This advisory recommendation has not been approved by the Instructional Quality Commission or the State Board of Education

# REVIEW PANEL ADVISORY RECOMMENDATION 2021 ARTS EDUCATION INSTRUCTIONAL MATERIALS ADOPTION

| **Publisher** | **Program** | **Grade Level(s)** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Arts Attack | *Arts Attack* | K–8 |

## Program Summary:

The Arts Attack digital program includes the following: *Teachers Manual* (*TM); Art Print Guide (APG); Grade Document (GD); Grade Video (GV); Art Print (AP); Video Lesson (VL); Response/Evaluation (RE); Discussion Question (DQ).*

Note: The citations listed below reflect the page numbers printed on the documents provided by the program and may be different from page numbers assigned by viewing software.

## Recommendation:

*Arts Attack* is not recommended for adoption because the instructional materials do not include content as specified in the *California Arts Standards for California Public Schools, Prekindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Arts Standards*), and do not meet all the criteria in category 1 and do not show strengths in categories 2, 3, and 4.

### **Criteria Category 1: Arts Education Content/Alignment with Standards**

The program does not support instruction designed to ensure that students master all the *Arts Standards* for the intended grade levels, and does not meet all of the evaluation criteria in category 1.

#### Citations:

Criteria Category 1, Criterion #1: Standards Not Met:

* Criterion #1.1: K.VA:Cr1.2; TM, pp. 67–68, procedures 1–7. The program does not provide students with sufficient opportunities to engage collaboratively in creative artmaking in response to an artistic problem. Students engage individually in teacher-directed projects. No opportunities for students to work collaboratively as defined by the *Arts Standards* Visual Art Glossary, p. 222.

Page 1

* Criterion #1.1: 3.VA:Pr4; TM, p. 98, Displaying Artwork. Insufficient opportunities for students to investigate and discuss possibilities and limitations of spaces, including electronic spaces, for exhibiting artwork. Instructions emphasize the teacher’s role in displaying artwork and do not include explicitly include students as partners to investigate and conceptualize displays or discovering venue options.
* Criterion #1.1: 4.VA:Cr2.2; TM, p. 36, Safety and Care of Equipment. The program outlines safety and care of equipment for the teacher only, insufficient providing explicit opportunities for students to demonstrate safe use and care for materials, tools, and equipment in a manner that prevents danger to oneself and others when making works of art.
* Criterion #1.1: 4.VA:Cn10; TM, pp. 143–147 (Kachina Dolls). The program missed opportunities for students to create works of art that reflect community cultural traditions. The program prescribes cultural traditions to investigate rather than providing space for students investigate community cultural traditions. Students are asked to copy the cultural and spiritual artifacts of other cultures, resulting in cultural misappropriation as described in the *California Arts Education Framework for Public Schools, Transitional Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Arts Education Framework*)*,* p. 81.
* Criterion #1.1: 5.VA:Re9; TM, p. 164, Year-end Art Print Study. Artwork provided as instructional examples is restricted to paintings, missing opportunities to provide variety in art media and promote diversity in the cultural/historical contexts of the artwork. The program lacks opportunities for students to recognize differences in criteria used to evaluate works of art depending on styles, genres, and media, as well as historical and cultural contexts.
* Criterion #1.1: 7.VA:Cr1.1; TM, pp. 97–112, VL Michelangelo. The program does not include guidance to support students to respond to and overcome creative blocks.
* Criterion #1.1: 7.VA:Cr1.2; TM, pp. 68–70, procedures 1–8, RE 19–22. Students are provided a limited set of criteria and are not afforded opportunities to develop their own criteria to guide their art-making to meet an identified goal.
* Criterion #1.4: Grades K–8; VLs contain documented/attributed source material inconsistent with 8.VA:Cr2.2,“Demonstrate awareness of practices, issues, and ethics of appropriation, fair use, copyright, open source, and Creative Commons as they apply to creating works of art and design.”
* Criterion #1.6: Grades K–8; TM, pp. 14–15, Scope and Sequence (all grade levels). The program does align with the *Arts Education Framework* (p. 81) by addressing culturally sustaining or relevant work and providing the sources and acknowledging where the contents, styles, and practices were generated. The program does not provide culturally and linguistically responsive activities for engaging students in the arts processes to increase students’ knowledge of the arts through their study of the historical, contemporary, and multicultural artistic concepts and the lives, contributions, and innovations of various artists and arts movements. The Culture and History category and the Artists and Aesthetics category of lessons misappropriate various cultures in materials designed for elementary and middle-school students.

