# **FINAL MINUTES OF MEETING: SEPTEMBER 19–20, 2019**

Instructional Quality Commission

An advisory body to the California State Board of Education

(Approved on November 14, 2019)

## **Report of ActionThursday, September 19, 2019**

## **Instructional Quality Commissioners Present:**

Soomin Chao, Chair

Jennifer Woo, Vice Chair

Christine Chapman

Lizette Diaz

Shay Fairchild

Deborah Costa Hernández

Jose Iniguez

Yolanda Muñoz

Melanie Murphy-Corwin

Nicole Naditz

David Phanthai

Alma-Delia Renteria

Manuel Rustin

Julie Tonkovich

Pamela Williamson

Assemblymember Shirley Weber

Senator Ben Allen

## **Commissioners Absent:**

Jose Lara

## **Executive Director:**

Stephanie Gregson

## **State Board of Education Liaison**:

Patricia Rucker

Ilene Straus

Please note that the complete proceedings of the September 19–20, 2019, Instructional Quality Commission (Commission or IQC) meeting, including closed-captioning, are available online at <https://www.cde.ca.gov/be/cc/cd/iqcmeetingagendas2019.asp>.

### **Full Instructional Quality Commission**

1. Call to Order

IQC Chair Chao called the meeting to order at approximately 10 a.m.

1. Salute to the Flag

Commissioner Diaz led the salute to the flag.

1. Overview of Agenda

IQC Chair welcomed and introduced the Commission’s two legislative members, Assemblymember Shirley Weber and Senator Ben Allen. Both said a few words.

1. Approval of Minutes

**ACTION**: Commissioner Muñoz moved to approve the May 16, 2019, Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Murphy-Corwin seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (16–0). Senator Allen was absent for the vote, and Commissioner Lara was absent from the meeting.

1. Report of the IQC Chair

IQC Chair Chao gave a report.

1. Report of the Executive Director

Executive Director Stephanie Gregson gave a report.

1. Report of the State Board of Education (SBE)

SBE members Rucker and Straus gave reports.

1. Additional 2019 IQC Meeting Date

**ACTION**: Commissioner Woo moved to approve the additional meeting date of October 4, 2019. Commissioner Costa-Hernández seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (17–0). Commissioner Lara was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION**: Commissioner Murphy-Corwin moved to approve the meeting date of April 17, 2020. Commissioner Naditz seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (17–0). Commissioner Lara was absent from the meeting.

1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **Arts Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Tonkovich called the Arts Subject Matter Committee (SMC) meeting to order.

1. *2020 California Arts Framework for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Arts Framework*)
2. Recommend to the Full IQC Approval of the Draft *Arts Framework* for the First 60-Day Public Review and Comment Period (Information/Action)

Public Comment on the Draft *Arts Framework*:

1. Gerald Lieberman, Director, State Education & Environment Roundtable
2. Mary Beth Barber, Visual & Performing Arts Curriculum Framework and Evaluation Criteria Committee Member

**ACTION**: Commissioner Murphy-Corwin moved to recommend to the full IQC that the draft *Arts Framework* be sent out for its first 60-day public review and comment period with the changes that were agreed to today. Commissioner Woo seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the committee members present (8–0).

**ACTION**: Commissioner Murphy-Corwin moved to request that the full IQC delegate to the Arts SMC Chair and Vice Chair the review and approval of the agreed-upon changes to the draft *Arts Framework* as well as any minor edits identified by staff or the writers (e.g., grammar, punctuation, word order, citations) before the draft *Arts Framework* is sent out for its first 60-day public review and comment period. Commissioner Chapman seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the committee members present (8–0).

1. Online Survey Questions for the Public Review and Comment Period (Information/Action)

**ACTION**: Commissioner Murphy-Corwin moved to request the full IQC to approve the questions for the online survey to be posted along with draft *Arts Framework*. Commissioner Woo seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the committee members present (8–0).

1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **World Languages Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Naditz called the World Languages SMC meeting to order.

