Attachment 1A Master List of Line Edit Recommendations

Health SMC Meeting

September 19, 2018

Page 1 of 290

# **Attachment 1A: Master List of Line Edit Recommendations**

Public Input on the Draft *Health Education Framework*

This table lists public comments that recommended changes to the content in the current draft of the *Health Education Framework* and are organized by chapter/appendix, page number, and line number. Text that is marked with an asterisk (\*) indicates an addition made by CDE for formatting purposes. All public comments appear exactly as they were submitted to the CDE. Instances where comments appear to be truncated are due to the fact that respondents had a maximum number of characters when submitting public comment through the online survey. The public comments indexed as “Att 01—Att 127” are included as individual files in **Attachment 4: List of Health Education Framework Public Comment Received**. Public comments indexed as “Attachment 2B” are included in **Attachment 2B: First 60-Day Public Review Health Education Framework Survey Responses (Raw Data File)**. Please email [healtheducationframework@cde.ca.gov](mailto:healtheducationframework@cde.ca.gov) to request access to any or all of the individual public comments submitted during the first 60-day review period.

**The following abbreviations are used throughout this document, in accordance with state and federal accessibility guidelines and formatting purposes**:

* <begin h> = highlighted text begins
* <end h> = highlighted text ends
* <begin s> = strikethrough text begins
* <end s> = strikethrough text ends
* SUPT = Superintendent
* REP = Representative
* CRED = Credentialed
* P/G/C of TK–12 Student = Parent/Guardian/Caretaker of TK–12 Student
* EC = California *Education Code*
* CDC = Centers for Disease Control

**The following definitions clarify the recommended actions provided throughout this document:**

* **Recommended** = CDE recommends that the Health SMC include the additions, edits, and/or changes as stated in the public comment
* **Not Recommended** = CDE recommends that the Health SMC does not include the additions, edits, and/or changes as stated in the public comment
* **No Motion Recommended** = CDE does not have a recommendation
* **Writer’s Discretion/ Additions** = CDE recommends that the Health SMC permit the Health Education Framework writers and CDE staff to add new content to the framework based on the public comment
* **Writer’s Discretion/ Line Edit** = CDE recommends that the Health SMC permit the Health Education Framework writers and CDE staff to edit existing content based on the public comment
* **Writer’s Discretion** = CDE recommends that the Health SMC permit the Health Education Framework writers and CDE staff to decide during the revision process to include or exclude the additions, edits, and/or changes as stated in the public comment
* **Non-Actionable** = the public comment does not include actionable edits that include additions, edits, and/or changes that can be applied to the framework and no action is needed

\*All recommended actions were made based on the following criteria: California *Education Code*, the 2019 Health Framework Revision Guidelines approved by the State Board of Education (https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/he/cf/hecfccguidelines.asp), and the 2008 Health Education Content Standards. Questions regarding the recommended actions can be sent to healtheducationframework@cde.ca.gov.

| **Framework Chapter or Appendix** | **Comment Numbers in Attachment 1A** | **Page Numbers in Attachment 1A** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Chapter 1 — Introduction | 01–61 | 4–35 |
| Chapter 2 — Supporting Health Education | 3 and 62–76 | 6 and 36–44 |
| Chapter 3 — Transitional Kindergarten through Three | 3 and 77–176 | 6 and 44–177 |
| Chapter 4 — Grades Four through Six | 3 and 177–297 | 6 and 177–163 |
| Chapter 5 — Grades Seventh through Eighth | 298–401 | 163–212 |
| Chapter 6 — Grades Nine through Twelve | 402–523 | 212–270 |
| Chapter 7 — Access and Equity | 524–580 | 271–285 |
| Chapter 8 — Assessment | 581–585 | 285–288 |
| Chapter 9 — Instructional Materials for Health Education | 586–587 | 289 |
| Appendix — Sex Trafficking | 588–593 | 289–290 |
| Appendix — Examples of Standards Based Instruction | 594 | 290 |

| **Comment #** | **Chapter** | **Method of Submission** | **Source** | **Comment** | **Comment Index** | **Recommended Action** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 01 | General | Email | California School Board Association | *\*The California School Board submitted a letter addressing anticipated “challenges in communication and implementation of the Health Framework and reinforces the need for guidance to districts with regard to teaching and communicating about the sensitive topics the Framework includes.” Below is an excerpt from the letter submitted to CDE. The full letter that was submitted to CDE is included in Att 17 (California School Board Association)*  **Critical Issues for Districts**  In view of all of this, CSBA has the following questions about the Framework for the IQC’s consideration: While there is a section on engaging with the community and parents about teaching sensitive or controversial topics, we believe that it could provide greater guidance. One suggestion would be to add additional resources to the appendix, including for parents and families from diverse cultural and language backgrounds.  As noted above, in order to implement the Framework, LEAs will have to make significant investments in instructional materials and professional learning for teachers and administrators. In addition, recruiting and hiring expert teachers who have expertise in all of the areas covered in the Framework will be a challenge. In an already crowded field of content demands on class time, adding the additional content in the Framework means that instructional time will be another challenge. | Att 17 | Writer’s Discretion/Additions |
| 02 | General | Email | California Teachers Association | *\*The California Teachers Association (CTA) submitted a letter with general comments, concerns, and line edit Recommendations on the Health Education Framework. Their comments were divided into two sections. The first section provides CTA’s general perceptions on how well the CFCC met its legislative charge concerning the framework update. CDE’s responses to the first section of CTA’s letter are located in the “Recommended Action” column of this comment.*  *\*The full letter that was submitted to the CDE is included in Att 18. CDE has responded to each of the line edit recommended changes that CTA provided in Section 2 of their letter throughout this item (A1). Each of CTA’s line edit recommendations appear in order of chapter, page number, and line number.* | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion/Addition |
| 03 | 1— Introduction  2— Supporting Health Education  3— TK– Grade 3  4— Grade 4– Grade 6 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | Chapters 1-4 make various reference to a non-binary gender construct. But Chapter 4 requires gender to be described as binary for 5th grade. For consistency of logic, prior grades must also support sex as binary. Corrections should be made to:   * **Chapter 3, lines 1050-1064**: Replace with “Students also learn about individual differences, including gender, from an early age. All forms of gender expression should be respected. Teachers should not intrude into the personal sexual development of students; this is the right of parents or legal guardians. * **Line 1087**: Delete inclusion of gender and transgender. * **Chapter 3, lines 1520-1527**: Adhere to binary gender construct. Add to line 1523, “families with a mother and father working together.” The traditional family structure is not always possible, but the enormity of literature supports it as the most effective home environment. If the framework wanted to make a contribution to the family, it would acknowledge the difficulties of non-traditional family forms rather than present them simply as options. * **Chapter 4, lines 1370-1376**: Remove lines as unsupported speculation. * **Chapter 4, lines 1381-1384**: Remove lines as unsupported speculation. * **Chapter 4, lines 1434-1736:** Remove entire section. Etc. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended per the following California *Education Code* Citations:  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(5)  EC 51930-51939  51933(a)(b)(c) |
| 04 | 1— Introduction | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | Ch. 1 Introduction – I’d like to see the document be more inclusive by incorporating the role of the school counselor and other pupil personnel services (PPS) credential holders to support student social-emotional health and a positive school climate. Also, the proper term is School Counselor, not counselor. I made several edits all throughout the document.  Specifying that credentialed health teachers and credentialed school nurses are the preferred personnel to deliver instruction on the health education framework is fine, but it is also very limiting and not at all comprehensive if the goal is to provide health education for all students. The real question is what is more important – that students receive instruction on health education, or that only certain highly qualified personnel can provide this instruction? In many, many small and rural schools, there are no credentialed school nurses, and no teachers with health credentials. I get that you want to promote the ideal, but realistically you are excluding the majority of school districts in CA. There several other options for providing health instruction that should be included. I would urge you to list all the options available to schools in order to make this material accessible to all students in all districts. | Att 21 | No Motion Recommended |
| 05 | 1— Introduction | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 1, lines 16-17- I’d like to see the document be more inclusive by incorporating the role of the school counselor and other pupil personnel services (PPS) credential holders to support student social-emotional health and a positive school climate. | Att 21 | Recommended |
| 06 | 1— Introduction | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 1, line 26-30-  While I agree with this statement, school counselors also provide instruction to students in a classroom setting and would be appropriate to list here. | Att 21a | No Motion Recommended |
| 07 | 1— Introduction | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 2, lines 30-33- These are all areas typically that fall under the umbrella of PPS Credentialed School Counselors – See EC 49600 | Att 21a | Writer’s Discretion |
| 08 | 1— Introduction | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 2, line 35-36-  See also Title 5 Regs- CCR 80049.1 Authorization for Service | Att 21a | No Motion Recommended |
| 09 | 1— Introduction | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 2, lines 51-53- The Health of Our State <begin h> Children today are increasingly vulnerable to succumbing to a food environment wrought with industries competing for their purchases. This has lead to the wide availability of hyper palatable foods with little to no regard for human health. Although no one entity is to blame within the system (e.g., people, agriculture, food industry, lobbyists, government, medicine, supplement industry, food experts, marketers, etc.), the food industry is a key participator. The food industry, in existence to maximize profits, employs highly skilled scientists to design substances disguised as food to target consumers of all ages, including our school aged children. They use marketing tactics in the form of enticing packaging, seductive adds on the Web, TV, billboards, magazines, and education materials that at a minimum engage the subconscious minds of our youth. Through careful research, these companies find the right combination of sugar, salt, and fat for a particular food to elicit what is called the “bliss point.” This “point” serves to activate components of the brain that reinforce acquiring, consuming, and overconsuming their product, They employ lobbyists that pressure government officials to all but guarantee legislation minimizes their losses and maximizes profits. | Att 03 | Not Recommended |
| 09 continued | 1— Introduction | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | All these efforts result in the production of substances for human consumption that look, taste, feel, and act nothing like the original food sources from which they came. They provide little, if any nutritional value, and some, if not most have detrimental effects on health. Some of these products even audaciously claim health benefits. The cattle, fish, egg, and poultry industry follow a similar model, offsetting their costs to the consumer in the form of compromised health including cardiovascular disease, stroke, and cancer, particularly from processed meats. <end h> <begin s> ~~California youth experience many real and potential health challenges that could be improved by may improve their health situation high-quality health education.~~ <end s> | Att 03 | Not Recommended |
| 10 | 1— Introduction | Email | Tracey Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | p. 2\*, Lines 54-55 highlight the under consumption of fruits and vegetables for adolescents. We Recommended reporting data for ALL under-consumed food groups across the general population to underscore this diet crisis (J Nutr. 2010). We urge you to rewrite lines 54-55 to read: Most of the general population in the U.S fall short of meeting the Recommended amounts of dairy, vegetables, fruits and whole grains. Low intakes for most of these food groups occur within the context of overall unhealthy eating patterns. **DETAILS to p. 2\*,** Lines 54-55: “Seventy-five percent of adolescents in California do not consume the Recommended five or more servings of fruit and vegetables per day”.  **COMMENT:** This statement omits the under consumed foods in other food groups and within different age groups. Data indicates that seventy-five percent of the general population in the U.S is low in other food group and subgroups, such as dairy, whole grains and lean protein sources. Low intakes for most of these food groups occur within the context of unhealthy overall eating patterns. We strongly encourage the IQC to broaden this message to reflect the prevalence of under consumed nutrient-rich foods.  **RECOMMENDATION:** Rewrite lines 54-55 to read: Most of the general population in the U.S fall short of meeting the Recommended amounts of dairy, vegetables, fruits and whole grains. Low intakes for most of these food groups occur within the context of overall unhealthy eating patterns.  *\*References cited in this comment are included in Att 19*. | Att 19 | Not Recommended  Framework content is written for students in grades TK-12 and does not include adults. Therefore, statistics that measure consumption based on the general population are not relevant to the framework. |
| 11 | 1— Introduction | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 3, lines 77-79-<begin h> The health of California’s youth may be improved by high quality health education. <end h> Many children in California are eating a nutritious diet, exercising regularly and meeting the Recommended amounts of physical activity, not using ATOD, and are generally healthy and happy. | Att 03 | Writer’s Discretion |
| 12 | 1— Introduction | Survey | Melissa Hamilton, CRED Teacher | p. 3\*, Lines 77-83 are not needed and politically driven (indicated the reason for students living healthy lifestyles are due to legislative changes; which I question). Additionally, one cannot use the word 'many' and have only 18 percent of students getting the Recommended amount of exercise. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s Discretion |
| 13 | 1— Introduction | Email | Tracey Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | **Rewrite p.3\*, lines 84-85 to read**: The California Healthy Kids Survey provides insightful data on health behaviors including alcohol and other drug use, school safety and nutrition behavior. The draft fails to mention nutrition and obesity. The rising rate of childhood obesity (CDC, 2016) relates to not only physical health problems, but also psychological problems, depression and bullying. The use of data supports much needed school-based health interventions (Adolesc Health. 2013).  **DETAILS to p. 3\*,** lines 84-85: “The California Healthy Kids Survey (2015) provides insightful student data on health behaviors including alcohol and other drug use and school safety.”  **COMMENT:** This paragraph fails to mention nutrition and obesity. The rising rate of childhood obesity is related to not only physical health problems, but also psychological problems such as anxiety and depression and social problems such as bullying and stigma. It is increasingly a focus of school-based health interventions.  As districts implement Local School Wellness Policies, the use of data to prove outcomes will become more critical. Educators can use tools like the aforementioned California Healthy Kids Survey for data on nutrition behaviors such as breakfast consumption, which has been linked to improved academic and health outcomes among children and adolescents. | Att 19 | Writer’s Discretion/Addition. |
| 13 continued | 1— Introduction | Email | Tracey Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager | **RECOMMENDATION:** Rewrite lines 84-85 to read:  The California Healthy Kids Survey (2015) provides insightful student data on health behaviors including alcohol and other drug use, school safety and nutrition behavior.  *\*References cited in this comment are included in Att 19*. | Att 19 | Writer’s Discretion/Addition |
| 14 | 1— Introduction | Survey | Elena Costa, Other, California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program Staff Member | Page 3, lines 84-87, discuss the California Healthy Kids Survey (CHKS) and highlights “insightful student data” on health behaviors that can be gleaned from its use from the 2015 results. Consider inclusion of the 2015 CHKS data showed that 32% of eleventh graders reported utilizing Electronic Smoking Devices (ESD), into this sentence. Citation: http://surveydata.wested.org/resources/Biennial\_State\_1315.pdf | Attachment 2B | Writer’s Discretion/Addition |
| 15 | 1— Introduction | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 6, lines 156-157- see lines 162-169 below (next comment) | Att 21a | No Motion Recommended |
| 16 | 1— Introduction | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 6, lines 160-166:  **Original Text:** Health education begins in the earliest years of schooling and continues through graduation from high school. It is best provided by credentialed teachers or credentialed school nurses with a special teaching authorization in health during a designated time in elementary grades and by credentialed health education teachers in a health education class in middle and high school. Establishing healthy behaviors, practices, and skills during childhood is more effective than trying to change well-established behaviors during adulthood.  **Suggested Text:** Health education begins in the earliest years of schooling and continues through graduation from high school. It is best provided by credentialed teachers, <begin s> ~~or credentialed~~ <end s> <begin h> **school counselors or** <end h> school nurses with a special teaching authorization in health during a designated time in elementary grades and by credentialed health education teachers in a health education class in middle and high school**.** <begin h>  **However, comprehensive health education can also be provided to students through an approved advisory program or by other credentialed student support staff.** <end h> Establishing healthy behaviors, practices, and skills during childhood is <begin h> **the work of all professional educators and** <end h> more effective than trying to change well-established behaviors during adulthood. | Att 21a | No Motion Recommended |
| 17 | 1— Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | p. 7, line 170- This is a good place to mention Social Emotional Learning and its relevance to health education.  Add two sentences at the end of this line: Social and Emotional Learning (SEL) can help students develop the understanding, strategies and skills that support a positive sense of self, promote respectful relationships and build student capacity to recognize and manage their own emotions and make responsible decisions. Social and emotional learning (SEL) provides a foundation for safe and positive learning, and enhances students' ability to succeed in school, careers, and life. | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion/Addition |
| 18 | 1— Introduction | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | P. 7, lines 190-194  original text: The health education standards and this framework provide RECOMMENDATIONs for health education teachers, other credentialed teachers, administrators, and curriculum development specialists to plan, implement, and evaluate effective health education TK through grade twelve.  Suggested text:  The health education standards and this framework provide RECOMMENDATIONs for health education teachers, other credentialed teachers, <begin h> school counselors, <end h> administrators, and curriculum development specialists to plan, implement, and evaluate effective health education TK through grade twelve. | Att 21a | Recommended |
| 19 | 1— Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | p. 8, line 204- Need to also give credit to ASCD for this whole child model but also adapt and extend this model to include wrap around services.  http://www.ascd.org/programs/learning-and-health/wscc-model.aspx  Begin the sentence: “*The CDC and* ASCD provide a …” | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion/Addition |
| 20 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | p. 8, line 207- Insert a new sentence at the beginning of this line: *ASCD's Whole Child approach is an effort to transition from a focus on narrowly defined academic achievement to one that promotes the long-term development and success of all children.* | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion/Addition |
| 21 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | p. 9-The Wheel:  There is a need to add wrap around services to the wheel and explain how a team of community groups, educators and health practitioners come together to provide supports for the student and his/her family.  CTA suggests the outside wheel could be completed to show the wrap around by adding “Community, Cultural Norms, Climate, Agencies, Parents, Health Practitioners, and Educators”. | Att 18 | No change to figure. Writer’s Discretion/line edit for narrative addition of “Community, cultural norms, climate, etc.” |
| 22 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | p. 10, Lines 237-239- There is a repeated sentence. Delete one of them. | Att 18 | Recommended. Duplicate sentence will be deleted. |
| 23 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | p. 10, lines 250-253- Suggest adding*:*  Information rich environment also includes videos and other forms of media as well as print. There is also a need for parent literature in English and other languages on topics of health to support what is being taught. The United States Environmental Protection Agency defines environmental justice as follows:  Environmental justice is the fair treatment and meaningful involvement of all people regardless of race, color, national origin, or income with respect to the development, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies. Other definitions include: equitable distribution of environmental risks and benefits; fair and meaningful participation in environmental decision-making; recognition of community ways of life, local knowledge, and cultural difference; and the capability of communities and individuals to function and flourish in society. An alternative meaning, used in social sciences, of the term "justice" is "the distribution of social goods". | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion/Addition |
| 24 | 1—Introduction | Email | John Lindner, Retired Elementary Teacher, Multiple Subject Credential | p. 10, Lines 226-228 – “California schools are made up of diverse populations that vary in terms of primary language, culture, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, religion, health conditions, immigration status, and types of abilities and disabilities.” – This is a strong, inclusive statement of diversity which would be improved by adding “gender identity” as a category. | Att 25 | Writer’s discretion to add gender identity and gender expression to this list to follow EC 200. |
| 25 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Melissa Hamilton, CRED Teacher | p. 10\*, Lines 237-239 are repetitive. | Attachment 2B | Recommended. Duplicate sentence will be deleted. |
| 26 | 1—Introduction | Email | John Lindner, Retired Elementary Teacher, Multiple Subject Credential | p. 10, Lines 237-239 – The same sentence is repeated almost verbatim twice: “For example, if a student has a disability, they are referred to as a student with a disability versus a disabled student. For example, if a student has a disability, the student is referred to as a student with a disability versus a disabled student.” | Att 25 | Recommended. Duplicate sentence will be deleted. |
| 27 | 1—Introduction | Email | John Lindner, Retired Elementary Teacher, Multiple Subject Credential | p. 10\*, Lines 242-245 – “Teachers create an inclusive classroom environment by adopting an asset orientation toward cultural and linguistic diversity and respecting multiple viewpoints and backgrounds, especially when addressing topics where values and expectations are likely to differ across cultural groups, such as sexuality and drug use.” Although addressed elsewhere in the draft (e.g., Ch. 2, p. 4, Lines 85 – 94; Ch. 2, p. 5, Lines 119-120), this would be a good place to also include language regarding a local education agency’s responsibility, as part of curriculum development and periodic review, to create a broad process to allow and encourage differing parental viewpoints, values and expectations to be heard prior to actual curriculum adoption/updates. A broad process would help promote “buy-in” to a curriculum prior to its being presented to an LEA’s governing board for approval. | Att 25 | No Motion Recommended |
| 28 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Brenda Lebsack, CRED Teacher TK-12, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | p. 12 - "Students wit EXPLORE their identities, gender expression and sexuality throughout their education". This is an oxymoron. In reading the CHYA curriculum, they are teaching that sexual orientation in "NOT A CHOICE". If it's not a choice, then why the need to explore and experiment? The GLAAD website states that "trying to change a person's gender identity is no more successful than trying to change a person's sexual orientation. It doesn't work." If this is true, then why the encouragement to explore? This sounds like picking and choosing rather than being who you are. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit. |
| 29 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Rebecca Mui, CRED Teacher TK-12 | p. 12\*, Line\* 283: Prioritize culturally relevant texts and topics: Use texts that accurately reflect a wide range of students’ ethnic, cultural, linguistic, and familial backgrounds, as well as other variables that contribute to their identities, such as sexual orientation and gender expression, so that students see themselves as belonging and valued in the school curriculum. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 30 | 1—Introduction | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **Page 12 of 29**  **Lines 283-285**  **283** – Prioritize culturally relevant texts and topics: Use texts that accurately reflect  **284** students’ ethnic, cultural, linguistic, and familial backgrounds, as well as other  **285** variables that contribute to their identities such as <begin s> ~~gender expression~~<end s>, so that  **286** students see themselves as belonging and valued in the school curriculum.  **Remove:** “gender expression” and replace with “religious beliefs” Or, add “and religious belief” after gender expression.“…identities such as gender expression and religious belief…”  **Reason:** The Quran, the Bible/Torah, the Book of Mormon, and other like religious texts fit thedescription of culturally relevant texts that contribute to the identities of students. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows EC 51933(d)(5) |
| 30 continued | 1—Introduction | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **Lines 289-293:**  **REMOVE**: Entire section about using gender neutral nouns/pronouns  **REASON**: Using gender-neutral pronouns will not create an inclusive classroom unless that classroom specifically has students that identify as transgender. If all the students in the classroom identify with their biological sex and maintain a traditional gender identity, then the use of gender-neutral pronouns in place of standard pronouns could make students feel less welcome as no pronouns are being used to accurately describe them.  **Lines 298-300:**  **298** …It is similarly important to acknowledge <begin s> ~~and affirm~~<end s>  **299** different sexual orientations and same-sex relationships so that all students feel their  **300** experiences and needs are reflected in their health education.  **Replace**: “affirm” with “respect” | Att 28+ | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows EC 51933(d)(5) |
| 31 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | p. 12\*, Lines: 283 – Prioritize culturally relevant texts and topics: Use texts that accurately reflect 284 students’ ethnic, cultural, linguistic, and familial backgrounds, as well as other 285 variables that contribute to their identities such as gender expression, so that 286 students see themselves as belonging and valued in the school curriculum. Remove: “gender expression” and replace with “religious beliefs” Or, add “and religious belief” after gender expression. “…identities such as gender expression and religious belief…”  p. 12\*, Lines: 289 …In terms of gender and 290 sexuality, using gender-neutral language and not promoting gender stereotypes can 291 help in creating an inclusive classroom. Gender-neutral language means not using 292 gendered pronouns or nouns to refer to an individual (e.g., he/she, him/her, his/hers).  p. 12\*, line\* 293 Gender-neutral pronouns include the singular form of “they/them/theirs.” REMOVE: Strike lines 289-293 about using gender neutral nouns/pronouns | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 32 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Jenn Hale, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 12\*, Lines 283-285 Page 12 of 29 283 – Prioritize culturally relevant texts and topics: Use texts that accurately reflect 284 students’ ethnic, cultural, linguistic, and familial backgrounds, as well as other 285 variables that contribute to their identities such as gender expression, so that 286 students see themselves as belonging and valued in the school curriculum. Remove: “gender expression” and replace with “religious beliefs” Or, add “and religious belief” after gender expression. “...identities such as gender expression and religious belief...” Reason: The Quran, the Bible/Torah, the Book of Mormon, and other like religious texts fit the description of culturally relevant texts that contribute to the identities of students.  Lines 289-293 Page 12 of 29 289 ...In terms of gender and 290 sexuality, using gender-neutral language and not promoting gender stereotypes can 291 help in creating an inclusive classroom. Gender-neutral language means not using 292 gendered pronouns or nouns to | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows  EC 51930(2)  EC 51930 (4) |
| 33 | 1—Introduction | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 12\*, Line 283-285: Replace “gender expression” with “family religious beliefs”. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 34 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Joe Sargunaraj , P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 12\*, Lines 283-285 Page 12 of 29 283 – Prioritize culturally relevant texts and topics: Use texts that accurately reflect 284 students’ ethnic, cultural, linguistic, and familial backgrounds, as well as other 285 variables that contribute to their identities such as gender expression, so that Remove: “gender expression” and replace with “…identities such as gender expression and religious belief…” Reason: The Quran, the Bible/Torah, the Book of Mormon, and other like religious texts fit the description of culturally relevant texts that contribute to the identities of students.  Lines 298-300 298 …It is similarly important to acknowledge and affirm 299 different sexual orientations and same-sex relationships so that all students feel their 300 experiences and needs are reflected in their health education. Replace: “affirm” with “respect” REASON: "affirm" seems to encourage students to explore "different sexual orientations". The focus should be on respect | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 35 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Greg Habbestad, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Lines 283-285 Page 12 of 29 Remove: “gender expression” and replace with “religious beliefs” Or, add “and religious belief” after gender expression. “…identities such as gender expression and religious belief…” Reason: The Quran, the Bible/Torah, the Book of Mormon, and other like religious texts fit the description of culturally relevant texts that contribute to the identities of students.  Lines 289-293 REMOVE: Entire section about using gender neutral nouns/pronouns REASON: Using gender-neutral pronouns will not create an inclusive classroom unless that classroom specifically has students that identify as transgender. If all the students in the classroom identify with their biological sex and maintain a traditional gender identity, then the use of gender-neutral pronouns in place of standard pronouns could make students feel less welcome as no pronouns are being used to accurately describe them.  Lines 298-300 Replace: “affirm” with “respect” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 36 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Kathy Yang, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Remove: “gender expression” and replace with “religious beliefs” Or, add “and religious belief” after gender expression. “...identities such as gender expression and religious belief...” Reason: The Quran, the Bible/Torah, the Book of Mormon, and other like religious texts fit the description of culturally relevant texts that contribute to the identities of students. REMOVE: Entire section about using gender neutral nouns/pronouns REASON: Using gender-neutral pronouns will not create an inclusive classroom unless that classroom specifically has students that identify as transgender. If all the students in the classroom identify with their biological sex and maintain a traditional gender identity, then the use of gender-neutral pronouns in place of standard pronouns could make students feel less welcome as no pronouns are being used to accurately describe the  P. 12\*, Lines 298-300 Replace: “affirm” with “respect” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 37 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Grace Pa, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | add “and religious belief” after gender expression. “...identities such as gender expression and religious belief...” Reason: The Quran, the Bible/Torah, the Book of Mormon, and other like religious texts fit the description of culturally relevant texts that contribute to the identities of students. REMOVE: Entire section about using gender neutral nouns/pronouns REASON: Using gender-neutral pronouns will not create an inclusive classroom unless that classroom specifically has students that identify as transgender. If all the students in the classroom identify with their biological sex and maintain a traditional gender identity, then the use of gender-neutral pronouns in place of standard pronouns could make students feel less welcome as no pronouns are being used to accurately describe them. Lines 298-300 298 ...It is similarly important to acknowledge and affirm 299 different sexual orientations and same-sex relationships so that all students feel their 300 experiences and needs a | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 38 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Jennifer Wong, College/University Faculty Member , P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 12: replace "gender expression" with "gender expression and religious beliefs" - all major religions have doctrinal beliefs about identity and expression of self that are also impactful "variables"  p. 12: remove entire section on gendered pronouns. this is not inclusive unless there is actually a transgender student in the class. Otherwise, the use of genderless pronouns actually makes for a LESS inclusive classroom, not acknowledging the boys and girls therein. throughout: replace "affirm" with "respect" e.g. "important to acknowledge and RESPECT" instead of "affirm" | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 39 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Angela Juarez, Community Member, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | p. 12\*, Lines 283 - 286 Add: “and religious belief” after gender expression. “…identities such as gender expression and religious belief…” Reason: The Quran, the Bible/Torah, the Book of Mormon, and other like religious texts of many Americans fit the description of culturally relevant texts that contribute to the identities of students. If we are going to be broad and diverse and thorough, we must also equally include all religious beliefs. It is not fair or comprehensive for students to only hear about gender identity without hearing about the wide array of religious writings. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 40 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Randee Snyder, Representing my grandchildren | p. 12\*, Line 285 Remove gender expression, replace with religious beliefs Remove entire section of: Line 289, 290, 291, 292, 293 - this is a very small minority, most people already believe and know what gender they are Line 298,299,300 - Why not just teach children to respect each other, not change them. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 41 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | p. 12, line 285- Add “such as sexual identities and gender expression,” | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 42 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Angela Juarez, Community Member, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | p. 12\*, Lines 289-293 Remove: Entire section about using gender neutral nouns/pronouns Reason: Using gender-neutral pronouns will not create an inclusive classroom unless that classroom specifically has students that identify as transgender. And we should not feel obligated to force these pronouns on students. If all the students in the classroom identify with their biological sex and maintain a traditional gender identity, | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 43 | 1—Introduction | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 12\*, Lines 289-293: Delete. If a class includes a transgender student, then pronoun requested by the student could be honored. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended |
| 44 | 1—Introduction | Email | John Lindner, Retired Elementary Teacher, Multiple Subject Credential | p. 12, Lines 289-298 – “In terms of gender and sexuality, using gender-neutral language and not promoting gender stereotypes can help in creating an inclusive classroom. Gender-neutral language means not using gendered pronouns or nouns to refer to an individual (e.g., he/she, him/her, his/hers). Gender-neutral pronouns include the singular form of ‘they/them/theirs.’ When referring to relationships, use the term ‘partner’ or ‘significant other.’ Using gender-neutral language helps avoid incorrect assumptions based on personal biases, student appearance, or possible lack of awareness. It can be helpful for a teacher to state their gender pronouns during classroom introductions and invite students to do the same if they are comfortable doing so.” -- I would Recommended inserting the word “just” between “not” and “using” in line 291. The terms “he/she, him/her, his/hers” are appropriate for use when students choose to use them for self-identification. I would also replace the word “use” in the phrase “use the term” in line 294 with “include”, so that “partner” and “significant other” are used; but more traditional terms (“husband”, “wife”) are also acknowledged and equally validated. | Att 25 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 45 | 1—Introduction | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 12\*, Line 298: replace “affirm” with “respect”. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows  EC 51930(2)  EC 51930(4)  EC 51933(d)(5) states “affirmatively” |
| 46 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Melissa Hamilton, CRED Teacher | p. 12\*, Lines 291-300 are deeply offensive to me. By not referring to a person by their assigned at birth gender in pronouns it denies part of a person's identity. Please remove this. I believe it will only be decisive and cause more conflict than acceptance. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows  EC 51930(2)  EC 51930(4)  EC 51933(d)(5) states “affirmatively” |
| 47 | 1—Introduction | Email | John Lindner, Retired Elementary Teacher, Multiple Subject Credential | p. 13, Lines 305 – 309 – “The usage of LGBTQ+ throughout this document is intended to represent an inclusive and ever-changing spectrum and understanding of identities. Historically, the acronym included lesbian, gay, and bisexual, but has continued to expand to include queer, questioning, intersex, asexual, allies, and alternative identities (LGBTQQIAA), as well as expanding concepts that may fall under this umbrella term in the future.” -- Please add the term “transgender”, either in line 307 after “gay, lesbian and bisexual” (moving and); or in line 308, in the expanded explanation of the acronyms, as well as in other parts of the draft where this explanation occurs (e.g., Ch. 2, p. 8, Lines 201-205). | Att 25 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 48 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Louise Sozo, Community Member | p. 13\*, Lines 305-315 state: "The usage of LGBTQ+ throughout this document is intended to represent an inclusive and ever-changing spectrum and understanding of identities. Historically, the acronym included lesbian, gay...and alternative identities (LGBTQQIAA), as well as expanding concepts that may fall under this umbrella term in the future." Why does the framework attempt to circumvent the scientific fact that ALL humans are born either male or female? What someone wants to claim as their "identity" is not based on scientific evidence. The framework repeatedly asserts that health education must be "medically accurate", but is neither medically nor scientifically accurate. Gender is NOT "ever changing." There are only two options: male or female. Anything else is purely conjecture. Please adhere to what is truly "medically accurate" when teaching our children "the facts of life" about body image, sexuality, or human growth and development. Don't use our taxes to "socialize" them. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 49 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | p. 13, line 331- Add sentence at the end of Line 331: *Decisions concerning age appropriateness should be made by each teacher.*  (NOTE: Health education should not be left up to a school board to decide.) | Att 18 | Not Recommended |
| 50 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | Page 13, Line 349- Add sentence at the beginning of this line: There is a need to talk about these issues with the students, not just to know or understand the statistics. | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion |
| 51 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | Page 14, Line 356- Add a new sentence after “respectful”: Professional development and trainings in cultural competency and bias training is Recommended for the educator to understand that their own biases, filters, and perceptions can impact the safety and sensitivity for these discussions. | Att 18 | Recommended |
| 52 | 1—Introduction | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 14, lines 356-358 original text:  It is important for teachers, other educators, school administrators, school board members, and parents, guardians, and caretakers to be aware of these issues in order to support students’ growth, learning, and emotional needs.  Suggested text:  It is important for teachers, other educators, school counselors, school administrators, school board members, and parents, guardians, and caretakers to be aware of these issues in order to support students’ growth, learning, and emotional needs. | Att 21a | Recommended |
| 53 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | Page 15, Line 374- Start with an introductory sentence: It is important to include information about mandated training and reporting of abuse. | Att 18 | Not Recommended |
| 54 | 1—Introduction | Survey | Melissa Hamilton, CRED Teacher | p. 16\*, Lines 392-394 What if a guest speaker is coming to talk about physical activity or nutrition? Why must they have expertise in those sexual topics? | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 55 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | Page 16, Line 407- There is a need for an introductory statement about having a strong foundation in implementing the health education standards and connecting them with the Common Core Standards in ELA and Literacy and ELD and language development. | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 56 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | Page 19, Line 437- Concerning the graphic on the Health Standards and the Rationale, The Health Standards and the Rationales are the what but what about the how of these standards? How are they going to be realized? The narrative needs to include more content to explain this graphic. An additional column should be added to show the “how”. | Att 18 | Not Recommended. |
| 57 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | Page 21, Delete Lines 450-457.  CTA believes this content is confusing and it creates the wrong interpretation of grade level assignment of the standards. It may be best left in the health content standards where the chart, referenced on page ix of the Health Education Content Standards for California Public Schools shows a better depiction of the minimum grade level assignment of the standards. (https://www.cde.ca.gov/be/st/ss/documents/healthstandmar08.pdf). If this section is left in, it may be misinterpreted by the publishers as they use this the guide the development of instructional materials. It is misleading if you say that you can integrate and use the standards throughout every grade level content. Just because a standard is mentioned at a particular grade level does not mean that content should not be developed for that grade level. It is even more critical with have content provided to provide ongoing, consistent development of curriculum content that builds on the rigor of the content from grade level to grade level. | Att 18 | No Motion Recommended |
| 58 | 1—Introduction | Email | Meghan Yap, California Coalition Against Sexual Assault | p. 23, Line 462 - Please change the color of the “1” to match the corresponding purple callout bubble. | Att 10 | Recommended |
| 59 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | Page 24, Line 477- Change “modification” to “differentiation”. | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion/Addition to add “differentiation”. |