### **Criteria Category 2: Program Organization**

The organization and features of the instructional materials do not support instruction and learning of the standards.

#### Citations:

* + Criterion #2.1: Grades K–8; TM, pp. 3–6 and 14–15; GV Teacher Training Video, Program Overview Chapter. The program delivers individual lessons organized in a manner misaligned to the recommendations for including enduring understandings, essential questions, and big ideas, as described in the *Arts Education Framework*, p. 12.
  + Criterion #2.4: Grades K–8; GD, California Standards Alignment. The California Standards Alignment document for each grade level contain inaccuracies and inconsistencies associated with the *Arts Standards* in the cited lessons.
  + Criterion #2.4: Grades K–8; GD, Lesson Summaries. Grade-level lessons are not aligned to the *Arts Standards*. The structure of the program is not organized by chapters or units and does not include explanation of how the arts standards will be met in each offering. The structure of the program does not provide chapter or unit outlines, essential questions, big ideas, and enduring understandings in alignment with the standards and the framework.
  + Criterion #2.5: Grades K–8; TM, VL, APG. The program includes images and graphics that lack sufficient diversity of represented artworks and art media to enhance students’ focus and understanding of the content and that does not reflect the diversity of California. Images, videos, and graphics are inconsistently attributed.

### **Criteria Category 3: Assessment**

The instructional materials do not provide teachers with assistance in using assessments for planning instruction and monitoring student progress toward mastering the content.

#### Citations:

* + Criterion #3.1: TM, p. 24. Diagnostic Assessment does not include strategies or instruments that guide teachers in determining students’ prior knowledge.
  + Criterion #3.4: Grades K–8; TM, Teaching the Arts Attack Program: Teach the Lesson: Show the Lesson on the Video to the Students, p. 17, 4–5. Guidance around teacher observation primarily focuses on ways to assess students’ ability to independently apply discipline-specific arts concepts, processes, and principles. The result is a series of missed opportunities for employing multiple measurements and differentiated strategies.
  + Criterion #3.5: Grades K–8; TM, Assessment and Evaluation, pp. 24–25. The assessment strategies provided do not include opportunities to for teachers to use a broad array of assessment strategies to evaluate student understanding.
  + Criterion #3.6: GV, Teacher Training Video, Helpful Teaching Tips *–* General (time stamp 48:57 to 1:00:08). The resource does not address specific elements of assessment and includes minimal guidance for adapting instruction based on evidence and improve student learning.

### **Criteria Category 4: Access and Equity**

Program materials do not ensure universal and equitable access to high-quality program and instruction for all students anddo not provide teachers with suggestions for differentiation for students with special needs.

