teachers may not know how to embrace the standards and feel confused with what to teach. There need to be sample lessons of what possible lessons which embrace the Core Standards would look like. While there are references to artists, how many arts teachers and going to read through any document? They will head directly to the grade level Core Standards tables. The examples need to be placed closer to the Core chart pages. Have less text so that teachers may be more included to read about suggested artists and practices. The Studio Habits of Mind need to be introduced earlier in this document, ideally closer to the beginning. How about providing links to each resource listed such as the Library of Congress, etc.? | Not Recommended |
| 50 | Van Dewark | n/a | The examples of how to look at standards provide clear models. Including UDL Guidelines and ELA/ELD considerations in this chapter supports all student learning. | Non-Actionable |

## Table 11: Chapter 8: Transcending Disciplinary Boundaries

| # | Source | Page | Line number(s) and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Bauguil et al. | 1 | Line 1 Chapter Title – Title is confusing and long-winded. Please rename the title to include the words “arts integration”. I would suggest “Arts Integration Considerations.” | Writers’ Discretion. Potential New Title: *Transcending Disciplinary Boundaries—Arts Integration* |
| 2 | Bauguil et al. | 1 | Line 1 Transcending Disciplinary Boundaries: maybe too complicated and ambitious? I suggest using: “Arts integration: Teaching in and with the arts”? | Not Recommended |
| 3 | Bauguil et al. | 1 | Line 1 Change title to include the word “Integration.” | Writers’ Discretion: see comment 1 |
| 4 | Bauguil et al. | 1 | Line 1 Quotes - All chapter Quotes: Quote – Please choose a quote that is arts integration specific, current, and from an arts integration expert. | Writers’ Discretion: review and replace quotes as chapter is revised |
| 5 | Dagani | 1 | Line 1 I really appreciate the connection to the Beyoncé quote - very creative! | Non-Actionable |
| 6 | Barber | 1 | Line 4 Replace quote  Reason: Quote not applicable  Note: This chapter is about the arts transcending the narrow field and integrating with other subjects. But Beyonce is an artist first and foremost, which makes this quote somewhat weak as an introduction to this topic | Writers’ Discretion: review and replace quotes as chapter is revised |
| 7 | Fennell | 1 | Line 8 Change ‘in’ to ‘through’ | Not Recommended |
| 8 | Pilhoefer | 1 | Line 8 Change ‘in’ to ‘through’ | Not Recommended |
| 9 | Fennell | 1 | Line 9 Provide powerful pathways of cognitive engagement and motivation for students –  change to: provide powerful pathways of cognitive and creative engagement as well as motivation for students | Recommend |
| 10 | Pilhoefer | 1 | Lines Replace “powerful pathways of cognitive engagement and motivation for students. The arts disciplines offer unique ways of learning about, experiencing, knowing, and exploring the world” with: .... dynamic pathways of interdisciplinary teaching and learning that not only connects the arts to other academic subjects, but also explores how the arts is a vehicle for making meaning for students and the world. | Not Recommended |
| 11 | Barber | 1 | Line 10-11 Write to read “unique ways of experiencing, knowing, exploring and learning about the world”  Reason: Clarity  Note: Better construction by putting the “about” at the end of list | Recommend: revise to read *The arts disciplines offer unique ways of experiencing, knowing, exploring, and learning about the world.* |
| 12 | Bauguil et al. | 1 | Line 11 Rearrange wording to translate and understand abstract feelings, ideas, and inquiries. | Writer Discretion |
| 13 | Fennell | 1 | Line 11 The arts positively impact student learning and their school communities.  Change to: The arts positively impact student learning and the interconnected school communities. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 14 | Fennell | 1 | Line 13 - They improve cognition, memory, risk-taking, higher order thinking, and creativity.  Change to: They enhance cognition, self-efficacy, memory, risk-taking, higher order thinking, and creativity. | Recommend: change to read  *They improve and enhance cognition, memory, self-efficacy, risk-taking, higher order thinking, and creativity.* |
| 15 | Pilhoefer | 1 | Line 13- replace “improve cognition” with “foster metacognitive skills” | Not recommended |
| 16 | Fennell | 1 | Line 16 - literature, sciences, history, environment, and social issues.  Change to: literature, sciences, history, environment, personal and social issues. | Recommended |
| 17 | Fennell | 1 | Line 18 - essential component in impactful arts integration.  Change to: essential component in all arts instruction, including arts integration. | Recommended |
| 18 | Barber | 1 | Line 20 Insert a comma after “instruction”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 19 | Fennell | 1 | Line 23 - discrete subject-specific boundaries through connecting the dots.  Change to: discrete subject-specific boundaries through content connections. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 20 | Bauguil et al. | 1 | Lines 17–23 The word ‘discrete’ is used three times but is not defined. Please define ‘discrete.’ | Writers’ Discretion: define discrete within the text or as a note/call-out box |
| 21 | Pilhoefer | 1 | Line 17-23 replace “intentionally, respectfully, meaningfully, and appropriately design and implement integrated instruction they provide students with opportunities to discover connections and to synthesize learning. Arts integrated curriculum augments and extends discrete discipline-specific arts and non-arts learning. Student learning then is able to transcend discrete subject-specific boundaries through connecting the dots.” With “Teachers can use the arts to differentiate instruction through multiple modes of representation, expression, and engagement. Arts integration increases collaboration through sharing knowledge and skills across fields, resulting in engagement in high-quality instructional practice.” | Not Recommended |
| 22 | Engdahl | 2 | Replace Emphasis Quote line 34 (Bresler) with: "I never the thought the arts could be so easily embedded in other curricular areas. The amount of possibilities, frameworks and activities I have seen and participated in make me wonder how much more can be done and in what other ways the arts can be integrated. I look forward to continue investigating and looking around for ways to create more open, equitable and diverse learning activities that allow my students to learn and express at the same time! Abel Guzman, Integrated Learning Specialist Program, Alameda County Office of Education." | Not Recommended |
| 23 | Pilhoefer | 2 | Line 40 There needs to be some definition of arts integration before speaking to approaches. Silverstein and Layne define arts integration as “an approach to teaching in which students construct and demonstrate understanding through an art form Students engage in a creative process, which connects an art form to another subject area and meets evolving objectives in both” (2010, para 3) | Not Recommended |
| 24 | Barber | 2 | Line 40 Replace “have” with “has”  Reason: Clarity  Note: Range is singular | Recommended |
| 25 | Pilhoefer | 2 | Line 42 Research has delved deeper to focus on the affects of integration on meta cognition (Sternberg, 1985). Similarly, there are many strategies in creativity that are visible in contemporary art (Marshall, 2010), also applicable to research in science (Miller, 2000), and creativity in all areas of inquiry (Cropley, 1992; Sawyer, 2006). | Not Recommended |
| 26 | Pilhoefer | 2 | Line 42 “Insert: Although, the last three decades of research has posed the arts at the center of innovative ideas the reform the structure of curriculum (Chappell, 2005; Krug & Cohen-Evron, 2000; Gude,2004, Walker, 2001)” after models. | Not Recommended |
| 27 | Pilhoefer | 2 | Line 43 starting with “Arts education researcher” This should be a separate paragraph on the benefits of arts integration | Not Recommended |
| 28 | Barber | 2 | Line 44 Delete comma after “creativity”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 29 | Pilhoefer | 2 | Line 46 Insert: Arts integration opens opportunities for students to develop 21st century learning skills to include creativity, collaboration, communication, critical thinking/problem solving (Bellisario and Donovan, 2012). | Not Recommended |
| 30 | Barber | 2 | Line 46 Define the Kennedy Center (because there are others)  Reason: Accuracy  Note: To separate this from, say, the Kennedy Center at BYU (international relations), consider using the entire name of the organization (The John F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts) – also note that there are different programs (CETA, ARTSEDGE) … where did this one come from? | Not Recommended |
| 31 | Engdahl | 1–3 | REPLACE LINES – 8 – 23 with the following: The arts are inherantly integrative as disciplines. The opening moments of Oklahoma! Are a perfect integration of theatre, music, and visual arts. Later the psychological complexity of the main character’s dilemma can only be expressed through dance. The newest addition to the arts standards, media arts, defines itself as transdisciplinary. Artists such as Beyoncé produce work that integrates all disciplines. In order to have a complete arts education, students need to understand and experience how the arts integrate with one another. At the same time the arts exist in society, culture, and the world, influenced by and influencing them. Artists create using their own experiences and knowledge base and explore themes related to all aspects of the world – art, math, literature, the sciences. Astronaut Alan Bean found that the profundity of walking on the moon could only be fully communciated through painting.  Arts Integration can be a powerful tool to make schools more equitable, especially those urban schools with formulaic curriculum that stifle student and teacher creativity, flexibility, and originality. (Donahue & Stuart, 2010). Dr. Julia Marshall (2010), SFSU Distinguished Professor of Art Education Emeritus states that "Integration is a significant, lively, and authentic art practice today and, therefore, studying about art and integrating it are compatible." Curricular Integration is an important concept in Linked Learning or Academy model high schools. In a medical high school the art teacher must use the curricular theme of the school as the basis for art lessons, just as a math teacher must integrating the arts in a performing arts high school. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 32 | Engdahl cont. | 1–3 | Dr. Hardiman, Director of the Neuro-Education Initiative at Johns Hopkins School of Education, states, “Arts integration should not replace arts education…” (2019) and that is not the intention of this chapter. However, arts integration when intentionally used is a powerful learning tool that cannot nor should not be diminshed or ignored. Students particiapting in arts-integrated lessons are 4.4 times more likley to be highly thoughtful and highly engaged than in regular classroom instruction. (Perpich Center for Arts Educatiuon, 2014) Students who particpated in arts integrated units were able to see multiple perspecitves in a situation, have better classroom dialogue, notice and respect personal boundaries, and to critique others in productive, non-hurtful ways. (Broussard, 2011). In eight underperforming schools across the nation that implemented an arts-integrated curriculum, the avergae improvement in math proficiency over four years was 22.5 percent. Reading proficiency improved by 12.6 percent. (Abodeely, 2015) Arts integration can have a dramatic effect on student attendance rates (Jensen 2002; Walker, Tabone, & Weltsek, 2011) It can also lead to a decrease in referrals and suspensions (Nobori, 2012) and increased intrinsic motivation (DeMoss & Morris, 2002).  When teachers of arts and other content areas intentionally, respectfully, meaningfully, and correctly design and implement integrated instruction that provides students with opportunities to discover connections and synthesize learning in an arts discipline with another arts discipline or subject area, students’ can transcend discrete subject-specific boundaries to connect the dots of their learning. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 33 | Romano | 1–3 | Thank you for the opportunity to share my comments regarding the draft of the California Arts Framework. The arts are vital to our students’ development. I have taught K, 1, 2, and third grades in public schools since the mid 1990s in the counties of Sacramento, El Dorado, and currently in San Diego. I have witnessed a wide range of investment in arts education. Most recently, our school lost funding for our music education teacher. While I continue to offer informal music experiences incorporated across disciplines, the loss is poignant and palpable.  Chapter 8: Transcending Disciplinary Boundaries is of particular interest to me as an educator.  The discussion in lines 17-67 is critical, and I appreciate the direct and plain discussion. Discrete arts instruction must be present for arts integration to occur. I recognize many instances where arts activities or engagements are included with instruction in other content areas and its called arts integration, but there is actually no instruction in the arts and no assessment of learning in the arts. I would like to see it added in this section (line 67, after the first sentence of the paragraph) that while many elementary teachers like myself use movement, singing, drawing, and role playing to help students understand and process learning across the curriculum, this chapter must clarify that using the arts as instructional strategies to teach other content areas is not arts education. | Writers’ Discretion: strengthen or clearly state what is not arts education |
| 34 | Stuber | 1–3 | I appreciate the clear identification of the need for “Sequential, standards-based, discrete instruction in the disciplines of the arts is an essential component in impactful arts integration.” (lines 17-18) and how “Intentional integration can serve as a nexus between students’ discrete content area learning and connecting learning can deepen conceptual understanding …” (lines 64-66). Arts learning through integration cannot take place without discrete learning in the content areas that are integrated. Too often I see or hear of colleagues that believe they are integrating the arts with other content areas but are in fact just using the arts as instructional tools. I think it is important to clearly state (after the quote line 61) that singing, dancing, acting, and drawing are effective mnemonic devices and help with information processing, however when the arts are used in this way, it is not arts education. | Writers’ Discretion: see previous comment |