| 60 | 1—Introduction | Email | Marlene Fong on behalf of the California Teachers Association | Page 25, Lines 490-493, Delete lines 490-493.  (This content seems to give an “out” to educators who may be uncomfortable with some topics or give their “own spin” on some topics. “Customizing” may be code for “pick and choose” what you like or don’t like. Next paragraph starting with Line 494 is sufficient. | Att 18 | Not Recommended. |
| 61 | 1—Introduction | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | P. 25, lines 508-510:  The general information chapters offer support to teachers, administrators, other educators, and school board members.  Suggested text:  The general information chapters offer support to teachers, <begin h> school counselors, <end h> administrators, other educators, and school board members. | Att 21a | Recommended |
| 62 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Survey | Richard Loya, Calif Assoc School Health Educators (CASHE), CRED Teacher TK-12, Single Subject Teaching Credential in Health Science | p. 1\*, lines 1-5 = great start.  p. 2\*, lines 50-53 indicating use of appropriate credentialed teachers is super. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 63 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 2, lines 50-55  Administrators are responsible for ensuring that health education instruction is provided by appropriately credentialed teachers—in particular, teachers with credentials in health science or health education for middle and high school grade levels that require single-subject credentials. Health education instruction may also be delivered by credentialed school nurses who hold a Special Teaching Authorization in Health (STAH) (California Commission on Teacher Credentialing 2016).  **Comment:**  This is a true statement, but not really comprehensive and can therefore be very limiting in the ability to provide health education for all students. In many, many small and rural schools, there are no credentialed school nurses, and no teachers with health credentials. I get that you want to promote the ideal, but realistically you are excluding the majority of school districts in CA. There several other options for providing health instruction that should be included. I would urge you to list all the options available to schools in order to make this material accessible to all student in all districts. | Att 21b | No Motion Recommended |
| 64 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 4, lines 86-90 **original text:**A comprehensive, coordinated school health education program includes appropriately credentialed elementary and health education teachers, administrators, credentialed school nurses, other educators, local school boards, a wide range of support staff and volunteers, families and community members, and community agencies.  **Suggested text:**  A comprehensive, coordinated school health education program includes appropriately credentialed elementary and health education teachers, <begin h> school counselors, <end h> administrators, credentialed school nurses, other educators, local school boards, a wide range of support staff and volunteers, families and community members, and community agencies. | Att 21b | Recommended |
| 6 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | Tracey Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | p. 5\*, Lines 112-114: We Recommended mentioning “overweight and obesity”. While we support the World Health Organization advice for school health education instructional strategies, we feel the advice omits obesity and overweight as health challenges. The increasing rate of childhood obesity is related to not only physical health problems, but also psychological problems such as anxiety and depression and social problems such as bullying and stigma (Childhood Obesity Causes & Consequences, CDC 2016). The Institute of Medicine Recommendeds schools should be the focal point of obesity prevention efforts with sequential food literacy and nutrition education as a key strategy. | Att 19 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 66 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 6, lines 145-153**:** Recognizing that there may be a shortage of credentialed health education teachers in some regions of the state, careful consideration of existing faculty resources to determine which faculty may have the most expertise in the area of health is Recommended. A careful review of the health education standards and framework with a team of educators to develop a strategy for providing high-quality health education that is integrated with other curricular areas when appropriate, including physical education, language arts, history and social science, and science is also Recommended. Lastly, professional learning for all educators responsible for addressing and integrating the standards and framework is highly Recommended  **Comment:** This is much more inclusive than the previous statement that I commented on above. | Att 21b | Non-Actionable |
| 67 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | John Lindner, Retired Teacher | p. 6, Lines 151-153: “Lastly, professional learning for all educators responsible for addressing and integrating the standards and framework is highly Recommended.” -- In line with the role of parents as fellow teachers of health education, specifically inviting parents to participate in the professional learning activities in health education would be again helpful for maintaining parental “buy-in” of the curriculum. | Att 25 | No Motion Recommended |
| 68 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | John Lindner, Retired Teacher | p. 6-7, Lines 167-174: “In addition, because many health education topics, particularly those related to sexuality and alcohol, tobacco and other drugs, have the potential to create controversy, all stakeholders must be in agreement prior to instruction so that classroom teachers are given the support needed to effectively deliver the required curriculum. For sensitive topics, school board members and district administrators must also ensure that educators and school-site administrators have the appropriate guidance and support to provide intervention and resources to students as necessary.” – To expect that “all stakeholders” be “in agreement prior to instruction” is probably unrealistic and can create an expectation that “non-agreement” will result in canceling instruction due to disagreement; there will always be areas of honest, hopefully respectful, disagreement in controversial topics. It might be better to phrase this in terms of and LEA’s responsibility to insure stakeholders are informed and honestly listened to, rather than “all in agreement”. | Att 25 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit to remove “all” and replace “must” with “ideally are”. |
| 69 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Survey | Richard Loya, Calif Assoc School Health Educators (CASHE), CRED Teacher TK-12, Single Subject Teaching Credential in Health Science | p. 7\*, lines 181-192 on employee wellness could be delated. it's like was just dropped in. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 70 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | John Lindner, Retired Teacher | p. 8, Lines 194-200: “Local school board members, administrators, instructional leaders, and school health personnel have the additional responsibility of periodically evaluating the effectiveness of the health education program to ensure that it is meeting the needs of a diverse student population, including LGBTQ+ students, English learners, and students with disabilities, as well as the needs of the community.” – Parents should be an explicitly identified and included part of the health education program’s evaluation; while school board members are the elected REPs of parents and other community stakeholders, LEAs should seek out parental engagement in curriculum review/evaluation. | Att 25 | No Motion Recommended |
| 71 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 8, lines 195-200  original text:  Local school board members, administrators, instructional leaders, and school health personnel have the additional responsibility of periodically evaluating the effectiveness of the health education program to ensure that it is meeting the needs of a diverse student population, including LGBTQ+ students, English learners, and students with disabilities, as well as the needs of the community.  Suggested text:  Local school board members, administrators, instructional leaders, <begin h> and student support<end h> and school health personnel have the additional responsibility of periodically evaluating the effectiveness of the health education program to ensure that it is meeting the needs of a diverse student population, including LGBTQ+ students, English learners, and students with disabilities, as well as the needs of the community. | Att 21b | Recommended |
| 72 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 9, lines 224-231  This is incorrect - CHKS is not a required survey instrument. It is only required if the district received TUPE funds. | Att 21b | Writer’s Discretion/ Will fact check this sentence and make additions/edits as needed. |
| 73 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Survey | Richard Loya, Calif Assoc School Health Educators (CASHE), CRED Teacher TK-12, Single Subject Teaching Credential in Health Science | p. 11\*, lines 298-301. very powerful. this could be expanded into a full page if one had the time - or maybe a full chapter.  p. 12\*, lines 331 - this entire section is very very vital lines 485 et al - delighted environment has remained since put in. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 74 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 14, lines 393-395  original text:  Teachers can also suggest that students talk to parents, guardians, or caregivers; the school nurse, social workers, or counselors; or community agencies if they need additional information (Telljohann 2015).  Suggested text:  Teachers can also suggest that students talk to parents, guardians, or caregivers; the school nurse, social workers, or <begin h> school <end h> counselors; or community agencies if they need additional information (Telljohann 2015). | Att 21b | Recommended |
| 75 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 21, line 569- Add: Parent volunteers can provide vital support to schools interested in starting or maintaining instructional gardens where students can learn about healthy food first-hand through growing, harvesting and preparing fresh fruits and vegetables. | Att 08b | Not Recommended.  This edit was already made in another chapter from the public comment period during the CFCC writing process. |
| 76 | 2— Supporting Health Education | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 21, line 573- Add the underlined section to this sentence: “Other ways to engage parents, guardians, and caretakers include inviting parents to share with students healthy dishes that reflect their cultural heritage. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Not Recommended.  This edit was already made in another chapter from the public comment period during the CFCC writing process. |
| 77 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Rebecca Mui | The explanations on gender stereotypes and trans identity is excellent. GLSEN released a lesson called "Identity Flowers" for grades 3-5 that could be useful to add. Partnering with the family: This section should use a broad definition of family, such as "families are people who love each other" and explicitly name two-mom, two-dad, LGBTQ-headed, single mom, single dad, multi-generational, etc." GLSEN's free Elementary Toolkit, Ready, Set, Respect, has lessons and book suggestions for inclusive family studies. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 78 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | Overall Comment for Chapter 3- Ensure that unprocessed, whole foods are emphasized over processed, refined foods. May need resources that better define unprocessed vs. processed and or whole foods vs. refined foods. | Att 04 | Writer’s Discretion/Addition |
| 79 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | Define the term “variety” for educators (referred to in lines 137, 157, 159, 165, 208, 595, 609, 613). We Recommended this chapter and the framework in general take a positive approach to Recommended healthy eating patterns rather than blanket statements restricting food components. We Recommended rephrasing statements like “eat too many foods with lots of fats and sugar” (line 159) or “foods that are high in calories” (lines 596-597) and replacing with more descriptive language. | Att 19 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 80 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 1, lines 10-14  original text:  Teachers, other educators, school nurses, administrators, curriculum specialists, and district personnel are in a unique and important position to inspire, encourage, teach, mentor, support, and guide young students in adopting healthy practices and positive health behaviors that will lead to a lifetime of good health.  Suggested text:  Teachers, other educators, school nurses, <begin h> **school counselors** <end h>**,** administrators, curriculum specialists, and district personnel are in a unique and important position to inspire, encourage, teach, mentor, support, and guide young students in adopting healthy practices and positive health behaviors that will lead to a lifetime of good health. | Att 21c | Recommended |
| 81 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | pp. 3-4, lines 83-84  TK is not a separate grade level. TK is still kindergarten by statute.EC 48000. In many small schools and rural districts, TK and K are combined in the same classroom. There is no requirement for TK to have a different curriculum than K; it is up to the LEA to modify the curriculum accordingly. | Att 21c | Not Recommended |
| 82 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 5, line 108  This entire section should be combined with K. | Att 21c | Not Recommended |
| 83 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 5, lines 123-124  …because it is NOT a new grade level. | Att 21c | Not Recommended |
| 84 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 5, lines 123-124  Ch. 3 - TK is not a separate grade level. TK is still kindergarten by statute.EC 48000. In many small schools and rural districts, TK and K are combined in the same classroom. There is no requirement for TK to have a different curriculum than K; it is up to the LEA to modify the curriculum accordingly. See comments below. | Att 21c | Not Recommended |
| 85 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 5, lines 124-126  “Intended” does not mean required. Why leave out sections d and e?  (d)For purposes of this section, “transitional kindergarten” means the first year of a two-year kindergarten program that uses a modified kindergarten curriculum that is age and developmentally appropriate.  (e)A transitional kindergarten shall not be construed as a new program or higher level of service.  I think the shall in (e) overrides the intended in (f). | Att 21c | Not Recommended. |
| 86 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 6, line 151- Many factors contribute to obesity in children including marketing of unhealthy food, limited access to healthy food, inadequate physical activity, increased portion sizes of processed or refined food, increased consumption of high-sugar beverages. | Att 03 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 87 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | p. 6, lines 156-160  We wish to make two comments regarding this paragraph:  1. We Recommended defining the term “variety” as it relates to describing nutritious foods. It’s important to be mindful of the classroom teacher’s knowledge of nutrition education terms and the possibility that they may not be well trained or particularly familiar with abstract or vague terms such as “variety”.  Moreover, considering that a key objective of the Health Framework is to guide the development and selection of instructional materials, we think that providing a definition of variety is fundamental knowledge that will help educators identify quality instructional materials.  For your consideration, Dairy Council of California defines “variety” in our nutrition education programs as follows: A diverse assortment of foods and beverages across and within all food groups – dairy, fruits, vegetables, grains and protein foods. This definition is supported by the 2015-2020 Dietary Guidelines of Americans and the USDA MyPlate. | Att 19 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 87 continued | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | 2. Rather than calling attention to dietary deficits or restrictions such as “not eating enough nutritious food”, and “a limited variety of foods”, Dairy Council of California believes the framework will be more effective by communicating that healthy eating is best achieved by taking a positive, proactive approach to nutrition education.  We agree with the guideline that children and adolescents should not consume above the Recommended amounts of saturated fat and added sugars. Recommendations for the public that make general restrictive statements such as “lots of fats” (without focusing on healthy eating patterns or Recommended amounts) could unintentionally limit access to and consumption of nutritious foods like milk and dairy foods.  **Recommendation:** Rewrite lines 156-160 as follows: To help children understand the importance of good nutrition, it is important to explain that there is more than one way to eat healthfully and everyone has their own eating style. Healthy eating patterns encompass all food and beverage choices over time, providing an adaptable, personalized framework tailored to individual preferences, culture, traditions and budget. Explain the importance of choosing a variety of nutrient-rich foods from all food groups – dairy, fruits, vegetables, grains and protein foods-- to help children build strong healthy bodies.  *\*References cited in this comment are included in Att 19*. | Att 19 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 88 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 6, lines 158-160- If children eat <begin s> ~~too many~~<end s> foods<begin h> or products<end h> with <begin s> ~~lots of~~ <end s> <begin h> added<end h> fats <begin h>,<end h> <begin s> ~~and~~ <end s> sugar, <begin h> and salt, <end h> or <begin h> eat<end h> a limited variety of foods, <begin h> do not have an eating pattern highly emphasizing plant foods, <end h> they do not get all the nutrients they need. <begin h> They will get all the nutrients they need from real food, without added fats, sugar, and salt. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended |
| 89 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 7, lines 168-170- Teachers should also be aware of the limited food choices some households may face due to their lack of income, lack of knowledge, or the lack of access to healthy foods. Teachers should also be aware that a child may need to be offered a new food up to 15 times before they accept it. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 90 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | 3 | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 7, lines 166-168- When discussing food choices with children it is important to be respectful of the food choices made in their homes and other places they eat, including traditional and cultural foods and food choices families make for ethical or health reasons. <begin h> In doing so, educators need to be aware of the reality that companies within the food industry must compete for consumers’ purchases for all food products, even traditional and cultural ones. They must alter all products, even those rooted in deep tradition to optimize palatability. While remaining culturally sensitive, teachers can describe a culture’s original food and how they were prepared. Often times preparing the foods in the traditional manner will not cost much more, if at all, than the pre-packaged products created from the food industry. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 91 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | 3 | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 7, line 176- There are many ways to introduce children to a wider range of healthy foods. Teachers can look for alphabet and counting books with illustrations of fruits and vegetables to read to the children. <begin h> Teachers must resist the temptation to implement industry created materials that promote unhealthy products despite their ease of use and high student engagement. <end h> Reading alphabet and counting books aloud to and with children helps them to develop early reading and mathematics skills, as well as supporting language development and recognizing numerals. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 92 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 7-8, Lines 184-198, Tie in the California Department of Health Service’s Harvest Of The Month (HOTM)—found at http://harvestofthemonth.cdph.ca.gov/Pages/default.aspx . Add more Recommendations such as exploring where food comes from and seasonality of fruits and veggies. Recommended doing taste testing in the cafeteria and classroom. | Att 04 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 93 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 7, line 187- Replace sentence beginning with “Not only” with: In a garden, children explore healthy foods with all of their senses. They look for plants and animals of various colors; crush and smell fragrant leaves; listen for buzzing insects and wind in the leaves; and, of course, taste fresh foods straight from the source. This direct experience and sensory stimulation helps children develop strong, positive associations with fresh fruits and vegetables. As young children harvest and eat fresh produce, not only do they learn that many foods come from plants; they also discover that they themselves are part of a vast and complex web of life. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 94 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 7-8, lines 206-219- Highlight and reference the U. S. Department of Agriculture’s (USDA) National School Lunch Program and School Breakfast Program as a nutrition resources for partnering with schools. Add additional examples such as partnering with nutrition experts such as the School District’s Food Service Department, connecting the school cafeteria | Att 04 | Recommended |
| 95 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 8, lines 212-214- Work with school personnel to ensure that drinking water is easily available for all students and that water<begin h> should be the primary beverage chosen for health. Students should also know that in addition to<end h> milk, <begin s> ~~and~~ ~~milk (or~~<end s> <begin h> there are many <end h> plant-based milk alternatives, such as soy or almond milk<begin s>~~) .~~ <end s> These should be <begin s> ~~are~~<end s> promoted over sugary beverages. | Att 03 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 96 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 8, lines 212-214- Add language that addresses other drinking water issues such as importance of water consumption, water safety, family perceptions of water quality/consumption | Att 04 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 97 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 8, line 217- Replace with: Invite students from a higher grade level or school administrators to role model trying new foods and making healthy food choices, such as by preparing and eating fruit and vegetable kabobs or a rainbow salad together. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. Also invite these guests to read books such as The Vegetables We Eat by Gail Gibbons (2008), “Zora’s Zucchini” by Katherine Pryor, “The Hungry, Hungry Caterpillar” or “Gregory, the Terrible Eater” to TK children. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 98 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 9, line 231- Add in: Invite family members to visit class to help prepare a healthy snack with students, highlighting healthy foods from a variety of cultures and traditions. Host a family cooking class or event for parents and caregivers. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 99 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools – Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 9, line 232- Safety <begin h> (Trauma Prevention) <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 100 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools – Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 13, lines 341-343- The school nurse can educate families regarding when to keep their child home due to illness and when their child is well enough to attend school. <begin h> Honing skills to make healthy choices should be emphasized early on in a child’s education. Parent engagement in their child’s choices is also essential for the child’s life-long health. Skillful consumers result from proper education and parent engagement. Children face many challenges if they are to avoid obesity with all of its accompanying chronic illnesses. Many conflicting messages exist within and outside our schools’ boundaries. Many of our children, with their parents’ and media’s help, currently see fast food locations as wholesome. They see food products packaged in material specifically designed to lure them. The products within these packages are themselves specifically designed to engage their brains’ neurological pathways that are common to all mammalian species and even most animals. Our children see media role models advocating for specific products research has shown to be directly linked to obesity and a host of chronic illnesses that never existed in epidemic proportions before the introduction of our current eating patterns. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 100 continued | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools – Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | The earlier a child learns how to sort out what is purposefully deceiving and what is healthy, the more likely the child will avoid the pitfalls to of unhealthy choices. Children need to learn that industry’s purpose is to take resources from people to the greatest extent it can. Investing resources in the interest of protecting human health are often at odds with their purpose. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 101 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 13, Lines 382-384, Visual pedagogy such as posters placed near sinks <begin s> ~~and~~ <end s> help students remember the steps of handwashing and tooth brushing and may be particularly effective for students with autism or other special needs. <begin h> Additionally, the latest facts on the influence of eating patterns on dental health should be shared to emphasize prevention. It is well established that sugary snacks and sodas damage teeth. As research becomes available on the influence of other foods’ correlation with dental decay, it should be shared. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 102 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 14, line 368- If the classroom environment supports <begin s> ~~teeth~~<end s> <begin h> **tooth** <end h> brushing during the school day, teachers | Att 14 | Recommended |
| 103 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 14, line 372- techniques and supply <begin s> ~~tooth brushes~~<end s> <begin h> **toothbrushes**, <end h> and toothpaste <begin h> **and dental floss**<end h>. Some communities have mobile. | Att 14 | Recommended |
| 104 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 14, line 375- nurse may be able to identify community dental services <begin h> **or service providers**. <end h> Even without opportunities to | Att 14 | Recommended |
| 105 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 14, line 379- in an engaging way. Small tooth brushes <begin h> **toothbrushes**<end h> for children to use to brush the teeth of dolls | Att 14 | Recommended |
| 106 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 15, lines 391-392- Learning about internal (lungs, heart, brain, stomach, muscles, bones) and external (eyes, ears, skin) body parts and their functions connects to learning about eating a variety of foods and exercise. For example, TK children learn that Vitamin D from the sun and calcium from chick peas, tofu, white beans, and <begin s> ~~dairy products~~ <end s> <begin h> leafy greens<end h> make the bones that support their bodies stronger and the vitamins in carrots are good for their eyes. <begin h> Teachers should emphasize the greater positive contributions of exercise to bone health. <end h> | Att 03 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 107 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 18, line 476- Add in: spaces and interest areas such as a school garden, a blocks ... | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 108 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 22, lines 595-598- A healthy diet includes a variety of foods<begin h> rich in fruits, vegetables, legumes, nuts, seeds, and whole grains<end h> including traditional and cultural foods to meet the nutritional needs of a growing body and <begin s> ~~limited~~<end s> avoiding consumption of <begin h> processed<end h> foods that are high in calories but provide few, if any, nutrients (<begin s> ~~Academy of Nutrition and Dietetics 2017, CDC 2017[~~<end s> <begin h> check to see if still accurate] <end h> <begin s>~~).~~ <end s> Search the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) and other reliable, medically accurate resources for current food groups and Recommended portion sizes. <begin h> Teachers should help students at this young age understand early on that portion sizes are less of an issue, if at all, if only natural foods are consumed. <end h> | Att 03 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 109 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 22, lines 601-606- NOTE: In our experience, holistic, experiential activities that engage young children with healthy foods are more memorable and effective ways to change consumption patterns than lessons that focus on the importance of specific nutrients. | Att 08b | Non-Actionable |
| 110 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | 3 | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 22, Lines 604-606, For example, students learn they need calcium for strong bones, and they learn about different foods that are calcium-rich <begin h> such as plant based foods. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 111 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | p. 22, lines 595-598-  **Comment:** In keeping with the comments provided regarding Lines 156-160, Dairy Council of California Recommends taking a positive proactive approach to nutrition education rather than calling attention to “foods high in calories”.  It is the positon of the Dairy Council of California that a healthy eating pattern provides an adaptable, personalized framework tailored to individual preferences, culture, traditions and budget. We Recommended defining “variety” within the context of a healthy eating pattern as a variety of nutrient-rich foods from the food groups – dairy, fruits, vegetables, grains and protein foods. The importance of healthy eating patterns and a variety of nutrient-rich foods from all food groups is supported by a growing body of evidence and emphasized in the 2015-2020 Dietary Guidelines for Americans. Public health nutrition guidance based in sound science ensures more opportunities for children to access nutritious foods at home and in school. | Att 19 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 111 continued | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | **RECOMMENDATION:** Delete the draft sentence, or reiterate the position on healthy eating patterns:  [There is more than one way to eat healthfully and everyone has their own eating style. Healthy eating patterns encompass all food and beverage choices over time, providing an adaptable, personalized framework tailored to your preferences, culture, traditions and budget. Choose a variety of nutrient-rich foods from all food groups – dairy, fruits, vegetables, grains and protein foods – for a healthy eating pattern].  *\*References cited in this comment are included in Att 19* | Att 19 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 112 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 28, line 606- Replace with: Students are introduced to a variety of foods *through direct experience and/or* through books ... | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 113 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 31, line 802, K.1.1.N- Add in: Students can also prepare snacks including all of the food groups, such as whole grain tortilla wrap with bean dip and diced vegetables inside. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 114 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | 3 | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 31, Lines 804-805, Students are encouraged to share and identify the healthy foods they ate this week. See the USDA MyPlate Web site for free resources. <begin h> Teachers should also emphasize that legumes and vegetables are particularly high in lean protein with respect to the “Protein” group. They should also point out that milk alternatives such as those from nuts and soy products are part of the group labeled “Dairy.” <end h> | Att 03 | Writer’s Discretion/addition to add milk alternatives are included in dairy. |
| 115 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 31, line 810, K.1.2.N- Add: Students are asked to point to their teeth, eyes, and skin as they learn that calcium-rich foods such as milk, cheese, almonds, tofu, and collard greens are important for strong bones ... | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 116 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 31, Lines 810-814, Students are asked to point to their teeth, eyes, and skin as they learn that calcium-rich foods are important for strong bones and teeth and that vegetables give us good eye sight, help us see in the dark like superheroes, and help heal cuts and scratches. <begin h> Students at this age should know that there are a wide variety of protein sources, not only those in animal products. <end h> Proteins such as <begin h> <end h> <begin s>~~chicken~~ <end s> <begin h> beans and peas, processed soy products, nuts, and seeds also<end h> help us to be strong by building muscles. Students enjoy flexing their biceps to show off their muscles. | Att 03 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 117 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 32, line 816, K.1.2.N- Add in: In a school garden, students can plant a rainbow of fruits and vegetables, such as a bed with red tomatoes, orange carrots, yellow bell peppers, green spinach, and blue borage flowers. They can harvest rainbow snacks from this bed and read aloud Rainbow Stew by Cathryn Falwell (2014). Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 118 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 32, lines 827-829- Creative healthy foods such as smoothies <begin h> without sugar or juice<end h>, <begin s> ~~breakfast burritos,~~ ~~quesadillas~~<end s>, nut or seed butter, vegetable soup<begin h> s <end h><begin s> ~~with rice noodles, low-fat cheese sandwiches~~ <end s>, or <begin h> natural<end h> trail mix <begin h> can<end h> be considered. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 119 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 33, lines 837-838-<begin h> [Eliminate or replace with a different book that shows healthy, plant based foods from around the world free of refined products] <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended |
| 120 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 33, lines 857-859- Students learn that bread, flour, and whole grain flour are in the grains food group but jam and frosting are not in a food group. How would you feel if you ate the same food at every meal? <begin h> *What do you think happens to the healthy part of the grain in most breads when the food companies process it into flour?* <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 121 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 34, line 875, K.1.2.N- Add: If you are growing fruits or vegetables in a garden with students, harvest and include them in the Friendship Pocket. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 122 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 34, line 883- Replace final sentence with: For example, students draw an orange or a tomato in a circle, a slice of cheese in a triangle, or a sandwich in a square. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 123 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 35, line 909, K.7.3.N- Add: Students discuss what plants need to thrive and then tend to the growing vegetables over time by adding compost to the soil, placing their plants in the sunlight, weeding, watering, and caring for their plants. They listen to stories about the journey of food from seed to table, such as What’s This? by Caroline Mockford (2000); Tops and Bottoms by Janet Stevens (1995); or Ten Seeds by Ruth Brown (2010). They count, measure, observe, and diagram how their plants change over time. Finally, they harvest, wash, prepare and taste the produce they grew. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 124 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Brenda Lebsack, CRED Teacher TK-12 | p. 41 - "some children in kindergarten and even younger have identified as transgender or understand they have a gender identity that is different from their sex assigned at birth". APA Handbook of Sexuality and Psychology 2014 on gender dysphoric children, advises that parents, schools, and the community NOT affirm gender dysphoric children as transgender. It says 75% of them will identify with their chromosomal sex by adolescence or adulthood. If they have been affirmed as transgender up to then, their distress upon changing to identify with their chromosomal sex is substantial. This curriculum is going against research. I myself was a tomboy for a very long time before puberty. If I received this teaching at a young age, it would have brought gender confusion. Research shows it is best to leave kids alone and not to affirm them as transgender. Plus the mind is not fully developed until age 25. Why should these choices be presented to children, who are highly imaginative? | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 125 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Gina Gleason | p. 41\*, Line 1050 - Recommended paragraph: Students also learn about individual differences, including gender, from a very early age. All forms of gender expression should be respected. Lines 1051 - 1060 - Remove Line 1061 - Remove "My Princess Boy by Cheryl" Lines 1062 - 1064 - Remove Line 1065 - Remove "Dispelling myths about gender expectations in" Line 1066-1070 - Recommended wording: "Kindergarten can lay the groundwork for acceptance, inclusiveness, and an anti-bullying environment in schools. Gender non-conformity and physical characteristics are often at the root of many forms of bullying. As students learn to accept differences and unique characteristics of others, they also learn about the characteristics of bullying and how to avoid being a bully (K.1.3.G, K.1.6.–7.S, Essential Concepts; K.7.2.M, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors)."  Line 1071-1077 - Remove Line 1084 - Remove "who defy traditional" Line 1085 - Remove "stereotypes" | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 126 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **pp. 41-42\*, Edit Lines 1050-1064:**  **1050** “Students also learn about individual differences, including gender, from a very early  **1051** age. <begin s>  ~~Gender socialization begins before children start school students may believe~~  **~~1052~~** ~~that different norms are associated with people of particular genders by the time they~~  **~~1053~~** ~~enter kindergarten. While this understanding be limited, students can still begin to~~  **~~1054~~** ~~challenge gender stereotypes in a way that is age appropriate. While students may not~~<end s>  **1055**<begin s> ~~fully understand the concepts of gender expression and identity, some children in~~  **~~1056~~** ~~kindergarten and even younger have identified as transgender or understand they have~~  **~~1057~~** ~~a gender identity that is different from their sex assigned at birth. This may present itself~~  **~~1058~~** ~~in different ways including dress, activity preferences, experimenting with dramatic play,~~  **~~1059~~** ~~and feeling uncomfortable self-identifying with their sex assigned at birth. However,~~  **~~1060~~** ~~gender non-conformity does not necessarily indicate that an individual is transgender,~~  **~~1061~~** ~~and all forms of gender expression should be respected.~~ *~~My Princess Boy~~* ~~by Cheryl~~  **~~1062~~** ~~Kilodavis is an age-appropriate book that can be used to demonstrate gender~~ | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 126 continued | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **~~1063~~** ~~differences and inclusion. (See the Access and Equity chapter for additional information~~  **~~1064~~** ~~about inclusive instruction.)”~~ <end s>  **Recommended Paragraph:** Students also learn about individual differences, including gender, from a very early age. Allforms of gender expression should be respected.  **Reasons for Edits:**  (1) **Line 1054:** “Challenging” gender stereotypes can alienate students who enjoy conforming to such stereotypes. While attempting to make non-conforming students feel comfortable, teachers should not make gender-conforming students feel uncomfortable.  (2) **Line 1061-1064:** It is contradictory to tell educators to “challenge gender stereotypes” while at the same time stating that boys who want to dress according to girl “stereotypes” are to be supported. It, ironically, encourages gender stereotypes. *My Princess Boy* reflects this irony. The boy is supposedly a “princess” because he *conforms* to princess stereotypes instead of simply being a boy who wears a dress.  (3) **Line 1050-1064** does not conform to the statement in Chapter 4, page 54, Lines 1381-1384, the Health Education Framework: “While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.” | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 126 continued | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | Since Chapter 4 acknowledges that gender should be described as binary for fifth graders, the Framework needs to conform to this in all the earlier grades.  **Edit Lines 1065-1077:**  **1065**<begin s>  ~~Dispelling myths about gender expectations in~~<end s> kindergarten can lay the groundwork for  **1066** acceptance, inclusiveness, and an anti-bullying environment in schools. Gender non-  **1067** conformity and physical characteristics are often at the root of many forms of bullying.  **1068** As students learn to accept differences and unique characteristics of others, they also  **1069** learn about the characteristics of bullying and how to avoid being a bully (K.1.3.G,  **1070** K.1.6.–7.S, Essential Concepts; K.7.2.M, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors).  **1071**<begin s>  ~~Discuss gender with kindergarteners by exploring gender stereotypes and~~ ~~asking open-~~<end s>  **1072**<begin s>  ~~ended questions, such as what are preferred colors, toys, and activities for boys/girls,~~ <end s> | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 126 continued | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **1073**<begin s>  ~~and then challenging stereotypes if presented. Throughout this discussion, show~~ <end s>  **1074**<begin s>  ~~images of children around the same age who do not conform to typical gender~~ <end s>  **1075**<begin s>  ~~stereotypes. Examples do not have to be exaggerated or overt. Simple differences,~~ <end s>  **1076**<begin s>  ~~such as colors or toy preferences, can demonstrate acceptance of gender non-~~<end s>  **1077**<begin s>  ~~conformity.~~ <end s>  **Recommended Paragraph:** Kindergarten can lay the groundwork for acceptance, inclusiveness, and an anti-bullying environment in schools. Gender non-conformity and physical characteristics are often at the root of many forms of bullying. As students learn to accept differences and unique characteristics of others, they also learn about the characteristics of bullying and how to avoid being a bully (K.1.3.G, K.1.6.–7.S, Essential Concepts; K.7.2.M, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors).  **Reason for Edits:** Biased: The paragraph begins with a harsh bias against the cultural norms of many children’s families – dismissing them as “myths.” The bias against the diversity of cultures is also reflected in the Recommendation to “challenge stereotypes.” The Framework should not characterize a family’s cultural expression as a “myth” and “stereotype”. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 127 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Randee Snyder,  Representing my grandchildren | Remove Lines 1050 thru 1064 Why are teachers supposed to challenge gender. Why are our tax dollars spent on this. Let those who have a problem start their own schools and teach their own ways. I'll tell you why, because there are not enough children who are confused about who they are. Maybe 1 %, So the 1% get to make the rules? How about teaching respect. Edit lines 1065, 1071 thru 1077 - Again, do not stereotype or add confusion to the children. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 128 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Michelle Childers, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Edit lines 1050-1064 to read "students also learn about individual differences, including gender, from a very early age. All forms of gender expression should be respected. reason: challenging gender stereotypes can alienate students who enjoy conforming to such stereotypes. While attempting to make non-conforming students feel comfortable, teachers should not make gender-confirming students feel uncomfortable. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 129 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Joe Sargunaraj, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Edit Lines 1050-1064: 1061 and all forms of gender expression should be respected. My Princess Boy by Cheryl 1062 Kilodavis is an age-appropriate book that can be used to demonstrate gender 1063 differences and inclusion. (See the Access and Equity chapter for additional information (2) Line 1061-1064: It is contradictory to tell educators to “challenge gender stereotypes” while at the same time stating that boys who want to dress according to girl “stereotypes” are to be supported. It, ironically, encourages gender stereotypes. My Princess Boy reflects this irony. The boy is supposedly a “princess” because he conforms to princess stereotypes instead of simply being a boy who wears different types of clothes Edit Lines 1084-1094: 1084 Partnering with your community: Members of the community who defy traditional 1085 stereotypes (e.g., women firefighters, male nurses) could be invited as guest speakers Add in line 1085: “(e.g., women firefighters, male nurses, and stay-at-home dads)” | Attachment 2B | Writer discretion/Addition to add “stay at home dads” only. |