1. *2020 World Languages Framework for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*WL Framework*)
2. Recommend to the Full IQC Approval of the Draft *WL Framework* for the First 60-Day Public Review and Comment Period (Information/Action)

**ACTION**: Commissioner Renteria moved to recommend to the full IQC that the draft *WL Framework* be sent out for its first 60-day public review and comment period with the changes that were agreed to today. Commissioner Diaz seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the committee members present (8–0).

**ACTION**: Commissioner Munoz moved to request that the full IQC delegate to the WL SMC Chair and Vice Chair the review and approval of the agreed-upon changes to the draft *WL Framework* as well as any minor edits identified by staff or the writers (e.g., grammar, punctuation, word order, citations) before the draft *WL Framework* is sent out for its first 60-day public review and comment period. Commissioner Chapman seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the committee members present (8–0).

1. Online Survey Questions for the Public Review and Comment Period (Information/Action)

**ACTION**: Commissioner Williamson moved to request the full IQC to approve the questions for the online survey to be posted along with draft *WL Framework*. Commissioner Renteria seconded the motion. There was no further discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the committee members present (8–0).

1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **Health Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Woo called the Health SMC meeting to order.

1. 2020 Health Instructional Materials Adoption
2. Recommendation of Instructional Materials Reviewers (IMRs) and Content Review Experts (CREs) (Information/Action)

**ACTION**: Commissioner Fairchild moved to recommend to the full IQC IMR and CRE applicants: 1, 2, 6, 7, 9, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 24, 25, 26, 28, 29, 30, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 45, 47, 49, 50, 51, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 71, 73, 74, 75, and 76. CRE applicants 11, 19, and 25 are being recommended as IMRs because they lack the qualifications to serve as a CRE for this adoption. Commissioner Costa-Hernández seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (7–0). Commissioner Lara was absent from the meeting.

1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **Mathematics Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Chapman called the Mathematics SMC meeting to order.

1. *2021 Mathematics Framework for California Public Schools, Kindergarten Through Grade Twelve* (*Mathematics Framework*)
2. Update on the Mathematics Focus Group Meetings and Public Comment Received Regarding the Revision of the *Mathematics Framework* (Information)

CDE staff provided a progress report on the development of the Focus Group Report following the focus group meetings that took place in August 2019. The completed report and draft guidelines for the revision of the *Mathematics Framework* will be submitted to the Mathematics SMC and IQC in November 2019.

1. Recommendation of Curriculum Framework and Evaluation Criteria Committee (CFCC) Members (Information)
2. Process Discussion Based on the SBE September Action on the Schedule of Significant Events (Timeline)

IQC Executive Director Gregson gave a report regarding the SBE’s recent action to adjust several milestones in the revised Timeline. The recommendation of members for the mathematics CFCC will take place at the November 2019 IQC meeting.

1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

### **Full Commission Reconvenes**

#### Reports/Action from the Subcommittees to the Full IQC

Arts Subject Matter Committee

1. Approve Draft *Arts Framework* for the First 60-Day Public Review and Comment Period (Action)

**ACTION**: Arts SMC Chair Tonkovich moved to approve the draft *Arts* *Framework* for the first 60-day public review and comment period with the suggested edits on which consensus was reached. Commissioner Murphy-Corwin seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (16–0). Commissioner Allen was absent for the vote, and Commissioner Lara was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION**: Arts SMC Chair Tonkovich moved to request that the full IQC delegate to the Arts SMC Chair and Vice Chair the review and approve all of the agreed-upon changes to the draft framework as well as any minor edits identified by staff or the writers (e.g., grammar, punctuation, word order, citations) before the framework is sent out for its first 60-day public review and comment period. Commissioner Murphy-Corwin seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (16–0). Commissioner Allen was absent for the vote, and Commissioner Lara was absent from the meeting.