| 35 | Dagani | 2 | Lines 33-182: I have not read Bresler’s research, but appreciate the inclusion of her work. However, there are other leading experts currently involved with Arts Integration application. Including reference to these professionals would be additionally valuable to the GE classroom teacher who is looking to learn more on “how to” incorporate Arts Integration. | Not Recommended |
| 36 | Barber | 3 | Line 53 Insert comma after “teachers”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 37 | Barber | 3 | Line 56 Replace the period after “approaches” with a comma and replace “However,” with “but”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 38 | Williams | 3 | Lines 58-62 I approve of this quote as well as the final sentence, “For students to gain the most value and benefits from arts integration approaches students need sequential, standards-based arts learning.” This stresses the importance of learning and comprehension within the arts discipline, and not just tacking on a “fun arts activity”. | Non-Actionable |
| 39 | Fennell | 3 | Lines 55-56 - disciplines through the Arts Standards four artistic processes and another subject area or areas.  Change to - disciplines through the four artistic processes of the Arts Standards and content of other subject areas. | Recommended |
| 40 | Barber | 3 | Line 62 Insert a comma after “approaches” and replace “students need” with “they need”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 41 | Pilhoefer | 3 | Line 63 Remove the word "arts" and add: learning through an authentic arts integration model that honors each academic content area. | Recommended: revise to read *To gain the value and benefit from arts integration, students need sequential, standards-based arts learning and instruction utilizing effective arts integration approaches that honor each academic content area addressed.* |
| 42 | Engdahl | 3 | Line 63 – add to paragraph “In Arts Integration: Teaching Subject Matter Through the Arts in Multicultural Settings (2017) Goldberg states that ‘what is unique to arts integration is the attention on the process of learning in the arts to engage discipline learning outside of the arts.’ Arts integration can be a means to include special needs students, who have equal rights to high quality learning experiences in the arts. VSA urges the integration of special needs into all arts activities integrating authentic learning in the arts builds learning in all subjects.” | Not Recommended |
| 43 | Stuber | 3 | The sentence “Intentional and strategic integration can also address issues of ‘time’ in the elementary classroom” (lines 66-67) may mislead the readers into believing that arts integration will involve less time. This misunderstanding may only reinforce the use of the arts as instructional tools. In lieu of that sentence, consider replacing with (in lines 66-67) “Intentional and strategic integration can allow instruction in two content areas concurrently in the elementary classroom.” | Recommended |
| 44 | Barber | 3 | Line 65 Insert comma after first use of “learning”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 45 | Pilhoefer | 3 | Line 67 Insert sentence: While integration is not meant to fill time in the school day, it is meant to be carefully planned so as to teach multiple learning objectives, academic standards, activities and assessment (Burnaford et al., 2001). | Not Recommended |
| 46 | Barber | 3 | Line 68 Replace “teachers” in this line with “they”  Reason: Clarity  Note: Teachers are the main subject of this sentence | Recommended |
| 47 | Pilhoefer | 4 | Line 83 Add sentence before [“teachers in classrooms..”]: Arts integration intentionally makes connections within the curriculum that draws from collaboration amongst teachers and their expertise to promote authentic learning through and with the arts (Robinson, 2011). | Writers’ Discretion |
| 48 | Pilhoefer | 4 | Condense highlighted areas [refers to lines 85–214] so that there is a more welcoming introduction to approaches using Burnaford's definition: Because there is no one definition of Arts Integration, it can be defined within the three approaches to learning: arts integration as learning through and within the arts, arts integration as a way to create curricular connections, and arts integration as collaborative engagement (Burnaford, 2007). In looking at the three approaches holistically, arts can be defined as a method of making curricular connections that uses collaboration to engage all in promoting learning through and within the arts (Robinson, 2011). | Not Recommended |
| 49 | Cooley | 4 | Line 88 Bresler’s four styles of arts integration and the short explanation of each style is very helpful and insightful. | Non-Actionable |
| 50 | Barber | 4 | Line 91 Insert comma after “style”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 51 | Williams | 4 | Lines 87-135 The use of Bresler’s four styles of arts integration is very smart. In descriptions and examples of the subservient, affective, and social-integration integrations, it is obvious to the reader that the arts are superficially used in these forms of integration. Language like “students are offered little or no direct, explicit arts instruction” makes this very clear. Using a combined definition of arts integration that reflects Bresler’s co-equal/cognitive style and the Kennedy Center’s definition of arts integration is the way I want arts integration to be implemented. | Non-Actionable |
| 52 | Barber | 5 | Line 99 Replace “dance teacher” with “dance educator”  Reason: Accuracy, inclusive  Note: With the single-subject certification in dance so recent, many dance educators may not be accurately described as “dance teachers” so “dance educator” is a more inclusive term | Not Recommended |
| 53 | Barber | 5 | Line 104-106 Adjustment of the sentence to read “The three other styles that Bresler identified as arts integration are subservient, affective, and social integration. These are explained here in brief to illustrate the differences in approaches, but are not necessarily recommended for fully comprehensive arts integration programming.”  Reason: Accuracy, clarity | Writers’ Discretion |
| 54 | Engdahl | 6 | Line 144 – The assumption in the line is incorrect – all credentialed multiple subject teachers are approved by the Commission on Teacher Credentialing to teach all subjects areas and to imply that there are some multiple subject teachers “who are knowledgeable and have disciplinary skills in the subject area” and that are are some who do NOT possess those skills contradicts the scope of their credential. While there may different skill levels we would never say that some multiple subject teachers should stay away from math. | Non-Actionable |
| 55 | Engdahl | 5 | Sentence beginning line 145 does not recognize student agency. Sentence should read. " To begin the process of developing an arts integrated unit or lesson, teachers should identify the the type of curriculum that is most appropriate for their students' learning." | Writers’ Discretion |
| 56 | Bauguil et al. | 5–6 | Thank you for including Bresler’s four styles of arts integration, as they still accurately describe the status of the arts in today’s schools. However, only the co-equal/cognitive style represents what integration should be. The three other styles portrait the arts as being used to support other activities, and should not be confused with arts integration. Many teachers and administrators who do not have an art background may not see the differences between the styles. We suggest making this distinction clear in the document. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 57 | Romano | 5–6 | I appreciate that Bressler’s styles of integration are included. They articulate the different methods of integration succinctly. It should be directly stated that the “subservient style” and “affective style” are not true arts education as the objectives in these styles are not for arts learning, but rather for learning objectives in other academic areas. Bressler’s models reflect my own approach as a general education teacher. However, I would like to see additional clarification added to lines 107-113 and 114-125 stating that the arts can be used in these ways but should not be called arts education when used in service of learning in another content area or for creating a positive classroom climate.  My experience is that schools in California are over-dependent on subservient models which dilutes student learning in the arts. It would be helpful for this chapter to include examples comparing “commonly seen” subservient examples to examples that would be considered “co-equal”. With a side by side comparison, it will be more evident to teachers and administrators how the subservient model lacks a standards based approach. A snapshot or vignette comparing the two would be helpful. For example, showing how a drawing “activity” in a science lesson where students are drawing but not provided instruction in visual arts concepts, skills, or vocabulary, could be developed to include authentic visual arts instruction and become “co-equal”.  I often hear from teachers and administrators that integration can be the “easy solution” for not having enough time or resources to offer quality arts education. This is deeply worrisome. Integration must not replace purposeful learning based in arts standards. When our school lost our music teacher, our students lost the opportunity for sequential, expertly planned lessons leading to mastery of music standards. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 58 | Stuber | 5 | The discussion of Bressler’s styles of integration is effective in illustrating different integration styles. However, I would like to see it clearly stated after line 113 that the subservient style is not true arts education. Again, after line 125, I would like to see it clearly stated that the affective style is not true arts education. I often see educators calling examples of both styles arts education. I am relieved to see this discussion included in the framework and want it to stay. While the subservient style and the affective style are effective in classroom management and instructional practices, the framework must keep this clear distinction. Care must be taken with the social-integration style to again be clear that this style is not true arts education, while not discouraging educators from including performances as part of the school culture. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 59 | Williams | 6 | Lines 142-151 It is interesting to talk about arts integration as only happening between two credentialed educators. There should also be a mention about arts integration in which one educator has the background and skill to integrate the arts without a partner. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 60 | Barber | 6 | Line 144 Delete comma after “others”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 61 | Engdahl | 6–30 | Lines 154, 235, 540, 705, 739 Delete “careful” or “carefully”, the modifer is unnecessary. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 62 | Stuber | 7 | I would like to see it directly stated at line 137 that the purpose of the CA Arts Framework is to provide guidance for arts education and the subservient, affective, and social-integration styles are not arts education, but serve other educational purposes. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 63 | Williams | 7 | Lines 157-159 It would be worthwhile to emphasize that this sentence means that student learning should be assessed in the arts as well as the other content area. This is covered later, but is good to state clearly throughout. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 64 | Barber | 7 | Line 179 Delete “any” and add “if” after “modifications”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 65 | Stuber | 7 | Please note at line 180, “to” is missing from the sentence between the words “able” and “implement”. | Recommended |
| 66 | Cooley | 8 | Line 183 Also Approaches to Arts Integration: Multidisciplinary—Interdisciplinary—Transdisciplinary, with explanations, snapshot and vignette examples are extremely helpful in understanding and supporting conversation around arts integration. | Non-Actionable |
| 67 | Dagani | 8 | Lines 183-765 There is too much precious real estate in this chapter dedicated to theoretical applications of Integration (Drake & Burns, and Fogarty models). The purpose of this document is to provide practical application of Integration. Why is there so much discussion of theory? This is NOT practical for the CA teachers who are new to A.I. (both general classroom and art specialist), and are looking for a way to integrate the arts into their curriculum. Teachers need examples, not theory! | Writers’ Discretion |
| 68 | Barber | 8 | Line 202-205 Replace or eliminate quote  Reason: Confusing  Note: I don’t understand this quote, and it doesn’t add a benefit to this paragraph | Writers’ Discretion |
| 69 | Bauguil et al. | 8 | Define multidisciplinary, interdisciplinary, and transdisciplinary please. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 70 | Pilhoefer | 5–9 | Researcher, Bresler offers four approaches of integrating the arts: subservient integration, co-equal cognitive integration, affective integration approach, and social integration approach (1995). Teachers who use the arts as an addition to their curriculum, or filler are using the subservient approach. The affective approach offers students arts as a compliment to their curriculum. Examples of this approach include complimenting the curriculum with music playing in the background as students work, written and verbal responses to art, and use of self-expression as a complement to the teacher's curriculum. The social integration approach is used to increase parental participation through school presentations and performances.  When the arts are integrated with non-arts content areas and require students to use a higher cognitive demand to gain further understandings of both content areas, teachers are using the co-equal cognitive integration approach (Gullatt, 2008). The co-equal cognitive arts integration approach equally merges art standards with non- arts standards to create connections in engaging processes that differentiate how students can demonstrate their learning | Writers’ Discretion |
