**California Department of Education**

# Report to the Governor, Legislature, and the Department of Finance: Career Technical Education Incentive Grant Annual Report



**Prepared by:**

**Career and College Transition Division**

**Access for All Branch**

November, 2020

*Description*: Career Technical Education Incentive Grant and Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve Component of the Strong Workforce Program Data Metrics Annual Legislative Report

*Authority*: *Education Code* sections 53071(c)(11)(C) and 88828(d)(8)(B)

*Recipient*: Governor, Legislature, and Department of Finance

*Due Date*: November 30, 2020

**California Department of Education**

**Report to the Governor, Legislature, and the Department of Finance:**

**Career Technical Education Incentive Grant Annual Report**

## Table of Contents

[Table of Contents 1](#_Toc56500267)

[Executive Summary 2](#_Toc56500268)

[Introduction 3](#_Toc56500269)

[Background 4](#_Toc56500270)

[2019 Annual Report (2017–18 School Year Data) 6](#_Toc56500271)

[2020 Annual Report (2018–19 Academic Year) 7](#_Toc56500272)

[Recommendations 9](#_Toc56500273)

[Future Considerations 11](#_Toc56500274)

[Appendix A: 2020 Career Technical Education Completer Data Survey Template (2018–19 Academic Year) 12](#_Toc56500275)

[Appendix B: 2021 Career Technical Education Completer Data Survey Template (2019–20 Academic Year) 14](#_Toc56500276)

## Executive Summary

This report is required annually by California *Education Code* (*EC*) sections 53071(c)(11)(C) and 88828(d)(8)(B), as currently established by Senate Bill 75 (Chapter 51, Statutes of 2019). It includes recommendations from the California Workforce Pathways Joint Advisory Committee (CWPJAC), established pursuant to *EC* Section 12053, regarding the data metrics collected from grantees of the Career Technical Education Incentive Grant (CTEIG) and the kindergarten through grade twelve component of the Strong Workforce Program (K–12 SWP). The 2019 Recommendation Report (2017–18 academic year) has been incorporated into this 2020 Annual Report (2018–19 academic year), with recommendations for both grant programs.

It is the general recommendation of the CWPJAC to make only non-substantive changes to the CTEIG and K–12 SWP metrics at this time. The recommendations are intended to precisely align each metric as reflected in the current administration of both programs. The determinants informing our recommendations are the legislative intent, a uniform source from which data can be gathered and utilized for measurement, and a methodological basis for developing functional indicators for each metric. These minor changes will allow for the disaggregation of each metric by race/ethnicity and special populations, enable consistent measurement across several state and federal programs, and foster enhanced comparative analyses of future data collections.

With the Federal Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the 21st Century Act (Perkins V) serving as supplemental to the CTEIG and the K–12 SWP, the importance of alignment cannot be overstated. Prior to the 2020 data collection period, the California Department of Education (CDE) and California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office staff began to reexamine their approaches to data collection, methodology, and translating the data metrics into functional indicators within the context of the current Career Technical Education State Plan and the Federal Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the 21st Century Act Perkins V. At present, these two documents are not aligned with the minimum eligibility standards, and corresponding data metrics, of the CTEIG or K–12 SWP programs. While not a formal recommendation, a brief overview of our strategy to pursue complete policy and program alignment has been included for future consideration.

If you have any questions regarding this report, please contact Michelle McIntosh, Education Administrator I, Career and College Transition Division, by phone at   
916-327-6367 or by email at [mmcintosh@cde.ca.gov](mailto:mmcintosh@cde.ca.gov).

You can find this report on the CDE CTEIG Web page at [https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/ct/ig/documents/lrcteig20.docx](http://staging.cde.ca.gov/ci/ct/ig/documents/lrcteig20.docx). If you need a copy of this report, please contact Michelle McIntosh, Education Administrator I, Career and College Transition Division, by phone at 916-327-6367 or by email at [mmcintosh@cde.ca.gov](mailto:mmcintosh@cde.ca.gov).

## Introduction

The Career Technical Education Incentive Grant (CTEIG) was originally established by Assembly Bill 104 (Chapter 13, Statutes of 2015) as a one-time investment of $900 million to cover a three-year span, and acted as a bridge for local educational agencies (LEAs) to support career technical education (CTE) programs until the Local Control Funding Formula was fully funded.