#### Citations:

* + Criterion #4.1: Grades K–8; TM, Artists Studied in Arts Attack, pp. 7–11; TM, Artists Studied in Digital Program, p. 11. The program provides lists of 32 and 61 artists. Choices are overwhelmingly male, resulting in missed opportunities to highlight contemporary artists, contemporary art movements, and diversity of artists from a variety ethnicities, cultures, experiences, and backgrounds to represent and reach the diversity of learners.
  + Criterion #4.1: Grades K–8; TM, Holiday Art Lessons: Grade 1, pp. 67 and 142; Grade 2, p. 63; Grade 3, p. 63; Grade 4, p. 57. Missed opportunities for instruction that includes all students, and guidance for highlighting diverse backgrounds as a resource for student learning.
  + Criterion #4.2: Grades K–8; TM, p. 18. The program missed opportunities to provide current and confirmed research for adapting the program and the instruction in ways that meet students’ needs. Current and confirmed research should provide students with opportunities for contemporary explorations of self, peoples, and cultures and with more student voice/choice in the lessons to provide differentiated instruction and be inclusive. (See also Kindergarten, p. 75; Grade 1, p. 142; Grade 2, p. 72; Grade 4, p. 143; Grade 5, p. 125; Grade 6, p. 145; Grade 7, p. 137; Grade 8, p. 93).
  + Criterion #4.3: Grades K–8; TM, p. 18. The program does not refer to current and confirmed research, including the guidelines of the Universal Design of Learning stipulated in the *Arts Education Framework*, resulting in missed opportunities for comprehensive teacher guidance and differentiation strategies to adapt the program to meet students' identified special needs and to provide effective, efficient instruction for all students.
  + Criterion #4.4: Grades K–8; TM, p. 18 (especially item 5 in the list). The program did not provide sufficient guidance to support English learners or alignment with the *California English Language Development Standards: Kindergarten Through Grade 12* (*ELD Standards*)adopted under *EC* Section 60811. The program does not provide specific support for students who are English learners or direct connections to the *ELD Standards* and missed opportunities for teachers to use students’ cultural backgrounds as assets to learning.
  + Criterion #4.5: Grades K–8; TM, p. 18 (especially item 5 in the list). The program misses opportunities to provide specific strategies and support for English learners in both student and teacher editions, as appropriate, at every grade level and grade span.
  + Criterion #4.6: Grades K–8; TM, p. 18. The program does not provide sufficient scaffolding or strategies for students who perform below grade level or need assistance with arts content.

### **Criteria Category 5: Instructional Planning and Support**

The instructional materials containa clear road map for teachers to follow when planning instruction and are designed to help teachers provide effective standards-based instruction and ensure opportunities for all students to learn the essential skills and knowledge specified in the standards.

#### Citations:

* + Criterion #5.1: Grades K–8; TM. Detailed lesson plans provide information needed teach the lesson, including background information, drawing aids or student handouts, concepts listed, vocabulary, step-by-step procedures, discussion guidance, assessment and evaluation exercises and connections activities.
  + Criterion #5.1: Grades K–8; TM (all grades), pp. 16–17, and GV Teacher Training Video, Teaching Tips (time stamp 34:07–1:00:08). Materials provide suggestions for organizing resources in the classroom and ideas for pacing lessons.
  + Criterion #5.5: GV How to Use Arts Attack and the Support Hotline in grade-level resources provides support for educators in the use of the program.
  + Criterion #5.6: Arts Attack Online is a user-friendly resource consisting of Videos, Documents, Art Print Images, and Lessons and is compatible with all common platforms and browsers.
  + Criterion #5.11: Guidelines for presentations of student artwork in an ART SHOW are outlined in How to Give an Art Show, pp. 26–28, of the Teacher’s Manual (all grades). Guideline 15 and 16 describe how to present explanations of formal and informal artistic elements and principles to explain each lesson and the complete survey of lessons and concepts for each grade level.