| 71 | Williams | 9 | Lines 216-218 This sentence makes it sound like arts integration lessons/units are mostly to be combined with standards-based arts curriculum, which doesn’t make a lot of sense. Yes, music and dance (for example) go well together, but arts integration is so much bigger than that – and I might argue that the primary usage of arts integration is with non-arts subject areas. | Non-Actionable |
| 72 | Engdahl | 9 | Add sentence line 220 “There are other valid models of arts integration including Marshall’s (2014, 2019) Creative Art-Based Inquiry, Goldberg’s (2017) Art as text, or multiple examples in Preparing Educators for Arts Integration: Placing Creativity at the Center of Learning, Diaz & McKenna (2017).” | Not Recommended |
| 73 | Barber | 9 | Line 215-6 Consider expanding this section – the conflation of two different educators’ models is confusing  Reason: Confusing  Note: Not sure how to fix, as I’m not an expert in these two models | Writers’ Discretion |
| 74 | Barber | 9 | Line 223 Replace “Teachers” with “educators”  Reason: Accuracy, inclusion  Note: The educators in this example may be working with a certified teacher but be teaching artists or classified teaching aids with special arts expertise | Writers’ Discretion |
| 75 | Bauguil et al. | 8–28 | Drake and Burn’s research and its connection to Fogarty’s instructional models are excessively complex and confusing. The Transdisciplinary Approach (p. 26), is similar to Project-Based Learning (PBL). While the similarity is indicated in the text, the framework should discuss PBL (as well as STEAM, which is not mentioned at all) in more detail. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 76 | Romano | 8–28 | I appreciate the researched-based discussion of integration styles and models throughout the chapter. The Shared Model, Nested Model, and Network Models and the vignettes and snapshots illustrating these models provide clear examples for elementary classroom teachers to see how an integrated approach should include instruction and assessment in both content areas. This research clearly defines integration (in all its forms) and will help teachers understand the various models. Teachers will better be able to design lessons understanding the different ways to integrate with these clear definitions and examples. I feel hopeful that this discussion will help show my fellow teachers and administrators what is needed to really design well-integrated curriculum that does justice to the standards of arts education. | Non-Actionable |
| 77 | Barber | 10 | Line 238-242 Replace each instance of “teacher” with “educator”  Reason: Accuracy, inclusion  Note: The educators in this example may be working with a certified teacher but be teaching artists or classified teaching aids with special arts expertise | Writers’ Discretion |
| 78 | Engdahl | 10 | Sentence 240 – “teaching artists” and “guest artists” should also be added to list of contributors to the shared model. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 79 | Bauguil et al. | 10 | Fig. 8.3 We like the Shared Module visual. | Non-Actionable |
| 80 | Barber | 11 | Line 252 and 258 Replace “teacher” with “educator”  Reason: Accuracy, inclusion  Note: The educators in this example may be working with a certified teacher but be teaching artists or classified teaching aids with special arts expertise | Writers’ Discretion |
| 81 | Barber | 12 | Line 294 Delete comma  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 82 | Pilhoefer | 14 | Line 220 Add on: Arts integration planning using the shared model has natural connections to Wiggins and McTyghe's Understanding by Design in creating interdisciplinary instruction focused on the enduring understandings and essential questions to focus on identified content and skills and create deeper learning experiences (2011). | Writers’ Discretion |
| 83 | Barber | 14 | Line 339 Delete comma  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 84 | Engdahl | 14 | The tone of the two paragraphs beginning at line 339 is condescending to teachers, implying that their skills may not be up to the task. It also discourages teachers from arts integration, For example, line 362 demands, “extended planning time.” In real schools, extended planning time rarely exists. The message behind this sentence is “don’t try this at home,” which is inequitable to California’s students. The tone should encourage, not discourage as it does now. | Non-Actionable |
| 85 | Pilhoefer | 14 | Line 341 [after “learners.” ]Add sentence: The Center for Applied Special Technology (CAST) states that UDL provided multiple means of: demonstrating learning, engagement, and actions and expressions (2009), which arts integration provides. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 86 | Pilhoefer | 14 | Line 341 [Refers to sentence that begins “For students to…”] with Replace sentence to include more recent research: In effective arts integrated learning students see beyond the boundaries of disciplines to "create a new social and cognitive space” (Marshall, 2014, p.106). | Not Recommended |
| 87 | Fennell | 14 | Line 346 - integration instruction supports deep learning for transfer and requires sufficient planning time to move beyond superficial or artificial connections.  Change to - integration instruction supports deep teaching and learning for transfer and requires sufficient planning time to move beyond superficial or artificial connections. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 88 | Barber | 14–15 | Line 336, 350, 354, 356, 360 Replace “a teacher or co-teachers” with “educators”  Reason: Accuracy and inclusion  Note: The educators in this example may be working with a certified teacher but be teaching artists or classified teaching aids with special arts expertise | Writers’ Discretion |
| 89 | Bauguil et al. | 14–16 | Several recommendations for teachers to collaborate. Could there be language that asks administrators to include collaboration and planning time for teachers? | Writers’ Discretion |
| 90 | Fennell | 16 | Lines 388-389 - arts integrated unit will provide students an opportunity to deepen their overall understanding of the shared concepts.  Change to - arts integrated unit will provide students an opportunity to deepen their overall understanding of the shared concepts through cognitive and creative application of the subjects. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 91 | Fennell | 18 | Line 437 - using standard musical notation, a technical language symbol system of music.  Change to - using standard musical notation. (delete after comma as I don’t believe the definitions of musical notation is needed). | Not recommended |
| 92 | Fennell | 18 | Between line 440 – 444, the concept of composing (adding pitch) to the sequence was omitted. Step 1 – compose the rhythmic phrase, Step 2 – add pitches to the rhythm to create a melody (pre-determine the pitches, key, starting and ending pitch, etc.) Step 3 – add lyrics to the melody that was created by adding pitch to the rhythm is then stated in line 441. Please note that this will align the lesson to the stated standard: Performance Standard: 5.MU:Cr1b.: Generate musical ideas (such as rhythms, melodies, and accompaniment patterns) within specific related tonalities, meters, and simple chord changes. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 93 | Fennell | 18 | Line 441 - Choral and combined groups additionally compose lyrics using English language over  Change to: Choral and combined groups additionally compose lyrics using English language under | Writers’ Discretion |
| 94 | Fennell | 18 | Line 446- The students exchange information and ideas  Change to: The students exchange and share information, notation, and ideas | Recommended |
| 95 | Stuber | 19 | Please note at line 457, you can eliminate the word “the” before “Ms. D. will lead …” | Recommended |
| 96 | Fennell | 19 | Line 465 – “Students will write a self-reflection on their creative process, the struggles they had, and what they want to try when composing again in the future.”  The reflection should be standards aligned within the process – given the previously stated standard: Performance Standard: 5.MU:Cr1b.: Generate musical ideas (such as rhythms, melodies, and accompaniment patterns) within specific related tonalities, meters, and simple chord changes  Change to: Students will write a self-reflection on their creative process, the struggles they had and improvements they want to make, an explanation of how the melody and rhythm were composed and why various aspects were chosen, as well as what they want to try when composing in the future. | Recommended |
| 97 | Barber | 20–26 | Line 498, 555, 563, 565, 569, 571, 575, 584, 587, 606, 614, 630, 634, 639, 641 Replace “Teachers” with “Educators”  Reason: Accuracy and inclusion  Note: The educators in this example may be working with a certified teacher but be teaching artists or classified teaching aids with special arts expertise | Writers’ Discretion |
| 98 | Fennell | 23 | Line 572 – “The table below captures their first brainstorm. In their next planning session, they will review and add or revise their identified standards as needed.”  Shouldn’t this be planned with the assessment in mind, first? Understanding By Design process? Given that the standards are in the chart, it would be easy to create an assessment first. | Not Recommended |
| 99 | Fennell | 24 | Line 580 – “The project will also provide students opportunities to purposefully utilize and hone their life long thinking and social skills including collaboration, consensus seeking, problem solving, conflict resolution, and communication.”  Comment: this is vague and an overall weak statement. Truly, these important skills should be intentionally integrated as part of the lesson – the lesson can be rewritten to reflect this.  Invite the students to choose the Habit of Mind or Executive Functioning Skill(s) that they need to improve upon and ask them to set personal goals, gather evidence, and share this growth within the project presentation. The teacher, student, and lesson should make intentional application surrounding the improvements in this area. | Not Recommended |
| 100 | Fennell | 24 | Lines 584 – 587 – “Prior to the planning session each teacher met with an English or history colleague to gain insight into possible contemporary or historical topics and related texts, primary sources, and other types of materials to stimulate the students’ creative work”  Comment – this is a very teacher-focused lesson and concept, given what we know about personalized learning, and students voice/choice – many teachers are moving towards student chosen content. This can be a co-created situation where the students brainstorm relevant topics and the teacher supports the student to find the quality materials that reflect student interest. It’s also rather archaic to say that teacher’s choice will ‘stimulated the students’ creative work’ – that is truly not the case. | Not Recommended |
| 101 | Barber | 25 | Line 593 Insert “by Abraham Lincoln” after “Proclamation”  Reason: Accuracy  Note: Author needs to be cited | Recommended |
| 102 | Barber | 25 | Line 607 Delete “a” and make plural “co-planners” and “co-learners”  Reason: construction | Recommended |
| 103 | Fennell | 26 | Lines 623-625 “Learners in network models discover the interrelationships and connectedness among different disciplines, gain insight into careers, and see the operational functioning of their disciplines in real world situations.”  Comment - This lesson should also intentionally integrate social-emotional skills, as a great deal of project based work is the integration of these life skills. This must be mentioned within the lesson.  What can be added: This connects and leans towards personalized learning that invites the students to make choices, set goals, interact with personally chosen content, collaborate with the teacher, and to set goals to improve social and emotional skills in relation to content and the experience of the project. | Writers Discretion |
| 104 | Barber | 26 | Line 642 Replace “that” with “who”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 105 | Engdahl | 26 | Line 642 – Why is the phrase “teaching artist” not used when referring to the “Local mural artist?” Don’t we want to encourage collaborating with artists who understand the educational process rather than not? | Writers’ Discretion |
| 106 | Bauguil et al. | 27 | Line 27 First paragraph of Attentiveness to Students’ Art Learning: Omit second sentence “It is critical for teachers to understand that approaches that combine or integrate content areas are not a replacement for specific discrete instruction in any content area.” The paragraph retains its message. | Not Recommended |
| 107 | Bauguil et al. | 28 | Line 5 Paragraph beginning “Many times, well-meaning…” Reword the paragraph to show arts enhancement and how it is not arts integration. Right now, it is condescending. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 108 | Engdahl | 27–28 | Delete lines 652-659. Delete lines 664-698. These paragraphs place curriculum over students and when we start teaching the curriculum instead of the students first we become inflexible and frankly irrelevant. The tone of the these paragrpahs implies that resources and time are what is needed. While this is true, these paragrpahs will reinforce the socio-economic differences, richer more well off school districts will support this while urban minority and rural districts will shy, leading to even great inequities in California. These paragraphs could be rewritten to encourage that ALL OF CALIFORNIA’s students have access to the arts. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 109 | Barber | 28 | Line 664 Delete comma after “integrated”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 110 | Fennell | 28 | Line 667 “asking students to ‘illustrate’ a story.”  Change to - asking students to “illustrate” a story as a possible project for a book report or project | Writers’ Discretion |