It was created as a state education, economic, and workforce development initiative to provide pupils in kindergarten through grade twelve (K–12) with the knowledge and skills necessary to transition from secondary education to postsecondary education and living-wage employment. The purpose of the program is to encourage, maintain, and strengthen the delivery of high-quality CTE programs.

With the enactment of AB 1808 (Chapter 32, Statutes of 2018), the K–12 component of the Strong Workforce Plan (SWP) was created and, along with the CTEIG, the companion state programs were allocated $150 million each, $300 million total, as ongoing funds. An additional $13.5 million was provided annually to establish technical assistance providers (TAPs) and workforce pathway coordinators in support of both state initiatives.

The K–12 SWP grant program was established as a component of the SWP to create, support, or expand high-quality CTE programs at the secondary level that are aligned with the workforce development efforts occurring through the SWP. Both programs support the overall development of high-quality CTE programs, courses, course sequences, programs of study, and pathways administered by K–12 LEAs.

The CTEIG and the K–12 SWP are administered by the California Department of Education (CDE) and the California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office (CCCCO), respectively.

Per *Education Code (EC)* sections 53071 and 88828, the California Workforce Pathways Joint Advisory Committee (CWPJAC) has the responsibility for making recommendations regarding the data metrics used for the CTEIG and K–12 SWP to the Department of Finance, the Governor, and appropriate policy and fiscal committees of the Legislature regarding whether:

1. The data metrics remain the most appropriate metrics to measure and evaluate program outcomes for both new and renewal applicants.
2. Other metrics should be included.

The data metrics for both programs were last revised by Senate Bill 75 (Chapter 51, Statutes of 2019) to their current iteration, and this report is intended to fulfill the reporting requirements for the CTEIG (2019 and 2020) and K–12 SWP (2020) programs.

## Background

The data metrics collected for both the CTEIG and K–12 SWP programs were most recently updated in SB 75 (Chapter 51, Statutes of 2019). The overarching aim of both the metrics is to measure the engagement, achievement, and transition of CTE students in grades seven through twelve, and beyond. Each is defined as follows within the context of the CTEIG and the K–12 SWP grant programs:

* ***Engagement***–defined as attending, focusing, and specializing in CTE course work and work-based learning, usually leading to completing programmatic career pathways;
* ***Achievement***–defined as academic performance, skill development, and, completing (graduating) high school for those focusing, and specializing in CTE course work; and,
* ***Transition***–defined as moving into some form of post-high school experience, typically on to postsecondary education; or into the workplace.

## A Uniform Source of Data

The CTEIG was created in 2015, and the K–12 SWP began in 2018. For the 2017–18 academic year, the CTEIG data was collected entirely through a survey. For the 2018–19 academic year, some of the CTEIG and K–12 SWP data was collected in the California Longitudinal Pupil Achievement Data System (CALPADS), but other metrics were collected using a survey. In 2019, the CDE’s Career and College Transition Division (CCTD) began discussions with the different divisions responsible for LEA data collection to explore the possibility of using a single process for obtaining information on the CTEIG and the K–12 SWP data metrics concurrently. One of the results of CCTD’s efforts was the development of the 2020 CTE Completer Data Template (Appendix A), which was utilized during the 2020 data collection period (2018–19 academic year). Moving forward, all CTEIG, K–12 SWP, and Federal Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the Perkins V data metrics will be submitted within the CALPADS starting with the 2021 data collection period (2019–20 academic year). Additionally, the 2021 CTE Completer Data Template (Appendix B) has been updated to standardize the uniform collection of all CTE Completer data moving forward.

## Methodological Basis for Developing Functional Measure(s) for Each Metric

With a single source of data collection, the ability to move towards a common methodology becomes possible. However, for the precision of metrics to have meaning, the student population of interest must be uniformly defined. The recommendation on methodology is that the data from which the metrics will be calculated will be drawn from an unduplicated aggregate count of students in the adjusted four-year graduating cohort. This aggregated count reflects the LEA report that confirms the student has enrolled in, and completed, at least one CTE course. Many students are likely completing at least one CTE pathway during the four-year cohort period.