1. Approve the Online Survey Questions for the Public Review and Comment Period (Action)

**ACTION**: Arts SMC Chair Tonkovich moved to approve the questions for the online survey that will be posted along with the draft framework when it is posted for the first 60-day public review and comment period, scheduled from October 1 through December 1, 2019. Commissioner Murphy-Corwin seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (16–0). Commissioner Allen was absent for the vote, and Commissioner Lara was absent from the meeting.

World Languages Subject Matter Committee

1. Approve Draft *WL Framework* for the First 60-Day Public Review and Comment Period (Action)

**ACTION**: WL SMC Chair Naditz moved to approve the draft *WL* *Framework* for the first 60-day public review and comment period with the suggested edits on which consensus was reached. Commissioner Williamson seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (16–0). Commissioner Allen was absent for the vote, and Commissioner Lara was absent from the meeting.

**ACTION**: WL SMC Chair Naditz moved that the full IQC delegate the WL SMC Chair and Vice Chair to review and approve all of the agreed-upon changes to the draft framework as well as any minor edits identified by staff or the writers (e.g., grammar, punctuation, word order, citations) before the framework is sent out for its first 60-day public review and comment period. Commissioner Williamson seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (16–0). Commissioner Allen was absent for the vote, and Commissioner Lara was absent from the meeting

1. Approve the Online Survey Questions for the Public Review and Comment Period (Action)

**ACTION**: WL SMC Chair Naditz moved to approve the questions for the online survey that will be posted along with the draft framework when it is posted for the first 60-day public review and comment period, scheduled from October 1 through December 1, 2019. Commissioner Muñoz seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (16–0). Commissioner Allen was absent for the vote, and Commissioner Lara was absent from the meeting.

Health Subject Matter Committee

1. Recommend IMRs and CREs to the SBE (Action)

**ACTION**: Health SMC Chair Woo moved to recommend to the SBE IMR and CRE applicants: 1, 2, 6, 7, 9, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 24, 25, 26, 28, 29, 30, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 45, 47, 49, 50, 51, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 71, 73, 74, 75, and 76. CRE applicants 11, 19, and 25 are being recommended as IMRs because they lack the qualifications to serve as a CRE for this adoption. Commissioner Costa-Hernández seconded the motion. There was no discussion or public comment. The motion was approved by a unanimous vote of the members present (16–0). Commissioner Allen was absent for the vote, and Commissioner Lara was absent from the meeting.

#### Other Matters/Public Comment on Today’s Agenda Items: None

ADJOURNMENT FOR THE DAY

IQC Chair Chao adjourned the meeting for the day at approximately 3:35 p.m.

## **Report of ActionFriday, September 20, 2019**

## **Instructional Quality Commissioners Present:**

Soomin Chao, Chair

Jennifer Woo, Vice Chair

Christine Chapman

Lizette Diaz

Shay Fairchild

Deborah Costa Hernández

Jose Iniguez

Yolanda Muñoz

Melanie Murphy-Corwin

Nicole Naditz

David Phanthai

Alma-Delia Renteria

Manuel Rustin

Julie Tonkovich

Pamela Williamson

Assemblymember Shirley Weber

Senator Ben Allen

## **Commissioners Absent:**

Jose Lara

## **Executive Director:**

Stephanie Gregson

## **State Board of Education Liaison**:

Feliza Ortiz-Licon

Ilene Straus

### **History–Social Science Subject Matter Committee**

SMC Chair Diaz called the History–Social Science SMC meeting to order.

1. Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum (ESMC)
2. Discussion on the Draft ESMC (Information/Action)

The California Department of Education (CDE) recommended that the Instructional Quality Commission delay any action or decision on the draft ESMC to provide more time for the CDE to review, revise, edit, and consider feedback regarding the content that will be considered for inclusion in the curriculum. The SMC accepted this recommendation and took no action on the draft at this meeting. Executive Director Gregson thanked the members of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Advisory Committee for their hard work in developing the first draft of the model curriculum.