| 111 | Romano | 28 | What needs to be stressed in this chapter (specifically in the paragraph that begins at line 699) is that this “easy solution” is lacking. Arts learning should not be provided in a lesson or activity here or there, but throughout the year, in a sequenced way that provides students the opportunity to achieve the standards by the end of the year. Arts Integration, as I have seen it in practice, does not provide students ongoing standards based instruction but just snippets of experiences here and there.  Thank you for taking my comments into consideration. Please feel free to follow-up if I may provide clarification. My hope is that the specific amendments above be helpful to fellow educators and administrators as we strive to create excellence in throughout our students’ education in the arts. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 112 | Fennell | 28 | Lines 680 – 682 “These types of activities can engage students, help students remember details and provide quick ways for the teacher to check for understanding.”  Change to - These types of activities can engage students, help students remember details and provide quick ways for the teacher to check for understanding, but actually only use the art form as a tool to assist in learning. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 113 | Barber | 28 | Line 689 Delete “”used””  Reason: Clarity  Note: Unclear, more straightforward with the elimination of this word | Writers’ Discretion |
| 114 | Barber | 28 | Line 689 Insert “implying arts education” after “labels”  Reason: Clarity | Writers’ Discretion |
| 115 | Stuber | 28–29 | It is especially important to emphasize that integration cannot replace discrete instruction and I like how its called out as in lines 664-666. Lines 699-713 are especially important and this passage should be more direct adding a few sentences at line 706 stating that teachers need time and deep content knowledge in both areas they are integrating. This requires more sophisticated planning and instructional design by teachers. Arts integration should not just be a lesson here or there, but part of sequential arts learning overtime that fits into a standards-based sequence of instruction. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 116 | Engdahl | 29 | At Line 699, replace paragraph with the following:  “In many elementary schools the general education classroom is often the sole provider of arts education. This is especially true in small and rural school districts. These teachers are fully authorized to teach the arts under their California Multiple Subject Preliminary or Clear credential although their level of expertise may vary. These teachers are responsible for both discrete and integrated approaches to arts learning. If these teachers feel the need to seek professional development and if it is available and accessible to them they should certainly avail themselves of it. If there is no professional learning available, like minded teachers may want to form local Professional Learning Communities (PLCs) with the support of their administrators. However, as an issue of equity no student in California should be deprived of arts education even if the teacher is learning alongside the students.” | Writers’ Discretion: consider placing in Chapter 9 |
| 117 | Williams | 28 | Lines 664-665 Great sentence, making the distinction between between arts integration and not exceedingly clear. However, I would disagree that just because something does not qualify to be arts integration, that it shouldn’t be labeled “arts-enhanced” or “arts infused” (lines 682-684). The Kennedy Center calls a strategy for using the arts as hooks or superficial engagement tools “arts-enhanced curriculum.” Yes, the arts are subservient (not the focus) in this model, and they aren’t assessed. But recognizing the arts as still present and literally enhancing the curriculum is still important. We all want deep integration, but this superficial method of incorporating the arts is often the gateway. | Not recommended |
| 118 | Barber | 29 | Line 690 Insert “arts” before “integrated”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 119 | Barber | 29 | Line 692 Insert “in the arts,” after “objectives”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 120 | Barber | 29 | Line 694 Delete comma after “members”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 121 | Barber | 29 | Line 695 Delete comma after “occurred”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 122 | Pilhoefer | 29 | Line 700 The teacher's understanding of Arts Integration is based on their educational preparation and experiences (Rabkin and Redmond, 2004). | Not Recommended |
| 123 | Barber | 29 | Line 706 Replace the two instances of “teachers” with “educators”  Reason: Accuracy and inclusion  Note: The educators in this example may be working with a certified teacher but be teaching artists or classified teaching aids with special arts expertise | Writers’ Discretion |
| 124 | Engdahl | 29 | Delete lines 711-713 – unnecessary and places students in the position of being the least important element in education. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 125 | Engdahl | 29 | Add additional sidebar after line 728  “Exemplary Professional Learning. Many professional arts organizations, universities and County Offices of Education offer professional learning. One excellent example is the Alameda County Office of Education's Integrated Learning Specialist Program model (ILSP). It is " A trans-disciplinary set of courses that envisions and nurtures new paradigms for teaching and learning. This program leverages tools and strategies that cultivate emergent dispositions and provokes new thinking about the role of arts and education. Working collaboratively in inspired learning communities, participants will investigate new pathways and examine and critique established norms and interrupt systems of inequity, promoting social justice and invention to build a better future for everyone." It is based on the Teaching For Understanding Model and Making Learning Visible framework from Project Zero at Harvard, Studio Habits, UDL, and Marshall's Integrated Learning Framework. Over the course of a year teachers from all over California can take courses such as Arts Immersion, Equity & Social Justice, Creative Inquiry. Collaborative Curriculum Design, and Ongoing Assessment Strategies.  The California Arts Project (TCAP), based on the Writing Project model and one of the California Subject Matter Projects (CSMPs) is statewide network of teachers and scholars with the mission of improving teaching and learning in the arts." | Not Recommended |
| 126 | Engdahl | 29 | Line 715 (sidebar) First sentence should read “Potentially harmful outcomes of poorly implemented arts activities, discrete or integrated, can occur when students are not perceived as successful in their “singing” or “acting” as other students when put in these situations.” | Writers’ Discretion |
| 127 | Bauguil et al. | 29 | Line 693 Omit end of paragraph, still works without it.  “Using labels such as “arts enhanced” or “arts infused” can give the impression to students, parents, and community members, that arts education has occurred, and students have gained knowledge and skills in one or more of the arts disciplines. If the enhancement or infusing of the arts into other content areas lacks discrete arts instruction and learning or has not been intentionally integrated, the arts are being used in a subservient manner as a teaching strategy.” | Not Recommended |
| 128 | Bauguil et al. | 29 | Line 25 Note or side bar – omit the whole thing | Not Recommended |
| 129 | Stuber | 29 | Please note at line 718, “possibly” is misspelled as “possibility”. | Recommended |
| 130 | Bauguil et al. | 30 | Line 729 “The overarching goal of interdisciplinary approaches…” Define Interdisciplinary approaches. Is this what the chapter is about? Arts integration? Or the definition from Foggart? This is confusing. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 131 | Pilhoefer | 30 | Line 729 ESSA report states that effective arts integration include professional development, the use of specialized teachers and instructional materials, field trips, and include whole-school reform models (2017). | Not Recommended |
| 132 | Williams | 30 | Lines 727-740 This paragraph seems to contradict earlier statements that the terms “arts enhanced” or “arts infused” are misnomers. Instead, this paragraph describes how “arts enhanced” or “arts infused” lessons are not as deep as “arts integration.” I agree with the description, and believe it is relevant, but would reiterate that the terminology should be settled. Just call it “arts-enhanced” or “arts infused” learning in lines 682-684. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 133 | Bauguil et al. | 30 | Line 25 Replace quote to a viable arts integration quote. | Not Recommended |
| 134 | Engdahl | 31 | Line 754 Insert “In the revised Bloom’s Taxomony, “Creating” is recognized as the the highest form of understanding. Learning in the arts and applying that in other subject areas is how students can most autheticallly and deeply express their knowledge.” as beginning of paragraph. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 135 | Bauguil et al. | 31 | “The overarching goal of interdisciplinary approach”  The meaning of the word “interdisciplinary” should be clearly stated here. Does it refers to the Drake and Burn’s interdisciplinary definition (p. 21) or does it mean “arts integration” as stated on p. 3? | Writers’ Discretion |
| 136 | Bauguil et al. | 31 | Line 15 Omit Last two sentences. “Artist-astronaut Alan Bean found painting to be a way to express his experiences on the moon. Similarly, artistically literate students can combine learning to create and communicate the intersections they discover. Arts integration can support students in connecting their discrete disciplinary learning – the dots – and in doing so transcend the learning silos within and across subjects. | Not Recommended |
| 137 | Fennell | 31 | Line 764 “Arts integration can support students in connecting their discrete disciplinary learning—the dots—and in doing so transcend the learning silos within and across subjects.”  Change to - Arts integration can support students in connecting their discrete disciplinary learning to transcend the learning silos within and across subjects. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 138 | Bauguil et al. | n/a | Overall the chapter reads more like a literature review. Many more detailed examples of arts integration should be provided. While the topic of pattern and symmetry are good examples of integration, they are always (and often only) the two examples cited with reference to arts integrating the arts. Several national and state organizations have developed models that work well and could be referenced in the framework:   * CETA Changing Education Through the Arts (Kennedy Arts Center) * CAPE Chicago Arts Partnerships in Education * Julia Marschall SF * Montalvo Arts Center Education Department / Teaching Artist Program (TAP)   Puget Sound Educational Service (PSESD) Washington State | Not Recommended |
| 139 | Brouilette | n/a | Dear Colleagues,  I felt depressed after reading chapter 8: “Transcending Disciplinary Boundaries.” It felt as if I had been transported back to the early days of No Child Left Behind, when arts advocates were understandably intent on fending off threats of arts teachers losing their jobs. However, times have changed. Since 2013, California has increased annual K-12 spending by more than half, to $102 billion. This is an era when large-scale constructive change is possible, when educators are willing to experiment with arts-based ways of enhancing student learning. Yet, instead of citing research-based evidence of how arts integration can boost learning, the chapter featured prickly warnings that teachers should not make the arts “subservient” to other goals, implying that arts integration can only be validly carried out with the participation of an arts specialist. Does this approach serve the best interests of TK-5 children who seldom or never see an arts teacher?  The chapter reminded me of the phonics vs. whole language battle that once preoccupied literacy researchers. Fortunately, research has long shown that phonemic awareness is crucial to learning to read. Yet, there is also far more to reading comprehension than sounding out words. Much the same can be said about the long-time debate among arts advocates about the value of classes dedicated to a single arts discipline, versus arts integration lessons given by classroom teachers. Children’s lives become richer through regular arts instruction. Yet arts integration can deepen understanding. For children in the primary grades, classroom drama is an effective tool for enhancing oral language skills, especially for English learners. Drawing in science notebooks can help students to focus fully on the veins within a leaf or the colors of a sunset. Historical songs show middle schoolers how various issues were perceived by people living in earlier eras. | Non-Actionable |
| 140 | Brouilette cont. | n/a | Along with mathematics and English language arts, the visual and performing arts serve as *both* a means of making sense of the world *and* a tool for sharing our discoveries with others. Would a reading specialist assert that reading skills should be utilized only in language arts classes? Do math teachers feel slighted when physics teachers make use of mathematics in their classes? Arts advocates will find that public appreciation of the arts only grows when we share the potential of arts-based learning to deepen understanding and transform lives. Whereas, it will only cause frustration and resentment if we try to control access to these ancient and powerful disciplines.  Let's fashion a more inclusive and inspiring message for classroom teachers who are interested in integrating the arts, but lack on-site resources. | Non-Actionable |
| 141 | Dagani | n/a | Global: This chapter needs serious reevaluation and revision! | Writers’ Discretion |
| 142 | Denton | n/a | Transcending disciplinary boundaries creates a connectedness to the arts that all students should experience. State-wide, non-elective, teacher training must be implemented well to take teachers with multiple subject credentials and relatively little art background and provide them with enough background and artistic skill to transcend these boundaries. | Not Actionable |
| 143 | Fennell | n/a | Overall - Shouldn’t this be planned with the assessment in mind, first? Understanding By Design process? It would result in a clearer focus and with a stronger assessment - though if not, the following can help. Understanding By Design process? | Not Actionable |