| 130 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Angela Juarez, Community Member, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Edit Lines 1050-1064: Recommended Paragraph: Students also learn about individual differences, including gender, from a very early age. All forms of gender expression should be respected. Reasons for Edits: (1) Line 1054: “Challenging” gender stereotypes can alienate students who enjoy conforming to such stereotypes. While attempting to make non-conforming students feel comfortable, teachers should not make gender-conforming students feel uncomfortable. (2) Line 1061-1064: It is contradictory to tell educators to “challenge gender stereotypes” while at the same time stating that boys who want to dress according to girl “stereotypes” are to be supported. It, ironically, encourages gender stereotypes. My Princess Boy reflects this irony. The boy is supposedly a “princess” because he conforms to princess stereotypes instead of simply being a boy who wears a dress. (3) Line 1050-1064 does not conform to the statement in Chapter 4, page 54, Lines 1381-1384, the Health Education Framework:“ | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 131 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Louise Sozo | p.41\*, Lines 1050-1077 state: "...students can still begin to challenge gender stereotypes in a way that is age appropriate. While students may not fully understand the concepts of gender expression and identity, some children in kindergarten and even younger have identified as transgender or understand they have a gender identity that is different from their sex assigned at birth." If you want to claim some young children UNDERSTAND gender identity and actually "identify" themselves as transgender, back it up with scientific evidence. ALL children have questions about gender as they mature, but it does not mean they are transgender or "different" and not clearly male/female. Sex and gender CANNOT be "assigned" by anyone! This is silliness that is not evidence-based, scientifically supported, or medically accurate. It is not "age appropriate" to teach children to "challenge" anything, especially their natural gender. Revise the framework to teach about health, not political correctness. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 132 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Grace Pa | Recommended Paragraph: Students also learn about individual differences, including gender, from a very early age. All forms of gender expression should be respected. Reasons for Edits: (1) Line 1054: “Challenging” gender stereotypes can alienate students who enjoy conforming to such stereotypes. While attempting to make non-conforming students feel comfortable, teachers should not make gender-conforming students feel uncomfortable. (2) Line 1061-1064: It is contradictory to tell educators to “challenge gender stereotypes” while at the same time stating that boys who want to dress according to girl “stereotypes” are to be supported. It, ironically, encourages gender stereotypes. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 133 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | Lines 1050-1064: Replace section with “Students learn about individual differences from an early age. This includes physical characteristics, and gender-related behavior. The differences between students should be respected. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 134 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Kathy Yang, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | (1)Line 1054: “Challenging” gender stereotypes can alienate students who enjoy conforming to such stereotypes. While attempting to make non-conforming students feel comfortable, teachers should not make gender-conforming students feel uncomfortable. (2) Line 1061-1064: It is contradictory to tell educators to “challenge gender stereotypes” while at the same time stating that boys who want to dress according to girl “stereotypes” are to be supported. It, ironically, encourages gender stereotypes. My Princess Boy reflects this irony. The boy is supposedly a “princess” because he conforms to princess stereotypes instead of simply being a boy who wears a dress. (3) Line 1050-1064 does not conform to the statement in Chapter 4, page 54, Lines 1381-1384, the Health Education Framework: “While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners th | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 135 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Rebecca Drexler Tweedle | Do not make and changes a deletions to lines 1050-1064,1065-1077, 1084-1094. Even though I personally conform to most gender stereotypes, I was embarrassed as a young child because my favorite color is blue and I thought that wasn't a girl color. I think this form of open-ended questions need to remain to help all kids feel accepted. Adding "Stay-at-home moms" seems to go against the point of this exercise as it conforms to gender norms. It should be changed to "stay-at-home dads" as my husband stayed at home in the beginning of our son's life while I went back to work after my maternity leave. Or for inclusivity it can be "stay-at-home parent". No other changes should be made. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 136 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Greg Habbestad, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Lines 1061-1063. Remove reference to ""My Princess Boy" by Cheryl Kilodavis. It is not appropriate for these grade levels by the standards of many Californians. Lines 1050-1064. Gender should be treated as binary, particularly at these early ages, as described in Chapter 4. Lines 1065-1077: The paragraph begins with a dismissive bias against the cultural norms of many children’s families – dismissing them as “myths.” The bias against the diversity of cultures is also reflected in the RECOMMENDATION to “challenge stereotypes.” The Framework should not characterize a family’s cultural expression as a “myth” and “stereotype”. Lines 1084-1094: Students from culturally traditional families are not represented anywhere in the Health Framework. It is biased to characterize children’s traditional cultures as “myths” and “stereotypes” that must be busted and defied. The underlying progressive message seems to be that only certain cultures are to be affirmed, while traditional ones eschewed. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(6)  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 137 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Howard Taras,  Other, School District Physician; Professor at UCSD | Lines 1065 to 1077: This is great as it is. Please note: I know there is some opposition to this section. However, I disagree with it. A family's cultural beliefs and expression can support a family member's gender identification or discriminate against a family member's gender identification. But it cannot create or recreate that family member's gender identification. Lines 1084-1094: There has been some suggestion that we should add to traditional stereotypes, and include "stay-at-home moms and stay-at-home dads". I am okay with this change. Lines 1520 to 1524 I like the "all family structures are valid". Please keep that. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 138 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 42\*, Edit Lines 1084-1094:**  **1084** Partnering with your community: Members of the community <begin s> ~~who defy traditional~~ <end s>  **1085**<begin s> ~~stereotypes~~<end s> (e.g., women firefighters, male nurses) could be invited as guest speakers  **1086** to share about their jobs and to serve as role models <begin s> ~~and myth busters~~. ~~Be sure to~~ <end s>  **1087**<begin s> ~~include individuals of all genders, including people who are transgender.~~ <end s> Students write  **1088** and illustrate a collective letter requesting a healthcare professional to speak to the  **1089** class. Dental providers may offer free dental health checks or fluoride treatments (with  **1090** permission). School nurses can provide mandated vision and hearing assessments for  **1091** all kindergarteners. As a part of this process, school nurses may provide referrals for  **1092** follow-up with community vision and hearing services providers. In addition, students,  **1093** families, teachers and staff may reach out to their school nurse as a health resource at  **1094** any time (K.1.4.G, Essential Concepts).  **Add in line 1085:**  “(e.g., women firefighters, male nurses, and stay-at-home moms and/or dads)” | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(6) |
| 138 continued | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **Reasons for Edits**:(1) Nowhere in the Health Framework are students from culturally traditional families represented. It is biased to characterize children’s traditional cultures as “myths” and “stereotypes” that must be busted and defied. The families of these students need to be included throughout the Framework.  (2) **Line 1087** does not conform to the statement in Chapter 4, page 54, Lines 1381-1384, the Health Education Framework: “While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.”  Since Chapter 4 acknowledges that gender should be described as binary for fifth graders, the Framework needs to conform to this in all the earlier grades. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(6) |
| 139 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Jennifer Wong, College/University Faculty Member, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | -line 1084: "defy traditional sterotypes" and "mythbusters" are not an objective statement; implies a negative bias toward, for example, stay-at-home moms, who are not represented anywhere in this framework.  -Line 1087 does not conform to the statement | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(6) |
| 140 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | Line 1085: Add “stay-at-home moms” after male nurses. There is a distressing deficiency of normal and traditional family structure in the framework. Who writes this stuff? | Att 32+ | Not Recommended |
| 141 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 42, line 1089- class. Dental providers may offer free dental health checks<begin h> **and identify students in need of care. Dental providers may also offer other preventive services, such as** <end h> fluoride treatments <begin h> **, with parental consent**<end h> (with permission) | Att 14 | Recommended |
| 142 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p.42, line 1092- follow-up with community <begin h> **dental**<end h>, vision and hearing services providers. In addition, students, | Att 14 | Recommended |
| 143 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Maureen Legg on behalf of the Eric Paredes Save a Life Foundation | p. 46, line 1188- Insert in 1188:…a guest speaker from the fire department or local emergency management services to provide education on emergency protocol, including introducing students to an automated external defibrillator (AED) as an important emergency rescue device, and if the school has one, showing students where it is to demonstrate how people can help emergency personnel help others. | Att 05 | Writer’s Discretion/Addition of AED. |
| 144 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Elena Costa, California Tobacco Control Program, California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program Staff Member | Page 51, lines 1336-1340, please consider removal of the comma between the word “thirdhand” and “smoke” to clarify that these two words are one concept. Page 53, lines 1400-1405, discuss the 2002 book “Smoking Stinks” and the main character’s “lack of sleep from her grandfather’s coughing and smoking (in the home) (and that it) is causing her to lose focus in school”. Consider seeking input from CDE’s, TUPE Program on RECOMMENDATIONs for age appropriate educational resources which shift the burden of addressing exposure to secondhand smoke in the home to the caregiver, rather than the child. Page 93, lines 2486-2487, references a problem-solving scenario where older students offer a cigarette to a younger student. Consider shifting the focus from cigarettes to electronic smoking devices given that CHKS 2015 reports “Students in all grades are also twice as likely to vape on school property than smoke cigarettes”. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 145 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 55, lines 1451-1453  original text:  Who are trusted adults? Students learn that their parents, guardians, caretakers, older family members, teachers, religious or community leaders, or the principal can all be trusted adults.  Suggested text:  Who are trusted adults? Students learn that their parents, guardians, caretakers, older family members, teachers, <begin h> school counselor, <end h> religious or community leaders, or the principal can all be trusted adults. | Att 21c | Recommended. |
| 146 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 58\*, Edit Lines 1520-1524**  **1520** After reading the book, *The Great Big Book of Families* by Mary Hoffman (2010) or  **1521** *Families Are Different* by Nina Pellergrini (1991), students learn that there are different  **1522** family structures in our society<begin s> ~~and that all family structures are valid.~~ <end s> For example,  **1533** there are immigrant families; families with lesbian, gay, bisexual, or<begin s> ~~transgende~~r <end s>  **1534** parents, guardians, or caretakers and children; families of various race and ethnicities;  **1535** step- and blended families; families headed by single parents, guardians or caretakes;  **1536** extended families; multi-generational families; families with members with disabilities;  **1537** families from different religious traditions; foster families; and adoptive families.  **Delete in line 1522:** “all family structures are valid.”  **Add in line 1523:** “families with both a mother and a father” | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51930(b)(2)  EC 51933(c)  EC 51933(d)(1)  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(5)  EC 51933(i) |
| 146 continued | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **Reasons for Edits**:(1) The Health Education Framework must include families with both mothers and fathers. Students from these families need to see themselves represented along with others. As teachers, we must also be careful not to marginalize and alienate cultural groups (orthodox Muslims, Jews, Mormons, Christians, etc.). Remove the phrase that “all family structures are valid” as it offends many cultural beliefs that should be respected and not diminished in school.  (2) **Inconsistent with Chapter 4:** The reference to transgenders in third grade does not conform to the statement in Chapter 4, page 54, Lines 1381-1384, the Health Education Framework: “While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.”  Since Chapter 4 acknowledges that gender should still be described as binary for fifth graders, the Framework needs to adhere to this in all the earlier grades. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51930(b)(2)  EC 51933(c)  EC 51933(d)(1)  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(5)  EC 51933(i) |
| 147 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 58\*, Line 1522: Delete “all family structures are valid.” This is an undefined, unsupported, and unnecessary characterization. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended. |
| 148 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 58\*, Line 1523: Add “families with both a mother and a father” at beginning. This should be recognized as the most proven and common structure. Delete “transgender” as not legally supported. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51930(b)(2)  EC 51933(c)  EC 51933(d)(1)  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(5)  EC 51933(i) |
| 149 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Maureen Legg on behalf of the Eric Paredes Save a Life Foundation | p. 75, line 1991- Insert in 1991: If a school has an automated external defibrillator (AED), students should be shown where it is, and how it can be retrieved and used for a person who is having sudden cardiac arrest and are not breathing. Accessing Valid Information (Grade 3) Standard 3-3.1.P Recognizing individuals who can assist with health related issues and potentially life-threatening health conditions (eg: asthma episodes or seizures) | Att 05 | Writer discretion/Addition |
| 150 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 77, Line 2043- children have 20 baby teeth that are important to keep clean and healthy by brushing twice a day with a toothpaste containing fluoride. and flossing twice Children should also begin to learn to floss as soon as two of the teeth touch each other to remove dental plaque and food where a toothbrush can’t reach. Brushing twice a day and flossing twice once a day at night removes germs that can cause disease and cavities2.  2. https://www.mouthhealthy.org/en/az-topics/d/decay | Att 14 | Writer’s discretion/Addition |
| 151 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 86, lines 2271-2274- To support their growing body, children’s diets should include fruits and vegetables, whole grains, lean protein<begin h> (including beans, peas, and soy products), <end h> and low-fat calcium-rich foods each day, <begin h> particularly from plants. Cautions about processed whole grain should be taught and teachers should emphasize that virtually all breads in the market are processed to the point of having little, if any of their original whole grain value. Many types of bread are devoid of the healthy bran and germ part of the grain and leave only the mildly nutritious at best endosperm The USDA cautions h<end h> <begin s> ~~H~~<end s> igh-sugar and high-fat food and beverages should be “sometimes” foods (USDA 2017). <begin h> However, students need to know the consequences of sugar on health, but on the degree to which it instills further cravings. Discussion can be facilitated regarding what is legal is not necessarily beneficial to one’s health. Students at this age are trying to make sense of behaviors and parameters set around food in their environment and cannot on their own make sense of all the information needed to make healthy choices for their future. Although teachers should use caution if drawing comparisons of those who consume excess sugary products to those addicted to nicotine or alcohol, students need to know that some artificial substances have the effect of making a consumer crave more in the moment and in the future. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 152 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 86, lines 2277-2279- With teacher assistance, students search the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) and other reliable, medically accurate resources for food groups and Recommended portion sizes. <begin h> However, it should be emphasized that controlling portion sizes of substances specifically designed to activate specific pathways of the brain make controlling portion sizes most difficult at best and could fatigue components of the brain in charge of reward postponement. Educators are encouraged to work with families to convey that surrounding the students in a healthy food environment will eliminate the need to enact this resistance and will serve to set their children up for success. By this stage of a child’s development, teachers need to be aware that a large portion of their students are already overweight and obese. Not emphasizing food environment’s role in the obesity epidemic could lead to feelings of moral inadequacy or impairment. These feelings are not productive and do not address the true nature of the risks to obesity and later the accompanying chronic illnesses. If students know that the food environment is a major contributor to their risks to obesity and that if an unhealthy food environment were replaced by a healthy one, they would have virtually no risk for obesity. Knowing they can overcome the risks to obesity if the environment changes will serve to inspire them to take action to create it. This would in turn facilitate the behaviors needed to make healthy choices. Family engagement is essential in reshaping a family’s food environment. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 153 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 86, line 2279- Add: Students learn the role of each food group in supporting overall health, and use sorting activities to discover a wide variety of foods that fit into each food group category. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 154 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 86, line 2283- Add: For example, students can prepare and enjoy wellbalanced snacks together, such as a whole grain cracker with a bean dip such as hummus, and a variety of sliced fruits and vegetables on top. Whenever possible, incorporate fruits and vegetables grown with the students in a small container or school garden in order to increase their enthusiasm and motivation to try these foods. They can even plant the food groups by growing wheat or another grain; beans for protein; and any fruits or vegetables that grow well in their region. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 155 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 86, lines 2293-2294- Students are surprised to learn and to compare and contrast the sugar content of each product; they learn that beverages such as water and<begin s> ~~milk~~<end s> <begin h> other whole food fruit and vegetable smoothies mixed with water <end h> contain no added sugar and are healthy choices. | Att 03 | Writers discretion/Addition to add whole food fruit and vegetable smoothies. |
| 156 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | p. 86, lines 2295-2297-  **Comment:** This statement defines chocolate milk as a sugar-sweetened beverage (SSB). All flavored milks are not included in the definition of SSB in California state laws restricting SSB in school meals or SSB taxes, in the California Healthy Kids survey, nor is it used in scientific research on SSB. Unlike soft drinks, fruit drinks and sports drinks; flavored milk is a nutrient-rich beverage that contains naturally occurring sugar, similar to sugars found in fruits, and contributes only 4% of added sugars in the diets of children 2-18 years. Flavored milk is included in the National School Lunch and Breakfast Programs, and the American Academy of Pediatrics states: “consumed within Recommended calorie amounts, sweetness can offer an effective tool to promote consumption of nutrient-dense foods and beverages.”  Milk is a healthy beverage choice and regardless if it is flavored or not, it offers the same unique nutritional package to help children achieve a balanced, healthy eating pattern, which includes adequate amounts of all required nutrients. For children, milk is a leading source of essential nutrients (including calcium, protein, vitamins A, D, and B12) that are important for growth and development. | Att 19 | Writers discretion/addition. |
| 156 continued | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | For these reasons, we urge you to remove “chocolate milk” from this paragraph to prevent the unintended consequence of classifying chocolate milk as a SSB like soft drinks, fruit drinks and sports drinks.  **Recommendation:** Revise lines 2295-2297 to read:  Through guided discussion, students learn that there are many commercials, media messages, and online images promoting soda, sweetened beverages such as sports drinks, high-sugar juice drinks and juices.  *\*References cited in this comment are included in Att 19* | Att 19 | Writers discretion/addition. |
| 157 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | p. 86, line 2297: We urge you to remove reference to flavored milk as a sugar-sweetened beverage (SSB) to be consistent with definitions in California state laws restricting SSB in school meals or SSB taxes and in scientific research on SSB. Milk provides key under-consumed nutrients for healthy growth and development | Att 19 | Writers discretion/addition. |
| 158 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 86-87, 2299-2303- Students learn that water, <begin s> ~~milk,~~ <end s> low-sodium soups~~,~~ <begin s> ~~and low-sugar or diluted juices~~<end s> <begin h> whole fruit and vegetable smoothies, and even fruits themselves being over 95% water<end h>, are the healthiest beverage choices because they keep them hydrated (which is essential for their brain and body systems to grow and function) and because they have no or small amounts of <begin s> ~~sugar and~~<end s> calories with<begin h> no added sugar. <end h> | Att 03 | Writers discretion/addition to add whole food fruit and vegetable smoothies. |
| 159 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 87, line 2303 Add: Students prepare and enjoy a healthy beverage together, such as a smoothie made by blending together fresh fruits, low-sugar or diluted juice, and unsweetened yogurt. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 160 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 87, lines 2308-2310-Remember that some students may experience physical and economic lack of access to safe and nutritious foods. <begin h> However, educators must understand that these students should not be excused from knowing the choices that must be made to achieve good health and avoid obesity and its accompanying chronic illnesses. Ignoring these students’ need for information on proper health would be like ignoring certain students’ need to learn automaticity in math, or critical reading in English language arts simply because they have incredibly more challenging home lives than students that already come ready and eager to learn. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 161 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 87, lines 2240-2249- Students use a decision-making process to select healthy foods (2.5.1.N, Decision Making), compare and contrast healthy and less healthy food choices for a variety of settings (2.5.2.N, Decision Making), and practice making healthy eating choices with friends and family (2.8.1.N, Health Promotion) <begin h>. The pitfalls of eating out, particularly at fast food restaurants should be taught. Although a teacher may be hard pressed to find restaurants with any completely healthy choices on their menus, teachers can teach students how to talk to the waiter in clear terms about what the cook must do in order to adapt a selected menu item so that it is health promoting rather than sickness promoting. Students should be encouraged to inquire about added sauces, which are generally made using oils, salt and sodium substances, and sugar and sugar substances. Students should understand that many waiters and cooks simply assume sauces are understood to come inseparable from the item. <end h> <begin s> ~~using printed menus available online from their favorite restaurants. With the assistance of the teacher, students identify and circle the healthy options on the menus that they have selected.~~ <end s> In small groups, students role play being at a restaurant and ordering their<begin h> adapted<end h> identified healthy items or asking their parents, guardians, or caretakers to order <begin s> ~~the~~ ~~healthy food~~<end s> this item for them. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 161 continued | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | Students take their menus home to reference the next time they are at<begin s> ~~their favorite~~<end s> this restaurant~~s~~. <begin h> Family engagement activities should be the venues to emphasize the more healthy benefits of preparing whole plant based foods at home. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 162 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 88, line 2349- Add: Students participate in a read aloud of “Don’t Yuck My Yum” by Amy Pleimling (2014) to learn the importance of being polite when trying new foods. They discuss ways to politely express when they do not like a new foods, such as by saying “This isn’t my favorite,” or “I think my taste buds need more time to get used to this one.” Then they create Healthy Food Passports where they can record their new taste adventures. Finally, they practice trying new healthy foods together. They participate in comparative tastings with fresh fruits and vegetables, or other healthy foods. When they try something new, they rate it on a scale of “Tried It; Liked It; Loved it!” and use adjectives to describe the smell, flavor, and textures of each new food. For each new fresh fruit or vegetable or other healthy food they try, they add a sticker or stamp to their Healthy Food Passport with the goal of tasting as many new, healthy foods as possible over time. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 163 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 89, line 2365-  <begin s> ~~Check juice labels to ensure that they are 100% juice.~~ <end s> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 164 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 89, line 2365- Add the following to the list:  ● Have a fruit or vegetable at every meal.  ● Choose new fruits and vegetables to try when you’re at the market.  ● Try growing a fruit or vegetable at home.  ● Chop up a bunch of vegetables, such as carrot sticks or bell pepper strips, and store in the fridge for easy, healthy snacks. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 165 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 90, lines 2406-2407- These are excellent activities, however, they should not be solely relied on as adequate physical activity. <begin h> A teacher should also emphasize that physical activity can never be a substitute for healthy nutrition and be able to impart the reasons why to their students. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 166 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 90, lines 2450-2452- Students write a letter to their favorite restaurant headquarters encouraging them to offer healthier menu options (2.5.2.N, Decision Making). <begin h> Alternatively, the class could choose a restaurant from a list the teacher (with administrative support) suggests, read copies of its menu, and students in groups could adapt one item converting it from a sickness promoting item to a health promoting one. Then, the class can write a letter to one of the restaurants to see if they could adapt the item for them, if they were to patronize the establishment. If so, the school could consider taking the class on a field trip to the restaurant and experience their healthy item with a talk by the culinary artist/chef who prepared it. Alternatively, the restaurant’s chef could come to the school and prepare the item for them or the restaurant could have it delivered. <end h> | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line addition. |
| 167 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | Page 92, lines 2442-2446  Current text:  Partnering with your school: Host a screening for parents, guardians, and caretakers of the free movie, *The Weight of the Nation for Kids: Confronting America’s Obesity Epidemic*, or a similar movie, followed by a Question and Answer (Q&A) session and discussion with vetted guest speakers, the school nurse, or other school health personnel…  Suggested text:  Partnering with your school: Host a screening for parents, guardians, and caretakers of the free movie, *The Weight of the Nation for Kids: Confronting America’s Obesity Epidemic*, or a similar movie, followed by a Question and Answer (Q&A) session and discussion with vetted guest speakers, the school nurse, <begin h> school counselor, <end h> or other school health personnel… | Att 21c | Recommended |
| 168 | 3— TK– Grade 3 |  | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP – CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 93, Lines 2474-2477- Students identify that a drug is a chemical that changes how the body and brain work (2.1.3.A, Essential Concepts) by labeling an anatomy diagram that shows the ingestion pathways of the substance (esophagus, stomach, and liver). <begin h> Similarities of the brain changes that occur when alcohol, tobacco, and other drugs are used to the brain changes that occur when processed foods specifically designed to activate these same brain pathways can begin to be addressed at this age. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 169 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 110\*, Edit Lines 2888-2894**:  **2888** …Students this age are also highly interested in the  **2889** digestive<begin s>  ~~and reproductive organs~~. ~~When providing instruction on sexual and~~ <end s>  **2890**<begin s>  ~~reproductive organs, teachers can introduce the concept that gender does not always~~ <end s>  **2891**<begin s>  ~~match the sexual and reproductive organs described. For example, teachers may share,~~ <end s>  **2892**<begin s>  ~~“In the classroom, we may use the term ‘female reproductive organs’ but some people~~ <end s>  **2893**<begin s>  ~~who feel they are male may have these organs.~~ <end s> The actual anatomical name for organs  **2894** is utilized.  **Reason for Edits**: **Inconsistent with Chapter 4:** This section does not conform to the statement in Chapter 4, page 54, Lines 1381-1384, the Health Education Framework: “While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.” Since Chapter 4 acknowledges that gender should be described as binary for fifth graders, the Framework needs to conform to this in all the earlier grades. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended. |
| 170 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Survey | Kristin Spieler, P/G/C of TK-12 Student, Parent of 3 children in the district | p. 110\*, Lines 2889-2893: Third grade is too young to introduce a discussion of “feelings” about sexual identity as a large majority of the kids will not have the cognitive understanding to comprehend this beyond just a lesson on physical traits and characteristics of the body. Students in third grade will likely be more confused by a statement like “some people who feel they are male may have these organs” (“these” is referring to female reproductive organs). This may be especially confusing if discussion reproductive organs is an entirely new concept at this age. It is more appropriate to talk about the fact that some girls with female organs may prefer looking, dressing and acting more like a boy while at the same time not suggesting that just because a girl dresses or looks like a boy then they wish they were a boy. In other words, sometimes girls will dress like a boy because they wish they were a boy and sometimes they dress that way just because they prefer that type of clothing. In | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 171 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Meghan Yap on behalf of the California Coalition Against Sexual Assault | p. 110\*, lines 2892-2893- “In the classroom, we may use the term ‘female reproductive organs,’ but some people who identify as male may have these organs.”  *The same comment was submitted by the California Department of Public Health (link to letter) and the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence (link to letter)* | Att 10 Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 172 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Maureen Legg on behalf of the Eric Paredes Save a Life Foundation | p. 114, line 3007- Insert at 3007: An additional extension to this heart health activity is to discuss that sometimes there are heart emergencies when the heart stops and needs to be restarted. A review of 9-1-1 protocol can include how to call for help, and how CPR can help keep a heart beating until help arrives. Explain how the proper method of compressions – 100 to 120 beats per minute hard and fast in the center of the chest – helps blood and oxygen continue to circulate in the body. Research has shown that acquiring these skills early sets the stage for reinforcement in subsequent grade levels. (PEDIATRICS Volume 141, number 6, June 2018:e20180705) Personal and Community Health (Grade 3) Standard 1-1.4.P Identify life-threatening conditions (eg: heart attacks, asthma attacks, poisoning); Accessing Valid Information (Grade 4) Standard 3-3.5.S Demonstrate how to dial 9-1-1 or other emergency numbers and how to provide appropriate information. | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion/line edit and addition. |
| 173 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | pp. 117-118, lines 3091-3094  **original text:**  Educators should be sensitive to and aware of foster or displaced children who may have not spent much of their lives with a current family member. In this situation, students can interview a teacher, the principal, a counselor, a family friend, or another trusted adult.  **Suggested text:**  Educators should be sensitive to and aware of foster or displaced children who may have not spent much of their lives with a current family member. In this situation, students can interview a teacher, the principal, a <begin h> school <end h> counselor, a family friend, or another trusted adult. | Att 21c | Recommended |
| 174 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 128, Line 3356- Approximately 20 million children in the United States live with a chronic illness, with <begin h> **dental caries3 and**<end h> asthma being the most common (CDC 2017a).  3.https://www.cdc.gov/healthywater/hygiene/disease/dental\_caries.html | Att 14 | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 175 | 3— TK– Grade 3 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 128, Iine 3359, issues such as obesity, asthma, diabetes, dental carries <begin h> **caries**<end h>, attention deficit hyperactivity | Att 14 | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 176 | 3—TK– Grade 3 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 136, line 3570  **current text:**  Each card contains information for various contacts such as the teacher, school nurse, principal, counselor, parent, guardian, caretaker, trusted adult, or community organization.  **Suggested text:**  Each card contains information for various contacts such as the teacher, school nurse, principal, <begin h> school <end h> counselor, parent, guardian, caretaker, trusted adult, or community organization. | Att 21c | Recommended. |
| 177 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Rebecca Mui, CRED Teacher TK-12 | For additional resources on how to support transgender and gender non-conforming students in the classroom, visit the GLSEN's site: www.glsen.org/trans. \*Note, GLSEN is no longer writing out our acronym. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s discretion/line edit |
| 178 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | In keeping with the Recommended edits stated for Chapter 1, we suggest that food RECOMMENDATIONs for students focus on healthy eating patterns rather than specific nutrients. There are several instances in this chapter where individual nutrients like calcium, fat and sugar are emphasized, which could have unintended consequences for developing healthy eating patterns (lines 18-21, 182-287, 274-278). Instead of focusing on food components to avoid, a more positive approach would be to emphasize what to eat, nutrient-rich choices from the food groups. | Att 19 | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 179 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 1, line 8  **original text:**  Teachers, school nurses, administrators, curriculum specialists, and district personnel are in a unique and important position to mentor and guide students in adopting skills, practices, and positive health behaviors that will lead to healthy outcomes and communities now and for years to come.  **Suggested text:**  Teachers, school nurses, <begin h> school counselors<end h>, administrators, curriculum specialists, and district personnel are in a unique and important position to mentor and guide students in adopting skills, practices, and positive health behaviors that will lead to healthy outcomes and communities now and for years to come. | Att 21d | Recommended. |
| 180 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 1, lines 18-21  To support their growing body, children’s diets should include fruits and vegetables, whole grains, lean protein and low-fat calcium rich each day. It should be emphasized that beans and peas and the like and soy products are lean proteins and are a part of MyPlate (USDA). Children must know all other plant sources, especially when a variety is consumed, provide more than sufficient protein to meet their Recommended Daily Allowances. Additionally, it should be emphasized that plants, not only dairy products, are sources of calcium rich foods. Although the USDA (2017) puts forth Hhigh-sugar and high-fat food and beverages should be “sometimes” foods., students need to know that these foods are specifically designed to create and stimulate pathways in the brain that lead to unhealthy short term and long term cravings for more, to the detriment of one’s physical and mental health. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 181 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 2, lines 28-30-  Regular physical activity builds strength, coordination, self-sufficiency, and confidence; enhances overall health; and can improve academic performance and sleep. Sleep rejuvenates the brain facilitating greater restraint from short term rewards over long term ones, such as good health. | Att 03 | Not Recommended |
| 182 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 3\*, lines 49-53**  **Add Sentences following Line 53:** Students who spend an hour or more on social media websites (Facebook, Instagram, etc.) are more likely to use or misuse substances than students who do not (The National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse at Columbia University, 2011). Research shows students who participate in their religion regularly have higher academic performance, are less likely to abuse substances, more likely to graduate high school, and more likely to enroll in college than their unaffiliated counterparts (See End Notes: Horwitz 2018; Loury 2004; National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse 2010; John Wallace et al., nod). Affirming students’ religious beliefs and encouraging less time spent on social media can have a positive influence and the students’ performance and the school’s success. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 183 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Jenn Hale, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 3\*, Grade 4, Lines 49-53 49 “Substance use and abuse costs our nation billions of dollars annually. Research 50 confirms a positive correlation with underage substance use and misuse and poor 51 academic performance, academic failure beginning in upper elementary grades, low 52 school attendance, lack of school commitment, and low school-completion rates 53 (Substance Abuse and Mental Health Service Administration [SAMHSA] 2017).” Add Sentences following Line 53: Students who spend an hour or more on social media websites (Facebook, Instagram, etc.) are more likely to use or misuse substances than students who do not (The National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse at Columbia University, 2011). Research shows students who participate in their religion regularly have higher academic performance, are less likely to abuse substances, more likely to graduate high school, and more likely to enroll in college than their unaffiliated counterparts (See End Notes: Horwitz 2018; Loury 2004; Nat | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 184 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Howard Taras, Other, School District Physician; Professor at UCSD | p. 3\*, Lines 49-53 Citing research that demonstrates correlations and associations, is different from citing research that has shown a cause-and-effect. So, I would eliminate these lines altogether, unless you can find some literature that shows the cause-and-effect association between underage substance abuse and poor academic performance. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 185 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 4\*, Line 85: Add “gender dysphoria,” after “eating disorders”. Basis is need for student awareness the medical categorization. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended. |
| 186 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Angela Juarez, Community Member, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Lines 49-53 Add Sentences following Line 53: Students who spend an hour or more on social media websites (Facebook, Instagram, etc.) are more likely to use or misuse substances than students who do not (The National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse at Columbia University, 2011). Research shows students who participate in their religion regularly have higher academic performance, are less likely to abuse substances, more likely to graduate high school, and more likely to enroll in college than their unaffiliated counterparts (See End Notes: Horwitz 2018; Loury 2004; National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse 2010; John Wallace et al., nod). Affirming students’ religious beliefs and encouraging less time spent on social media can have a positive influence and the students’ performance and the school’s success. Edit Lines 96-99 Recommended Change: Remove the end of the sentence on line 98, “making sexual health education a critical content area in late elementary.” Reason f | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 187 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | p. 3\*, line 53\*- Add Sentences following Line 53: Students who spend an hour or more on social media websites (Facebook, Instagram, etc.) are more likely to use or misuse substances than students who do not (The National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse at Columbia University, 2011). Research shows students who participate in their religion regularly have higher academic performance, are less likely to abuse substances, more likely to graduate high school, and more likely to enroll in college than their unaffiliated counterparts (See End Notes: Horwitz 2018; Loury 2004; National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse 2010; John Wallace et al., nod). Affirming students’ religious beliefs and encouraging less time spent on social media can have a positive influence and the students’ performance and the school’s success. Line 98-99 - Remove the end of the sentence on line 98, “making sexual health education a critical content area in late elementary.” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 188 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Jennifer Wong, College/University Faculty Member, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Add Line 53: Students who spend an hour or more on social media (Instagram, etc.) are more likely to use/misuse substances than students who do not (Columbia University, 2011). Research shows students who participate in their religion regularly have higher academic performance, are less likely to abuse substances, more likely to graduate high school, and more likely to enroll in college than their unaffiliated counterparts | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 189 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Kathy Yang, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Add Sentences following Line 53: Students who spend an hour or more on social media websites are more likely to use or misuse substances than students who do not (The National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse at Columbia University, 2011). Research shows students who participate in their religion regularly have higher academic performance, are less likely to abuse substances, more likely to graduate high school, and more likely to enroll in college than their unaffiliated counterparts | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 190 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Rebecca Drexler Tweedle | Do not add sentences following Line 53 as we should not bring in religion in public education as it will alienate households that do not regularly practice religion. Even though there is a citation, I wasn't able to find the references and I would question the validity to this claim, especially as in my family and social circles this is not the case and religion, or lack thereof organized religion, hasn't had any bearing of academic outcomes nor drug abuse. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 191 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 3, Lines 58-59-  At this important juncture, health educators play a pivotal role in supporting students to lead an ATOD-free lifestyle. In playing this role, educators must be aware that food products have alarmingly similar parallels to ATOD. They can be considered even more potent than ATOD in that in addition to stimulating the same neurological systems of ATOD abusers, these substances provide calories that all life requires. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 192 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | p. 3, lines 58-59- This sentence places a value on ATOD usage. Change the sentence: At this point and juncture, health educators provide options for students to make good healthy choices about an ATOD-free lifestyle. | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 193 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 4\*, Edit Lines 78-85**  **Add to Line 85, after “…eating disorders…”**: Add “gender dysphoria” to the list of childhood mental health conditions.  **Reason for Change:** Students need to understand the medical categorization and description of gender dysphoria. Gender Dysphoria DSM-5 302.85 (F64.9) | Att 28+ | Not Recommended. |