1. Public Comment on the Draft ESMC

The following individuals provided comment (affiliations are listed as provided by the speaker):

* + 1. Jason Weiner, Jewish Community Relations Council Sacramento
		2. Jo Kaster, Jewish Community Relations Council Sacramento
		3. Bruce Poner, Jewish Public Affairs Committee/Sacramento Jewish Community Relations Council
		4. Meshi Benezri, Student
		5. Michaela Pelta, Student
		6. Danielle York, Student
		7. Kian Mirshokri, Student
		8. Kate Chavez, StandWithUs
		9. Daly Jordan-Koch, California Teachers Association
		10. Jessica Trubowitch, Jewish Community Relations Council - SF
		11. Easan Katir, Hindu American Foundation
		12. Adam Eilath, Wornick Jewish Day School
		13. Roxanne Makasdjian, Genocide Education Project
		14. Michelle Wolfson, Parent, Rosa Parks Elementary
		15. Eran Hazary, American Jewish Council
		16. Alphonso Thompson, Model Curriculum Advisory Committee
		17. Maya Howard, Jewish Community Relations Council
		18. Lynn Barkley-Baskin, Jewish Community Relations Council
		19. Melissa Moreno, Save CA Ethnic Studies
		20. Ellen Brotsky, Jewish Voice for Peace
		21. Max Samarov, Stand With Us
		22. Maddie Carmel, Congregation Beth Am/Jewish and Israel Advocacy Committee (JIAC)
		23. Barbara Windham, Congregation Beth Am/JIAC
		24. Theresa Montano, Save CA Ethnic Studies
		25. R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, Save CA Ethnic Studies
		26. Dominique Williams, Save CA Ethnic Studies
		27. Lara Kiswani, San Francisco State University/Arab Resource and Organizing Center
		28. Jean Quan, Save CA Ethnic Studies
		29. Roy Taggug, UC Davis Bulosan Center for Filipino Studies
		30. Angie Fa, Save CA Ethnic Studies
		31. Artnelson Concordia, Save CA Ethnic Studies/San Francisco Unified School District
		32. Susan George, Democratic Organizer
		33. Patrick Camangian, University of San Francisco
		34. Claire Chedekel, Parent
		35. Sophia Armen, UC San Diego/Armenian National Committee of America
		36. Mike Williams, Deganawidah-Quetzalcoatl University
		37. Jon Windham, Parent
		38. Aimee Riechel, San Francisco Unified School District
		39. Kyle Beckham, San Francisco State University
		40. Shekhiynah Larks, Be’chol Lashon
		41. Aryeh Weinberg, Be’chol Lashon
		42. Aiden Mosely
		43. Renz Andales, Pin@y Educational Partnership
		44. Erin Cruz, Pin@y Educational Partnership
		45. Arelene Daus-Magbual, Pin@y Educational Partnership/San Francisco State University
		46. Mario Galvan, Ethnic Studies Now
		47. Margarita Berta-Avila, Ethnic Studies Now
		48. Serena Eisenberg
		49. Allyson Tintiangco-Cubales, San Francisco State University/Pin@y Educational Partnership
		50. Carmel Johnson
		51. Lupita Torres
		52. Harjit Singh
		53. Nicole Martinez
		54. Amira Beckham
		55. Ramond Takhsh, Assyrian American Association of Southern California
		56. Ramona Tascoe, San Francisco State University/University of California San Francisco
		57. Guillermo Gomez, Save CA Ethnic Studies
		58. Jada Quidachay, Save CA Ethnic Studies
		59. Karen Stiller, Jewish Community Relations Council
		60. Nikhil Laud, San Francisco Unified School District
		61. Celeste Francisco, Pin@y Educational Partnership
		62. Arneson Sambile
		63. Rosario Machahilas
		64. Shelby Speers, Pin@y Educational Partnership
1. Continue Discussion on the Draft ESMC (Information/Action)

After public comment, SMC Chair Diaz thanked the presenters and said that she was looking forward to seeing another draft of the model curriculum in the future.

1. Other Matters/Public Comment: None

ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

IQC Chair Chao adjourned the meeting at approximately 11 a.m.

California Department of Education: November 2019

Page 11 of 11