| 144 | Goldberg | n/a | Dear IQC Director,  As written, chapter 8 does not represent a quality effort representing the field of arts integration. It would be an embarrassment (in my opinion) to and for the state of California to publish the chapter in its current state. We can do a lot better. To that end, please accept the attached suggestions and actions. I would be happy to further discuss this chapter or elements of it with the IQC. I can be reached at this email or via phone. I've included my bio FYI.  I will be sending an additional email with chapter 8 reviews from pre-service teachers at Cal State San Marcos.  Merryl Goldberg is a Professor of Music at California State University San Marcos and Director of the **ART=OPPORTUNITY** campaign of Center ARTES, a university center dedicated to restoring arts to education.  In 2018 she was awarded the Wang Family Excellence Award for Outstanding Faculty Teaching in the CSU (23 campus) systemwide.  Her publications include Arts Integration: Teaching Subject Matter Through the Arts in Multicultural Settings 5th edition (2017) as well as other books, articles, chapters, editorials, and blogs.  She has received numerous research and programmatic grants including Federal Department of Education Arts in Education Program, Fulbright-Hays Foundation, National Endowment for the Arts, California Arts Council, Stuart and Panta Rhea grants.  Merryl’s undergraduate degree is from New England Conservatory of Music, and her doctorate is from the Harvard Graduate School of Education.  Prior to entering academia, she recorded numerous CDs and was on the road for 13 years playing the saxophone with the Klezmer Conservatory Band.  Merryl’s hometown is Boston. Go Red Sox!  [A copy of the attachment may be requested by sending an email to [vapa@cde.ca.gov](mailto:vapa@cde.ca.gov)] | Non-Actionable |
| 145 | Goldberg | n/a | Dear IQC director for VAPA,  Please find attached many reviews of Chapter 8 from pre-service teachers in a required class called "Learning Through the Arts," taught at Cal State San Marcos. The students are on track to become multiple subject teachers and are finishing up their Liberal Studies degree. My co-professor and I asked the students to read and provide a review of Chapter 8 as an alternative assignment. They gave us permission to send them along. If I were to summarize, I would have to say that the majority did not find the chapter instructive.  [Copies of the chapter 8 reviews by pre-service teachers may be requested by sending an email to [vapa@cde.ca.gov](mailto:vapa@cde.ca.gov).] | Non-Actionable |
| 146 | Landon | n/a | Between 2014 and 2016 the California Alliance for Arts Education supported the efforts of the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing (CTC), to strengthen and streamline the accreditation system by updating teacher preparation standards and improving performance assessments. The goal was to adopt new guidelines for the preparation of multiple subject teachers. Those guidelines specifically called out the role of arts and arts integration in meeting the needs of students, and advocated for the inclusion of both visual and performing arts standards, as well as identifying arts integration directly in the Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs). That process led to the adoption of TPEs that intentionally include the role of arts in engaging and supporting all learners, as well as the use of arts integration in understanding and organizing subject matter for student learning. A task force for CTC stated that the expectations “reflected the field’s evolving set of expectations for teacher knowledge and ability,” and was “research-based and aligned to national teaching standards expectations.”  In reflecting on the draft of Chapter 8 of the proposed “California Arts Framework for Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve (Arts Framework)” I felt that the hard earned ground of the new TPEs was being eroded by a re-framing of their purpose. I was surprised and disappointed to see that there was no reference to term “arts integration” in the title of the chapter. I think that was both unfortunate and misleading.  In addition, I was struck by the absence of research-based examples of best practices to support student learning. I also feel the proposed framework would be enhanced by an assessment of the benefits of arts integration.  In order to continue to support our commitment to the quality of our students’ education I encourage you to review the language of Chapter 8 and revise the content to include a more detailed explanation of the explicit role of arts integration that aligns with the recommendations of the California Teaching Commission. | Non-Actionable |
| 147 | Lieberman | n/a | Attention Executive Director and Members of the IQC:  I am submitting the attached as a public comment on the current draft of the California Arts Framework for Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve (Arts Framework).  Chapter 8 Transcending Disciplinary Boundaries—Connecting the Dots of Learning  This document is presented for consideration as a vignette for inclusion in Chapter 8 Transcending Disciplinary Boundaries—Connecting the Dots of Learning. I believe that the draft framework would be improved by adding an in-depth vignette/example that explores specific, standards-based connections to the Visual and Performing Arts. This vignette also provides a specific VAPA-connected discussion of California’s adopted Environmental Principles and Concepts (EP&Cs), which are not otherwise represented within the current draft of the VAPA Framework.  It parallels the styles and depth of content for the vignettes related to the EP&Cs that are included in the current versions of the Science, History-Social Science, and Health Frameworks.  Thank you for your consideration.  [A copy of the attachment may be requested by sending an email to [vapa@cde.ca.gov](mailto:vapa@cde.ca.gov).] | Writers’ Discretion |
| 148 | Music | n/a | The Alameda COE partnered with the Harvard Graduate School of Education's Project Zero to pilot and refine the Studio Thinking Framework (Hetland, Winner, Veenema and Sheridan) in five consecutive USDOE funded professional development and model arts demonstration grants in schools and districts across seven Bay area counties in Region 4. In 2009, this work was formalized into an in-depth professional development program:The Integrated Learning Specialist Program based on the Universal Design for Learning and contemporary arts practices: http://www.integratedlearningacoe.org/. Over 2000 teachers have participated in the program and 25 demonstration schools in the Bay Area are models of whole school transformation through the arts. Dr. Julia Marshall is advisor to this program, and has many nationally and internationally recognized scholarly contributions including her new book Integrating the Visual Arts Across the Curriculum - a resource to the VAPA framework to shift from theory to accessible professional practice. | Non-Actionable |
| 149 | Piccola | n/a | The chapter is called connecting the dots. The chapter states that, "Designing arts integration instruction requires teachers working either alone or in collaboration with others, who are knowledgeable and have disciplinary skills in the subject areas they are integrating." I do not believe this to be true. I do not believe that teachers have to have disciplinary skills in the arts. The arts are so very important in the acquisition of so many subjects. Adding the arts to any curriculum is not a difficult task. There are many simple steps a teacher can take to integrate the arts. For example, students can act out a period of history, teachers can bring in period art and have students get a feel for what it would be like to be in that time period. Students can memorize songs that correlate with math equations. It does not take a teacher skilled in the subject. One of the other problems I see with this is that it is very dry and boring. The chapter gives a minimal number of ideas on connecting the dots and they all require collaboration with an Arts teacher. The arts are very important in the education of students. It helps them to retain information as well as understand the content. It does not require the teacher to make it a huge production. Practical applications would be a better approach. It seems as though this article make Arts Integration a very difficult task. | Not Recommended |
| 150 | Pilhoefer | n/a | Hello, Please accept this document with feedback on Chapter 8 of the VAPA framework.  [A copy of the document may be requested by sending an email to [vapa@cde.ca.gov](mailto:vapa@cde.ca.gov).] | Non-Actionable |
| 151 | Potter | n/a | This is really the heart of it: "The arts disciplines offer unique ways of learning about, experiencing, knowing, and exploring the world." | Non-Actionable |
| 152 | Quiroz | n/a | Reading chapter 8: Transcending Disciplinary Boundaries as a student at CSUSM taking an "arts integration" class, I feel confident writing a proper review for this chapter. Through the chapter, Many sentences contained too many of the same words. Seemed a little repetitive and as the reader made me feel a bit confused/lost. The begging focused more on what teachers should be doing and could do rather than proving the things being talked about actually helped students development and skills within the different subjects. When using examples to back these up, the examples I feel were not showing enough benefit to the student. The art "integration" was simply thought of as a way to help enforce the other subjects versus the importance of the actual art integration itself. However, the chapter did do a great job talking and showing just what teacher might do to get a certain outcome. Also explaining why a teacher would choose to implement art with in the lesson. Though with the integration, many of the examples were said to give the students little to no instruction. The samples shown were very limited to Dance and Music. Not much was shown about the other art forms that could be used. | Non-Actionable |
| 153 | Spangler | n/a | I feel strongly that the first part of this chapter should be revised to be more reader friendly and less theoretical. For example, I suggest describing the two takes on arts integration (not four) as provided by the Kennedy Center and Dr. Merryl Golberg in her book "Arts Integration." As currently written this section is not practical for a non-academic. I do like the couple of examples of arts integrated lessons that were provided. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 154 | Stuber | n/a | I have been a music teacher at the middle school level for 15 years and at the elementary school level for 7 years, as well as a 2nd grade classroom teacher for 6 years in the Vista Unified School District. I feel that Chapter 8: Transcending Disciplinary Boundaries is an important chapter to distinguish what is and is not arts education. | Non-Actionable |
| 155 | Stuber | n/a | I would like to see additional vignettes or snapshots showing what is typically or commonly seen in the subservient situation and how that might be augmented to become a “co-equal” approach. This will help to illustrate what is and is not true arts education. For example, a common practice is to sing a poem or nursery rhyme in the primary grades. But singing to learn the poem in itself is not integrated music and ELA learning. Co-equal arts integration would include instruction and assessment in music learning such as steady beat and rhythmic patterns. Another example of subservient to co-equal might be to show how instead of only singing a GLAD (Guided Language Acquisition Design) Bugaloo Chant to reinforce a science or history topic which is not integrating music with a content area. Co-equal arts integration would include instruction and assessment in the harmonic progression of the Bugaloo Chant. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 156 | Stuber | n/a | I appreciate the researched-based discussion of the Shared Model, Nested Model, and Network Models and the vignettes and snapshots illustrating these models are very effective. These provide clear examples for teachers to see how an integrated approach should include instruction and assessment in both content areas. | Non-Actionable |
| 157 | Stuber | n/a | Thank you for your work on the California Arts Framework. | Non-Actionable |
| 158 | Valenzuela | n/a | Chapter 8, hits some important points about arts integration including the idea that it’s an engaging way for students to learn and make connections. In the beginning of the chapter, there are many benefits to an arts integration way of learning that are listed. However, the rest of the chapter focuses primarily on the techniques used to integrate arts into teaching other subjects. It would be more insightful to demonstrate how these techniques bring benefits to the students. For example, dive deeper into how integrating the arts improves cognition, memory, risk-taking, etc. In terms of the discussion about the difference between arts-integration and arts-enhancement, there could have been more clarification. At the end of the chapter, it pointed out that students should be educated about each discipline before combining the two into one lesson. In other words, students should have a lesson with the arts that will be used to learn about another subject. I feel like most teachers might assume students have had some exposure to the basic elements to art that they don’t take the time to make sure students know skills such as drawing. It might be helpful to provide tips on how to approach this and make sure all students have a base understanding. As far as the three techniques that are addressed in this chapter, I think they were very informative. The multidisciplinary section seemed to be the most informative of them all because multiple examples were provided on how this technique would look like as a process and a lesson. The multidisciplinary and interdisciplinary techniques seemed very similar to me and I was a little bit confused about the interdisciplinary style. I was confused on how the experts contributes to the lessons and why you would want so many types of experts for one lesson. Overall, I think this chapter could go into more of the specifics about the benefits of arts integration and provide equal amount of examples/models for each of the three teaching styles. | Non-Actionable |
| 159 | Van Dewark | n/a | Addressing Arts Integration is essential and forward thinking. | Non-Actionable |