The student population of interest for CTE programs covered by the CTEIG and K–12 SWP is now commonly defined, which is reflected in the virtually identical data metrics for the two programs. The student population of interest (grades nine through twelve CTE students completing an industry pathway), as well as potential CTEIG and K–12 SWP grantees, are coming from the same pool of LEA applicants. Therefore, it is recommended that the CTEIG and K–12 SWP metric definitions, data collection, methodology, and measurement approaches be the same. In short, it increases alignment between the two programs.

To judge the engagement, achievement, and transition of a student being impacted by the CTEIG and/or K–12 SWP programs, each metric needs to be expressed numerically. The numerical expression is generally an absolute number or a percentage. For an indicator to be expressed as a percentage, there has to be a numerator and a denominator. Further, an indicator permits the setting of a baseline, as well as a target to be achieved in the future. Moreover, for every refined and updated CTEIG and K–12 SWP metric, and associated indicators, it should be noted that each can also be measured at the disaggregated race/ethnicity and special population levels.

## Summary

Because the Perkins V is supplemental to the CTEIG and the K–12 SWP, it is important that the data metrics align so that data is being measured consistently for benchmarking student achievement/progress. Both the CTEIG and the K–12 SWP request annual applications and provide funds to eligible grantees from the same set of LEAs, which shows about an 80 percent overlap, and hence creates an opportunity to continue to work to align the analysis of data metrics and the application process for these two grants. With CALPADS becoming the single source for collecting a commonly validated set of data, the ability to measure and report common data metrics, and associated indicators, is increased significantly for all state- and federally-funded CTE programs.

## 2019 Annual Report (2017–18 School Year Data)

**Data Collection Process**

The metrics from AB104 (Chapter 13, Statutes of 2015) were used during the 2019 collection to reflect the metrics in statute at the time of the 2017–18 school year. In 2019, the CDE was collecting 2017–18 academic year data for CTEIG only, since the K–12 SWP program had just been created.

The data collection process was administered by a CDE TAP, the San Bernardino County Office of Education (SBCOE). The SBCOE was tasked with contacting all grant recipients statewide, which was conducted entirely through Survey Monkey.

**Data Definitions**

Metric 1: The number of pupils completing high school.

*Defined as grade twelve students who took a CTE course, no matter what level, graduated in 2017–18, and a subset of Metric 2.*

Metric 2: The number of pupils completing CTE coursework.

*Defined as the number of students who took and completed any**CTE course, which includes one or**all of the following: Intro, Concentrator, Capstone, including courses offered outside the period day.*

Metric 3: The number of pupils obtaining an industry-recognized credential, certificate, license, or other measure of technical skill attainment.

*Defined as a subset of Metric 2.*

Metric 4: The number of former pupils employed and the types of businesses in which they are employed. Unavailable.

*Defined as a subset of Metric 2.*

Metric 5: The number of former pupils enrolled in a postsecondary educational institution, a state apprenticeship program, or another form of job training.

*Defined as a subset of Metric 2.*

## 2020 Annual Report (2018–19 Academic Year)

**Data Collection Process**

The Perkins V established new CTE performance indicators and modified federal reporting requirements (formerly, Fall 2 [E2] reporting) for CTE Completers. All LEAs operating CTE programs are now required to submit postsecondary status data for their CTE Completers, regardless of whether they received Perkins V funding. Moreover, the data metrics required under the CTEIG and K–12 SWP grant programs were derived from the Perkins IV and V legislation. Moreover, both the CTEIG and the K–12 SWP grant programs require LEAs to annually submit their CTE Completer and grant program information to the CDE to remain eligible for future funding.

To alleviate the administrative burden of collecting CTE data for three separate programs, the CDE created the CTE Completer Data Survey template (see Appendix B). The CDE instructed all LEAs to use this comprehensive survey template during their collection of CTE Completer and grant program information in 2020.