| 194 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Howard Taras, Other, School District Physician; Professor at UCSD | p. 4\*, Lines 78-85: I understand that some people want to include "gender dysphoria" to this chapter. I am not opposed to that, as long as it is in a separate paragraph from other mental health disorders (e.g., eating disorders, autism spectrum disorders, etc). That paragraph should explain that youth who try to hide how they really feel about their gender (or whose families and communities do not accept how they feel) can develop gender dysphoria. That paragraph should emphasize that "gender nonconformity" is not a mental disorder. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 195 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Jennifer Wong, College/University Faculty Member, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Add to Line 85: add “gender dysphoria” to the list of childhood mental health conditions; Students need to understand the medical categorization and description of gender dysphoria. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 196 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Michelle Childers, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Add to line 85, after "...eating disorder..." Add gender dysphoria to the list of childhood mental health conditions. Students should and need to understand the medical categorization and description of gender dysphoria. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 197 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Kathy Yang, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Add to Line 85, after “...eating disorders...”: Add “gender dysphoria” to the list of childhood mental health conditions. Students need to understand the medical categorization and description of gender dysphoria. Remove on line 98, “making sexual health education a critical content area in late elementary.” With only an estimated 3% of California High School students reported being sexually active before the age of 13, the number is significantly less for students in late elementary. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 198 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Greg Habbestad, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Add to Line 85, after “…eating disorders…”: Add “gender dysphoria” to the list of childhood mental health conditions. **Reason for Change**: Students need to understand the medical categorization and description of gender dysphoria Edit Lines 96-99 96 “An estimated 3.1 percent of California high school students reported being sexually 97 active before the age of 13. Approximately 32.3 percent of high school students are 98 sexually active, making sexual health education a critical content area in late 99 elementary (CDC 2015c).” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 199 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **Edit Lines 96-99**  **96 “**An estimated 3.1 percent of California high school students reported being sexually  **97** active before the age of 13. Approximately 32.3 percent of high school students are  **98** sexually active, <begin s> ~~making sexual health education a critical content area in late~~ <end s>  **99** <begin s> ~~elementary~~ <end s> (CDC 2015c).**”**  **Recommended Change:** Remove the end of the sentence on line 98, “making sexual health education a critical content area in late elementary.”  **Reason for Change:** With only an estimated 3% of California High School students reported being sexually active before the age of 13, the number is significantly less for students in late elementary. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended |
| 200 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Joe Sargunaraj, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Edit Lines 96-99 96 “An estimated 3.1 percent of California high school students reported being sexually Recommended Change: Remove the end of the sentence on line 98, “making sexual health education a critical content area in late elementary.” Reason for Change: Where is the data to prove that late elementary sexual education helps with the goal of reducing sexually active students. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. Research support is provided for sexual health education and in compliance with California Healthy Youth Act and EC for 5th grade and up. |
| 201 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Greg Habbestad, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Recommended Change: Remove the end of the sentence on line 98, “making sexual health education a critical content area in late elementary.” Reason for Change: With only an estimated 3% of California High School students reported being sexually active | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 202 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 5, Lines 112-114- Students who feel connected to their school are less likely to smoke cigarettes, drink alcohol, engage in unhealthy eating, have sexual intercourse, carry weapons, or become involved in violence. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 203 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 8, lines 175-187- Identify healthy food sources. Include information re: unprocessed/whole foods vs. processed/refined foods, different types of sweeteners and fats added to foods (e.g., high fructose corn syrup, artificial sweeteners, natural sugar, etc.). Include food sources high in antioxidants. Include label reading as a strategy to learn about the different ingredients and nutrients found in food—which ones and in what amounts are healthy/unhealthy, etc. | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 204 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 8, lines 182-187- Concrete thinkers, yet still largely relying on their emotional components of their brain (limbic system), fourth-grade students typically have a strong sense of fairness or justice and do not like to be wrong. Food substances marketers often use kid friendly cartoons and appealing childhood stars. If a charismatic animal cartoon tells a child a breakfast cereal loaded with sugar is “great,” even the most experienced teacher will be challenged to teach the fourth grade student that choosing a different form of breakfast is even better. For this reason, sufficient time should be built into lessons addressing healthy decision making. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. This type of content and instructional activities are included in other areas of this chapter. |
| 205 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 9, lines 220-221- Replace: “design a cereal box” with “design an advertisement for a fresh fruit or vegetable widely available in their region, including information on nutrient content, flavors, and possible preparations” | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 206 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 9, lines 227-230Students discover that water, milk, low-sodium soups, and low-sugar or diluted juices whole food smoothies with all the fiber included, and even fruits directly eaten are healthier beverage choices as they keep us hydrated (which is essential for their brain and body systems to grow and function) and have no or are low in sugar and calories with no added sugar. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. Verbiage already included of “low in sugar and calories” already addresses no added sugar. |
| 207 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 9, line 231- Add: Students grow plants in a small container or school garden and conduct experiments by watering some more than others. They then compare the impact of hydration on plants with the impacts on humans. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 208 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 9, line 233- Add: Students make various flavored waters by adding mint leaves, lemon slices, cucumber slices, or the like, to discover ways to add a bit of flavor and variety to their hydration routine without drinking highly sweetened beverages. Students make various herbal teas in the same way, by adding chamomile, mint leaves, and the like, to hot water and allowing it to steep before drinking. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food or beverages in the classroom and check for food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 209 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 10, line 240- Add: Students discuss and practice healthier ways to get an energy boost, such as by eating a piece of fresh fruit full of natural sugars or by making a simple trail mix with sunflower seeds and raisins. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 210 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 10, lines 250-252- Limiting Avoiding sugar along with healthy eating is an important component of maintaining a healthy body, along with physical activity and reducing screen time. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 211 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 10, line 254- disease of the pancreas where blood sugar cannot be regulated) and dental carries caries | Att 14 | Writer’s discretion/line edit to fix spelling error |
| 212 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 10-11, lines 261-267- Role-play or discussion scenarios accompany the decision-making process. For example, a friend wants to watch videos online on her phone eat a bowl of ice cream; instead you suggest playing outside or taking a bike ride for physical activity as you have been indoors and sedentary most of the day. Another example is you are at a your family wants to go to a restaurant that mostly serves high-fat, high-calorie foods such as hamburgers and french fries; you want to make a healthier choice so you suggest going to the produce section of the grocery store and buy as many fresh or frozen vegetables or legumes, quinoa, etc., to make a tasty soup. You suggest adding some spices such as cilantro, garlic, cumin, basil, or curry. You keep the receipt and go home and mix the ingredients in a large pot of water and cook. Your family enjoys the meal together while discussing the monetary cost of purchasing and preparing the food vs. the cost of eating at the restaurants. The costs to health and the benefits to family time can be similarly compared.. choose not to order french fries or a soda with your hamburger. Family engagement is essential for facilitating healthy choices. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 213 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 11, lines 264-267  **current text:**  Another example is you are at a restaurant that mostly serves high-fat, high-calorie foods such as hamburgers and french fries; you want to make a healthier choice so you choose not to order french fries or a soda with your hamburger.  **Suggested text:**  Another example is you are at a restaurant that mostly serves high-fat, high-calorie foods such as hamburgers and <begin s> ~~french~~<end s> <begin h> French <end h> fries; you want to make a healthier choice so you choose not to order<begin s> ~~french~~ <end s> <begin h> French<end h> fries or a soda with your hamburger. | Att 21d | Not Recommended.  According to the CDE Correspondence Guide “french” as part of french fries is not capitalized. |
| 214 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 10-11, Line 271- Elaborate on the “Five-Step Decision-Making Process” by adding examples of refusal skills to avoid non nutritious foods and including strategies for choosing healthier foods. | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 215 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 11, line 281- Add: Possible celebrations that include healthy foods and/or physical activity include playing a physical game together, such as capture the flag; or preparing and enjoying a healthy snack together, such as a fruit kabobs or a rainbow salad (containing all the colors of the rainbow). Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 216 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 11-12, Lines 285-286- Prior to the guest speaker, students research what each of these professionals do and then prepare at least one question for the guest speaker. Researching how animal products are produced and the details in which the workers engage should not be discouraged. The teacher should be prepared for controversies as fourth graders have a more bold sense for justice, even for animals. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 217 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 12, lines 289-299- Add resources/activities that educate teachers (and other school staff) on the value, quality, and healthfulness of the National School Lunch Program and School Breakfast Program. | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 218 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 13, lines 316-318- The school cafeteria manager serves as a guest speaker to discuss the nutritional value and menu selections of the school breakfast and lunch program. Depending on the size and routines of the school, such a presentation should be considered for the classroom level or small settings. Students should be encouraged to point out items that are not consistent with good health according to research they have discovered. The cafeteria manager, administration, and teacher should be prepared to tell them about the required parameters within which schools need to select foods, costs of meeting minimum requirements vs costs for foods aligned to optimum health, and what the school receives for feeding children. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 219 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 14, lines 340-344- Working in small groups students create, with teacher prepared guidelines and parameters, look up recipes for and propose one healthy homemade snack, for example a whole food fruit and vegetable strawberry low-fat yogurt smoothie or hummus and carrot sticks. The three groups with the healthiest snack proposal based on pre-established criteria (for example highest protein, highest fiber to calorie ratio) lowest sugar, moderate-to-high protein, lowest saturated fat, low-to-moderate calories) wins the prize. The entire class makes—and enjoys eating—the winning snack. An extension of the lesson might include a non-competitive taste assessments where different characteristics of taste are assessed. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 220 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 14, Lines 357-359- Students identify a healthy item or two they would like to see added to their parent’s, guardian’s, or caregiver’s grocery list. Items must be from the Recommended food groups, low in void of sugar, low in saturated fat, and salt, and high in fiber. | Att 03 | Not Recommended |
| 221 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | P. 14, lines 362-365  **original text:**  Partnering with your school: A Wellness Week can be hosted at your school. Interested teachers, members of parent organizations, the school nurse, and administrators and staff plan engaging wellness activities to be implemented in and out of the classroom during one designated week.  **Suggested text:**  Partnering with your school: A Wellness Week can be hosted at your school. Interested teachers, members of parent organizations, the school nurse <begin h> or school counselor, <end h> and administrators and staff plan engaging wellness activities to be implemented in and out of the classroom during one designated week. | Att 21d | Recommended |
| 222 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 15, line 374- Add: gardening classes | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 223 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 15, line 377- Add: Students start seeds for regionally-appropriate edible plants such as spinach or cabbage in the classroom. They take home their young plants to grow to maturity. Together with their caregivers, they tend to the plant and harvest and enjoy the produce it provides. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 224 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | P. 23, lines 578-581  **original text:**  Students are informed that if they or someone they know is in danger of hurting themselves or others to immediately contact a trusted adult such as a teacher, administrator, parent, guardian, caretaker, school nurse, or counselor or call a suicide prevention hotline, 9-1-1, or the school police.  **Suggested text:**  Students are informed that if they or someone they know is in danger of hurting themselves or others to immediately contact a trusted adult such as a teacher, administrator, parent, guardian, caretaker, school nurse, or <begin h> school<end h> counselor or call a suicide prevention hotline, 9-1-1, or the school police. | Att 21d | Recommended |
| 225 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 27, line 685- Insert at 685: Local EMS can instruct students, staff and parents on the Cardiac Chain of Survival to respond to a sudden cardiac arrest. Studies show it is the leading cause of death on school campuses, but the American Heart Association also reports that 7 out of 10 cardiac arrests happen at home, so being prepared to respond anywhere can save a life. Personal and Community Health (Grade 5) Standard 1-1.5.P Define life-threatening situations (heart attacks, asthma attacks, poisonings.) | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 226 | 4 | Survey | Elena Costa, California Tobacco Control Program, California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program Staff Member | Page 28, lines 719-721, given that 4 out 5 kids who have used tobacco started with a flavored product, please consider utilizing “flavored tobacco product” in place of “cigarette” in this example. Citation: Am J Prev Med. 2017 Aug;53(2):139-151. doi: 10.1016/j.amepre.2017.01.026. Epub 2017 Mar 16. Flavored Tobacco Product Use in Youth and Adults: Findings From the First Wave of the PATH Study (2013-2014). Page 29, lines 739-740, references “Electronic Nicotine Delivery Systems (ENDS). In 2016, CA updated the definition of these products to “Electronic Smoking Devices (ESD). Please consider updating the definition to ESDs throughout this document to match the language that is found in the CA’s Health and Safety Code. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 227 | 4 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 34, lines 864-868  **original text:**  If a student has a loved one or friend experiencing ATOD addiction, it is important for the student to know they are not alone and can contact a trusted adult such as a teacher, administrator, school nurse, or counselor for support (4.7.1.A, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors).  **Suggested text:**  If a student has a loved one or friend experiencing ATOD addiction, it is important for the student to know they are not alone and can contact a trusted adult such as a teacher, administrator, school nurse, or<begin h> school<end h> counselor for support (4.7.1.A, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors). | Att 21d | Recommended |
| 228 | 4 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 36, Lines 894-896- Late elementary is an opportune time to assist students with responsible decision-making that supports healthy choices and positive health behaviors for a lifetime amidst a sea of misinformation and advertisements targeted directly at them. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 229 | 4 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 36\*, Edit Lines 894-896**  **894** “…Late elementary is an  **895** opportune time to assist students with responsible decision-making that supports  **896** healthy choices and positive health behaviors for a lifetime.”  **Add Sentence after Line 896**: This includes affirming students’ individual religious beliefs/backgrounds, as studies prove religious participation mitigates substance abuse, increases academic performance, improves child health, vocabulary, reading, math, and social skills, and increases high school completion and college enrollment (See End Notes: Horwitz, 2018; John Wallace et al., nod; Loury, 2004; National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse, 2010; Schottenbauer, et al., 2007).  **Reason for Edit:** Assisting students in making responsible decisions that will support a healthy lifestyle, and a lifetime of positive health behaviors, must include affirming students who actively participate in their religion. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows  EC 51933(i) |
| 230 | 4 | Survey | Joe Sargunaraj, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | GRADE 5 Edit Lines 894-896 895 opportune time to assist students with responsible decision-making that supports 896 healthy choices and positive health behaviors for a lifetime.” Add Sentence after Line 896: This includes affirming students’ individual volunteer activities and religious beliefs | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 231 | 4 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 36\*, Lines 894-896: Add a sentence affirming role of individual religious beliefs or religious background as important to reducing substance abuse, poor academic performance, and supporting mental health and school completion.” | Att 32+ | Not Recommended. |
| 232 | 4 | Survey | Jennifer Wong, College/University Faculty Member, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Add Line 896:This includes affirming students’ individual religious beliefs/backgrounds; religious participation mitigates substance abuse, increases academic performance, improves child health, vocabulary, reading, math, and social skills, and increases high school completion and college enrollment (Horwitz, 2018; John Wallace et al., nod; Loury, 2004; National Center on Addiction a | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 233 | 4 | Survey | Rebecca Drexler Tweedle | Do not add sentence after Line 896 as we should not bring in religion in public education as it will alienate households that do not regularly practice religion. Even though there is a citation, I wasn't able to find the references and I would question the validity to this claim, especially as in my family and social circles this is not the case and religion, or lack thereof organized religion, hasn't had any bearing of academic outcomes nor drug abuse. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 234 | 4 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 36, Lines 915-918- Building on their foundational knowledge from earlier grades, fifth grade students continue to focus on the Recommended food groups, with particular emphasis that beans, peas, soy products from MyPlate and the like are highly lean sources of protein, with nuts and seeds having adequate protein as well. They should also know that plants provide excellent sources of calcium. Students Additionally, they must also know that portion sizes, and eating in moderation (5.1.1.N, 5.1.4.N, 5.1.7.–8.N, Essential Concepts) are concepts that are now unique to the human condition in the current food environment dominated by the current food industry. Instead of eating natural products for consumption in the wild or those directly produced from the farm, companies redesign them adding substances never before found in nature with a specific goal of conditioning the consumer’s brain to facilitate excessive consumption. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 235 | 4 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 36-37, Lines 918-922- Fifth grade students are now more influenced by their peers than in prior years and may be eating greater amounts and more frequently due to growth spurts—so opportunities for applied activities on the importance of healthy, nutritious meals, snacks, and beverages with no sugar or sodium, and not artificially altered are important (5.1.6.N, 5.1.8.N, Essential Concepts; 5.5.1.N, Decision Making; 5.7.1.N, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors). | Att 03 | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows the Health Education Content Standards. |
| 236 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 37, Lines 925-928- Or due to an increased appetite from growth spurts associated with puberty, fifth graders may be tempted to reach for unhealthy snacks or meal options such as high-fat, high-sugar, nutrient-deficient snack foods. Some students may not have access to healthy foods at home. Even further, several food industry companies are more than happy to provide educational materials, free of charge, that often contradicts the goals and objectives of educators. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 237 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 37, line 932- Add: Students explore a school garden or outdoor space to map the flow of matter and energy in the natural world, for example by drawing the sun and then an arrow labeled “energy” that goes from the sun to a plant in the garden; and another arrow labeled “energy” from the plant to an animal or human. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 238 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 37, lines 932-935- Students also learn plants get the materials they need for growth mainly from air and water versus the soil and byproducts of human activities that cause changes to natural systems that influence the materials plants need for growth (California Next Generation Science Standards [CA NGSS]: | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 239 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 37, line 937- Plant-based foods are an important part the foundation of a nutritious diet. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion. Line edit. |
| 240 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 37, line 937- Add: Students look at plants growing in a school garden or other outdoor space and discuss their ideas about where plants get the matter from which they’re made. Then they participate in a role play to demonstrate the process of photosynthesis, whereby plants take in air and water and, with energy from the sun, they use those atoms to build plant material and give off Carbon Dioxide. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 241 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 37, line 938- Add: Students harvest and enjoy a food straight from the source, such as carrots they have grown in a school garden or container. They discuss how the nutrients in that food were taken up from the soil. They compost the carrot tops to give nutrients back to the soil to grow more nutritious food, and discuss how they participate in the cycle of nutrients and matter in the garden. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 242 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 37, Lines 937-939- These connections to nutrition education provide opportunities to apply knowledge in science to health education as students compare what they eat to what animals eat other primates eat to what other animals eat. For example, the digestive systems of herbivores, omnivores, and carnivores can be compared along with other shared and unique, yet basic, anatomical, physiological, and biochemical features. | Att 03 | Not Recommended |
| 243 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 37, line 940- NOTE: This information seems overly detailed for this age group. In our experience, holistic, experiential activities that engage children with healthy foods are more effective ways to change consumption patterns than lessons that focus on the importance of specific nutrients. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 244 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 37-38, Lines 946-950- Once all correct partners are formed, students then work together with their paired partner to research foods that contain high levels of each nutrient and how their assigned nutrient impacts one’s metabolism. Students write their findings down on large paper posted around the room and present them to the entire class (5.1.3.N, Essential Concepts).For activities like these, teachers should take great care to distinguish carbohydrate in its naturally occurring form vs its processed form, e.g., high fructose corn syrup. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 245 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 38, line 950- Add: Students create Venn Diagrams with circles showing, for example, “Foods High in Potassium” and “Foods that I Like.” In the center of these diagrams, they identify foods high in each vitamin, nutrient, or mineral that they also like. Then students prepare and enjoy fresh, whole foods that are high in each nutrient together. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 246 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 38, Lines 954-958- A fun and engaging activity for students to describe the food groups and Recommended portion sizes and explain eating in moderation is to ask students in pairs or small groups to write and perform a song, skit, or poem on a chosen topic of nutrition to share with the class(5.1.1.N, 5.1.4.N 5.1.6.N, Essential Concepts). Students could be encouraged to add the lack of need to control portion sizes or eating in moderation when eating foods only available at the earlier times of human evolution, prior to industry and animal husbandry. | Att 03 | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows the Health Education Content Standards. |
| 247 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 38, Lines 965-966- Did you enjoy or try any health promoting ethnic or cultural foods you hadn’t tried before? | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 248 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 38, line 969- Add: If educators are concerned that this sharing might make some students embarrassed or ashamed due to lack of access to healthy foods at home, for example, they can engage in a similar activity using pre-selected, hypothetical meal calendars rather than by asking students to share what they actually ate over the past few days. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 249 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 38, lines 970-972- Building on this activity, students then create a “healthy vision board” showcasing their ideal healthy snacks, meals, and beverages (5.1.6.N, 5.1.8.N, Essential Concepts) being sure to include water and whole fruit and vegetable smoothies. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 250 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 38, line 972- Add: Students can use foods identified in the Venn Diagrams described above to get ideas of what to include on their “Healthy Vision Boards.” | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 251 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 38, Lines 972-978- Students set one personal nutrition goal based on their vision board. They can add challenges and barriers to achieving this goal and also list strategies that could facilitate reaching it. Students check back on their goals in one month (5.6.1.N, Goal Setting). | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 252 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 39, lines 979-983- Another fun and engaging way to motivate students to eat healthy foods is to have a cooking demonstration. An easy “no cook” healthy snack can be demonstrated by making “whole food” hummus and veggies in class (5.1.6.N, Essential Concepts; 5.5.1.N, Decision Making; 5.7.1.N, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors). Avocado to replace Oolive oil, roasting some sesame seeds adding water and avocado and putting them into a blender or food processor to make tahini, and cooking some garbanzo beans starting at the beginning of the day, cumin explaining it is made from ground plants and gives hummus one of its unique flavors, can be blended to enjoy with fresh vegetables such as carrots or cucumbers. Easier than that is making whole food plant based smoothies using lots of fresh fruits for naturally delicious flavors. Students can add high protein vegetables like spinach and broccoli. After enjoying their tasty snack they can research the nutrient content of their smoothies. They can list all the nutrients from their approximated amounts from the Nutrition Almanac or online and compare to what is Recommended for them. This activity can be extended to apply their math skills. For example working in groups students could determine ratios of calories to protein, determining how many of these they would need to consume to get their Recommended allowances of various nutrients. They could also compare this ratio to a typical meal served in their cafeteria and even compare specific nutrient contents, such as fat, Vitamin C, etc. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 252 continued | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | An even broader discussion might include how some of the nutrients might be higher in the cafeteria menu or elsewhere due to fortification. The teacher can explain why processed foods need to be fortified due to many cultures’ reliance on them as their main source of essential nutrients. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 253 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 39, lines 988-990- Add examples of nutritious/healthy snacks at home (fruit, vegetables-dried, whole; whole grain items; low-fat dairy products—yogurt, cheese, cottage cheese; low-fat protein items—jerky; plant-based items—beans, peas, lentils. | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 254 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 39, Lines 990-992- An alternative to Another parallel to this activity may be for students to analyze fast food menus, identifying healthy and unhealthy food items based on calories, sugar, portion sizes, and saturated fat. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 255 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 39, lines 993-998- More nutrition and physical activity learning activities can be found in the table below and at the California Department of Education’s Healthy Eating and Nutrition Education Web page. The Nutrition Education Resource Guide for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve (CDE 2016) serves as a resource to plan, implement, and evaluate instructional strategies for a comprehensive nutritional education program and is available on the Web site. In addition to meeting the Health Education Content Standards, this Guide was also designed to align the nutrition competencies with the Common Core State Standards. The Introduction of the California Department of Education’s (CDE’s) California Common Core State Standards (2013) encourages students “to conduct original research to answer questions or solve problems.” It puts forth “the need to conduct research and to produce and consume media is embedded into every aspect of today’s curriculum” (p. iv). When introducing nutritional curricula, it is imperative for students to investigate and possibly uncover potential hidden interests. Teachers are encouraged to guide students in finding potential hidden interests or sources for potential biases. The acknowledgement section of this Guide itself reveals the development team consisting of two CDE consultants, each with an RD (Registered Dietitian). | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 255 continued | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | The contributors to the update, ten, include one program manager from the Dairy Council of California and another RD. Students can also engage in a Web search for the sponsors of the accrediting agency for Registered Dietitians (Accreditation Council for Education in Nutrition and Dietetics). They will see that their top sponsor (Academy National Sponsor) is the National Dairy Council. The two Premier sponsors consist of nutritional supplement companies. One of the seven exhibitor sponsors for their 2017 annual conference, with over 10,000 RDs attending was The a2 Milk Company™, another one, Premier Protein, distributes supplements consisting of dairy products. Discussion about biases in producing any materials and media could be discussed with great care not to denigrate any profession or people within it. Students must realize that individuals often have and express vastly different views and opinions than the sponsors of organizations with whom they are affiliated. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 256 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 41, Lines 1039-1042- Examples of nutritious foods may include low-fat yogurt, low-fat cheese sticks cruciferous vegetables, salads, vegetable soups and stews without sodium products added, whole fruit and vegetable smoothies, beans and brown rice, and oatmeal without added sugar, salt, or fats, and whole-grain and low-sugar cereals, and whole wheat bread. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 257 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 43, Lines 1090-1092- Students are reminded that to perform well in school, sports, and activities and to avoid illness and have a healthy life, foods that are low in sugar have no added sugar, low in unhealthy fats and oils, and low in salt salt and sodium products are better choices. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 258 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 43, line 1099- Add: Following this activity, students prepare a minimallyprocessed snack, such as a carrot and beet slaw. They use nutrition facts about the ingredients to list important nutrition facts, such as “high in Vitamin C,” or “low in fats and salts.” You can find nutrition facts about fresh produce by doing a Google search of the produce item or by using the CDE’s Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Cards, found at: https://www.cde.ca.gov/ls/nu/he/nutredres.asp. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 259 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 49, Lines 1244-1246- As part of a nutrition unit after teaching food groups, and the Recommended portion sizes, and how portion control is less of an issue, if at all, if only non-processed plant based foods are chosen and taste buds are realigned to them, show before and after photos of how portion sizes have increased over time and ask the students to compare and contrast the photos. In parallel, show how nutritional choices have changed along with portion sizes. See if students can make a connection between the degree of food processing over time with portion sizes. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 260 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 49, lines 1259-1260- Students bring in empty packages of nutritious foods, beverages, and snacks or healthy snack alternatives for display. look up nutritious foods consisting of lots of vegetables, fruits, squash, tubers, legumes, nuts, seeds, etc., to display. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 261 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 50, line 1269- Add: students discuss why this has occurred and discuss strategies for reversing this trend. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 262 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 50, lines 1272-1275- Fast Food Nutrient Scavenger Hunt Students visit Web sites of fast various foods restaurants to locate the nutrient information for various popular foods, healthy and unhealthy. This activity should follow implementation of the classroom example in this chapter, Food Label Detectives. Worksheet questions can be developed to address compare pairs of foods students select. Students could then put their foods into a grid with each food item in the first column with the remaining columns composed of such variables as weight, mass, measure, calories, fat, trans-fat, percentage of calories from fat, protein, sodium, selected vitamins, etc. A simple worksheet can be developed that elicits responses showing the foods with high or low fat, sodium, protein, calorie content, etc., e.g., “What are the three foods lowest in fat?” Students could also be asked to calculate the amount of protein, vitamins, minerals, etc., they would consume if all their Recommended allowance of calories came from the foods they selected. For example, if a food contained 500 Calories and their Recommended daily consumption of Calories is 2,000, then they would multiply each nutrient by 4. This would yield the amount of each nutrient a person would obtain if their entire Recommended calorie intake was from that food. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 263 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 51, lines 1293-1296- To learn about the Recommended food groups, portion sizes, and eating in moderation, students create and play a Jeopardy! style group quiz in teams using an electronic program or other resource. They rely on multiple sources for information to develop the questions and answers. For this game, students will need to research the nutrient contents of food items, dishes, and popular menu items. The Nutritional Almanac can be an indispensable resource. Students could create one column labeled, “Nutrient content of foods equated on calories (i.e., foods based on a given number of calories).” A list of possible question responses could be given as there are hundreds of foods. An answer revealed in the Jeopardy! game could be, “This food contains the highest amount of protein.” The question response could be, “What is spinach?” Other answers revealed could take the same form for highest iron, Vitamin C, lowest sodium, etc. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 264 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 51, lines 1307-1308- Chair yoga (eyes open) is a great way to stretch and take a 5–10 minute break during long class periods. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 265 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 52, lines 1330-1332- Students plan a weekly school-wide walk around the school or neighborhood or a walk-a-thon fundraiser that promotes physical activity (5.6.2.N, Goal Setting; 5.8.1.N, Health Promotion). Teachers should be able to explain the adage, “You can’t outrun a bad diet,” as there is a prevailing misconception that inactivity is the major cause of obesity or that students can comfortably “burn off” the excesses calories typically consumed from an eating pattern that regularly includes processed foods. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 266 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 53, lines 1342-1346- Partnering with the family: Good health begins with the entire family. Share nutrition education handouts with the family with caution to ensure there are no industry influenced sponsors of it associated with unhealthy products. Parents, guardians, and caretakers can visit a local organic farm, farmer’s market, or health food store with their child even the produce section of a local grocery store (5.8.1.N, Health Promotion). Students can learn about and participate in physical activities that their family members enjoyed when they were in fifth grade. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 267 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Brenda Lebsack, CRED Teacher TK-12 | On p. 54 EC 51933 is quoted. However I find it strange that "religion" is left out of this quote when quoting this ed code. The Ed Code should properly read... • Instruction and materials in all grades may not reflect or promote bias against any person on the basis of actual or perceived disability, gender, gender identity, gender expression, race or ethnicity, nationality, RELIGION, or sexual orientation, or any other category protected by the non‐discrimination policy codified in Education Code § 220. Why was the word "religion" left out of this quote? For education to be "inclusive" and safe for ALL students educators must recognize that religion and culture go hand in hand. Recognizing different points of view on controversial subjects such as sexuality and gender is the true spirit of being "inclusive". Presenting different viewpoints is how we teach tolerance and mutual respect. Disregarding a viewpoint, as though it does not exist, is a form of "shaming". | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 268 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 54\*, Edit Lines 1369:**  **Add Sentence after 1369:** Since teachers are not medical doctors, this RECOMMENDATION by the CDC is not to be promoted by the teacher but left to parents/guardians.  **Edit Lines 1370-1376:**  **1370**<begin s> “~~While the California Healthy Youth Act of 2016 (CHYA) (~~*~~Education Code~~* ~~[~~*~~EC~~*~~] Sections~~ <end s>  **1371**<begin s> ~~51930–51939) mandates sexual health instruction in higher grades, schools are~~ <end s>  **1372**<begin s> ~~encouraged to provide age-appropriate, medically accurate sexual health instruction~~ <end s>  **1373**<begin s> ~~earlier than grade seven.~~ ~~If provided, it is important to note that per~~ *~~EC~~* ~~section 51933,~~ <end s>  **1374**<begin s> ~~instruction is required to be age-appropriate; medically accurate; and appropriate and~~ <end s>  **1375**<begin s> ~~inclusive for students of all races, ethnicities, cultural backgrounds, genders, and sexual~~ <end s>  **1376**<begin s> ~~orientations~~,” <end s>  **Edit: Remove Entire Section (1370-1376):**  **Reason: Inconsistent with Chapter 4:** Chapter 4, page 54, Lines 1381-1384, of the Health Education Framework states: “While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.” | Att 28+ | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 269 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | William Lundin, Community Member | p. 54\*, line\* 1381 "While recognizing that gender is not binary..." despite the popularizing of such ideas by Hollywood and fringe subcultures, distorting the physical and biological norms for human sapiens, indeed for all mammals, is a dastardly disservice; very new-think. Human reproductive cycle and our biochemistry relies upon a binary system. Normalizing deviant psychological occurrences, blurring the distinction between choices about sexual gratification, vs. factual matters of nature, is inappropriate for students in this age range. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 270 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Janet Chang, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Gender is "binary" for the majority of the general public. Only a small portion of our society is made up of the LBGTQ community. Do not make the curriculum more about them by including issues that are irrelevant to the general public. The majority of the children in this group have a mom and a dad that need to be referred to as husband and a wife. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 271 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 54\*, Edit Lines 1386–1390**  **1386** …Instruction on sexual health  **1387** content must affirm diverse sexual orientations and include examples of same-sex  **1388** relationships when discussing relationships. Comprehensive sexual health instruction  **1389** must also include gender, gender expression, gender identity, and the harmful  **1390** outcomes that may occur from negative gender stereotypes (EC section 51933[d][6]).  **Add Sentence: At the end of Line 1390: “…**gender nonconformity, and sexual relationships.”  **Revised Sentence Should Read:** Comprehensive sexual health instruction must also include gender, gender expression, gender identity, and the harmful outcomes that may occur from negative gender stereotypes, gender nonconformity, and sexual relationships.  **Reason for Edit:** Harmful outcomes should include the possible harmful results from gender dysphoria and sexual relationships. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(c)  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(5)  EC 51933(d)(6) |