## Table 12: Chapter 9: Implementing Effective Arts Education

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Barber | 1 | Line 15 Insert “and other educators” after “teachers”  Reason: Accuracy and inclusion | Not Recommended |
| 2 | Barber | 1 | Line 22 Insert a sentence about the planning process here, particularly strategic planning, LCAP and continuous improvement. For example, “Components include comprehensive planning in incorporation of arts education with strategic planning, local control accountability plans, and continuous improvement goals and actions. These plans should insure equity and access for all students through professional learning and engaging a wide range of stakeholders in addition to contributing to student and parent engagement as well as positive school climate.”  Reason: Put planning up front  Note: If this is for administrators, the connection between investment in arts education and other requirements should be up front. | Not Recommended |
| 3 | Williams | 3 | Lines 67-72 It appears that there is an extra quotation mark in this quote. I believe it happens after “Arts Education” in line 67, right before the ellipses. | Recommended |
| 4 | Barber | 4 | Line 78 Replace “this means” with “The availability of”  Reason: Clarity | Not recommended |
| 5 | Williams | 4 | Line 91 I believe you want to use the plural possessive students’ instead of singular possessive student’s. Or change it to “a student’s...”. | Recommended |
| 6 | Barber | 5 | Line 133 Insert “and” before “expand”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 7 | Barber | 11 | Line 260 Rewrite as “How are instruments accounted for …”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 8 | Barber | 11 | Line 261 Rewrite as “How are counselors at the middle school level communicated with so they know ….”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 9 | Barber | 13 | Line 299 Delete “the” and insert “in dance, music, theatre and visual arts” after “associations”  Reason: Clarity  Note: The original sentence makes it seem like the only legitimate VAPA organizations exclude the media arts – and by the time this is read, there may be media arts organizations established. | Not Recommended |
| 10 | Williams | 13 | Line 300 and Line 314 Isn’t it Opportunity to Learn standards? (singular “Opportunity,” not “Opportunities”?) | Recommended |
| 11 | Barber | 13 | Line 310 Delete comma  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 12 | Barber | 15 | Line 346 Insert “provide” after “disciplines”  Reason: Clarity  Note: There appeared to be a word missing | Recommended: revise sentence to read *Effective curriculum provides outlines in each of the five arts disciplines that articulates the sequence of instruction and learning expectations for all students.* |
| 13 | Williams | 17 | Line 401-410 It might also be worth noting that AB 2735, signed into law in 2018, prohibits English Learner students from being denied enrollment into courses that are required for high school graduation or college admission, which can include the arts. | Writers’ Discretion |
| 14 | Williams | 18 | Line 454 I recommend using “advanced courses” instead of “advance courses.” | Recommended |
| 15 | Williams | 21 | Line 507-509 Be aware that in some districts, arts courses may be uncapped, meaning there is no student-to-teacher ratio that needs to be observed. Perhaps there should be additional statements about reasonable numbers (admittedly also vague), or balance in terms of student load (so if you run a 100+ person marching band, a class of 15 for AP Music Theory is appropriate). | Not Recommended |
| 16 | Barber | 21 | Line 520-21 End sentence after “1970.” Delete “and” and start next sentence “The signing into law of Senate Bill 916 in 2016 added K-12 single subject ….”  Reason: Clarity  Note: The original sentence conflates actions from 1970 to actions in 2016 | Recommended |
| 17 | Barber | 23 | Line 579 Insert comma after “modifications”  Reason: Clarity | Not Recommended |
| 18 | Barber | 23 | Line 585 Insert “often” after “learning”  Reason: Accuracy  Note: Some arts learning does not involve the body | Not Recommended |
| 19 | Barber | 24 | Line 606 Insert comma after “progress”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 20 | Barber | 24 | Line 608 Replace “presentation” with “presentations”  Reason: Parallel construction | Recommended |
| 21 | Williams | 24 | Line 609-613 These two sentences are powerful, and I completely agree. | Non-Actionable |
| 22 | Williams | 25 | Lines 625-680 Start this section with non-technology instructional materials. So many schools struggle for basic art supplies and instruments. Move lines 662-667 to the top of the section. Technology is important as well, but using media arts as an example (lines 638-661) may result in some skipping the section thinking it doesn’t apply to them. Additionally, consider including a table of technology examples in each of the arts disciplines. Specific software or brand names are not important, but it would be good to open the readers’ minds to what technology includes. For example, in music: computers, speakers, handheld recording devices, music playback devices, microphones, digitization equipment, keyboards, MIDI controllers, composition/notation software, DAW software, audio interfaces, etc. | Not Recommended except for writers’ Discretion to move lines 662– 667 |
| 23 | Barber | 25 | Line 642 Insert “along with dance, music, theater and visual arts”  Reason: Clarity  Note: Inclusive of all the arts disciplines adds clarity | Writers’ Discretion |
| 24 | Barber | 26 | Line 644 Insert a sentence explaining why the discussion of CT’s program. Suggestion: “Other state have examined this issue. For example, Connecticut’s Department of …”  Reason: Clarity | Writers’ Discretion to make edits for clarity |
| 25 | Williams | 27 | Lines 684-686 Something about this sentence doesn’t read quite right. “Effective approaches engage stakeholders in comparing the district’s current arts education instructional programs to the education code, guiding documents for arts education, and qualities of effective arts education programs.” I think it’s because it doesn’t say what the stakeholders do with the documents and qualities. For example: “…comparing the district’s current arts education instructional programs to the education code, [creating] guiding documents for arts education, and [compiling] qualities of effective arts education programs.” | Non-Actionable |
| 26 | Barber | 27 | Line 689 Replace “that” with “who”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 27 | Barber | 28 | Line 271 Replace “is” with “may be”  Reason: Accuracy | Not Recommended |
| 28 | Williams | 29 | Line 748 I recommend adding a qualifier like “quality arts education,” since you are talking about improvements that can be made. The goal is not just access (making sure student receive an arts education) but making sure that education is of high quality (as shown through data listed like district benchmark assessments, etc.). | Writers’ Discretion |
| 29 | Barber | 34 | Line 859-60 Cite the author of this text, and include in the Works Cited at back of chapter  Reason: Accuracy and citations  Note: I didn’t see this work cited at the back | Not Recommended: work is cited but the link needs to be edited |
| 30 | Barber | 35 | Line 892 Replace “that” with “who”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 31 | Williams | 36 | Lines 925-998 This entire section is excellent. The data provided is credible and convincing, and the examples of how professional learning needs differ between specialists at different grade levels or in different disciplines are very clear. | Non-Actionable |
| 32 | Barber | 39 | Line 1010 Delete comma after “also”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 33 | Barber | 39 | Line 1020 There appears to be a word missing before “information” – suggest “supply”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended: add “offer” before information |
| 34 | Barber | 41 | Line 1050 Delete “In” and replace “XXX” with “J”  Reason: Clarity, accuracy | Recommended |
| 35 | Barber | 44 | Line 1140 Replace “XX” with “9.2”  Reason: Clarity, accuracy | Recommended |
| 36 | Barber | 47 | Line 1174 Insert comma after “educators”  Reason: Clarity | Recommended |
| 37 | Barber | 47 | Line 1178 Change “art practices” to “arts practices”  Reason: Inclusive of all disciplines | Recommended |
| 38 | Williams | 48 | Line 1202 “I came away from the institute with [discovering] the value…” I know there is some paraphrasing there, but it’s not the right word/phrasing choice. Perhaps try “I came away from the institute with [the discovery of] the value…” | Recommended |
| 39 | Williams | 50 | Line 1266 If you are talking about a district PLC that includes all the choral teachers in one district, you want to use the singular possessive “all the district’s choral teachers”. This is what you should use, if I am reading it correctly. The plural possessive “all the districts’ choral teachers” includes choral teachers in all the districts. | Recommended |
| 40 | Barber | 52 | Line 1326-27 Change the placement of “(F)” to after “subject requirement courses” in line 1327  Reason: Accuracy | Not Recommended |
| 41 | Williams | 52–53 | Lines 1318-1343 This is really powerful, and it is presented with clarity. Are these statewide priorities, or just examples of how the arts fit into the LCFF priority areas? | Writers’ Discretion to clarify further |
| 42 | Williams | 55 | Lines 1387-1389 This is a run-on sentence: “Effective arts education is equitable, inclusive, and thoughtfully implements the California Arts Standards TK–12 and supports all students in developing their artistic voice while becoming prepared for college and career.” Fix it by breaking it up into sections, like (for example) “Effective arts education is equitable and inclusive; it thoughtfully implements the California Arts Standards TK–12 and supports all students in developing their artistic voice while becoming prepared for college and career.” | Recommended: revise to: *Effective arts education is equitable and inclusive; it thoughtfully implements the California Arts Standards TK–12 and supports all students in developing their artistic voice while becoming prepared for college and career.* |
| 43 | Denton | n/a | Currently, very few colleges are providing single subject credentials for the arts. Finding single subject fully credentialed teachers will be difficult. An alternative to credential experienced professionals who are willing to teach should accompany these standards so implementation does not fall flat. The degree of discreet knowledge required of a teacher in each of the areas in order to effectively implement the application level the standards require is high. The various methodologies that can be employed also require training to provide students a sequential development. Schools should not have to bear the brunt of teacher training and materials. If restricted, designated state funds are not provided, many districts will not implement effective arts programs. | Non-Actionable |
| 44 | Benavides | n/a | This is only feasible if a school district fully funds a district wide VAPA program. Most programs are self-sustainable because they have no funding. | Non-Actionable |
| 45 | Husselstein | n/a | Nicely Written.. Thank you PD for teachers and administration- Being that so many of our school leaders experienced public education in the throes of Prop 13, many districts lack administrators with ANY experience in the arts. Bringing them into our experience is vital to the success of these new standards. Multiple subject teacher's qualifications within arts teaching. While their document may legally allow them to cover these subjects, the classes many of our educators participate in do NOT provide the training to teach ensembles such as band, orchestra and choir. While the scope of this project is not to re-write the credentialing process, perhaps add a notation that specifies schools should strive to hire educators with the pedagogical skills to effectively develop our student's skills for these disciplines. Traveling teachers need time in their schedule SEPARATE from lunches and breaks, for classroom set up if they are teaching in shared spaces. | Not Recommended |
| 46 | Potter | n/a | "The arts are a major area of human cognition, one of the ways in which we know about the world and express our knowledge. Much of what is said in the arts cannot be said in another way. To withhold artistic means of understanding is as much a malpractice as to withhold mathematics…Since schools traditionally develop only linguistic and logical/mathematical skills, they are missing an enormous opportunity to develop the whole child. Dr. Howard Gardner—Harvard Graduate School of Education" | Non-Actionable |
| 47 | Williams | n/a | General As a compound adjective, “standards-based” needs to be hyphenated when it refers to another noun (e.g. standards-based curriculum, standards-based instruction). There are almost 30 instances of this phrase in this chapter. | Recommended |

## Table 13: Chapter 10: Instructional Materials

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Barber | 5–6 | Line 126-149 Periods at the end of sentences.  Reason: Consistency in chapter  Note: Putting periods at the end of the bulleted sentences was established in the previous section. | Not Recommended |
| 2 | Barber | 6–7 | Line 158-170 Periods at the end of the sentences.  Reason: (same as above)  Note: (same as above) | Not Recommended |
| 3 | Benavides | n/a | See comment #15 | Non-Actionable |
| 4 | Husselstein | n/a | With appreciation of the intent, the phrase "at promise student" does not make any sense. I would offer that be reworded to something along the lines of - "Students needing assistance to uncover potential", or "Students with needs for additional support", or just call a spade a spade, "At-Risk" or "Students missing the opportunities for success". Or, All means ALL. Consider adding something to address the need for sanitation of wind instruments between students. Consider adding music libraries and distribution practices need to be in compliance with copyright laws. | Not Recommended |
| 5 | Potter | n/a | Good | Not Actionable |

## Table 14: Appendices

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Barber | 1–9 | Line 2-237 Footnote or other indication that these references to the Ed Code are as of January 2020  Reason: Accuracy | Not Recommended |
| 2 | Barber | 10 | Line 238-260 Footnote or other indication that these references to the CSU and UC requirements are as of January 2020  Reason: Accuracy | Not Recommended |