Once all of the data had been compiled, the LEA was required to submit the student-level data for questions one, three, four, five, and six of the survey template into their Student Information System (SIS), and then export the data into the CALPADS through the Postsecondary Status (PSTS) file. The PSTS file replaces the E2 reporting file that traditionally collects CTE Completer information. The student-level data collected by the LEAs for questions two, seven, eight, and nine of the survey template was aggregated (total of every answer to each question) and submitted through a Snap Survey developed by the CDE. The survey can be found on the CDE Surveys web page at <https://surveys2.cde.ca.gov/go/ctecompleters2018-19.asp>.

Unfortunately, the CDE was unable to program all of the questions from the survey template into the PSTS file in time for the 2020 data collection (2018–19 academic year) period. However, the CDE has confirmed the data metrics required for all three programs (CTEIG, K–12 SWP, and Perkins V) will be collected in CALPADS for the 2021 (2019*–*20 academic year) data collection period.

**Data Definitions for 2018–19 Academic Year**

Metric 1: The high school graduation rate.

*Defined as any member of the 2018–19 adjusted graduation cohort who exited grade twelve and completed 300 hours; including the capstone with a grade of C- or better, and a subset of Metric 2.*

Metric 2: The number of pupils completing CTE coursework.

*Defined as any student in the graduation cohort who completed at least one CTE course.*

Metric 3: The number of pupils meeting academic and career-readiness standards as defined in the College/Career Indicator associated with the California School Dashboard. (CTEIG only)

*Defined as CTE Concentrators who achieved reading/language arts and mathematics proficiency after taking the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 assessments.*

Metric 4: The number of pupils obtaining an industry-recognized credential, certificate, license, or other measure of technical skill attainment.

*Defined as a subset of Metric 2.*

Metric 5: The number of former pupils employed and the types of businesses in which they are employed.

*Defined as a subset of Metric 2.*

Metric 6: The number of former pupils enrolled in each of the following:

(I) A postsecondary educational institution.

(II) A state apprenticeship program.

(III) A form of job training other than a state apprenticeship program.

*Defined as a subset of Metric 2. Disaggregated by public, private nonprofit, and private for-profit institutions (*K–12 SWP*).*

## Recommendations

The CWPJAC, in consultation with CDE and CCCCO staff, recommends there be no substantive changes to the CTEIG and K–12 SWP data metrics at this time. *EC* Section 53071(c)(11)(B) defines the metrics required for collection as part of the CTEIG program, and *EC* Section 88828(d)(8)(B) defines the metrics required for collection as part of the K–12 SWP. These two statutes are virtually identical. As such, the CWPJAC recommends non-substantive changes to create exact alignment of the data metrics for these complimentary programs.

The following is a side-by-side depiction of the CTEIG and K–12 SWP data metrics as listed in *EC* sections 53071 and 88828.

| CTEIG *EC* Section 53071(c)(11)(B)(i-vi) | K–12 SWP *EC* Section 88828(d)(8)(B)(i-v) |
| --- | --- |
| (i) The high school graduation rate. | (i) The high school graduation rate. |
| (ii) The number of pupils completing career technical education coursework. | (ii) The number of pupils completing career technical education coursework. |
| (iii) The number of pupils meeting academic and career-readiness standards as defined in the College/Career Indicator associated with the California School Dashboard. | **No correlating metric listed in the K–12 SWP statute.** |
| (iv) The number of pupils obtaining an industry-recognized credential, certificate, license, or other measure of technical skill attainment. | (iii) The number of pupils obtaining an industry-recognized credential, certificate, license, or other measure of technical skill attainment. |
| (v) The number of former pupils employed and the types of businesses in which they are employed. | (iv) The number of former pupils employed and the types of businesses in which they are employed. |
| (vi) The number of former pupils enrolled in each of the following: (I) A postsecondary educational institution. (II) A state apprenticeship program. (III) A form of job training other than a state apprenticeship program. | (v) The number of former pupils enrolled in each of the following: (I) A postsecondary educational institution, disaggregated by public, private nonprofit, and private for-profit institutions. (II) A state apprenticeship program. (III) Another form of job training. |

The following non-substantive changes are recommended for exact alignment across both programs:

1. Currently, there are six metrics listed for CTEIG and five metrics for K–12 SWP. The CTEIG metric number three–*EC* Section 53071(c)(11)(B)(iii)–is not listed in the K–12 SWP statute, and should be added to the metrics.
2. CTEIG metric number six–*EC* Section 53071(c)(11)(B)(vi)–and K–12 SWP metric number five–*EC* Section 88828(d)(8)(B)(v) are virtually similar with two important differences.
3. The first sub-subparagraph (I) in both the CTEIG metric six and the K–12 SWP metric five are similar; however, the K–12 version disaggregates the number of former pupils enrolled in a postsecondary educational institution by public, private non-profit, and private for-profit institutions. The same CTEIG metric does not disaggregate this compound metric, and should be corrected to reflect the K–12 SWP statutes.
4. The third sub-subparagraph (III), in both the CTEIG metric six and K–12 SWP metric five, are similar; however, the CTEIG metric specifies another form of job training “other than a state apprenticeship program”, while the K–12 SWP metric states “another form of job training.” While the distinction in the CTEIG metric could suggest that those pupils enrolled in another form of job training “other than a state apprenticeship program” could, under a strict literal interpretation, also be included in the count for sub-subparagraph one (I) of the compound metric total, they are essentially asking the same question in a different way. The CTEIG metric six should be changed to reflect the K–12 SWP statute.

Once the differences between the CTEIG and K–12 SWP statutes have been reconciled, and a single source of data collection and consistent methodology have been employed, meaningful longitudinal data analysis can be conducted for both programs. However, given the multiple iterations of metrics for both programs and the lack of consistency in the areas mentioned above, it would be premature to make substantive changes to the data metrics at this time.

## Future Considerations

As part of the annual data metrics review, CDE and CCCCO staff have been reexamining the approaches to methodology; specifically, translating the data metrics into functional measures. This has been done in consultation with State Board of Education staff regarding placing the CTEIG and K–12 SWP metrics within the context of the CWPJAC’s *Guiding Policy Principles to Support Student-Centered K–14+ Pathways* (*Guiding Policy Principles*) included in the State Plan for CTE and the Perkins V application.

With a more robust set of data anticipated with the 2021 data collection, the CDE will be able to perform more methodical variations of data runs. These data runs were not possible up until now because varied data collection methods, inconsistent methodologies, and measurement approaches were not explicit. Through a phased approach, the CDE will develop data runs by identifying the appropriate indicators to accurately measure the intent of each metric. Moreover, these data runs should permit staff to refine and update indicators as more data becomes available in future academic year cycles.

In the future, it is the objective of the CWPJAC to operationalize the CTEIG and K–12 SWP metrics to reflect the *Guiding Policy Principles* and the 12 Essential Elements of a High-Quality College and Career Pathway. Currently, the CTEIG and K–12 SWP statutes list the 11 Essential Elements of High Quality CTE as the minimum eligibility standards developed under the previous State Plan for CTE. To align the *Guiding Policy Principles* with any future recommended changes to the data metrics, the current minimum eligibility standards must be replaced by the 12 Essential Elements in the CTEIG. How and when the CWPJAC’s *Guiding Policy Principles* will be recommended for incorporation into the CTEIG and K–12 SWP statutes is a decision requiring further examination and analysis of the 2021 data collection process. In the meantime, CDE staff recognizes the need to provide the field with strong professional development and implementation guidance around the CWPJAC’s *Guiding Policy Principles*, prior to any future recommended changes in the data metrics.

## Appendix A: 2020 Career Technical Education Completer Data Survey Template (2018–19 Academic Year)

Questions 1, 3, 4, 5, and 6 will be reported into your Student Information System and exported into the California Longitudinal Pupil Achievement Data System through the Postsecondary Status file.

1. Are you enrolled in one of the following educational or training programs? Select the one that best applies. If you are not enrolled in any educational or training program, do not check any.