| 272 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Howard Taras, Other, School District Physician; Professor at UCSD | Lines 1386-1390: These are okay the way they are. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 273 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 54\*, Line 1390: To harmful outcomes, add “gender dysphoria and sexual relationships before maturity.” | Att 32+ | Not Recommended. |
| 274 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **pp. 54-55\* Edit Lines 1392 – 1399**  **1392**<begin s> ~~While some teachers may prefer to~~ <end s>  **1393** <begin s> ~~separate male and female students during sexual health education, this is not~~ <end s>  **1394**<begin s> ~~Recommended. Receiving puberty and sexual health education separately can foster~~ <end s>  **1395** <begin s> ~~anxiety and misinformation between males and females and allow for some students to~~ <end s>  **1396**<begin s> ~~be mis-gendered or placed in a group that does not reflect their gender identity. In a~~ <end s>  **1397**<begin s> ~~safe learning environment where students of all genders learn together about growth~~ <end s>  **1398** <begin s> ~~and development, teachers can reduce discomfort and foster understanding about both~~ <end s>  **1399**<begin s> ~~similarities and differences in the puberty changes experienced by students.~~ <end s>  **Edit: Remove entire section:** Starting from **(1392) “**While some teachers…” and ending at “…experienced by students **(1399)**.” | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 274 continued | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **Reason for Edit:** There is no evidence to support the Recommendation not to separate students according to male and female. Males and females develop differently, at different rates, and with different physiological changes. This statement implies that teachers would be doing biological males a disservice by placing them through sexual health education applicable to males, and instead should educate them according to their gender identity (even though they will never experience the normal developmental process of a gender that is not reflective of their biological sex). | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(4) |
| 275 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Howard Taras, Other, School District Physician; Professor at UCSD | p. 54\*, Lines 1392-1399: I like that there is no separation of genders, for all | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 276 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 54\*, Lines 1392-1399: It is now less common to separate students, but I’m not aware of any published benefit of combining, or discouraging separation. Lacks medical accuracy. | Att 32+ | Non-Actionable |
| 277 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **pp. 56-66\*, Edit Lines 1434-1736**  **Edit:** Eliminate the entire section.  **Reason:** Chapter 4 acknowledges that gender should still be described as binary for fifth graders, the Framework should not Recommended sexual health education for earlier grades which would lead to education about nonbinary genders.Conflicts with state guidelines to not introduce sexual education until the 7th grade. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(a)  EC 51934(b) |
| 278 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 56\*, Line 1451-1452: Providing support to the practice of masturbation lacks medical accuracy and is an intrusion on the rights of parents to guide moral development. Delete this as not appropriate for the classroom. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended. Framework content follows EC 51931(f) |
| 279 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Lora Caldwell, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | 100% agree we need inclusive, comprehensive sexuality education, especially important is lines 1394-1396 "Receiving puberty and sexual health education separately can foster anxiety and misinformation between males and females and allow for some students to be misgendered, or placed in a group that does not reflect their gender identity." | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 280 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Kristin Spieler, P/G/C of TK-12 Student, Parent of 3 children in the district | Lines 1451-1457: Fifth grade is too young to even mention “sexual activities”, especially since some of these kids will be hearing about puberty, periods, sexual organ development, etc. for the first time. It will only serve to confuse them more as they wonder what “sexual activities” are. They are already feeling awkward at this age even talking about puberty and bodily changes so most are not developmentally ready at this age. This type of discussion should be saved until Jr. High when they are older and able to handle it more. In addition, considering that puberty can be a confusing time for young transgender students, an age appropriate discussion of this should center around how puberty is a confusing time for many students and that feelings change often about how you feel about your body, how you feel about other friends that are girls and boys, etc. There are many kids who may not be homosexual or transgender but during the confusing time of puberty may question their feeli | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 281 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 56\*, Edit Lines 1451 – 1452**  **1451**<begin s>  ~~…If the topic of~~  **1452**<begin s> ~~masturbation arises, teachers may explain masturbation is not physically harmful.~~ =<end s>  **Edit:** Remove Line 1451 starting at “If the topic of…” and Line 1452 ending at “…harmful”.  **Reason:** Masturbation is a sensitive topic amongst religious individuals of various backgrounds. Such discussions should be left to parents/guardians.  **Edit Lines 1452-1459**  **1452**…This  **1453** is also an important time to discuss gender, gender roles, and gender expression as  **1454** puberty can be a difficult time for young transgender students. Educators should  **1455** acknowledge this and create an environment that is inclusive<begin s> ~~and challenges binary~~ <end s>  **1456** <begin s> ~~concepts about gender~~. <end s> Refer to the Gender Socialization Classroom Example found  **1457** later in this section. For additional resources on how to support transgender and gender  **1458** non-conforming students in the classroom, visit the Gay, Lesbian, and Straight  **1459** Education Network’s Web (GLSEN) site.  **Edit:** Remove Lines 1452-1459 | Att 28+ | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows:  EC 52931(f)  EC 51933(i)  EC 51933(c)  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(5)  EC 51933(d)(6) |
| 281 continued | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **Reasons:**   1. Line #1454-1455: “Educators should acknowledge this and create an environment that is inclusive *and challenges binary concepts about gender*.”    1. Teachers should not *challenge* the religious beliefs of students regarding gender.   **Lines 1452-1459** Conflict With: **Chapter 4, page 54, Lines 1381-1384**“While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.” | Att 28+ | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows:  EC 52931(f)  EC 51933(i)  EC 51933(c)  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(5)  EC 51933(d)(6) |
| 282 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Joe Sargunaraj, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 56\*, Edit Lines 1452-1459 1458 non-conforming students in the classroom, visit the Gay, Lesbian, and Straight 1459 Education Network’s Web (GLSEN) site. Remove reference to an external website. Reason: This allows material that is not reviewed by parents and educators to enter the curriculum | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 283 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 66, lines 1718-1720  Ms. J encourages students to utilize school resources such as the school nurse, principal, school counselor, school social worker, or school psychologist. Ms. J also provides local online resources for students to explore on their own.  **Comment:** I like how all three are listed here, school counselor, social worker, and psychologist. | Att 21d | Non-Actionable |
| 284 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 69, lines 1796-1800  **original text:**  Some students may recognize parents, guardians, or caretakers as trusted adults, while some may not. Other resources and trusted adults should be discussed, such as teachers, school nurses, school administrators and support staff, religious leaders, coaches, law enforcement, and community organizations.  **Suggested text:**  Some students may recognize parents, guardians, or caretakers as trusted adults, while some may not. Other resources and trusted adults should be discussed, such as teachers, school nurses, <begin h> school counselors, <end h> school administrators and support staff, religious leaders, coaches, law enforcement, and community organizations. | Att 21d | Recommended |
| 285 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | p. 72\*, **Edit Lines 1832-1844**  **Edit: Add to line 1832 after “Partnering with the Family”:** Foster good relationships between students and parents. Affirm each student’s familial backgrounds and/or religious beliefs, as family attendance at religious [or] spiritual programs [is] significantly correlated with improved child health, vocabulary, reading, math, and social skills (Schottenbauer, et al., 2007).  **Reason:** Teachers must be aware of the tremendous value a family’s religious ties and orientation have on the students and the school as a whole, and affirm such behavior regardless of religious affiliation. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows  EC 51933(e)  EC 51933(i) |
| 286 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Maureen Legg,  Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 77, line 1970- Insert at 1970: A paramedic with the fire department can also provide a captivating discussion on life-threating situations (e.g. an allergic reaction to food, heart attack, sudden cardiac arrest when the heart stops beating, or asthma attack), who students should call in an emergency, and how they can help the victim by using CPR and retrieving the school’s AED when needed. | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 287 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | P, 77, line 1974- dentist, family general dentist, or hygienist can be contacted to visit the class to discuss and | Att 14 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 288 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 85, line 2176- Insert at 2176: …calling 9-1-1, how to perform CPR and knowing where the closest automated external defibrillator (AED) is. | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 289 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 85, line 2179- Insert at 2179: The presentation can review the Cardiac Chain of Survival and how everyone can have a role in helping a victim who is not breathing. Personal and Community Health (Grade 5) Standard 1-1.5.P Define life-threatening situations (heart attacks, asthma attacks, poisonings); Accessing Valid Information (Grade 6) Standard 3-3.1.S Identify rules and laws intended to prevent injuries.  See Classroom Lesson at end of this document Personal and Community Health (Grade 5) Standard 1-1.5.P Define life-threatening situations (heart attacks, asthma attacks, poisonings); Accessing Valid Information (Grade 6) Standard 3-3.1.S Identify rules and laws intended to prevent injuries  *\*The image that accompanies this comment is included in Att 05.* | Att 05 | Not Recommended. |
| 290 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 90\*, Edit Lines 2320-2323**  **2320** ~~Students learn that some people perceive guns to be cool and exciting, evoking a sense~~  **~~2321~~** ~~of power.~~ Sometimes weapons are used to intentionally harm people out of anger, hate,  **2322** frustration, revenge, or a deeply held belief. Sometimes innocent people are killed as a  **2323** result of intentional or unintentional weapon use (4.2.2. S, Analyzing Influences).   1. **Remove:** 2320<begin s> ~~Students learn that some people perceive guns to be cool and exciting, evoking a sense~~ <end s> 2321<begin s> ~~of power.~~ <end s>   **Reason:** People have different opinions about firearms. Some people love firearms, others hate them, and others are indifferent. There is no need to only emphasize that some people “perceive guns to be cool and exciting”.   1. **Add to the End of Line 2323:** although deaths from unintentional firearm discharge are very rare. 2. **Add Sentence after Line 2323:**Sometimes firearms are used in instances of self-defense, where criminal acts were mitigated, prevented, or deterred. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows Health Education Content Standards. |
| 290 continued | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **Reason:** The description of the use of firearms is biased and solely negative, which paints a picture of weapons in the US that is not reflective of reality. While people will sometimes use firearms for evil, many times people use them as a means to prevent harm at the hands of another (rape, murder, theft, etc.).  **Revised Lines 2320-2323 Should Read:**  Sometimes weapons are used to intentionally harm people out of anger, hate, frustration, revenge, or a deeply held belief. Sometimes innocent people are killed as a result of intentional or unintentional weapon use, although deaths from unintentional weapon use are very rare (4.2.2 S, Analyzing Influences). Sometimes firearms are used in instances of self-defense, where criminal acts were mitigated, prevented, or deterred. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended.  Content derived from Health Education Content Standards. |
| 291 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 91\*, Edit Lines 2324-2327**  **Add To Line 2325 after “…weapon violence.”:** Students also learn that families and friends experience sustained life from instances of justified, defensive use of firearms.  **Add To Line 2326 after “weapons safety”** “…and appropriate protections for the Second Amendment.”  **Revised Lines 2324-2327 Should Read:** Students learn that families and friends experience sustained loss and pain fromweapon violence through research of occurrences of weapon violence. Students also learn that families and friends experience sustained life from instances of justified, defensive use of firearms. They then list the laws or policies they would propose on weapon safety and appropriate protections for the Second Amendment, if they were an elected official in their community.  *\*“Sources” included with this comment are included in Att 28+* | Att 28+ | Not Recommended.  Content derived from Health Education Content Standards. |
| 292 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 93, lines 2394-2398  **original text:**  Students are informed that if they or someone they know is in danger of hurting themselves or others or is depressed or distraught to contact a trusted adult such as a teacher, administrator, parent, guardian, caretaker, school nurse, or counselor immediately for the protection of self and others (6.2.1.S, Analyzing Influences; 6.4.1.S, Interpersonal Communication  **Suggested text:**  Students are informed that if they or someone they know is in danger of hurting themselves or others or is depressed or distraught to contact a trusted adult such as a teacher, administrator, parent, guardian, caretaker, school nurse, or <begin h> school<end h> counselor immediately for the protection of self and others (6.2.1.S, Analyzing Influences; 6.4.1.S, Interpersonal Communication | Att 21d | Recommended |
| 293 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 99, lines 2572-2575  **original text:**  If a student has a loved one or friend experiencing a problem related to ATOD addiction, it is important the student knows there are people who can help and when to contact a trusted adult such as a teacher, school nurse, administrator, or counselor for support (6.5.2.A, Decision Making).  **Suggested text:**  If a student has a loved one or friend experiencing a problem related to ATOD addiction, it is important the student knows there are people who can help and when to contact a trusted adult such as a teacher, school nurse, administrator, or<begin h> school <end h> counselor for support (6.5.2.A, Decision Making). | Att 21d | Recommended |
| 294 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Survey | Elena Costa, California Tobacco Control Program, California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program Staff Member | Page 100, line 2593, please consider updating “cigarettes” to “tobacco product” as CA defines “tobacco products” broadly and this will enhance the options for students to define the problem around use within their communities. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 295 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 109, lines 2834-2835  **original text:**  Teachers should notify the school nurse, site administrators, and other school staff before students engage in this activity.  **Suggested text:**  Teachers should notify the school nurse, <begin h> school counselor<end h>, site administrators, and other school staff before students engage in this activity. | Att 21d | Recommended. |
| 296 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 115, lines 2998-2999  **original text:**  Talk to a parent, guardian, caretaker, teacher, counselor, or trusted adult about what is bothering you.  **Suggested text:**  Talk to a parent, guardian, caretaker, teacher, <begin h> school<end h> counselor, or trusted adult about what is bothering you. | Att 21d | Recommended. |
| 297 | 4—  Grades 4–6 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 117, lines 3032-3033  **original text:**  10. If needed, talk to your parent, guardian, or caretaker about finding a counselor to speak with if you are feeling stressed, anxious, or depressed  **Suggested text:**  10. If needed, talk to your parent, guardian, or caretaker about finding a<begin h> school <end h> counselor to speak with if you are feeling stressed, anxious, or depressed | Att 21d | Recommended. |
| 298 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | General Comment:  Education Code section 48205 requires schools officials to excuse students from school to attend confidential medical appointments. The school cannot require that the student have parent or guardian consent in order to attend the appointment and cannot notify parents or guardians. Confidential appointments are appointments to receive services that minors can obtain on their own consent under state or federal law. Also, in CA, children over 12 have protected confidentiality (EC 49602). Any information of a personal nature disclosed by a pupil 12 years of age or older in the process of receiving counseling from a school counselor as specified in Section 49600 is confidential. | Att 21 Att 21e |  |
| 299 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | Comment: Health instruction should be provided by credentialed health education teachers or credentialed school nurses with a specialized teaching authorization in health using evidence-based practices. While guest speakers and video resources can be an important supplemental resource for health education, the primary instruction is the responsibility of the health education teacher<begin h>. This is another opportunity to be inclusive. <end h> | Att 21e |  |
| 300 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | p. 1, line 3- Add “and challenging” after “exciting” | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 301 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | p. 1, lines 11-16- Put a period after “responsibility” in Line 13 and start a new sentence beginning with “they”. | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 302 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | p. 2, lines 34-38- Delete “may have the opportunity to engage in sexual activity” to “may have already become sexually active”. Insert a period after “activity” in Line 36 and delete “making” and begin a new sentence with “This is an opportune time for seventh and eighth grade students to learn more about…” | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 303 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 2, lines 40-41- Students this age generally enter into a vulnerable state of needing to feel a sense of belonging, love, and attractiveness. According to the State of Obesity, published by the non-profit agency, Trust for America’s Health and the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation (2017), 31.2% of children between the ages of 10 and 17 are already overweight or obese ranking California 24th among all other states. With greater self-awareness and through no fault of their own, placed in a food environment wrought with companies striving to take their money while contributing to their obesity, a strikingly high percentage of our preteens can feel trapped in their current state despite their greatest efforts to escape. Educators have a responsibility in their teaching to not dismiss obesity to simply a lack of exercise. Students at this age are beginning to comprehend the pressures big industries place on our state and federal governments to subsidize, condone, or not strictly prohibit numerous substances that serve to exploit individuals. Educators have a responsibility to become adept at and incorporate into their teaching, basic politics surrounding these substances labeled as food. Educators have a responsibility to be open to abandoning traditional and current propaganda and embrace modern research that contradicts traditional beliefs and values that might be aligned to profit these big industries. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 304 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | p. 2, lines 44-45- Add to the sentence, “and should ensure that Health Education is an elective course or incorporated into other content areas”. | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 305 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 2, lines 46-48- Students also learn essential skills for injury and violence prevention; strategies for optimal mental, social, and personal health; and responsible decision-making regarding alcohol, tobacco, and other drugs (ATOD). Students should be left with the understanding that industries specifically design substances from foods to make them hyper-palatable. Students should know these substancse share many neurophysiological effects on the brain as ATOD that contribute to their overconsumption and persistent cravings. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 306 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 2-3, lines 46-48- Include discussion about how and why certain nutrients (fats, sugars, caffeine, etc.) trigger similar responses in the brain as certain drugs. | Att 04 | Not Recommended. |
| 307 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | p. 3, Lines 77-79- Insert a transitional sentence to introduce the Health Standards. | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 308 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | p. 3, line 80-Add: “Content Areas One” before the Heading: “Nutrition and Physical Activity (N)” | Att 18 | Not Recommended. |
| 309 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | pp. 3-4, lines 81-87 We Recommended adding Dr. Isobel R. Contento’s (2016) internationally recognized definition of nutrition education, which underscores the fact that behavioral change demands broad and comprehensive education and support to ensure success. Her definition: Nutrition education is a continuum of learning experiences to develop knowledge and skills that become lifelong healthy practices. | Att 19 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 310 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Dianne Wilson-Graham, California Physical Education-Health Project | p. 4, Line 86- **RECOMMENDATION:** Replace quote, or align language with other SBE approved documents for physical education.  **Rationale:** The opinion of the author quoted here, does not align with the California physical education standards or Framework. These documents expand the primary goals of physical education, to include more elements. These should be included here. | Att 20 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 311 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 4, line 92- Add: Along with increased independence, Middle Grade students are able to take on more responsibilities, such as preparing their own snacks and lunches. Therefore, developing skills in sourcing and preparing enjoyable snacks and meals that are healthy can have tremendous impact. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 312 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 4, lines 104-109- Some seventh and eighth graders may know what a healthy snack and meal is; however, reinforcement of the importance of proper nutrition, which includes an abundance of fruits and vegetables, lean proteins, calcium-rich foods, whole grains, and foods low in void of sugar, is important as most adolescents do not receive their Recommended amount of calcium, iron, and zinc (United States Department of Agriculture [USDA], 2016). Students must also know that beans, peas, and soy products themselves are the leanest of these protein sources, along with vegetables. Nuts and seeds contain adequate protein as well. Students should also be aware that whole plants can be calcium rich natural foods and contain substantial amounts of other vitamins and minerals. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 313 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 4, lines 104-109- Include examples of non-dairy sources of calcium in addition to dairy sources of calcium. For example, after “…calcium, iron, and zinc (United States Department of Agriculture [USDA], 2016).” Add a sentences such as, “It is important that students understand that calcium sources are not restricted to dairy. There are a variety of plant based sources for this essential nutrient including [provide examples here]. | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 314 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | p. 5, Starting with Line 119- If this paragraph is highlighting an example, perhaps, starting with “For example,” the rest of the paragraph should be boxed in as an example for teachers to use. | Att 18 | Not Recommended.  The example is within the context of the entire paragraph. |
| 315 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 5, lines 120-124- Some potentially effective messages include a healthy diet is essential for optimal athletic performance, drinking plenty of water daily supports a clear complexion, or calcium, particularly directly from plants themselves, supports the creation of strong bone growth and proper posture for optimal performance in a wide array of activities. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 316 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 5, line 121- Add “academic and” after “essential for optimal” and before “athletic” so it reads “…a healthy diet is essential for optimal academic and athletic performance…” Add examples of benefits of good nutrition for learning (less tired, less sick, better concentration, etc.). | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 317 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | p. 5, lines 127-132 The nutrient deficiencies writing project suggested in this chapter should be re-evaluated as we feel it is important to look at the effect of whole foods and dietary patterns—rather than individual nutrients—on disease risk. Emerging research supports the health benefits of the entire food matrix, rather than individual nutrients in isolation. (2015 Dietary Guidelines for Americans) | Att 19 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 318 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | p. 5, Starting with Line 143- If this is an example, perhaps, start the sentence with “For example, a stove or oven is not necessary.” | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 319 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 5, lines 143-144- A blender or food processor can be brought to class to demonstrate how to make smoothies, hummus to eat with veggies, or fresh salsa, or guacamole to eat with veggies. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 320 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 6, line 152- Add the underlined section to this sentence: … by providing suggested items and participating actively in the preparation of the snack, for example by washing and chopping vegetables, measuring and blending hummus ingredients, or mashing avocados for guacamole. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. Whenever possible, incorporate foods grown by the students themselves in a garden or container to increase their motivation to try them. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 321 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 6, lines 152-157 Replace all: “cooking demonstration” with “hands-on cooking activity” | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 322 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 6, lines 168-170- Students can be reminded that breakfast does not always have to include traditional breakfast food items. For example, a quesadilla with low-fat cheese bowl of leftover beans and whole grain rice is a great way to start the day with protein. Having a whole apple, orange, or banana, or a handful of berries, or strawberries can add delicious flavor and more fiber and vitamins. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 323 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 6, lines 168-170- Use different “protein source” other than quesadilla. Use other examples…such as brown rice, beans, and salsa. | Att 04 | Not Recommended. |
| 324 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 7, lines 181-184- Change sentence to read: Health education teachers and site administrators can collaborate and engage with the school nutrition services staff to develop and implement strategies that appeal to students to encourage them to eat a nutritious breakfast. | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 325 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Chair, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 7, lines 185-201- Add zinc, magnesium, healthy fat, B vitamins to nutrients for students to investigate | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 326 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 7, line 188- Add: Whenever possible, highlight local, seasonal produce available in the cafeteria and the community at that time, such as apples or tomatoes in the fall and radishes or asparagus in the spring. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 327 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 8, lines 207-210- Students are provided a list of Web site links to find the calorie output associated with common activities and the caloric values of common foods. They are encouraged to note their portion sizes using the National Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute’s Portion Distortion Serving Card (2017) for the purpose of being able to accurately determine the caloric values. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 328 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 8, lines 217-218- Add: Note that educators should assess their classroom climate for student comfort level with sharing the above information. The journal-sharing activity may be optional. If educators are concerned that this sharing might make some students embarrassed or ashamed due to lack of access to healthy foods at home, for example, they can engage in a similar activity using pre-selected, hypothetical meals rather than by asking students to share what they actually ate. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 329 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 8, lines 222-224- Students are encouraged to continue to log their food and beverage consumption and physical activity or journal their reflections on their own (7–8.6.1-2.N, Goal Setting; 7–8.7.1.N, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors). Educators should reveal that portion control might not be necessary if processed foods, particularly those with sugar, fat, and salt, are avoided and replaced by all natural whole foods. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 330 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 8, lines 234-237- On one hand, Sstudents at this age are inundated with media images, social media, and marketing regarding body image and society’s over-emphasis on the importance of being thin or maintaining an ideal body image. On the other, they are inundated with media images, social media, and marketing serving to motivate them to consume highly processed substances that when consumed, activate neurological pathways established that facilitate further consumption of the product in the moment and for acquiring these products later. This activation is orders of magnitude beyond the activation caused by whole, natural foods. Further, these substances have an advantage over illegal substances in that they provide calories, which are needed to sustain life. | Att 03 | Not Recommended |
| 331 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 9, lines 242-245- Student discussions on healthy body images can help dispel common stereotypes surrounding society’s perception of what an ideal body image is. For example, students may be healthy, characterized by a Body Mass Index (BMI) within the healthy range, and not fall into society’s expectations around a thin physique. When discussing these issues with students or advising any particular group of students or the class, teachers must use great caution and judgment to not condone unhealthy habits or that eating a sugary, salty, or fatty processed substance even once in a while is conducive to establishing healthy behaviors. Educators, including administrators, must emphasize the food environment’s role in students’ decision making processes. Teachers can draw general parallels between nicotine and alcohol addicts describing the neurophysiological reasons why “once in a while” or “in moderation” does not work. Educators will be hard pressed to find a youth with a body image issue that is not surrounded by a food environment which in turn contributes to consuming and overconsuming substances. Schools should strive to become exemplars of healthy food environments. Family engagement efforts should serve to educate parents on this environment and what they could do to achieve it within their households. Bringing in speakers without hidden agendas or chefs with agreed upon dishes to prepare and demonstrate could serve these efforts. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 331 continued | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | In addition,Educators must remember, good and poor health habits have effects that transcend different cultural, racial, or ethnic groups may value different body types as ideal or healthy. Educators are encouraged to emphasize consumption of vegetables, legumes, whole grains, nuts, seeds, and fruits for excellent sources of protein, complex carbohydrates, vitamins, calcium and all other minerals while containing only healthy levels of sodium and fat. This way, educators can emphasize exercise and sports for their own sake rather than for burning off excess calories ingested from consumption or overconsumption of substances that have no nutritional benefit over the foods from which they came. Students should be left with an understanding that an ideal body image is far more natural and easy to obtain in an ideal food environment. Teachers can help their students identify pressures and factors in place that constitute our world’s food environment that consists of unhealthy foods with pressures to consume them. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 332 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 9, lines 256-257- Students learn that responsible decision-making within this food environment is essential to maintaining a healthy body weight with proper nutrition and safe diet practices. SThrough student research and a teacher-led discussions, provide examples of tactics advertisers use to market weight loss and weight gain supplements and diets that restrict calories or certain foods or nutrients. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 333 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 10, lines 271-276- Prior to the activity, via Web sites, students use class time to research various popular diets and healthy ways to lose weight safely or to maintain a healthy body weight. Examples include exercise, eating Recommended portions plenty of whole fruits and vegetables, drinking plenty of water, eating a variety of lean proteins from plants such as beans, peas, soy products, vegetables such as spinach and broccoli, and nuts and seeds, and whole grains such as brown rice, being aware that if whole foods from plants are the sole source of nutrients, of limiting meal portion sizes , and limiting foods high in sugar and unhealthy fats are not of great, if any, concern. Teachers should emphasize the importance of sufficient sleep to help rejuvenate the components of the brain in charge of postponing short term reward for long term gain (namely pre-frontal cortex components). The caveat that Vitamin B12 should be supplemented if not eating fortified processed foods or animal products should be discussed. A variety of reasons for this nutrient no longer being in the current natural food environment could be searched and discussed. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 334 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 10, lines 279-284  **original text:**  From additional instruction, students learn that if they or someone they know is suffering from an eating disorder or is concerned about their weight, to contact a trusted adult such as their teacher, the school nurse, or counselor for help.  **Suggested text:**  From additional instruction, students learn that if they or someone they know is suffering from an eating disorder or is concerned about their weight, to contact a trusted adult such as their teacher, the school nurse, or <begin h> school <end h> counselor for help. | Att 21e | Recommended. |
| 335 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 12, lines 339-344- Five topics, one per table, related to physical activity are written on large poster paper at each table: physical activity ideas without equipment (7–8.1.15.N, Essential Concepts); mental and social benefits of physical activity (7–8.5.4.N, Decision Making); short- and long-term benefits of physical activity (7–8.7.4.N, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors); how physical activity <begin h> and proper nutrition <end h> impacts chronic disease (7–8.1.8.N, Essential Concepts); and injury prevention strategies (7–8.1.7.P, Essential Concepts). | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 336 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 15, lines 431-435- The Nutrition Education Resource Guide for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve (CDE 2016) serves as a resource to plan, implement, and evaluate instructional strategies for a comprehensive nutritional education program and is available on the CDE Nutrition Education Web page.. As mentioned in Chapter 4, in addition to meeting the Health Education Content Standards, this Guide was also designed to align the nutrition competencies with the Common Core State Standards. The Introduction of the California Department of Education’s (CDE’s) California Common Core State Standards (2013) encourages students “to conduct original research to answer questions or solve problems.” It puts forth “the need to conduct research and to produce and consume media is embedded into every aspect of today’s curriculum” (p. iv). When introducing nutritional curricula, it is imperative for students to investigate and possibly uncover potential hidden interests. Teachers are encouraged to guide students in finding potential hidden interests or sources for potential biases. The acknowledgement section of this Guide itself reveals the development team consisting of two CDE consultants, each with an RD (Registered Dietitian). The contributors to the update, ten, include one program manager from the Dairy Council of California and another RD. Students can also engage in a Web search for the sponsors of the accrediting agency for Registered Dietitians (Accreditation Council for Education in Nutrition and Dietetics). | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 336 continued | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | They will see that their top (Academy National Sponsor) is the National Dairy Council. The two Premier sponsors consist of nutritional supplement companies. One of the seven exhibitor sponsors for their 2017 annual conference, with over 10,000 RDs attending was The a2 Milk Company™, another one, Premier Protein, distributes supplements consisting of dairy products. Discussion about biases in producing any materials and media could be discussed with great care not to denigrate any profession or people within it. Students must realize that individuals often have and express vastly different views and opinions than the sponsors of organizations with whom they are affiliated. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 337 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 16, lines 457-460- Using free technology programs such as Animoto, students create small online vignettes using characters and scripts they write to demonstrate healthy food choices and Recommended portion sizes. The vignettes are shared in class or showcased on the school’s Web site or social media sites. Teachers should emphasize the greatly reduced need to control portion sizes if choosing natural, unprocessed foods, with no additives, particularly from plant sources. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 338 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 17, lines 472-477- Students visit Web sites of fast food restaurants to locate the nutritional information for various foods they enjoy eating and compare them to the daily-Recommended guidelines. Students research healthier options, or less unhealthy options, and write a detailed plan to consume healthier alternatives either at the restaurants or elsewhere. Students can be taught coping skills when with a group of students at such an unhealthy establishment or prior to entering one. For example, water is always available and can be ordered when no healthy items exist. This can turn into a larger discussion, perhaps involving the school counselor about what to do when in situations like these. Parallels can be drawn to a recovering nicotine or alcohol addict when faced with such triggers as peer pressure, sights, and smells. Such triggers serve to wear down components of the brain that have evolved to resist such short term pleasures. Students also create a poster with images of unhealthy items with their sodium and sugar levels on one side and pictures of healthier options with their sodium and sugar levels on the other as a comparison | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 339 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 18, lines 488-491- Alternatively, students may take a walking trip to visit local stores and create a food map highlighting local stores that offer fresh fruits and vegetables along with healthy snacks such as whole food fruit and vegetable smoothies. (This activity also connects to the Model School Library Standards and CA CCSS for ELA/Literacy W.7–8.10.) | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 340 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 18, lines 498-500- Invite a health inspector from your local health department as a guest speaker for your class to discuss the prevention of foodborne illnesses and safe food handling and storage. Students could prepare questions such as sources of food borne illnesses, the extreme medical like caution that must be taken when handling and preparing animal products. | Att 03 | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows Health Education Content Standards. |
| 341 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 18, lines 502-506- As a follow-up activity, students research various occupations in public health found on the American Public Health Association and What is Public Health? Web sites and write a paper on what career interests them, why, and what degrees they would need to work in public health. Alternatively, students can brainstorm with the teacher many contrasting jobs within the food industry. Although care should be taken to manage controversy productively, controversial jobs such as those in the slaughter houses of cattle and poultry and those that must make egg and dairy production efficient for the masses. In leading these discussions, it is crucial to stay factual and non-biased as parents could get the impression that the school is advocating against these industries or individuals working in them. | Att 03 | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows Health Education Content Standards. |
| 342 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 19, lines 521-522-<begin s> ~~Limiting~~ <end s> Eliminating nutrient-deficient, high-sugar, high-fat food items is encouraged (7–8.8.1.N, Health Promotion). | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 343 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 19, line 532- Add: Where do I go to get fresh produce and other healthy foods? - Students survey their community to identify markets, stores, farmers’ markets, and/or restaurants where fresh produce and other healthy foods are available. They then create a map, brochure or other resource highlighting these food sources in their communities Consider distributing the guide to other students in the school or posting to the school’s Web site to encourage peers to eat healthy foods. In neighborhoods with limited access to fresh produce and other healthy foods, students work together to identify potential ways they might contribute to a solution, such as by bringing their concerns to city government officials and/or writing to the owners of a local convenience store to ask them to stock fresh produce. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 344 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 19, lines 535 Also encourage students and their families or caregivers to prepare and enjoy healthy foods together, such as by hosting community cooking classes or inviting guardians in to share a healthy recipe that reflects their cultural heritage. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 345 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 20, line 550- “sexual harassment, sexual assault, sexual abuse, human trafficking, adolescent relationship abuse, and intimate partner violence.”  Include topics outlined in California Healthy Youth Act.  \*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence. | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended |
| 346 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 24\*, Lines 673-675: Request that panel diversity reflect religions, family structures, and gender orientations typical of the community. Re religion, US DOE NCES report says 80% of high school seniors say religion plans an important role in their lives. Exclusion of religion from such a panel is egregious.  Line 685: Remove “Planned Parenthood” as a biased Recommendation over other groups. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended |
| 347 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | p. 24\*, line 675- **Line 675**  **Recommended change** **- include “religions”:** “REP of the range of races, ethnicities, religions, and national origins of the students.”  **Reason for the Edit:**The U.S. Department of Education’s National Center for Education Statistics (NCES) reported that, 80 percent of high school seniors indicate that religion plays a role in their lives. It reported that 55 percent consider their religion as “very important” or “pretty important.” It is reasonable to assume this is similar, if not higher, for middle school students. (Aud, S., Kewal Ramani, A., and Frohlich, L. (2011). *America’s Youth: Transitions to Adulthood* (NCES 2012-026). U.S. Department of Education, National Center for Education Statistics. p.112) | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 347 continued | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **Line 685:**  **683** …Guest  **684** speakers from your local public health department, sexual health clinic, or local  **685** nonprofit organization, such as <begin s> ~~Planned Parenthood~~, <end s> may have well-informed sexual  **686** health educators and age-appropriate materials to support comprehensive sexual health  **687** education.  **Recommended Change:** Remove: “such as Planned Parenthood”  **Reason for the Edit:** Referencing one specific organization is biased. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended |
| 348 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Jenn Hale, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 24\* Chapter 5: Grades Seven and Eight Line 675 673 ...The panel should 674 be diverse and include individuals of different genders and sexual orientations and be 675 REP of the range of races, ethnicities, and national origins of the students. Recommended change - include “religions”: “REP of the range of races, ethnicities, religions, and national origins of the students.” Reason for the Edit: The U.S. Department of Education’s National Center for Education Statistics (NCES) reported that, 80 percent of high school seniors indicate that religion plays a role in their lives. It reported that 55 percent consider their religion as “very important” or “pretty important.” It is reasonable to assume this is similar, if not higher, for middle school students. (Aud, S., Kewal Ramani, A., and Frohlich, L. (2011). America’s Youth: Transitions to Adulthood (NCES 2012-026). U.S. Department of Education, National Center for Education Statistics. p.112) Line 685: 683 ...Guest 684 | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 349 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | p. 24\*, Line 675 - Recommended change - include “religions”: “REP of the range of races, ethnicities, religions, and national origins of the students.”  p. 24\*, Line 685 - Recommended Change: Remove: “such as Planned Parenthood” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 350 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Angela Juarez, Community Member, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | p. 24\*, Line 675 Recommended change - include “religions”: “REP of the range of races, ethnicities, religions, and national origins of the students.” Reason for the Edit: The U.S. Department of Education’s National Center for Education Statistics (NCES) reported that, 80 percent of high school seniors indicate that religion plays a role in their lives. It reported that 55 percent consider their religion as “very important” or “pretty important.” It is reasonable to assume this is similar, if not higher, for middle school students. (Aud, S., Kewal Ramani, A., and Frohlich, L. (2011). America’s Youth: Transitions to Adulthood (NCES 2012-026). U.S. Department of Education, National Center for Education Statistics. p.112)  p. 24\*, Line 685: Recommended Change: Remove: “such as Planned Parenthood” Reason for the Edit: Referencing one specific organization is biased. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 351 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Joe Sargunaraj, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 24\*, line 675 REP of the range of races, ethnicities, and national origins of the students. Recommended change - include “religions”: “REP of the range of races, ethnicities, religions, and national origins of the students.”  p. 24\*, line 685 nonprofit organization, such as Planned Parenthood, may have well-informed sexual Recommended Change: Remove: “such as Planned Parenthood” Reason for the Edit: Referencing one specific organization is biased since there are other pregnancy clinics with different operating styles. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 352 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Greg Habbestad, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 24\*, Line 675. Recommended change - include “religions”, since different religions often inform individuals sexual norms more than races, ethnic backgrounds.  p. 24\*, Line 685: 683 …Guest 684 speakers from your local public health department, sexual health clinic, or local 685 nonprofit organization, such as Planned Parenthood.... Recommended Change: Remove: “such as Planned Parenthood” Reason for the Edit: Referencing one specific organization is extremely biased, showing that certain reproductive values are preferred by the government over others. Recommended Change: Delete lines 807-816 Reason for the Edit: Having students practice putting condoms on a penis model or their fingers will be highly offensive to students of orthodox religious groups (Muslims, Jews, Christians, etc.). They risk offending their families’ and personal beliefs or feeling marginalized and bullied by their peers for not participating in the activity. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 353 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 24, line 687- “local domestic violence organizations or rape crisis centers to provide education on adolescent relationship abuse, sexual assault, healthy relationships, and sex trafficking.”  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence.* | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended |
| 354 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 26, line 726- “Two people have been dating. One partner says to the other that they want a naked picture texted to them.”  Suggest changing scenario for this bullet. Bringing up the option of suicide opens up to a very serious and intense discussion that would require the teacher to have additional resources and guidance. For the purposes of the given scenario, we would suggest the example of “sexting.”  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence.* | Att 15 Att 16 | Not Recommended. |
| 355 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 28\*, Line 791:**  **Recommended Change:** Similar to Lines 1631-1642, insert *Essential Concepts 7-8.1.3.G “Explain the effectiveness of abstinence in preventing HIV, other STDs, and unintended pregnancy.”*  **Similar to Lines 1631-1642, include the following:** “Everyone is doing it…Students predict what the state of California and national percentage rates are for sexual activity by youth in their age group. Students’ data predictions are captured on the white board or an electronic software program and projected for all students to see. Working in pairs, students investigate, compare, and analyze the actual rates of sexual activity using the CDC’s data for California and the California Healthy Kids Survey data available online. Students learn that most other adolescents their age are “not doing it.”  **From the Health Education Framework, Chapter 4, Lines 96-99:** “An estimated 3.1 percent of California high school students reported being sexually active before the age of 13. Approximately 32.3 percent of high school students are sexually active, making sexual health education a critical content area in late elementary (CDC 2015c).” | Att 28+ | Not Recommended |
| 356 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | p. 28\*, Line 791 - Recommended Change: Similar to Lines 1631-1642, insert Essential Concepts 7-8.1.3.G “Explain the effectiveness of abstinence in preventing HIV, other STDs, and unintended pregnancy.” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 357 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Robert L. Hellewell et al. CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 28\*, Line 791, and p. 68\*, line 1642: Add this reference: Essential Concepts 7-8.1.2.G “Explain the effectiveness of abstinence in preventing HIV, other STDs, and unintended pregnancy.” | Att 32+ | Not Recommended. |
| 358 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | p. 29\*, Recommended Change: Delete lines 807-816 Reason for the Edit: Having students practice putting condoms on a penis model or their fingers will be highly offensive to students of orthodox religious groups (Muslims, Jews, Christians, etc.). They risk offending their families’ and personal beliefs or feeling marginalized and bullied by their peers for not participating in the activity. Further, condoms are designed for vaginal not anal intercourse. Teaching students about HIV prevention via use of a condom does not ensure against contracting the disease in the event of anal intercourse. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51930(b)(1)  EC 51933(i) |
| 359 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | p. 29\*, Lines 807-816 - Remove Lines 885-886 - Remove the words, “in which difference are celebrated and accepted.” End the sentence on line 885 with the word “understanding.” | Attachment 2B | Writer’s discretion/edit. Remove “celebrated” and keep “accepted”. |
| 360 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Howard Taras,  Other, School District Physician; Professor at UCSD | p. 29\*, lines 807-816: The Barrier method demonstration is very important as a learning tool that can change future behavior. Please be sure to keep that. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable. |
| 361 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Angela Juarez, Community Member, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Recommended Change: Delete p. 29\*, lines 807-816 Reason for the Edit: Having students practice putting condoms on a penis model or their fi | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 362 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 29\*, Lines 807-816: Delete demonstration drills for condoms and dental dams as offensive to religious values of many families, and a violation of parental rights to supervise and direct their children’s sexual development and practice. These drills have no literature showing added protection, rather they promote risky behavior and the social/physical consequences. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended. |
| 363 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 32\*, Lines 885-886:**  883 …Not only is this recognition important for the  884 inclusion of all students, but it is also critical for creating a safe environment with an  885 expectation of empathy, sensitivity, and understanding in which differences are  886 celebrated and accepted.  **Recommended Change:**  Delete the words, “in which difference are celebrated and accepted.” End the sentence on line 885 with the word “understanding.”  **Reason for the Edit:**  It is an unnecessary bias to have students “celebrate” any and all expressions of gender and sexual identity. Students can be empathetic, sensitive, and understanding of others without needing to “celebrate” them. Such celebration is insensitive to a range of cultural, ethnic, and religious communities. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended |
| 364 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 32\*, Lines 885-886: Delete “celebrated and accepted” as an inappropriate intrusion into parental rights and family values. “Respectful” or “understanding” is appropriate. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended |
| 365 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 34, line 896- Add to Respect column: “valuing your partner and ‘others’.”  \*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence. | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended |
| 366 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 34, line 897- Add to Negotiation & Compromise: “not always being the one to give in or compromise.”  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence.* | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended |
| 367 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 35, line 907- Add to circle: Stalking  May want to consider substituting existing handout with Break the Cycle’s Forms of Abuse:  https://www.breakthecycle.org/sites/default/files/Forms%20of%20Abuse\_en.pdf  \*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence. | Att 15 Att 16 | Not Recommended. Stalking falls under the different forms of abuse but it is not a separate form of abuse.  Writer’s discretion/addition to edit content and include stalking if not already included. |
| 368 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Meghan Yap, California Coalition Against Sexual Assault | p. 37, line 940-  April is Sexual Assault Awarenenss Month.  Inclusion of SAAM is important among list of TDV month and DV month; activities in this section are specific to sexual assault  *\*This comment was also submitted by the California Department of Public Health* | Att 10 | Writer’s discretion/addition to consider including SAAM and TDV in the sexual assault content area. |
| 369 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Krista Niemczyk, Public Policy Manager, California Partnership to End Domestic Violence | p. 37, line 940-  April is Sexual Assault Awarenenss Month.  Inclusion of SAAM is important among list of TDV month and DV month; activities in this section are specific to sexual assault  Suggest that teachers not limiting the conversation of these topics only during specified “awareness months.” This information can be taught anytime and across the whole school year. | Att 16 | Writer discretion/addition to consider including SAAM in the sexual assault content area and language to suggest that teachers not limit the conversation of these topics only during specified “awareness months.” |
| 370 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 37, line 943- The suggestion for Ms. L to notify the class ahead of time should be clear about whether the teacher will notify prior to the next class or mention at the beginning of the class when the lesson sensitive lesson will be address to prepare students. Our suggestion is for the latter.  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended |
| 371 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 37, line 955- “A key understanding is the link of teen dating violence, domestic violence, and sexual violence to power and control. Different forms of abuse (physical, emotional, technological, etc.) are meant to control the person being targeted. Coercive control is a pattern of behavior which seeks to take away the victim’s liberty or freedom and to strip away their sense of self.” Need to preface by explaining that unhealthy relationships are about power and control. Violence also takes on many forms. Add: “Power and Control Wheel” located here (Source: Break the Cycle): https://www.breakthecycle.org/learn-about-dating-abuse  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Line edit/Writer’s discretion |
| 372 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 39\*, Lines 995-999: The paragraph denigrates the role of religion and is offensive to many conservative religious beliefs. It also violated parental rights. Is it abusive to encourage children to be modest, or avoid sexual risks? This is a possible interpretation. | Att 32 | Not Recommended  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 373 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 39\*, Lines 996-1000**  995<begin s>  ~~Examples for spiritual abuse include using religion to justify abuse, insisting on rigid~~<end s>  996<begin s> ~~gender roles, forcing~~ <end s> ~~boyfriend/girlfriend/partner(s) to do things against their beliefs,~~ <end s>  997<begin s> ~~mocking beliefs or cultural practices, mocking or banning the language or dialect that~~<end s>  998<begin s> ~~speak, not allowing~~ <end s> ~~boyfriend/girlfriend/partner(s) to do things they enjoy or to better~~<end s>  999<begin s> ~~themselves, including interfering with their education.~~ <end s>  **Recommended Change:** Remove all lines from 995 to 999. **Reason for the Edit:** This paragraph is extremely insensitive to a variety of orthodox religious groups (Muslims, Jews, Mormons, Christians, etc.). It can easily be interpreted to mean that even the most basic religious beliefs and practices of these groups are “abusive”. For example, if a religion teaches modesty in romantic relationships, but the boyfriend/girlfriend/partners believe they should have pre-marital sexual intercourse, lines 996-1000 could be interpreted to mean such insistence on modesty is “abusive.” | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 374 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | p. 39\*, Lines 996-999 – Remove | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 375 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Howard Taras, Other, School District Physician; Professor at UCSD | p. 39\*, lines 996-1000: These lines that explain how sometimes religion can be used to justify abuse is excellent and important. These sentences are not anti-religion. Quite the opposite. They show how religions can be misused, not that religions are bad in themselves. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 376 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Joe Sargunaraj, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 39\*, Line 998 speak, not allowing boyfriend/girlfriend/partner(s) to do things they enjoy or to better Remove "things they enjoy" Reason for the Edit: It can easily be misinterpreted. For example, if a religion teaches modesty in romantic relationships, but the boyfriend/girlfriend/partners believe they should have premarital sexual intercourse since it is one of "things they enjoy", lines 996-1000 could be interpreted to mean such insistence on modesty is “abusive.” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 377 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 39, line 1011- Could not locate the handout that shows equality at the center of healthy relationships  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 378 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 41, lines 1038-1041  **Current text:** Ms. L shares that there are safe and trusted adults at school, including herself, and encourages students to utilize school resources such as the principal, school nurse, school social worker, or school psychologist.  **Proposed text:** Ms. L shares that there are safe and trusted adults at school, including herself, and encourages students to utilize school resources such as the principal, school nurse, <begin h> school counselor<end h>, school social worker, or school psychologist. | Att 21e | Recommended |
| 379 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 41- lines 1050-1051- Sexual Assault Awareness Month is in April. Stalking Awareness Month is in January.  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s discretion/Addition to include SAAM and Stalking Awareness months |
| 380 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Meghan Yap, California Coalition Against Sexual Assault | p. 41, line 1051-  April is Sexual Assault Awarenenss Month.  Inclusion of SAAM is important among list of TDV month and DV month; activities in this section are specific to sexual assault  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Department of Public Health* | Att 10 Att 15 | Writer’s discretion/Addition to include SAAM and Stalking Awareness months |
| 381 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Krista Niemczyk, Public Policy Manager, California Partnership to End Domestic Violence | p. 41, line 1051-  April is Sexual Assault Awarenenss Month.  Inclusion of SAAM is important among list of TDV month and DV month; activities in this section are specific to sexual assault  Suggest that teachers not limiting the conversation of these topics only during specified “awareness months.” This information can be taught anytime and across the whole school year. | Att 16 | Writer’s discretion/Addition to include SAAM and Stalking Awareness months |
| 382 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 42\***  **Edit Lines 1084-1094:**  **1084** Partnering with your community: Members of the community<begin s> ~~who defy traditional~~  **~~1085~~** ~~stereotypes~~ <end s> (e.g., women firefighters, male nurses) could be invited as guest speakers  **1086** to share about their jobs and to serve as role models <begin s> ~~and myth busters. Be sure to~~  **~~1087~~** ~~include individuals of all genders, including people who are transgender~~. <end s> Students write  **1088** and illustrate a collective letter requesting a healthcare professional to speak to the  **1089** class. Dental providers may offer free dental health checks or fluoride treatments (with  **1090** permission). School nurses can provide mandated vision and hearing assessments for  **1091** all kindergarteners. As a part of this process, school nurses may provide referrals for  **1092** follow-up with community vision and hearing services providers. In addition, students,  **1093** families, teachers and staff may reach out to their school nurse as a health resource at  **1094** any time (K.1.4.G, Essential Concepts). | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(6) |
| 382 continued | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **Add in line 1085:**  “(e.g., women firefighters, male nurses, and stay-at-home moms)”  **Reasons for Edits**:   1. Nowhere in the Health Framework are students from culturally traditional families represented. It is biased to characterize children’s traditional cultures as “myths” and “stereotypes” that must be busted and defied. The families of these students need to be included throughout the Framework. 2. **Line 1087** does not conform to the statement in Chapter 4, page 54, Lines 1381-1384, the Health Education Framework: “While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.”   Since Chapter 4 acknowledges that gender should be described as binary for fifth graders, the Framework needs to conform to this in all the earlier grades. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(6) |
| 383 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Meghan Yap, California Coalition Against Sexual Assault | p. 43, line 1094- While facilitating discussions about sexual assault and domestic violence, educators must be careful to avoid victim-blaming and heteronormative language as these attitudes may increase a survivor’s guilt and shame around their experience(s).  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Department of Public Health and the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 10 Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s discretion/line edit |
| 384 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Meghan Yap, California Coalition Against Sexual Assault | p. 43, line 1099- Sexual assault impacts people of all genders, not just women. One in six men in the United States experience sexual assault (The National Intimate Partner and Sexual Violence Survey 2017). Adding this clarity is important as many students are unaware of the prevalence of male experiences of sexual assault and perceive forms of gender-based violence as “women’s issues.” See page 24: https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/pdf/NISVSStateReportBook.pdf  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Department of Public Health and the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 10 Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s discretion/addition |
| 385 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 45, line 1112- Update percentage from NISVS 2015 data brief: 30.5% (about 7.8 million victims) reporting that their first victimization occurred between the ages of 11 and 17 https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/nisvs/2015NISVSdatabrief.html  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended |
| 386 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 46, line 1123- May want to add “flashbacks” as a psychological impact (https://www.rainn.org/effects-sexual-violence) and “anger” (http://www.nsvrc.org/sites/default/files/saam\_2016\_impact-of-sexual-violence.pdf ) “Anger, aggression and hostility” are listed on page 52 under warning signs of sexual abuse  May want to call out HIV as a physical impact. STIs are listed but given severity of HIV might be worth specific mention.  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended. |
| 387 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Meghan Yap, California Coalition Against Sexual Assault | p. 47, line 1133\* - This image does not accurately communicate the relationship between these different forms of abuse. This image implies that sex trafficking is a culmination of DV, SV, and child abuse, yet this document states that any minor engaged in sex work is being trafficked. This Venn Diagram communicates that sex trafficking fundamentally includes elements of all three forms of violence. While survivors of human trafficking may have experienced all of these forms of violence, it may not be true for all trafficking survivors as this indicates. We Recommended removing this image and using text to convey the intersections of abuse.  *\*This comment was also submitted by the California Department of Public Health and the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 10 Att 16 | Writer’s Discretion/Edit graphic to represent text |
| 388 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 50, line 1158- The U.S. Department of Education says teachers should be on the lookout for the following potential indications that a child is a victim of sex trafficking:  • Has unexplained absences from school for a period of time, and is therefore a truant  • Demonstrates an inability to attend school on a regular basis  • Chronically runs away from home  • Makes references to frequent travel to other cities  • Exhibits bruises or other physical trauma, withdrawn behavior, depression, or fear  • Lacks control over her or his schedule or identification documents  • Is hungry-malnourished or inappropriately dressed (based on weather conditions or surroundings)  • Shows signs of drug addiction  The first warning sign for teachers seems odd; “child under 18 providing commercial sex.” That doesn’t seem like a warning sign but actual confirmation that it is happening.  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 389 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 51, line 1188- If a student discloses, it is important to practice active listening, be non-judgmental, and respond with empathy and valid resources.  Suggest changing end of sentence from “be non-judgmental and respond with empathy and valid resources” to “be non-judgmental, respond with empathy, and provide valid resources.”  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended |
| 390 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 53, lines 1208-1212  **Comment:** Education Code section 48205 requires schools officials to excuse students from school to attend confidential medical appointments. The school cannot require that the student have parent or guardian consent in order to attend the appointment and cannot notify parents or guardians. Confidential appointments are appointments to receive services that minors can obtain on their own consent under state or federal law. | Att 21e | Recommended. |
| 391 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | P. 53, lines 1212-1214  **Comment:** In CA, Children over 12 have protected confidentiality. EC 49602. Any information of a personal nature disclosed by a pupil 12 years of age or older in the process of receiving counseling from a school counselor as specified in Section 49600 is confidential. | Att 21e | Recommended. |
| 392 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | P. 53, lines 1220-1222  **Comment:** I’m not sure why school counselors are referred to as “counselors” as if anyone can do it, but school nurses are always “credentialed school nurses”. The irony is that you cannot practice school counseling without a credential but a nurse who works in a school has five years to obtain a credential. | Att 21e | Recommended |
| 393 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 55\*, lines 1314-1317- Amend line 1314-1317 because as it’s stated in the Framework draft, it does not accurately reflect the law: California state law requires certain protocol be followed each school year before a student participates in a school-sponsored athletic activity, which is defined as interscholastic athletics as governed by the California Interscholastic Federation (CIF), athletic contests or competition other than interscholastic athletics, cheerleading and noncompetitive cheerleading, club-sponsored sports activities and practices, interscholastic practices and scrimmages. For CIF activities, the school must collect and retain a copy of the sudden cardiac arrest information sheet required by the CIF for that pupil. Reference: https://epsavealife.org/law/ and California State Education Sections 33479–33479.9 | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 394 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 56, line 1335- Injury Prevention and Safety Learning Activities Analyzing Health Influences 7-8.1.15.S  Sudden cardiac arrest occurs from a heart condition that is often undiagnosed because youth don’t necessarily recognize the warning signs of a potential heart condition. Or, they don’t want to feel different, feel left behind because they can’t keep up, or jeopardize play time if they complain about not feeling well. Teaching students to speak up and advocate for themselves is an essential component of health literacy. Have students compete a cardiac risk assessment to review the warning signs and family risk factors. The form can also be taken home and shared with parents who can help youth assess family history of heart conditions. Warning signs and risk factors are on the Sudden Cardiac Arrest Information Sheet required by the Eric Paredes Sudden Cardiac Arrest Prevention Act noted above and cardiac risk assessment forms can be found through the California Interscholastic Federation and the Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation.  https://epsavealife.org/what-is-sca/warning-signs/  See Classroom Lesson at end of this document: Essential Concepts 7–8.1.10.S and Practicing Health Enhancing Behaviors 7–8.7.1.S  *\*The images and lesson that accompany this comment are included in Attachment 05.* | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 395 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Kathy Yang, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 57\*, Edit Lines 1369: 1364 ...Sexual health education 1365 sexually transmitted infection (STI) and human 1366 immunodeficiency virus (HIV) and reducing sexual risk-taking behaviors once students 1367 do become sexually active (Kirby et al 2007). Additionally, the CDC (2017) Recommendeds 1368 children ages 11 or 12 obtain the human papilloma virus (HPV) vaccine for protection 1369 against cervical and other cancers and genital warts. Since teachers are not medical doctors, this RECOMMENDATION by the CDC is not to be promoted by the teacher but left to parents/guardians. Edit: Remove entire section: Starting from (1392) -(1399).” Reason for Edit: Males and females develop differently, at different rates, and with different physiological changes. This statement implies that teachers would be doing biological males a disservice by placing them through sexual health education applicable to males, and instead should educate them according to their gender identity (even though they will never experi | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable  Page numbers and line numbers of comment do not align with current chapters of framework |
| 396 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Rebecca Drexler Tweedle | p. 57\*, Do not add the sentence after 1369 as even though teachers are not medical doctors, they have a great influence on exposing children to sexual education. Since sexual education has changed since the mid-1990s, rates of STDs, especially HIV have been on the rise. Parents may not have the desire to talk to their children about sex, and should have the option to pass this opportunity on to a health teacher. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable  Page numbers and line numbers of comment do not align with current chapters of framework |
| 397 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Michelle Childers, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 58\*, At the end of line 1390: "...gender nonconformity, and sexual relationships." Remove entire section: starting from 1392- 1399 There is no evidence to support the Recommendation not to separate students according to male and female. they develop differently and it would be a disservice to place them together. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable  Page numbers and line numbers of comment do not align with current chapters of framework |
| 398 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 58\*, lines 1520-1524**  **1520** After reading the book, *The Great Big Book of Families* by Mary Hoffman (2010) or  **1521** *Families Are Different* by Nina Pellergrini (1991), students learn that there are different  **1522** family structures in our society<begin s> ~~and that all family structures are valid.~~ <end s> For example,  **1533** there are immigrant families; families with lesbian, gay, bisexual, or <begin s> ~~transgender~~<end s>  **1534** parents, guardians, or caretakers and children; families of various race and ethnicities;  **1535** step- and blended families; families headed by single parents, guardians or caretakes;  **1536** extended families; multi-generational families; families with members with disabilities;  **1537** families from different religious traditions; foster families; and adoptive families.  **Delete in line 1522:**  “all family structures are valid.”  **Add in line 1523:**  “families with both a mother and a father” | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51930(b)(2)  EC 51933(c)  EC 51933(d)(1)  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(5)  EC 51933(i) |
| 398 continued | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **Reasons for Edits**:  (1) The Health Education Framework must include families with both mothers and fathers. Students from these families need to see themselves represented along with others. As teachers, we must also be careful not to marginalize and alienate cultural groups (orthodox Muslims, Jews, Christians, etc.). Remove the phrase that “all family structures are valid” as it offends many cultural beliefs that should be respected and not diminished in school.  (2) **Inconsistent with Chapter 4:** The reference to transgenders in third grade does not conform to the statement in Chapter 4, page 54, Lines 1381-1384, the Health Education Framework: “While recognizing that gender is not binary, the use of “boys/girls” and “male/female” is intentional in this chapter to accommodate the developmental stage of fifth graders who are more concrete learners than students in middle or high school. More inclusive terms related to gender identity will be used in higher grades.”  Since Chapter 4 acknowledges that gender should still be described as binary for fifth graders, the Framework needs to adhere to this in all the earlier grades. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51930(b)(2)  EC 51933(c)  EC 51933(d)(1)  EC 51933(d)(4)  EC 51933(d)(5)  EC 51933(i) |
| 399 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Elena Costa, California Tobacco Control Program, California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program Staff Member | Page 69, lines 1655-1656, given that in 2016 California law deemed it illegal for individuals under the age of 21 to purchase all tobacco products, consider proposing an alternate exercise which asks students to present arguments on the benefits to banning the sale of tobacco products to those born after a certain year. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 400 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Survey | Elena Costa, California Tobacco Control Program, California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program Staff Member | Page 70, lines 1687-1869, refers to an activity where students are to find photos in magazines where tobacco products are being advertised to influence “young consumers”. Since the 1998 Master Settlement Agreement, the Tobacco Industry has been banned from placing transit and billboard advertisements, paid brand product placement, cartoons, tobacco brand sponsorships of sporting events and concerts, as well as advertising and marketing practices that target individuals under 18. Consider removing the RECOMMENDATION for seventh and eighth grade students to search for tobacco advertisements given that this type of ad placement is illegal in the United States. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s discretion/line item edit or addition. |
| 401 | 5— Grades 7–8 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Dental Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 94, line 2306- dental health professional such as a pediatric dentist, family general dentist, or hygienist can | Att 14 | Recommended. |
| 402 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Melissa Hamilton, CRED Teacher TK-12 | This chapter does not give equal time to abstinence. In fact the word is only mentioned twice. Students who practice abstinence have no risk for STD's, acts of sexual violence, unwanted pregnancy, etc. TO be truly inclusive this document needs to give equal playing time to abstinence. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 403 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | Add stronger examples of refusal skills to avoid non nutritious foods similar to refusal skills for alcohol, tobacco or drugs, offer healthier examples such as apples instead of fries | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion. Line item addition. |
| 404 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | Overall chapter  **Comment:** Ch. 6 – Once again, this would be a good place to provide alternative ways health education can be provided for schools without credentialed health teachers or credentialed school nurses with specialized authorization. I’ve been in education over 30 years and I have never known of or employed a credentialed health teacher or school nurse with the specialized authorization. How many of them are there? Where do they work? I’d be curious to know how many credentialed school nurses have this specialized authorization in CA. | Att 21 Att 21f |  |
| 405 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Richard Loya, Calif Assoc School Health Educators (CASHE), CRED Teacher TK-12 Single Subject Teaching Credential in Health Science, Other, Vice President CASHE | p. 1\*, lines 16-19 Support HEalth education course be a full year long - long over due. chances of this happening are low of course but with language in this Framework could lend support to fruition. OR legislative compromise of one semester which would be super also. also includes use of credentialed teachers - super! | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 406 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 1, lines 16-19  **Comment:**This would be a good place to provide alternative ways health education can be provided for schools without credentialed health teachers or credentialed school nurses with specialized education over 30 years and I have never known of or employed a credentialed health teacher or school nurse with the specialized authorization. How many of them are there? Where do they work? I’d be curious to know how many credentialed school nurses have this specialized authorization in CA. | Att 21f |  |
| 407 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | William Lundin, Community Member | "The ability to reason, think abstractly and critically, solve complex problems, and evaluate consequences are continuing to develop for most but will not be fully developed until young adulthood" It is crucial that this is considered when a child expresses any kind of life altering wish or decision regarding bi/pan/trans gender ism; just as they are too young to responsibly operate cars, guns, alcohol, or elected office. p. 2\*, line\* 53 ", it is also important to address sexual assault, affirmative consent, and cultural influences ..." note affirmative consent in California is not possible until age 18, schools should be careful to not fall into the role of pandering or allow staff to play the role of fagin. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 408 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p.4, lines 96-99  **original text:**  Health instruction should be provided by credentialed health education teachers or credentialed school nurses with a specialized teaching authorization in health who have the knowledge necessary to effectively teach comprehensive health education.  **Suggested text:**  Health instruction should be provided by credentialed health education teachers or credentialed school nurses with a specialized teaching authorization in health who have the knowledge necessary to effectively teach comprehensive health education. <begin h> School counselors are also an excellent resource. <end h> | Att 21f | Writer’s discretion/line item edit/addition to replace “excellent” with a more objective adjective. |
| 409 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 5, lines 126-131- Emphasize that knowledge is not enough; need behavioral skills to eat healthy diet. Incorporate and implement popular Behavior Change theories and apply them to food choices and physical activity. For example, add a sentence following the Nutrition and Physical Activity (N) introductory paragraph such as, “Although it is crucial that students can distinguish between healthy and unhealthy food choices, they need to be aware that this knowledge alone may not be sufficient. The wider availability of unhealthy processed foods, price, peer pressure, product attraction, and advertising all contribute to a student’s choices. As emphasized later, | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion/Addition |
| 410 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 6, lines 127-131- They may be earning money, which allows them to purchase foods or beverages of their choice. Unhealthy food and snack options are accessible in vending machines, campus student stores, convenience stores, and by going to fast food establishments with friends (United States Department of Agriculture [USDA] 2017). Teachers must emphasize that mere knowledge of what is health promoting and what is sickness and obesity promoting is not enough. Students must be aware that the environment outside their school boundaries consists of industries whose primary objective is to maximize profit, regardless of any unintended costs to the natural environment, humanity, or individuals. Students at this age can understand that competition for consumers’ purchases facilitates agressiv marketing tactics, designing substances that while legal to sell for human consumption, have no place in a healthy eating pattern. Students can make the connections industries have to put legal and political pressures on our governments to enact a variety of laws in their favor. Students can create reports on many of the politics surrounding nutrition. For example, students can report on the politics behind food labels, the Generally Recommended as Safe (GRAS) list, subsidies, check-off programs, water conservation, and sustainability. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 411 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 6, lines 150-153- In high school, students’ nutrition habits are generally well-established; however, reinforcement of the importance of proper nutrition that includes an abundance of fruits and vegetables, lean proteins such as beans, peas, and soy products, calcium-rich foods (from plant based sources), and whole grains (e.g., brown rice and oatmeal) is important, as most teens do not receive their Recommended amount of calcium, iron, and zinc. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/Line item edit. |
| 412 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 6, lines 153-158- Iron is particularly important for menstruating teens who are losing iron each month (American Academy of Pediatrics [AAP] 2017, USDA 2017). Excellent sources of safe iron include plant-based sources like whole grains, legumes, beans, dried fruits, nuts, seeds and dark green leafy vegetables. Calcium and vVitamin D are also critical for teens as their bones continue to grow until age 18, when their bones then become the densest and strongest they will ever be. Building healthy bones at this young age helps to prevent osteoporosis later in life (AAP 2017). Students should know that plants are an excellent source of calcium and sunshine is an excellent source of Vitamin D. Students should discover through Web searches that beta carotene in many plant based foods such as carrots, sweet potatoes, winter squash, spinach, kale, and fruits like cantaloupe and apricots, has protective effects against the sun. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/Line item edit. |
| 413 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 6, lines 163-167- If a teen’s diet includes a variety of fruits and vegetables, whole grains (e.g., brown rice or oatmeal), lean protein (e.g., beans, peas, soy products and the like), and calcium rich foods (from plant sources in particular) each day, they should be receiving adequate nutrition. Although the USDA states that Hhigh-sugar and high-fat food and beverages, including fruit juices (limit to eight to twelve ounces a day), should be “sometimes” foods<begin h>., students would be better served to avoid these substances altogether. <end h> | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 414 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | p. 6\*, Lines 168-171- In addition to previous comments about the importance of healthy dietary patterns, we suggest including milk (unflavored or chocolate) as an example of a nutrient-rich and affordable post-exercise recovery beverage as an alternative to sports drinks. (Roy, B. Int J Sports Med, 2008)  \**References cited in this comment are included in Att 19* | Att 19 | Recommended. |