| 3 | Barber | 13 | Line 339 There’s an extra space in “students”  Reason: Typo | Recommended |
| 4 | Barber | 19 | Line 420 Here is an example of the use of the word “performance” that can have dual meanings and needs clarifying  Reason: Accuracy and clarity | Recommended: In this sentence only delete the word *performance* and revise to read *Criteria are the traits, attributes, or guidelines used for categorizing or judging; in arts assessment, the guidelines used to judge or determine the quality of a student’s of a student’s demonstration of learning.* |
| 5 | Barber | 19 | Line 431 Replace “judgements” with “evaluation”  Reason: Clarity  Note: We’re defining evaluation, so the word “evaluation” should be used here | Not Recommended |
| 6 | Barber | 20 | Line 449-450 Performance and Performance  Reason: Accuracy and clarity  Note: This same word is used in two contexts in the same sentence – clarification needed | Not Recommended |
| 7 | Barber | 23 | Line 514 Adjust sentence so the date for “caution label” is not set but is instead on an ongoing basis, since the website updates on a regular timeframe  Reason: Accuracy and inclusion of comprehensive info | Not Recommended |
| 8 | Barber | 31 | Line 687 Inclusion of Theatre and Media Arts journals?  Reason: Inclusion of materials  Note: Do these exist? If so, can they be included? | Recommended:  Add the two Educational Theatre Association (EdTA) journals, *Dramatics* and *Teaching Theatre*, and a link to EdTAs Research and Reports page. There is not at this time a recognized media arts education journal for grades kindergarten through twelve. |
| 9 | Barber | 32 | Line 711 Adjustment of the description of the California Arts Council to demonstrate impact on arts education. Suggestion: “The California Arts Council is the state’s arts agency with the mission to advance California through the arts and creativity, including support for arts education for all California students.”  Reason: Accurate impact  Note: The mission alone does not tell the purpose or impact of this agency. | Not Recommended |
| 10 | Barber | 33 | Line 725 Full name of the “John F. Kennedy Center for the Arts”  Reason: Accuracy  To differentiate it from other Kennedy Centers, such as the international institute at BYU | Not Recommended  The listing is for website - The Kennedy Center ARTSEDGE – with is the title listed on the website |
| 11 | Potter | n/a | Good | Non-Actionable |

## Table 15: Other General Comments

| # | Source | Page | Line number and Comment | IQC Action |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | Barber | n/a | Typographical recommendations versus content-based recommendation. The various typographical or copy-editing suggestions are in regular text in the grids below. Suggestions that are content based or a typographical change that may alter content are in bold.  Global notes. The following notes and suggestions are for issues that are found throughout the document.   * There is not consistency in the terms “standards based” and “standards-based” (with hyphen). I recommend using the term WITH the hyphen. I have not checked specific instances, but find/replace tool can be used to help. * There is not consistency in the punctuation at the end of a bulleted sentence in a list. Sometimes there is no punctuation, sometimes there are semi-colons, sometimes periods, and sometimes no punctuation at all. While no punctuation is fine for bullets consisting of words or short phrases, the use of semi-colons or periods helps tremendously when reading bullets consisting of longer full sentences. * Chapter glossaries (for the discipline chapters): Each discipline chapter definitions should include standard ones relating to intellectual property and digital citizenship. These terms include:   + Intellectual property   + Fair use   + Public domain   + Copyright   + Trademarks (particularly issues with unintentional violations)   + Digital citizenship   Each term definition may include additional information depending upon impact in the specific discipline. | No Motion Recommended: the typographical or copy-editing suggestions were included in the chapter tables in this document. Punctuation and hyphen issues not addressed in the chapter tables will be addressed in the professional editing process that will follow state board adoption. |
| 1 | Barber cont. | n/a | Complicated terms that have dual meanings:   * PERFORM and PERFORMANCE – the word “perform” and its related noun “performance” are used in two distinct contexts in this document. One is to present artwork (dance, music, theatre) to an audience. The other is in relation to educational performance or the demonstration and application of learning. Because these two terms can become entangled, a close edit is needed to determine how they are used and if the terms are used clearly. Also, it might be smart to acknowledge this issue up front in the How to Read pre-chapter or in Chapter 1. They should definitely be defined in the glossaries of the performing arts chapters (dance, theatre, music) and maybe in the other two disciplines as well. * MEDIA – there are two contexts for MEDIA and the related MULTI-MEDIA. One is the broad definition of communication outlets or tools used to store and deliver information – or arts information, in this case. That can be analog (physical) and digital (technological). But the “media arts” are very specifically about the technology media. In today’s world the use of the “media” is slated to only refer to the technology-based media. Like with the word “performance,” it might be smart to acknowledge this issue up front and include definitions in each discipline glossary. | Not Recommended |
| 2 | Benavides | n/a | Unless the state gives school districts money specifically allocated for VAPA programs, this framework is only going to be a suggestion to arts teachers. | Non-Actionable |
| 3 | Brunel | n/a | Who is the intended audience for these frameworks? Any educator doesn't need the vast amounts of support data given; any administrator who is not an arts teacher will have no idea what to do with all the data. If it's for future grant application use, then there's too much arts information and not enough numbers to support it. It is, simply, much too long. For those districts who do not have any artists on their payroll, I sincerely doubt that any classroom teacher would be able to use this guide to inform their lesson planning. For the district curriculum specialist, the arts information so vital is buried in the morass of studies, theories, and directions of too many. Ultimately, if you want anyone to actually use these frameworks, this document is far from ready for adoption. I appreciate the hard work my arts colleagues put into this document. It's time to re-draft, re-focus, and pare down. | Non-Actionable |
| 4 | Cauchi | n/a | As an instrumental music teacher, I need a method book that addresses all the standards for performance and any related standards. | Non-Actionable |
| 5 | Cooley | n/a | I appreciate how each of the discipline chapters have similar introductions, using alike sequence, language, graphics, and charts. I also appreciate how this document can be used like a field guide. A teacher (or administrator) can choose to focus on and comprehend a specific discipline chapter. Then if they need or want additional information, they can refer the other relevant chapters, 1,2,8,9,10 | Non-Actionable |
| 6 | Cortez | n/a | We need more training in teaching music. | Non-Actionable |
| 7 | Dagani | n/a | As a veteran teacher, highly trained artist, and a member of the CFCC, I cannot see a value in Chapter 8 to educators (general ed or art specialists). There is so much discussion here regarding the “theories” related to integration that I am afraid teachers will not see the true value and practicality of Arts Integration. Integration is so new to California educators, and a solid example, with well-written examples, charts, guides would be so much more beneficial. For some of our learners, Integration may be the ONLY exposure they will have to the arts - as is the case in my district!!! This chapter needs radical reconsideration. Otherwise, I am afraid teachers will continue to do what they are doing now - relying on downloads and internet ideas to teach - which, unfortunately, are not always true integration, but more “enhanced” or “infused” activities that focus on art strategies, not standards. What does practical Arts Integration look like? That is what our teachers need! | No Motion Recommended: see Table 11 for specific recommendations related to Chapter 8. |
| 8 | Ellis | n/a | The framework is worded well, but still not as clearly written as it could be. | Non-Actionable |
| 9 | Gifford | n/a | Regarding inclusive Arts Education, (Careful scheduling and planning of services, inclusive instructional approaches, and arts instruction all need to be considered to protect and ensure access to a well-rounded education for each and every student). Does the Framework include any mention of discouraging the practice of overloading VAPA teachers with an unreasonable;amount of Special Education students? Does the Framework include any provision for accountability / for teachers who do not align with the Standards? | Non-Actionable |
| 10 | Husselstein | n/a | I rated the format/clarity lower because of the slideshow format. If it were in print, I think it would be easier to look at. The most important section of the framework surrounding standards are the grade level expectation. I wish that were more clearly defined visually, and, honestly, a little more skill specific. The old framework did a very (if not overly) thorough job of that and it made curriculum mapping and lesson planning very accessible for teachers. These new standards are SO different, so open, (some say vague), I worry we are going to lose a lot of people in the interpretation stages. We will be depending on districts to commit a lot of planning time to their music team if they are going to be able to interpret these thoroughly. The 'what should be taught when' factor does not come across in the music section of this format. | Non-Actionable |
| 11 | Lewis Morris | n/a | I’m concerned that it is unrealistic for the general multiple subject credential teacher to implement and teach at the elementary school level without extensive training. | Non-Actionable |
| 12 | McNiel | n/a | I have not read the framework, but am sending a general comment expressing my belief that all K-12 students should receive arts instruction, including visual, performing, creative writing, etc... My daughter had no art classes in her public junior high (7th and 8th grades) nor did they go on field trips to see art. She attended a public charter school (Montessori) for elementary school, and they did provide diverse visual and performing arts, as well as digital/photo/video, music education, fortunately. They regularly attended local theater productions. My daughter is now a sophomore in high school. It is a public school, located on community college grounds. She has not had any art in high school (except some poetry/writing). Art classes are considered electives, which you take, beginning in junior year, through the college. They have not attended any performances or shows. I am disappointed in this. I really wish that the school system at least provided free or low-cost arts programs on campus, in the summer, if it isn't offered during the school year. Wealthy privileged kids can receive arts education. Why should public school students receive less? Studies clearly show that it is important on so many levels. Thank you. | Non-Actionable |
| 13 | Potter | n/a | Inspiring and well written. Thank you! | Non-Actionable |
| 14 | Reedy | n/a | I'm worried about the examples because what we learned with the earlier VAPA standards and framework is despite how they were introduced, people used them prescriptively and expectations of student learning were wrong. I see the intent and I applaud it. We will only know the answer to the last two questions (that I rated fair, but I hope that with good professional development we can move that to good or excellent) in time. I do not think educators will be able to teach dance using this framework without really high-quality professional development. Also, I wish I could come back and work on this more rather than have to submit because I would like to comment on the rest, but I have run out of time. | Non-Actionable |
| 15 | Ruez | n/a | I have invested much of my 18 year career at Oceanside High School developing and refining Workplace Skills: Decision Making, Goal Setting, Conflict Resolution and Job Finding. My search for real conflict resolution began as a combat correspondent photographer in Vietnam. 18 years ago my proposal to integrated conflict resolution into the SDCOE ROP Competencies won unanimous approval. Likewise with my Board of Education approving its integration into my courses and more recently with A-G course content approval. Soon I will be leaving the classroom in search of venues from which I can reach more students. If any of this resonates with you at CTE state levels let me know. | Non-Actionable |
| 16 | Spangler | n/a | Because the information provided is so rich it comes across as a little dense. I only read chapters 1 and 8. I hope that formatting could break up the text so it is easier to digest. | Non-Actionable |
| 17 | Thompson | n/a | You MUST make this readable and accessible. As it is, NOBODY is going to read or learn from it. | Non-Actionable |
| 18 | Van Dewark | n/a | This is a very large document with loads of relevant information for designing, developing and supporting an arts education program. Although I focussed mainly on the Visual Arts chapter, I took time to read through the non-discipline specific chapters and appreciate the research-based structures and graphics. Sample lesson approaches, where offered, were interesting and doable, but may need a defined section or placement to set them apart from general text and discussions in respective chapters. This framework will be invaluable to those schools initiating a program, as well as to those with an established arts program, interested in expanding or just "checking in". | Non-Actionable |

## Table 16: Staff-Recommended Edits

The following edits are recommended by the California Department of Education staff. All page/line numbers reference the field review version of the document posted at <https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/vp/cf/>.