* Four-year College/University (map to Code 200)
* Community college (210)
* Vocational or technical school (two-year degree program) (220)
* High School Equivalency Test Preparation Program (300)
* Vocational or technical school (certificate program) (310)
* Regional Occupational Program (ROP) (320)
* Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act Supported Program (330)
* Non-Workability Employment Program (340)
* Adult Training Program (350)

1. If you checked one of the above for question 1, was the program:

* Public
* Private Nonprofit
* For Profit

1. Are you enlisted in the military? (If response is "yes", map to 400)

* Yes
* No

1. Are you incarcerated? (If response is "yes", map to 900)

* Yes
* No

1. Are you employed?

* Yes, Full-time or part-time employment with compensation at or above minimum wage (map to 910)
* Yes, Full-time or part-time employment with compensation less than minimum wage (920)
* No

1. If none of the above options apply, check one of the following:

* None of the options apply (map to 940)
* I decline to respond (960)

1. If you are employed, what type of business or in what field are you employed? (Check which industry that best represents the type of employment)

* Agriculture and Natural Resources
* Arts, Media, and Entertainment
* Building and Construction Trades
* Business and Finance
* Education, Child Development, and Family Services
* Energy, Environment, and Utilities
* Engineering and Architecture
* Fashion and Interior Design
* Information and Communication Technologies
* Health Science and Medical Technology
* Hospitality, Tourism, and Recreation
* Manufacturing and Product Development
* Marketing, Sales, and Service
* Transportation
* Public Services
* Other (Please specify)

1. Are you enrolled in one of the following? (Only check if applicable):

* Peace Corps
* Ameri Corps
* A State Apprenticeship program
* Other job training program

1. Have you received one of the following?

* Industry-recognized credential (e.g. Serv-Safe, National Institute of Metalworking Skills, American Welding Society, etc.)
* Certificate issued by a post-secondary institution
* License issued by the State of California (e.g. Cosmetology, Certified Nursing Assistant, etc.)
* Other measure of technical skill attainment (e.g. third-party certification, National Occupational Competency Testing Institute, Certiport, etc.)
* None of the above

Questions 2, 7, 8, and 9 will be reported through a Snap Survey developed by the CDE and can be found on the CDE Survey web page at <https://surveys2.cde.ca.gov/go/ctecompleters2018-19.asp>.

## Appendix B: 2021 Career Technical Education Completer Data Survey Template (2019–20 Academic Year)

Beginning with the 2021 data collection cycle, all Career Technical Education Completer data will be reported in your Student Information System and exported into the California Longitudinal Pupil Achievement Data through the Postsecondary Status file.

1. Are you enrolled in one of the following educational or training programs? Select the one that best applies. If you are not enrolled in any educational or training program, do not check any.

* Four-year College/University
* Community college
* Vocational or technical school (two-year degree program)
* High School Equivalency Test Preparation Program
* Vocational or technical school (certificate program)
* Regional Occupational Program (ROP)
* Work Force Innovation and Opportunity Act Supported Program
* Non-Workability Employment Program
* Adult Training Program
* State Apprenticeship Program
* Other Job Training Program

1. If you checked one of the above for question 1, was the program:

* Public
* Private Nonprofit
* For Profit

1. Are you enlisted in the military?

* Yes
* No

1. Are you incarcerated?

* Yes
* No

1. Are you employed?

* Yes, Full-time or part-time employment with compensation at or above minimum wage
* Yes, Full-time or part-time employment with compensation less than minimum wage
* Yes, Other type of employment
* No

1. Are you enrolled in one of the following? (Only check if applicable):

* Peace Corps
* Ameri Corps

1. If none of the above options apply, check one of the following:

* None of the options apply
* I decline to respond

1. If you are employed, what type of business or in what field are you employed? Check the industry that best represents the type of employment.

* Agriculture and Natural Resources
* Arts, Media, and Entertainment
* Building and Construction Trades
* Business and Finance
* Education, Child Development, and Family Services
* Energy, Environment, and Utilities
* Engineering and Architecture
* Fashion and Interior Design
* Information and Communication Technologies
* Health Science and Medical Technology
* Hospitality, Tourism, and Recreation
* Manufacturing and Product Development
* Marketing, Sales, and Service
* Transportation
* Public Services
* Other

1. Have you received one of the following?

* Industry-recognized credential (e.g. Serv-Safe, National Institute of Metalworking Skills, American Welding Society, etc.)
* Certificate issued by a post-secondary institution
* Degree awarded by a postsecondary institution
* License issued by the State of California (e.g. Cosmetology, Certified Nursing Assistant), etc.)
* Other measure of technical skill attainment (e.g. third-party certification, National Occupational Competency Testing Institute, Certiport, etc.)
* None of the above