| 415 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 6, lines 173-175- Search the U.S. USDA Web site and other reliable, medically accurate resources for the most current food groups and Recommended portion sizes along with activities. Students should be informed that portion sizes are much less relevant if a whole foods plant based eating pattern is followed. This eating pattern is void of all the substances designed to form, activate, and establish neurological pathways within the brain that lead to psychological, less physiological, needs for these substances. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 416 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 7, lines 195-199- Opportunities to support teens when they are making healthy choices surrounding nutrition and physical activity are always encouraged. This can be demonstrated by using supportive language and informing students that eating is one of life’s greatest pleasures and that consumption of all foods, particularly plant based, can be balanced for an overall healthy lifestyle. Reframing nutrition vernacular away from “don’t” and “you shouldn’t” can be more effective with teens who have a strong sense of independence. For example, it is alright to eat sweets once in a while as long as they are informed of the short and long term consequences of their actions. Being factual based, refraining from giving personal opinions based simply on beliefs and traditions can facilitate productive teaching and learning with deeper nutritional concepts addressing anatomy, physiology, and even basic biochemistry. in balance with healthy foods and physical activity. Cultural considerations of students’ eating customs and nutrition choices should always be handled with sensitivity and inclusion. In addition, sensitivity to students’ food decisions that are based on moral and ethical reasons should be validated and respected. For example, some students’ cultures require them to have others slaughter animals for them to eat each meal while remaining ignorant of the devastating effects on their health and the environment, much less the animals themselves. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 416 continued | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | Several students from various cultures might find this practice odd at best, but more likely cruel, repulsive, and simply ignorant. Some students may be vegetarian or have an eating pattern consistent with a vegan (not using any animal products) by choice and should be included in discussions about proper nutrition in accordance with their dietary restrictions. Educators must be aware that although students are largely a product of their culture, family practices, economy, and the food environment, they have a responsibility to provide factual evidence in a respectful climate and engage students in inquiry that might challenge their beliefs. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 417 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 7, lines 195-199- Include an explanation of caution/awareness that choosing foods high in fat, sugar, sodium, and/or calories (i.e., “eating sweets once in a while…”) can trigger chemicals in the brain that reinforce the cravings for such foods. | Att 04 | Not Recommended |
| 418 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Richard Loya, Calif Assoc School Health Educators (CASHE), CRED Teacher TK-12 Single Subject Teaching Credential in Health Science, Other, Vice President CASHE | p. 7\*, line 202 (and so many other places) the word "culture" is used and yet so very little on naming such example groups: Asian, Native American, Latino. it is a real disservice to leave out such groups and some discussion on each. too bad some subject areas are so short with only a few really covered in dept. but understand where the funding came from that allowed the updating. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended.  *Chapter 7: Access and Equity* covers many of the cultural groups that are unable to be detailed in each grade level chapter. |
| 419 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 8, lines 207-208- Include “subconscious” along with conscious decision making. “This topic can be a rich opportunity…about how people make conscious and subconscious decisions…” | Att 04 | Recommended. |
| 420 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 8, line 217-218- Add ideas/examples to use other resources, such as technology/apps, to select healthy food items, track food intake, etc. Suggest use of other resources, such as technology, along with journaling. | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion. Line item addition. |
| 421 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 8, lines 223-226- Add idea to use other resources, such as technology, to track exercise/physical activity | Att 04 | Writer’s discretion. Line item edit. |
| 422 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 9, lines 248-251- Other students may experience barriers to participating in physical activity such as a lack of access to a safe area to exercise or for recreation, transportation challenges, or limited funds to participate in exercise programs or obtain equipment (AAP 2017, CDC 2017b, Rosen et al. 2014). Regardless, students should exercise for the right reasons, for example to have fun, to play in a sport, or to do something outdoors. Exercising for the sole sake of burning off excessive calories due to the consumption or overconsumption of substances that provide little to no nutritional benefits can be daunting, lack positive internal motivation, not have any significant impact on burning off the actual excessive calories consumed, and too unrealistic to sustain. Unfortunately, there is more truth than not to the adage, “You can’t outrun a bad diet.” | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 423 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 11, lines 305-310- More nutrition and physical activity learning activities can be found below and at the California Department of Education’s Healthy Eating and Nutrition Education Web page. The Nutrition Education Resource Guide for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve (CDE 2017) serves as a resource to plan, implement, and evaluate instructional strategies for a comprehensive nutritional education program and is available on the Web site. As mentioned in Chapters 4 and 5, in addition to meeting the Health Education Content Standards, this Guide was also designed to align the nutrition competencies with the Common Core State Standards. The Introduction of the California Department of Education’s (CDE’s) California Common Core State Standards (2013) encourages students “to conduct original research to answer questions or solve problems.” It puts forth “the need to conduct research and to produce and consume media is embedded into every aspect of today’s curriculum” (p. iv). When introducing nutritional curricula, it is imperative for students to investigate and possibly uncover potential hidden interests. Teachers are encouraged to guide students in finding potential hidden interests or sources for potential biases. The acknowledgement section of this Guide itself reveals the development team consisting of two CDE consultants, each with an RD (Registered Dietitian). | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 423 continued | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | The contributors to the update, 10, include one program manager from the Dairy Council of California and another RD. Students can also engage in a Web search for the sponsors of the accrediting agency for Registered Dietitians (Accreditation Council for Education in Nutrition and Dietetics). They will see that their top (Academy National Sponsor) is the National Dairy Council. The two Premier sponsors consist of nutritional supplement companies. One of the seven exhibitor sponsors for their 2017 annual conference, with over 10,000 RDs attending was The a2 Milk Company™, another one, Premier Protein, distributes supplements consisting of dairy products. Discussion about biases in producing any materials and media could be discussed with great care not to denigrate any profession or people within it. Students must realize that individuals often have and express vastly different views and opinions than the sponsors of organizations with whom they are affiliated. | Att 03 | Not Recommended |
| 424 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 12, lines 329-333- Students research the caloric expenditure of their various activities. An extension of this activity can be a healthy cooking demonstration to sample healthy foods. See Drexel University’s grades 9–12, Eat Right Now: Understanding Energy Balance for a detailed lesson plan. (See the body image section of this chapter to support students for whom this may be a triggering activity.) <begin h> Students should additionally be encouraged to research the physiological and neurophysiological effects of processed foods, particularly added sugars on the body. <end h> Although the laws of physics (namely, the conservation of energy) are not defied, students can be more informed when they hear phrases such as “a calorie is a calorie” or contradictory phrases, “a calorie is NOT a calorie.” | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/Addition |
| 425 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 13, lines 347-348- Students will create a radio advertisement promoting healthy food choices to help prevent their chronic disease to share with the class.  Education for Changing the Food Environment  It is difficult at best to persuade others that removing several food substances and products from an environment and replacing them with healthy, primarily plant based foods can transform a sickness promoting food environment to a health promoting one. Students need to be well versed on compelling research that can serve as a foundation for convincing others how to choose healthy foods. To help others realize the need to change the food environment, students can be encouraged to select one to several videos from the Web to be viewed during family time. Students can design a tasty dish or entire dinner from whole plant sources including spices to prepare for their family or friends. Families can take challenges to see how many of them can go without eating processed foods for one, two, or three days. Discussion of the insidious pressures to acquire, consume, and overconsume these products revealed from this activity can serve as first hand evidence of the existence of the unhealthy food environment. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 425 continued | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | Supplementing and Fortifying Processed Foods  “After the first synthesis of thiamine in 1936, prevention on a mass scale became possible. Soon it was publicly advocated that thiamine be added to alcoholic beverages to prevent the thiamine‐deficiency diseases of alcoholics. . . By 1940, the alcoholic‐beverage industry was experimentally adding thiamine to its products. Seagram & Sons found it was stable in their whiskey. The California Wine Institute found it was stable in their wines. Anheuser‐Busch found it was stable in their beer. Recent research that I conducted shows that not only would adding thiamine to alcoholic beverages save lives and minds but also it would actually save public money as well” .NY Times, February 12, 1969; Brandon Centerwall). Thiamine deficiency is a well know symptom of those consuming high amounts of alcohol leading to deterioration of the brain due to lack of Thiamine, Wernicke‐Korsakoff syndrome . Alcoholics develop this disease more readily because of their overall dependence on alcohol supplanting nutrition foods, if not all. However, instead of supplementing these beverages with Thiamine, an alternative to immediate total abstinence is to take Thiamine supplements. Today, foods are processed to the point that they are unable to sustain a person’s nutritional needs without fortification. Manufacturers of these substances are encouraged, if not obligated, to fortify their products with one or two nutrients that were removed during processing. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 425 continued | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | This allows humans to consume all or virtually all of their diet from processed foods without experiencing any particular vitamin or mineral deficiency. Student work in various groups with chart paper to create lists, illustrations, or diagrams and report out their results to the class: 1) pros and cons for fortifying foods, 2) pros and cons for banning fortification, 3) pressures facilitating the fortification of processed foods, 4) who benefits and who loses from fortifying foods, 5) relationship between processing and the need to fortify, 6) regulations that could be put in place to facilitate the food industry to make healthy choices for humans. The teacher helps each group facilitate classroom discussion surrounding each chart presentation. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 426 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Clell Hoffman, Child Nutrition Advisory Council | p. 13, line 356- Add ideas/examples to use other resources, such as technology/apps, to select healthy food items, track food intake, etc. Suggest use of other resources, such as technology, along with journaling. | Att 04 | Recommended. |
| 427 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 13, lines 365-366- They can identify healthier alternatives to their favorite snacks such as eating bean or carrot chips that are high in fiber in place of potato chips | Att 03 | Recommended. |
| 428 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 13, line 368- Add: Students then reimagine one of their own favorite snacks and come up with ways to make it healthier, for example by replacing potato chips with kale chips. Whenever possible, incorporate fresh produce grown by the students themselves to increase their motivation to eat it. Together, they prepare and enjoy their reimagined, healthy snacks together. Consult your school’s policy on preparing and serving food in the classroom and check for nut and other food allergies. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 429 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 14, lines 387-389- The collective document is printed as a resource for future reference and to share with family members and peers.  Alternatives to Portion Control/Moderation  Students review research pertaining to substances produced by industry from raw agricultural products. The students review ways foods are designed to facilitate the brain to work with the body to acquire, consume, and overconsume them. Students report on factors the industry uses to find the “Bliss Point” of substances. Students can report what neurological changes occur in the mind when consuming substances designed to reach this point.  Students can report on or review population, longitudinal, laboratory, and case studies that show calorie consumption as a function of degree of food processing. | Att 03 | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows Health Education Content Standards. |
| 430 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Kumar Chandran, Policy Director, Food Corps | p. 14, line 389- Add: Students then prepare a healthy alternative to soda or energy drinks, such as a fruit-infused water; an herbal tea; or a smoothie. As they enjoy together, they review the health benefits of replacing a soda or energy drink with this alternative. | Att 08b | Writer’s discretion/line edit. |
| 431 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | pp. 15-16, lines 424-426- The breakfast educators also use other platforms such as the school’s announcement system, video monitors, sports events, Web site, or social media to deliver nutrition information. Educators need to be sure they have a solid research base for what is purported to be a “healthy” breakfast. Sometimes students and adults confuse “hearty” for “healthy.” Students find traditional breakfast items and look up their specific nutrient composition, e.g., protein, fat, carbohydrate, sugar, etc. Criteria for “healthy” should be provided near the onset of the activity. Students can justify why their researched breakfasts or items are healthy or unhealthy. Encouraging students to search for common breakfasts in other cultures or countries could provide them with more options. Selecting non-traditional items should be encouraged as well. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit/addition. |
| 432 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 17, lines 454-456- The chart should include the type of activity (aerobic, muscle strengthening, and/or bone strengthening), the activity they will be doing, how many minutes they will do it, and the benefit of the activity. As stated previously, teachers need to exercise caution when making a connection between physical inactivity and obesity. Although they well might be related, it is generally agreed that inactivity is only one, and perhaps, a less important contributing factor than proper eating patterns free of processed foods and high in plant products. Making the connection between inactivity and obesity too “causal” can lead students to think they can binge eat or indulge and simply “exercise” the excess calories off. Similarly, students could erroneously think their obesity is simply their lack of moral fortitude to exercise it all off. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 433 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 18, lines 383-388- Examples might include being offered unhealthy choices by a grandparent, deciding what to order when sharing a meal with friends, spending the night at a friend’s house, or attending a sporting event. For example, students might say “no thank you” to the grandparent. If the grandparent offers again, they might accept the food and then just eat a little of it could have well prepared polite reasons for them not being able to partake. When sharing a meal with friends, they might suggest making tasty healthy plant based options or choose a restaurant that the students have communicated with previously that know how to adapt a particular dish to suit their needs. a more nutritious option to go with the less-nutritious food such as eating a salad and splitting a pizza. | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/Line item edit. |
| 434 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 18, lines 493-502- Students explain why activity breaks are important to learning and wellness.  Student Health Council  Partnering with your school: Students participate in school activities that promote health, nutrition, and physical activity by creating a school-wide health campaign (See the Classroom Example in the nutrition and physical activity section of the Grades 7 and 8 chapter.) Students advocate for and educate peers by convening a student health council that is governed under the student council or serving as a student REP to the school board or parent-teacher association. Students may also lead an effort to ensure the student store and school vending machines comply with state nutrition policy guidelines (9–12.7.5.N, Practicing Health-Enhancing Behaviors; 9–12.8.1-2.N, Health Promotion). In their investigation of the student store, students can explore what items sell the most, what might happen to revenue if the store stopped selling these items, and the degree to which revenue drives the selection of items offered. Parallels can be drawn between what their student store might be selling and the motivation and tactics characteristic of food industries. | Att 03 | Not Recommended. |
| 435 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Patrick Traynor, Ph.D. SUPT of Schools - Alpine County; Curriculum Coordinator REP - CHILD NUTRITION ADVISORY COUNCIL | p. 19, lines 510-519- Students analyze the internal and external influences that affect food choices and the personal barriers to healthy eating, describe community programs and services that help people gain access to affordable healthy foods, and advocate for enhanced nutritional options in the school and community by partnering with various nutrition-based nonprofits or grant-funded programs such as First 5 California, Meals on Wheels, a local community garden, or a food bank. As an extension of this activity, students can determine what criteria these agencies use for determining good nutrition or what the desired outcomes of these agencies efforts are. For example, a desired outcome to simply provide calories to those who struggle financially is probably not as worthy as a desired outcome to provide healthy nutrition to the same people. Teachers and administrators can search the California School-Based Health Alliance Web site for additional California nonprofit agencies (9–12.2.1.N, Analyzing Influences; 9–12.3.5.N, Accessing Valid Information; 9–12.8.1.N, Health Promotion). | Att 03 | Writer’s discretion/ Line item edit/addition. |
| 436 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | p. 19\*, Lines 522-530- In discussing vegetarian or vegan eating patterns, we Recommended providing educators with specific information about or link to the Healthy Vegetarian Eating pattern included in the Dietary Guidelines for Americans. Additionally, in discussions of advocacy opportunities for students, we Recommended including nutrition and healthy eating as examples in addition to safe walking and play spaces. | Att 19 | Recommended. |
| 437 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 22, lines 605-608  **current text:** Additional collaboration with district-level curriculum specialists, credentialed school nurses, or qualified community-based organizations and agencies can assist in providing medically accurate information that is objective, inclusive, and age-appropriate  **Suggested text:** Additional collaboration with district-level curriculum specialists, credentialed school nurses <begin h> or school counselors<end h>, or qualified community-based organizations and agencies can assist in providing medically accurate information that is objective, inclusive, and age-appropriate | Att 21f | Recommended. |
| 438 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Brenda Lebsack, CRED Teacher TK-12 | p. 20 and 29 state that FDA approved contraceptives must be taught. However, in the current CHYA curriculum it is being taught that, condoms for anal sex is "safe" and "low risk" in preventing HIV or STI's. Condoms are NOT FDA APPROVED for anal sex. The efficacy rate is 70% with perfect use according to the CDC, yet this efficacy rate is never mentioned in the curriculum when teaching about anal sex. p. 20 says instruction should evaluate the safety and effectiveness (including success and failure rates), yet this is not being done in our top state approved curriculum for CHYA. P. 21 brings up teaching gender identities that are ever expanding. Parents are NOT AWARE of these new genders being presented on p. 32. Being both genders at same time, neither gender, genderqueer, gender fluid, and an infinite number of ways to express gender. Transparent definitions need to be given to parents prior to student instruction. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 439 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 22, line 605- Include “your school or district’s Title IX Coordinator” as an additional resource to collaborate.  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended. |
| 440 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | HPV Human Papillomavirus (HPV) is mentioned once on p. 23\*, line 641 relating to vaccines, but not mentioned again under Essential Concepts: 9-12.1.7.G (Describe the short- and long-term effects of HIV, AIDS, and other STDs, Lines 759 and 797) or Decision Making: 9–12.5.4.G (Evaluate the risks and consequences associated with sexual activities, including HIV, other STDs, and pregnancy, Lines 762-763). HPV is the most common sexually transmitted infection (STI). According to the CDC, 79 million Americans, most in their late teens and early 20s, are infected with HPV, which is associated with several types of cancers, including oropharyngeal cancer(5). In fact, again according to the CDC, HPV is thought to cause 70% of oropharyngeal cancers in the United States(6) (which is why it is of concern to dentists who are often the first to diagnose the condition). The transmission of infection is completely preventable by administration of the HPV vaccine and reduced by certain sexual practices. And while vaccination is Recommended at age 11 -12, the CDC also Recommendeds that girls and women through age 26 years and boys and men through age 21 get the vaccine if they were not vaccinated when they were younger. All of this information, which would seem to be pertinent in a high school teen’s decision-making, is absent from the document.  (5) https://www.cdc.gov/std/hpv/stdfact-hpv.htm  (6)https://www.cdc.gov/cancer/hpv/basic\_info/hpv\_oropharyngeal.htm | Att 14 | Recommended. |
| 441 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 23, line 647- Add “healthy relationships free of violence”  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended |
| 442 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 24\*, Lines 654 – 657**  **Edit: Add after line 657**: Such instructionmust also be inclusive of religious families, beliefs, and cultural backgrounds, to ensure that students of such backgrounds feel equally represented in the coursework.  **Reason:** Inclusive language intended to extend into multiple facets of the daily lives of students. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Health framework content follows EC 51933(i) |
| 443 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Jenn Hale, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 24\*, Lines 654 - 657 654 Building on growth, development, and sexual health content provided in earlier grades, 655 instruction in high school should include opportunities for students to learn and analyze 656 important concepts and theory and apply skill-based instructional activities in a safe, 657 open, inclusive, supportive, unbiased, and judgment-free environment. Edit: Add after line 657: Such instruction mu | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 444 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Angela Juarez, Community Member, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Edit: Add after p. 24\*, line 657: Such instruction must also be inclusive of religious families, beliefs, and backgrounds, to ensure that students of such backgrounds feel equally represented in the coursework. Let's be consistently INCLUSIVE OF ALL - including religious students/students of various faiths. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 445 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 26\*, Lines 716-718**  **716** Comparisons are made with sexual health education in a range of countries  **717** including countries such as Sweden and Jamaica where mandatory comprehensive sex  **718** education is a national policy <begin s> ~~unlike the United States.~~ <end s>  **Edit #1:** Remove “…unlike the United State…” from line 718.  **Reason**: This carries a derogatory bias towards the United States’ approach to sexual health education.  **Edit #2**: **Add to line 718:** Include comparisons between countries with similar cultural/religious demographics as the United States. | Att 28+ | Edit #1=Recommended with Writer’s Discretion to distinguish the difference between a state and national policy in the United States and change the tone of the sentence to be positive.  Edit #2= Not Recommended |
| 446 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Jenn Hale, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 26\*, Lines 716-718 716 Comparisons are made with sexual health education in a range of countries 717 including countries such as Sweden and Jamaica where mandatory comprehensive sex 718 education is a national policy unlike the United States.  **Edit #1:** Remove “...unlike the United State...” from line 718. Reason: This carries a derogatory bias towards the United States’ approach to sexual health education, which is determined by states and local communities.  **Edit #2:** Add to line 718: Include comparisons between countries with similar cultural/religious demographics as the United States. | Attachment 2B | Edit #1=Recommended with Writer’s Discretion to distinguish the difference between a state and national policy in the United States and change the tone of the sentence to be positive.  Edit #2= Not Recommended |
| 447 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Greg Habbestad, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 26\*, Lines 716-718 Remove “…unlike the United State…” from line 718. Reason: This carries a derogatory bias towards the United States’ | Attachment 2B | Recommended with Writer’s Discretion to distinguish the difference between a state and national policy in the United States and change the tone of the sentence to be positive. |
| 448 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | Remove “…unlike the United State…” from p. 26\*, line 718. Add to line 718: Include comparisons between countries with similar cultural/religious demographics as the United States. Add after line 657: Such instruction must also be inclusive of religious families, beliefs, and backgrounds, to ensure that students of such backgrounds feel equally represented in the coursework.  Lines 836-845 - Remove entire lesson plan | Attachment 2B | Line 718- Recommended with Writer’s Discretion to distinguish the difference between a state and national policy in the United States and change the tone of the sentence to be positive  Lines 836-845= Not Recommended |
| 449 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 26\*, Lines 716-718: Remove “unlike the United States” in comparing countries (Jamaica and Sweden examples) as it carries a pejorative bias against the U.S. approach to health education, which is determined by states and communities in a democratic process respectful of parental rights. | Att 32+ | Recommended with Writer’s Discretion to distinguish the difference between a state and national policy in the United States and change the tone of the sentence to be positive. |
| 450 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 27, lines 755-757  **original text:**  The credentialed school nurse may also be a resource for instructional materials and a guest speaker.  **Suggested text:**  The credentialed school nurse <begin h> or school counselor <end h> may also be a resource for instructional materials and a guest speaker. | Att 21f | Recommended. |
| 451 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 30\*, Lines 836-845**  <begin s> **~~836~~** ~~Barrier Method Demonstration~~  **~~837~~** ~~A condom (internal/female and external/male condom) and dental dam demonstration is~~  **~~838~~** ~~provided. After the demonstration, students individually practice the step-by-step~~  **~~839~~** ~~process on a penis model or their fingers. Alternatively, students can place the steps,~~  **~~840~~** ~~displayed on cards, in the correct order and show examples of internal/female and~~  **~~841~~** ~~external/male. For teaching methods, health education teachers should reference~~  **~~842~~** ~~current medically accurate instructional resources online and show examples of male~~  **~~843~~** ~~and female condoms and dental dams. In addition to skill demonstration, students also~~  **~~844~~** ~~apply a decision-making model to evaluate the value of using condoms for STI and~~  **~~845~~** ~~pregnancy prevention.~~ <end s>  **Edit:** Remove entire lesson plan (Lines 836-845)  **Reason:** Having students practice putting condoms on a penis model or their fingers will be highly offensive to students of orthodox religious groups (Muslims, Jews, Christians, etc.). They risk offending their families’ and personal beliefs or feeling marginalized and bullied by their peers for not participating in the activity. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51930(b)(1) |
| 452 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Howard Taras, Other, School District Physician; Professor at UCSD | pp. 30-31\*, lines 836-845: The Barrier method demonstration is very important as a learning tool that can change future behavior. Please be sure to keep that.  Line 960 (pg 37 or 115): These lines that explain how sometimes religion can be used to justify abuse is excellent and important. These sentences are not anti-religion. Quite the opposite. They show how religions can be misused, not that religions are bad in themselves. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 453 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Kathy Yang, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Remove entire lesson plan (pp. 30-31\*, Lines 836-845) Reason: Having students practice putting condoms on a penis model or their fingers will be highly offensive to students of orthodox religious groups (Muslims, Jews, Christians, etc.). They risk offending their families’ and personal beliefs or feeling marginalized and bullied by their peers for not participating in the activity. Edit: Remove the entire section Reason for the Edit: This paragraph is extremely insensitive to a variety of orthodox religious groups (Muslims, Jews, Christians, etc.). It can easily be interpreted to mean that even the most basic religious beliefs and practices of these groups are “abusive”. For example, if a religion teaches modesty in romantic relationships, but the boyfriend/girlfriend/partners believe they should have pre-marital sexual intercourse, this section could be interpreted to mean such insistence on modesty is “abusive.” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows EC 51930(b)(1) |
| 454 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Angela Juarez, Community Member, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | Edit: Remove entire lesson plan (pp. 30-31\*, Lines 836-845) Reason: Having students practice putting condoms on a penis model or their fingers will be highly offensive to students of orthodox religious groups (Muslims, Jews, Christians, etc.). They risk offending their families’ and personal beliefs or feeling marginalized and bullied by their peers for not participating in the activity. OR let parents and students know ahead of time that this will happen in this particular health class section and give each individual family their due right to decide for their student to either participate or opt out. Things like this should never be forced in a free society. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows EC 51930(b)(1) |
| 455 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Greg Habbestad, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | pp. 30-31\*, Lines 836-845 Remove entire lesson plan (Lines 836-845) Reason: Having students practice putting condoms on a penis model or their fingers will be highly offensive to students of orthodox religious groups (Muslims, Jews, Christians, etc.). They risk offending their families’ and personal beliefs or feeling marginalized and bullied by their peers for not participating in the activity. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows EC 51930(b)(1) |
| 456 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | pp. 30-31\*, Lines 836-845: Delete demonstration drills for condoms and dental dams as offensive to religious and moral values of many families, and a violation of parental rights to supervise and direct their children’s sexual development and practice. These drills have no literature showing added protection, rather the preponderance of data suggest they promote risky behavior and consequent social/psychological/physical harm. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows EC 51930(b)(1) |
| 457 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | p. 31, Line 844- Add “STD” after “STI” | Att 18 | Not Recommended. |
| 458 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 31, Line 848- Define “sexting”. Start Line 849 with Sexting is the sending of sexually explicit messages or images by cell phone. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 459 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 31, Lines 851-852- Provide a link for the website for the video. | Att 18 | Not Recommended. |
| 460 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 31, Line 856- Add “STI” before “STD”. Consistency in referencing | Att 18 | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows Heath Education standards |
| 461 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 31, Line 857- Change “What’s Risky?” which is vague to “What are Risky Situations?” | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 462 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 31, Line 860- Before the students explore the “why” of a risky situation would put them at risk, they need to understand what would make any of the situations that they listed a high risk for a disease such as HIV or STD. Then, they could talk about is involved in Lines 860-864. | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion. Line item addition. |
| 463 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 32, Line 870- There is mention of using a condom. It seems odd that there is no mention of a female usage of contraception. | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion. Line item addition. |
| 464 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 32, Line 871- Spelling. “about” | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 465 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 32, Line 873- Could the “Yes means Yes” Law be cited as an example of California Law?  Add after “laws” in Line 873: “like the Yes means Yes law, | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 466 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 32, lines 870-875  **current text:**  The goal should include action steps such as using condoms correctly and consistently if sexually active; having a conversation with their partner abut boundaries; identifying their closest healthcare providers, including school nurses or counselors; and knowing California laws regarding minor consent and confidential medical release. The health benefits of maintaining this goal should be clearly shown  **Suggested text:**  The goal should include action steps such as using condoms correctly and consistently if sexually active; having a conversation with their partner abut boundaries; identifying their closest healthcare providers, including school nurses or <begin h> school <end h> counselors; and knowing California laws regarding minor consent and confidential medical release. The health benefits of maintaining this goal should be clearly shown <begin h> (EC 48205 and 59602) <end h> | Att 21f | Recommended. |
| 467 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 32, Lines 875-880- There should be citations, annotated or footnoted for each of these definitions; otherwise, it would seem as if you made them up. | Att 18 | Recommended with Writer’s Discretion/Addition |
| 468 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 32, Starting with Line 882- There should be some introduction of “gender fluidity” and “intersectionality”. | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion. |
| 469 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 33, lines 896-901- Common Orientations may not be inclusive and should encompass more than sexual orientations. It may also help to include explanation of Sexual Attraction vs Gender Identity vs Gender Expression vs Biological Gender, not just SO [sexual orientation].  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended with Writer’s Discretion/Addition for clarification |
| 470 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 35, Lines 921-923- What about schools that do not have a GSA or LGBTQ club? Provide some suggestions. | Att 18 | Recommended with Writer’s Discretion/Addition |
| 471 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 36, Line 946- The grade levels should be identified so that teachers could easily refer back to them in the framework. | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 472 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 36, lines 949-950- Better data and citations would be:  -Nearly 1.5 million high school students nationwide experience physical abuse from a dating partner in a single year.(1)-One in three girls in the U.S. is a victim of dating violence.(2)  (1)Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, “Physical Dating Violence Among High School Students—United States, 2003,” Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report, May 19, 2006, Vol. 55, No. 19.  (2) Davis, Antoinette, MPH. 2008. Interpersonal and Physical Dating Violence among Teens. The National Council on Crime and Delinquency Focus. Available at http://www.nccd-crc.org/nccd/pubs/2008\_focus\_teen\_dating\_violence.pdf.  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s Discretion/Recommend addition of first statistic. |
| 473 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | pp. 36-37\*, line 960  **Forms of Abuse**  **Spiritual** <begin s> **~~-~~** ~~Using religion to justify abuse, forcing others to adhere to rigid gender roles, forcing partner to do things against their beliefs, mocking beliefs or cultural practices, not allowing partner to do things they enjoy or to better themselves, including interfering with their education.~~ <end s>  **Edit**: Remove the entire section  **Reason for the Edit:** This paragraph is extremely insensitive to a variety of orthodox religious groups (Muslims, Jews, Christians, etc.). It can easily be interpreted to mean that even the most basic religious beliefs and practices of these groups are “abusive”. For example, if a religion teaches modesty in romantic relationships, but the boyfriend/girlfriend/partners believe they should have pre-marital sexual intercourse, this section could be interpreted to mean such insistence on modesty is “abusive.” | Att 28+ | Not Recommended. |
| 474 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | pp. 36-37, Line 960: Delete negative reference to religion. The role of religion in supporting doctrinal gender roles should not be attacked in the schools. It is offensive to moral values of the strong majority of most California communities. And it offends the legal rights of parents to guide the moral and religious development of children. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows EC 51938(a)  EC 51938(b)(4)  Parents/Guardians may opt their student out of the following individual elements of California Comprehensive Sexual Health Education (see legal definition EC 51931(b)) or HIV Prevention Education (see legal definition EC 51931(d)). |
| 475 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | p. 36\*, Lines 960, pg. 37 of 115 - Remove the entire section | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended.  Framework content follows  EC 51938(a)  EC 51938(b)(4) |
| 476 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Greg Habbestad, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 36\*, Line 960, pg. 37 of 115, Remove entire section Reason for the Edit: This paragraph is extremely insensitive to a variety of orthodox religious groups. It can easily be interpreted to mean that even the most basic religious beliefs and practices of these groups are “abusive”. For example, religious teachings of modesty in relationships, if the boyfriend/girlfriend/partners believe they should have pre-marital sex, this section could mean such insistence on modesty is “abusive.” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51938(a)  EC 51938(b)(4) |
| 477 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Joe Sargunaraj, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | pp. 36-37\*, Line 960, pg. 37 of 115 forcing partner to do things against their beliefs, mocking beliefs or cultural practices, not allowing partner to do things they enjoy or to better themselves, including interfering with their education. Remove "things they enjoy" Reason for the Edit: It can easily be misinterpreted. For example, if a religion teaches modesty in romantic relationships, but the boyfriend/girlfriend/partners believe they should have premarital sexual intercourse since it is one of "things they enjoy",this could be interpreted to mean such insistence on modesty is “abusive.” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 478 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | pp. 37-38, lines 960- Include reproductive coercion under emotional abuse.  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s discretion/Addition to add reproductive coercion in section on sexual abuse. |
| 479 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 36, Line 960- Box on examples of Abuse. Add pushing and shoving. | Att 18 | Recommended |
| 480 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 36, Line 950- Delete Liz Claiborne and The Family Fund. The framework should not be promoting a product. | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit to change the citation as appropriate |
| 481 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 37, Line 960- In the box in Sexual Abuse, add sexting as an Example of Abuse | Att 18 | Recommended |
| 482 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | pp. 38-39, lines 965-983- Cycle of abuse content is outdated; include content on power and control instead. “A key understanding is the link of teen dating violence, domestic violence, and sexual violence to power and control. Different forms of abuse (physical, emotional, technological, etc.) are meant to control the person being targeted. Coercive control is a pattern of behavior which seeks to take away the victim’s liberty or freedom and to strip away their sense of self.” Source: Break the Cycle https://www.breakthecycle.org/learn-about-dating-abuse  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s discretion to add additional content regarding coercive control. |
| 483 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | pp. 43-45, lines 1079-1094- Separate bullying and sexual harassment as different issues, or remove the term “bullying” from this section since its header is “Sexual Harassment”. Combining the two terms when talking about harassment related to gender is not an accurate portrayal of the topic.  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s discretion/line edit |
| 484 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 45\*, Lines 1096 – 1105**  **1096** …Rape culture also contributes to sexual violence and is  **1097** an important concept to discuss with students in ninth through twelfth grades.  **1098** Normalization, desensitization, and acceptance of sexual violence are the essence of  **1099** rape culture. Examples of rape culture include<begin s> ~~the objectification of women and~~ <end s>  **1100** <begin s> ~~feminine-presenting people~~, <end s> glamorization of sexual violence in music and film,  **1101** minimizing sexual violence or blaming the victim of sexual assault, and misogyny.  **1102** <begin s> ~~Students may not relate to this as a social issue if they believe that rape culture does~~ <end s>  **1103**<begin s> ~~not exist or if they think they do not participate in or perpetuate it.~~ <end s> Students need  **1104** teacher guidance to think critically about how they may or may not contribute to rape  **1105** culture.  **Edit #1**: Remove 1099-1100 “…the objectification of women and feminine-presenting people…”  **Reason**: Biased and Exclusive: People of every sex and gender can be objectified, not just women and feminine-presenting people. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended |
| 484 continued | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | 1. Models of all genders and sex, from Playboy to Victoria Secret to Calvin Klein, willingly subject themselves to sexual objectification as part of their career. This is not to say that sexual objectification of others is good, but it does not constitute rape (or rape culture) when the person being objectified is subjecting themselves to it willingly (consent).   **Edit #2**: **Line 1101**: Add “misandry” after “…of sexual assault…” and before “…and misogyny”.  **Revised Line Should Read**: **1101** “…minimizing sexual violence or blaming the victim of sexual assault, misandry, and misogyny.”  **Reason**:  Original text is exclusive of sexual misconduct towards men, or masculine-presenting people, as if “rape culture” only applies to women and feminine-presenting people.  **Edit #3**: Remove Lines  **1102** <begin s> ~~Students may not relate to this as a social issue if they believe that rape culture does~~ <end s>  **1103**<begin s> ~~not exist or if they think they do not participate in or perpetuate it.~~ <end s>  **Reason:** Forces students to accept the idea that they all live in a rape culture that they participate in or perpetuate. This is a sweeping generalization that presumes all students guilty. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended |
| 485 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Rebecca Drexler Tweedle | The reasoning given for p. 45\*, lines 1096-1105 are projecting that the objectification is based just on models. Having children self-reflect on our society as it currently stands is critical to prevent scenarios where they may actively or passively participate in rape. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s discretion/line edit |