| # | Chapter | Page/Line # | Recommended Edit |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | 1 | 29/790–802 | Revise lines 790–802 to read  *This places new emphasis on the arts as part of every student’s education, regardless of student circumstances, classifications, or conditions. The ESSA requires local education agencies (LEAs) to measure the effectiveness of their curricula. In a needs assessment conducted under Title IV, Part A of ESSA, LEAs can identify gaps and deficiencies, and can improve the scope and depth of a student’s education by applying additional federal funds available under that Title as needed. Additionally, flexibility in Title I funds to support a well-rounded education is now available to provide supplemental funds for a well-rounded education including the arts. Professional learning and development for teachers of the arts disciplines (single subject and multiple subject teachers) can be provided through ESSA Titles I, II and IV-A funds to support that well-rounded education.* |
| 2 | 1 | 30/814–826 | Writers’ Discretion to revise and strengthen emphasis quote at line 814. Revise lines 818–826 to read  *Finally, alongside other federal statutes, ESSA provides for ways to promote an inclusive environment, and discourages the removal of students from the classroom, including arts classrooms, for remedial instruction. Throughout ESSA, education—including access to arts education for all—is supported by the protection of instructional time. This means that students are not “pulled out” from arts (or “elective”) courses to receive remedial instruction, English language instruction, or any other necessary service supporting students’ learning and success in school – in other words, the arts are a key part of education and should not be deprioritized to meet a students’ other educational needs.* |
| 3 | 1 | 42/1131–1135 | Revise to read *A comprehensive and sequential arts education for all California students offers the promise of a society of engaged, creative, expressive, responsive, and artistically literate members of society who are active in local and extended communities. Developing artistically literate individuals is the fundamental goal of the California Arts Standards. California aims for a society in which community members…* |
| 4 | 2 | 71/1682 | Replace *proficiently* with *proficiency.* |
| 5 | 2 | 73/1718–1722 | Revise sentence *The UDL learning guidelines provide useful prompts for teachers to develop accessible and meaningful arts learning* to read  *The UDL principles provide useful guidelines for teachers to develop accessible and meaningful arts learning. More information on UDL principles and guidelines, as well as practical suggestions for classroom teaching and learning, can be found at the National Center for UDL and in the California ELA/ELD Framework (2015).* |
| 6 | 2 | 73/1720 | Insert table 3.19: Universal Design for Learning from Chapter 3 (page 65, line 1491) along with the reference *(ELA-ELD Framework 2015, and CAST 2018)*. |
| 7 | 2 | 75/1777 | Replace *Doing and Expressing* with *Action and Expression.* |
| 8 | 2 | 75/1784 | Replace *Doing* with *Action*. |
| 9 | 3 | 77/1814 | Insert *at* between *looking* and *picture* to read … *the teacher introduces the students by first looking at a picture on a map*… |
| 10 | 3 | 80/1879 | Replace *Reading the Individual Education Plans (IEPs)…* with *Reading the Individualized Education Programs (IEPs)…* |
| 11 | 3 | 81/1910–1913 | Delete language: *…possess acute perception along with an inner compass for adult professionalism or lack thereof. An unusual insight into moral issues, an ability to empathize with others, and a high regard for beauty all combine to make advanced learners highly sensitive. Such sensitivity may also work against them when they…* |
| 12 | 3 | 82/1947–1952 | Delete lines 1947–1952. |
| 13 | 3 | 85/1961 | After *Enlargements of the text on an interactive whiteboard, projector, or chart paper assist the whole class as they go over difficult text.* Insert *Provide written materials in digital text that can be accessed through screen readers.* |
| 14 | 3 | 88/1961 | Revise sentence starting with *Graphic organizers support…* to read *Graphic organizers, such as sentence starters or language frames, support authentic discussion by promoting student conversation related to the task.* |
| 15 | 4 | 1/19–21 | Revise sentence to read *They should be proficient in the production, design, placement, and analysis of media artworks that assert their own perspectives and shape their worlds.* |
| 16 | 4 | 55/1397–1403 | Replace emphasis quote. |
| 17 | 4 | 58/1465 | Delete the word *all* from the sentence. |
| 18 | 4 | 59/1510 | Replace *Individual Education Program* with *Individualized Education Program*. |
| 19 | 4 | 60/1524–1527 | Revise sentence *In a narrow course or unit, where there are not diverse choices for modification, such as interactive coding or media literacy, teachers can refer to the IEP or 504 plan for specific accommodations or recommendations, such as extended time, additional support, alternative curricula, etc.* to read *Specific accommodations might include extended time, additional support, preferential seating, etc.* |
| 20 | 4 | 61/1561–1562 | Delete *As with other students, teachers should be aware of students within their classrooms that are identified as gifted.* |
| 21 | 4 | 61/1564 | Replace *ideological* with *intellectual*. |
| 22 | 5 | 81/5050–2051 | Revise sentence to read *Depending on the Individualized Education Program (IEP), students with disabilities might also require a full-time, designated aide.* |
| 23 | 5 | 82/2075 | Insert …*digital text that can be accessed through screen readers* after *This could include enlarged print for students who have visual impairment sight,…* |
| 24 | 5 | 83/2103–2106 | Delete *…possess acute perception along with an inner compass for adult professionalism or lack thereof. An unusual insight into moral issues, an ability to empathize with others, and a high regard for beauty all combine to make advanced learners highly sensitive. Such sensitivity may also work against them when they…* |
| 25 | 5 | 84/2135–2141 | Delete Lines 2135–2141. |
| 26 | 5 | 88/2151 | In the Multiple Means of Representation table insert   * *Speak, chant, sing the note values and rhythms of the musical phrase to support students in connecting terminology and presentation.* * *Presentation of research and musical ideas can be in written, auditory, or pictorially displayed*.   After *Use multi-sensory modalities including visual, auditory and kinesthetic learning.* |
| 27 | 5 | 88/2151 | Revise bulleted sentence that begins *Teachers enlarge notation or lyrics:* insert *digital text/screen readers, other…* after … *Students can work with partners for the independent portion of reading music or reading about music and activities, and are given direct access to a range of dictionaries,…* |
| 28 | 5 | 90/2151 | Delete *or try out choreographic sequences*. |
| 29 | 5 | 90/2151 | Revise bulleted sentence that begins *When exposing all students to more complex…*: After *Teachers use online apps to support formatting of text, as needed* insert *and provide written materials in digital text that can be accessed through screen readers.* |
| 30 | 5 | 91/2150 | Replace *Graphic organizers support authentic discussion by including sentence starters or language frames that promote student conversation related to the task* with *Graphic organizers, such as sentence starters or language frames, support authentic discussion by promoting student conversation related to the task.* |
| 31 | 6 | 64/1554 | After *The primary goals of the California Arts Standards* insert *for theatre* |
| 32 | 6 | 69/1690 | After … *who struggle with narrative writing* insert *With these students in mind, the teacher has installed a speech-to-text app on student laptops to support their writing.* |
| 33 | 6 | 82/2027 | After *include providing* insert *scripts in digital text that can be accessed with a screen reader,* |
| 34 | 6 | 82/2043 | Delete …*possess acute perception along with an inner compass for adult professionalism or lack thereof. An unusual insight into moral issues, an ability to empathize with others, and a high regard for beauty all combine to make advanced learners highly sensitive. Such sensitivity may also work against them when they…* |
| 35 | 6 | 83/2077–2083 | Delete lines 2077–2083. |
| 36 | 6 | 86/2092 | In the Multiple Means of Representation table after *Enlargements of the text on an interactive whiteboard, projector, or chart paper assist the whole class as they go over difficult text* insert *Provide written materials in digital text that can be accessed through screen readers.* |
| 37 | 6 | 87/2092 | After the sentence that begins *When exposing all students to more complex, non-fiction printed materials,* add *Teachers can also provide written materials in digital text that can be accessed through screen readers.* |
| 38 | 7 | 84/1947 | Replace *Individual Education Program* with *Individualized Education Program*. |
| 39 | 7 | 85/1970 | Replace sentence that begins at line 1970 with *Accommodations in visual arts could include free choice of manipulatives, media, and tools so students are able to access the creative process in ways that are meaningful.* |
| 40 | 7 | 87/2018 | Delete …*possess acute perception along with an inner compass for adult professionalism or lack thereof. An unusual insight into moral issues, an ability to empathize with others, and a high regard for beauty all combine to make advanced learners highly sensitive. Such sensitivity may also work against them when they…* |
| 41 | 7 | 88/2053–2059 | Delete lines 2053–2059. |
| 42 | 7 | 92/2090 | In the Multiple Means of Representation table revise bullet that begins ***Students can work with partners*: delete *dance specific* and add sentence *Teachers can provide written materials in digital text that can be accessed through screen readers.*** |
| 43 | 8 | 25/594 | Correct spelling of name *Rudolfo Anaya.* |

California Department of Education, January 2020