## Edits and Corrections:

The panel recommends the following edits and corrections:

| # | Grade level | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for edit |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | 1 | TM  Art Supply List | 34  1 | For cowboy & Indian printing lesson | Correct to say: For cowboy & his horse printing lesson | To align with the title of the Lesson & Video |
| 2 | 5 | TM | 1 | … grades K–6 | … grades K–8 | K–8 is the correct grade span |
| 3 | 5 | APG | 23 | He remained in Paris until 1985, … | He remained in Paris until 1885, … | 1985 is a typo |
| 4 | 3 | APG | 13 | Missing death year (2000) for Jacob Lawrence | Add death year (2000) for Jacob Lawrence | Missing death year – inconsistent with rest of APG |
| 5 | 6 | TM | 40 | 3. TROPICAL BIRDS: Color 5340 | 3.TROPICAL BIRDS: Color 53 | 5340 is a typo |
| 6 | 8 | General Materials | Title page | How to Read a Picture Grade 7 | How to Read a Picture Grade 8 | Grade 8 is the correct grade level (is Grade 8 in TM p. 57) |

## Social Content Citations:

The panel found the following social content violations:

| # | SC Code | Grade level | Component | Page number(s) | Current text | Proposed corrected text | Reason for citation |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1 | L-1 | K | TM | 67–68 | “Cat in the Hat” | A non-branded character | Use of a branded name, “Cat in the Hat.” |
| 2 | G-3 | 1 | TM | 67 | Halloween Night | A non-holiday-specific representation | Diversity of religion is not depicted. |
| 3 | L-1 | 1 | TM | 122 | “Cat in the Hat” | A non-branded character | Use of a branded name, “Cat in the Hat.” |
| 4 | L-1 | 1 | TM | 123 | …on the internet: (Google Images website) are: … | …on the internet are: … | Brand name (Google) |
| 5 | L-1 | 1 | TM | 141 | Art.com | Art web page | Commercial site |
| 6 | G-3 | 1 | TM | 142 | Sweet Smell of Christmas | A non-holiday-specific representation | Diversity of religion is not depicted. |
| 7 | L-1 | 1 | TM | 142 | Sweet Smell of Christmas | A non-branded book | Use of branded materials. |
| 8 | G-3 | 2 | TM | 63 | Halloween Night | A non-holiday-specific representation | Diversity of religion is not depicted. |
| 9 | E-1 | 2 | TM | 145–149 | Seven Dwarfs lesson | NA | Problematic for students with disabilities– focus on a group of people solely on genetic traits seems insensitive. |
| 10 | G-3 | 3 | TM | 63 | Halloween Night | A non-holiday-specific representation | Diversity of religion is not depicted. |
| 11 | L-1 | 3 | TM | 152 | …available using the Google website… | …available on the internet … | Brand name (Google) |
| 12 | G-3 | 4 | TM | 57 | Halloween Night | A non-holiday-specific representation | Diversity of religion is not depicted. |
| 13 | L-1 | 4 | TM | 95 | …(These are all on the internet at www.google.com:...) | (These images can be found with an internet search …) | Brand name (www.google.com) |
| 14 | B-1 | 5 | TM | 125–130 and throughout | (term “Indians”) | Native American | Missed opportunity to update material to be culturally sensitive or align with social expectations to reflect the diversity of CA |
| 15 | B-1 | 5 | TM | 125–140 | All content in selected pages. | NA | Entire lesson presents Native Americans as exclusively in the past |
| 16 | A-8 | 5 | TM | 134 | “man” and “mankind” | Change “man” to “people” and “humans” instead of “mankind” | for inclusivity/non-gendered language |
| 17 | E1 | 6 | TM | 110 | “Stress that, being **handicapped**, he became an observer of life” | “Stress that, having a disability, he became and observer of life.” | not inclusive - otherising |
| 18 | L-1 | 6 | TM | 148 | …Google Images website… | …on the internet … | Brand name (Google Images) |
| 19 | B | 7 | Video | G7–16 | “Here’s an African mask I made as an example” | remove “African” | If the instructor made it and is not from Africa herself, it is not an African mask. |
| 20 | L-1 | 8 | TM | 70 | …(Go to the Google Images website and search under …) | …(Conduct an internet search for …) | Brand name (Google Images) |
| 21 | L-1 | 8 | TM | 116 | graphic/image of “Oil of Olay Total Effects” bottle | A non-branded material | Use of branded materials. |

California Department of Education, August 2021