| 486 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 45\*, Lines 1096-1105: Delete reference to “rape culture” as not defined or supported. It indicts the general community without justification. It would be appropriate to discuss the harms of pornography, which are manifold and well documented. | Att 32+ | Not Recommended |
| 487 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | p. 45\*, Lines 1099-1100 - Remove “…the objectification of women and feminine-presenting people…” | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 488 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Howard Taras, Other, School District Physician; Professor at UCSD | p. 45\*, Lines 1099-1100: This sentence on objectification of women is excellent. Consider some examples of "objectification of men", For example, men can feel forced to play certain roles in sexual encounters that are not necessarily of their own choosing. Beefcake calendars are one example. | Attachment 2B | Recommended with writer’s discretion. |
| 489 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Angela Juarez, Community Member, Multiple Subject Teaching Credential | p. 45\*, Remove lines 1099-1100 “…the objectification | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 490 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | p. 45\*, Line 1101 - Revised line should read, “…minimizing sexual violence or blaming the victim of sexual assault, misandry, and misogyny.” Lines 1102-1103 - Remove lines | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 491 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Sabrina Hughes, Waymakers Sexual Assault Victim Servics, Sexual Assault Prevention Educator with the non-profit Waymakers, in Orange County | p. 45\*, line 1106\*- I love that there is mention of rape culture in this section - that is so vital to this discussion! One additional statement I would Recommended under the "Comments that Reflect Rape Culture" on line 1106 is one specific to male survivors, for example "A REAL MAN can't be raped by a woman." As a Sexual Assault Prevention Educator, this is a sentiment I heard often; when a male is the victim, they treat it as a joke, and that the man/boy is weak for "letting" the assault happen. I think this will also help mitigate some pushback from male high school students - as I've learned over the last two years in my job role, if you don't give male victims/survivors some time to be recognized, the resistant, hyper-masculine male students will shut down and refuse to listen to anything you have to say about sexual assault. Again, this is a result of rape culture, but it's important to work with where our culture is at. And male survivors of course exist! So I think that's important to add. | Attachment 2B | Recommended |
| 492 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Meghan Yap, California Coalition Against Sexual Assault | p. 46, line 1124 - This figure illustrates rape culture as an individual-level issue, where extensive research has demonstrated the need to examine and address sexual violence as a societal level issue, thus the analysis of “culture” in the study of rape culture, attitudes, and norms. This image depicts sexual violence and rape culture as interactions between people, ignoring the broader context in which violence occurs.  While the text does clarify that trauma from the “perpetrator” and “perpetuator” are experienced differently, the image still depicts an equal impact. We Recommended removing this image and utilizing text to convey this message.  *\*The same comment was submitted by the California Department of Public Health and the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 10 Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s Discretion/Edit graphic to represent text |
| 493 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 47, lines 1144-1145- Statistic of rape victims first victimized between ages of 11-17 actually makes it important that this be reworded to say that “middle school and high school are a critical times to discuss culture change and non-victim blaming prevention strategies” instead of only “high school.”  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended |
| 494 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 48, lines 1162-1168- While it does acknowledge increased risk for sexual violence if “both individuals are under the influence of alcohol or drugs”, it does not state directly that alcohol and drugs also increase the risk of perpetrating sexual violence as well.  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 495 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 49, lines 1200-1201- Add additional creative activities to the poetry slam example. Other examples may include visual art, film, or theater.  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 496 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 51, Lines 1211-1364- Just wanted to note there is a lot of content here specific to sex trafficking. It seems a bit disproportionate to have a lengthy description of a lesson related to this topic (which makes up a small proportion of TDV/SV, but other sections on sexual assault/harassment, media, social norms change, bystander intervention, etc. are short by comparison. We highly suggest moving this Classroom Example to an Sex Trafficking Appendix.  \**The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 15 Att 16 | Not Recommended. |
| 497 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Meghan Yap, California Coalition Against Sexual Assault | p. 51, line 1244- Mr. H explains his role as a mandated  reporter before beginning the activity. Language added for consistency.  *\*The same comment was submitted by the California Department of Public Health and the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence* | Att 10 Att 15 Att 16 | Writer’s Discretion/Line Edit |
| 498 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Meghan Yap, California Coalition Against Sexual Assault | p. 54, line 1311 - This image does not accurately communicate the relationship between these different forms of abuse. This image implies that sex trafficking is a culmination of DV, SV, and child abuse, yet this document states that any minor engaged in sex work is being trafficked. This Venn Diagram communicates that sex trafficking fundamentally includes elements of all three forms of violence. While survivors of human trafficking may have experienced all of these forms of violence, it may not be true for all trafficking survivors as this indicates. We Recommended removing this image and using text to convey the intersections of abuse.  \**The same comment was submitted by the California Department of Public Health* | Att 10 | Recommended with Writer’s Discretion to edit the graphic to better convey the text. |
| 499 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Lidia Carlton, CDPH STD Control Branch, Health Education, Other, State Dept of Public Health/member of HE CFCC | p. 55\*, Line 1338. This reads as if legal sex workers are promoting sex trafficking. Time and time again we have discussed in the CFCC that this is overly shaming towards sex workers. Pornography is a legal way for people to engage in work and gain income, and without a larger critical analysis of capitalism and limited opportunity for making fair wages, it is quite judgmental to vilify this form of work. Please remove: "In analyzing this concept, many students conclude that even willing participation in the sex industry may promote sex trafficking." This is the equivalent of saying that people who willingly provide labor services are contributing to human trafficking. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 500 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Jeannine Barbato, California Department of Public Health | p. 58, lines 1368-1369- Other common awareness events to add to this list are “Walk a Mile in Her Shoes” or “Denim Day”.  *\*The same comment was also submitted by the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence.* | Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended. |
| 501 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 58\*, Lines 1375-1380**  **1375** Partnering with your community: Students identify local resources for reproductive and  **1376** sexual health and evaluate laws related to sexual involvement with minors by inviting  **1377** the<begin s> ~~local American Civil Liberties Union chapter, local Planned Parenthood, CDPH, or~~ <end s>  **1378** <begin s> ~~CDE~~<end s> to provide a professional development presentation on the California Healthy  **1379** Youth Act for teachers, administrators, school board members, and parents, guardians,  **1380** and caretakers.  **Edit Lines 1377-1378:** Remove the names of the listed organizations (ACLU, Planned Parenthood, CDPH, or CDE)  **Reason**: Demonstrates bias by directing students to specific organizations; such references are not inclusive. | Att 28+ |  |
| 502 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Robert L. Hellewell et al.  CDE received emails from 4 individuals, who included the same comment with identical language | p. 58\*, Lines 1375-1380: Delete reference to certain organization (ACLU, Planned Parenthood, CDPH, CDE) as this shows unsupported bias and such references are not inclusive. | Att 32+ |  |
| 503 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | p. 58\*, Lines 1377-1378: Remove the names of the listed organizations (ACLU, Planned Parenthood, CDPH, or CDE) | Attachment 2B |  |
| 504 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Joe Sargunaraj, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | p. 58\*, line 1377 the local American Civil Liberties Union chapter, local Planned Parenthood, CDPH, or 1378 CDE to provide a professional development presentation on the California Healthy Edit Lines 1377-1378: Remove the names of the listed organizations (ACLU, Planned Parenthood, CDPH, or CDE) Reason: Demonstrates bias by directing students to specific organizations; such references are not inclusive. | Attachment 2B |  |
| 505 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Rebecca Drexler Tweedle | Leave p. 58\*, lines 1377-1378 as students need to know about these resources available to them. | Attachment 2B | Recommended |
| 506 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 58, lines 1390-1393  **Current text:** Students should be made aware that it is important to have someone that they feel comfortable speaking with when needed and that someone at school such as a counselor or credentialed school nurse can be a resource.  **Suggested text:** Students should be made aware that it is important to have someone that they feel comfortable speaking with when needed and that someone at school such as a <begin h> school <end h> counselor or credentialed school nurse can be a resource. | Att 21f | Recommended. |
| 507 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 60\*, After line 1426, insert: provides information related to concussions and SCA, including information sheets for students | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion. Line item edit. |
| 508 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 64\*, Insert after line 1573: Analyzing Health Influences 9-12.2.1.S Practice health literacy by reviewing warning signs of a potential heart condition and encourage students to advocate for themselves  *\* Images that accompany this comment are included in Att 05.* | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion. Line item edit. |
| 509 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 64\*, Insert at line 1578: …for an injury prevention campaign that includes warning signs and risk factors of an undetected heart condition. Sudden cardiac arrest occurs from a heart condition that is often undiagnosed because youth don’t necessarily recognize the warning signs of a potential heart condition. Or, they don’t want to feel different, feel left behind because they can’t keep up, or jeopardize play time if they complain about not feeling well. Teaching students to speak up and advocate for themselves is an essential component of health literacy.  \**Images that accompany this comment are included in Att 05.* | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion. Line item edit. |
| 510 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 64\*, Insert at line 1580: …tip sheets, cardiac risk assessment forms and talking point. | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion. Line item edit. |
| 511 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 64\*, Insert at line 1599: A comprehensive training also includes reviewing the importance of automated external defibrillators (AEDs) as the only way to restart a heart that has stopped beating. As noted by the American Academy of Pediatricians (PEDIATRICS Volume 141, number 6, June 2018:e20180705), high school students are highly capable of properly using an AED within 90 seconds after receiving verbal instructions. Students should be advised on the location of AEDs if present on a school campus. 9-121.1.S Essential Concepts  \**More information regarding the reference cited in this comment is provided in Att 05* | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion. Line item edit. |
| 512 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Maureen Legg, Eric Paredes Save A Life Foundation | p. 70\*, 1727: Saving a Life Amend starting at line 1728: Working in teams of two, students will respond to various scenarios dealing with basic first aid and life-saving emergencies. One student in the pair will describe what should be done as the other partner demonstrates proper procedures for the situation. Partners will then switch roles. First-aid situations might include a friend getting cut on a piece of glass at the beach or touching a hot lawn mower and burning your hand. Life-threatening situations might include a child they are babysitting who chokes on a piece of candy. A scenario such as a coach or player collapsing at a practice or game could include playing out the Cardiac Chain of Survival, which is now part of coach training as outlined in the Eric Paredes Sudden Cardiac Arrest Prevention Act.  http://cpr.heart.org/AHAECC/CPRAndECC/AboutCPRFirstAid/CPRFactsAndStats/UCM\_475731\_Out-ofhospital-Chain-of-Survival.jsp  See Classroom Lesson below 9-12.1.1.S and 9-12 1.3.S (Essential Concepts)  *\*The image that accompanies this comment and the Classroom Lesson are included in Att 05* | Att 05 | Writer’s discretion. Line item edit. |
| 513 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 73\*, Lines 1798-1801**  **Edit Lines:** Research shows students who participate in their religion regularly have higher academic performance, are less likely to abuse substances, more likely to graduate high school, and more likely to enroll in college than their unaffiliated counterparts (See End Notes: Horwitz 2018; Loury 2004; National Center on Addiction and Substance Abuse 2010; John Wallace et al., nod). Affirming students’ religious beliefs and encouraging less time spent on social media can have a positive influence and the students’ performance and the school’s success. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended  Framework content follows  EC 51933(i) |
| 514 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Howard Taras, Other, School District Physician; Professor at UCSD | p. 73\*, Lines 1798-1801: I would remove citing scientific evidence that only shows correlations, not cause- and effect. It is dangerous to do so. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 515 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Elena Costa, California Tobacco Control Program, California Department of Public Health, California Tobacco Control Program Staff Member | Page 76, lines 1868-1869, consider updating the example pertaining to the concept of “community risk”. The example provided may be interpreted as culturally insensitive and appears to imply that tobacco use in the home with underage individuals is a “value” or “norm” in Middle Eastern cultures.  Page 79, lines 1952-1955, consider updating the statement to “Students calculate the daily and monthly cost of using tobacco products (e.g., cigarettes, electronic smoking devices, chewing tobacco). Then they calculate the cost for 5, 10, and 20 years along with the higher cost tobacco users (...)” Page 79, lines 1969-1970, please see comment provided to “Grades 7 & 8” on the identical scenario.  Page 82, lines 2025-2029, please include a RECOMMENDATION for students to utilize the CA Tobacco Control Program’s http://tobaccofreeca.com/ website to determine if vaping toxic aerosol is a Recommended means of cessation to compare to websites that offer counter arguments. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s discretion. Line item addition. |
| 516 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Eric Buehrer et al., Gateways to Better Education  CDE received individual, form, and blank emails from 585 individuals, who included the same comment with identical or similar language | **p. 83\*, Lines 2067-2071**  **Edit: Line 2071:** Add “gender dysphoria” to the list of childhood mental health conditions.  **Reason for Change:** Students need to understand the medical categorization and description of gender dysphoria. | Att 28+ | Not Recommended. |
| 517 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Howard Taras, Other, School District Physician; Professor at UCSD | p. 83\*, Lines 2067-2071: Some may want this to include "gender dysphoria" to this list of mental health disorders. I am not opposed to that, as long as it | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 518 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Gina Gleason, Faith and Public Policy | p. 83\*, Line 2071 - Add “gender dysphoria” to the list of childhood mental health conditions. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 519 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 85, lines 2124-2128  **current** text**:** To create safe zones in the school, as well as in the classroom, health education teachers, credentialed school nurses, and school administrators identify teachers, administrators, and counselors who can serve as Safe Zone gatekeepers for students who are suffering from a mental health challenge or issue.  **Suggested text:** To create safe zones in the school, as well as in the classroom, health education teachers, credentialed school nurses, and school administrators identify teachers, administrators, and <begin h> school <end h> counselors who can serve as Safe Zone gatekeepers for students who are suffering from a mental health challenge or issue. | Att 21f | Recommended. |
| 520 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Meghan Yap, California Coalition Against Sexual Assault | p. 89, lines 2237- 2240- Close to 60 percent of teens engage in dieting, fasting, self-induced vomiting, or taking diet pills or laxatives; furthermore, female students who are overweight are more likely than female students who are at the recommeded weight to engage in extreme dieting (Evans et. al. 2017, Wetheim et al. 2009).  Text corrected from “females” to “female students;” later text refers to “male students”  *\*The same comment was submitted by the California Department of Public Health and the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence.* | Att 10 Att 15 Att 16 | Recommended. |
| 521 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Survey | Michelle Childers, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | People have different opinions about firearms. Some people love them, others hate them. there is no need to only emphasize that some people "perceive guns to be cool and exciting. Add to the end of line 2323 (p. 92\*): , although deaths from unintentional firearm discharge are very rare. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable- This comment does not align to the content in line 2323 of Chapter 6 of the Health Education Framework. |
| 522 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 104\*, line 2626- professional such as a pediatric dentist, family general dentist, or hygienist can visit the class to | Att 14 | Recommended. |
| 523 | 6— Grades 9–12 | Email | Dr. Jay Kumar, State Director, California Dental Association and California Society of Pediatric Dentistry | p. 105\*, lines 2674- annual dermatology checks for skin cancer, bi-annual dental exams(4), and annual physical (4) http://www.aapd.org/media/Policies\_Guidelines/BP\_Periodicity.pdf | Att 14 | Recommended. |
| 524 | 7— Access and Equity | Survey | Joe Sargunaraj, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Add a section for "Religiously Diverse Learners" California has a large diversity of religions and belief in several religions can make it harder for students to learn some aspects of science. Showing sensitivity to this can make it easier for students to learn scientific concepts. Here are some examples 1. Accepting the scientific truth of biological evolution does not mean that your religious beliefs are incorrect. Both of them can be true. 2. Teachers should not make statements that threaten the religious beliefs of students or mocking any aspect of their belief. This could significantly impact the ability of the student to learn | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended |
| 525 | 7— Access and Equity | Survey | Rebecca Mui, GLSEN, CRED Teacher TK-12 | Your definition of sexual orientation should be updated to include asexual people and to be more inclusive of trans and gender nonconforming people: Sexual orientation refers to a person’s enduring pattern of romantic and sexual attraction or lack of sexual attraction to another person or group of people. General RECOMMENDATIONs from GLSEN: - anti-bullying policies should be updated to "LGBTQ inclusive policies (e.g. anti-bullying, anti-harassment, and nondiscrimination)." -"Increase students' access to an inclusive curriculum with sensitivity to pronouns and the experiences of trans and gender nonconforming people." Additional RECOMMENDATIONs: Instead of "safe zone" can you use "GLSEN's Safe Space Sticker"? "Consider seeking professional development opportunities in LGBTQ+ issues." - This should be moved under GLSEN's RECOMMENDATIONs, as we provide PD and it is one of our four supports. GLSEN also supports GSAs at www.glsen.org/gsa | Attachment 2B | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 526 | 7— Access and Equity | Survey | Michelle Childers, P/G/C of TK-12 Student | Remove entire lesson plan from (lines 836-845) having students practice putting condoms on a penis model or their fingers will be highly offensive to students or orthodox religious groups, (muslims, jews, Christians etc.) They risk offending their families' and personal beliefs or feeling marginalized or bullied by their peers for not participating in the activity. Line 960. Pg. 37 of 115 edit: remove entire section. This paragraph is extremely insensitive to a variety of orthodox religious groups. It can easily be interpreted to mean that even the most basic religious beliefs and practices of these groups are "abusive". For example, if a religion teaches modesty in romantic relationships, but the boyfriend/girlfriend/partners believe they should have pre-marital sexual intercourse, this section could be interpreted to mean such insistence on modesty is "abusive" | Attachment 2B | The content of Chapter 7 does not align to the line numbers submitted in this comment. |
| 527 | 7— Access and Equity | Survey | Richard Loya, Calif Assoc School Health Educators (CASHE), CRED Teacher TK-12, Single Subject Teaching Credential in Health Science, Other, Vice President CASHE | p.1\*, lines\* 13-20: fantastic on diversity. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 528 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 1, Lines 18-21- Expand definition of “shared responsibility”. Rewrite the sentence, “the notion of shared responsibility that includes a deeper understanding of the health education standards and its application to real life situation, is critical.” | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 529 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Tracy Mendez, RDN, Program Director and Valerie Fung-A-Ling, Project Manager, Dairy Council of California | p. 1\*, lines 22-24- Add to lines 22-24: Food is a universal language. Health educators should consider integrating multi-cultural nutrition education resources to bridge the cultural differences between students and to facilitate communications between parents and teachers about healthy eating. | Att 19 | Writer’s discretion/line item edit. |
| 530 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 3, lines 55-58  **current text:** Teachers should consider referring and navigating students in need of services to appropriate professionals, including the school nurse, administrators, counselors, school psychologists, and school social workers, as available.  **Suggested text:** Teachers should consider referring and navigating students in need of services to appropriate professionals, including the school nurse, administrators, <begin h> school <end h> counselors, school psychologists, and school social workers, as available. | Att 21g | Recommended |
| 531 | 7— Access and Equity | Survey | Richard Loya, Calif Assoc School Health Educators (CASHE), CRED Teacher TK-12, Single Subject Teaching Credential in Health Science, Other, Vice President CASHE | pp. 3-4\*, lines\* 70 -90; too bad can't cite a California source as opposed to the national citation. lots of talk on culture in this chapter which is fine but missing specific examples of top 3 or 4 cultures found in california. it's like how do we promote culture by never naming some of the cultures. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. |
| 532 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 4, Line 92- What is “Figure 1?” It is referenced but not readily visible. | Att 18 | Recommended. Remove “Figure 1”. |
| 533 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 5, Line 120- “Different” can also be view as a diminutive word. “Unique” is more strength based or asset based focused. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 534 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 7, Lines 171-181- Delete this paragraph. This paragraph is making some very general statements about English Learners. Start this section with the definition of English Learners, Line 188. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 535 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 8, Line 212- Add “rigorous” after “robust”. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 536 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 8, Line 218- Change the sentence to read: To fully include ELs in health education instruction, it is important to use in tandem the CA Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts in Literacy in History/Social Science, and Technical Subjects with the CA ELD Standards, and the Health Education Standards. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 537 | 7— Access and Equity | Survey | Richard Loya, Calif Assoc School Health Educators (CASHE), CRED Teacher TK-12, Single Subject Teaching Credential in Health Science, Other, Vice President CASHE | p. 12\*, lines\* 263-307: why the draft is stuck with only naming teachings as Mr. K or Ms. C - like we are afraid of cultures?? | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended. The names are general to be inclusive. |
| 538 | 7— Access and Equity | Survey | Richard Loya, Calif Assoc School Health Educators (CASHE), CRED Teacher TK-12, Single Subject Teaching Credential in Health Science, Other, Vice President CASHE | p. 14\*, line 308\*- box after 308: IT TASTES BETTER - THAT IS SUCH A BOGUS CLAIM. doesn't belong. I have liver because of how it tastes. to say that organic food never tastes like cardboard - all depends on preparation. this last bo of reiteration of appeal is terrible and should be deleted. | Attachment 2B | Writer’s discretion. Line item edit. |
| 539 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 14, Line 308- Write a Preface after the title: Even though writing is the last skill to develop for any student. It is especially important for teachers to lay the foundation for oral language development, reading and listening skills, before writing a narrative. Below is a sample template to help ELs organize a written assignment. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 540 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 15, Line 312- Bold the heading, Long-Term English Learner and change the font size like in Line 339 on Page 16 | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 541 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 15, Lines 313-317- Delete these two sentences. [Unless there is data and research to back this, these statements come from a Eurocentric point of view.] | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 542 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 15, Line 317- Start this heading with the definition of a Long-term English Learner. “Students identified as Long-Term English Learners (LTELs) have been schooled in the United States…” | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 543 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 15, Line 322- Rewrite the sentence: Fluent in social/conversational English but challenged by academic literacy tasks, LTELS may have difficulties engaging meaningfully in increasingly rigorous coursework. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 544 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 16, Line 340- Delete “and” at the end of Line 340. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 545 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 17, Lines 354-356- Revise the sentence to read: An anticipated outcome of the CA Common Core Standards is that students go deeper into the content of what they are learning and develop an academic vocabulary in the content areas. By differentiating instruction and using the ELD standards, ELs will have greater success in learning the language and nuances of health education. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 546 | 7— Access and Equity | Survey | Vernita Gutierrez, Community Member | p. 19\*, line 409\*- Section 409. Ethnically and Culturally Diverse Learners. Although Latinos make up a greater proportion of residents in California, I would like to see more explicit consideration be given to Black students (students of African descent, including African, African-American and the African diaspora) with regard to race and equity, as people of African descent are the most oppressed people in the world, and anti-blackness is known to exist even among other people of color. Also, more could be said specifically with regard to refugee and Native/Indigenous students. | Attachment 2B | Not Recommended as the Access and Equity is inclusive of most cultures and priority populations. |
| 547 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 19, Lines 421-423- Delete these two sentences. Ethnically and culturally diverse learners may feel marginalized or that their race, ethnically, religion, or cultures are not respected due to lack of representation in broader society or school settings. They may even be victimized or bullied by other students.  They are subjective statements that have no data to support them. Start this section with Line 424, “Issues may arise…” | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 548 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 19, Line 431- Delete “or”. Add “or trafficking”. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 549 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 19, Line 432- Put a period at the end of Line 432 and delete the rest of the sentence in Lines 433 and 434 | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 550 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 20, Lines 456-458- Use more current statistics that 2014 if possible. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 551 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 20, Line 452- Move the Title: Migrant Students and entire section to before “Ethnically and Culturally Diverse Learners” in Line 409. It is more consistent with the development the content. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 552 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 20, Line 466- Delete the line and add “and recognize any issues such as trafficking.” | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 553 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 21, Line 467- Delete “and”. Change “successful” to “success”. Put a period after “school.” Delete the rest of the sentence. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 554 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 21, Line 481-482- Delete “search the” and add “the following resources and website can be helpful:” | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 555 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 22, Lines 497-498- Put a period after “jobs”. Delete the rest of the sentence. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 556 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 22, Line 502- Put a period after “circumstances.” Delete the rest of the sentence. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 557 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 22, Line 503- Change “street” to “streets” | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 558 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 22, Lines 504-505- Delete the sentence. Add a new sentence: “These circumstances make them more vulnerable to trafficking.” | Att 18 | Recommended |
| 559 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 22, lines 509-511  **current text**: For students you suspect are homeless or in a transitional living situation, work with your school social worker, counselor, or administrators to connect students and families with the McKinney-Vento Homeless Assistance Act lead for your district.  **Suggested text:** For students you suspect are homeless or in a transitional living situation, work with your school social worker, <begin h> school <end h> counselor, or administrators to connect students and families with the McKinney-Vento Homeless Assistance Act lead for your district. | Att 21g | Recommended. |
| 560 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 22, Line 510- Add at the end of the sentence, “and be alert to signs of trafficking.” | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion/Line Edit |
| 561 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 22, Lines 521-523- Delete the sentence. [Does not fit in this context.] | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 562 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 22, Line 524- Delete “In other words” | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 563 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 22, Line 526- Add a colon after “on”. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 564 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 23, Line 532- Delete “important for all students”. [It is redundant.] | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 565 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 23, Line 543-546- Delete “to catch up as they are unable to draw from previous learning.”  Add: “and reveal some gaps in their understanding and skills development”.  Delete Lines 544-546. Add a new sentence: Additional supports such as computer modules, home study, and independent studies should be considered as alternative instructional tools. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 566 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 24, Lines 562-570- Revise the whole paragraph to read: As Gorski emphasizes, myths that blame the poor for the inequities that exist in schools are not supported by evidence. Students living in poverty are capable learners who are fully able to engage and achieve in intellectually rich health education. Rather than approaching socio-economically disadvantaged students and their families as having “deficits” that need to be “fixed”, this framework takes an asset-based approach that views all student and their families having rich cultural experiences worth valuing. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 567 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 31, lines 611-613  current text:  Ask the school social worker, or school nurse about connecting students in to the district foster youth liaison to obtain additional learning resources and health services for students  Suggested text:  Ask the school social worker, <begin h> school counselor, <end h> or school nurse about connecting students in to the district foster youth liaison to obtain additional learning resources and health services for students | Att 21g | Recommended. |
| 568 | 7— Access and Equity | Survey | Brenda Lebsack, CRED Teacher TK-12 | P. 32, line 654\*- again mentions "expansive genders". From ACLU's" Be The Change - Advocacy Toolkit for Ensuring Your Local Schools Provide Comprehensive Sexual Health Education" https://www.aclunc.org/docs/advocacy\_toolkit.pdf Top of Pg 4 [of the toolkit\*] states... 89% of California parents support comprehensive sexual health education. The Tool kit is written in context of supporting content for AB 329. I've read the study from Berkeley conducted in 2007, and there was NOTHING on the parent survey about Gender Identity, Gender Expression and the Gender Spectrum Definitions. Why are we falsely promoting parental support when none of these terms were on the study? Another very large study in California needs to be conducted which reflects the true content of our new Sex Education State Mandates according to the CHYA. This should also include anal sex, pansexuality, asexuality, intersex, and the many LGBTQQIAA alternative identities referred to in this framework of which most parents are totally unaware. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 569 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 32, Line 665- Replace all references with the word “gender” in all documents. [As a term of art, “sex” has too many meanings.] | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion. Line item edits to edit for consistency. |
| 570 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 33, Line 673- Delete “behavior modification”. [It has clinical overtones. Find another word.] | Att 18 | Writer’s discretion. Line item edits. |
| 571 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 38, Line 822- Add to Title: Students with Disabilities, IEPs and 504s | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 572 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 38, Line 843-844- Add “(IEP)” after program in Line 844. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 573 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 40, Lines 877-878- Delete this statement. It is inflammatory and made without basis in fact, citation, or documentation. | Att 18 | Not Recommended. |
| 574 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 40, Lines 878-879- Delete “It is equality as important to note that”. Start the sentence with “Students…” | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 575 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 43, Line 955- Add: “or sex trafficking” | Att 18 | Not Recommended. Sex trafficking is included in forms of abuse and is emphasized throughout the document. |
| 576 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 43, Line 979- Add “institutional” after “of”. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 577 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 44, lines 961-964  **current text:** Students who have experienced trauma may have a number of varying trauma responses, which can impact both mental and physical health. Health educators may be in a position to suggest helpful resources and connect students to school supports including the school nurse, social worker, or counselor.  **Suggested text:** Students who have experienced trauma may have a number of varying trauma responses, which can impact both mental and physical health. Health educators may be in a position to suggest helpful resources and connect students to school supports including the school nurse, <begin h> school <end h> social worker, or <begin h> school <end h> counselor. | Att 21g | Recommended. |
| 578 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 44, Line 984- Add after “such as”, “Universal Design for Learning (UDL)”. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 579 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 44, Lines 990-993- Move this sentence to the first sentence to start the paragraph in Line 979. | Att 18 | Recommended. |
| 580 | 7— Access and Equity | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 45, lines 1010-1012  **current text:** Tier 3 prevention is informed by a specialized team of special educators, behavioral interventionists, school psychologists, and counselors.  **Suggested text:** Tier 3 prevention is informed by a specialized team of special educators, behavioral interventionists, school psychologists, and<begin h> school<end h> counselors. | Att 21g | Recommended. |
| 581 | 8— Assessment | Email | Paul Meyers, District SUPT, Standard School District | p. 8, lines 168-171  **comment:** This should be deleted because its misleading. See prior comment about K and TK being the same grade level. | Att 21h | Line item edit to add health education in front of “content standards” on line 169. |
| 582 | 8— Assessment | Email | Dianne Wilson-Graham, California Physical Education-Health Project | Page 15, Notes for Teachers Section  **Recommendation:** Delete “create a rubric”, and add the following “A structure for collaborative conversations can be used in health education and will provide multiple opportunities for students and teachers to use collaborative conversations for both learning, and collecting evidence of learning. The student work product for this assessment tool would be completed by an observing student.”  **Rationale**- This description is needed to support teachers of health education in linking health education content with literacy – a new idea for many of them. The suggested language is much more useful to teachers beginning to move toward this. A rubric may be a common practice, so it’s inclusion it not needed. | Att 20 |  |
| 583 | 8— Assessment | Email | Dianne Wilson-Graham, California Physical Education-Health Project | Page 17, Notes for Teachers Section-  **Recommendation:** Delete the text in the Notes for Teachers section, and replace with “After reviewing the evidence collected, teachers can extend students learning of local resources for contraceptives, and compare and contrast resources for HIV/STD testing, and medical care.”  **Rationale-** The Recommended language provides guidance for pre assessment, and extending current display of learning. This would be preferable to ideas for students. | Att 20 |  |
| 584 | 8— Assessment | Email | Dianne Wilson-Graham, California Physical Education-Health Project | Page 30 (and others)-  **Recommendation**: Additional language should be added to some sample assessment tools to reflect the unpacked content that is shown in the sample. Additional language should be added to some sample assessment tools to indicate the content and evidence links with literacy.  **Rationale**: The sample assessment tool on page 30, grades 7-8, was written for unpacked (or a piece of) content in the standard. This should be noted in the left column under the grade level to provide information for the reader which supports their reading this example. The current example, demonstrates a mis-alignment with the content and the tool, because it does not indicate that the content is a small piece of the learning in the standard. It is Recommended it read as follows: 7-8 Unpacked Content 3 Links with Literacy | Att 20 |  |
| 585 | 8— Assessment | Email | Dianne Wilson-Graham, California Physical Education-Health Project | Page 38, line 435- Table  **Recommendation**: Omit this table from the draft Health Framework.  **Rationale**: The sample products shown in this table, do not support teachers looking at the evidence of learning an assessment tool is to collect, rather, they distract from the learning and focus on the product. Products display evidence of learning, they do not mine evidence of learning as assessment tools do. Examples of products, promote teacher distraction in many areas (time for production, materials, grading/scoring, setting up field trips, etc.), rather than focus their thinking on evidence of learning.The sample assessment tools provided earlier in the chapter present a much clearer picture, and this table is not aligned, nor is it clear about evidence of learning. | Att 20 |  |
| 586 | 9— Instructional Materials for Health Education | Survey | Brenda Lebsack, CRED Teacher TK-12 | p. 7 states instructional resources must be appropriate for use with all students regardless their.....religion, culture, etc.... I have yet to see a CHYA curriculum that is inclusive of varied view points. AB 329 states you cannot promote religion, but by law, that does not mean other views should be disregarded as though they do not exist. How is teaching one gender ideology as "fact" inclusive of our students with varied cultural and religious backgrounds? I am a teacher. I am already hearing students of various backgrounds say they are being "shamed" for their religious beliefs. They are respectful with their beliefs, yet if they hold a different view they are now being bullied and called derogatory names such as bigot, hater, homophobe, racist. Why should our Muslim, Mormon, Catholic, Christian, Jehovah Witness and Orthodox Jewish Students be stigmatized for not holding to these so called "politically correct" beliefs now being taught in school? This is hypocritical. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 587 | 9— Instructional Materials for Health Education | Survey | Melissa Hamilton, CRED Teacher TK-12 | p. 7\*, Lines 178-180- If indeed the material is to be appropriate for all cultures and religions than parents need to have an opt-out option for sexual issues that go against their religion. Also, it is philosophically impossible to have a health curriculum be appropriate for all given how some cultures and religions are diametrically opposed. | Attachment 2B | Non-Actionable |
| 588 | Appendix—Sex Trafficking | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 3, Line 64- #81, Self-harm. Add: “including cutting”. Add a new #94, “Secretive or strange behavior of a parent” | Att 18 | Line 81- Recommended.  Line 94 – Not Recommended. |
| 589 | Appendix—Sex Trafficking | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 5, Line 131- Add under Psychological Impact: “Transforming this fear into parenting behaviors”. | Att 18 | Not Recommended |
| 590 | Appendix—Sex Trafficking | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 5, Line 138- Add a sentence on underlying reasons that these signs may be trauma related. | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion to edit for clarity if needed. |
| 591 | Appendix—Sex Trafficking | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 8, Line 205- Add at the end of that sentence: “and their families”. | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion |
| 592 | Appendix—Sex Trafficking | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 9, Line 209- Change to color of the circles to a lighter color to make it more readable and printable. | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion |
| 593 | Appendix—Sex Trafficking | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | Page 10, Lines 218-219- Add some examples of protocols. | Att 18 | Not Recommended. Example protocol is located on page 11 |
| 594 | Appendix— Examples of Standards Based Instruction | Email | Marlene Fong, California Teachers Association | p. 1- The introduction of this section should show and explain how the Health Education Standards should align with the Common Core Standards and the braiding of the interdisciplinary aspects of other content areas. | Att 18 | Writer’s Discretion/Addition |

California Department of Education, August 2018